

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF QUÉBEC

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-SECOND LEGISLATURE

Votes and Proceedings

of the Assembly

Wednesday, 29 May 2019 - No. 46

President of the National Assembly: Mr. François Paradis

The Assembly was called to order at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS

Statements by Members

Mr. Skeete (Sainte-Rose) made a statement to underline Lyme Disease Awareness Month.

Mrs. David (Marguerite-Bourgeoys) made a statement to congratulate École secondaire Cavelier-De LaSalle's Robotronix Team 3550 on their performance at the Robotique FIRST competition.

Mr. Campeau (Bourget) made a statement to underline the 40th anniversary of the Club de l'âge d'or Saint-Herménégilde.

Mrs. Ménard (Laporte) made a statement to congratulate two schools in the Laporte riding on their environmental protection and fair trade certifications.

Mr. Fitzgibbon (Terrebonne) made a statement to underline the 20th anniversary of the Knights of Columbus of Lachenaie – Council 12460.

Mrs. Lessard-Therrien (Rouyn-Noranda-Témiscamingue) made a statement to congratulate the Rouyn-Noranda Huskies hockey team, Memorial Cup winners.

29 May 2019

Mr. Lafrenière (Vachon) made a statement to underline Paralympic swimmer Benoît Huot's swim career.
Mr. Lemay (Masson) made a statement to underline École de la Source students' participation in activities related to the Grand défi Pierre Lavoie.
Mr. Lévesque (Chauveau) made a statement to congratulate snowboarder Laurie Blouin on her sports performance.
Mrs. Melançon (Verdun) made a statement to underline the 70th anniversary of Club Richelieu de Verdun.
By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 54.1 and 54.3, Mrs. Perry Mélançon (Gaspé) made a statement to congratulate Mrs. Marielle Ruest,
winner of the "Prix du bénévolat en loisir et en sport Dollard-Morin" award. —————
At 9.53 o'clock a.m., Mrs. Soucy, Second Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.
The proceedings resumed at 10.01 o'clock a.m.

Moment of reflection

Presenting Reports from Committees

Mr. Bachand (Richmond), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Institutions, which met on 13 and 28 May 2019 for clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 6, An Act to transfer responsibility for the registry of lobbyists to the Lobbyists Commissioner and to implement the Charbonneau Commission recommendation on the prescription period for bringing penal proceedings. The report contains amendments to the bill.

(Sessional Paper No. 626-20190529)

Presenting Petitions

Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on abolishing single-use plastic bags in businesses, signed by 857 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 627-20190529)

Complaints of Breach of Privilege or Contempt and Personal Explanations

The President issued his directive on the point of privilege raised by Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) on 9 May 2019 on the application of parliamentary privilege concerning written questions on the *Order Paper and Notices*.

RULING FROM THE CHAIR

The Chair wishes to recall that it is up to the courts to determine the scope of a parliamentary privilege. When defining a privilege, the courts must show deference to the opinion of legislative assembly presidents. The Chair's analysis of requests for directives on points of privilege raised is therefore part of its role as guardian of the rights and privileges of the Assembly and its Members.

In a democratic society, each State branch must be able to play its role independently. Legislatures and their constituent members therefore enjoy parliamentary privileges that ensure their autonomy and independence when exercising legislative and deliberative functions, including that of holding the Government to account.

The privilege of freedom of speech has its origins in article 9 of the 1689 British Bill of Rights. The article enshrines the basic principle of freedom of speech and also that of the Assembly's control over its parliamentary proceedings and procedures. This privilege is set out in section 44 of the *Act respecting the National Assembly*. The freedom of speech privilege provides protection for what Members say in parliamentary proceedings in the Assembly and in committee and also for the parliamentary duties Members carry out.

Parliamentary privilege protection covers parliamentary deliberations and decisions made by legislative assemblies. It also covers all acts enabling Members to take part in parliamentary proceedings.

Although, to date, the courts have never ruled on the specific case of written questions placed on the *Order Paper and Notices*, the Chair considers it would be difficult to conceive of them not being protected by the privilege of freedom of speech. These questions are part of the procedures provided for in the Standing Orders and made available to Members in the exercise of their deliberative and government oversight functions.

Furthermore, oral questions and written questions should be viewed as complementary. Indeed, during oral question and answer period, questions must relate to matters of urgent or topical public importance for which a minister or the Government is officially responsible. All other questions must be placed on the *Order Paper and Notices*. The Standing Orders also stipulate that the rules pertaining to oral questions also apply to written questions.

In order for the Assembly and its Members to fully exercise with dignity the means of parliamentary oversight provided for in the Standing Orders, it is clear that written questions must be given the same protection as oral questions. Even though protected by parliamentary privilege, written questions must still comply with the rules governing parliamentary debates, in particular Standing Order 35, which deals with unparliamentary language and words inadmissible in debate.

Oral Questions and Answers

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

Deferred Divisions

The Assembly took the divisions, which had been deferred at the sitting of 28 May 2019, on the amendments proposed by Mrs. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent) and Mrs. Labrie (Sherbrooke) and on the report from the Committee on Culture and Education on its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 12, An Act to clarify the scope of the right to free education and to allow the regulation of certain financial contributions that may be required.

By leave of the Assembly, Mrs. Soucy, Second Vice-President, read the text of the amendment by Mrs. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent).

The question was put on the amendment proposed by Mrs. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent).

The amendment was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **120** in Appendix)

Yeas: 49 Nays: 71 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the amendment proposed by Mrs. Labrie (Sherbrooke).

The amendment was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **121** in Appendix)

Yeas: 49 Nays: 71 Abstentions: 0

Finally, the question was put on the report from the Committee on Culture and Education.

The report was concurred in on the following vote:

(Division No. 122 in Appendix)

Yeas: 71 Nays: 49 Abstentions: 0

Motions Without Notice

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mrs. Melançon (Verdun), together with Mrs. Roy, Minister of Culture and Communications, Mrs. Labrie (Sherbrooke), Mrs. Perry Mélançon (Gaspé), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly recognize the excellence as well as the cultural and social contribution of the Petits Chanteurs du Mont-Royal;

THAT it applaud the quality of the musical education the institution has provided for several decades;

THAT it ask the Government to assume its functions and to propose adequate solutions without delay to ensure the institution's mission.

The question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 123 in Appendix)

Yeas: 115 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 0

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mrs. Massé, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, together with Mrs. Charest, Minister Responsible for the Status of Women, Mr. Arcand, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Bérubé, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly reaffirm that the right of women to make choices about their bodies is a basic, inalienable human right;

THAT, in the lead-up to the next federal election, it recall that social and political consensus exists in Québec regarding abortion rights;

THAT the National Assembly affirm its solidarity with women around the globe fighting to obtain or to retain these rights.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the question was put on the motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 124 in Appendix)

Yeas: 117 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 0

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine), together with Mrs. Roy, Minister of Culture and Communications, Mr. Benjamin (Viau), Mrs. Dorion (Taschereau), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly recall that it unanimously passed Bill 104, An Act to amend the Charter of the French language on 12 June 2002;

THAT it ask the Government that section 1 of Bill 104, the only provision of this legislation that is still not in effect, be brought into force so that the Government use only the official language, that is, French, in its written communications with legal persons established in Québec and with other governments;

THAT it ask the Government to bring into force the section in question as soon as possible.

The question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 125 in Appendix)

Yeas: 116 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 0

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mrs. LeBel, Minister of Justice, together with Mr. Tanguay (LaFontaine), Mr. Leduc (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve), Mrs. Hivon (Joliette), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly mark Victims and Survivors of Crime Week, held starting 26 May 2019 under this year's theme "The Power of Collaboration";

THAT the Assembly highlight the work of community organizations and the quality of the resources and services in place to help crime victims and their families;

THAT the National Assembly thank all those who work with crime victims and survivors and their loved ones and who help make our society a more just and safer place for all;

THAT, lastly, it recall its unanimous resolution of 28 February 2019, petitioning the Government to abolish the statute of limitations for victims of sexual assault.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

Notices of Proceedings in Committees

Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

- the Committee on Citizen Relations, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 9, An Act to increase Québec's socio-economic prosperity and adequately meet labour market needs through successful immigrant integration;
- the Committee on Culture and Education, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 5, An Act to amend the Education Act and other provisions regarding preschool education services for students 4 years of age;
- the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain, to undertake clauseby-clause consideration of Bill 16, An Act mainly to regulate building inspections and divided co-ownership, to replace the name and improve the rules of operation of the Régie du logement and to amend the Act respecting the Société d'habitation du Québec and various legislative provisions concerning municipal affairs;

 the Committee on Health and Social Services, to continue its clause-byclause consideration of Bill 2, An Act to tighten the regulation of cannabis.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Government Bills

Passage

Mrs. McCann, Minister of Health and Social Services, moved the passage of Bill 7, An Act respecting certain terms of employment applicable to officers of the health and social services network.

A debate arose thereon.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 53 and 59, Mr. Proulx, Official Opposition House Leader, tabled the following:

A copy of an excerpt from the digest of parliamentary rulings "Recueil de décisions concernant la procédure parlementaire" on Decision No. 35(6)/5.

(Sessional Paper No. 628-20190529)

The debate on the motion moved by Mrs. McCann, Minister of Health and Social Services, is concluded.

Joint Bills

Passage in Principle

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader and Minister of Immigration, Diversity and Inclusiveness, Mr. Proulx, Official Opposition House Leader, and Mr. Ouellet, House Leader of the Third Opposition Group, moved that Bill 19, An Act to amend the Act respecting the conditions of employment and the pension plan of the Members of the National Assembly following the adoption of certain fiscal measures by the Parliament of Canada, do now pass in principle.

A debate arose thereon.

At 1.00 o'clock p.m., Mrs. Soucy, Second Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 3.00 o'clock p.m.

Accordingly, pursuant to Standing Order 97, the debate on the motion moved by Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader and Minister of Immigration, Diversity and Inclusiveness, Mr. Proulx, Official Opposition House Leader, and Mr. Ouellet, House Leader of the Third Opposition Group, was adjourned in the name of Mr. Nadeau-Dubois (Gouin).

The proceedings resumed at 3.00 o'clock p.m.

Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition

Mr. Leitão (Robert-Baldwin) moved:

THAT the National Assembly recognize the RénoVert tax credit's importance for home renovation and in terms of energy efficiency;

THAT it ask the CAQ Government to reconsider its decision and immediately renew the RénoVert tax credit for the 2019–2020 fiscal year.

Mrs. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, informed the Assembly of the allocation of speaking time for the proceedings with respect to this limited debate: 10 minutes to the mover of the motion for his reply; 53 minutes 30 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Government; 32 minutes 19 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition; 11 minutes 9 seconds to the Second Opposition Group; 10 minutes 2 seconds to the Third Opposition Group; and 1 minute 30 seconds to each independent Member. However, if only one independent Member takes part in the debate, that Member's speaking time is 2 minutes. Within this framework, any time not used by the independent Members or by a parliamentary group shall be redistributed among the parliamentary groups in the proportions established above. Lastly, individual addresses shall not be limited.

A debate arose thereon.

At the end of her address, Mrs. Ghazal (Mercier) moved:

THAT the motion moved by the Member for Robert-Baldwin be amended as follows:

By adding the following paragraph after the second paragraph: "THAT, lastly, it ask the Government to develop an enhanced energy efficiency program for all Québec households by creating a borrowing mechanism funded by the energy savings achieved."

The motion, as amended, would read as follows:

THAT the National Assembly recognize the RénoVert tax credit's importance for home renovation and in terms of energy efficiency;

THAT it ask the CAQ Government to reconsider its decision and immediately renew the RénoVert tax credit for the 2019–2020 fiscal year;

THAT, lastly, it ask the Government to develop an enhanced energy efficiency program for all Québec households by creating a borrowing mechanism funded by the energy savings achieved.

The debate continued on the main motion moved by Mr. Leitão (Robert-Baldwin) and on the amendment motion moved by Mrs. Ghazal (Mercier), subject to the permission of its author.

Pursuant to Standing Order 98.1, Mr. Leitão (Robert-Baldwin) refused the amendment proposed by Mrs. Ghazal (Mercier).

The debate being concluded, the question was put on the motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

At the request of Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, the division was deferred until Routine Proceedings on the next sitting day.

Government Bills

Passage

The debate being concluded earlier in the sitting, the Assembly put the question on the motion moved by Mrs. McCann, Minister of Health and Social Services, for the passage of Bill 7, An Act respecting certain terms of employment applicable to officers of the health and social services network; a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

At the request of Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, the division was deferred until Routine Proceedings on the next sitting day.

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, requested a directive on the presence of a minister in the context of a debate on the passage of Bill 7.

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, requested a directive on the circumstances around the question put on the motion for the passage of Bill 7, An Act respecting certain terms of employment applicable to officers of the health and social services network.

Mr. Picard, First Vice-President, after hearing arguments from all parties, took the matter under advisement.

Passage in Principle

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Minister of Immigration, Diversity and Inclusiveness, moved that Bill 21, An Act respecting the laicity of the State, do now pass in principle.

A debate arose thereon.

The debate was adjourned in the name of Mrs. David (Marguerite-Bourgeoys).

At 5.59 o'clock p.m., Mr. Picard, First Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Thursday, 30 May 2019 at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

FRANÇOIS PARADIS

President

APPENDIX

Recorded Divisions

On the amendment proposed by Mrs. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent):

(Division No. 120)

YEAS - 49				
Anglade (QLP)	Fournier (IND)	Massé (QS)	Robitaille (<i>QLP</i>)	
Arcand (QLP)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Melançon (QLP)	Rotiroti (<i>QLP</i>)	
Arseneau (PQ)	(Jonquière)	Ménard (QLP)	Rousselle (<i>QLP</i>)	
Barrette (QLP)	Ghazal (QS)	Montpetit (QLP)	Roy(PQ)	
Benjamin (QLP)	Hivon (PQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	(Bonaventure)	
Bérubé (PQ)	Kelley (QLP)	Nichols (QLP)	Sauvé (QLP)	
Birnbaum (<i>QLP</i>)	Labrie (QS)	Ouellet (PQ)	St-Pierre (<i>QLP</i>)	
Charbonneau (QLP)	LeBel (PQ)	Ouellette (IND)	Tanguay (QLP)	
Ciccone (QLP)	(Rimouski)	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	Thériault (QLP)	
David (QLP)	Leduc (QS)	Polo (QLP)	Weil (QLP)	
Derraji (<i>QLP</i>)	Leitão (QLP)	Proulx (QLP)	Zanetti (QS)	
Dorion (QS)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	(Jean-Talon)		
Fontecilla (<i>QS</i>)	Maccarone (QLP)	Richard (PQ)		
Fortin (<i>QLP</i>)	Marissal (QS)	Rizqy (<i>QLP</i>)		
	NAYS - '	71		
Allaire (CAQ)	Dufour (CAQ)	Lafrenière (<i>CAQ</i>)	Poulin (CAQ)	
Asselin (CAQ)	Émond (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)	
Bachand (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	Lamothe (CAQ)	(Berthier)	
Bélanger (<i>CAQ</i>)	Foster (CAQ)	Lavallée (<i>CAQ</i>)	Provençal (CAQ)	
Blais (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Reid (CAQ)	
(Prévost)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	(Champlain)	Roberge (CAQ)	
Blais (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)	
(Abitibi-Ouest)	(Groulx)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Roy(CAQ)	
Bonnardel (<i>CAQ</i>)	Girault (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	(Montarville)	
Boulet (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	Samson (CAQ)	
Bussière (CAQ)	Guilbault (<i>CAQ</i>)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Schneeberger (CAQ)	
Caire (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Simard (CAQ)	
Campeau (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	Skeete (CAQ)	
Carmant (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)	
Caron (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	(Laviolette–Saint-Maurice)	
Charest (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Tardif (CAQ)	
Charette (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (<i>CAQ</i>)	Lévesque (CAQ)	(Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata)	
Chassé (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	Thouin (CAQ)	
Chassin (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)	
D'Amours (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)		
Dansereau (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)		
Dubé (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	(Soulanges)		

On the amendment proposed by Mrs. Labrie (Sherbrooke):

(Division No. 121)

YEAS - 49

Anglade (PLQ)	Fournier (IND)	Massé (QS)	Robitaille (<i>PLQ</i>)
Arcand (PLQ)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Melançon (PLQ)	Rotiroti (<i>PLQ</i>)
Arseneau (PQ)	(Jonquière)	Ménard (PLQ)	Rousselle (<i>PLQ</i>)
Barrette (<i>PLQ</i>)	Ghazal (QS)	Montpetit (<i>PLQ</i>)	Roy(PQ)
Benjamin (PLQ)	Hivon (PQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	(Bonaventure)
Bérubé (PQ)	Kelley (PLQ)	Nichols (<i>PLQ</i>)	Sauvé (PLQ)
Birnbaum (PLQ)	Labrie (QS)	Ouellet (PQ)	St-Pierre (<i>PLQ</i>)
Charbonneau (PLQ)	LeBel (PQ)	Ouellette (IND)	Tanguay (PLQ)
Ciccone (PLQ)	(Rimouski)	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	Thériault (PLQ)
David (<i>PLQ</i>)	Leduc (QS)	Polo (PLQ)	Weil (PLQ)
Derraji (PLQ)	Leitão (PLQ)	Proulx (PLQ)	Zanetti (QS)
Dorion (QS)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	(Jean-Talon)	
Fontecilla (QS)	Maccarone (PLQ)	Richard (PQ)	
Fortin (<i>PLQ</i>)	Marissal (QS)	Rizqy (<i>PLQ</i>)	
	NAYS -	71	
Allaire (CAQ)	Dufour (CAQ)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)
Asselin (CAQ)	Émond (CAQ)	Lamontagne (<i>CAQ</i>)	Proulx (CAQ)
Bachand (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	Lamothe (CAQ)	(Berthier)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Foster (CAQ)	Lavallée (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Reid (CAQ)
(Prévost)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	(Champlain)	Roberge (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)
(Abitibi-Ouest)	(Groulx)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Roy(CAQ)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Girault (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	(Montarville)
Boulet (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	Samson (CAQ)
Bussière (CAQ)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Caire (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Simard (CAQ)
Campeau (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	Skeete (<i>CAQ</i>)
Carmant (CAQ)	Isabelle (<i>CAQ</i>)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)
Caron (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	(Laviolette–Saint-Maurice)
Charest (CAQ)	Jeannotte (<i>CAQ</i>)	(Chapleau)	Tardif (CAQ)
Charette (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (<i>CAQ</i>)	Lévesque (CAQ)	(Rivière-du-Loup–Témiscouata)
Chassé (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	Thouin (CAQ)
Chassin (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)
D'Amours (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)	
Dansereau (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	
Dubé (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	(Soulanges)	

On the report from the Committee on Culture and Education:

Dufour (CAQ)

Allaire (CAQ)

(Division No. 122)

YEAS - 71

Lafrenière (CAQ)

Poulin (CAQ)

mune (crig)	Duloui (Crig)	Editemete (Crig)	rounn (crig)
Asselin (CAQ)	Émond (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)
Bachand (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	Lamothe (CAQ)	(Berthier)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Foster (CAQ)	Lavallée (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Reid (CAQ)
(Prévost)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	(Champlain)	Roberge (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)
(Abitibi-Ouest)	(Groulx)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Roy(CAQ)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Girault (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	(Montarville)
Boulet (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	Samson (CAQ)
Bussière (<i>CAQ</i>)	Guilbault (<i>CAQ</i>)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Caire (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Simard (CAQ)
Campeau (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	Skeete (CAQ)
Carmant (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)
Caron (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Lévesque (<i>CAQ</i>)	(Laviolette–Saint-Maurice)
Charest (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Tardif (CAQ)
Charette (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Lévesque (<i>CAQ</i>)	(Rivière-du-Loup–Témiscouata)
Chassé (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	Thouin (CAQ)
Chassin (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)
D'Amours (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)	
Dansereau (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	
Dubé (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	(Soulanges)	
	NAYS -	49	
Anglade (PLQ)	Fournier (IND)	Massé (QS)	Robitaille (<i>PLQ</i>)
Arcand (PLQ)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Melançon (PLQ)	Rotiroti (PLQ)
Arseneau (PQ)	(Jonquière)	Ménard (PLQ)	Rousselle (<i>PLQ</i>)
Barrette (<i>PLQ</i>)	Ghazal (QS)	Montpetit (<i>PLQ</i>)	Roy(PQ)
Benjamin (PLQ)	Hivon (PQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	(Bonaventure)
Bérubé (PQ)	Kelley (PLQ)	Nichols (PLQ)	Sauvé (PLQ)
Birnbaum (<i>PLQ</i>)	Labrie (QS)	Ouellet (PQ)	St-Pierre (<i>PLQ</i>)
Charbonneau (PLQ)	LeBel (PQ)	Ouellette (IND)	Tanguay (PLQ)
Ciccone (PLQ)	(Rimouski)	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	Thériault (PLQ)
David (PLQ)	Leduc (QS)	Polo (PLQ)	Weil (PLQ)
Derraji (PLQ)	Leitão (PLQ)	Proulx (<i>PLQ</i>)	Zanetti (QS)
Dorion (QS)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	(Jean-Talon)	
Fontecilla (QS)	Maccarone (PLQ)	Richard (PQ)	
Fortin (PLQ)	Marissal (QS)	Rizqy (<i>PLQ</i>)	

On the motion moved by Mrs. Melançon (Verdun), together with Mrs. Roy, of Culture and Communications, Mrs. Labrie (Sherbrooke), Mrs. Perry Mélançon (Gaspé), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin):

(Division No. 123)

YEAS - 115				
Allaire (CAQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	LeBel (CAQ)	Proulx (PLQ)	
Arcand (PLQ)	Fortin (<i>PLQ</i>)	(Champlain)	(Jean-Talon)	
Arseneau (PQ)	Foster (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Provençal (<i>CAQ</i>)	
Asselin (CAQ)	Fournier (IND)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Reid (CAQ)	
Bachand (CAQ)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Richard (PQ)	
Barrette (PLQ)	(Jonquière)	(Les Plaines)	Rizqy (<i>PLQ</i>)	
Bélanger (CAQ)	Ghazal (QS)	Leduc (QS)	Roberge (<i>CAQ</i>)	
Benjamin (PLQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lefebvre (<i>CAQ</i>)	Robitaille (<i>PLQ</i>)	
Bérubé (PQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Leitão (PLQ)	Rotiroti (PLQ)	
Birnbaum (PLQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)	
Blais (CAQ)	(Groulx)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Rousselle (<i>PLQ</i>)	
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Girault (CAQ)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	Roy(PQ)	
Blais (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	(Bonaventure)	
(Prévost)	Guilbault (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Roy(CAQ)	
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Guillemette (<i>CAQ</i>)	Lévesque (<i>CAQ</i>)	(Montarville)	
Boulet (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	Sauvé (<i>PLQ</i>)	
Bussière (CAQ)	Hivon (PQ)	Maccarone (PLQ)	Schneeberger (CAQ)	
Caire (CAQ)	Isabelle (<i>CAQ</i>)	Marissal (QS)	Simard (CAQ)	
Campeau (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Skeete (CAQ)	
Carmant (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Massé (QS)	St-Pierre (<i>PLQ</i>)	
Caron (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (<i>CAQ</i>)	McCann (CAQ)	Tanguay (PLQ)	
Charbonneau (PLQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Melançon (PLQ)	Tardif (CAQ)	
Charest (CAQ)	Kelley (PLQ)	Ménard (PLQ)	(Laviolette–Saint-Maurice)	
Charette (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Montpetit (<i>PLQ</i>)	Tardif (CAQ)	
Chassin (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (<i>QS</i>)	(Rivière-du-Loup–Témiscouata)	
D'Amours (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Nichols (<i>PLQ</i>)	Thériault (PLQ)	
Dansereau (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	Thouin (CAQ)	
David (PLQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Ouellette (IND)	Tremblay (CAQ)	
Derraji (PLQ)	Lafrenière (<i>CAQ</i>)	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	Weil (PLQ)	
Dorion (QS)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	Zanetti (QS)	
Dubé (CAQ)	Lamothe (CAQ)	(Soulanges)		
Dufour (CAQ)	Lavallée (<i>CAQ</i>)	Polo (PLQ)		
Émond (<i>CAQ</i>)	LeBel (PQ)	Poulin (CAQ)		
Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	(Rimouski)	Proulx (CAQ)		
		(Berthier)		

On the motion moved by Mrs. Massé, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, together with Mrs. Charest, Minister Responsible for the Status of Women, Mr. Arcand, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Bérubé, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin):

(Division No. 124)

YEAS - 117

Allaire (CAQ)	Émond (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Anglade (<i>PLQ</i>)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	(Champlain)	Reid (CAQ)
Arcand (PLQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	Lecours (CAQ)	Richard (PQ)
Arseneau (PQ)	Fortin (<i>PLQ</i>)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Rizqy (<i>PLQ</i>)
Asselin (CAQ)	Foster (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Roberge (CAQ)
Bachand (CAQ)	Fournier (IND)	(Les Plaines)	Robitaille (<i>PLQ</i>)
Barrette (PLQ)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Leduc (QS)	Rotiroti (PLQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)	(Jonquière)	Lefebvre (<i>CAQ</i>)	Rouleau (CAQ)
Benjamin (<i>PLQ</i>)	Ghazal (QS)	Leitão (PLQ)	Rousselle (<i>PLQ</i>)
Bérubé (PQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	Roy(PQ)
Birnbaum (<i>PLQ</i>)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Lemieux (CAQ)	(Bonaventure)
Blais (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	Roy(CAQ)
(Prévost)	(Groulx)	Lévesque (<i>CAQ</i>)	(Montarville)
Blais (CAQ)	Girault (<i>CAQ</i>)	(Chapleau)	Samson (CAQ)
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Grondin (CAQ)	Lévesque (<i>CAQ</i>)	Sauvé (<i>PLQ</i>)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Guilbault (<i>CAQ</i>)	(Chauveau)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Boulet (<i>CAQ</i>)	Guillemette (<i>CAQ</i>)	Maccarone (<i>PLQ</i>)	Simard (CAQ)
Bussière (<i>CAQ</i>)	Hébert (CAQ)	Marissal (QS)	Skeete (<i>CAQ</i>)
Caire (CAQ)	Hivon (PQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Tanguay (<i>PLQ</i>)
Campeau (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	Massé (QS)	Tardif (CAQ)
Carmant (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)	(Laviolette–Saint-Maurice)
Caron (CAQ)	Jeannotte (<i>CAQ</i>)	Melançon (PLQ)	Tardif (CAQ)
Charbonneau (PLQ)	Jolin-Barrette (<i>CAQ</i>)	Ménard (PLQ)	(Rivière-du-Loup–Témiscouata)
Charest (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Montpetit (<i>PLQ</i>)	Thériault (PLQ)
Charette (CAQ)	Kelley (<i>PLQ</i>)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	Thouin (CAQ)
Chassé (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Ouellet (PQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Chassin (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Ouellette (<i>IND</i>)	Weil (<i>PLQ</i>)
Ciccone (<i>PLQ</i>)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	Zanetti (QS)
D'Amours (<i>CAQ</i>)	Laforest (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	
Dansereau (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	(Soulanges)	
David (<i>PLQ</i>)	Lafrenière (<i>CAQ</i>)	Polo (PLQ)	
Derraji (<i>PLQ</i>)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)	
Dorion (QS)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)	
Dubé (CAQ)	Lavallée (<i>CAQ</i>)	(Berthier)	
Dufour (CAQ)	LeBel (PQ)	Proulx (PLQ)	
	(Rimouski)	(Jean-Talon)	

On the motion moved by Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine), together with Mrs. Roy, Minister of Culture and Communications, Mr. Benjamin (Viau), Mrs. Dorion (Taschereau) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin):

(Division No. 125)

YEAS - 116

1EAS - 110				
Allaire (<i>CAQ</i>)	Émond (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)	
Anglade (<i>PLQ</i>)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	(Champlain)	Reid (CAQ)	
Arcand (PLQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	Lecours (CAQ)	Richard (PQ)	
Arseneau (PQ)	Fortin (<i>PLQ</i>)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Rizqy (<i>PLQ</i>)	
Asselin (CAQ)	Foster (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Roberge (CAQ)	
Bachand (CAQ)	Fournier (IND)	(Les Plaines)	Robitaille (<i>PLQ</i>)	
Barrette (<i>PLQ</i>)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Leduc (QS)	Rouleau (CAQ)	
Bélanger (CAQ)	(Jonquière)	Lefebvre (<i>CAQ</i>)	Rousselle (<i>PLQ</i>)	
Benjamin (<i>PLQ</i>)	Ghazal (QS)	Leitão (PLQ)	Roy(PQ)	
Bérubé (PQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	(Bonaventure)	
Birnbaum (<i>PLQ</i>)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Roy(CAQ)	
Blais (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	(Montarville)	
(Abitibi-Ouest)	(Groulx)	Lévesque (<i>CAQ</i>)	Samson (CAQ)	
Blais (CAQ)	Girault (<i>CAQ</i>)	(Chapleau)	Sauvé (<i>PLQ</i>)	
(Prévost)	Grondin (CAQ)	Lévesque (<i>CAQ</i>)	Schneeberger (CAQ)	
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Guilbault (<i>CAQ</i>)	(Chauveau)	Simard (CAQ)	
Boulet (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	Maccarone (<i>PLQ</i>)	Skeete (CAQ)	
Bussière (<i>CAQ</i>)	Hébert (<i>CAQ</i>)	Marissal (QS)	Tanguay (<i>PLQ</i>)	
Caire (CAQ)	Hivon (PQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)	
Campeau (CAQ)	Isabelle (<i>CAQ</i>)	Massé (QS)	(Laviolette–Saint-Maurice)	
Carmant (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)	
Caron (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Melançon (PLQ)	(Rivière-du-Loup–Témiscouata)	
Charbonneau (<i>PLQ</i>)	Jolin-Barrette (<i>CAQ</i>)	Ménard (PLQ)	Thériault (<i>PLQ</i>)	
Charest (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Montpetit (<i>PLQ</i>)	Thouin (CAQ)	
Charette (CAQ)	Kelley (PLQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	Tremblay (CAQ)	
Chassé (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Ouellet (PQ)	Weil (<i>PLQ</i>)	
Chassin (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Ouellette (IND)	Zanetti (QS)	
Ciccone (<i>PLQ</i>)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Perry Mélançon (PQ)		
D'Amours (<i>CAQ</i>)	Laforest (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)		
Dansereau (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	(Soulanges)		
David (<i>PLQ</i>)	Lafrenière (<i>CAQ</i>)	Polo (PLQ)		
Derraji (<i>PLQ</i>)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)		
Dorion (QS)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)		
Dubé (CAQ)	Lavallée (<i>CAQ</i>)	(Berthier)		
Dufour (CAQ)	LeBel (PQ)	Proulx (PLQ)		
	(Rimouski)	(Jean-Talon)		