

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF QUÉBEC

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-SECOND LEGISLATURE

## **Votes and Proceedings**

of the Assembly

Wednesday, 29 September 2021 - No. 210

President of the National Assembly: Mr. François Paradis

The Assembly was called to order at 9:40 a.m.

\_\_\_\_\_

#### **ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

### **Statements by Members**

Ms. IsaBelle (Huntingdon) made a statement to congratulate three horse riders from the Huntingdon riding on their performances in the West Feria equestrian competition.

\_\_\_\_

Ms. Melançon (Verdun) made a statement to underline the retirement of Ms. Patricia Bossy, director of the organization J'apprends avec mon enfant.

\_\_\_\_

Mr. Lévesque (Chauveau) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Roger Barbeau for his community involvement and volunteering.

\_\_\_\_

Mr. Polo (Laval-des-Rapides) made a statement to underline Hispanic Heritage Month.

\_\_\_\_

Mr. Skeete (Sainte-Rose) made a statement to underline Laval Seniors Week.
Ms. Labrie (Sherbrooke) made a statement to underline the people of Sherbrooke rallying together to fight climate change and protect the environment.
Mr. Lemieux (Saint-Jean) made a statement to underline the company Les Plastiques Évolupak's opening of a second factory in Saint-Jean-sur-Richelieu.
Ms. Guilbault (Louis-Hébert) made a statement to pay tribute to Dr. Pierre Ferron, ear nose and throat specialist.
Mr. Benjamin (Viau) made a statement to congratulate Mr. Wolf Thyma, recipient of a scholarship for the upcoming generation in the field of health sciences.
At 9:51 a.m., Ms. Soucy, Second Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.
The proceedings resumed at 10:04 a.m.

Moment of reflection

#### **Introduction of Bills**

Mr. Tanguay (LaFontaine) moved that leave be granted to introduce the following bill:

An Act to amend the Educational Childcare Act to guarantee the right to receive childcare services

The question was put on this motion; in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 14 September 2021, a vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 1225 in Appendix)

Yeas: 119 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 0

Accordingly, Bill 897 was introduced in the Assembly.

#### **Presenting Papers**

Mr. Dubé, Minister of Health and Social Services, tabled the following:

The 2020–2021 annual management reports of the following integrated university health and social services centres:

Capitale-Nationale

(Sessional Paper No. 2851-20210929)

Nord-de-l'Île-de-Montréal

(Sessional Paper No. 2852-20210929)

The 2020–2021 annual management report of Centre hospitalier universitaire de Montréal

(Sessional Paper No. 2853-20210929)

The 2020–2021 annual management report of Centre intégré de santé et de services sociaux des Laurentides:

(Sessional Paper No. 2854-20210929)

The 2020–2021 annual report on the implementation of the complaints examination procedure, user satisfaction and respect of user rights of the Centre intégré de santé et de services sociaux des Laurentides;

(Sessional Paper No. 2855-20210929)

The 2020–2021 annual report on the implementation of the complaints examination procedure, user satisfaction and respect of user rights of the Institut universitaire de cardiologie et de pneumologie de Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 2856-20210929)

Mr. Charette, Minister of the Environment and the Fight Against Climate Change, tabled the following:

The 2020-2021 annual report of Recyc-Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 2857-20210929)

Mr. Bonnardel, Minister of Transport, tabled the following:

The 2020-2021 annual management report of the Société des traversiers du Ouébec.

(Sessional Paper No. 2858-20210929)

Ms. LeBel, Minister Responsible for Government Administration and Chair of the Conseil du trésor, tabled the following:

The 2020–2021 annual report of the Société québécoise des infrastructures. (Sessional Paper No. 2859-20210929)

Mr. Lamontagne, Minister of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, tabled the following:

The 2020–2021 annual report of La Financière agricole du Québec. (Sessional Paper No. 2860-20210929)

\_\_\_\_\_

Mr. Boulet, Minister of Labour, Employment and Social Solidarity, tabled the following:

The 2020–2021 annual management report of the Tribunal administratif du travail. (Sessional Paper No. 2861-20210929)

\_\_\_\_\_

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, tabled the following:

The Government's reply to petitions tabled on 27 May 2021 by Ms. Ghazal (Mercier) on opposition to the elevated structure of the Réseau express métropolitain (REM) and creating an advisory committee.

(Sessional Paper No. 2862-20210929)

#### **Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

#### **Motions Without Notice**

Ms. Richard (Duplessis), together with Ms. Sauvé (Fabre), Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey), Mr. Roy (Bonaventure), Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved a motion on appointing a seniors' ombudsman to strengthen the fight against maltreatment; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Lafrenière, Minister Responsible for Indigenous Affairs, together with Mr. Kelley (Jacques-Cartier), Ms. Massé (Sainte-Marie-Saint-Jacques), Mr. Ouellet, House Leader of the Third Opposition Group, Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey), Mr. Roy (Bonaventure), Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly recall the death of Joyce Echaquan, which occurred under tragic circumstances on 28 September 2020 at the Joliette hospital, a death which shook us all and shined a light on the discrimination experienced by members of Indigenous communities;

THAT it reiterate its support to her spouse, Mr. Carol Dubé, her family and the entire community;

THAT it reiterate the importance of continuing to apply the tenets of Joyce's Principle, which aims to guarantee all Indigenous peoples the right of equitable access, without any discrimination, to all health and social services;

THAT it underline that it is the responsibility of all to fight racism in our society, as stated in the report by the Public Inquiry Commission on relations between Indigenous Peoples and certain public services;

THAT, in the name of our duty of remembrance, it recognize September 30 as a day of remembrance in honour of the survivors and victims of residential schools;

THAT, as a sign of solidarity with the First Nations communities in Québec, the National Assembly be lit up in the colour orange;

THAT, lastly, it observe a minute of silence in memory of Ms. Echaquan and the survivors and victims of residential schools.

The question was put on this motion; in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 14 September 2021, a vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 1226 in Appendix)

Yeas: 119 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 0

At the request of the President, the Assembly observed a minute of silence.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Ms. Anglade, Leader of the Official Opposition, together with Ms. Massé (Sainte-Marie-Saint-Jacques), Mr. Arseneau, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey), Mr. Roy (Bonaventure), Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly acknowledge the serious and painful testimonies revealed through the Radio-Canada investigative series "Enquête" of Indigenous and racialized women in Québec who have undergone sterilization procedures without their free, prior and informed consent;

THAT it unequivocally condemn such practices and declare that this situation infringes on the rights and freedoms guaranteed under the *Québec Charter of human rights and freedoms* and the *Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms*;

THAT it affirm that the right of women to make choices about their bodies cannot be called into question in any way whatsoever and that an infringement of one woman's right represents an infringement of the right of all Québec women;

THAT it acknowledge that sterilization without consent can leave the women who undergo the procedure with significant emotional scars and lead them to mistrust the health network, thus having a negative impact on women's health;

THAT, lastly, it demand that the Premier convene the President of the Collège des médecins without delay to ensure that all necessary means are taken to put an immediate end to this abhorrent practice.

The question was put on this motion; in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 14 September 2021, a vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 1227 in Appendix)

Yeas: 118 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 0

\_\_\_\_\_

Mr. Fontecilla (Laurier-Dorion), together with Ms. Hivon (Joliette) and Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey), moved a motion on establishing a Québec rent register; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 84.1 and pursuant to Standing Order 146, Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, moved:

THAT, within the framework of the consideration of Bill 92, An Act to create a court specialized in sexual and domestic violence and respecting training of judges in these matters, the Committee on Institutions hold special consultations and public hearings on Tuesday, 19 October 2021 from 9:45 a.m. to 12:35 p.m., and after Routine Proceedings until 7:00 p.m.; and on Wednesday, 20 October 2021 after Routine Proceedings until 12:30 p.m. and from 3:00 p.m. to 6:30 p.m.;

THAT, for this purpose, the Committee hear the following individuals and organizations:

Ms. Louise Riendeau, Regroupement des maisons pour femmes victimes de violence conjugale

Ms. Manon Monastesse, Director of the Fédération des maisons d'hébergement pour femmes

Me Elizabeth Corte, Chief Judge of the Court of Québec from 2009 to 2016 and Co-Chair of the report "Rebâtir la confiance", together with Ms. Julie Desrosiers, researcher and Full Professor, Faculty of Law, Université Laval, and Co-Chair of the report entitled "Rebâtir la confiance"

Crime Victims Assistance Centres Network

Mr. Sylvain Guertin, investigator specialized in sexual assault and major crimes and Associate Director of the Direction des enquêtes criminelles at the Sûreté du Québec, together with the Service de police de la Ville de Montréal and the Service de police de la Ville de Québec Me Roxanne Roussel, expert in family law

Barreau du Ouébec

Me Maude Cloutier, holder of a master's degree on the comparative study of specialized courts (Dubé Gravel Avocats), together with Ms. Angela Campbell, Law Professor, McGill University

Regroupement québécois des centres d'aide et de lutte contre les agressions à caractère sexuel (RQCALACS)

Me Sophie Gagnon, Juripop

Ms. Mélanie Walsh, Director General, Auberge Madeleine and partner in the "Partenariat pour la prévention et la lutte à l'itinérance des femmes regroupant 5 maisons"

Director of Criminal and Penal Prosecutions (DCPP);

THAT a period of 12 minutes be set aside for opening statements, allocated as follows: 5 minutes 34 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Government, 3 minutes 43 seconds to the Official Opposition, 56 seconds to the Second Opposition Group, 56 seconds to the Third Opposition Group and, lastly, 51 seconds to the independent Member;

THAT, subject to the joint hearing of Me Maude Cloutier and Ms. Angela Campbell, the presentation by each individual or organization last no longer than 10 minutes and the exchange with the Committee members last no longer than 35 minutes, allocated as follows: 16 minutes 15 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Government, 10 minutes 50 seconds to the Official Opposition, 2 minutes 43 seconds to the Second Opposition Group, 2 minutes 43 seconds to the Third Opposition Group and 2 minutes 30 seconds to the independent Member;

THAT the joint presentation by Me Maude Cloutier and Ms. Angela Campbell last no longer than 10 minutes and the exchange with the Committee members last no longer than 50minutes, allocated as follows: 23 minutes 13 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Government. 15minutes 29seconds to the Official Opposition, 3 minutes 52 seconds to the Second Opposition Group, 3 minutes 52 seconds the Third Opposition Group to 3 minutes 30 seconds to the independent Member;

THAT those being heard be permitted to testify by video conference;

THAT a 10-minute interval be scheduled between discussions with each individual or organization;

THAT the Minister of Justice be a member of the said Committee during its proceedings with respect to this order of reference.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **1228** in Appendix)

Yeas: 118 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 0

#### **Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

- the Committee on Labour and the Economy, to continue its clause-byclause consideration of Bill 100, Tourist Accommodation Act;
- the Committee on Culture and Education, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 96, An Act respecting French, the official and common language of Québec;
- the Committee on Citizen Relations, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 101, An Act to strengthen the fight against maltreatment of seniors and other persons of full age in vulnerable situations as well as the monitoring of the quality of health services and social services;
- the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain, to continue its clauseby-clause consideration of Bill 49, An Act to amend the Act respecting elections and referendums in municipalities, the Municipal Ethics and Good Conduct Act and various legislative provisions.

4207

## ORDERS OF THE DAY

At 11:07 a.m., the President suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.
The proceedings resumed at 11:18 a.m.
Government Bills
Passage
Mr. Boulet, Minister of Labour, Employment and Social Solidarity, moved the passage of Bill 59, An Act to modernize the occupational health and safety regime.
A debate arose thereon.
At 1:00 p.m., Ms. Soucy, Second Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 3:00 p.m.
Accordingly, pursuant to Standing Order 97, the debate on the motion moved by Mr. Boulet, Minister of Labour, Employment and Social Solidarity, was adjourned in the name of Mr. Leduc (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve).
The proceedings resumed at 3:00 p.m.

#### **Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition**

Ms. Montpetit (Maurice-Richard) moved:

THAT the National Assembly acknowledge that for almost three years, Québec has recorded a serious deterioration in its wait times for access to front-line services;

THAT it deplore the fact that the growing number of disruptions in services is a stressor for the patients waiting for medical appointments as well as for the entire population;

THAT it note that emergency room wait times are increasing, despite a reduction of 1 million ambulatory visits;

THAT it deplore the fact that currently in Québec, 146,000 patients are waiting for surgeries;

THAT it note that the number of people waiting for a family physician in Québec has increased by nearly 60% in the last two years, rising to more than 830,000 individuals in July;

THAT it recall that the CAQ government had made the strong commitment to offer a family physician to all Quebecers, with an access time of less than 36 hours, to reduce the average wait time to see an emergency physician to 90 minutes, to continue the 17 pilot projects on patient-nurse ratios and to increase the rate of use of operating rooms;

THAT it note that access to health care in Québec has declined since the CAQ government came to power;

THAT it demand that the Government establish a crisis management unit in order to put an end to disruptions in services in the network;

THAT, lastly, it call on the CAQ government to commit to quickly making the necessary adjustments requested by the various actors in the health network, especially ending mandatory overtime for nurses and establishing safe nurse-to-patient ratios.

Mr. Picard, First Vice-President, informed the Assembly of the allocation of speaking time for the proceedings with respect to this limited debate: 10 minutes to the mover of the motion for her reply; 51 minutes 15 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Government; 31 minutes 53 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition; 11 minutes 23 seconds to the Second Opposition Group; 7 minutes 58 seconds to the Third Opposition Group; and 7 minutes 30 seconds to the independent Members, subject to a maximum of 2 minutes each. Within this framework, any time not used by the independent Members or by a parliamentary group shall be redistributed among the parliamentary groups in the proportions established above. Lastly, individual addresses shall not be limited.

A debate arose thereon.

At the end of his address, Mr. Marissal (Rosemont) moved:

THAT the motion by the Member for Maurice-Richard be amended as follows:

- 1. By adding the words "has been neglected over the past decades and that this access" after the words "in Québec" in the seventh paragraph;
- 2. By adding the word "unit" after the word "field" in the eighth paragraph;
- 3. By adding the words "and the widespread use of private placement agencies" after the words "for nurses" in the last paragraph.

The motion, as amended, would read as follows:

THAT the National Assembly acknowledge that for almost three years, Québec has recorded a serious deterioration in its wait times for access to front-line services;

THAT it deplore the fact that the growing number of disruptions in services is a stressor for the patients waiting for medical appointments as well as for the entire population;

THAT it note that emergency room wait times are increasing, despite a reduction of 1 million ambulatory visits;

THAT it deplore the fact that currently in Québec, 146,000 patients are waiting for surgeries;

THAT it note that the number of people waiting for a family physician in Québec has increased by nearly 60% in the last two years, rising to more than 830,000 individuals in July;

THAT it recall that the CAQ government had made the strong commitment to offer a family physician to all Quebecers, with an access time of less than 36 hours, to reduce the average wait time to see an emergency physician to 90 minutes, to continue the 17 pilot projects on patient-nurse ratios and to increase the rate of use of operating rooms;

THAT it note that access to health care in Québec has been neglected over the past decades and that this access has declined since the CAQ government came to power;

THAT it demand that the Government establish a crisis management field unit in order to put an end to disruptions in services in the network;

THAT, lastly, it call on the CAQ government to commit to quickly making the necessary adjustments requested by the various actors in the health network, especially ending mandatory overtime for nurses and the widespread use of private placement agencies and establishing safe nurse-to-patient ratios.

The debate continued on the main motion moved by Ms. Montpetit (Maurice-Richard) and on the amendment motion moved by Mr. Marissal (Rosemont), subject to the permission of its author.

Pursuant to Standing Order 98.1, Ms. Montpetit (Maurice-Richard) refused the amendment proposed by Mr. Marissal (Rosemont).

The debate being concluded, the question was put on motion; in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 14 September 2021, a vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 1229 in Appendix)

Yeas: 44 Nays: 72 Abstentions: 0

#### **Government Bills**

Passage

The Assembly resumed the debate, which had been adjourned earlier in the sitting, on the motion moved by Mr. Boulet, Minister of Labour, Employment and Social Solidarity, for the passage of Bill 59, An Act to modernize the occupational health and safety regime.

The debate was adjourned in the name of Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière).

\_\_\_\_\_

At 6:30 p.m., Ms. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Thursday, 30 September 2021 at 9:40 a.m.

## FRANÇOIS PARADIS

President

## **APPENDIX**

## **Recorded Divisions**

On the motion moved by Mr. Tanguay (LaFontaine):

## (Division No. 1225)

## **YEAS - 119**

Allaire $(CAQ)$	Dubé ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lavallée ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Poulin ( $CAQ$ )
Anglade (QLP)	Dufour (CAQ)	LeBel $(CAQ)$	Proulx $(CAQ)$
Arcand (QLP)	Émond ( <i>CAQ</i> )	(Champlain)	(Côte-du-Sud)
Arseneau (PQ)	Fitzgibbon ( $CAQ$ )	Lecours $(CAQ)$	Proulx $(CAQ)$
Asselin $(CAQ)$	Fontecilla (QS)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	(Berthier)
Bachand (CAQ)	Fortin (QLP)	Lecours (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Barrette (QLP)	Foster $(CAQ)$	(Les Plaines)	Reid $(CAQ)$
Bélanger ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Gaudreault (PQ)	Leduc (QS)	Richard (PQ)
Benjamin (QLP)	(Jonquière)	Lefebvre ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Rizqy (QLP)
Bérubé (PQ)	Ghazal ( <i>QS</i> )	Legault (CAQ)	Roberge ( $CAQ$ )
Birnbaum (QLP)	Girard (CAQ)	Leitão (QLP)	Robitaille (QLP)
Blais (CAQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Lemay (CAQ)	Rotiroti (QLP)
(Prévost)	Girard (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	(Groulx)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	Rousselle (QLP)
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Girault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Roy (IND)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	(Bonaventure)
Boulet ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Guilbault ( $CAQ$ )	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Roy $(CAQ)$
Boutin ( $CAQ$ )	Guillemette ( $CAQ$ )	(Chapleau)	(Montarville)
Bussière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Hébert (CAQ)	Maccarone (QLP)	Samson (IND)
Caire (CAQ)	Hivon $(PQ)$	Marissal (QS)	Sauvé (QLP)
Campeau (CAQ)	Isabelle ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Martel $(CAQ)$	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Carmant $(CAQ)$	Jacques (CAQ)	Massé (QS)	Simard (CAQ)
Caron (CAQ)	Jeannotte $(CAQ)$	McCann (CAQ)	Skeete $(CAQ)$
Charbonneau (QLP)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Melançon (QLP)	St-Pierre (QLP)
Charest (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Ménard (QLP)	Tanguay (QLP)
Charette $(CAQ)$	Kelley (QLP)	Montpetit (QLP)	Tardif $(CAQ)$
Chassé (CAQ)	Labrie $(\widetilde{QS})$	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	(Laviolette–Saint-
` ~	~ /	~ /	Maurice)
Chassin (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Nichols (QLP)	Tardif $(CAQ)$
Ciccone $(QLP)$	Lacombe $(CAQ)$	Ouellet $(PQ)$	(Rivière-du-Loup–
(2)	` ~ ~	ν 2/	Témiscouata)
D'Amours (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Ouellette (IND)	Thériault (QLP)
Dansereau $(CAQ)$	Laframboise $(CAQ)$	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	Thouin $(\widetilde{CAQ})$
David (QLP)	Lafrenière $(CAQ)$	Picard (CAQ)	Tremblay $(\widetilde{CAQ})$
Derraji (QLP)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	(Soulanges)	Weil (QLP)
Dorion $(QS)$	Lamothe ( $CAQ$ )	Polo (QLP)	Zanetti (QS)
= -11011 (20)		( 2 /	

On the motion moved by Mr. Lafrenière, Minister Responsible for Indigenous Affairs, together with Mr. Kelley (Jacques-Cartier), Ms. Massé (Sainte-Marie-Saint-Jacques), Mr. Ouellet, House Leader of the Third Opposition Group, Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey), Mr. Roy (Bonaventure), Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin):

(Division No. 1226)

(Identical to Division No. 1225)

On the motion moved by Ms. Anglade, Leader of the Official Opposition, together with Ms. Massé (Sainte-Marie-Saint-Jacques), Mr. Arseneau, House Leader of the Third Opposition Group, Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey), Mr. Roy (Bonaventure), Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin):

## (Division No. 1227)

YEAS - 118				
Allaire (CAQ)	Dufour $(CAQ)$	Lecours (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)	
Anglade (QLP)	Émond ( $CAQ$ )	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Reid (CAQ)	
Arcand (QLP)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Richard (PQ)	
Arseneau (PQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	(Les Plaines)	Rizqy (QLP)	
Asselin (CAQ)	Fortin (QLP)	Leduc (QS)	Roberge (CAQ)	
Bachand (CAQ)	Foster (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Robitaille ( <i>QLP</i> )	
Barrette (QLP)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Rotiroti (QLP)	
Bélanger ( <i>CAQ</i> )	(Jonquière)	Leitão (QLP)	Rouleau (CAQ)	
Benjamin (QLP)	Ghazal (QS)	Lemay (CAQ)	Rousselle (QLP)	
Bérubé (PQ)	Girard $(CAQ)$	Lemieux ( $CAQ$ )	Roy (IND)	
Birnbaum (QLP)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Lessard-Therrien $(QS)$	(Bonaventure)	
Blais $(CAQ)$	Girard $(CAQ)$	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Roy(CAQ)	
(Prévost)	(Groulx)	(Chapleau)	(Montarville)	
Blais $(CAQ)$	Girault ( $CAQ$ )	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Sauvé (QLP)	
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Grondin ( $CAQ$ )	(Chauveau)	Schneeberger (CAQ)	
Bonnardel ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Guilbault (CAQ)	Maccarone (QLP)	Simard $(CAQ)$	
Boulet $(CAQ)$	Guillemette ( $CAQ$ )	Marissal (QS)	Skeete ( $CAQ$ )	
Boutin $(CAQ)$	Hébert ( $CAQ$ )	Martel $(CAQ)$	St-Pierre ( <i>QLP</i> )	
Bussière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Hivon (PQ)	Massé (QS)	Tanguay (QLP)	
Caire $(CAQ)$	Isabelle ( <i>CAQ</i> )	McCann (CAQ)	Tardif $(CAQ)$	
Campeau (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Melançon (QLP)	(Laviolette–Saint-Maurice)	
Carmant $(CAQ)$	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Ménard (QLP)	Tardif $(CAQ)$	
Caron $(CAQ)$	Jolin-Barrette ( $CAQ$ )	Montpetit (QLP)	(Rivière-du-Loup–	
			Témiscouata)	
Charbonneau (QLP)	Julien (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	Thériault (QLP)	
Charest (CAQ)	Kelley (QLP)	Nichols (QLP)	Thouin $(CAQ)$	
Charette ( $CAQ$ )	Labrie (QS)	Ouellet $(PQ)$	Tremblay $(CAQ)$	
Chassé (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Ouellette (IND)	Weil (QLP)	
Chassin (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	Zanetti (QS)	
Ciccone (QLP)	Laforest (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)		
D'Amours ( $CAQ$ )	Laframboise (CAQ)	(Soulanges)		
Dansereau (CAQ)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Polo (QLP)		
David (QLP)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)		
Derraji (QLP)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)		
Dorion (QS)	Lavallée (CAQ)	(Côte-du-Sud)		
Dubé (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)		
	(Champlain)	(Berthier)		

On the motion moved by Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader:

(Division No. 1228)

(Identical to Division No. 1227)

## On the motion moved by Ms. Montpetit (Maurice-Richard):

## (Division No. 1229)

## **YEAS - 43**

Anglade (QLP)	Dorion $(QS)$	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	Richard (PQ)
Arcand (QLP)	Fontecilla (QS)	Maccarone (QLP)	Rizqy (QLP)
Arseneau (PQ)	Fortin (QLP)	Marissal (QS)	Robitaille ( <i>QLP</i> )
Barrette (QLP)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Massé (QS)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Benjamin (QLP)	(Jonquière)	Melançon (QLP)	Rousselle (QLP)
Bérubé (PQ)	Ghazal (QS)	Ménard (QLP)	Sauvé (QLP)
Birnbaum (QLP)	Hivon $(PQ)$	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	St-Pierre ( <i>QLP</i> )
Charbonneau (QLP)	Kelley (QLP)	Nichols (QLP)	Tanguay (QLP)
Ciccone (QLP)	Labrie (QS)	Ouellet $(PQ)$	Thériault (QLP)
David (QLP)	Leduc $(QS)$	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	Weil (QLP)
Derraji (QLP)	Leitão (QLP)	Polo (QLP)	Zanetti (QS)
	NAYS	- 72	

NAYS - 72			
Dufour $(CAQ)$	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Proulx $(CAQ)$	
Émond ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lamothe (CAQ)	(Berthier)	
Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	Lavallée ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Provençal ( <i>CAQ</i> )	
Foster $(CAQ)$	LeBel $(CAQ)$	Reid ( $CAQ$ )	
Girard $(CAQ)$	(Champlain)	Roberge $(CAQ)$	
(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Lecours (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)	
Girard $(CAQ)$	(Les Plaines)	Roy(CAQ)	
(Groulx)	Lecours $(CAQ)$	(Montarville)	
Girault (CAQ)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Schneeberger ( $CAQ$ )	
Grondin ( $CAQ$ )	Lefebvre ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Simard $(CAQ)$	
Guilbault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Legault (CAQ)	Skeete ( $CAQ$ )	
Guillemette ( $CAQ$ )	Lemay $(CAQ)$	Tardif $(CAQ)$	
Hébert ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lemieux ( $CAQ$ )	(Laviolette–Saint-Maurice)	
Isabelle ( $CAQ$ )	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Tardif $(CAQ)$	
Jacques (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	(Rivière-du-Loup–Témiscouata)	
Jeannotte (CAQ)	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Thouin $(CAQ)$	
Jolin-Barrette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	(Chapleau)	Tremblay $(CAQ)$	
Julien (CAQ)	Martel $(CAQ)$		
Lachance $(CAQ)$	McCann(CAQ)		
Lacombe (CAQ)	Picard $(CAQ)$		
, <del>-</del>	(Soulanges)		
, —,	Poulin ( $CAQ$ )		
Lafrenière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Proulx $(CAQ)$		
	(Côte-du-Sud)		
	Dufour (CAQ) Émond (CAQ) Fitzgibbon (CAQ) Foster (CAQ) Girard (CAQ) (Lac-Saint-Jean) Girard (CAQ) (Groulx) Girault (CAQ) Grondin (CAQ) Guilbault (CAQ) Guilbault (CAQ) Guillemette (CAQ) Hébert (CAQ) Jacques (CAQ) Jacques (CAQ) Jeannotte (CAQ) Julien (CAQ) Luchance (CAQ) Laforest (CAQ) Laframboise (CAQ)	$\begin{array}{llll} \text{Dufour } (CAQ) & \text{Lamontagne } (CAQ) \\ \text{\'emond } (CAQ) & \text{Lamothe } (CAQ) \\ \text{Fitzgibbon } (CAQ) & \text{Lavall\'ee } (CAQ) \\ \text{Foster } (CAQ) & \text{LeBel } (CAQ) \\ \text{Girard } (CAQ) & (Champlain) \\ (Lac-Saint-Jean) & \text{Lecours } (CAQ) \\ \text{Girard } (CAQ) & (Les Plaines) \\ (Groulx) & \text{Lecours } (CAQ) \\ \text{Girault } (CAQ) & (Lotbini\`ere-Frontenac) \\ \text{Grondin } (CAQ) & \text{Lefebvre } (CAQ) \\ \text{Guilbault } (CAQ) & \text{Legault } (CAQ) \\ \text{Guillemette } (CAQ) & \text{Lemay } (CAQ) \\ \text{H\'ebert } (CAQ) & \text{Lemieux } (CAQ) \\ \text{Isabelle } (CAQ) & \text{L\'evesque } (CAQ) \\ \text{Jacques } (CAQ) & \text{L\'evesque } (CAQ) \\ \text{Jolin-Barrette } (CAQ) & \text{L\'evesque } (CAQ) \\ \text{Jolin-Barrette } (CAQ) & \text{Martel } (CAQ) \\ \text{Lachance } (CAQ) & \text{McCann } (CAQ) \\ \text{Lacombe } (CAQ) & \text{Picard } (CAQ) \\ \text{Laforest } (CAQ) & \text{Poulin } (CAQ) \\ \text{Laframboise } (CAQ) & \text{Poulin } (CAQ) \\ \text{Lafreni\`ere } (CAQ) & \text{Proulx } (CAQ) \\ \end{array}$	