

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF QUÉBEC

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-SECOND LEGISLATURE

Votes and Proceedings

of the Assembly

Wednesday, 30 September 2020 - No. 128

President of the National Assembly: Mr. François Paradis

The Assembly was called to order at 9:40 a.m.

ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS

Statements by Members

.

Ms. Guilbault (Louis-Hébert) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Pierre-Luc Bédard, recipient of the Medal of the National Assembly.

Ms. Girault (Bertrand) made a statement to underline the work of the organization La Manufacture Laurentides.

Ms. Robitaille (Bourassa-Sauvé) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Patrice Laplante and Ms. Louise Robic, former Members of the National Assembly.

Mr. Lévesque (Chapleau) made a statement to underline the contribution of Gatineau.TV in promoting its community.

Mr. Marissal (Rosemont) made a statement to applaud the tenacity and creativity of small businesses during the pandemic.

Mr. Lemieux (Saint-Jean) made a statement to encourage citizens to take a pause from their daily activities.

Mr. Lévesque (Chauveau) made a statement to underline the holding of Lac-Beauport's Semaine de la consommation locale.

Ms. Gaudreault (Hull) made a statement to pay tribute to the organization FabLab Onaki, recipient of the Social Impact Award.

Ms. Soucy (Saint-Hyacinthe) made a statement to applaud the creation of a committee working to rehouse the victims of fires.

At 9:51 a.m., Mr. Picard, First Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

The proceedings resumed at 10:01 a.m.

Moment of reflection

Introduction of Bills

Ms. Laforest, Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing, moved that leave be granted to introduce the following bill:

67 An Act to establish a new development regime for the flood zones of lakes and watercourses, to temporarily grant municipalities powers enabling them to respond to certain needs and to amend various provisions

The question was put on this motion; in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 15 September 2020, a vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **471** in Appendix)

Yeas: 120 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 0

Accordingly, Bill 67 was introduced in the Assembly.

Mr. Arcand (Mont-Royal–Outremont) moved that leave be granted to introduce the following bill:

691 An Act to amend the Act respecting the Ministère des Transports to maintain air transportation services in certain regions of Québec

The question was put on this motion; in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 15 September 2020, a vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **472** in Appendix)

Yeas: 120 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 0

Accordingly, Bill 691 was introduced in the Assembly.

Presenting Reports from Committees

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 61 and 174, Ms. Soucy, Second Vice-President, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Institutions, which held public hearings on 22, 23, 24 and 29 September 2020 within the framework of special consultations on Bill 64, An Act to modernize legislative provisions as regards the protection of personal information.

(Sessional Paper No. 1858-20200930)

Oral Questions and Answers

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

Motions Without Notice

Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine), together with Ms. Montpetit (Maurice-Richard), Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage) and Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey), moved a motion on the Government's press briefings on the COVID-19 pandemic situation; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent. By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Carmant, Minister for Health and Social Services, together with Ms. Maccarone (Westmount–Saint-Louis), Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), Mr. LeBel (Rimouski), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

> THAT the National Assembly mark the International Day of the Deaf, which took place on 26 September 2020 and is a day that has been recognized by the United Nations since 1959;

> THAT the National Assembly recognize Deaf culture and identity;

THAT it pledge to promote the use and dissemination of the Quebec Sign Language (LSQ), in particular by establishing a simultaneous interpretation service in LSQ for the Assembly's proceedings, giving first priority to Routine Proceedings;

THAT, lastly, it promote accessibility to services for the Deaf and sign language communities.

The question was put on this motion; in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 15 September 2020, a vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **473** in Appendix)

Yeas: **120** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

Ms. Montpetit (Maurice-Richard), together with Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine) and Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey), moved a motion on the tabling of certain documents from the Institut national de santé publique du Québec; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent. Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), together with Ms. Montpetit (Maurice-Richard), Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved a motion on compulsory overtime by professionals in the Québec health and social services network; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), together with Ms. Labrie (Sherbrooke), Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) and Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey), moved a motion on the public nature of the deliberations of Québec's elected municipal officials; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

Notices of Proceedings in Committees

Mr. Caire, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

- the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries, Energy and Natural Resources, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 50, An Act respecting the leasing of part of the water power of the Shipshaw River;
- the Committee on Public Finance, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 53, Credit Assessment Agents Act;
- the Committee on Citizen Relations, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 56, An Act to recognize and support caregivers and to amend various legislative provisions;

 the Committee on Health and Social Services, to continue its clause-byclause consideration of Bill 52, An Act to strengthen the complaint examination process of the health and social services network, in particular for users receiving services from private institutions.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

At 11:26 a.m., Ms. Soucy, Second Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

The proceedings resumed at 11:33 a.m.

Mr. Picard, First Vice-President, informed the Assembly that he had received a request for a debate upon adjournment to be held on Thursday, 1 October 2020, on a question from Mr. Kelley (Jacques-Cartier) to Ms. Guilbault, Minister of Public Security, on the CAQ Government's lack of respect for Indigenous communities.

Government Bills

Passage in Principle

The Assembly resumed the debate, which had been adjourned on 29 September 2020, on the motion moved by Mr. Charette, Minister of the Environment and the Fight Against Climate Change, that Bill 46, An Act to amend the Natural Heritage Conservation Act and other provisions, do now pass in principle.

The debate being concluded, the question was put on the motion; at 12:51 p.m., in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 15 September 2020, Mr. Picard, First Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for no longer than 10 minutes so that a recorded division could be held.

The proceedings resumed at 12:59 p.m.

A vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **474** in Appendix)

Yeas: **120** Nays: **1** Abstentions: **0**

Accordingly, Bill 46 was passed in principle.

Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, moved that Bill 46 be referred to the Committee on Transportation and the Environment for clause-by-clause consideration.

The question was put on this motion; in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 15 September 2020, a vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 475 in Appendix)

Yeas: 119 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 0

At 1:00 p.m., Mr. Picard, First Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 3:00 p.m.

The proceedings resumed at 3:00 p.m.

Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition

Mr. Nadeau-Dubois, House Leader of the Second Opposition Group, moved:

That the National Assembly acknowledge the recent reports on the situation of elderly Quebecers living in CHSLDs;

THAT it recall that numerous reports have raised the alarm on living conditions in CHSLDs over the last 20 years;

THAT it recognize that, as specified in the investigation report on the events at the CHSLD Herron entitled "Rapport d'enquête sur les événements survenus dans le cadre de la pandémie de la COVID-19 au CHSLD Herron", as conditions in that CHSLD worsened each day, the public authorities' actions on the ground were further complicated and slowed due to its private status; THAT it recall and reaffirm the strong social and political consensus in Québec about the public nature of our health and social services system;

THAT it recall that the Québec State is best equipped to meet the needs of the most vulnerable populations, in particular seniors who are sick or losing autonomy;

THAT the National Assembly ask the Québec government to act without delay in nationalizing all private CHSLDs in Québec.

Ms. Soucy, Second Vice-President, informed the Assembly of the allocation of speaking time for the proceedings with respect to this limited debate: 10 minutes to the mover of the motion for his reply; 48 minutes 30 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Government; 28 minutes 5 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition; 21 minutes 23 seconds to the Second Opposition Group; 9 minutes 2 seconds to the Third Opposition Group; and 1 minute 30 seconds to each independent Member. However, if only one independent Member takes part in the debate, that Member's speaking time is 2 minutes. Within this framework, any time not used by the independent Members or by a parliamentary group shall be redistributed among the parliamentary groups in the proportions established above.

A debate arose thereon.

At the end of his address, Mr. Carmant, Minister for Health and Social Services, moved:

THAT the motion moved by Mr. Nadeau-Dubois, House Leader of the Second Opposition Group, be amended as follows:

In the last paragraph, by replacing "act without delay in nationalizing all private CHSLDs in Québec" by "continue to harmonize Québec CHSLDs to make them institutions under agreement as was done for the CHSLD Santé Courville in Waterloo, Estrie". The motion, as amended, would read as follows:

That the National Assembly acknowledge the recent reports on the situation of elderly Quebecers living in CHSLDs;

THAT it recall that numerous reports have raised the alarm on living conditions in CHSLDs over the last 20 years;

THAT it recognize that, as specified in the investigation report on the events at the CHSLD Herron entitled "Rapport d'enquête sur les événements survenus dans le cadre de la pandémie de la COVID-19 au CHSLD Herron", as conditions in that CHSLD worsened each day, the public authorities' actions on the ground were further complicated and slowed due to its private status;

THAT it recall and reaffirm the strong social and political consensus in Québec about the public nature of our health and social services system;

THAT it recall that the Québec State is best equipped to meet the needs of the most vulnerable populations, in particular seniors who are sick or losing autonomy;

THAT the National Assembly ask the Québec government to continue to harmonize Québec CHSLDs to make them institutions under agreement as was done for the CHSLD Santé Courville in Waterloo, Estrie.

The debate continued on the main motion moved by Mr. Nadeau-Dubois, House Leader of the Second Opposition Group, and on the amendment motion moved by Mr. Carmant, Minister for Health and Social Services, subject to the permission of its author.

At the end of his address, Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) moved:

THAT the fifth paragraph of the motion moved by Mr. Nadeau-Dubois, House Leader of the Second Opposition Group, be amended by inserting ", by ensuring adequate funding for the health and social services system," after "Québec State".

The motion, as amended, would read as follows:

That the National Assembly acknowledge the recent reports on the situation of elderly Quebecers living in CHSLDs;

THAT it recall that numerous reports have raised the alarm on living conditions in CHSLDs over the last 20 years;

THAT it recognize that, as specified in the investigation report on the events at the CHSLD Herron entitled "Rapport d'enquête sur les événements survenus dans le cadre de la pandémie de la COVID-19 au CHSLD Herron", as conditions in that CHSLD worsened each day, the public authorities' actions on the ground were further complicated and slowed due to its private status;

THAT it recall and reaffirm the strong social and political consensus in Québec about the public nature of our health and social services system;

THAT it recall that the Québec State, by ensuring adequate funding for the health and social services system, is best equipped to meet the needs of the most vulnerable populations, in particular seniors who are sick or losing autonomy;

THAT the National Assembly ask the Québec government to act without delay in nationalizing all private CHSLDs in Québec.

The debate continued on the main motion moved by Mr. Nadeau-Dubois, House Leader of the Second Opposition Group, and on the amendment motions moved by Mr. Carmant, Minister for Health and Social Services, and by Mr. LeBel (Rimouski), subject to the permission of its author.

Pursuant to Standing Order 98.1, Mr. Nadeau-Dubois, House Leader of the Second Opposition Group, accepted the amendment proposed by Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) and refused the amendment proposed by Mr. Carmant, Minister for Health and Social Services.

The debate being concluded, the question was first put on the amendment motion moved by Mr. LeBel (Rimouski); at 4:59 p.m., in accordance with the motion carried on 15 September 2020, Ms. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for no longer than 10 minutes so that a recorded division could be held.

The proceedings resumed at 5:03 p.m.

A vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 476 in Appendix)

Yeas: 46 Nays: 73 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion moved by Mr. Nadeau-Dubois, House Leader of the Second Opposition Group; in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 15 September 2020, a vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 477 in Appendix)

Yeas: 19 Nays: 73 Abstentions: 27

Government Bills

Passage

Mr. Charette, Minister of the Environment and the Fight Against Climate Change, moved the passage of Bill 44, An Act mainly to ensure effective governance of the fight against climate change and to promote electrification.

A debate arose thereon.

At 6:00 p.m., Ms. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until 1 October 2020 at 9:40 a.m.

FRANÇOIS PARADIS

President

APPENDIX

Recorded Divisions

On the motion moved by Ms. Laforest, Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing:

(Division No. 471)

YEAS - 120

Allaire (CAQ) Anglade (OLP) Arcand (QLP) Arseneau (PQ) Asselin (CAQ) Bachand (CAQ) Barrette (*QLP*) Bélanger (CAQ) Benjamin (QLP) Bérubé (PQ) Birnbaum (QLP) Blais (CAQ) (Prévost) Blais (CAQ) (Abitibi-Ouest) Bonnardel (CAQ) Boulet (CAQ) Boutin (CAQ) Bussière (CAQ) Caire (CAQ)Campeau (CAQ) Carmant (CAQ) Caron (CAQ) Charbonneau (OLP) Charest (CAQ) Charette (CAQ) Chassé (CAQ) Chassin (CAQ) Ciccone (QLP) D'Amours (CAQ) Dansereau (CAQ) David (QLP) Derraji (OLP) Dorion (QS) Dubé (CAQ)

Dufour (CAQ) Émond (CAO) Fitzgibbon (CAQ) Fontecilla (OS) Fortin (QLP) Foster (CAQ) Fournier (IND) Gaudreault (PQ)(Jonquière) Ghazal (QS) Girard (CAQ) (Lac-Saint-Jean) Girard (CAO) (Groulx) Girault (CAQ) Grondin (CAQ) Guilbault (CAQ) Guillemette (CAQ) Hébert (CAQ) Hivon (PQ) Isabelle (CAQ) Jacques (CAQ) Jeannotte (CAO) Jolin-Barrette (CAO) Julien (CAQ) Kelley (QLP) Labrie (QS)Lachance (CAQ)Lacombe (CAQ)Laforest (CAO) Laframboise (CAQ) Lafrenière (CAQ) Lamontagne (CAO) Lamothe (CAQ) Lavallée (CAO)

LeBel (PQ)(Rimouski) LeBel (CAQ) (Champlain) Lecours (CAQ) (Lotbinière-Frontenac) Lecours (CAQ) (Les Plaines) Leduc (QS) Lefebvre (CAQ) Legault (CAQ) Leitão (QLP) Lemay (CAO) Lemieux (CAQ) Lessard-Therrien (QS)Lévesque (CAQ) (Chauveau) Lévesque (CAQ) (Chapleau) Maccarone (QLP) Marissal (QS) Martel (CAQ) Massé (QS) McCann (CAO) Melançon (*QLP*) Ménard (QLP) Montpetit (QLP) Nadeau-Dubois (QS) Nichols (QLP) Ouellet (PO) Perry Mélançon (PQ) Picard (CAQ) (Soulanges) Polo (QLP) Poulin (CAO)

Proulx (CAQ) (Côte-du-Sud) Proulx (CAQ) (Berthier) Provençal (CAQ) Reid (CAQ) Richard (PQ) Rizqy (QLP) Roberge (CAQ) Robitaille (*QLP*) Rotiroti (QLP) Rouleau (CAQ) Rousselle (*QLP*) Roy (PQ)(Bonaventure) Roy (CAQ) (Montarville) Samson (CAQ) Sauvé (*QLP*) Schneeberger (CAQ) Simard (CAQ) Skeete (CAQ) St-Pierre (OLP) Tanguay (OLP) Tardif (CAQ) (Laviolette–Saint-Maurice) Tardif (CAQ) (Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata) Thériault (QLP) Thouin (CAO) Tremblay (CAQ)Weil (QLP) Zanetti (OS)

On the motion moved by Mr. Arcand (Mont-Royal–Outremont):

(Division No. 472)

(Identical to Division No. 471)

On the motion moved by Mr. Carmant, Minister for Health and Social Services, together with Ms. Maccarone (Westmount–Saint-Louis), Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), Mr. LeBel (Rimouski), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin):

(Division No. 473)

(Identical to Division No. 471)

On the motion moved by Mr. Charette, Minister of the Environment and the Fight Against Climate Change:

(Division No. 474)

YEAS - 120						
Allaire (CAQ)	Dufour (CAQ)	LeBel (PQ)	Proulx (CAQ)			
Anglade (QLP)	Émond (CAQ)	(Rimouski)	(Côte-du-Sud)			
Arcand (QLP)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)			
Arseneau (PQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	(Champlain)	(Berthier)			
Asselin (CAQ)	Fortin (<i>QLP</i>)	Lecours (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)			
Bachand (CAQ)	Foster (CAQ)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Reid (CAQ)			
Barrette (QLP)	Fournier (IND)	Lecours (CAQ)	Richard (PQ)			
Bélanger (CAQ)	Gaudreault (PQ)	(Les Plaines)	Rizqy (QLP)			
Benjamin (QLP)	(Jonquière)	Leduc (QS)	Roberge (CAQ)			
Bérubé (PQ)	Ghazal (QS)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Robitaille (QLP)			
Birnbaum (QLP)	Girard (CAQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Rotiroti (QLP)			
Blais (CAQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Leitão (QLP)	Rouleau (CAQ)			
(Prévost)	Girard (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	Rousselle (QLP)			
Blais (CAQ)	(Groulx)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Roy (PQ)			
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Girault (CAQ)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	(Bonaventure)			
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Roy (CAQ)			
Boulet (CAQ)	Guilbault (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	(Montarville)			
Boutin (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Samson (CAQ)			
Bussière (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Sauvé (QLP)			
Caire (CAQ)	Hivon (PQ)	Maccarone (QLP)	Schneeberger (CAQ)			
Campeau (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	Marissal (QS)	Simard (CAQ)			
Carmant (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Skeete (CAQ)			
Caron (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Massé (QS)	St-Pierre (QLP)			
Charbonneau (QLP)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)	Tanguay (QLP)			
Charest (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Melançon (QLP)	Tardif (CAQ)			
Charette (CAQ)	Kelley (QLP)	Ménard (QLP)	(Laviolette–Saint-Maurice)			
Chassé (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Montpetit (QLP)	Tardif (CAQ)			
Chassin (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	(Rivière-du-Loup–Témiscouata)			
Ciccone (QLP)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Nichols (QLP)	Thériault (QLP)			
D'Amours (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	Thouin (CAQ)			
Dansereau (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)			
David (QLP)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	Weil (QLP)			
Derraji (QLP)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	(Soulanges)	Zanetti (QS)			
Dorion (QS)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Polo (QLP)				
Dubé (CAQ)	Lavallée (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)				

YEAS - 120

Ouellette (IND)

NAYS - 1

On the motion moved by Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader:

(Division No. 475)

YEAS - 119

Allaire (CAQ)Dufour (CAQ) Anglade (QLP) Arcand (*QLP*) Arseneau (PO) Asselin (CAO) Fortin (OLP) Bachand (CAQ) Foster (CAQ) Barrette (QLP) Bélanger (CAQ) (Jonquière) Benjamin (QLP) Ghazal (QS)Bérubé (PQ) Girard (CAQ) Birnbaum (QLP) Blais (CAQ) Girard (CAQ) (Prévost) (Groulx) Blais (CAO) Girault (CAQ) (Abitibi-Ouest) Bonnardel (CAO) Boulet (CAQ) Boutin (CAQ) Hébert (CAQ) Bussière (CAQ) Hivon (PQ) Caire (CAQ)Campeau (CAQ) Carmant (CAQ) Caron (CAQ) Charbonneau (*QLP*) Julien (CAQ) Charest (CAQ) Kelley (QLP) Charette (CAQ) Labrie (QS)Chassé (CAQ) Chassin (CAO) Ciccone (QLP) D'Amours (CAQ) Dansereau (CAQ) David (QLP) Derraji (QLP) Dorion (QS) Dubé (CAQ) LeBel (PQ) (Rimouski)

Émond (CAQ) Fitzgibbon (CAQ) Fontecilla (QS) Gaudreault (PQ) (Lac-Saint-Jean) Grondin (CAQ) Guilbault (CAO) Guillemette (CAQ) Isabelle (CAQ) Jacques (CAQ) Jeannotte (CAQ) Jolin-Barrette (CAQ) Lachance (CAQ)Lacombe (CAQ) Laforest (CAQ) Laframboise (CAQ) Lafrenière (CAQ) Lamontagne (CAQ) Lamothe (CAQ) Lavallée (CAQ)

LeBel (CAQ) (Champlain) Lecours (CAQ) (Lotbinière-Frontenac) Lecours (CAO) (Les Plaines) Leduc (QS)Lefebvre (CAQ) Legault (CAQ) Leitão (QLP) Lemay (CAQ) Lemieux (CAQ) Lessard-Therrien (OS) Lévesque (CAQ) (Chauveau) Lévesque (CAO) (Chapleau) Maccarone (OLP) Marissal (QS) Martel (CAQ) Massé (QS) McCann (CAQ) Melançon (QLP) Ménard (QLP) Montpetit (OLP) Nadeau-Dubois (QS) Nichols (*QLP*) Ouellet (PO) Perry Mélançon (PQ) Picard (CAQ) (Soulanges) Polo (QLP) Poulin (CAQ) Proulx (CAQ) (Côte-du-Sud)

Proulx (CAQ) (Berthier) Provençal (CAQ) Reid (CAQ) Richard (PO) Rizqy (QLP) Roberge (CAQ) Robitaille (*QLP*) Rotiroti (QLP) Rouleau (CAQ) Rousselle (QLP) Roy (PQ)(Bonaventure) Roy (CAQ) (Montarville) Samson (CAO) Sauvé (QLP) Schneeberger (CAQ) Simard (CAO) Skeete (CAQ) St-Pierre (QLP) Tanguay (QLP) Tardif (CAQ) (Laviolette-Saint-Maurice) Tardif (CAO) (Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata) Thériault (*QLP*) Thouin (CAO) Tremblay (CAQ) Weil (OLP) Zanetti (QS)

On the motion moved by Mr. LeBel (Rimouski):

(Division No. 476)

YEAS - 46

Anglade (<i>QLP</i>) Arcand (<i>QLP</i>) Arseneau (<i>PQ</i>) Barrette (<i>QLP</i>) Benjamin (<i>QLP</i>) Bérubé (<i>PQ</i>) Birnbaum (<i>QLP</i>) Charbonneau (<i>QLP</i>) Ciccone (<i>QLP</i>) David (<i>QLP</i>) Derraji (<i>QLP</i>) Dorion (<i>QS</i>) Fontecilla (<i>QS</i>)	Fortin (<i>QLP</i>) Gaudreault (<i>PQ</i>) (<i>Jonquière</i>) Ghazal (<i>QS</i>) Hivon (<i>PQ</i>) Kelley (<i>QLP</i>) Labrie (<i>QS</i>) LeBel (<i>PQ</i>) (<i>Rimouski</i>) Leduc (<i>QS</i>) Leitão (<i>QLP</i>) Lessard-Therrien (<i>QS</i>) Maccarone (<i>QLP</i>)	Marissal (QS) Massé (QS) Melançon (QLP) Ménard (QLP) Montpetit (QLP) Nadeau-Dubois (QS) Nichols (QLP) Ouellet (PQ) Perry Mélançon (PQ) Polo (QLP) Richard (PQ) Rizqy (QLP) Robitaille (QLP)	Rotiroti (<i>QLP</i>) Rousselle (<i>QLP</i>) Roy (<i>PQ</i>) (<i>Bonaventure</i>) Sauvé (<i>QLP</i>) St-Pierre (<i>QLP</i>) Tanguay (<i>QLP</i>) Thériault (<i>QLP</i>) Weil (<i>QLP</i>) Zanetti (<i>QS</i>)			
NAYS - 73						
Allaire (CAQ) Asselin (CAQ) Bachand (CAQ) Bélanger (CAQ) Blais (CAQ) (Prévost) Blais (CAQ) (Abitibi-Ouest) Bonnardel (CAQ) Boulet (CAQ) Boulet (CAQ) Boutin (CAQ) Boutin (CAQ) Caire (CAQ) Campeau (CAQ) Carmant (CAQ) Caron (CAQ) Charest (CAQ) Charest (CAQ) Charette (CAQ) Chassé (CAQ) Chassin (CAQ) D'Amours (CAQ)	Dubé (CAQ) Dufour (CAQ) Émond (CAQ) Fitzgibbon (CAQ) Foster (CAQ) Girard (CAQ) (Lac-Saint-Jean) Girard (CAQ) (Groulx) Girault (CAQ) Guilbault (CAQ) Guilbault (CAQ) Guilbault (CAQ) Guilbault (CAQ) Hébert (CAQ) Isabelle (CAQ) Jacques (CAQ) Jacques (CAQ) Jolin-Barrette (CAQ) Julien (CAQ) Lachance (CAQ) Lacombe (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ) Lafrenière (CAQ) Lamontagne (CAQ) Lamothe (CAQ) Lamothe (CAQ) Lavallée (CAQ) Lebel (CAQ) (<i>Champlain</i>) Lecours (CAQ) (<i>Lotbinière-Frontenac</i>) Lecours (CAQ) (<i>Les Plaines</i>) Lefebvre (CAQ) Legault (CAQ) Lemieux (CAQ) Lemieux (CAQ) Lévesque (CAQ) Lévesque (CAQ) Lévesque (CAQ) Lévesque (CAQ) (<i>Chapleau</i>) Lévesque (CAQ) (<i>Chaveau</i>) Martel (CAQ) Picard (CAQ) (<i>Soulanges</i>)	Poulin (CAQ) Proulx (CAQ) (Côte-du-Sud) Proulx (CAQ) (Berthier) Provençal (CAQ) Reid (CAQ) Roberge (CAQ) Rouleau (CAQ) Roy (CAQ) (Montarville) Samson (CAQ) Schneeberger (CAQ) Simard (CAQ) Skeete (CAQ) Tardif (CAQ) (Laviolette–Saint-Maurice) Tardif (CAQ) (Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata) Thouin (CAQ) Tremblay (CAQ)			

On the motion moved by Mr. Nadeau-Dubois, House Leader of the Second Opposition Group:

(Division No. 477) YEAS - 19						
Arseneau (PQ)	Hivon (PQ)	Massé (QS)	Zanetti (QS)			
Bérubé (PQ)	Labrie (QS)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	Zalietti (Q5)			
Dorion (QS)	Labric (QS) LeBel (PQ)	Ouellet (PQ)				
Fontecilla (<i>QS</i>)	(Rimouski)	Perry Mélançon (<i>PQ</i>)				
Gaudreault (PQ)	Leduc (QS)	Richard (PQ)				
(Jonquière)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	Roy (PQ)				
Ghazal (QS)	Marissal (QS)	(Bonaventure)				
Ghuzur (£5)	NAYS					
Allaire (CAQ)Dubé (CAQ)Laframboise (CAQ)Poulin (CAQ)						
Asselin (CAQ)	Dufour (<i>CAQ</i>)	Lafrenière (<i>CAQ</i>)	Proulx (CAQ)			
Bachand (CAQ)	Émond (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	(<i>Côte-du-Sud</i>)			
Bélanger (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon (<i>CAQ</i>)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Proulx (<i>CAQ</i>)			
Blais (CAQ)	Foster (CAQ)	Lavallée (CAQ)	(Berthier)			
(Prévost)	Girard (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)			
Blais (CAQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	(Champlain)	Reid (CAQ)			
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Girard (<i>CAQ</i>)	Lecours (CAQ)	Roberge (CAQ)			
Bonnardel (<i>CAQ</i>)	(Groulx)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Rouleau (CAQ)			
Boulet (CAQ)	Girault (<i>CAQ</i>)	Lecours (<i>CAQ</i>)	Roy (CAQ)			
Boutin (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	(Montarville)			
Bussière (CAQ)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Samson (<i>CAQ</i>)			
Caire (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Schneeberger (CAQ)			
Campeau (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	Simard (CAQ)			
Carmant (CAQ)	Isabelle (\widetilde{CAQ})	Lemieux (\widetilde{CAQ})	Skeete (CAQ)			
Caron (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)			
Charest (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	(Laviolette–Saint-Maurice)			
Charette (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Tardif (<i>CAQ</i>)			
Chassé (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	(Rivière-du-Loup–Témiscouata)			
Chassin (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Thouin (CAQ)			
D'Amours (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)			
Dansereau (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)				
(Soulanges)						
ABSTENTIONS - 27						
Anglade (<i>QLP</i>)	Derraji (QLP)	Nichols (QLP)	Tanguay (<i>QLP</i>)			
Arcand (QLP)	Fortin (<i>QLP</i>)	Polo (QLP)	Thériault (QLP)			
Barrette (QLP)	Kelley (QLP)	Rizqy (QLP)	Weil (QLP)			
Benjamin (<i>QLP</i>)	Leitão (QLP)	Robitaille (<i>QLP</i>)				
Birnbaum (QLP)	Maccarone (QLP)	Rotiroti (QLP)				
Charbonneau (QLP)	Melançon (QLP)	Rousselle (QLP)				
Ciccone (QLP)	Ménard (QLP)	Sauvé (QLP)				
David (QLP)	Montpetit (QLP)	St-Pierre (QLP)				

2348