

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF QUÉBEC

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-SECOND LEGISLATURE

## **Votes and Proceedings**

of the Assembly

Friday, 7 December 2018 – No. 8

President of the National Assembly: Mr. François Paradis

The Assembly was called to order at 9.41 o'clock a.m.

#### **ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

## **Statements by Members**

Mr. Lemay (Masson) made a statement to underline Mascouche residents' generosity during the "Guignolée" campaign.

Mrs. Sauvé (Fabre) made a statement to underline Romania's 100th anniversary.

Mrs. Tardif (Laviolette–Saint-Maurice) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Yvon Leclerc, independent researcher, photographer, graphic artist, director, editor and author of scientific works.

Mr. Tanguay (LaFontaine) made a statement to congratulate the Club de soccer Rivière-des-Prairies for being named Best Club.

Mrs. Guilbault (Louis-Hébert) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Michel Juneau for his volunteer work and community involvement.

Mrs. Perry Mélançon (Gaspé) made a statement to underline the 15th anniversary of the Festival Musique du bout du monde.

Mrs. Picard (Soulanges) made a statement to underline the Centre de femmes La Moisson's initiative to raise awareness about violence against women.

Mrs. Lessard-Therrien (Rouyn-Noranda–Témiscamingue) made a statement to congratulate Mrs. Christine Girard, weightlifter, gold medalist at the London Olympic Games and bronze medallist at the Beijing Olympic Games.

Mr. Roberge (Chambly) made a statement to underline the 20th The Gift of Reading campaign.

Mrs. Melançon (Verdun) made a statement to pay tribute to the Grands Verdunois for their community involvement.

At 9.54 o'clock a.m., Mrs. Soucy, Second Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

The proceedings resumed at 10.02 o'clock a.m.

Moment of reflection

## **Introduction of Bills**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader and Minister of Immigration, Diversity and Inclusiveness, together with Mr. Proulx, Official Opposition House Leader, Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) and Mr. Nadeau-Dubois (Gouin), moved that leave be granted to introduce the following bill:

> 4 An Act to ratify the Agreement relating to the concept of parliamentary group, to the conduct of proceedings in the Assembly and in parliamentary committees as well as to budgetary aspects for the duration of the 42nd Legislature

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, Bill 4 was introduced in the Assembly.

Mrs. Labrie (Sherbrooke) moved that leave be granted to introduce the following bill:

190 An Act to exclude child support payments from income calculation under various social laws

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, Bill 190 was introduced in the Assembly.

## **Presenting Papers**

Mrs. Blais, Minister Responsible for Seniors and Informal Caregivers, tabled the following:

The 2017–2018 annual report on the Québec-wide framework agreement to combat maltreatment of seniors.

(Sessional Paper No. 254-20181207)

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, tabled the following on behalf of Mrs. Girault, Minister of International Relations and La Francophonie:

The 2017–2018 annual report of the Offices jeunesse internationaux du Québec. (Sessional Paper No. 255-20181207)

Mrs. LeBel, Minister of Justice, tabled the following:

The 2017–2018 annual management report of the Directeur des poursuites criminelles et pénales.

(Sessional Paper No. 256-20181207)

Mr. Julien, Minister of Energy and Natural Resources, tabled the following:

The 2017–2018 annual management report of the Ministère de l'Énergie et des Ressources naturelles.

(Sessional Paper No. 257-20181207)

Mr. Dufour, Minister of Forests, Wildlife and Parks, tabled the following:

The 2017–2018 activity report of the Chief Forester.

(Sessional Paper No. 258-20181207)

Mr. Boulet, Minister of Labour, Employment and Social Solidarity, tabled the following:

The 2017–2018 annual management report of the Tribunal administratif du travail.

(Sessional Paper No. 259-20181207)

Mrs. Roy, Minister of Culture and Communications and Minister Responsible for the French Language, tabled the following:

The 2017–2018 annual management report of the Ministère de la Culture et des Communications;

(Sessional Paper No. 260-20181207)

The 2017–2018 annual activity report of the Bibliothèque et Archives nationales du Québec;

(Sessional Paper No. 261-20181207)

The 2017–2018 annual management report of the Conseil supérieur de la langue française;

(Sessional Paper No. 262-20181207)

The 2017–2018 activity report of the Conseil consultatif de la lecture et du livre; (Sessional Paper No. 263-20181207)

The 2017–2018 annual management report of the Office québécois de la langue française, including the activity report of the Commission de toponymie. (Sessional Paper No. 264-20181207)

The President tabled the following:

The investigation report from the Ethics Commissioner to the President of the National Assembly with regard to Mr. François Legault, Leader of the Second Opposition Group and Member for L'Assomption (investigation requested on 2 August 2018).

(Sessional Paper No. 265-20181207)

## **Presenting Petitions**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mr. Arseneau (Îles-dela-Madeleine) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on improving childcare services on the Îles-de-la-Madeleine, signed by 708 citizens of the Îles-de-la-Madeleine.

(Sessional Paper No. 266-20181207)

#### **Complaints of Breach of Privilege or Contempt and Personal Explanations**

The President ruled on the point of privilege or contempt that was initially raised verbally by the Official Opposition House Leader on 28 November 2018, immediately after the Premier gave the Opening Speech of the Session, and then in writing on 29 November 2018, by means of a notice sent to the Chair pursuant to the Standing Orders of the National Assembly. The Official Opposition House Leader alleged that the Premier and his cabinet acted in contempt of Parliament by forwarding his entire Opening Speech to journalists, whereas he had just begun to deliver it in the National Assembly Chamber.

## RULING FROM THE CHAIR

The Chair points out that this is the first point of privilege raised in the National Assembly with regard to disclosure of the content of the Opening Speech of the Session.

However, in 2012, in response to a request for a directive, the Chair had recalled the principles governing delivery of the Opening Speech of the Session. As the Chair did not receive notice of a point of privilege at the time, it did not formally rule on whether premature disclosure of the content of the Opening Speech of the Session constituted prima facie contempt of Parliament. In its directive, the Chair highlighted the importance of the parliamentary principle holding that the Government's general policy directions must be disclosed to the Members in the House before third parties are informed thereof. This principle reaffirms the executive power's respect for the legislative power and respect for the Members' role as overseers of government action. Consequently, the Chair had warned the Members that they needed to be very careful when communicating information intended first and foremost for the Assembly.

Canadian parliamentary jurisprudence yields three precedents on premature disclosure of the Throne Speech—the equivalent to the National Assembly's Opening Speech of the Session. In all three cases, which occurred, in the House of Commons of Canada, the Legislative Assembly of Alberta and the Legislative Assembly of Ontario, respectively, the Speakers concluded that such disclosure did not constitute a breach of parliamentary privilege. The Speakers of these assemblies also drew a parallel with the secret surrounding the Budget Speech's delivery which, in their opinion, is more a matter of parliamentary custom than one of privilege.

Québec parliamentary jurisprudence states that disclosure of the content of a bill before it is introduced in the National Assembly can constitute contempt of Parliament. With regard to the Budget Speech, in the past, like the assemblies in the three abovementioned Canadian cases, the Chair of the National Assembly has held that a Budget Speech-related leak falls outside the scope of parliamentary privilege. In light of these precedents, the Chair considers it inappropriate to differentiate between a Budget Speech leak and premature disclosure of the Opening Speech of the Session. However, the Chair stresses that, while premature disclosure of the Opening Speech of the Session does not fall within the scope of parliamentary privilege, this in no way diminishes its importance.

The Chair considers that the Opening Speech of the Session should not have been given to journalists before it was presented to the Members. In this respect, as in the past, the Chair underscores that certain information must be communicated to the Members before being forwarded to third parties. This is true for bills, reports to be tabled in the Assembly and written questions to be entered on the Order Paper and Notices. The Opening Speech of the Session is now added to this list. It is a matter of deference to the Members and respect for the important duties they perform.

The Chair points out that, as regards this principle, journalists have no special status. They cannot be given documents that Members should be apprised of first. Moreover, a document to be communicated to the Members first cannot be given to journalists beforehand, despite being marked "SOUS EMBARGO" (do not release)". The reason for this is quite simple: doing so deprives the Members of their most legitimate right, namely, the right to know the content of the document before anyone else.

The Chair recalls that excluding the parliamentarians from this communication is problematic, as the Members are unaware of information to which journalists are privy. It is precisely for that reason that the Chair reminds parliamentarians, as it did in a June 2018 ruling, that as concerns the in-camera budget meetings preceding the Finance Minister's Budget Speech, journalists do take part, but the Members are also invited. In that ruling, the Chair mentioned that forwarding the content of a bill under embargo to journalists before the bill is introduced in the Assembly puts the Members in an unfair, undesirable situation. The Chair considers that the same applies to disclosure of the Opening Speech of the Session to third parties before it is read in the House. The President issued a directive on a question raised by the House Leader of the Second Opposition Group on 4 December 2018 on holding a parliamentary commission on the future of information in Québec before the parliamentary committee had ruled on this proposed order of initiative.

#### RULING FROM THE CHAIR

Our parliamentary jurisprudence contains no precedent that specifically addresses a case like the one for which this directive was requested. However, parallels can be drawn with numerous rulings on presuming passage of a bill or knowingly invoking legislative provisions that have not yet been passed. On both of these points, jurisprudence is clear and consistent: invoking legislative provisions that are still undergoing consideration in the National Assembly in order to take action or implying that a bill has force of law in public comments or communications could constitute contempt of Parliament.

Whenever such an issue has been submitted to the Chair, the latter has recognized the Government's right and duty to inform citizens, but also the requirement that such communications reflect respect for and deference to the Assembly and its Members. The public must not have the impression that a proposed measure is a *fait accompli* and that Parliament has no role to play in examining and passing it.

In its communications, the Government should be careful not to diminish the parliamentarians' role by giving the impression that they have no role to play in deciding whether or not to adopt an order of initiative.

Parliamentary committees adopt proposed orders of initiative if a majority of the members from each parliamentary group has voted in their favour. The Government, therefore, cannot impose an order of initiative on a given matter on a committee. An announcement like the one made on 30 November 2018 creates confusion as to the Government's involvement in a procedure available to the Members sitting on a committee. That being said, despite the intention voiced by the Minister, the competent committee will maintain its full autonomy and its ability to freely decide when the proposed order of initiative is officially submitted to it.

The Chair wishes to remind all Members to bear in mind the deference they must show to the Assembly and its Members. This applies even more so to the Members constituting the Cabinet, as they are called on to communicate a great many decisions and announcements to the public, which then require parliamentary action for these measures to materialize.

#### **Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

## **Deferred Divisions**

The Assembly took the divisions, which had been deferred at the sitting of 6 December 2018, on the motions stating a grievance moved during the debate on the Opening Speech of the Session and on the motion moved by Mr. Legault, Premier, that the Assembly approve the Government's general policy.

First, the question was put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Arcand, Leader of the Official Opposition. This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ Government for its lack of rigour and for calling into question the accounting principles used by the Ministère des Finances and validated by the Auditor General, thereby undermining citizens' confidence in our institutions and jeopardizing sound management of the State.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 6 in Appendix)

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Bérubé, Leader of the Second Opposition Group. This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly censure the Government for its lack of concrete, detailed, quantified commitments to improve the services offered to Quebecers.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 7 in Appendix)

Yeas: 43 Nays: 64 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Massé, Leader of the Third Opposition Group. This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Coalition avenir Québec Government for its weak environmental protection guidelines, particularly with regard to fighting climate change and reducing greenhouse gas emissions.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 8 in Appendix)

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. LeBel (Rimouski). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Government for its lack of concrete, detailed, quantified commitments to fight poverty in Québec.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 9 in Appendix)

Yeas: 43 Nays: 64 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Labrie (Sherbrooke). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly censure the Coalition avenir Québec Government for its lack of an overall vision and coherence with regard to early education and early childhood educational services.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **10** in Appendix)

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ Government, which refuses to listen to early childhood and education partners regarding the impact that kindergarten classes for all four-year-old children would have on the childcare services and education networks.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **11** in Appendix)

Yeas: 43 Nays: 64 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Fortin (Pontiac). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ Government for choosing ideology over science and ignoring public health experts regarding the minimum age for the purchase and possession of cannabis.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **12** in Appendix)

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Anglade (Saint-Henri–Sainte-Anne). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ Government, which refuses to recognize that the number one issue for Québec's economic development is the human resources shortage.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **13** in Appendix)

Yeas: 24 Nays: 73 Abstentions: 10

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Government for its refusal to commit to attaining the 2020 greenhouse gas reduction target.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 14 in Appendix)

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Fontecilla (Laurier-Dorion). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Coalition avenir Québec Government for its intention to lower immigration targets over the coming years.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **15** in Appendix)

Yeas: 43 Nays: 64 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. David (Marguerite-Bourgeoys). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ Government, which is completely abandoning the most vulnerable members of our society and ignoring the social services needs of citizens and community organizations at a time when it has major budgetary surpluses.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 16 in Appendix)

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Lessard-Therrien (Rouyn-Noranda–Témiscamingue). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Coalition avenir Québec Government for failing to announce measures supporting the ecological conversion of the agricultural sector.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **17** in Appendix)

Yeas: 43 Nays: 64 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Ouellet (René-Lévesque). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Government for its lack of willingness to support our regions, in particular eastern Québec, and the lack of clear, tangible commitments to promote their development.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 18 in Appendix)

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Melançon (Verdun). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ Government, which has left Québec's cultural milieu with no response as to maintaining the sums linked to Québec's cultural policy launched by the previous government.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **19** in Appendix)

Yeas: 43 Nays: 64 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Birnbaum (D'Arcy-McGee). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ Government and the Premier for lacking a humanist vision of the future of government relations with the First Nations and the Inuit, with whom we share Québec's territory.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 20 in Appendix)

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Marissal (Rosemont). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Coalition avenir Québec Government for the absence of any concrete commitment to reinvest in public services.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 21 in Appendix)

Yeas: 43 Nays: 64 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Ghazal (Mercier). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Coalition avenir Québec Government for its project to create a third link between Lévis and Québec City.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 22 in Appendix)

Yeas: 18 Nays: 89 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Barrette (La Pinière). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ Government for promising infrastructure projects without additional funding, suggesting to the population that they could be carried out without affecting current projects.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 23 in Appendix)

Yeas: 43 Nays: 64 Abstentions: 0

Finally, the question was then put on the motion moved by Mr. Legault, Premier, that the Assembly approve the Government's general policy.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 24 in Appendix)

## **Motions Without Notice**

After consultation with the Opposition parties and the independent Member, Mrs. LeBel, Minister of Justice, moved the following, on behalf of Mr. Legault, Premier:

> THAT, in accordance with sections 58, 58.1 and 58.3 of the *Charter of human rights and freedoms* (chapter C-12), Me Marie Laure Leclercq be appointed a part-time member of the Commission des droits de la personne et des droits de la jeunesse for a five-year term, effective immediately.

The question was put on the motion, and a recorded division was taken as required for the application of section 58 of the *Charter of human rights and freedoms*.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 25 in Appendix)

Yeas: 98 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 9

After consultation with the Opposition parties and the independent Member, Mrs. LeBel, Minister of Justice, moved the following, on behalf of Mr. Legault, Premier:

> THAT, in accordance with sections 58, 58.1 and 58.3 of the *Charter of human rights and freedoms* (chapter C-12), Me Anne-Marie Santorineos be appointed a part-time member of the Commission des droits de la personne et des droits de la jeunesse for a five-year term, effective immediately.

The question was put on the motion, and a recorded division was taken as required for the application of section 58 of the *Charter of human rights and freedoms*.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 26 in Appendix)

Yeas: 98 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 9

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Arcand, Leader of the Official Opposition, together with Mrs. Roy, Minister of Culture and Communications, Mrs. Melançon (Verdun), Mr. LeBel (Rimouski), Mrs. Massé, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, and Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey), moved:

THAT the National Assembly mark the passing of Mr. François Macerola on 8 November 2018;

THAT it applaud his outstanding contribution to Québec art and culture;

THAT, lastly, the Members of this Assembly observe a minute of silence in his memory.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

At the request of Mrs. Soucy, Second Vice-President, the Assembly observed a minute of silence.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia), together with Mrs. Guilbault, Deputy Premier, Mr. Arcand, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mrs. Massé, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, and Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey), moved:

THAT the National Assembly pay tribute to Mr. Bernard Landry, Premier of Québec from 2001 to 2003, Deputy Premier from 1994 to 2001, Minister of State for Economic Development, Minister of Foreign Trade, Minister of International Relations, Minister of Finance, Minister of International Affairs, Immigration and Cultural Communities, Minister of Industry, Commerce, Science and Technology, Minister of Revenue and, most importantly, Member for Fabre and Laval-des-Rapides, between 1976 and 1985, then Member for Verchères, from 1994 to 2005, for his extraordinary contribution to the development of modern-day Québec;

THAT it applaud, in particular, his contribution to the rise of a multimedia sector and to the signing of the Paix des Braves as well as his loyalty to his pro-independence convictions;

THAT the Members of the Assembly observe a minute of silence in his memory.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

At the request of Mrs. Soucy, Second Vice-President, the Assembly observed a minute of silence.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mrs. Lessard-Therrien (Rouyn-Noranda–Témiscamingue), together with Mr. Bonnardel, Minister of Transport, Mr. Fortin (Pontiac), Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin) and Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey), moved:

THAT the National Assembly recognize that the Rouyn-Noranda Airport is the third largest in Québec; THAT it express its concern about NAV Canada's plan to replace the Flight Information Services currently managed by a human by an automated system at night, despite the fact that these services are recognized by users as being efficient, reliable, safe and necessary for the regions' economic development and for emergency medical evacuations;

THAT the National Assembly ask NAV Canada to maintain the services offered to air carriers so as to take remote regions' needs and specific requirements into account.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Martel (Nicolet-Bécancour), together with Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine), moved:

THAT the National Assembly recognize the expertise of the Davie shipyard in Lévis, which, in recent years, has shown its ability to carry out complex naval contracts;

THAT it ask the Federal Government to adjust its National Shipbuilding Strategy so that Québec obtains its fair share of federal contracts;

THAT it ask the Federal Government to endorse the Senate's recommendation to proceed immediately with renewal of the Canadian Coast Guard's aging icebreaking fleet;

THAT it ask the Federal Government to grant a contract, in the short term, for a second Resolve-class interim supply ship.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 21, the proceedings continued past 1.00 o'clock p.m.

#### **ORDERS OF THE DAY**

#### **Joint Bills**

## Passage in Principle

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 236 and 237, Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader and Minister of Immigration, Diversity and Inclusiveness, Mr. Proulx, Official Opposition House Leader, Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) and Mr. Nadeau-Dubois (Gouin), moved that Bill 4, An Act to ratify the Agreement relating to the concept of parliamentary group, to the conduct of proceedings in the Assembly and in parliamentary committees as well as to budgetary aspects for the duration of the 42nd Legislature, do now pass in principle.

The motion was carried and Bill 4 was accordingly passed in principle.

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, moved that Bill 4 be referred to the Committee of the Whole for clause-by-clause consideration.

The motion was carried.

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, moved that the Assembly resolve itself into a Committee of the Whole for the clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 4, An Act to ratify the Agreement relating to the concept of parliamentary group, to the conduct of proceedings in the Assembly and in parliamentary committees as well as to budgetary aspects for the duration of the 42nd Legislature. The motion was carried.

Committee of the Whole

Bill 4 was considered in the Committee of the Whole and thereupon reported.

The report was concurred in.

Passage

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 22 and 230, Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader and Minister of Immigration, Diversity and Inclusiveness, Mr. Proulx, Official Opposition House Leader, Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) and Mr. Nadeau-Dubois (Gouin), moved the passage of Bill 4, An Act to ratify the Agreement relating to the concept of parliamentary group, to the conduct of proceedings in the Assembly and in parliamentary committees as well as to budgetary aspects for the duration of the 42nd Legislature.

The motion was carried and, accordingly, Bill 4 was passed.

At 1.09 o'clock p.m., Mrs. Soucy, Second Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Tuesday, 5 February 2019 at 1.40 o'clock p.m.

## ROYAL ASSENT

On Friday, 7 December 2018 at 2.00 o'clock p.m. in the Office of the Lieutenant-Governor, in the presence of Mrs. Durepos, Director of the Sittings Service and Delegate of the Secretary General, the Honourable J. Michel Doyon, Lieutenant-Governor of Québec, was pleased to assent to the following bill:

4 An Act to ratify the Agreement relating to the concept of parliamentary group, to the conduct of proceedings in the Assembly and in parliamentary committees as well as to budgetary aspects for the duration of the 42nd Legislature

## FRANÇOIS PARADIS

President

## APPENDIX

## **Recorded Divisions**

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Arcand, Leader of the Official Opposition:

## (Division No. 6)

## **YEAS - 43**

Anglade ( <i>QLP</i> ) Arcand ( <i>QLP</i> ) Arseneau ( <i>PQ</i> ) Barrette ( <i>QLP</i> ) Benjamin ( <i>QLP</i> ) Bérubé ( <i>PQ</i> ) Birnbaum ( <i>QLP</i> ) Charbonneau ( <i>QLP</i> ) Fontecilla ( <i>QS</i> ) Fortin ( <i>QLP</i> ) Fournier ( <i>PQ</i> ) Gaudreault ( <i>PQ</i> ) ( <i>Jonquière</i> )	Ghazal (QS) Hivon (PQ) Kelley (QLP) Labrie (QS) LeBel (PQ) (Rimouski) Leduc (QS) Leitão (QLP) Lessard-Therrien (QS) Maccarone (QLP) Marissal (QS) Massé (QS) Melançon (QLP)	Ménard ( <i>QLP</i> ) Montpetit ( <i>QLP</i> ) Nadeau-Dubois ( <i>QS</i> ) Nichols ( <i>QLP</i> ) Ouellet ( <i>PQ</i> ) Ouellette ( <i>IND</i> ) Perry Mélançon ( <i>PQ</i> ) Polo ( <i>QLP</i> ) Proulx ( <i>QLP</i> ) ( <i>Jean-Talon</i> ) Rizqy ( <i>QLP</i> ) Robitaille ( <i>QLP</i> ) Rotiroti ( <i>QLP</i> )	Rousselle ( <i>QLP</i> ) Roy ( <i>PQ</i> ) ( <i>Bonaventure</i> ) Sauvé ( <i>QLP</i> ) St-Pierre ( <i>QLP</i> ) Tanguay ( <i>QLP</i> ) Weil ( <i>QLP</i> ) Zanetti ( <i>QS</i> )		
(Jonquiere)	Wielaliçoli (QLF)	Kotiloti (QLF)			
NAYS - 64					
Allaire (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	Lavallée (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)		
Bachand (CAQ)	Foster (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Reid (CAQ)		
Bélanger (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	(Champlain)	Roberge ( $CAQ$ )		
Blais (CAQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Lecours $(CAQ)$	Rouleau (CAQ)		
(Prévost)	Girard (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	$\operatorname{Roy}\left(CAQ\right)$		
Blais (CAQ)	(Groulx)	Lecours $(CAQ)$	(Montarville)		
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Grondin (CAQ)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Schneeberger ( $CAQ$ )		
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Lefebvre ( $CAQ$ )	Simard $(CAQ)$		
Boulet (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Lemay $(CAQ)$	Skeete ( $CAQ$ )		
Bussière (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)		
Caire $(CAQ)$	Jacques (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	(Laviolette-Saint-Maurice)		
Campeau (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	Tardif (CAQ)		
Carmant ( $CAQ$ )	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	(Rivière-du-Loup–Témiscouata)		
Caron $(CAQ)$	Julien (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Thouin (CAQ)		
Charest $(CAQ)$	Lachance (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)		
Charette ( $CAQ$ )	Lacombe (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)			
Chassin (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)			
Dansereau (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	(Soulanges)			
Dubé (CAQ)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)			
Dufour (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)			
Émond (CAQ)	Lamothe (CAQ)	(Côte-du-Sud)			

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Bérubé, Leader of the Second Opposition Group:

## (Division No. 7)

(Identical to Division No. 6)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Massé, Leader of the Third Opposition Group:

(Division No. 8)

(Identical to Division No. 6)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. LeBel (Rimouski):

(Division No. 9)

(Identical to Division No. 6)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Labrie (Sherbrooke):

(Division No. 10)

(Identical to Division No. 6)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent):

(Division No. 11)

(Identical to Division No. 6)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Fortin (Pontiac):

(Division No. 12)

(Identical to Division No. 6)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Anglade (Saint-Henri–Sainte-Anne):

#### (Division No. 13)

## **YEAS - 24**

Anglade (QLP)	Kelley (QLP)	Polo (QLP)	Sauvé (QLP)	
Arcand (QLP)	Leitão (QLP)	Proulx (QLP)	St-Pierre (QLP)	
Barrette (QLP)	Maccarone (QLP)	(Jean-Talon)	Tanguay (QLP)	
Benjamin (QLP)	Melançon (QLP)	Rizqy ( <i>QLP</i> )	Weil (QLP)	
Birnbaum (QLP)	Ménard (QLP)	Robitaille (QLP)		
Charbonneau (QLP)	Montpetit (QLP)	Rotiroti (QLP)		
Fortin (QLP)	Nichols (QLP)	Rousselle ( <i>QLP</i> )		

#### NAYS - 73

$A = \frac{1}{2} $
Allaire $(CAQ)$
Bachand (CAQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)
(Abitibi-Ouest)
Blais (CAQ)
(Prévost)
Bonnardel (CAQ)
Boulet (CAQ)
Bussière (CAQ)
Caire $(CAQ)$
Campeau (CAQ)
Carmant ( $CAQ$ )
Caron $(CAQ)$
Charest $(CAQ)$
Charette ( $CAQ$ )
Chassin $(CAQ)$
Dansereau (CAQ)
Dubé (CAQ)
Dufour (CAQ)
Émond ( $CAQ$ )
Fitzgibbon ( $\widetilde{CAQ}$ )
Fontecilla $(QS)$

Foster (CAQ) Ghazal (QS)Girard (CAQ) (Lac-Saint-Jean) Girard (CAQ) (Groulx) Grondin (CAQ) Guilbault (CAQ) Hébert (CAQ) Isabelle (CAQ) Jacques (CAQ) Jeannotte (CAQ) Jolin-Barrette (CAQ) Julien (CAQ) Labrie (QS)Lachance (CAQ)Lacombe (CAQ)Laforest (CAQ) Laframboise (CAQ) Lafrenière (CAQ) Lamontagne (CAQ) Lamothe (CAQ)Lavallée (CAQ)

LeBel (CAQ) (Champlain) Lecours (CAQ) (Les Plaines) Lecours (CAQ) (Lotbinière-Frontenac) Leduc (QS)Lefebvre (CAQ) Lemay (CAQ)Lemieux (CAQ) Lessard-Therrien (QS)Lévesque (CAQ) (Chauveau) Lévesque (CAQ) (Chapleau) Marissal (QS) Martel (CAQ) Massé (QS) McCann (CAQ) Nadeau-Dubois (QS) Picard (CAQ) (Soulanges)

#### **ABSTENTIONS - 10**

Arseneau (PQ)
Bérubé (PQ)
Fournier $(PQ)$
Gaudreault (PQ)
(Jonquière)

Hivon (PQ) LeBel (PQ) (Rimouski) Ouellet (PQ) Ouellette (*IND*) Perry Mélançon (*PQ*) Roy (*PQ*) (*Bonaventure*)

Poulin (CAQ)

Proulx (CAQ) (Côte-du-Sud) Provençal (CAQ) Reid (CAQ) Roberge (CAQ) Rouleau (CAQ) Roy (CAQ) (Montarville) Schneeberger (CAQ) Simard (CAQ) Skeete (CAQ) Tardif (CAO) (Laviolette-Saint-Maurice) Tardif (CAQ) (Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata) Thouin (CAQ) Tremblay (CAQ) Zanetti (QS)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière):

## (Division No. 14)

## **YEAS - 43**

Arcand $(QLP)$ Hivon $(PQ)$ Montpetit $(QLP)$ Roy $(PQ)$ Arseneau $(PQ)$ Kelley $(QLP)$ Nadeau-Dubois $(QS)$ $(Bonaventure)$ Barrette $(QLP)$ Labrie $(QS)$ Nichols $(QLP)$ Sauvé $(QLP)$ Benjamin $(QLP)$ LeBel $(PQ)$ Ouellet $(PQ)$ St-Pierre $(QLP)$ Bérubé $(PQ)$ $(Rimouski)$ Ouellette $(IND)$ Tanguay $(QLP)$ Birnbaum $(QLP)$ Leduc $(QS)$ Perry Mélançon $(PQ)$ Weil $(QLP)$ Charbonneau $(QLP)$ Leitão $(QLP)$ Polo $(QLP)$ Zanetti $(QS)$ Fontecilla $(QS)$ Lessard-Therrien $(QS)$ Proulx $(QLP)$ Fortin $(QLP)$ Maccarone $(QLP)$ $(Iean-Talon)$	Anglade ( <i>QLP</i> )	Ghazal (QS)	Ménard (QLP)	Rousselle ( <i>QLP</i> )
Arseneau $(PQ)$ Kelley $(QLP)$ Nadeau-Dubois $(QS)$ (Bonaventure)Barrette $(QLP)$ Labrie $(QS)$ Nichols $(QLP)$ Sauvé $(QLP)$ Benjamin $(QLP)$ LeBel $(PQ)$ Ouellet $(PQ)$ St-Pierre $(QLP)$ Bérubé $(PQ)$ (Rimouski)Ouellette $(IND)$ Tanguay $(QLP)$ Birnbaum $(QLP)$ Leduc $(QS)$ Perry Mélançon $(PQ)$ Weil $(QLP)$ Charbonneau $(QLP)$ Leitão $(QLP)$ Polo $(QLP)$ Zanetti $(QS)$ Fontecilla $(QS)$ Lessard-Therrien $(QS)$ Proulx $(QLP)$	Arcand (QLP)	Hivon $(PQ)$	Montpetit (QLP)	$\operatorname{Roy}(PQ)$
Benjamin $(QLP)$ LeBel $(PQ)$ Ouellet $(PQ)$ St-Pierre $(QLP)$ Bérubé $(PQ)$ $(Rimouski)$ Ouellette $(IND)$ Tanguay $(QLP)$ Birnbaum $(QLP)$ Leduc $(QS)$ Perry Mélançon $(PQ)$ Weil $(QLP)$ Charbonneau $(QLP)$ Leitão $(QLP)$ Polo $(QLP)$ Zanetti $(QS)$ Fontecilla $(QS)$ Lessard-Therrien $(QS)$ Proulx $(QLP)$	Arseneau (PQ)	Kelley (QLP)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	(Bonaventure)
Bérubé $(PQ)$ $(Rimouski)$ Ouellette $(IND)$ Tanguay $(QLP)$ Birnbaum $(QLP)$ Leduc $(QS)$ Perry Mélançon $(PQ)$ Weil $(QLP)$ Charbonneau $(QLP)$ Leitão $(QLP)$ Polo $(QLP)$ Zanetti $(QS)$ Fontecilla $(QS)$ Lessard-Therrien $(QS)$ Proulx $(QLP)$	Barrette ( <i>QLP</i> )	Labrie $(QS)$	Nichols ( <i>QLP</i> )	Sauvé (QLP)
Birnbaum $(QLP)$ Leduc $(QS)$ Perry Mélançon $(PQ)$ Weil $(QLP)$ Charbonneau $(QLP)$ Leitão $(QLP)$ Polo $(QLP)$ Zanetti $(QS)$ Fontecilla $(QS)$ Lessard-Therrien $(QS)$ Proulx $(QLP)$	Benjamin (QLP)	LeBel $(PQ)$	Ouellet $(PQ)$	St-Pierre ( <i>QLP</i> )
Charbonneau $(QLP)$ Leitão $(QLP)$ Polo $(QLP)$ Zanetti $(QS)$ Fontecilla $(QS)$ Lessard-Therrien $(QS)$ Proulx $(QLP)$	Bérubé (PQ)	(Rimouski)	Ouellette (IND)	Tanguay (QLP)
Charbonneau $(QLP)$ Leitão $(QLP)$ Polo $(QLP)$ Zanetti $(QS)$ Fontecilla $(QS)$ Lessard-Therrien $(QS)$ Proulx $(QLP)$	Birnbaum ( <i>QLP</i> )	Leduc $(QS)$	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	Weil (QLP)
	Charbonneau (QLP)	Leitão (QLP)		Zanetti (QS)
Fortin $(OLP)$ Maccarone $(OLP)$ $(Lean-Talon)$	Fontecilla (QS)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	Proulx ( <i>QLP</i> )	
	Fortin (QLP)	Maccarone (QLP)	(Jean-Talon)	
Fournier (PQ) Marissal (QS) Rizqy (QLP)	Fournier (PQ)	Marissal (QS)	Rizqy ( <i>QLP</i> )	
Gaudreault ( $PQ$ ) Massé ( $QS$ ) Robitaille ( $QLP$ )	Gaudreault ( $PQ$ )	Massé (QS)	Robitaille (QLP)	
(Jonquière) Melançon (QLP) Rotiroti (QLP)	(Jonquière)	Melançon (QLP)	Rotiroti (QLP)	
NAYS - 64		NAYS - (	64	
Allaire (CAQ)Fitzgibbon (CAQ)Lavallée (CAQ)Provençal (CAQ)	Allaire (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	Lavallée (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Bachand (CAQ)Foster (CAQ)LeBel (CAQ)Reid (CAQ)	Bachand (CAQ)	Foster (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Reid (CAQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)Girard (CAQ)(Champlain)Roberge (CAQ)	Bélanger (CAQ)	Girard $(CAQ)$		Roberge $(CAQ)$
Blais (CAQ)(Lac-Saint-Jean)Lecours (CAQ)Rouleau (CAQ)	Blais (CAQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Lecours (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)
(Prévost) Girard (CAQ) (Les Plaines) Roy (CAQ)	(Prévost)	Girard $(CAQ)$	(Les Plaines)	Roy $(CAQ)$
Blais (CAQ)(Groulx)Lecours (CAQ)(Montarville)	Blais $(CAQ)$	(Groulx)	Lecours $(CAQ)$	(Montarville)
(Abitibi-Ouest) Grondin (CAQ) (Lotbinière-Frontenac) Schneeberger (CAQ)	(Abitibi-Ouest)		(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Bonnardel (CAQ)Guilbault (CAQ)Lefebvre (CAQ)Simard (CAQ)	Bonnardel (CAQ)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Simard $(CAQ)$
Boulet (CAQ)Hébert (CAQ)Lemay (CAQ)Skeete (CAQ)	Boulet (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Lemay $(CAQ)$	Skeete ( $CAQ$ )
Bussière ( $CAQ$ )Isabelle ( $CAQ$ )Lemieux ( $CAQ$ )Tardif ( $CAQ$ )	Bussière (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	Lemieux ( $CAQ$ )	× ~
Caire (CAQ)Jacques (CAQ)Lévesque (CAQ)(Laviolette-Saint-Maurice)	Caire $(CAQ)$			(Laviolette–Saint-Maurice)
Campeau ( $CAQ$ )Jeannotte ( $CAQ$ )( $Chauveau$ )Tardif ( $CAQ$ )	Campeau (CAQ)	Jeannotte ( $CAQ$ )	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
Carmant (CAQ)Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)Lévesque (CAQ)(Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata)				-
Caron (CAQ)Julien (CAQ)(Chapleau)Thouin (CAQ)	Caron (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Thouin $(CAQ)$
Charest (CAQ)Lachance (CAQ)Martel (CAQ)Tremblay (CAQ)	Charest (CAQ)	Lachance $(CAQ)$	Martel (CAQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Charette ( $CAQ$ )Lacombe ( $CAQ$ )McCann ( $CAQ$ )	Charette ( $CAQ$ )	· ~ ·	McCann (CAQ)	
Chassin (CAQ) Laforest (CAQ) Picard (CAQ)			· ~ /	
Dansereau (CAQ)Laframboise (CAQ)(Soulanges)	· ~ ~ /			
Dubé ( $CAQ$ )Lafrenière ( $CAQ$ )Poulin ( $CAQ$ )		· ~ ~ /		
Dufour $(CAQ)$ Lamontagne $(CAQ)$ Proulx $(CAQ)$				
	Émond (CAQ)	Lamothe (CAQ)	(Côte-du-Sud)	

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Fontecilla (Laurier-Dorion):

(Division No. 15)

(Identical to Division No. 14)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. David (Marguerite-Bourgeoys):

(Division No. 16)

(Identical to Division No. 14)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Lessard-Therrien (Rouyn-Noranda–Témiscamingue):

(Division No. 17)

(Identical to Division No. 14)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Ouellet (René-Lévesque):

(Division No. 18)

(Identical to Division No. 14)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Melançon (Verdun):

(Division No. 19)

(Identical to Division No. 14)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Birnbaum (D'Arcy-McGee):

(Division No. 20)

(Identical to Division No. 14)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Marissal (Rosemont):

(Division No. 21)

(Identical to Division No. 14)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Ghazal (Mercier):

## (Division No. 22)

## **YEAS - 18**

Arseneau (PQ) Bérubé (PQ) Fontecilla (QS) Fournier (PQ) Gaudreault (PQ) (Jonquière)	Ghazal (QS) Hivon (PQ) Labrie (QS) LeBel (PQ) (Rimouski) Leduc (QS)	Lessard-Therrien (QS) Marissal (QS) Massé (QS) Nadeau-Dubois (QS) Ouellet (PQ) Perry Mélançon (PQ)	Roy ( <i>PQ</i> ) ( <i>Bonaventure</i> ) Zanetti ( <i>QS</i> )
	NAYS - 8	9	
Allaire ( $CAQ$ ) Anglade ( $QLP$ ) Arcand ( $QLP$ ) Bachand ( $CAQ$ ) Barrette ( $QLP$ ) Bélanger ( $CAQ$ ) Benjamin ( $QLP$ ) Birnbaum ( $QLP$ ) Blais ( $CAQ$ ) ( $Prévost$ ) Blais ( $CAQ$ ) ( $Abitibi-Ouest$ ) Bonnardel ( $CAQ$ ) Boulet ( $CAQ$ ) Boulet ( $CAQ$ ) Bussière ( $CAQ$ ) Caire ( $CAQ$ ) Campeau ( $CAQ$ )	Émond ( $CAQ$ ) Fitzgibbon ( $CAQ$ ) Fortin ( $QLP$ ) Foster ( $CAQ$ ) Girard ( $CAQ$ ) ( $Lac$ -Saint-Jean) Girard ( $CAQ$ ) ( $Groulx$ ) Grondin ( $CAQ$ ) Guilbault ( $CAQ$ ) Hébert ( $CAQ$ ) Hébert ( $CAQ$ ) Jacques ( $CAQ$ ) Jacques ( $CAQ$ ) Jacques ( $CAQ$ ) Jolin-Barrette ( $CAQ$ ) Julien ( $CAQ$ ) Kelley ( $QLP$ )	Lecours (CAQ) (Les Plaines) Lecours (CAQ) (Lotbinière-Frontenac) Lefebvre (CAQ) Leitão (QLP) Lemay (CAQ) Léwesque (CAQ) (Chauveau) Lévesque (CAQ) (Chapleau) Maccarone (QLP) Martel (CAQ) McCann (CAQ) Melançon (QLP)	Proulx $(QLP)$ (Jean-Talon) Provençal $(CAQ)$ Reid $(CAQ)$ Rizqy $(QLP)$ Roberge $(CAQ)$ Robitaille $(QLP)$ Rotiroti $(QLP)$ Rouleau $(CAQ)$ Rousselle $(QLP)$ Roy $(CAQ)$ (Montarville) Sauvé $(QLP)$ Schneeberger $(CAQ)$ Simard $(CAQ)$ Skeete $(CAQ)$ St-Pierre $(QLP)$
Carmant ( $CAQ$ ) Caron ( $CAQ$ ) Charbonneau ( $QLP$ ) Charest ( $CAQ$ ) Charette ( $CAQ$ ) Chassin ( $CAQ$ ) Dansereau ( $CAQ$ ) Dubé ( $CAQ$ ) Dubé ( $CAQ$ ) Dufour ( $CAQ$ )	Lachance $(CAQ)$ Lacombe $(CAQ)$ Laforest $(CAQ)$ Laframboise $(CAQ)$ Lafrenière $(CAQ)$ Lamontagne $(CAQ)$ Lamothe $(CAQ)$ Lavallée $(CAQ)$ LeBel $(CAQ)$ (Champlain)	Montpetit ( <i>QLP</i> ) Nichols ( <i>QLP</i> ) Ouellette ( <i>IND</i> ) Picard ( <i>CAQ</i> ) ( <i>Soulanges</i> ) Polo ( <i>QLP</i> ) Poulin ( <i>CAQ</i> ) Proulx ( <i>CAQ</i> ) ( <i>Côte-du-Sud</i> )	Tanguay (QLP) Tardif (CAQ) (Laviolette–Saint-Maurice) Tardif (CAQ) (Rivière-du-Loup–Témiscouata) Thouin (CAQ) Tremblay (CAQ) Weil (QLP)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Barrette (La Pinière):

(Division No. 23)

(Identical to Division No. 21)

On the motion moved by Mr. Legault, Premier, that the Assembly approve the Government's general policy:

## (Division No. 24)

YEAS - 64					
Allaire (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	Lavallée (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)		
Bachand ( $\widetilde{CAQ}$ )	Foster (CAQ)	LeBel $(CAQ)$	Reid (CAQ)		
Bélanger $(CAQ)$	Girard $(CAQ)$	(Champlain)	Roberge $(CAQ)$		
Blais (CAQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Lecours $(CAQ)$	Rouleau ( $CAQ$ )		
(Prévost)	Girard (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	Roy(CAQ)		
Blais (CAQ)	(Groulx)	Lecours $(CAQ)$	(Montarville)		
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Grondin (CAQ)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Schneeberger (CAQ)		
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Guilbault ( $CAQ$ )	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Simard $(CAQ)$		
Boulet (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Lemay $(CAQ)$	Skeete $(CAQ)$		
Bussière $(CAQ)$	Isabelle $(CAQ)$	Lemieux ( $CAQ$ )	Tardif $(CAQ)$		
Caire $(CAQ)$	Jacques $(CAQ)$	Lévesque $(CAQ)$	(Laviolette-Saint-Maurice)		
Campeau (CAQ)	Jeannotte ( $CAQ$ )	(Chauveau)	Tardif ( $CAQ$ )		
Carmant $(CAQ)$	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	(Rivière-du-Loup–Témiscouata)		
Caron $(CAQ)$	Julien (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Thouin (CAQ)		
Charest $(CAQ)$	Lachance (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Tremblay ( $CAQ$ )		
Charette ( $CAQ$ )	Lacombe (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)			
Chassin (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)			
Dansereau ( $CAQ$ )	Laframboise (CAQ)	(Soulanges)			
Dubé (CAQ)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)			
Dufour (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Proulx $(CAQ)$			
Émond (CAQ)	Lamothe (CAQ)	(Côte-du-Sud)			
NAYS - 43					
Anglade (QLP)	Ghazal (QS)	Ménard (QLP)	Rousselle (QLP)		
Arcand (QLP)	Hivon $(PQ)$	Montpetit (QLP)	$\operatorname{Roy}\left(PQ\right)$		
Arseneau (PQ)	Kelley (QLP)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	(Bonaventure)		
Barrette ( <i>QLP</i> )	Labrie (QS)	Nichols (QLP)	Sauvé ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Benjamin (QLP)	LeBel $(PQ)$	Ouellet $(PQ)$	St-Pierre ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Bérubé (PQ)	(Rimouski)	Ouellette (IND)	Tanguay ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Birnbaum ( <i>QLP</i> )	Leduc (QS)	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	Weil ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Charbonneau (QLP)	Leitão (QLP)	Polo ( <i>QLP</i> )	Zanetti (QS)		
Fontecilla (QS)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	Proulx ( <i>QLP</i> )			
Fortin (QLP)	Maccarone (QLP)	(Jean-Talon)			
Fournier $(PQ)$	Marissal (QS)	Rizqy (QLP)			
Gaudreault (PQ)	Massé (QS)	Robitaille (QLP)			
(Jonquière)	Melançon (QLP)	Rotiroti (QLP)			

On the motion moved by Mrs. LeBel, Minister of Justice, on behalf of Mr. Legault, Premier, that Me Marie Laure Leclercq be appointed a part-time member of the Commission des droits de la personne et des droits de la jeunesse:

## (Division No. 25)

YEAS - 98				
Allaire (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Proulx ( <i>QLP</i> )	
Anglade ( <i>QLP</i> )	Fortin (QLP)	(Champlain)	(Jean-Talon)	
Arcand (QLP)	Foster (CAQ)	Lecours $(CAQ)$	Provençal (CAQ)	
Arseneau (PQ)	Fournier (PQ)	(Les Plaines)	Reid $(CAQ)$	
Bachand (CAQ)	Gaudreault ( $PQ$ )	Lecours $(CAQ)$	Rizqy ( <i>QLP</i> )	
Barrette (QLP)	(Jonquière)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Roberge $(CAQ)$	
Bélanger (CAQ)	Girard $(CAQ)$	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Robitaille (QLP)	
Benjamin (QLP)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Leitão (QLP)	Rotiroti (QLP)	
Bérubé (PQ)	Girard ( $CAQ$ )	Lemay (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)	
Birnbaum (QLP)	(Groulx)	Lemieux ( $CAQ$ )	Rousselle (QLP)	
Blais (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	$\operatorname{Roy}\left(PQ\right)$	
(Prévost)	Guilbault (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	(Bonaventure)	
Blais (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	$\operatorname{Roy}\left(CAQ\right)$	
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Hivon $(PQ)$	(Chapleau)	(Montarville)	
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	Maccarone (QLP)	Sauvé (QLP)	
Boulet ( $CAQ$ )	Jacques (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Schneeberger ( $CAQ$ )	
Bussière (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)	Simard (CAQ)	
Caire (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Melançon (QLP)	Skeete (CAQ)	
Campeau (CAQ)	Julien ( $CAQ$ )	Ménard (QLP)	St-Pierre (QLP)	
Carmant ( $CAQ$ )	Kelley (QLP)	Montpetit (QLP)	Tanguay ( <i>QLP</i> )	
Caron ( $CAQ$ )	Lachance $(CAQ)$	Nichols (QLP)	Tardif ( $CAQ$ )	
Charbonneau (QLP)	Lacombe $(CAQ)$	Ouellet $(PQ)$	(Laviolette–Saint-Maurice)	
Charest $(CAQ)$	Laforest (CAQ)	Ouellette (IND)	Tardif ( $CAQ$ )	
Charette ( $CAQ$ )	Laframboise (CAQ)	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	(Rivière-du-Loup–Témiscouata)	
Chassin $(CAQ)$	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Picard $(CAQ)$	Thouin (CAQ)	
Dansereau (CAQ)	Lamontagne ( $CAQ$ )	(Soulanges)	Tremblay (CAQ)	
Dubé (CAQ)	Lamothe $(CAQ)$	Polo (QLP)	Weil ( <i>QLP</i> )	
Dufour (CAQ)	Lavallée (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)		
Émond ( <i>CAQ</i> )	LeBel $(PQ)$	Proulx $(CAQ)$		
	(Rimouski)	(Côte-du-Sud)		
ABSTENTIONS - 9				
Fontecilla (QS)	Leduc $(QS)$	Massé (QS)		
Ghazal (QS)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)		
Labrie (QS)	Marissal (QS)	Zanetti (QS)		

On the motion moved by Mrs. LeBel, Minister of Justice, on behalf of Mr. Legault, Premier, that Me Anne-Marie Santorineos be appointed a part-time member of the Commission des droits de la personne et des droits de la jeunesse:

(Division No. 26)

(Identical to Division No. 25)