



NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF QUÉBEC

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-SECOND LEGISLATURE

Votes and Proceedings

of the Assembly

Tuesday, 4 February 2020 — No. 95

**President of the National Assembly:
Mr. François Paradis**

The Assembly was called to order at 1.40 o'clock p.m.

ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS

Statements by Members

Mr. Lafrenière (Vachon) made a statement to congratulate Dr. Laurent Duvernay-Tardif, member of the winning Super Bowl football team, the Kansas City Chiefs.

Mr. Birnbaum (D'Arcy-McGee) made a statement to pay tribute to Dr. Ronald Melzack for his contribution to pain research.

Ms. Tardif (Laviolette-Saint-Maurice) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Jacques Fortin for his dedication to the community of La Tuque.

Mr. Kelley (Jacques-Cartier) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Alan Dean for his commitment to the visually impaired.

Ms. Charest (Brome-Missisquoi) made a statement to underline the project for a new campus for the École des entrepreneurs du Québec.

4 February 2020

Ms. Blais (Abitibi-Ouest) made a statement to underline the success of the Apprentis spécialisés project aimed at keeping students in school.

Ms. Lachance (Bellechasse) made a statement to congratulate Ms. Stéphanie Ouellet, recipient of a grant for the development of her company, Boucherie La bouchée double.

Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia) made a statement to underline the 30th anniversary of Cégep de Matane.

Mr. Roberge (Chambly) made a statement to underline the 35th anniversary of Maison Simonne-Monet-Chartrand.

Mr. Lévesque (Chapleau) made a statement to underline the 25th anniversary of Centre d'Entraide La Destinée.

At 1.52 o'clock p.m., Mr. Picard, First Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

The proceedings resumed at 2.02 o'clock p.m.

4 February 2020

At the request of the President, the Assembly observed a moment of silence in memory of Mr. Robert Lamontagne, former Member for Roberval, Ms. Ginette Grandmont, former Member for Masson, Mr. Laurier Gardner, former Member for Arthabaska, Mr. Jean-Noël Tremblay, former Member for Chicoutimi, and Mr. Pierre-Étienne Laporte, former Member for Outremont.

The President read an excerpt of a letter, dated 9 December 2019, to Mr. Siegfried Peters, Secretary General of the National Assembly, from Me Pierre Reid, Chief Electoral Officer of Québec and Chair of the Commission de la représentation électorale, about the by-election held on 2 December 2019 in the electoral division of Jean-Talon.

The President then tabled the following:

The aforementioned letter accompanied by a notice proclaiming Ms. Joëlle Boutin the candidate elected in the electoral division of Jean-Talon.
(Sessional Paper No. 1283-20200204)

At the invitation of the President, Mr. Legault, Premier, and Mr. Lefebvre, Chief Government Whip, welcomed Ms. Boutin, the new Member for Jean-Talon.

Mr. Legault, Premier, Mr. Arcand, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Bérubé, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, and Ms. Massé, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, made some comments.

Ms. Boutin (Jean-Talon) then took the floor.

Lastly, the President welcomed the new Member.

Presenting Papers

Ms. McCann, Minister of Health and Social Services, tabled the following:

The action plan to attract and retain health and social services workers entitled “Le plan d’action pour l’attraction et la fidélisation des préposés aux bénéficiaires et des auxiliaires aux services de santé et sociaux”.
(Sessional Paper No. 1284-20200204)

4 February 2020

Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, tabled the following:

The 2018–2019 annual management report of Revenu Québec.
(Sessional Paper No. 1285-20200204)

Mr. Julien, Minister of Energy and Natural Resources, tabled the following:

The financial statements of Transition énergétique Québec for the fiscal year ending 31 March 2018.
(Sessional Paper No. 1286-20200204)

Mr. Boulet, Minister of Labour, Employment and Social Solidarity, tabled the following:

The 2019–2020 public employment services action plan;
(Sessional Paper No. 1287-20200204)

The 2018–2019 annual report of the Cree Hunters and Trappers Income Security Board.
(Sessional Paper No. 1288-20200204)

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, tabled the following:

The reply to a written question from Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin) on the functioning of the Commission des normes, de l'équité, de la santé et de la sécurité du travail – Question No. 95, *Order Paper and Notices* of 6 November 2019;
(Sessional Paper No. 1289-20200204)

4 February 2020

The replies to written questions from Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin) on putting in place a unified national program for access to speech therapist and audiologist services thus ensuring that all Québec children have access to such services within a reasonable 3-month period – Questions No. 96, 97 and 98, *Order Paper and Notices* of 6 November 2019;

(Sessional Paper No. 1290-20200204)

The reply to a written question from Ms. Ghazal (Mercier) on guidelines for the distribution of advertising flyers and their packaging – Question No. 99, *Order Paper and Notices* of 12 November 2019;

(Sessional Paper No. 1291-20200204)

The reply to a written question from Ms. Ghazal (Mercier) on the indemnities provided for by the public automobile insurance plan administered by the Société de l'assurance automobile du Québec – Question No. 101, *Order Paper and Notices* of 27 November 2019;

(Sessional Paper No. 1292-20200204)

The reply to a written question from Ms. Perry Mélançon (Gaspé) on the problem of coastal erosion in the administrative region of Gaspésie–Îles-de-la-Madeleine – Question No. 102, *Order Paper and Notices* of 28 November 2019;

(Sessional Paper No. 1293-20200204)

The reply to a written question from Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) on combining study programs related to business management (410.00), accounting and management (410.BO) and office automation (412.AO) to create a single college program in administration – Question No. 103, *Order Paper and Notices* of 29 November 2019;

(Sessional Paper No. 1294-20200204)

The reply to a written question from Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage) on the provision of interpretation services – Question No. 104, *Order Paper and Notices* of 3 December 2019;

(Sessional Paper No. 1295-20200204)

The reply to a written question from Mr. Kelley (Jacques-Cartier) on negotiations concerning the service agreement governing priority access to ten beds earmarked for veterans at Ste. Anne's Hospital (HSA) – Question No. 105, *Order Paper and Notices* of 4 December 2019;

(Sessional Paper No. 1296-20200204)

4 February 2020

The reply to a written question from Mr. Benjamin (Viau) on police stops – Question No. 106, *Order Paper and Notices* of 4 December 2019;
(Sessional Paper No. 1297-20200204)

The reply to a written question from Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage) on Form 1015 to reinstate the right of students with invisible disabilities to accommodation measures with respect to financial assistance – Question No. 107, *Order Paper and Notices* of 4 December 2019;
(Sessional Paper No. 1298-20200204)

The reply to a written question from Mr. Marissal (Rosemont) on the Caisse de dépôt et placement du Québec's loan to the state-owned corporation Empresas Públicas de Medellín (EPM) for the Hidroituango power project – Question No. 108, *Order Paper and Notices* of 4 December 2019;
(Sessional Paper No. 1299-20200204)

The reply to a written question from Ms. Lessard-Therrien (Rouyn-Noranda-Témiscamingue) on clarifications concerning funding for organizations involved in mental health services for agriculture-sector workers – Question No. 109, *Order Paper and Notices* of 4 December 2019;
(Sessional Paper No. 1300-20200204)

The reply to a written question from Ms. Weil (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce) on osteopathy – Question No. 110, *Order Paper and Notices* of 5 December 2019;
(Sessional Paper No. 1301-20200204)

The replies to written questions from Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage) on regional plans for medical staff (PREM) exemptions in 2019 in the Capitale-Nationale region and on obtaining more information concerning, more specifically, local community service centers (CLSC) in the Limoilou-Vanier sector – Questions No. 111 and 112, *Order Paper and Notices* of 5 December 2019;
(Sessional Paper No. 1302-20200204)

The reply to a written question from Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin) on maintaining the Clinique Santé Amitié's activities and upholding the independence required to carry out its community medicine mission – Question No. 113, *Order Paper and Notices* of 6 December 2019;
(Sessional Paper No. 1303-20200204)

4 February 2020

The reply to a written question from Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin) on state-owned corporation Hydro-Québec's investments following the passage of Bill 34, An Act to simplify the process for establishing electricity distribution rates – Question No. 114, *Order Paper and Notices* of 6 December 2019;

(Sessional Paper No. 1304-20200204)

The reply to a written question from Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin) on the Arrima Platform – Question No. 115, *Order Paper and Notices* of 6 December 2019;

(Sessional Paper No. 1305-20200204)

The reply to a written question from Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin) on a transfer from the Québec Government designed to help Montréal address significant challenges related to green infrastructure – Question No. 116, *Order Paper and Notices* of 6 December 2019.

(Sessional Paper No. 1306-20200204)

The President tabled the following:

The report from the Chief Electoral Officer of Québec on the implementation of section 490 of the *Election Act* within the framework of the by-election held on 2 December 2019 in the electoral division of Jean-Talon;

(Sessional Paper No. 1307-20200204)

The report from the Chief Electoral Officer of Québec on the official results of the by-election held on 2 December 2019 in the electoral division of Jean-Talon;

(Sessional Paper No. 1308-20200204)

A letter, dated 4 February 2020, he had received from Mr. Tanguay, Official Opposition House Leader, about statements made by the Premier and the Minister of Education and Higher Education about Bill 40, An Act to amend mainly the Education Act with regard to school organization and governance;

(Sessional Paper No. 1309-20200204)

The new seating plan of the National Assembly, dated 4 February 2020;

(Sessional Paper No. 1310-20200204)

4 February 2020

A copy of the notice of motion by Mr. Fortin (Pontiac) to be placed on the *Order Paper and Notices* of Wednesday, 5 February 2020 under Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition.

(Sessional Paper No. 1311-20200204)

Presenting Petitions

Mr. Nadeau-Dubois (Gouin) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on the public education available in Ahuntsic, signed by 630 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1312-20200204)

Ms. Ghazal (Mercier) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on measures to reduce traffic during construction work on the Réseau express métropolitain (REM – Metropolitan Express Network), signed by 2,108 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1313-20200204)

Ms. Lessard-Therrien (Rouyn-Noranda–Témiscamingue) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on reducing arsenic emissions and a study on the health of the Rouyn-Noranda population, signed by 1,927 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1314-20200204)

4 February 2020

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Ms. Lessard-Therrien (Rouyn-Noranda–Témiscamingue) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on reducing arsenic emissions and a study on the health of the Rouyn-Noranda population, signed by 3,830 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1315-20200204)

Complaints of Breach of Privilege or Contempt and Personal Explanations

Mr. Charette, Minister of the Environment and the Fight Against Climate Change, offered his apologies pursuant to a ruling rendered by the President on 5 December 2019, concerning the tabling of the strategic plan of the Conseil de gestion du Fonds vert.

Mr. Nadeau-Dubois, House Leader of the Second Opposition Group, informed the Assembly that the explanations provided by Mr. Charette, Minister of the Environment and the Fight Against Climate Change, satisfy him and thus end the complaints of breach of privilege or contempt procedure that had been initiated on 29 November 2019.

The President then informed the Assembly that he had, within the prescribed time, received a request from Mr. Tanguay, Official Opposition House Leader, to be heard on an alleged breach of privilege.

In his notice, the Official Opposition House Leader alleged that the Minister of Health and Social Services acted in contempt of Parliament on 7 December 2019 by asserting, during Oral Questions and Answers, that an action plan to address the shortage of orderlies in the health and social services network would be tabled as soon as possible.

The notice further stated the Official Opposition House Leader's intention to move a motion under Standing Orders 315 and following.

The President informed the Assembly that he would hear arguments at a later sitting.

4 February 2020

The President gave a directive on modifications in the distribution of certain measures and speaking times having become necessary following changes in the composition of the Assembly.

RULING FROM THE CHAIR

Following the successive changes in the composition of the Assembly since the beginning of the current legislature, in particular with the number of Members of the Official Opposition changing from 30 to 28, the Chair has analyzed the distribution of the different measures, based on the broad principles established at the beginning of the Legislature.

After analysis, and as has been done by the Chair on several occasions in the past, the distribution requires a slight adjustment, this time for Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition and for Interpellations. These measures will be allocated according to a 10-sitting cycle instead of an 11-sitting cycle such that the Official Opposition will now be entitled to 6 of these measures per cycle, while the others remain unchanged.

There is no need to make changes to other measures at this time.

The President then tabled the following:

A table indicating the distribution of Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition and Interpellations.

(Sessional Paper No. 1316-20200204)

Oral Questions and Answers

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

4 February 2020

Motions Without Notice

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Legault, Premier, together with Mr. Arcand, Leader of the Official Opposition, Ms. Massé, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, Mr. Bérubé, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly recall that, on 29 January 2017, Quebecers Ibrahima Barry, Mamadou Tanou Barry, Khaled Belkacemi, Abdelkrim Hassane, Azzeddine Soufiane and Aboubaker Thabti lost their lives while gathered in prayer (Québec mosque attacks);

THAT it applaud the courage and resilience of all those who were injured during that tragic event and must live today and for a long time to come with the aftermath of that event;

THAT it offer its sincere condolences to the families and friends of those who lost their lives;

THAT it denounce all hate speech and hateful acts that fuel prejudice against certain communities;

THAT it recall that the Québec people believe in the values of openness, tolerance, fraternity and solidarity;

THAT the National Assembly observe a moment of silence to honour the memory of those who died.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

At the request of Mr. Legault, Premier, the Assembly observed a minute of silence.

4 February 2020

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Arcand, Leader of the Official Opposition, together with Mr. Legault, Premier, Ms. Massé, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, Mr. Bérubé, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly deplore the tragedy of Ukrainian International Airlines Flight PS752, which was shot down over Iran on 8 January 2020, resulting in the deaths of 176 persons;

THAT it recall that among the dead were 63 Canadians, including five victims from Québec;

THAT it express its sadness and sympathy to the bereaved families;

THAT it ensure that the Federal Government implements the motion carried unanimously in the House of Commons on 27 January 2020 so the families are able to obtain answers to their questions as well as justice;

THAT, lastly, it honour the memory of the victims of this tragedy by observing a minute of silence.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

At the request of Mr. Arcand, Leader of the Official Opposition, the Assembly observed a minute of silence.

4 February 2020

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Ms. Massé, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, together with Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, Mr. Arcand, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Bérubé, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly pay tribute to Mr. Claude Béland, one of the most influential figures in Québec's cooperative movement, who passed away in November 2019;

THAT it underline Mr. Béland's outstanding career, during which he carried out countless mandates in the service of the Québec State;

THAT it recall his great humanity and democratic principles;

THAT it convey its condolences to his family, friends, colleagues and many admirers throughout Québec;

THAT, lastly, it observe a minute of silence in his memory.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

At the request of Ms. Massé, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, the Assembly observed a minute of silence.

Mr. Ouellet (René-Lévesque), together with Mr. Marissal (Rosemont), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved a motion concerning the Government's investments in Bombardier or one of its subsidiaries; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

4 February 2020

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 84.1 and pursuant to Standing Order 146, Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, moved:

THAT the National Assembly give effect to the order of reference given to the Committee on Health and Social Services within the framework of the consideration of Bill 52, An Act to strengthen the complaint examination process of the health and social services network, in particular for users receiving services from private institutions, and hold special consultations and public hearings on Tuesday, 18 February 2020 from 10.00 o'clock a.m. to 11.45 o'clock a.m., after Routine Proceedings until 5.45 o'clock p.m. and from 7.30 o'clock p.m. to 9.00 o'clock p.m.; on Wednesday, 19 February 2020 after Routine Proceedings until 1.00 o'clock p.m. and from 3.00 o'clock p.m. to 6.00 o'clock p.m.; and on Thursday, 20 February 2020 after Routine Proceedings until 1.00 o'clock p.m. and from 3.00 o'clock p.m. to 5.15 o'clock p.m.;

THAT, for this purpose, the Committee hear the following:

Conseil pour la protection des malades
Regroupement provincial des comités des usagers
Québec Public Protector (Québec Ombudsman)
Office des personnes handicapées du Québec
Réseau FADOQ
Association des groupes d'intervention en défense des droits en santé mentale du Québec
Fédération des Centres d'assistance et d'accompagnement aux plaintes
Barreau du Québec
Association des établissements privés conventionnés
Regroupement des Commissaires aux plaintes et à la qualité du Québec
Association québécoise de défense des droits des personnes retraitées et préretraitées
Fédération québécoise de l'autisme
Association des établissements de longue durée privés du Québec
Fédération professionnelle des Préposé(e)s aux bénéficiaires du Québec

4 February 2020

Ordre des infirmières et infirmiers du Québec
Fédération interprofessionnelle de la santé du Québec
Confédération des syndicats nationaux
Les Usagers de la Santé du Québec;

THAT a period of 12 minutes be set aside for opening statements, allocated as follows: 6 minutes to the parliamentary group forming the Government, 4 minutes to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition, 1 minute to the Second Opposition Group and 1 minute to the Third Opposition Group;

THAT the presentation by each organization last no longer than 10 minutes and the exchange with the Committee members last no longer than 35 minutes, allocated as follows: 17 minutes 30 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Government, 11 minutes 40 seconds to the Official Opposition, 2 minutes 55 seconds to the Second Opposition Group and 2 minutes 55 seconds to the Third Opposition Group;

THAT the Minister Responsible for Seniors and Informal Caregivers be a member of the said Committee during its proceedings with respect to this order of reference.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

Pursuant to Standing Order 129, Mr. Lefebvre, Chief Government Whip, moved:

THAT the Member for Jean-Talon be named a permanent member of the Committee on Public Administration in substitution for the Member for Repentigny;

THAT the Member for Jean-Talon be named a permanent member of the Committee on Labour and the Economy in substitution for the Member for Montmorency;

THAT these changes take effect on 5 February 2020.

The motion was carried.

4 February 2020

Notices of Proceedings in Committees

Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

- the Committee on Labour and the Economy, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 15, An Act respecting the Société de développement et de mise en valeur du Parc olympique;
- the Committee on Public Finance, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 37, An Act mainly to establish the Centre d'acquisitions gouvernementales and Infrastructures technologiques Québec;
- the Committee on Culture and Education, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 40, An Act to amend mainly the Education Act with regard to school organization and governance;
- the Committee on Transportation and the Environment, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 44, An Act mainly to ensure effective governance of the fight against climate change and to promote electrification.

And, by leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 143, he convened the following committee:

- the Committee on Institutions, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 39, An Act to establish a new electoral system.

4 February 2020

ORDERS OF THE DAY

At 3.56 o'clock p.m., at the request of Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, Mr. Picard, First Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until the expiry of the time limit for receiving notices for debates upon adjournment.

The proceedings resumed at 4.06 o'clock p.m.

At 4.08 o'clock p.m., at the request of Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, Mr. Picard, First Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 6.00 o'clock p.m.

The proceedings resumed at 6.00 o'clock p.m.

Debates upon Adjournment

At 6.00 o'clock p.m., the Assembly held three debates upon adjournment:

- the first, on a question from Ms. Sauvé (Fabre) to Ms. Blais, Minister Responsible for Seniors and Informal Caregivers, about the lack of short-term measures to compensate for the shortage of spaces in CHSLDs;

4 February 2020

- the second, on a question from Mr. Barrette (La Pinière) to Mr. Bonnardel, Minister of Transport, about the significant impact of the third link on traffic in the Saint-Roch district;
- the third, on a question from Ms. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent) to Mr. Roberge, Minister of Education and Higher Education, about the CAQ Government's complete improvisation with regard to Bill 40, An Act to amend mainly the Education Act with regard to school organization and governance.

Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, moved the adjournment of the Assembly until Wednesday, 5 February 2020 at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, at 6.37 o'clock p.m., Ms. Soucy, Second Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Wednesday, 5 February 2020 at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

4 February 2020

ROYAL ASSENT

On Wednesday, 11 December 2019 at 2.15 o'clock p.m. in the Office of the Lieutenant-Governor, in the presence of Ms. Laforest, Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing, and Ms. Proulx, Minister for Regional Economic Development, Delegates of the Premier, and of Ms. Durepos, Director of the Committees Service and Delegate of the Secretary General, the Honourable J. Michel Doyon, Lieutenant-Governor of Québec, was pleased to assent to the following bills:

- 16 An Act mainly to regulate building inspections and divided co-ownership, to replace the name and improve the rules of operation of the Régie du logement and to amend the Act respecting the Société d'habitation du Québec and various legislative provisions concerning municipal affairs
- 27 An Act respecting mainly government organization as regards the economy and innovation
- 47 An Act to ensure the implementation of certain measures of the 2020–2024 partnership agreement between the Gouvernement du Québec and the municipalities
- 54 An Act concerning the prohibition against bringing certain actions related to the operation of off-highway vehicles on trails forming part of the interregional network
- 204 An Act respecting the establishment of a special taxation scheme for Port of Havre-Saint-Pierre
- 205 An Act respecting Ville de Gaspé
- 206 An Act to amend the Act respecting the charter of the Coopérative fédérée de Québec
- 207 An Act respecting Ville de Murdochville
- 208 An Act concerning the transfer of a right of emphyteusis to the Ville d'Alma

FRANÇOIS PARADIS

President