



---

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF QUÉBEC

---

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-SECOND LEGISLATURE

## **Votes and Proceedings**

**of the Assembly**

**Thursday, 21 March 2019 — No. 23**

**President of the National Assembly:  
Mr. François Paradis**

---



The Assembly was called to order at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

---

## ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS

### Statements by Members

Mr. Campeau (Bourget) made a statement to underline the retirement of Mrs. Mireille Giroux, Director General of the organization Mercier-Ouest Quartier en Santé.

---

Mrs. Gaudreault (Hull) made a statement to underline the 20th anniversary of Maison Mathieu-Froment-Savoie (1997).

---

Mrs. IsaBelle (Huntingdon) made a statement to congratulate two farms in Huntingdon riding for their ranking among the 25 Top Managed Herds of 2018 in Canada.

---

Mrs. Weil (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce) made a statement to underline the creation of the Habilitas Foundation.

---

Mrs. Soucy (Saint-Hyacinthe) made a statement to congratulate the swimmer Mrs. Andréanne Patry-Landry on her participation in the Special Olympics in Abu Dhabi.

**21 March 2019**

---

Mr. Nadeau-Dubois (Gouin) made a statement in support of students' grievances regarding paid internships.

---

Mrs. Hébert (Saint-François) made a statement to congratulate Maison Jeunes-Est for the youth support it provides.

---

Mrs. Hivon (Joliette) made a statement to underline the 125th anniversary of the Chambre de commerce du Grand Joliette.

---

Mr. Julien (Charlesbourg) made a statement to pay tribute to young Thomas Ratté, the victim of a road accident.

---

Mr. Allaire (Maskinongé) made a statement to underline the merging of the companies Divel, Epsilia and Pluritag.

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 54.1 and 54.3, Mr. Lefebvre (Arthabaska) made a statement to underline the Semaine nationale de la francophonie.

---

At 9.53 o'clock a.m., Mr. Picard, First Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

---

**21 March 2019**

---

The proceedings resumed at 10.01 o'clock a.m.

---

Moment of reflection

### **Presenting Papers**

Mr. Dubé, Minister Responsible for Government Administration and Chair of the Conseil du trésor, transmitted the following message from the Honourable Lieutenant-Governor of Québec to the President, who communicated it to the Assembly:

#### **OFFICE OF THE LIEUTENANT-GOVERNOR**

In accordance with the provisions of section 54 of the *Constitution Act, 1867*, I hereby transmit the estimates of expenditure for the fiscal year ending 31 March 2020 to the National Assembly and recommend the said estimates to it for consideration.

Québec City, 21 March 2019

J. Michel Doyon

Mr. Dubé, Minister Responsible for Government Administration and Chair of the Conseil du trésor, tabled the following:

Expenditure Management Strategy – 2019–2020 Expenditure Budget – Volume 1  
(French and English versions);

(Sessional Paper No. 445-20190321)

Annual Expenditure Management Plans of the Departments and Bodies – 2019–  
2020 Expenditure Budget – Volume 2 (French and English versions);

(Sessional Paper No. 446-20190321)

Estimates of the Departments and Bodies – 2019–2020 Expenditure Budget –  
Volume 3 (French and English versions);

(Sessional Paper No. 447-20190321)

**21 March 2019**

---

Special Funds Budget – 2019–2020 Expenditure Budget – Volume 4 (French and English versions);

(Sessional Paper No. 448-20190321)

Budget of the Bodies Other than Budget-Funded Bodies – 2019–2020 Expenditure Budget – Volume 5 (French and English versions);

(Sessional Paper No. 449-20190321)

Estimates and Annual Expenditure Management Plans of the National Assembly and Persons Appointed by the National Assembly – 2019–2020 Expenditure Budget – Volume 6 (French and English versions);

(Sessional Paper No. 450-20190321)

Additional Information – 2019–2020 Expenditure Budget – Volume 7 (French and English versions);

(Sessional Paper No. 451-20190321)

Québec's Public Infrastructures, March 2019 – 2019–2029 Québec Infrastructure Plan – 2019–2020 Annual Management Plans for Public Infrastructure Investments – 2019–2020 Expenditure Budget – Volume 8 (French and English versions);

(Sessional Paper No. 452-20190321)

2019–2020 Expenditure Budget in Brief.

(Sessional Paper No. 453-20190321)

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, moved:

THAT, pursuant to Standing Order 280, the estimates of expenditure for the fiscal year ending 31 March 2020 be referred to a Committee of the Whole for consideration and for concurrence in one quarter of the said estimates.

The motion was carried.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 53, the Assembly took Motions Without Notice.

**21 March 2019**

---

**Motions Without Notice**

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, moved:

THAT, pursuant to the provisions of subparagraph 4.1 of the first paragraph of Standing Order 87 and Standing Orders 280 and 281, the Assembly consider and concur in Interim Supply for the 2019–2020 fiscal year as provided hereinafter;

THAT, as soon as Orders of the Day for the 26 March 2019 sitting are called, the Assembly resolve itself into a Committee of the Whole and consider Interim Supply as follows:

THAT, for a period not exceeding 1 hour, an exchange take place between the Minister Responsible for Government Administration and Chair of the Conseil du trésor and the Members in Opposition;

THAT, immediately thereafter, and for a period not exceeding 1 hour, an exchange take place between the Minister of Immigration, Diversity and Inclusiveness and the Members in Opposition;

THAT, immediately thereafter, and for a period not exceeding 1 hour, an exchange take place between the Minister of Health and Social Services and the Members in Opposition;

THAT, at 6.00 o'clock p.m., the Committee of the Whole suspend its proceedings and that the proceedings of the Assembly be suspended until 7.30 o'clock p.m.;

THAT, at 7.30 o'clock p.m., the Committee of the Whole continue its proceedings and, if necessary, be able to conclude the exchange between the Members in Opposition and the Minister of Health and Social Services;

**21 March 2019**

---

THAT, immediately thereafter and for a period not exceeding 1 hour, an exchange take place between the Minister of the Environment and the Fight Against Climate Change and the Members in Opposition;

THAT, immediately thereafter and for a period not exceeding 1 hour, an exchange take place between the Minister of Education and Higher Education and the Members in Opposition;

THAT, immediately upon conclusion of this exchange, the Chair of the Committee of the Whole put the question for concurrence in one quarter of the estimates of expenditure for the 2019–2020 fiscal year;

THAT the Chair of the Committee of the Whole then report to the Assembly and that the question for concurrence in such report and the question for passage of the consequent appropriation bill be put without debate, pursuant to the first paragraph of Standing Order 281;

THAT, lastly, pursuant to the second paragraph of Standing Order 281, the Government House Leader be permitted to move a motion without notice that may not be debated stating that the main estimates of expenditure, save those of the National Assembly, be referred to the Standing Committees for consideration;

THAT the opening statements for each of the exchanges with the aforementioned Ministers not exceed 5 minutes 34 seconds for the parliamentary group forming the Government; 3 minutes 43 seconds for the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition; 56 seconds for the Second Opposition Group; 56 seconds for the Third Opposition Group; and 51 seconds for the independent Members as a whole;

THAT, for each of the exchanges with the aforementioned Ministers, a period of 1 minute 30 seconds per hour be set aside for exchanges with the independent Members as a whole;



**21 March 2019**

---

THAT any time not used by the independent Members be redistributed proportionally among the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition, the Second Opposition Group and the Third Opposition Group;

THAT the President of the Assembly or the Chair of the Committee of the Whole be permitted to suspend the proceedings at any time;

THAT, despite Standing Order 20, the Committee of the Whole and the Assembly be permitted to continue their proceedings until the latter has voted on the appropriation bill and on the motion for referral of all of the estimates of expenditure, save those of the National Assembly, for consideration in the Standing Committees;

THAT this motion become an order of the Assembly and take precedence over any incompatible provisions of the Standing Orders.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

---

The President tabled the following:

The new seating plan of the National Assembly, dated 21 March 2019.  
(Sessional Paper No. 454-20190321)

### **Presenting Reports from Committees**

Mr. Provençal (Beauce-Nord), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Health and Social Services, which held public hearings on 20 March 2019 within the framework of special consultations on Bill 7, An Act respecting certain terms of employment applicable to officers of the health and social services network.

(Sessional Paper No. 455-20190321)

**21 March 2019**

---

### **Presenting Petitions**

Mr. Roy (Bonaventure) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on the government assessment and action plan with regard to cancer prevention, signed by 688 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 456-20190321)

---

Mr. Chassin (Saint-Jérôme) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on using vitamin C infusion therapies in Québec, signed by 119,875 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 457-20190321)

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mr. Roy (Bonaventure) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on the government assessment and action plan with regard to cancer prevention, signed by 1,128 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 458-20190321)

### **Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

**21 March 2019**

---

### **Deferred Divisions**

The Assembly took the division, which had been deferred at the sitting of 20 March 2019, on the motion moved by Mr. Barrette (La Pinière) during Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition.

This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly ask the CAQ Government to honour its commitment to reimburse \$1.4 billion to Hydro-Québec customers.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **41** in Appendix)

Yeas: **39**   Nays: **67**   Abstentions: **0**

### **Motions Without Notice**

Mrs. Ghazal (Mercier), together with Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved a motion on taxi drivers and Bill 17, An Act respecting remunerated passenger transportation by automobile; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

---

Mr. Roy (Bonaventure), together with Mrs. Montpetit (Maurice-Richard), Mrs. Lessard-Therrien (Rouyn-Noranda-Témiscamingue), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved a motion on farmland grabbing; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

---

**21 March 2019**

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Fitzgibbon, Minister of Economy and Innovation, together with Mrs. Anglade (Saint-Henri-Sainte-Anne), Mrs. Ghazal (Mercier), Mr. LeBel (Rimouski), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly mark Québec Retail Trade Week, which runs from 17 to 23 March 2019, and pay tribute to retailers for their contribution to the Québec economy;

THAT the National Assembly highlight the importance of ensuring tax fairness between e-commerce and retail trade to ensure Québec's prosperity.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

---

Mrs. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent), together with Mr. Nadeau-Dubois (Gouin), Mr. Roy (Bonaventure), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved a motion on psychology internship bursaries; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

---

Pursuant to Standing Order 129, Mr. Lebel (Rimouski) moved:

THAT the Member for Îles-de-la-Madeleine be named a permanent member of the Committee on Transportation and the Environment;

THAT the Member for Rimouski be named a permanent member of the Committee on Institutions in substitution for the Member for Matane-Matapédia;

THAT these changes take effect immediately.

The motion was carried.

### **Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

- the Committee on Culture and Education, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 12, An Act to clarify the scope of the right to free education and to allow the regulation of certain financial contributions that may be required;
- the Committee on Public Finance, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 3, An Act to establish a single school tax rate;
- the Committee on Institutions, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 1, An Act to amend the rules governing the appointment and dismissal of the Anti-Corruption Commissioner, the Director General of the Sûreté du Québec and the Director of Criminal and Penal Prosecutions;
- the Committee on Labour and the Economy, to undertake clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 10, An Act to amend the Pay Equity Act mainly to improve the pay equity audit process.

---

Mr. Picard, First Vice-President, gave the following notice:

- the Committee on Culture and Education shall hold a deliberative meeting to discuss the possibility of carrying out two orders of initiative.

**21 March 2019**

---

**Information on the Proceedings of the Assembly**

Mr. Picard, First Vice-President, informed the Assembly that on Friday, 29 March 2019, Mrs. Ghazal (Mercier) would question Mr. Charette, Minister of the Environment and the Fight Against Climate Change, during an interpellation on Québec's actual capacity to fight climate change within Canada.

---

**ORDERS OF THE DAY**

*Passage in Principle*

The Assembly resumed the debate, which had been adjourned on 20 March 2019, on the motion moved by Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Minister of Immigration, Diversity and Inclusiveness, that Bill 9, An Act to increase Québec's socio-economic prosperity and adequately meet labour market needs through successful immigrant integration, do now pass in principle.

---

At 1.00 o'clock p.m., Mr. Picard, First Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 3.00 o'clock p.m.

---

The proceedings resumed at 3.00 o'clock p.m.

---

**21 March 2019**

---

The Assembly continued the debate on the motion moved by Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Minister of Immigration, Diversity and Inclusiveness, that Bill 9, An Act to increase Québec's socio-economic prosperity and adequately meet labour market needs through successful immigrant integration, do now pass in principle.

At 3.59 o'clock p.m., Mrs. Soucy, Second Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 4.00 o'clock p.m.

Accordingly, pursuant to Standing Order 87.4, the debate on the motion moved by Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Minister of Immigration, Diversity and Inclusiveness, was adjourned in the name of Mrs. Thériault (Anjou–Louis-Riel).

---

The proceedings resumed at 4.03 o'clock p.m.

---

### **Business Having Precedence**

#### *Budget Speech*

Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, delivered the Budget Speech.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 53, Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, tabled the following documents during his address:

Budget Speech – Budget 2019–2020 (French and English versions);  
(Sessional Paper No. 459-20190321)

Budget Plan – Budget 2019–2020 (French and English versions);  
(Sessional Paper No. 460-20190321)

**21 March 2019**

---

Additional Information – Budget 2019–2020 (French and English versions);  
(Sessional Paper No. 461-20190321)

Budget in Brief – Budget 2019–2020 (French and English versions);  
(Sessional Paper No. 462-20190321)

Summary of consolidated budgetary transactions – 2018–2019 preliminary  
results – Table 1;  
(Sessional Paper No. 463-20190321)

Summary of consolidated budgetary transactions – 2019–2020 forecast – Table  
2;  
(Sessional Paper No. 464-20190321)

Consolidated revenues – 2019–2020 forecast – Table 3;  
(Sessional Paper No. 465-20190321)

Consolidated expenditures – 2019–2020 forecast – Table 4;  
(Sessional Paper No. 466-20190321)

Consolidated expenditures – 2019–2020 forecast – Table 5;  
(Sessional Paper No. 467-20190321)

Non-budgetary transactions – 2019–2020 forecast – Table 6.  
(Sessional Paper No. 468-20190321)

At the end of his address, Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, moved that the  
Assembly approve the Government's budgetary policy.

Mr. Leitão (Robert-Baldwin) commented on behalf of the Official Opposition.

Mr. Marissal (Rosemont) commented on behalf of the Second Opposition Group.

Mr. Ouellet (René-Lévesque) commented on behalf of the Third Opposition  
Group.



**21 March 2019**

---

**Government Bills**

*Passage in Principle*

The Assembly resumed the debate on the motion moved by Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Minister of Immigration, Diversity and Inclusiveness, that Bill 9, An Act to increase Québec's socio-economic prosperity and adequately meet labour market needs through successful immigrant integration, do now pass in principle.

The debate was adjourned in the name of Mr. Derraji (Nelligan).

---

At 6.00 o'clock p.m., Mrs. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Tuesday, 26 March 2019 at 1.40 o'clock p.m.

**FRANÇOIS PARADIS**

*President*

21 March 2019

---

## APPENDIX

### Recorded Divisions

On the motion moved by Mr. Barrette (La Pinière):

#### (Division No. 41)

##### YEAS - 39

Anglade ( <i>QLP</i> )	Fournier ( <i>IND</i> )	Melançon ( <i>QLP</i> )	Roy ( <i>PQ</i> )
Barrette ( <i>QLP</i> )	Gaudreault ( <i>PQ</i> )	Ménard ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Bonaventure</i> )
Benjamin ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Jonquière</i> )	Montpetit ( <i>QLP</i> )	Sauvé ( <i>QLP</i> )
Bérubé ( <i>PQ</i> )	Ghazal ( <i>QS</i> )	Nadeau-Dubois ( <i>QS</i> )	Tanguay ( <i>QLP</i> )
Birnbaum ( <i>QLP</i> )	Hivon ( <i>PQ</i> )	Ouellette ( <i>IND</i> )	Thériault ( <i>QLP</i> )
Charbonneau ( <i>QLP</i> )	Kelley ( <i>QLP</i> )	Perry Melançon ( <i>PQ</i> )	Weil ( <i>QLP</i> )
Ciccone ( <i>QLP</i> )	Labrie ( <i>QS</i> )	Proulx ( <i>QLP</i> )	Zanetti ( <i>QS</i> )
David ( <i>QLP</i> )	LeBel ( <i>PQ</i> )	( <i>Jean-Talon</i> )	
Derraji ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Rimouski</i> )	Richard ( <i>PQ</i> )	
Dorion ( <i>QS</i> )	Leduc ( <i>QS</i> )	Rizqy ( <i>QLP</i> )	
Fontecilla ( <i>QS</i> )	Lessard-Therrien ( <i>QS</i> )	Robitaille ( <i>QLP</i> )	
Fortin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Maccarone ( <i>QLP</i> )	Rotiroti ( <i>QLP</i> )	

##### NAYS - 67

Allaire ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Émond ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lavallée ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Proulx ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Asselin ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Fitzgibbon ( <i>CAQ</i> )	LeBel ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Berthier</i> )
Bachand ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Foster ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Champlain</i> )	Provençal ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Bélanger ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Girard ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lecours ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Reid ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Blais ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Lac-Saint-Jean</i> )	( <i>Lotbinière-Frontenac</i> )	Roberge ( <i>CAQ</i> )
( <i>Prévost</i> )	Girault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lecours ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Rouleau ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Blais ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Grondin ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Les Plaines</i> )	Roy ( <i>CAQ</i> )
( <i>Abitibi-Ouest</i> )	Guilbault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lefebvre ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Montarville</i> )
Bonnardel ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Guillemette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Legault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Schneeberger ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Boulet ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Hébert ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lemay ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Simard ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Caire ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Isabelle ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lemieux ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Skeete ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Campeau ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Jacques ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Tardif ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Carmant ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Jeannotte ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Chauveau</i> )	( <i>Laviolette-Saint-Maurice</i> )
Caron ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Jolin-Barrette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Tardif ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Charest ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Julien ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Chapleau</i> )	( <i>Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata</i> )
Charette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lachance ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Martel ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Thouin ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Chassé ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lacombe ( <i>CAQ</i> )	McCann ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Tremblay ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Chassin ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Laforest ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Picard ( <i>CAQ</i> )	
D'Amours ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Laframboise ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Soulanges</i> )	
Dansereau ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lafrenière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Poulin ( <i>CAQ</i> )	
Dufour ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lamontagne ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Proulx ( <i>CAQ</i> )	
		( <i>Côte-du-Sud</i> )	