



---

---

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

---

---

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-FIRST LEGISLATURE

## **Votes and Proceedings**

**of the Assembly**

**Tuesday, 12 April 2016 — No. 160**

**President of the National Assembly:  
Mr. Jacques Chagnon**

---

**QUÉBEC**



The Assembly was called to order at 1.40 o'clock p.m.

---

## **ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

### **Statements by Members**

Mr. Chevarie (Îles-de-la-Madeleine) made a statement to underline the work done by responders following the 29 March 2016 plane crash on the Magdalen Islands and to express condolences to the victims' families and friends.

---

Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia) made a statement to request government assistance for the restoration of Mont-Joli's Stade du centenaire.

---

Mrs. Simard (Charlevoix-Côte-de-Beaupré) made a statement to congratulate Auberge des Peupliers on joining the Hôtellerie Champêtre network of country inns and hotels in Québec.

---

Mr. Lemay (Masson) made a statement to suggest that a "hypoglycemia day" be decreed.

---

Mr. Giguère (Saint-Maurice) made a statement to congratulate Mr. Jacques Goulet, who received the Maple Leaf Award of Distinction from the Canadian Association of New York.

**12 April 2016**

---

Mrs. Maltais (Taschereau) made a statement to congratulate honourees at an evening event paying tribute to volunteers in Taschereau riding.

---

Mrs. St-Pierre (Acadie) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. François Cloutier, former Member of the National Assembly and former Minister.

---

Mr. Jolin-Barrette (Borduas) made a statement to underline the 30th anniversary of Corporation aide et intégration jeunesse au travail de la Vallée-du-Richelieu.

---

Mr. Blais (Charlesbourg) made a statement to pay tribute to the Centre d'aide et d'action bénévole de Charlesbourg.

---

Mr. Ouimet (Marquette) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Jean-Claude Ménard for his contribution to promoting and preserving folk heritage.

---

At 1.53 o'clock p.m., Mrs. Gaudreault, Second Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

---

The proceedings resumed at 2.00 o'clock p.m.

12 April 2016

---

Moment of reflection

**Presenting Papers**

Mr. Arcand, Minister of Energy and Natural Resources, tabled the following:

The Québec energy policy entitled “La Politique énergétique du Québec 2030”.  
(Sessional Paper No. 2090-20160412)

---

Mrs. Charlebois, Minister for Rehabilitation, Youth Protection, Public Health and Healthy Lifestyles, tabled the annual reports of Québec en Forme, for the following fiscal years:

2010–2011	(Sessional Paper No. 2091-20160412)
2011–2012	(Sessional Paper No. 2092-20160412)
2012–2013	(Sessional Paper No. 2093-20160412)
2013–2014	(Sessional Paper No. 2094-20160412)
2014–2015	(Sessional Paper No. 2095-20160412)

---

Mr. Fournier, Government House Leader, tabled the following:

The Government’s reply to a petition tabled on 23 February 2016 by Mr. Martel (Nicolet-Bécancour) on de-amalgamating Lac-à-la-Tortue from Ville de Shawinigan;  
(Sessional Paper No. 2096-20160412)

**12 April 2016**

---

The Government's reply to a petition tabled on 15 March 2016 by Mr. Bergeron (Verchères) on adopting an order to exclude land from an agricultural zone for the construction of an elementary school in Val-des-Monts;

(Sessional Paper No. 2097-20160412)

The Government's reply to a petition tabled on 16 March 2016 by Mrs. D'Amours (Mirabel) on designating Remembrance Day a statutory holiday.

(Sessional Paper No. 2098-20160412)

---

The President tabled the following:

A letter, dated 8 April 2016, he had received from Mrs. Guylaine Leclerc, Auditor General of Québec, in response to a motion carried unanimously by the Assembly on 6 April 2016 on the awarding of a loan and subsidy to the company Premier Tech by Investissement Québec and the Ministère du Développement économique respectively.

(Sessional Paper No. 2099-20160412)

### **Presenting Reports from Committees**

Mr. Bernier (Montmorency), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Public Finance, which met on 5, 6 and 7 April 2016 to continue the debate on the Budget Speech pursuant to Standing Order 275.

(Sessional Paper No. 2100-20160412)

12 April 2016

---

### **Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 53 and 59, Mr. Paradis (Lévis) tabled the following:

A list concerning the condition of buildings in the health network.  
(Sessional Paper No. 2101-20160412)

### **Motions Without Notice**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mrs. David, Minister responsible for Higher Education, together with Mrs. Hivon (Joliette), Mrs. Samson (Iberville) and Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques), moved:

THAT the National Assembly honour the memory of Mr. Marcel Dubé, a prolific author and pioneer of Québec theatre;

THAT it remember the social profundity of his work and his love of the French language;

THAT it highlight his influence on Québec theatre and its artists, who, like him, have contributed to defining it.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

At the request of Mrs. Gaudreault, Second Vice-President, the Assembly observed a minute of silence.

**12 April 2016**

---

Mr. Drainville, Official Opposition House Leader, together with Mr. Bonnardel, Second Opposition Group House Leader, and Mr. Khadir (Mercier), moved a motion concerning the Quebec Liberal Party's funding practices; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

---

Mrs. Roy (Montarville), together with Mr. Drainville, Official Opposition House Leader, moved a motion concerning political party financing; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

---

Mr. Khadir (Mercier) moved a motion to hold a parliamentary committee on the sale of RONA; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

#### **Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

Mr. Sklavounos, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

- the Committee on Institutions, to conclude its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 64, Firearms Registration Act;
  - the Committee on Transportation and the Environment, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 76, An Act to modify the organization and governance of shared transportation in the Montréal metropolitan area.
-



12 April 2016

---

## ORDERS OF THE DAY

### Business Having Precedence

#### *Debate on the Budget Speech*

The Assembly resumed the debate, which had been adjourned on 5 April 2016, on the motion moved by Mr. Leitão, Minister of Finance, that the Assembly approve the Government's budgetary policy, and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Marceau (Rousseau), Mr. Bonnardel (Granby), Mr. Khadir (Mercier), Mr. Therrien (Sanguinet), Mr. Caire (La Peltrie), Mr. Lelièvre (Gaspé), Mr. Lisée (Rosemont), Mr. Bergeron (Verchères), Mrs. Poirier (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve), Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie-Saint-Jacques), Mrs. Hivon (Joliette), Mr. Villeneuve (Berthier), Mrs. David (Gouin), Mr. Kotto (Bourget), Mr. Ouellet (René-Lévesque) and Mr. Rochon (Richelieu), subject to the receivability of these motions. By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 276, Mr. Bonnardel (Granby) commented on behalf of the Second Opposition Group.

The debate being concluded, Mrs. Gaudreault, Second Vice-President, declared that the motions stating a grievance were receivable.

Mrs. Gaudreault, Second Vice-President, then proceeded to put the question on the motions stating a grievance moved during the debate.

First, the question was put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Marceau (Rousseau). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for its lack of an economic policy, which has resulted in stagnating private-sector investments, an unrelenting burden on families and the Government's renegeing on its promise to create 250,000 jobs.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. 182 in Appendix)

Yeas: 46 Nays: 61 Abstentions: 2

2117

**12 April 2016**

---

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Bonnardel (Granby). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for having increased every Québec citizen's tax burden by an average of \$750 since the beginning of its term in office.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **183** in Appendix)

Yeas: **46** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

---

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Khadir (Mercier). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly of Québec severely censure the Liberal Government for its 2016–2017 budget and its \$2 billion surplus paid in full into the Generations Fund, which keep Québec in a permanent state of austerity and prevent adequate funding of public services, in particular those of the health and social services network.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **184** in Appendix)

Yeas: **20** Nays: **87** Abstentions: **0**

---

**12 April 2016**

---

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Therrien (Sanguinet). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for its austerity policy, which jeopardizes Québec's economic growth.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **185** in Appendix)

Yeas: **46** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

---

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Caire (La Peltrie). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for lacking a credible plan to bridge the remaining \$890 million gap in 2017–2018 program spending.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **186** in Appendix)

Yeas: **44** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **2**

---

**12 April 2016**

---

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Lelièvre (Gaspé). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for the lack of concrete measures meeting the regions' needs, especially those of the resource regions, in its 2016–2017 budget.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **187** in Appendix)

Yeas: **46** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

---

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Lisée (Rosemont). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for having tabled a budget inspired by the practices of Stephen Harper's Conservative Government, which Quebecers rejected massively in the last federal general election.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **188** in Appendix)

Yeas: **29** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **17**

---

**12 April 2016**

---

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Bergeron (Verchères). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for forsaking Québec's formal claim to have the federal contribution to health funding restored to 25% immediately.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **189** in Appendix)

Yeas: **46** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

---

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Poirier (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for having tabled a budget that reduces the amounts allocated to social housing.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **190** in Appendix)

Yeas: **46** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

---

**12 April 2016**

---

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly of Québec severely censure the Liberal Government for its 2016–2017 budget and its support plan in key sectors of the economy that do not clearly promote the Québec economy’s ecological transition.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **191** in Appendix)

Yeas: **46** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

---

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Hivon (Joliette). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for the cutbacks of \$5 million imposed on the Director of Criminal and Penal Prosecutions and for not allocating the \$30 million accumulated in the Crime Victims Assistance Fund and the Access to Justice Fund for the purposes intended.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **192** in Appendix)

Yeas: **46** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

---

**12 April 2016**

---

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Villeneuve (Berthier). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for its successive cuts to La Financière agricole funding.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **193** in Appendix)

Yeas: **46** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

---

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. David (Gouin). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly of Québec severely censure the Liberal Government for its 2016–2017 budget and its Plan for Success in Education and Higher Education, which does not counterbalance the public education system's chronic underfunding caused by budgetary cutbacks made by this government and previous governments.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **194** in Appendix)

Yeas: **46** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

---

**12 April 2016**

---

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Kotto (Bourget). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for the lack of adequate financial means in its 2016–2017 budget for the francization of new Quebecers.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **195** in Appendix)

Yeas: **46** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

---

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Ouellet (René-Lévesque). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for doing nothing to assist or support entrepreneurs and businesses trying to get Québec back on its feet.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **196** in Appendix)

Yeas: **46** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

---



**12 April 2016**

---

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Rochon (Richelieu) This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for its paltry investments in homecare and home-support services.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **197** in Appendix)

Yeas: **46** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

---

Finally, the question was put on the motion moved by Mr. Leitão, Minister of Finance, that the Assembly approve the Government's budgetary policy.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **198** in Appendix)

Yeas: **61** Nays: **46** Abstentions: **0**

## **Government Bills**

### *Passage in Principle*

Mr. Leitão, Minister of Finance, moved that Bill 88, An Act respecting development of the small-scale alcoholic beverage industry, do now pass in principle.

**12 April 2016**

---

After debate thereon, the motion was carried, and Bill 88 was accordingly passed in principle.

Mrs. Vien, Deputy Government House Leader, moved that Bill 88 be referred to the Committee on Public Finance for clause-by-clause consideration.

The motion was carried.

---

Mr. Leitão, Minister of Finance, moved that Bill 75, An Act respecting the restructuring of university-sector defined benefit pension plans and amending various legislative provisions, do now pass in principle.

After debate thereon, the motion was carried, and Bill 75 was accordingly passed in principle.

Mrs. Vien, Deputy Government House Leader, moved that Bill 75 be referred to the Committee on Labour and the Economy for clause-by-clause consideration.

The motion was carried.

### **Debates on Reports from Committees**

The Assembly resumed the debate, which had been adjourned on 6 April 2016, on consideration of the report from the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries, Energy and Natural Resources, which met on 16 and 17 March 2015 to hold public hearings within the framework of special consultations on the farmland grabbing phenomenon. The report contains observations, conclusions and 5 recommendations.

---

At 6.00 o'clock p.m., Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

---

12 April 2016

---

### **Debates upon Adjournment**

At 6.05 o'clock p.m., the Assembly held a debate upon adjournment on a question from Mrs. Poirier (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve) to Mr. Coiteux, Minister of Public Security, about the Minister's power to entrust the Bureau des enquêtes indépendantes with inquiries into allegations that police officers sexually assaulted Aboriginal women.

At 6.18 o'clock p.m., Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 7.30 o'clock p.m.

The proceedings resumed at 7.30 o'clock p.m.

### **Debates on Reports from Committees**

The Assembly resumed the debate on consideration of the report from the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries, Energy and Natural Resources, which met on 16 and 17 March 2015 to hold public hearings within the framework of special consultations on the farmland grabbing phenomenon. The report contains observations, conclusions and 5 recommendations.

The debate expired and, pursuant to Standing Order 95, no question was put.

**12 April 2016**

---

Mr. Sklavounos, Deputy Government House Leader, moved the adjournment of the Assembly until Wednesday, 13 April 2016 at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

The motion was carried.

---

Accordingly, at 20.05 o'clock p.m., Mrs. Gaudreault, Second Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Wednesday, 13 April 2016 at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

**JACQUES CHAGNON**

*President*

12 April 2016

---

**APPENDIX**

**Recorded Divisions**

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Marceau (Rousseau):

**(Division No. 182)**

**YEAS - 46**

Bergeron (PQ)	Lamarre (PQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	Roy (PQ)
Bérubé (PQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	(Vachon)	(Bonaventure)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Lavallée (CAQ)	Pagé (PQ)	Samson (CAQ)
Charette (CAQ)	LeBel (PQ)	Paradis (CAQ)	Soucy (CAQ)
Cousineau (PQ)	Leclair (PQ)	(Lévis)	Spénard (CAQ)
D'Amours (CAQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Péladeau (PQ)	Surprenant (CAQ)
Drainville (PQ)	Léger (PQ)	Picard (CAQ)	Therrien (PQ)
Gaudreault (PQ)	Lelièvre (PQ)	Poirier (PQ)	Traversy (PQ)
(Jonquière)	Lemay (CAQ)	Richard (PQ)	Turcotte (PQ)
Hivon (PQ)	Maltais (PQ)	Rochon (PQ)	Villeneuve (PQ)
Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Marceau (PQ)	Roy (CAQ)	
Khadir (IND)	Martel (CAQ)	(Montarville)	
Kotto (PQ)	Massé (IND)	Roy (IND)	
Laframboise (CAQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	(Arthabaska)	
	(René-Lévesque)		

**NAYS - 61**

Anglade (QLP)	Charlebois (QLP)	Huot (QLP)	Reid (QLP)
Arcand (QLP)	Chevarie (QLP)	Iracà (QLP)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Auger (QLP)	Coiteux (QLP)	Kelley (QLP)	Rousselle (QLP)
Barrette (QLP)	Couillard (QLP)	Leitão (QLP)	Sauvé (QLP)
Bernier (QLP)	D'Amour (QLP)	Lessard (QLP)	Simard (QLP)
Billette (QLP)	Daoust (QLP)	Matte (QLP)	(Dubuc)
Birnbaum (QLP)	David (QLP)	Ménard (QLP)	Simard (QLP)
Blais (QLP)	(Outremont)	Merlini (QLP)	(Charlevoix-Côte-de-Beaupré)
Blanchette (QLP)	de Santis (QLP)	Montpetit (QLP)	Sklavounos (QLP)
Bolduc (QLP)	Fournier (QLP)	Morin (QLP)	St-Denis (QLP)
Boucher (QLP)	Giguère (QLP)	Nichols (QLP)	Tanguay (QLP)
Boulet (QLP)	Girard (QLP)	Ouellette (QLP)	Thériault (QLP)
Bourgeois (QLP)	Habel (QLP)	Plante (QLP)	Tremblay (QLP)
Busque (QLP)	Hamad (QLP)	Poëti (QLP)	Vallée (QLP)
Carrière (QLP)	Hardy (QLP)	Polo (QLP)	Vien (QLP)
Charbonneau (QLP)	Heurtel (QLP)	Proulx (QLP)	Weil (QLP)

**12 April 2016**

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Bonnardel (Granby):

**(Division No. 183)**

*(Identical to Division No. 182)*

---

12 April 2016

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Khadir (Mercier):

**(Division No. 184)**

**YEAS - 20**

Bonnardel (CAQ)	Lavallée (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	Spénard (CAQ)
Charette (CAQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Roy (CAQ)	Surprenant (CAQ)
D'Amours (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	(Montarville)	
Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Roy (IND)	
Khadir (IND)	Massé (IND)	(Arthabaska)	
Laframboise (CAQ)	Paradis (CAQ)	Samson (CAQ)	
Lamontagne (CAQ)	(Lévis)	Soucy (CAQ)	

**NAYS - 87**

Anglade (QLP)	David (QLP)	Maltais (PQ)	Roy (PQ)
Arcand (QLP)	(Outremont)	Marceau (PQ)	(Bonaventure)
Auger (QLP)	de Santis (QLP)	Matte (QLP)	Sauvé (QLP)
Barrette (QLP)	Drainville (PQ)	Ménard (QLP)	Simard (QLP)
Bergeron (PQ)	Fournier (QLP)	Merlini (QLP)	(Charlevoix-Côte-de-Beaupré)
Bernier (QLP)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Montpetit (QLP)	Simard (QLP)
Bérubé (PQ)	(Jonquière)	Morin (QLP)	(Dubuc)
Billette (QLP)	Giguère (QLP)	Nichols (QLP)	Sklavounos (QLP)
Birnbaum (QLP)	Girard (QLP)	Ouellet (PQ)	St-Denis (QLP)
Blais (QLP)	Habel (QLP)	(René-Lévesque)	Tanguay (QLP)
Blanchette (QLP)	Hamad (QLP)	Ouellet (PQ)	Thériault (QLP)
Bolduc (QLP)	Hardy (QLP)	(Vachon)	Therrien (PQ)
Boucher (QLP)	Heurtel (QLP)	Ouellette (QLP)	Traversy (PQ)
Boulet (QLP)	Hivon (PQ)	Pagé (PQ)	Tremblay (QLP)
Bourgeois (QLP)	Huot (QLP)	Péladeau (PQ)	Turcotte (PQ)
Busque (QLP)	Iracà (QLP)	Plante (QLP)	Vallée (QLP)
Carrière (QLP)	Kelley (QLP)	Poëti (QLP)	Vien (QLP)
Charbonneau (QLP)	Kotto (PQ)	Poirier (PQ)	Villeneuve (PQ)
Charlebois (QLP)	Lamarre (PQ)	Polo (QLP)	Weil (QLP)
Chevarie (QLP)	LeBel (PQ)	Proulx (QLP)	
Coiteux (QLP)	Leclair (PQ)	Reid (QLP)	
Couillard (QLP)	Léger (PQ)	Richard (PQ)	
Cousineau (PQ)	Leitão (QLP)	Rochon (PQ)	
D'Amour (QLP)	Lelièvre (PQ)	Rotiroti (QLP)	
Daoust (QLP)	Lessard (QLP)	Rousselle (QLP)	

**12 April 2016**

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Therrien (Sanguinet):

**(Division No. 185)**

*(Identical to Division No. 182)*

---



12 April 2016

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Caire (La Peltrie):

**(Division No. 186)**

**YEAS - 44**

Bergeron (PQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Pagé (PQ)	Samson (CAQ)
Bérubé (PQ)	Lavallée (CAQ)	Paradis (CAQ)	Soucy (CAQ)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	LeBel (PQ)	(Lévis)	Spénard (CAQ)
Charette (CAQ)	Leclair (PQ)	Péladeau (PQ)	Surprenant (CAQ)
Cousineau (PQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	Therrien (PQ)
D'Amours (CAQ)	Léger (PQ)	Poirier (PQ)	Traversy (PQ)
Drainville (PQ)	Lelièvre (PQ)	Richard (PQ)	Turcotte (PQ)
Gaudreault (PQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	Rochon (PQ)	Villeneuve (PQ)
(Jonquière)	Maltais (PQ)	Roy (CAQ)	
Hivon (PQ)	Marceau (PQ)	(Montarville)	
Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Roy (IND)	
Kotto (PQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	(Arthabaska)	
Laframboise (CAQ)	(René-Lévesque)	Roy (PQ)	
Lamarre (PQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	(Bonaventure)	
	(Vachon)		

**NAYS - 61**

Anglade (QLP)	Charlebois (QLP)	Huot (QLP)	Reid (QLP)
Arcand (QLP)	Chevarie (QLP)	Iracà (QLP)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Auger (QLP)	Coiteux (QLP)	Kelley (QLP)	Rousselle (QLP)
Barrette (QLP)	Couillard (QLP)	Leitão (QLP)	Sauvé (QLP)
Bernier (QLP)	D'Amour (QLP)	Lessard (QLP)	Simard (QLP)
Billette (QLP)	Daoust (QLP)	Matte (QLP)	(Dubuc)
Birnbaum (QLP)	David (QLP)	Ménard (QLP)	Simard (QLP)
Blais (QLP)	(Outremont)	Merlini (QLP)	(Charlevoix-Côte-de-Beaupré)
Blanchette (QLP)	de Santis (QLP)	Montpetit (QLP)	Sklavounos (QLP)
Bolduc (QLP)	Fournier (QLP)	Morin (QLP)	St-Denis (QLP)
Boucher (QLP)	Giguère (QLP)	Nichols (QLP)	Tanguay (QLP)
Boulet (QLP)	Girard (QLP)	Ouellette (QLP)	Thériault (QLP)
Bourgeois (QLP)	Habel (QLP)	Plante (QLP)	Tremblay (QLP)
Busque (QLP)	Hamad (QLP)	Poëti (QLP)	Vallée (QLP)
Carrière (QLP)	Hardy (QLP)	Polo (QLP)	Vien (QLP)
Charbonneau (QLP)	Heurtel (QLP)	Proulx (QLP)	Weil (QLP)

**ABSTENTIONS - 2**

Khadir (IND)	Massé (IND)
--------------	-------------

**12 April 2016**

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Lelièvre (Gaspé):

**(Division No. 187)**

*(Identical to Division No. 182)*

---

12 April 2016

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Lisée (Rosemont):

**(Division No. 188)**

**YEAS - 29**

Bergeron (PQ)	Lamarre (PQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	Roy (IND)
Bérubé (PQ)	LeBel (PQ)	(Vachon)	(Arthabaska)
Cousineau (PQ)	Leclair (PQ)	Pagé (PQ)	Therrien (PQ)
Drainville (PQ)	Léger (PQ)	Péladeau (PQ)	Traversy (PQ)
Gaudreault (PQ)	Lelièvre (PQ)	Poirier (PQ)	Turcotte (PQ)
(Jonquière)	Maltais (PQ)	Richard (PQ)	Villeneuve (PQ)
Hivon (PQ)	Marceau (PQ)	Rochon (PQ)	
Khadir (IND)	Massé (IND)	Roy (PQ)	
Kotto (PQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	(Bonaventure)	
	(René-Lévesque)		

**NAYS - 61**

Anglade (QLP)	Charlebois (QLP)	Huot (QLP)	Reid (QLP)
Arcand (QLP)	Chevarie (QLP)	Iracà (QLP)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Auger (QLP)	Coiteux (QLP)	Kelley (QLP)	Rousselle (QLP)
Barrette (QLP)	Couillard (QLP)	Leitão (QLP)	Sauvé (QLP)
Bernier (QLP)	D'Amour (QLP)	Lessard (QLP)	Simard (QLP)
Billette (QLP)	Daoust (QLP)	Matte (QLP)	(Dubuc)
Birnbaum (QLP)	David (QLP)	Ménard (QLP)	Simard (QLP)
Blais (QLP)	(Outremont)	Merlini (QLP)	(Charlevoix-Côte-de-Beaupré)
Blanchette (QLP)	de Santis (QLP)	Montpetit (QLP)	Sklavounos (QLP)
Bolduc (QLP)	Fournier (QLP)	Morin (QLP)	St-Denis (QLP)
Boucher (QLP)	Giguère (QLP)	Nichols (QLP)	Tanguay (QLP)
Boulet (QLP)	Girard (QLP)	Ouellette (QLP)	Thériault (QLP)
Bourgeois (QLP)	Habel (QLP)	Plante (QLP)	Tremblay (QLP)
Busque (QLP)	Hamad (QLP)	Poëti (QLP)	Vallée (QLP)
Carrière (QLP)	Hardy (QLP)	Polo (QLP)	Vien (QLP)
Charbonneau (QLP)	Heurtel (QLP)	Proulx (QLP)	Weil (QLP)

**ABSTENTIONS - 17**

Bonnardel (CAQ)	Lavallée (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	Surprenant (CAQ)
Charette (CAQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Roy (CAQ)	
D'Amours (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	(Montarville)	
Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Samson (CAQ)	
Laframboise (CAQ)	Paradis (CAQ)	Soucy (CAQ)	
Lamontagne (CAQ)	(Lévis)	Spénard (CAQ)	

**12 April 2016**

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Bergeron (Verchères):

**(Division No. 189)**

*(Identical to Division No. 182)*

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Poirier (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve):

**(Division No. 190)**

*(Identical to Division No. 182)*

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques):

**(Division No. 191)**

*(Identical to Division No. 182)*

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Hivon (Joliette):

**(Division No. 192)**

*(Identical to Division No. 182)*

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Villeneuve (Berthier):

**(Division No. 193)**

*(Identical to Division No. 182)*

12 April 2016

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. David (Gouin):

**(Division No. 194)**

*(Identical to Division No. 182)*

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Kotto (Bourget):

**(Division No. 195)**

*(Identical to Division No. 182)*

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Ouellet (René-Lévesque):

**(Division No. 196)**

*(Identical to Division No. 182)*

---

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Rochon (Richelieu):

**(Division No. 197)**

*(Identical to Division No. 182)*

---

12 April 2016

---

On the motion moved by Mr. Leitão, Minister of Finance, that the Assembly approve the Government's budgetary policy:

**(Division No. 198)**

**YEAS - 61**

Anglade ( <i>QLP</i> )	Charlebois ( <i>QLP</i> )	Huot ( <i>QLP</i> )	Reid ( <i>QLP</i> )
Arcand ( <i>QLP</i> )	Chevarie ( <i>QLP</i> )	Iracà ( <i>QLP</i> )	Rotiroti ( <i>QLP</i> )
Auger ( <i>QLP</i> )	Coiteux ( <i>QLP</i> )	Kelley ( <i>QLP</i> )	Rousselle ( <i>QLP</i> )
Barrette ( <i>QLP</i> )	Couillard ( <i>QLP</i> )	Leitão ( <i>QLP</i> )	Sauvé ( <i>QLP</i> )
Bernier ( <i>QLP</i> )	D'Amour ( <i>QLP</i> )	Lessard ( <i>QLP</i> )	Simard ( <i>QLP</i> )
Billette ( <i>QLP</i> )	Daoust ( <i>QLP</i> )	Matte ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Dubuc</i> )
Birnbaum ( <i>QLP</i> )	David ( <i>QLP</i> )	Ménard ( <i>QLP</i> )	Simard ( <i>QLP</i> )
Blais ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Outremont</i> )	Merlini ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Charlevoix-Côte-de-Beaupré</i> )
Blanchette ( <i>QLP</i> )	de Santis ( <i>QLP</i> )	Montpetit ( <i>QLP</i> )	Sklavounos ( <i>QLP</i> )
Bolduc ( <i>QLP</i> )	Fournier ( <i>QLP</i> )	Morin ( <i>QLP</i> )	St-Denis ( <i>QLP</i> )
Boucher ( <i>QLP</i> )	Giguère ( <i>QLP</i> )	Nichols ( <i>QLP</i> )	Tanguay ( <i>QLP</i> )
Boulet ( <i>QLP</i> )	Girard ( <i>QLP</i> )	Ouellette ( <i>QLP</i> )	Thériault ( <i>QLP</i> )
Bourgeois ( <i>QLP</i> )	Habel ( <i>QLP</i> )	Plante ( <i>QLP</i> )	Tremblay ( <i>QLP</i> )
Busque ( <i>QLP</i> )	Hamad ( <i>QLP</i> )	Poëti ( <i>QLP</i> )	Vallée ( <i>QLP</i> )
Carrière ( <i>QLP</i> )	Hardy ( <i>QLP</i> )	Polo ( <i>QLP</i> )	Vien ( <i>QLP</i> )
Charbonneau ( <i>QLP</i> )	Heurtel ( <i>QLP</i> )	Proulx ( <i>QLP</i> )	Weil ( <i>QLP</i> )

**NAYS - 46**

Bergeron ( <i>PQ</i> )	Lamarre ( <i>PQ</i> )	Ouellet ( <i>PQ</i> )	Roy ( <i>PQ</i> )
Bérubé ( <i>PQ</i> )	Lamontagne ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Vachon</i> )	( <i>Bonaventure</i> )
Bonnardel ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lavallée ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Pagé ( <i>PQ</i> )	Samson ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Charette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	LeBel ( <i>PQ</i> )	Paradis ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Soucy ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Cousineau ( <i>PQ</i> )	Leclair ( <i>PQ</i> )	( <i>Lévis</i> )	Spénard ( <i>CAQ</i> )
D'Amours ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Legault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Péladeau ( <i>PQ</i> )	Surprenant ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Drainville ( <i>PQ</i> )	Léger ( <i>PQ</i> )	Picard ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Therrien ( <i>PQ</i> )
Gaudreault ( <i>PQ</i> )	Lelièvre ( <i>PQ</i> )	Poirier ( <i>PQ</i> )	Traversy ( <i>PQ</i> )
( <i>Jonquière</i> )	Lemay ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Richard ( <i>PQ</i> )	Turcotte ( <i>PQ</i> )
Hivon ( <i>PQ</i> )	Maltais ( <i>PQ</i> )	Rochon ( <i>PQ</i> )	Villeneuve ( <i>PQ</i> )
Jolin-Barrette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Marceau ( <i>PQ</i> )	Roy ( <i>CAQ</i> )	
Khadir ( <i>IND</i> )	Martel ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Montarville</i> )	
Kotto ( <i>PQ</i> )	Massé ( <i>IND</i> )	Roy ( <i>IND</i> )	
Laframboise ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Ouellet ( <i>PQ</i> )	( <i>Arthabaska</i> )	
	( <i>René-Lévesque</i> )		