



NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF QUÉBEC

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-SECOND LEGISLATURE

Votes and Proceedings

of the Assembly

Thursday, 18 April 2019 — No. 35

**President of the National Assembly:
Mr. François Paradis**

The Assembly was called to order at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS

Statements by Members

Mr. Lévesque (Chauveau) made a statement to underline Distillerie de Québec's success.

Mr. Rousselle (Vimont) made a statement to underline World Day for Safety and Health at Work and Memorial Day for Persons Killed or Injured on the Job.

Mr. Picard (Chutes-de-la-Chaudière) made a statement to underline the Orchestre d'harmonie des Chutes' 25th anniversary.

Mr. Arcand (Mont-Royal-Outremont) made a statement to pay tribute to Mrs. Lorraine Vaillancourt, recipient of the Medal of the National Assembly.

Mrs. Lachance (Bellechasse) made a statement to congratulate judoka Miss Coralie Godbout, gold medalist at the Canada Games.

18 April 2019

Mr. Skeete (Sainte-Rose) made a statement to underline the success of the company Les Moteurs Nordresa.

Mrs. Lavallée (Repentigny) made a statement to underline the 20th anniversary of the Coopérative en soutien à domicile de la MRC de L'Assomption.

Mrs. Perry Mélançon (Gaspé) made a statement to congratulate Mr. Éric Brodeur, Shell Science Lab Challenge winner.

Mr. Charette (Deux-Montagnes) made a statement to underline Earth Day.

Mr. Tremblay (Dubuc) made a statement to underline the Centre d'employabilité de La Baie's work.

At 9.51 o'clock a.m., Mrs. Soucy, Second Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

The proceedings resumed at 10.01 o'clock a.m.

18 April 2019

Moment of reflection

Introduction of Bills

Mr. Dubé, Minister Responsible for Government Administration and Chair of the Conseil du trésor, moved that leave be granted to introduce the following bill:

- 23 An Act respecting the names and responsibilities of certain ministers and government departments and to enact the Act respecting the Ministère des Forêts, de la Faune et des Parcs

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, Bill 23 was introduced in the Assembly.

Mr. Picard (Chutes-de-la-Chaudière) moved that leave be granted to introduce the following bill:

- 390 An Act to replace the Act respecting the Amicale des anciens parlementaires du Québec

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, Bill 390 was introduced in the Assembly.

Presenting Papers

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, tabled the following:

The Government's reply to petitions tabled on 19 March 2019 by Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) on excluding income from support payments in calculating various benefits.

(Sessional Paper No. 546-20190418)

18 April 2019

The President ruled on the point of privilege raised by the Leader of the Second Opposition Group on 9 April 2019 regarding calling attention to the lack of quorum in the course of a debate during Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition.

RULING FROM THE CHAIR

According to Section 8 of the *Act respecting the National Assembly*, when the Assembly's 125 Members are sitting, quorum is 13 Members if a committee is sitting and 21 if not. The Chair has no discretion regarding application of the quorum rule. Thus, when attention is called to a lack of quorum, the Chair must suspend the proceedings until it sees that the Assembly once again has the quorum required to sit.

Since the Government controls the essence of the Assembly's daily order of business, the implicit obligation to maintain quorum for debate on the measures it proposes is its responsibility. However, in the case at hand, we must determine who is responsible for maintaining the Assembly's quorum for a debate during Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition.

Such business may be entered on the *Order Paper and Notices* by a Member of an opposition group able to maintain quorum in the House, by an opposition group unable to maintain quorum or by an independent Member. It is especially in these latter cases that the question of how to enforce quorum arises.

In the Chair's view, all Members should contribute to maintaining quorum to the extent they are able. A majority government with many Members must play a key role in maintaining quorum. But an opposition group should also make an effort in keeping with its resources when a Wednesday motion is debated. As concerns the Second and Third Opposition Groups, each has the right to a limited number of Wednesday motions per year. So, as far as possible, they should prioritize their Members' presence in the House for debates on business they enter on the *Order Paper and Notices*. In this context, debates on Wednesday motions should never be prevented or delayed, given that they constitute too important a measure in a parliamentary democracy.

In the past, on several occasions, a parliamentary group with few Members or an independent Member has moved a motion under Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition without the quorum rule creating a real problem. These precedents clearly show that Parliament can operate with the current rules.

18 April 2019

The Chair appeals to Members' sense of responsibility to ensure that proceedings and debates on matters entered under Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition run smoothly.

In a parliamentary assembly, the House leaders are responsible for ensuring that things run smoothly. The Chair understands that political strategy is also part of their role. However, it considers that this should never take precedence over the Assembly's functioning.

The Chair would like to point out that, several times, it has had to rule on requests for directives which, in its opinion, could have been settled differently. The Chair considers that it should be called on only as a last resort to decide on matters that, basically, concern the organization of parliamentary proceedings.

The Chair sets out what it would like to see in matters of quorum in the future. First, the Government is responsible for maintaining quorum, especially in the context of a majority government, as is currently the case. Second, an Opposition Group must do everything it can to have the most Members present when one of its Wednesday motions is debated. Third, the Government must ensure quorum for a debate on a matter entered on the *Order Paper and Notices* by an independent Member. Finally, no debate on business entered on the *Order Paper and Notices* by an Opposition Member should be suspended due to a lack of quorum. In fact, prior discussions between the House leaders should be held to prevent this from happening.

The Chair indicates that if the Members wish, the quorum rule can be added to the list of topics to be debated in the context of the parliamentary reform. The Chair asks the Members to reflect on this in the future, to ensure that parliamentary proceedings run efficiently and smoothly.

Oral Questions and Answers

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

18 April 2019

Motions Without Notice

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), together with Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly take note of the results of the consultation of Québec's health and social services assistants;

THAT it recognize the current crisis in the home care support service sector and commit to implementing the measures needed to resolve this crisis;

THAT it acknowledge the essential contribution health and social services assistants make to the interdisciplinary work done in Québec CLSCs to ensure beneficiaries of safe, quality care and services;

THAT the National Assembly affirm the importance of ensuring that home care support service organization and work organization guarantee the physical and psychological well-being of the people working in this field.

The question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 86 in Appendix)

Yeas: **107** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

18 April 2019

Mr. Ouellet (René-Lévesque), together with Mrs. Anglade (Saint-Henri–Sainte-Anne), Mr. Marissal (Rosemont) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved a motion on the appointment of the President and Chief Executive Officer of Investissement Québec; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mrs. Girault, Minister of International Relations and La Francophonie, together with Mrs. Dorion (Taschereau), Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly applaud the appointment of a Quebecer, Mrs. Catherine Cano, as Administrator of the Organisation internationale de la Francophonie;

THAT it reiterate the Québec Government's desire to support the Organisation in its mission and its management and accountability modernization efforts;

THAT it reiterate its support for the Organisation's goals, in particular to defend and promote the French language, gender equality, sustainable economic development, support for young people, democracy and human rights;

THAT the Assembly encourage La Francophonie efforts in Africa, where 34 countries are Organisation members and which will represent 40% of the world's population in 2100;

THAT, lastly, it confirm, in the Administrator's presence today, the Québec Government's clear-cut support for the Organisation internationale de la Francophonie, which will be celebrating its 50th anniversary in Tunis, Tunisia in 2020.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

18 April 2019

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mrs. Montpetit (Maurice-Richard), together with Mr. Charette, Minister of the Environment and the Fight Against Climate Change, Mrs. Ghazal (Mercier), Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly highlight Earth Day, to be held on 22 April;

THAT it underscore this global opportunity to rally around the major issues of protecting the environment and fighting climate change;

THAT it ask the Government to show leadership and immediately table concrete measures to meet this environmental challenge.

The question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **87** in Appendix)

Yeas: **106** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

18 April 2019

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 84.1 and pursuant to Standing Order 146, Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, moved:

THAT, within the framework of the consideration of Bill 21, An Act respecting the laicity of the State, the Committee on Institutions hold special consultations and public hearings on 7 May 2019, from 10.00 o'clock a.m. to 12.00 o'clock noon, after Routine Proceedings until 6.00 o'clock p.m. and from 7.30 o'clock p.m. to 9.30 o'clock p.m.; on 8 May 2019, after Routine Proceedings until 1.00 o'clock p.m. and from 3.00 o'clock p.m. to 6.00 o'clock p.m.; on 9 May 2019, after Routine Proceedings until 1.00 o'clock p.m. and from 3.00 o'clock p.m. to 6.00 o'clock p.m.; on 14 May 2019, from 10.00 o'clock a.m. to 12.00 o'clock noon, after Routine Proceedings until 6.00 o'clock p.m. and from 7.30 o'clock p.m. to 9.30 o'clock p.m.; on 15 May 2019, after Routine Proceedings until 1.00 o'clock p.m. and from 3.00 o'clock p.m. to 6.00 o'clock p.m.; and on 16 May 2019, after Routine Proceedings until 1.00 o'clock p.m. and from 3.00 o'clock p.m. to 4.30 o'clock p.m.;

THAT, for this purpose, the Committee hear the following individuals and organizations:

Pour les droits des femmes
Mrs. Djemila Benhabib and Mrs. Louise Mailloux, jointly, on behalf of the Collectif citoyen pour l'égalité et la laïcité
Fédération des travailleurs du Québec
Mrs. Leila Lesbet, Association des nord-africains pour la laïcité
Mouvement national des Québécois
Barreau du Québec
Commission des droits de la personne et des droits de la jeunesse
Mrs. Nadia El-Mabrouk
Ligue d'action nationale
Mr. Gérard Bouchard
Association des directeurs de police du Québec
Fédération des policiers et policières municipaux
Syndicat des constables spéciaux du gouvernement du Québec
Mrs. Julie Latour, Juristes pour la laïcité
Syndicat de la fonction publique et parapublique du Québec
Ville de Montréal
Fraternité des policiers et policières de Montréal

18 April 2019

Fédération québécoise des directions d'établissement
d'enseignement
Fédération des commissions scolaires
Mr. Charles Taylor and Mr. Jocelyn Maclure, jointly
Mr. Guy Rocher
Union des municipalités du Québec
Fédération québécoise des municipalités
Syndicat des agents de protection de la faune du Québec
Fédération autonome de l'enseignement
Quebec English School Boards Association
Mouvement laïque québécois
Association des policières et policiers du Québec
Confédération des syndicats nationaux
Centrale des syndicats du Québec
Mr. Pierre Bosset
Avocats et notaires de l'État
Fédération des femmes du Québec
Coalition inclusion Québec
Ligue des droits et libertés
Mrs. Fatima Houda-Pepin;

THAT a period of 12 minutes be set aside for opening statements, allocated as follows: 5 minutes 34 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Government, 3 minutes 43 seconds to the Official Opposition, 56 seconds to the Second Opposition Group, 56 seconds to the Third Opposition Group and 51 seconds to the independent Members;

THAT the presentation by each individual or organization last no longer than 10 minutes and the exchange with the Committee members last no longer than 35 minutes, allocated as follows: 16 minutes 15 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Government, 10 minutes 50 seconds to the Official Opposition, 2 minutes 43 seconds to the Second Opposition Group, 2 minutes 43 seconds to the Third Opposition Group and 2 minutes 30 seconds to the independent Members;

THAT the Minister of Immigration, Diversity and Inclusiveness be a member of the said Committee during its proceedings with respect to this order of reference.

18 April 2019

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

Notices of Proceedings in Committees

Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

- the Committee on Citizen Relations, to undertake examination of the “Intimidation” component of the 2019–2020 estimates of expenditure of the “Famille” portfolio; then, undertake examination of the “Youth” component of the 2019–2020 estimates of expenditure of the “Conseil exécutif” portfolio; and finally, undertake examination of the “Seniors and Caregivers” component of the 2019–2020 estimates of expenditure of the “Santé et Services sociaux” portfolio;
- the Committee on Transportation and the Environment, to undertake examination of the 2019–2020 estimates of expenditure of the “Transports” portfolio; then, undertake examination of the 2019–2020 estimates of expenditure of the “Forêts, Faune et Parcs” portfolio; and finally, undertake examination of the 2019–2020 estimates of expenditure of the “Environnement et Lutte contre les changements climatiques” portfolio;
- the Committee on Institutions, to undertake examination of the “Relations with English-speaking Quebecers” component of the 2019–2020 estimates of expenditure of the “Conseil exécutif” portfolio; then, undertake examination of the “Aboriginal Affairs” component of the 2019–2020 estimates of expenditure of the “Conseil exécutif” portfolio; and finally, undertake examination of the “Canadian Relations and the Canadian Francophonie” component of the 2019–2020 estimates of expenditure of the “Conseil exécutif” portfolio;
- the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries, Energy and Natural Resources, to undertake examination of the 2019–2020 estimates of expenditure of the “Agriculture, Pêcheries et Alimentation” portfolio;
- the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain, to undertake examination of the “Municipal Affairs” component of the 2019–2020 estimates of expenditure of the “Affaires municipales et Habitation” portfolio;

18 April 2019

- the Committee on Labour and the Economy, to undertake examination of the “Regional Economic Development” component of the 2019–2020 estimates of expenditure of the “Économie et Innovation” portfolio; then, undertake examination of the “Digital Strategy” component of the 2019–2020 estimates of expenditure of the “Économie et Innovation” portfolio; and finally, undertake examination of the “Employment and Social Solidarity” component of the 2019–2020 estimates of expenditure of the “Travail, Emploi et Solidarité sociale” portfolio;
- the Committee on Culture and Education, to undertake examination of the “Culture and Communications” component of the 2019–2020 estimates of expenditure of the “Culture et Communications” portfolio; and then, undertake examination of the “Preschool, Primary and Secondary Education” component of the 2019–2020 estimates of expenditure of the “Éducation et Enseignement supérieur” portfolio.

Information on the Proceedings of the Assembly

Mrs. Soucy, Second Vice-President, informed the Assembly that on Friday, 3 May 2019, Mr. Fortin (Pontiac) would question Mrs. Proulx, Minister for Regional Economic Development, during an interpellation on the CAQ Government’s lack of real leadership as regards regional economic vitality.

At 11.28 o’clock a.m., pursuant to Standing Order 282, Mrs. Soucy, Second Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Tuesday, 30 April 2019 at 1.40 o’clock p.m.

FRANÇOIS PARADIS

President

18 April 2019

APPENDIX

Recorded Divisions

On the motion moved by Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), together with Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin):

(Division No. 86)

YEAS - 107

Allaire (CAQ)	Dufour (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Perry Mélançon (PQ)
Anglade (QLP)	Émond (CAQ)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Polo (QLP)
Arcand (QLP)	Fontecilla (QS)	Lavallée (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)
Arseneau (PQ)	Fortin (QLP)	LeBel (PQ)	Proulx (CAQ)
Asselin (CAQ)	Foster (CAQ)	(Rimouski)	(Côte-du-Sud)
Bachand (CAQ)	Fournier (IND)	LeBel (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)
Barrette (QLP)	Gaudreault (PQ)	(Champlain)	(Berthier)
Bélanger (CAQ)	(Jonquière)	Lecours (CAQ)	Proulx (QLP)
Benjamin (QLP)	Ghazal (QS)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	(Jean-Talon)
Bérubé (PQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Bimbaum (QLP)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	(Les Plaines)	Reid (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Leduc (QS)	Rizqy (QLP)
(Prévost)	(Groulx)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Roberge (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	Girault (CAQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Robitaille (QLP)
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Grondin (CAQ)	Leitão (QLP)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Rousselle (QLP)
Boulet (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	Roy (PQ)
Caire (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	(Bonaventure)
Campeau (CAQ)	Hivon (PQ)	(Chauveau)	Sauvé (QLP)
Carmant (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Caron (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Simard (CAQ)
Charbonneau (QLP)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Maccarone (QLP)	Skeete (CAQ)
Charest (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Marissal (QS)	Tanguay (QLP)
Charette (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)
Chassin (CAQ)	Kelley (QLP)	Massé (QS)	(Laviolette-Saint-Maurice)
Ciccone (QLP)	Labrie (QS)	McCann (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)
D'Amours (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Ménard (QLP)	(Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata)
Dansereau (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Montpetit (QLP)	Thouin (CAQ)
Derraji (QLP)	Laforest (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Dorion (QS)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Nichols (QLP)	Weil (QLP)
Dubé (CAQ)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	Zanetti (QS)

18 April 2019

On the motion moved by Mrs. Montpetit (Maurice-Richard), together with Mr. Charette, Minister of the Environment and the Fight Against Climate Change, Mrs. Ghazal (Mercier), Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin):

(Division No. 87)

YEAS - 106

Allaire (CAQ)	Émond (CAQ)	Lavallée (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)
Arcand (QLP)	Fontecilla (QS)	LeBel (PQ)	(Berthier)
Arseneau (PQ)	Fortin (QLP)	(Rimouski)	Proulx (QLP)
Asselin (CAQ)	Foster (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	(Jean-Talon)
Bachand (CAQ)	Fournier (IND)	(Champlain)	Provençal (CAQ)
Barrette (QLP)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Reid (CAQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)	(Jonquière)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Rizqy (QLP)
Benjamin (QLP)	Ghazal (QS)	Lecours (CAQ)	Roberge (CAQ)
Bérubé (PQ)	Girard (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	Robitaille (QLP)
Birnbaum (QLP)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Leduc (QS)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Blais (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Rousselle (QLP)
(Prévost)	(Groulx)	Leitão (QLP)	Roy (PQ)
Blais (CAQ)	Girault (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	(Bonaventure)
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Grondin (CAQ)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	Sauvé (QLP)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Boulet (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	Simard (CAQ)
Caire (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Skeete (CAQ)
Campeau (CAQ)	Hivon (PQ)	(Chapleau)	Tanguay (QLP)
Carmant (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	Maccarone (QLP)	Tardif (CAQ)
Caron (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Marissal (QS)	(Lavolette-Saint-Maurice)
Charbonneau (QLP)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)
Charest (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Massé (QS)	(Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata)
Charette (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)	Thouin (CAQ)
Chassé (CAQ)	Kelley (QLP)	Ménard (QLP)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Chassin (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Montpetit (QLP)	Weil (QLP)
Ciccone (QLP)	Lachance (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	Zanetti (QS)
D'Amours (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Nichols (QLP)	
Dansereau (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	
Derraji (QLP)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	
Dorion (QS)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Polo (QLP)	
Dubé (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)	
Dufour (CAQ)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)	
		(Côte-du-Sud)	