



---

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

---

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-FIRST LEGISLATURE

## **Votes and Proceedings**

**of the Assembly**

**Wednesday, 5 April 2017 — No. 243**

**President of the National Assembly:**  
**Mr. Jacques Chagnon**

---

**QUÉBEC**



The Assembly was called to order at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

---

## **ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

### **Statements by Members**

Mr. Habel (Sainte-Rose) made a statement to congratulate Mrs. Mary Lazaris, Principal of Twin Oaks Elementary School, who was honoured by the organization The Learning Partnership.

---

Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia) made a statement to congratulate Mr. Michel Coutu, winner of the RIDEAU Broadcaster award.

---

Mrs. de Santis (Bourassa-Sauvé) made a statement to underline the 1st anniversary of the Données Québec portal.

---

Mr. Picard (Chutes-de-la-Chaudière) made a statement to underline the 75th anniversary of the Cercle de fermières de Saint-Jean-Chrysostome.

---

Mr. Blanchette (Rouyn-Noranda-Témiscamingue) made a statement to pay tribute to Mrs. Gladys Chamberland, recipient of the Medal of the National Assembly.

**5 April 2017**

---

Mrs. Ouellet (Vachon) made a statement to underline the 25th anniversary of the textile recovery and sorting centre Certex.

---

Mr. Fortin (Sherbrooke) made a statement to underline the 100th birthday of Mrs. Marie-Ange Salois and Mrs. Rose Paquette.

---

Mrs. Roy (Montarville) made a statement to underline the 45th anniversary of Club FADOQ de Boucherville.

---

Mrs. Vallée (Gatineau) made a statement to underline the 25th anniversary of the Ordre des traducteurs, terminologues et interprètes agréés du Québec.

---

Mrs. Poirier (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve) made a statement to congratulate the “Hommage aux femmes” project winners.

---

At 9.52 o’clock a.m., Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

---

The proceedings resumed at 10.01 o’clock a.m.

---

**5 April 2017**

---

Moment of reflection

### **Presenting Papers**

Mr. Fournier, Government House Leader, tabled the following:

The Government's reply to petitions tabled on 21 February 2017 by Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) on increasing social assistance recipients' allowable employment income;

(Sessional Paper No. 3114-20170405)

The Government's reply to petitions tabled on 14 March 2017 by Mr. Birnbaum (D'Arcy-McGee) on the languages used on road safety signage;

(Sessional Paper No. 3115-20170405)

The Government's reply to petitions tabled on 14 March 2017 by Mr. Martel (Nicolet-Bécancour) on restoring and ensuring the sustainability of health services at the Centre Christ-Roi in Nicolet and the Centre multiservices en santé et en services sociaux de Fortierville.

(Sessional Paper No. 3116-20170405)

### **Presenting Reports from Committees**

Mr. Bernier (Montmorency), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Public Finance, which met on 16, 17, 21, 23 and 29 March and on 4 April 2017 for clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 126, An Act to foster the financial health and sustainability of the Pension Plan of Management Personnel and to amend various legislative provisions. The report contains amendments to the bill;

(Sessional Paper No. 3117-20170405)

5 April 2017

---

The report from the Committee on Public Finance, which held public hearings on 30 September, on 17 and 18 November 2015, on 12 and 19 May and on 15 September 2016 within the framework of special consultations on the tax haven phenomenon. The report contains observations, conclusions and 38 recommendations.

(Sessional Paper No. 3118-20170405)

---

Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Institutions, which, on 26 May and 3 June 2015, and on 17 May, 27 September and 4 October 2016, examined the report on the implementation of the *Code of ethics and conduct of the Members of the National Assembly*. The report contains observations and conclusions.

(Sessional Paper No. 3119-20170405)

### Presenting Petitions

Mr. Rochon (Richelieu) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on acquisition of an EBUS bronchoscope for the Hôtel-Dieu de Sorel-Tracy hospital, signed by 2,566 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 3120-20170405)

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mr. Rochon (Richelieu) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on acquisition of an EBUS bronchoscope for the Hôtel-Dieu de Sorel-Tracy hospital, signed by 6,450 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 3121-20170405)

---

**5 April 2017**

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mr. Bourcier (Saint-Jérôme) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on applying the four prevention mechanisms provided for in the *Act respecting occupational health and safety* to all sectors of economic activity in Québec, signed by 7,234 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 3122-20170405)

### **Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 53 and 59, Mr. Lisée, Leader of the Official Opposition, tabled the following:

A copy of a document on Bombardier senior executives' remuneration.

(Sessional Paper No. 3123-20170405)

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 53 and 59, Mr. Therrien (Sanguinet) tabled the following:

A copy of a document on Bombardier senior executives' remuneration.

(Sessional Paper No. 3124-20170405)

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 53 and 59, Mrs. Ouellet (Vachon) tabled the following:

A copy of a document on water supply risks for populations dependent on the Ottawa and St. Lawrence rivers due to the Energy-East pipeline project entitled "Risques pour l'approvisionnement en eau des populations tributaires de la rivière Outaouais et du fleuve Saint-Laurent dus au projet d'oléoduc Énergie-Est".

(Sessional Paper No. 3125-20170405)

5 April 2017

---

### Motions Without Notice

Mr. Ouellet (René-Lévesque), together with Mr. Laframboise (Blainville), Mr. Khadir (Mercier), Mr. Surprenant (Groulx) and Mrs. Ouellet (Vachon), moved a motion concerning the need for binding referendums in urban planning matters; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

---

Mr. Charette (Deux-Montagnes), together with Mr. Therrien (Sanguinet) and Mr. Surprenant (Groulx), moved a motion concerning the condition of roads under the Québec Government's responsibility; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Polo (Laval-des-Rapides), together with Mr. Pagé (Labelle), Mr. Schneeberger (Drummond-Bois-Francis), Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie-Saint-Jacques), Mr. Surprenant (Groulx) and Mrs. Ouellet (Vachon), moved:

THAT the National Assembly mark the wins of the Collège Montmorency Nomades men's and women's basketball teams, who dominated the provincial championships held on 5 March 2017, here in Québec City, at Cégep de Sainte-Foy, for a first double victory in 11 years;

THAT it applaud the Nomades' 11th provincial title in women's basketball and 8th provincial title in men's basketball;

THAT it also underscore the 3rd Canadian Champion title earned by the men's basketball team on 18 March 2017 against Sheridan College;

THAT it recognize the athletic and academic excellence of students Maurane Corbin, Maël Gilles, Andrea Torres, Juliette Gauthier and Frédérique Beauchamp;



**5 April 2017**

---

THAT it recognize the athletic and academic excellence of students Alix Lochard, Kevin Civil, Blondeau Tchoukiegno and Christophe Fortier and applaud their coach, Marc-Olivier Beauchamp, named Coach of the Year by the Canadian Collegiate Athletic Association;

THAT, lastly, it highlight the profound commitment and team spirit shown by these young athletes, who put the spotlight on Collège Montmorency and Laval at the provincial and national levels in the field of collegiate sports.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

---

Mrs. Ouellet (Vachon), together with Mr. Marceau (Rousseau) and Mr. Khadir (Mercier), moved a motion concerning the tax breaks for the super-rich elite; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

#### **Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

Mr. Tanguay, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

- the Committee on Public Finance, to undertake the debate on the Budget Speech;
- the Committee on Institutions, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 98, An Act to amend various legislation mainly with respect to admission to professions and the governance of the professional system.

5 April 2017

---

Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, gave the following notice:

- the Committee on Public Administration shall hold a deliberative meeting to prepare the hearing of the Ministère de la Sécurité publique and the Commission québécoise des libérations conditionnelles on the section of the Auditor General of Québec's fall 2016 report entitled "Correctional Services: Reintegration"; then, hold a public meeting to hear the Ministère de la Sécurité publique and the Commission québécoise des libérations conditionnelles; and finally, hold a deliberative meeting to discuss the observations, conclusions and recommendations, if any, following this hearing.

---

## ORDERS OF THE DAY

### Business Having Precedence

#### *Debate on the Budget Speech*

The Assembly resumed the debate, which had been adjourned on 4 April 2017, on the motion moved by Mr. Leitão, Minister of Finance, that the Assembly approve the Government's budgetary policy, and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Marceau (Rousseau), Mr. Bonnardel (Granby), Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie-Saint-Jacques), Mrs. Léger (Pointe-aux-Trembles), Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia), Mr. Ouellet (René-Lévesque), Mr. Turcotte (Saint-Jean), Mr. Villeneuve (Berthier), Mr. Paradis (Lévis), Mr. Roberge (Chambly), Mrs. Ouellet (Vachon), Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière), Mr. Khadir (Mercier), Mr. Caire (La Peltre) and Mrs. D'Amours (Mirabel), subject to the receivability of these motions.

**5 April 2017**

---

At 12.59 o'clock p.m., Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 3.00 o'clock p.m.

---

The proceedings resumed at 3.00 o'clock p.m.

---

*Debate on the Budget Speech*

The Assembly continued the debate on the motion moved by Mr. Leitão, Minister of Finance, that the Assembly approve the Government's budgetary policy, and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Marceau (Rousseau), Mr. Bonnardel (Granby), Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie-Saint-Jacques), Mrs. Léger (Pointe-aux-Trembles), Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia), Mr. Ouellet (René-Lévesque), Mr. Turcotte (Saint-Jean), Mr. Villeneuve (Berthier), Mr. Paradis (Lévis), Mr. Roberge (Chambly), Mrs. Ouellet (Vachon), Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière), Mr. Khadir (Mercier), Mr. Caire (La Peltre) and Mrs. D'Amours (Mirabel), subject to the receivability of these motions.

Given that 13 hours and 30 minutes had elapsed since Mr. Leitão, Minister of Finance, began the Budget Speech, the debate thereon was suspended in the Assembly to be resumed by the Committee on Public Finance, in accordance with the provisions of Standing Order 275.

**Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition**

Mr. Therrien (Sanguinet) moved:

THAT the National Assembly ask Bombardier executives to forego the increase in their compensation for 2016.

**5 April 2017**

---

Following a meeting with the House leaders, Mrs. Gaudreault, Second Vice-President, informed the Assembly of the allocation of speaking time for the proceedings with respect to this limited debate: 10 minutes to the mover of the motion for his reply; approximately 18 minutes to the parliamentary group forming the Government; approximately 10 minutes 42 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition; approximately 7 minutes 23 seconds to the Second Opposition Group; 1 minute 40 seconds to the Members of Québec solidaire and 37 seconds to the Member for Groulx. Within this framework, any time not used by the independent Members or by a parliamentary group shall be redistributed among the parliamentary groups in the proportions established above. Lastly, individual addresses shall not be limited.

A debate arose thereon.

At the end of her address, Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques) moved:

THAT the motion moved by the Member for Sanguinet  
be amended as follows:

By adding the words “and any future increase as long as  
the company is dependent on public funds”.

The motion, as amended, would read as follows:

THAT the National Assembly ask Bombardier  
executives to forego the increase in their compensation for 2016  
and any future increase as long as the company is dependent on  
public funds.

The debate continued on the main motion moved by Mr. Therrien (Sanguinet) and on the amendment motion moved by Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques), subject to the permission of its author.

Pursuant to Standing Order 98.1, Mr. Therrien (Sanguinet) refused the amendment proposed by Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques).

**5 April 2017**

---

The debate being concluded, the question was put on the motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **300** in Appendix)

Yeas: **43**    Nays: **61**    Abstentions: **0**

### **Government Bills**

#### *Passage in Principle*

Mr. Coiteux, Minister of Municipal Affairs and Land Occupancy, moved that Bill 122, An Act mainly to recognize that municipalities are local governments and to increase their autonomy and powers, do now pass in principle.

A debate arose thereon.

The debate was adjourned in the name of Mr. Ouellet (René-Lévesque).

---

At 5.59 o'clock p.m., Mr. Ouimet, First Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Thursday, 6 April 2017 at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

**JACQUES CHAGNON**

*President*

5 April 2017

---

## APPENDIX

### Recorded Divisions

On the motion moved by Mr. Therrien (Sanguinet):

#### (Division No. 300)

##### YEAS - 43

Bergeron (PQ)	Jean (PQ)	Maltais (PQ)	Roy (PQ)
Bérubé (PQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Marceau (PQ)	(Bonaventure)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Kotto (PQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Roy (CAQ)
Bourcier (PQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Massé (IND)	(Montarville)
Caire (CAQ)	Lamarre (PQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Charette (CAQ)	Lavallée (CAQ)	(René-Lévesque)	Spénard (CAQ)
Cousineau (PQ)	LeBel (PQ)	Pagé (PQ)	Therrien (PQ)
D'Amours (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Paradis (CAQ)	Traversy (PQ)
Fournier (PQ)	Legault (CAQ)	(Lévis)	Turcotte (PQ)
(Marie-Victorin)	Léger (PQ)	Picard (CAQ)	Villeneuve (PQ)
Gaudreault (PQ)	Lelièvre (PQ)	Poirier (PQ)	
(Jonquière)	Lemay (CAQ)	Roberge (CAQ)	
Hivon (PQ)	Lisée (PQ)	Rochon (PQ)	

##### NAYS - 61

Anglade (QLP)	Coiteux (QLP)	Huot (QLP)	Reid (QLP)
Arcand (QLP)	Couillard (QLP)	Iracà (QLP)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Auger (QLP)	D'Amour (QLP)	Kelley (QLP)	Sauvé (QLP)
Barrette (QLP)	David (QLP)	Leitão (QLP)	Simard (QLP)
Bernier (QLP)	de Santis (QLP)	Lessard (QLP)	(Dubuc)
Birnbaum (QLP)	Drolet (QLP)	Melançon (QLP)	Simard (QLP)
Blais (QLP)	Fortin (QLP)	Ménard (QLP)	(Charlevoix-Côte-de-Beaupré)
Blanchette (QLP)	(Sherbrooke)	Merlini (QLP)	St-Denis (QLP)
Bolduc (QLP)	Fortin (QLP)	Montpetit (QLP)	St-Pierre (QLP)
Boucher (QLP)	(Pontiac)	Moreau (QLP)	Tanguay (QLP)
Boulet (QLP)	Fournier (QLP)	Morin (QLP)	Thériault (QLP)
Bourgeois (QLP)	(Saint-Laurent)	Nichols (QLP)	Vallée (QLP)
Busque (QLP)	Giguère (QLP)	Ouellette (QLP)	Vallièrès (QLP)
Carrière (QLP)	Girard (QLP)	Plante (QLP)	Vien (QLP)
Charbonneau (QLP)	Habel (QLP)	Poëti (QLP)	Weil (QLP)
Charlebois (QLP)	Hardy (QLP)	Polo (QLP)	
Chevarie (QLP)	Heurtel (QLP)	Proulx (QLP)	