



NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

FIRST SESSION

THIRTY-NINTH LEGISLATURE

Votes and Proceedings

of the Assembly

Tuesday, 7 April 2009 — No. 16

**President of the National Assembly:
Mr. Yvon Vallières**

QUÉBEC

The Assembly was called to order at 10.00 o'clock a.m.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Government Motions

The Assembly held the debate on the motion arising out of the tabling by Mr. Arcand, Minister of International Relations, on 26 March 2009, of The Entente entre le Québec et la France en matière de reconnaissance mutuelle des qualifications professionnelles, signed in Québec City on 17 October 2008.

This motion reads as follows:

THAT, pursuant to section 22.3 of the *Act respecting the Ministère des Relations internationales*, the National Assembly ratify the Entente entre le Québec et la France en matière de reconnaissance mutuelle des qualifications professionnelles, signed in Québec City on 17 October 2008.

Following a meeting with the House leaders, Mrs. Houda-Pepin, First Vice-President, informed the Assembly of the speaking time for the proceedings with respect to this limited debate: 12 minutes shall be allotted to the independent Members; the two parliamentary groups will share equally the rest of the time allotted for this debate; within this framework, any time not used by a parliamentary group may be added to that of the other group, while any time not used by the independent Members will be redistributed equally among the parliamentary groups, it having been agreed that this apportionment may not be carried out before the time allotted to both parliamentary groups has entirely expired; and individual addresses shall not be limited.

A debate arose thereon.

7 April 2009

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried. Accordingly, this commitment was approved.

At 11.18 o'clock a.m., at the request of Mrs. Vien, Minister of Government Services, Mrs. Houda-Pepin, First Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 2.00 o'clock p.m.

The proceedings resumed at 2.06 o'clock p.m.

Moment of reflection

ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS

Introduction of Bills

Mrs. Weil, Minister of Justice, moved that leave be granted to introduce the following Bill:

- 9 An Act to amend the Code of Civil Procedure to prevent improper use of the courts and promote freedom of expression and citizen participation in public debate

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, Bill 9 was introduced in the Assembly.

7 April 2009

Mr. Villeneuve (Berthier) moved that leave be granted to introduce the following Bill:

192 An Act to amend the Act to ensure the enlargement of Parc national du Mont-Orford, the preservation of the biodiversity of adjacent lands and the maintenance of recreational tourism activities in order to bring the excluded lands back within the boundaries of the park

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, Bill 192 was introduced in the Assembly.

Presenting Papers

Mr. President tabled the following:

Copy of the notice of motion by Mrs. Maltais (Taschereau) which will be placed on the *Order Paper and Notices* of Wednesday, 8 April 2009, under Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition.

(Sessional Paper No. 155-20090407)

Presenting Reports from Committees

Mr. Paquet (Laval-des-Rapides), committee chairman, tabled the following:

A report from the Committee on Public Finance, which, on 1 and 2 April 2009, continued the debate on the Budget Speech.

(Sessional Paper No. 156-20090407)

Mrs. Doyer (Matapédia), committee vice-chairman, tabled the following:

A report from the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, which, on 7 April 2009, held public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 4, An Act to regularize and provide for the development of local slaughterhouses and to amend the Food Products Act.

(Sessional Paper No. 157-20090407)

Presenting Petitions

The abstracts of four petitions respecting the creation of a public-private partnership establishing the Early Childhood Development Fund were tabled:

- the first, being the abstract of a petition signed by 29 citizens from the riding of Pointe-aux-Trembles, by Mrs. Léger (Pointe-aux-Trembles);
(Sessional Paper No. 158-20090407)
- the second, being the abstract of a petition signed by 19 citizens of Montréal, by Mr. Kotto (Bourget);
(Sessional Paper No. 159-20090407)
- the third, being the abstract of a petition signed by 63 citizens of Montréal, by Mrs. Poirier (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve);
(Sessional Paper No. 160-20090407)
- the fourth, being the abstract of a petition signed by 8 citizens of Greater Montréal, by Mrs. Poirier (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve).
(Sessional Paper No. 161-20090407)

Mr. Charette (Deux-Montagnes) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition respecting financial support to community projects in non profit community-owned housing, and signed by 58 citizens of Saint-Eustache.

(Sessional Paper No. 162-20090407)

7 April 2009

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mrs. Beaudoin (Rosemont) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition respecting a request for a moratorium on all construction projects on the grounds of the Olympic Village, and signed by 163 citizens of Montréal.

(Sessional Paper No. 163-20090407)

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mr. Kotto (Bourget) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition respecting the creation of a public-private partnership establishing the Early Childhood Development Fund, and signed by 41 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 164-20090407)

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mr. Khadir (Mercier) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition respecting a waiting period before being covered by the Québec health insurance plan, and signed by 1100 citizens of Greater Montréal.

(Sessional Paper No. 165-20090407)

Oral Questions and Answers

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

7 April 2009

Motions Without Notice

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Charest, Premier, Mrs. Marois, Leader of the Official Opposition, and Mr. Picard (Chutes-de-la-Chaudière) jointly moved:

THAT the National Assembly pay homage to Mr. Daniel Bienvenue, by underlining his remarkable contribution to serving his fellow citizens and the Québec State for almost 30 years;

THAT it express its deepest condolences to his wife Danièle Langlois, his daughter Andréanne, his son Philippe, as well as to all of his family members and friends.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

At the invitation of Mr. Chagnon, Second Vice-President, the Assembly observed a minute of silence.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 84 and 185, Mr. Charest, Premier, Mrs. Marois, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mrs. Roy (Lotbinière) and Mr. Khadir (Mercier) jointly moved:

THAT the National Assembly express its deepest sympathy to all members of the Italian-Québec community, to the Italian people and to the families stricken by the violent earthquake that hit the Abruzzi region yesterday, 6 April 2009;

THAT the National Assembly ensure the Italian-Québec community as well as the Italian Government and people of the solidarity of the people of Québec in these difficult hours.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

7 April 2009

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 84 and 185, Mrs. Courchesne, Minister of Education, Recreation and Sports, Mr. Bérubé (Matane), Mr. Bonnardel (Shefford) and Mr. Khadir (Mercier) jointly moved:

THAT the National Assembly mark the excellent performance of the World Figure Skating Championships silver medallist, Joannie Rochette, who became the first Canadian skater to climb onto the podium since 1988.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 84 and 185, Mr. Bouchard (Vachon), Mrs. James, Minister of Immigration and Cultural Communities, Mr. Deltell (Chauveau) and Mr. Khadir (Mercier) jointly moved:

THAT the National Assembly mark Tartan Day and that it once again recognize the major contribution of Quebecers of Scottish descent to the economic, social and cultural development of Quebec.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 84 and 185, Mr. Drainville (Marie-Victorin), Mr. Bolduc, Minister of Health and Social Services, Mr. Caire (La Peltre) and Mr. Khadir (Mercier) jointly moved:

THAT the National Assembly mark World Health Day which, this year, focuses on the safety of health facilities and the preparation of health workers who treat populations affected by emergencies;

7 April 2009

THAT it reiterate that the objectives of the World Health Organization must be reached in order to save lives and improve health worldwide.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 84 and 185, Mrs. Richard (Marguerite-D'Youville), Mrs. Poirier (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve), Mrs. St-Pierre, Minister of Culture, Communications and the Status of Women, Mr. Bonnardel (Shefford) and Mr. Khadir (Mercier) jointly moved:

THAT the National Assembly mark the 9th Invisible Work Day;

THAT we commend the unpaid work which all too often goes unmentioned, even though the United Nations Organization and other statistical institutes indicate that it constitutes great wealth for all countries;

THAT we mark the major contribution to society of these volunteered hours.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 84 and 185, Mr. Bergman (D'Arcy-McGee), Mr. Simard (Richelieu), Mrs. Roy (Lotbinière) and Mr. Khadir (Mercier) jointly moved:

THAT the National Assembly of Québec commemorate the 15th anniversary of the Rwandan genocide and pay homage to the Rwandan martyrs.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

7 April 2009

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 84 and 185, Mr. Hamad, Minister responsible for the Capitale-Nationale region, Mrs. Maltais (Taschereau) and Mr. Bonnardel (Shefford) jointly moved:

THAT the National Assembly mark the 200th anniversary of the founding of the Chambre de commerce de Québec, the first Francophone chamber of commerce in North America, active since 21 February 1809, by recognizing its assistance and contribution to the economic life of Québec City businesses through its vitality and outreach.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 84 and 185, Mrs. Gagnon-Tremblay, Minister responsible for the Estrie region, Mr. Bérubé (Matane), Mr. Bonnardel (Shefford) and Mr. Khadir (Mercier) jointly moved:

THAT the National Assembly mark the naming of the city of Sherbrooke to host the Canada Games in the summer of 2013; the entire population of Québec will have the opportunity, for its part, to come and cheer on our emerging athletes and then take advantage of the improvements that will be made to the sports facilities of the region.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 84 and 185, Mrs. Gonthier (Mégantic-Compton), Mr. Cloutier (Lac-Saint-Jean), Mr. Deltell (Chauveau) and Mr. Khadir (Mercier) jointly moved:

WHEREAS the Mount Mégantic Observatory is the most important of its kind in eastern North America;

7 April 2009

WHEREAS it is a major research laboratory for
Université Laval and Université de Montréal;

THAT the National Assembly ask the Federal
Government to reconsider its decision to cut the subsidy granted
to the Mount Mégantic Observatory through the Natural
Sciences and Engineering Research Council (NSERC) of
Canada.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

Notices of Proceedings in Committees

Mr. Dupuis, Government House Leader, convened the following Committees:

- the Committee on Social Affairs, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 7, An Act to establish an early childhood development fund;
- the Committee on Labour and the Economy, to give clause-by-clause consideration to Bill 25, An Act to amend the Pay Equity Act;
- the Committee on Public Finance, to hear the interested parties and give clause-by-clause consideration to Private Bill 202, An Act respecting Abitibi-Consolidated Company of Canada.

Mr. Chagnon, Second Vice-President, gave the following notices:

- the Committee on Public Administration shall hear the Auditor General of Québec on his annual management report and his financial commitments for 2007-2008; this same Committee will then hold a deliberative meeting to discuss the observations, conclusions and, if any, recommendations following this hearing;
- the Committee on Transportation and the Environment shall hold a deliberative meeting for the purpose of organizing its proceedings and of discussing the possibility of carrying out an order of surveillance on the Agence métropolitaine de transport and an order of initiative on the situation of lakes.

Information on the Proceedings of the Assembly

Mr. Chagnon, Second Vice-President, informed the Assembly that on Wednesday, 8 April 2008, during Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition, a debate will be held on the motion by Mrs. Maltais (Taschereau). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly recall sections 61 and 62 of the *Act respecting the National Assembly* as well as the wording of the oath of allegiance taken by the members of the Cabinet, that it demand that the Premier have his own directives regarding conflicts of interest enforced, that it solemnly affirm that a Cabinet member must not be bound to another employer during the exercise of his duties and that it ask for the appointment, as expeditiously as possible, of an independent ethics commissioner.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Business Having Precedence

Debate on the Budget Speech

The Assembly resumed the debate, which had been suspended on 31 March 2009, on the motion by Mrs. Jérôme-Forget, Minister of Finance, —That this Assembly approves in general the budgetary policy of the Government, and on the want of confidence motions moved by Mr. Legault (Rousseau), Mr. Khadir (Mercier), Mr. Simard (Richelieu), Mrs. Marois, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Girard (Gouin) and Mrs. Bouillé (Iberville).

The debate being concluded, Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, rendered the following ruling on the receivability of the want of confidence motion by Mrs. Bouillé (Iberville):

7 April 2009

RULING FROM THE CHAIR

The want of confidence motion moved by Mrs. Bouillé (Iberville) within the framework of the debate on the Budget Speech is out of order on the grounds that this motion contains recitals, which is contrary to Standing Order 191.

On behalf of the Member concerned, Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, requested leave of the Assembly to replace the aforementioned motion ruled out of order by a new motion in compliance with the Standing Orders.

By leave of the Assembly, Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, tabled the motion by Mrs. Bouillé (Iberville), which now reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Government for having let the agricultural community down by systematically refusing to increase the budget of La Financière agricole du Québec of 300 million dollars for the past 7 years, and by causing the organization to face a deficit of more than 1.2 billion dollars in 2009.

Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, then proceeded to put the question on the want of confidence motions presented during the debate on the Budget Speech.

First, the question was put on the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Legault (Rousseau). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Government for having presented a 2009-2010 budget without a recovery plan to limit the effects of the economic crisis on Québec, particularly the lack of major measures to counter dropping out of school, to adequately fund postsecondary education, to increase the productivity of businesses and minimize the number of jobs lost and to come in aid to moderate-income individuals.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. 17 in Appendix)

Yeas: **48** Nays: **62** Abstentions: **0**

7 April 2009

The question was then put on the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Khadir (Mercier). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Government for having presented a budget that will have effects that are totally contrary to the revolution of sustainable development announced by the Premier just two weeks ago.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **18** in Appendix)

Yeas: **48** Nays: **62** Abstentions: **0**

The question was then put on the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Simard (Richelieu). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Premier as well as the Chair of the Conseil du trésor for their mismanagement of the public expenditure before the crisis that led to a structural deficit of close to 4 billion dollars and who announce major cuts in services to citizens in the coming years as well as drastic tariff increases.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **19** in Appendix)

Yeas: **48** Nays: **62** Abstentions: **0**

The question was then put on the want of confidence motion moved by Mrs. Marois, Leader of the Official Opposition. This motion reads as follows:

7 April 2009

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Premier of Québec for having plunged Quebecers into an election campaign at a time when a serious economic crisis was erupting without establishing a profile of the public finances and of the state of the Caisse de dépôt et placement du Québec.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **20** in Appendix)

Yeas: **48** Nays: **62** Abstentions: **0**

The question was then put on the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Girard (Gouin). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Government for not having made any commitment as regards the creation of the 15,000 spaces in subsidized child care promised during the last election campaign.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **21** in Appendix)

Yeas: **48** Nays: **62** Abstentions: **0**

The question was then put on the want of confidence motion moved by Mrs. Bouillé (Iberville). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Government for having let the agricultural community down by systematically refusing to increase the budget of La Financière agricole du Québec of 300 million dollars for the past 7 years, and by causing the organization to face a deficit of more than 1.2 billion dollars in 2009.

7 April 2009

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **22** in Appendix)

Yeas: **48** Nays: **62** Abstentions: **0**

Finally, the question was put on the want of confidence motion moved by Mrs. Jérôme-Forget, Minister of Finance, —That this Assembly approves in general the budgetary policy of the Government.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **23** in Appendix)

Yeas: **62** Nays: **48** Abstentions: **0**

Government Bills

Passage in Principle

Mrs. Weil, Minister responsible for the administration of legislation respecting the professions, moved, —That Bill 3, An Act to provide for the implementation of the Entente entre le Québec et la France en matière de reconnaissance mutuelle des qualifications professionnelles and similar agreements, do now pass in principle.

After debate thereon, the motion was carried and Bill 3 was accordingly passed in principle.

Mr. Gauthrin, Deputy Government House Leader, moved that Bill 3 be referred for clause-by-clause consideration to the Committee on Institutions.

The motion was carried.

7 April 2009

Debates Upon Adjournment

The Assembly held three debates upon adjournment:

- the first, on a question by Mr. Cloutier (Lac-Saint-Jean) to Mrs. Jérôme-Forget, Minister of Finance, about the income stabilization programme and the harmonization of sales taxes;
- the second, on a question by Mr. St-Arnaud (Chambly) to Mr. Dupuis, Minister of Public Security, about the lack of resources for Montreal police officers, according to the report of the Commission de la santé et de la sécurité du travail;
- the third, on a question by Mr. Villeneuve (Berthier) to Mrs. Beauchamp, Minister of Sustainable Development, Environment and Parks, about Mont-Orford.

At 6.38 o'clock p.m., Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Wednesday, 8 April 2009, at 10.00 o'clock a.m.

YVON VALLIÈRES

President

7 April 2009

APPENDIX

Recorded Divisions

On the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Legault (Rousseau) within the framework of the debate on the Budget Speech:

(Division No. 17)

YEAS - 48

Aussant	Cloutier	Legault	Poirier
Beaudoin	Cousineau	Léger	Rebello
<i>[Mirabel]</i>	Curzi	Lemay	Richard
Beaudoin	Doyer	Malavoy	<i>[Duplessis]</i>
<i>[Rosemont]</i>	Dufour	Maltais	Richard
Bédard	Ferland	Marois	<i>[Marguerite-D'Youville]</i>
Bergeron	Gaudreault	McKay	Robert
Bérubé	<i>[Jonquière]</i>	Pagé	Roy
Bonnardel	Gauvreau	Pelletier	St-Arnaud
Bouchard	Girard	<i>[Rimouski]</i>	Traversy
Boucher	Hivon	Pelletier	Trottier
Caire	Khadir	<i>[Saint-Hyacinthe]</i>	Turcotte
Champagne	Kotto	Picard	Villeneuve
Charette	Leclair	Pinard	

NAYS - 62

Arcand	Charest	James	Paradis
Auclair	Charlebois	Jérôme-Forget	Pigeon
Bachand	Chevarie	Kelley	Reid
<i>[Outremont]</i>	Corbeil	L'Écuyer	Rotiroti
Bachand	Courchesne	Lehouillier	Simard
<i>[Arthabaska]</i>	Diamond	Lessard	<i>[Dubuc]</i>
Beauchamp	Drolet	MacMillan	Sklavounos
Béchar	Dubourg	Marcoux	St-Amand
Bergman	Dupuis	Marsan	St-Pierre
Bernard	Dutil	Matte	Thériault
Bernier	Gagnon-Tremblay	Ménard	Tomassi
Billette	Gaudreault	Moreau	Vallée
Blais	<i>[Hull]</i>	Morin	Vien
Bolduc	Gautrin	Normandeau	Weil
Boulet	Gonthier	Ouellette	Whissell
Carrière	Hamad	Ouimet	
Charbonneau	Huot	Paquet	

7 April 2009

On the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Khadir (Mercier) within the framework of the debate on the Budget Speech:

(Division No. 18)

(Identical to Division No. 17)

On the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Simard (Richelieu) within the framework of the debate on the Budget Speech:

(Division No. 19)

(Identical to Division No. 17)

On the want of confidence motion moved by Mrs. Marois, Leader of the Official Opposition, within the framework of the debate on the Budget Speech:

(Division No. 20)

(Identical to Division No. 17)

On the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Girard (Gouin) within the framework of the debate on the Budget Speech:

(Division No. 21)

(Identical to Division No. 17)

On the want of confidence motion moved by Mrs. Bouillé (Iberville) within the framework of the debate on the Budget Speech:

(Division No. 22)

(Identical to Division No. 17)

7 April 2009

On the motion by Mrs. Jérôme-Forget, Minister of Finance, —That this Assembly approves in general the budgetary policy of the Government:

(Division No. 23)

YEAS - 62

Arcand	Charest	James	Paradis
Auclair	Charlebois	Jérôme-Forget	Pigeon
Bachand	Chevarie	Kelley	Reid
<i>[Outremont]</i>	Corbeil	L'Écuyer	Rotiroti
Bachand	Courchesne	Lehouillier	Simard
<i>[Arthabaska]</i>	Diamond	Lessard	<i>[Dubuc]</i>
Beauchamp	Drolet	MacMillan	Sklavounos
Béchar	Dubourg	Marcoux	St-Amand
Bergman	Dupuis	Marsan	St-Pierre
Bernard	Dutil	Matte	Thériault
Bernier	Gagnon-Tremblay	Ménard	Tomassi
Billette	Gaudreault	Moreau	Vallée
Blais	<i>[Hull]</i>	Morin	Vien
Bolduc	Gautrin	Normandeau	Weil
Boulet	Gonthier	Ouellette	Whissell
Carrière	Hamad	Ouimet	
Charbonneau	Huot	Paquet	

NAYS - 48

Aussant	Cloutier	Legault	Poirier
Beaudoin	Cousineau	Léger	Rebello
<i>[Mirabel]</i>	Curzi	Lemay	Richard
Beaudoin	Doyer	Malavoy	<i>[Marguerite-D'Youville]</i>
<i>[Rosemont]</i>	Dufour	Maltais	Richard
Bédard	Ferland	Marois	<i>[Duplessis]</i>
Bergeron	Gaudreault	McKay	Robert
Bérubé	<i>[Jonquière]</i>	Pagé	Roy
Bonnardel	Gauvreau	Pelletier	St-Arnaud
Bouchard	Girard	<i>[Saint-Hyacinthe]</i>	Traversy
Boucher	Hivon	Pelletier	Trottier
Caire	Khadir	<i>[Rimouski]</i>	Turcotte
Champagne	Kotto	Picard	Villeneuve
Charette	Leclair	Pinard	