



NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF QUÉBEC

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-SECOND LEGISLATURE

Votes and Proceedings

of the Assembly

Tuesday, 3 December 2019 — No. 90

**President of the National Assembly:
Mr. François Paradis**

The Assembly was called to order at 1.40 o'clock p.m.

ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS

Statements by Members

Mrs. Foster (Charlevoix–Côte-de-Beaupré) made a statement to pay tribute to Mrs. Thérèse Delisle Goulet for her contribution to fire safety in the municipality of Saint-Laurent-de-l'Île-d'Orléans.

Mr. Rousselle (Vimont) made a statement to underline the excellence of Club de soccer Monteuil.

Mr. Poulin (Beauce-Sud) made a statement to pay tribute to Mrs. Édith Leclerc for her work in raising awareness about autism spectrum disorders.

Mr. Benjamin (Viau) made a statement to underline the 35th anniversary of Cirque du Soleil.

Mr. Lemieux (Saint-Jean) made a statement to underline the success of the Santa Claus parade in Saint-Jean-sur-Richelieu.

Mr. Lévesque (Chapleau) made a statement to underline the work done by the organization La Pointe aux jeunes.

3 December 2019

Mr. Carmant (Taillon) made a statement to underline the International Day of Persons with Disabilities.

Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques) made a statement to underline World AIDS Day.

Mrs. LeBel (Champlain) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Martin Crête, President of Groupe Crête, for his contribution to the Mauricie region's economic vitality.

Mr. Bachand (Richmond) made a statement to congratulate Mrs. Jennie Carignan on being selected to lead the NATO Mission Iraq.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 54.1 and 54.3, Mrs. McCann (Sanguinet) made a statement to underline World AIDS Day.

At 1.53 o'clock p.m., Mr. Picard, First Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

The proceedings resumed at 2.03 o'clock p.m.

Moment of reflection

Introduction of Bills

Mrs. Blais, Minister Responsible for Seniors and Informal Caregivers, moved that leave be granted to introduce the following bill:

52 An Act to strengthen the complaint examination process of the health and social services network, in particular for users receiving services from private institutions

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, Bill 52 was introduced in the Assembly.

Presenting Papers

Mr. Charette, Minister of the Environment and the Fight Against Climate Change, tabled the following:

The 2018–2021 strategic plan of the Conseil de gestion du Fonds vert.
(Sessional Paper No. 1199-20191203)

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, tabled the following:

The Government's reply to a written question from Mrs. Lessard-Therrien (Rouyn-Noranda–Témiscamingue) on improving Route 117 between Val-d'Or and Rouyn-Noranda – Question No. 90, *Order Paper and Notices* of 24 October 2019;

(Sessional Paper No. 1200-20191203)

3 December 2019

The reply to a written question from Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage) on reinstating free first cycle in vitro fertilization – Question No. 100, *Order Paper and Notices* of 20 November 2019.

(Sessional Paper No. 1201-20191203)

The President tabled the following:

The investigation report from the Ethics Commissioner to the President of the National Assembly concerning Mrs. Marie-Louise Tardif, Member for Laviolette–Saint-Maurice, entitled “Rapport d’enquête de la Commissaire à l’éthique et à la déontologie au président de l’Assemblée nationale au sujet de Mme Marie-Louise Tardif, députée de Laviolette–Saint-Maurice”;

(Sessional Paper No. 1202-20191203)

A letter, dated 26 November 2019, he had received from Me Marie Rinfret, Ombudsperson, concerning the declaration signed by the members of the Association des Ombudsmans et Médiateurs de la Francophonie, who met in Rabat on 23 and 24 October 2019. This letter was accompanied by the said declaration;

(Sessional Paper No. 1203-20191203)

A letter, dated 19 November 2019, he had received from Mr. Roger Torrent i Ramió, President of the Parliament of Catalonia, in response to the motion on the political situation in Catalonia carried by the Assembly on 29 October 2019;

(Sessional Paper No. 1204-20191203)

A letter, dated 25 November 2019, he had received from Mr. Enrique Ruiz Molero, Ambassador of Spain to Canada in Ottawa, in response to the motion on the political situation in Catalonia carried by the Assembly on 29 October 2019.

(Sessional Paper No. 1205-20191203)

3 December 2019

Complaints of Breach of Privilege or Contempt and Personal Explanations

The President informed the Assembly that he had, within the prescribed time, received a request from Mr. Tanguay, Official Opposition House Leader, to be heard on an alleged breach of privilege.

In his notice, the Official Opposition House Leader alleged that the rules of the National Assembly had been violated with respect to communications sent by the Government to third parties regarding the bill to strengthen the complaint examination process of the health and social services network, in particular for users receiving services from private institutions.

The notice further stated the Official Opposition House Leader's intention to move a motion under Standing Orders 315 and following.

The President took the matter under advisement.

Oral Questions and Answers

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

At the request of the President, Mrs. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent) withdrew certain words deemed unparliamentary.

Deferred Divisions

The Assembly took the divisions, which had been deferred at the sitting of 29 November 2019, on the amendment proposed by Mr. Fortin (Pontiac) and on the report from the Committee on Health and Social Services on its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 31, An Act to amend mainly the Pharmacy Act to facilitate access to certain services.

3 December 2019

First, the question was put on the amendment proposed by Mr. Fortin (Pontiac).

The amendment was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **259** in Appendix)

Yeas: **44** Nays: **68** Abstentions: **0**

Lastly, the question was put on the report of the Committee on Health and Social Services.

The report was concurred in on the following vote:

(Division No. **260** in Appendix)

Yeas: **112** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

Motions Without Notice

After consultation with the Opposition parties and the independent Members, Mr. Legault, Premier, moved the following:

THAT, in accordance with sections 121 and 122 of the *Public Service Act* (chapter F-3.1.1), a list of substitute members of the Commission de la fonction publique be drawn up for a one-year term, effective immediately:

Mrs. Véronique Emond, President and Consultant,
RH Juriconseils;
Mr. Louis Garant, Grievance and Dispute Adjudicator;
Mr. Jean-François Mallette, Attorney and Partner,
Prévost Fortin D'Aoust.

The question was put on the motion, and a recorded division was taken as required for the application of section 122 of the *Public Service Act*.

3 December 2019

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **261** in Appendix)

Yeas: **112** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mrs. Hivon (Joliette), together with Mr. Boulet, Minister of Labour, Employment and Social Solidarity, Mr. Rousselle (Vimont), Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly recognize the unfairness of the Québec Parental Insurance Plan to adoptive parents;

THAT it call for an increase in the number of benefits weeks for adoptive families in order that they benefit from the same duration of benefits as biological families, thus allowing adopted children to benefit from the same duration of time with their parents as biological children do.

The debate being concluded, the question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **262** in Appendix)

Yeas: **110** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mrs. LeBel, Minister of Justice, together with Mr. Tanguay (LaFontaine), Mrs. Massé, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

3 December 2019

THAT the Members of the National Assembly take advantage of the 10th anniversary of the Québec Policy against Homophobia to reiterate the importance of fighting the prejudice and discrimination LGBTQ people face in their daily lives;

THAT they applaud the work of the organizations as well as the individual and collective initiatives promoting the protection and full recognition of the rights of LGBTQ persons;

THAT, lastly, they applaud the courage of those individuals who identify as LGBTQ in Québec. Not all have had the same journey and same level of receptivity from their loved ones, families, colleagues and friends when affirming their identity—but all have chosen authenticity and self-respect.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

Mrs. Maccarone (Westmount–Saint-Louis), together with Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved a motion on the financial compensation allocated to families caring for a child with a disability; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mrs. Dorion (Taschereau), together with Mr. Fitzgibbon, Minister of Economy and Innovation, Mrs. Melançon (Verdun), Mr. Ouellet (René-Lévesque) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly express its support for the cooperative model chosen to revive Capitales Médias, allowing workers to be involved in the revival of the six dailies;

3 December 2019

THAT it encourage the Québec Government to continue its efforts to find the financial support required to complete the project from various investors;

THAT, lastly, the National Assembly reiterate the importance of press diversity to ensuring a healthy democracy.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin) moved a motion on establishing a Québec showcase on the Amazon website; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 84.1 and pursuant to Standing Order 146, Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, moved:

THAT, within the framework of the consideration of Bill 39, An Act to establish a new electoral system, the Committee on Institutions hold special consultations and public hearings on 22 January 2020 from 9.30 o'clock a.m. to 12.45 o'clock p.m. and from 2.00 o'clock p.m. to 5.45 o'clock p.m.; on 23 January 2020 from 9.30 o'clock a.m. to 12.30 p.m. and from 2.00 o'clock p.m. to 5.45 p.m.; on 4 February 2020 after Routine Proceedings until 5.45 o'clock p.m. and from 7.30 o'clock p.m. to 9.45 o'clock p.m.; on 5 February 2020 after Routine Proceedings until 1.00 o'clock p.m. and from 3.00 o'clock p.m. to 6:00 o'clock p.m.; and on 6 February 2020 after Routine Proceedings until 1.00 o'clock p.m. and from 3.00 o'clock p.m. to 6:00 o'clock p.m.;

THAT, for this purpose, the Committee hear the following individuals and organizations:

Mouvement démocratie nouvelle
Groupe Femmes, Politique et Démocratie
Conseil du statut de la femme
Quebec Student Union
Fédération étudiante collégiale du Québec

3 December 2019

Citoyenneté Jeunesse
Mercedez Roberge, Table des regroupements
provinciaux d'organismes communautaires et bénévoles
Fédération des travailleurs et travailleuses du Québec
Confédération des syndicats nationaux
Centrale des syndicats démocratiques
Centrale des syndicats du Québec
Fédération autonome de l'enseignement
Fédération québécoise des municipalités
Union des municipalités du Québec
Union des producteurs agricoles du Québec
Chief Electoral Officer
NPD-Québec
Conservative Party of Québec
Green Party of Quebec
Quebec Liberal Party
Manon Tremblay, Political Scientist at the University of
Ottawa
Christian Dufour, Political Scientist and Legal Expert
Éric Montigny, Political Science Professor and
Director of the Research Chair in Democracy and
Parliamentary Institutions
André Blais, Full Professor, Department of Political
Science, Université de Montréal
Louis Massicotte, Professor, Faculty of Social Sciences,
Université Laval
Assembly of the First Nations of Quebec and Labrador
Darren Hughes, General Director of the Electoral
Reform Society
Henry Milner, Professor of Political Science
Stéphane Rouillon, Mathematician and Electoral System
Expert
Marc-André Bodet, Associate Professor, Department of
Political Science, Université Laval
Paul Cliche, Author of the book "Pour réduire le déficit
démocratique au Québec : Le scrutin proportionnel"
Solution étudiante nationale pour un scrutin équitable
Table de concertation des organismes au service des
personnes réfugiées et immigrantes
Brian Tanguay, Professor, Department of Political
Science, Wilfrid Laurier University

3 December 2019

Louis Sormany, Deputy Secretary for Legislation at the
Ministère du Conseil exécutif du Québec from 2001
to 2013

Jean-Pierre Derriennic, Associate Professor, Faculty of
Social Sciences, Université Laval;

THAT a period of 12 minutes be set aside for opening
statements, allocated as follows: 5 minutes 34 seconds to the
parliamentary group forming the Government, 3 minutes
43 seconds to the Official Opposition, 56 seconds to the Second
Opposition Group, 56 seconds to the Third Opposition Group
and, lastly, 51 seconds to the Member for Chomedey;

THAT the presentation by each organization last no
longer than 10 minutes and the exchange with the Committee
members last no longer than 35 minutes, allocated as follows:
16 minutes 15 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the
Government, 10 minutes 50 seconds to the Official Opposition,
2 minutes 43 seconds to the Second Opposition Group,
2 minutes 43 seconds to the Third Opposition Group and
2 minutes 30 seconds to the Member for Chomedey;

THAT the Minister Responsible for Democratic
Institutions, Electoral Reform and Access to Information be a
member of the said Committee during its proceedings with
respect to this order of reference.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

3 December 2019

Pursuant to Standing Order 146, Mr. Caire, Deputy Government House Leader, moved:

THAT the order adopted by the Assembly on 26 November 2016 instructing the Committee on Transportation and the Environment to hold special consultations and public hearings within the framework of the consideration of Bill 44, An Act mainly to ensure effective governance of the fight against climate change and to promote electrification, be rescinded.

A debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **263** in Appendix)

Yeas: **96** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 84.1 and pursuant to Standing Order 146, Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, moved:

THAT, within the framework of the consideration of Bill 44, An Act mainly to ensure effective governance of the fight against climate change and to promote electrification, the Committee on Transportation and the Environment hold special consultations and public hearings on Tuesday, 21 January 2020 from 9.30 o'clock a.m. to 12.00 o'clock p.m. and from 2.00 o'clock p.m. to 5.45 o'clock p.m.; on Wednesday, 22 January 2020 from 9.30 o'clock a.m. to 12.30 o'clock p.m. and from 2.00 o'clock p.m. to 5.45 o'clock p.m.; on Thursday, 23 January 2020 from 9.30 o'clock a.m. to 12.30 o'clock p.m. and from 2.00 o'clock p.m. to 5.45 o'clock p.m.; on Tuesday, 4 February 2020 after Routine Proceedings from approximately 3.30 o'clock p.m. until 5.45 o'clock p.m. and from 7.30 o'clock p.m. to 9.00 o'clock p.m.; and on Wednesday, 5 February 2020 after Routine Proceedings from approximately 11.30 o'clock a.m. until 1.00 o'clock p.m.;

1548

3 December 2019

THAT, for this purpose, the Committee hear the following individuals and organizations:

Alliance Switch
FondAction CSN
Alain Webster, Full Professor, Université de Sherbrooke
Écotech Québec
Fédération québécoise des municipalités
Union des municipalités du Québec
Fédération des travailleurs et travailleuses du Québec
Association de l'industrie électrique du Québec
Vivre en Ville
Association québécoise de la production d'énergie renouvelable
Auditor General of Québec
Ville de Montréal
The Pacte
E-Taxi
Regroupement national des conseils régionaux de l'environnement du Québec
Association du transport urbain du Québec
Association des transporteurs collectifs ruraux du Québec
Ouranos
Normand Mousseau, Institut de l'énergie Trottier
Conseil national des jeunes ministres de l'Environnement of the Fondation Monique Fitz-Back
David Suzuki Foundation
Johanne Whitmore and Pierre-Olivier Pineau, Chair in Energy Sector Management, HEC Montréal
Conseil du patronat du Québec
Propulsion Québec
Hydro-Québec
Quebec Business Council on the Environment
Conseil québécois des entreprises en efficacité énergétique
Fédération des Chambres de commerce du Québec
Équiterre

3 December 2019

Association québécoise de lutte contre la pollution
atmosphérique
Quebec Environmental Law Centre
La planète s'invite au parlement
Nature Québec;

THAT a period of 12 minutes be set aside for opening statements, allocated as follows: 6 minutes to the parliamentary group forming the Government, 4 minutes to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition, 1 minute to the Second Opposition Group and 1 minute to the Third Opposition Group;

THAT the presentation by each individual or organization last no longer than 10 minutes and the exchange with the Committee members last no longer than 35 minutes, allocated as follows: 17 minutes 30 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Government, 11 minutes 40 seconds to the Official Opposition, 2 minutes 55 seconds to the Second Opposition Group and 2 minutes 55 seconds to the Third Opposition Group;

THAT the Committee clerk be permitted to modify the schedule so as to take into account any request for changes made by individuals and organizations;

THAT the Minister of the Environment and the Fight Against Climate Change be a member of the said Committee during its proceedings with respect to this order of reference.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

3 December 2019

Notices of Proceedings in Committees

Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

- the Committee on Labour and the Economy, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 27, An Act respecting mainly government organization as regards the economy and innovation;
- the Committee on Public Finance, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 37, An Act mainly to establish the Centre d'acquisitions gouvernementales and Infrastructures technologiques Québec;
- the Committee on Culture and Education, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 40, An Act to amend mainly the Education Act with regard to school organization and governance;
- the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain, to undertake clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 47, An Act to ensure the implementation of certain measures of the 2020–2024 partnership agreement between the Gouvernement du Québec and the municipalities.

Information on the Proceedings of the Assembly

The President heard arguments from all sides on the point of privilege or contempt raised by Mr. Nadeau-Dubois, House Leader of the Second Opposition Group, on 29 November 2019.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 53 and 59, Mr. Nadeau-Dubois, House Leader of the Second Opposition Group, tabled the following:

A copy of an excerpt from the digest of parliamentary rulings “Recueil de décisions concernant la procédure parlementaire” on Decision No. 67/28;
(Sessional Paper No. 1206-20191203)

3 December 2019

A copy of the response, dated 26 November 2019, by Mrs. Chantal Guertin, person in charge of access to documents and the protection of personal information for the Conseil de gestion du Fonds vert, regarding access-to-information request No. 2019-11-001 concerning the strategic plan of the Conseil de gestion du Fonds vert.

(Sessional Paper No. 1207-20191203)

The President took the matter under advisement.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Private Members' Public Bills

Passage in Principle

Mr. Picard (Chutes-de-la-Chaudière) moved that Bill 390, An Act to replace the Act respecting the Amicale des anciens parlementaires du Québec, do now pass in principle.

A debate arose thereon.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 53 and 59, Mr. Picard (Chutes-de-la-Chaudière) tabled the following:

A copy of the minutes of the extraordinary meeting of the board of directors of the Amicale des anciens parlementaires du Québec held on Monday, 2 December 2019.

(Sessional Paper No. 1208-20191203)

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried, and Bill 390 was accordingly passed in principle.

3 December 2019

Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, moved that Bill 390 be referred to the Committee of the Whole for clause-by-clause consideration.

The motion was carried.

Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, moved that the Assembly resolve itself into a Committee of the Whole for the clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 390, An Act to replace the Act respecting the Amicale des anciens parlementaires du Québec.

The motion was carried.

At 4.46 o'clock p.m., Mrs. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

The proceedings resumed at 4.51 o'clock p.m.

Committee of the Whole

Bill 390 was considered in Committee of the Whole, then amended and thereupon reported.

The report was concurred in.

Passage

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 230, Mr. Picard (Chutes-de-la-Chaudière) moved the passage of Bill 390, An Act to replace the Act respecting the Amicale des anciens parlementaires du Québec.

3 December 2019

A debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried and, accordingly, Bill 390 was passed.

Debates on Reports from Committees

The Assembly resumed the debate, which had been adjourned on 29 November 2019, on consideration of the report from the Committee on Public Administration, which met on 9 and 30 October and on 14 November 2019, to hear deputy ministers and heads of public bodies on Chapter 5 entitled “Computer Recovery” and Chapter 7 entitled “Information Technology Contracts – Follow-Up on a Special Audit” of the Auditor General of Québec’s May 2018 report; on the administrative management and financial commitments of the Ministère de la Santé et des Services sociaux; and on the administrative management and financial commitments of the Ministère de l’Éducation et de l’Enseignement supérieur. The report contains observations, conclusions and nine recommendations.

At 6.00 o’clock p.m., Mrs. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 7.30 o’clock p.m.

The proceedings resumed at 7.31 o’clock p.m.

The Assembly continued the debate on consideration of the report from the Committee on Public Administration.

The debate expired and, pursuant to Standing Order 95, no question was put.

3 December 2019

Government Bills

Report Stage

The Assembly took into consideration the report from the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain on its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 16, An Act mainly to regulate building inspections and divided co-ownership, to replace the name and improve the rules of operation of the Régie du logement and to amend the Act respecting the Société d'habitation du Québec and various legislative provisions concerning municipal affairs, together with the amendments transmitted by Mrs. Thériault (Anjou–Louis-Riel) and Mr. Fontecilla (Laurier-Dorion).

The amendments proposed by Mrs. Thériault (Anjou–Louis-Riel) were declared in order.

The amendments proposed by Mr. Fontecilla (Laurier-Dorion) were declared out of order, as the Standing Orders provide that, in order to be deemed in order, amendments must be relevant to the subject matter of a bill and consistent with its spirit and must not be contrary to its principle or introduce new ones. The first of the amendments proposed by the Member for Laurier-Dorion modifies the responsibilities of the Régie du logement by adding a rent registry. The second provides for the Minister to impose a moratorium on evictions in sectors where the rate of available housing is 3% or less. Although generally related to the housing sector, the proposed amendments introduce elements other than the measures contained in the bill.

A debate arose thereon.

The debate was adjourned in the name of Mr. Fontecilla (Laurier-Dorion).

3 December 2019

At 9.30 o'clock p.m., Mrs. Soucy, Second Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Wednesday, 4 December 2019 at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

FRANÇOIS PARADIS

President

3 December 2019

APPENDIX

Recorded Divisions

On the amendment proposed by Mr. Fortin (Pontiac):

(Division No. 259)

YEAS - 44

| | | | |
|-------------------|-----------------------|---------------------|-----------------|
| Anglade (PLQ) | Fournier (IND) | Marissal (QS) | Roy (PQ) |
| Arcand (PLQ) | Gaudreault (PQ) | Massé (QS) | (Bonaventure) |
| Arseneau (PQ) | (Jonquière) | Melançon (PLQ) | Sauvé (PLQ) |
| Barrette (PLQ) | Ghazal (QS) | Ménard (PLQ) | St-Pierre (PLQ) |
| Benjamin (PLQ) | Hivon (PQ) | Montpetit (PLQ) | Tanguay (PLQ) |
| Bérubé (PQ) | Kelley (PLQ) | Nadeau-Dubois (QS) | Thériault (PLQ) |
| Birnbaum (PLQ) | Labrie (QS) | Ouellet (PQ) | Weil (PLQ) |
| Charbonneau (PLQ) | LeBel (PQ) | Perry Mélançon (PQ) | Zanetti (QS) |
| Cicccone (PLQ) | (Rimouski) | Polo (PLQ) | |
| Derraji (PLQ) | Leduc (QS) | Rizqy (PLQ) | |
| Dorion (QS) | Leitão (PLQ) | Robitaille (PLQ) | |
| Fontecilla (QS) | Lessard-Therrien (QS) | Rotiroti (PLQ) | |
| Fortin (PLQ) | Maccarone (PLQ) | Rousselle (PLQ) | |

NAYS - 68

| | | | |
|-----------------|----------------------|------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Allaire (CAQ) | Émond (CAQ) | Lamothe (CAQ) | Provençal (CAQ) |
| Asselin (CAQ) | Fitzgibbon (CAQ) | LeBel (CAQ) | Reid (CAQ) |
| Bachand (CAQ) | Foster (CAQ) | (ChAMPLAIN) | Roberge (CAQ) |
| Bélanger (CAQ) | Girard (CAQ) | Lecours (CAQ) | Rouleau (CAQ) |
| Blais (CAQ) | (Lac-Saint-Jean) | (Les Plaines) | Roy (CAQ) |
| (Prévost) | Girard (CAQ) | Lecours (CAQ) | (Montarville) |
| Blais (CAQ) | (Groulx) | (Lotbinière-Frontenac) | Samson (CAQ) |
| (Abitibi-Ouest) | Girault (CAQ) | Lefebvre (CAQ) | Schneeberger (CAQ) |
| Bonnardel (CAQ) | Gronin (CAQ) | Legault (CAQ) | Simard (CAQ) |
| Boulet (CAQ) | Guilbault (CAQ) | Lemay (CAQ) | Skeete (CAQ) |
| Bussière (CAQ) | Guillemette (CAQ) | Lemieux (CAQ) | Tardif (CAQ) |
| Caire (CAQ) | Hébert (CAQ) | Lévesque (CAQ) | (Lavolette-Saint-Maurice) |
| Campeau (CAQ) | Isabelle (CAQ) | (Chapleau) | Tardif (CAQ) |
| Carmant (CAQ) | Jacques (CAQ) | Lévesque (CAQ) | (Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata) |
| Caron (CAQ) | Jolin-Barrette (CAQ) | (Chauveau) | Thouin (CAQ) |
| Charette (CAQ) | Julien (CAQ) | McCann (CAQ) | Tremblay (CAQ) |
| Chassé (CAQ) | Lachance (CAQ) | Picard (CAQ) | |
| Chassin (CAQ) | Lacombe (CAQ) | (Soulanges) | |
| D'Amours (CAQ) | Laforest (CAQ) | Poulin (CAQ) | |
| Dansereau (CAQ) | Laframboise (CAQ) | Proulx (CAQ) | |
| Dubé (CAQ) | Lafrenière (CAQ) | (Côte-du-Sud) | |
| Dufour (CAQ) | Lamontagne (CAQ) | Proulx (CAQ) | |
| | | (Berthier) | |

3 December 2019

On the report from the Committee on Health and Social Services:

(Division No. 260)

YEAS - 112

| | | | |
|-------------------|----------------------|------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Allaire (CAQ) | Émond (CAQ) | LeBel (PQ) | Proulx (CAQ) |
| Anglade (PLQ) | Fitzgibbon (CAQ) | (Rimouski) | (Côte-du-Sud) |
| Arcand (PLQ) | Fontecilla (QS) | Lecours (CAQ) | Provençal (CAQ) |
| Arseneau (PQ) | Fortin (PLQ) | (Lotbinière-Frontenac) | Reid (CAQ) |
| Asselin (CAQ) | Foster (CAQ) | Lecours (CAQ) | Rizqy (PLQ) |
| Bachand (CAQ) | Fournier (IND) | (Les Plaines) | Roberge (CAQ) |
| Barrette (PLQ) | Gaudreault (PQ) | Leduc (QS) | Robitaille (PLQ) |
| Bélanger (CAQ) | (Jonquière) | Lefebvre (CAQ) | Rotiroti (PLQ) |
| Benjamin (PLQ) | Ghazal (QS) | Legault (CAQ) | Rouleau (CAQ) |
| Bérubé (PQ) | Girard (CAQ) | Leitão (PLQ) | Rousselle (PLQ) |
| Birnbaum (PLQ) | (Lac-Saint-Jean) | Lemay (CAQ) | Roy (PQ) |
| Blais (CAQ) | Girard (CAQ) | Lemieux (CAQ) | (Bonaventure) |
| (Prévost) | (Groulx) | Lessard-Therrien (QS) | Roy (CAQ) |
| Blais (CAQ) | Girault (CAQ) | Lévesque (CAQ) | (Montarville) |
| (Abitibi-Ouest) | Grondin (CAQ) | (Chapleau) | Samson (CAQ) |
| Bonnardel (CAQ) | Guilbault (CAQ) | Lévesque (CAQ) | Sauvé (PLQ) |
| Boulet (CAQ) | Guillemette (CAQ) | (Chauveau) | Schneeberger (CAQ) |
| Bussière (CAQ) | Hébert (CAQ) | Maccarone (PLQ) | Simard (CAQ) |
| Caire (CAQ) | Hivon (PQ) | Marissal (QS) | Skeete (CAQ) |
| Campeau (CAQ) | Isabelle (CAQ) | Massé (QS) | St-Pierre (PLQ) |
| Carmant (CAQ) | Jacques (CAQ) | McCann (CAQ) | Tanguay (PLQ) |
| Caron (CAQ) | Jolin-Barrette (CAQ) | Melançon (PLQ) | Tardif (CAQ) |
| Charbonneau (PLQ) | Julien (CAQ) | Ménard (PLQ) | (Lavolette-Saint-Maurice) |
| Charette (CAQ) | Kelley (PLQ) | Montpetit (PLQ) | Tardif (CAQ) |
| Chassé (CAQ) | Labrie (QS) | Nadeau-Dubois (QS) | (Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata) |
| Chassin (CAQ) | Lachance (CAQ) | Ouellet (PQ) | Thériault (PLQ) |
| Ciccone (PLQ) | Lacombe (CAQ) | Perry Mélançon (PQ) | Thouin (CAQ) |
| D'Amours (CAQ) | Laforest (CAQ) | Picard (CAQ) | Tremblay (CAQ) |
| Dansereau (CAQ) | Laframboise (CAQ) | (Soulanges) | Weil (PLQ) |
| Derraji (PLQ) | Lafrenière (CAQ) | Polo (PLQ) | Zanetti (QS) |
| Dorion (QS) | Lamontagne (CAQ) | Poulin (CAQ) | |
| Dubé (CAQ) | Lamothe (CAQ) | Proulx (CAQ) | |
| Dufour (CAQ) | LeBel (CAQ) | (Berthier) | |
| | (Champlain) | | |

3 December 2019

On the motions moved by Mr. Legault, Premier:

(Division No. 261)

YEAS - 112

| | | | |
|-------------------|----------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Allaire (CAQ) | Émond (CAQ) | LeBel (PQ) | Proulx (CAQ) |
| Anglade (PLQ) | Fitzgibbon (CAQ) | (Rimouski) | (Côte-du-Sud) |
| Arcand (PLQ) | Fontecilla (QS) | Lecours (CAQ) | Provençal (CAQ) |
| Arseneau (PQ) | Fortin (PLQ) | (Lothbinière-Frontenac) | Reid (CAQ) |
| Asselin (CAQ) | Foster (CAQ) | Lecours (CAQ) | Rizqy (PLQ) |
| Bachand (CAQ) | Fournier (IND) | (Les Plaines) | Roberge (CAQ) |
| Barrette (PLQ) | Gaudreault (PQ) | Leduc (QS) | Robitaille (PLQ) |
| Bélanger (CAQ) | (Jonquière) | Lefebvre (CAQ) | Rotiroti (PLQ) |
| Benjamin (PLQ) | Ghazal (QS) | Legault (CAQ) | Rouleau (CAQ) |
| Bérubé (PQ) | Girard (CAQ) | Leitão (PLQ) | Rousselle (PLQ) |
| Birnbaum (PLQ) | (Lac-Saint-Jean) | Lemay (CAQ) | Roy (PQ) |
| Blais (CAQ) | Girard (CAQ) | Lemieux (CAQ) | (Bonaventure) |
| (Prévost) | (Groulx) | Lessard-Therrien (QS) | Roy (CAQ) |
| Blais (CAQ) | Girault (CAQ) | Lévesque (CAQ) | (Montarville) |
| (Abitibi-Ouest) | Grondin (CAQ) | (Chapleau) | Samson (CAQ) |
| Bonnardel (CAQ) | Guilbault (CAQ) | Lévesque (CAQ) | Sauvé (PLQ) |
| Boulet (CAQ) | Guillemette (CAQ) | (Chauveau) | Schneeberger (CAQ) |
| Bussière (CAQ) | Hébert (CAQ) | Maccarone (PLQ) | Simard (CAQ) |
| Caire (CAQ) | Hivon (PQ) | Marissal (QS) | Skeete (CAQ) |
| Campeau (CAQ) | Isabelle (CAQ) | Massé (QS) | St-Pierre (PLQ) |
| Carmant (CAQ) | Jacques (CAQ) | McCann (CAQ) | Tanguay (PLQ) |
| Caron (CAQ) | Jolin-Barrette (CAQ) | Melançon (PLQ) | Tardif (CAQ) |
| Charbonneau (PLQ) | Julien (CAQ) | Ménard (PLQ) | (Lavolette-Saint-Maurice) |
| Charette (CAQ) | Kelley (PLQ) | Montpetit (PLQ) | Tardif (CAQ) |
| Chassé (CAQ) | Labrie (QS) | Nadeau-Dubois (QS) | (Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata) |
| Chassin (CAQ) | Lachance (CAQ) | Ouellet (PQ) | Thériault (PLQ) |
| Ciccone (PLQ) | Lacombe (CAQ) | Perry Mélançon (PQ) | Thouin (CAQ) |
| D'Amours (CAQ) | Laforest (CAQ) | Picard (CAQ) | Tremblay (CAQ) |
| Dansereau (CAQ) | Laframboise (CAQ) | (Soulanges) | Weil (PLQ) |
| Derraji (PLQ) | Lafrenière (CAQ) | Polo (PLQ) | Zanetti (QS) |
| Dorion (QS) | Lamontagne (CAQ) | Poulin (CAQ) | |
| Dubé (CAQ) | Lamothe (CAQ) | Proulx (CAQ) | |
| Dufour (CAQ) | LeBel (CAQ) | (Berthier) | |
| | (Champlain) | | |

3 December 2019

On the motion moved by Mrs. Hivon (Joliette), together with Mr. Boulet, Minister of Labour, Employment and Social Solidarity, Mr. Rousselle (Vimont), Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin):

(Division No. 262)

YEAS - 110

| | | | |
|-------------------|-------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Allaire (CAQ) | Dufour (CAQ) | LeBel (CAQ) | Proulx (CAQ) |
| Anglade (PLQ) | Émond (CAQ) | (Champlain) | (Côte-du-Sud) |
| Arcand (PLQ) | Fitzgibbon (CAQ) | LeBel (PQ) | Proulx (CAQ) |
| Arseneau (PQ) | Fontecilla (QS) | (Rimouski) | (Berthier) |
| Asselin (CAQ) | Fortin (PLQ) | Lecours (CAQ) | Provençal (CAQ) |
| Bachand (CAQ) | Foster (CAQ) | (Lothbinière-Frontenac) | Reid (CAQ) |
| Barrette (PLQ) | Fournier (IND) | Lecours (CAQ) | Rizqy (PLQ) |
| Bélanger (CAQ) | Gaudreault (PQ) | (Les Plaines) | Roberge (CAQ) |
| Benjamin (PLQ) | (Jonquière) | Leduc (QS) | Robitaille (PLQ) |
| Bérubé (PQ) | Ghazal (QS) | Lefebvre (CAQ) | Rotiroti (PLQ) |
| Birnbaum (PLQ) | Girard (CAQ) | Leitão (PLQ) | Rouleau (CAQ) |
| Blais (CAQ) | (Lac-Saint-Jean) | Lemay (CAQ) | Rousselle (PLQ) |
| (Prévost) | Girard (CAQ) | Lemieux (CAQ) | Roy (CAQ) |
| Blais (CAQ) | (Groulx) | Lessard-Therrien (QS) | (Montarville) |
| (Abitibi-Ouest) | Girault (CAQ) | Lévesque (CAQ) | Roy (PQ) |
| Bonnardel (CAQ) | Grondin (CAQ) | (Chauveau) | (Bonaventure) |
| Boulet (CAQ) | Guilbault (CAQ) | Lévesque (CAQ) | Samson (CAQ) |
| Bussière (CAQ) | Guillemette (CAQ) | (Chapleau) | Sauvé (PLQ) |
| Caire (CAQ) | Hébert (CAQ) | Maccarone (PLQ) | Schneeberger (CAQ) |
| Campeau (CAQ) | Hivon (PQ) | Marissal (QS) | Simard (CAQ) |
| Carmant (CAQ) | Isabelle (CAQ) | Massé (QS) | Skeete (CAQ) |
| Caron (CAQ) | Jacques (CAQ) | McCann (CAQ) | St-Pierre (PLQ) |
| Charbonneau (PLQ) | Julien (CAQ) | Melançon (PLQ) | Tanguay (PLQ) |
| Charette (CAQ) | Kelley (PLQ) | Ménard (PLQ) | Tardif (CAQ) |
| Chassé (CAQ) | Labrie (QS) | Montpetit (PLQ) | (Lavolette-Saint-Maurice) |
| Chassin (CAQ) | Lachance (CAQ) | Nadeau-Dubois (QS) | Tardif (CAQ) |
| Ciccone (PLQ) | Lacombe (CAQ) | Ouellet (PQ) | (Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata) |
| D'Amours (CAQ) | Laforest (CAQ) | Perry Mélançon (PQ) | Thériault (PLQ) |
| Dansereau (CAQ) | Laframboise (CAQ) | Picard (CAQ) | Thouin (CAQ) |
| Derraji (PLQ) | Lafrenière (CAQ) | (Soulanges) | Tremblay (CAQ) |
| Dorion (QS) | Lamontagne (CAQ) | Polo (PLQ) | Weil (PLQ) |
| Dubé (CAQ) | Lamothe (CAQ) | Poulin (CAQ) | Zanetti (QS) |

3 December 2019

On the motion moved by Mr. Caire, Deputy Government House Leader:

(Division No. 263)

YEAS - 96

| | | | |
|--------------------------|---------------------------------|------------------------|--|
| Allaire (CAQ) | Fortin (PLQ) | Lecours (CAQ) | Robitaille (PLQ) |
| Anglade (PLQ) | Foster (CAQ) | (<i>Les Plaines</i>) | Rotiroti (PLQ) |
| Arcand (PLQ) | Gaudreault (PQ) | Leduc (QS) | Rousselle (PLQ) |
| Arseneau (PQ) | (<i>Jonquière</i>) | Lefebvre (CAQ) | Roy (PQ) |
| Asselin (CAQ) | Ghazal (QS) | Leitão (PLQ) | (<i>Bonaventure</i>) |
| Bachand (CAQ) | Girard (CAQ) | Lemay (CAQ) | Roy (CAQ) |
| Barrette (PLQ) | (<i>Lac-Saint-Jean</i>) | Lemieux (CAQ) | (<i>Montarville</i>) |
| Bélanger (CAQ) | Girard (CAQ) | Lessard-Therrien (QS) | Samson (CAQ) |
| Benjamin (PLQ) | (<i>Groulx</i>) | Lévesque (CAQ) | Sauvé (PLQ) |
| Birnbaum (PLQ) | Girault (CAQ) | (<i>Chapleau</i>) | Schneeberger (CAQ) |
| Blais (CAQ) | Grondin (CAQ) | Lévesque (CAQ) | Simard (CAQ) |
| (<i>Abitibi-Ouest</i>) | Guillemette (CAQ) | (<i>Chauveau</i>) | Skeete (CAQ) |
| Bussièrre (CAQ) | Hébert (CAQ) | Maccarone (PLQ) | St-Pierre (PLQ) |
| Caire (CAQ) | Hivon (PQ) | Marissal (QS) | Tanguay (PLQ) |
| Campeau (CAQ) | Isabelle (CAQ) | Massé (QS) | Tardif (CAQ) |
| Caron (CAQ) | Jacques (CAQ) | Melançon (PLQ) | (<i>Laviolette-Saint-Maurice</i>) |
| Charbonneau (PLQ) | Jolin-Barrette (CAQ) | Ménard (PLQ) | Tardif (CAQ) |
| Charette (CAQ) | Kelley (PLQ) | Montpetit (PLQ) | (<i>Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata</i>) |
| Chassé (CAQ) | Labrie (QS) | Nadeau-Dubois (QS) | Thériault (PLQ) |
| Chassin (CAQ) | Lachance (CAQ) | Ouellet (PQ) | Thouin (CAQ) |
| Ciccone (PLQ) | Laforest (CAQ) | Perry Melançon (PQ) | Tremblay (CAQ) |
| D'Amours (CAQ) | Laframboise (CAQ) | Polo (PLQ) | Weil (PLQ) |
| Dansereau (CAQ) | Lafrenière (CAQ) | Poulin (CAQ) | Zanetti (QS) |
| Derraji (PLQ) | Lamothe (CAQ) | Proulx (CAQ) | |
| Dubé (CAQ) | LeBel (CAQ) | (<i>Côte-du-Sud</i>) | |
| Dufour (CAQ) | (<i>Champlain</i>) | Provençal (CAQ) | |
| Émond (CAQ) | LeBel (PQ) | Reid (CAQ) | |
| Fitzgibbon (CAQ) | (<i>Rimouski</i>) | Rizqy (PLQ) | |
| Fontecilla (QS) | Lecours (CAQ) | Roberge (CAQ) | |
| | (<i>Lotbinière-Frontenac</i>) | | |