



NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-FIRST LEGISLATURE

Votes and Proceedings **of the Assembly**

Friday, 13 June 2014 — No. 17

President of the National Assembly:
Mr. Jacques Chagnon

QUÉBEC

The Assembly was called to order at 9.45 o'clock a.m.

ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS

Statements by Members

Mrs. Gaudreault (Hull) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Gérard Lamoureux, who worked for almost 40 years at the Centre de travail LARO.

Mrs. Simard (Charlevoix–Côte-de-Beaupré) made a statement to congratulate Mrs. Karine Dufour of Charlevoix, who was awarded the Prix méritas Réjean-Marier de l'intervenante de l'année 2013-2014.

Mr. Morin (Côte-du-Sud) made a statement to congratulate Klô Pelgag for her outstanding musical career.

Mr. Dufour (René-Lévesque) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Dany Belzile.

13 June 2014

Mrs. Vien (Bellechasse) made a statement to congratulate the organizers of the Mini Relay For Life in Saint-Gervais.

Mrs. Weil (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce) made a statement to underline World Refugee Day.

Mr. Arcand (Mont-Royal) made a statement to underline the 150th anniversary of Joliette.

Mrs. Zakaïb (Richelieu) made a statement to underline the Inside Out project carried out by three young people of Fernand-Lefebvre high school.

Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) made a statement to underline the 70th anniversary of the Institut maritime du Québec.

At 9.56 o'clock a.m., Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

The proceedings resumed at 10.14 o'clock a.m.

Moment of reflection

13 June 2014

Introduction of Bills

Mr. Hamad, Minister of Labour, moved that leave be granted to introduce the following Bill:

- 8 An Act to amend the Labour Code with respect to certain employees of farming businesses

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, Bill 8 was introduced in the Assembly.

Presenting Papers

Mrs. David, Minister of Culture and Communications, tabled the following:

The 2013-2016 strategic plan of the Société de développement des entreprises culturelles;

(Sessional Paper No. 148-20140613)

The 2013-2015 strategic plan of the Régie du cinéma;

(Sessional Paper No. 149-20140613)

The 2012-2013 annual activity report of the Conservatoire de musique et d'art dramatique du Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 150-20140613)

Mr. Leitão, Minister of Finance, tabled the following:

The 2014 annual report of Loto-Québec;

(Sessional Paper No. 151-20140613)

The 2014 annual report of the Société des alcools du Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 152-20140613)

13 June 2014

Mr. Coiteux, Minister responsible for Government Administration and Ongoing Program Review and Chair of the Conseil du trésor, tabled the following:

The 2013 annual management report of the Commission administrative des régimes de retraite et d'assurances.

(Sessional Paper No. 153-20140613)

Mrs. Vien, Minister of Tourism, tabled the following:

The 2013 annual report of the Parc olympique.

(Sessional Paper No. 154-20140613)

Mr. Hamad, Minister of Labour, tabled the following:

The 2013 annual management report of the Commission de la construction du Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 155-20140613)

Mrs. Charlebois, Minister for Rehabilitation, Youth Protection and Public Health, tabled the following:

The 2014-2019 strategic plan of the Office des personnes handicapées du Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 156-20140613)

Mr. Fournier, Government House Leader, tabled the following:

The reply from the Government to the written question by Mr. Bonnardel (Granby), concerning the obligations of the Ministère de l'Éducation, du Loisir et du Sport as regards ensuring that school boards enforce the *Education Act* and basic school regulation – Question 1, *Order Paper and Notices* of 6 June 2014;

(Sessional Paper No. 157-20140613)

13 June 2014

The reply from the Government to the written question by Mr. Bonnardel (Granby), concerning the lack of social housing units in localities such as Granby – Question 2, *Order Paper and Notices* of 6 June 2014.

(Sessional Paper No. 158-20140613)

Mr. President tabled the following:

A letter, dated 3 June 2014, he had received from Mr. François Legault, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, informing him of the appointment of Mr. Éric Caire, Member for La Peltre, as Deputy House Leader of the Second Opposition Group, effective as at 2 June 2014;

(Sessional Paper No. 159-20140613)

A letter, dated 3 June 2014, he had received from Mr. François Legault, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, informing him of the appointment of Mrs. Nathalie Roy, Member for Montarville, as Chair of the Second Opposition Group Caucus, effective as at 2 June 2014.

(Sessional Paper No. 160-20140613)

Presenting Reports from Committees

Mrs. Léger (Pointe-aux-Trembles), committee chairman, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries, Energy and Natural Resources, which met on 12 June 2014 for clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 5, An Act to amend the Act to limit oil and gas activities and other legislative provisions.

(Sessional Paper No. 161-20140613)

Mr. Bernier (Montmorency), committee chairman, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Public Finance, which, on 11 and 12 June 2014, continued the debate on the Budget Speech.

(Sessional Paper No. 162-20140613)

13 June 2014

Presenting Petitions

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mr. Leclair (Beauharnois) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition respecting changes to the *Tobacco Act* to protect young people, and signed by 760 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 163-20140613)

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mrs. Ouellet (Vachon) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition respecting changes to the Highway Safety Code respecting reserved lanes, and signed by 122 drivers of the Société de transport de Montréal.

(Sessional Paper No. 164-20140613)

Complaints of Breach of Privilege or Contempt and Personal Explanations

Mr. President gave a ruling on the point of privilege or contempt raised by the Member for Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques on 12 June 2014 concerning the Member for Jean-Lesage, who allegedly used threatening language while directing an intimidating gesture at her.

RULING FROM THE CHAIR

In her notice, the Member indicated that, at the sitting of 10 June, the Member for Jean-Lesage spoke to her on the floor of the Assembly Chamber regarding her recent comments on nickel dust in Limoilou. On this occasion, the Member for Jean-Lesage allegedly used threatening language while directing an intimidating gesture at her.

The President began by stating that, as provided for in jurisprudence, when a situation involves elements that he did not witness himself, he must take the word of the Member who was reportedly threatened.

He then recalled that the *Act respecting the National Assembly* establishes the individuality of the office of Member and specifically provides that Members enjoy complete independence in the exercise of their duties. To ensure this, the Assembly and its Members are vested with parliamentary privileges that allow them to perform their duties freely and without hindrance. In 1993, the Supreme Court ruled that these privileges have a constitutional status, which indicates the importance given to the independence of the Parliament and its Members.

To ensure the observance of parliamentary privileges, the Assembly has the power to take action against contempt, which parliamentary law defines as being any act or omission which obstructs or impedes the work of the Assembly or of its Members, or which calls into question its authority and dignity. In this regard, the *Act respecting the National Assembly* provides that no person may breach the privileges of the Assembly and mentions various acts that constitute breaches of the privileges of the Assembly. Among these are assaulting, interfering with, bullying or threatening Members of the Assembly in the carrying out of their parliamentary duties as well as attempting to influence the vote, opinion, judgment or action of a Member by means of deceit, threats or undue pressure.

It is fundamental for a parliamentary institution such as the Assembly to be a forum for debates and exchanges. Certainly, opposing viewpoints may be heard therein and debates are sometimes animated, but they must not be to the detriment of the most basic respect that parliamentarians must have for one another at all times.

This is the spirit in which the rules governing the Assembly debates are written. The Standing Orders of the Assembly state that no Member speaking shall use language that is violent, abusive, or insulting, nor shall he threaten another Member. Though the comments made by the Member for Jean-Lesage were not made within the framework of a parliamentary debate, the Chair cannot accept that threatening words or acts may have occurred in this Chamber.

The Chair establishes a link with the obligation provided in the *Code of Ethics*, which stipulates that the "conduct of Members must be characterized by benevolence, integrity, adaptability, wisdom, honesty, sincerity and justice". At a time when society is dealing with issues of intimidation and parliamentarians are regularly advocating a change in tone during debates, the Chair finds it regrettable to be required to give a ruling on such a matter. It must be made very clear that the Chair will never accept that a Member be threatened or bullied, especially when this takes place on the floor of the House. It is a matter of respect for the dignity of the Assembly. It is for this reason that the Chair declares the point of privilege raised by the Member for Sainte-Marie-Saint-Jacques admissible.

13 June 2014

However, as the Member did not indicate any intention to move a motion impugning the conduct of the Member, there will be no follow-up to this matter.

Mr. President then tabled a letter, dated 12 June 2014, he had received from the Member for Jean-Lesage in which the latter explained his version of the facts and expressed his apologies to the Member for Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques.

(Sessional Paper No. 165-20140613)

Mr. President gave a ruling on a complaint of breach of privilege or contempt raised on 12 June by the Official Opposition House Leader. In her notice, she put forward that the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Land Occupancy had allegedly been in contempt of Parliament by releasing the content of Bill 3, An Act to foster the financial health and sustainability of municipal defined benefit pension plans, before it was introduced in the Assembly. She argued that there were similarities between certain provisions contained in this bill and an article published in a newspaper on 11 June 2014.

RULING FROM THE CHAIR

The President looked at the arguments regarding the obligation, for the Chair, to delay the introduction of the bill when the bill is the subject of a point of privilege. He recalled that a ruling on the receivability of a point of privilege cannot have an impact on the possibility for a bill to be introduced in the Assembly. The introduction of a bill and the point of privilege are two distinct elements and one has no impact on the other. The Assembly alone must decide, in its sovereign capacity, on the advisability of introducing the bill, examining it and assessing its content.

That being said, if the Chair is able to give a ruling on the day the bill is introduced, this ruling is given before the introduction of the bill, which may require the suspension of Assembly proceedings. The day the matter was raised, the Chair was not able to give its ruling. This did not prevent the minister from exercising his fundamental right to introduce the bill and did not prevent the Assembly from deciding to introduce the bill. The Chair must encourage parliamentary debate, not prevent it.

As regards the disclosure of the bill before its introduction in the Assembly, during their arguments, the House leaders of the Official Opposition and the Government each in turn gave examples of certain similarities and differences between Bill 3 and the details described in the aforementioned newspaper article. It seems obvious that the journalist had access to information allowing him to write his article, which is questionable.

Certainly, parliamentary jurisprudence recognizes the Government's right to inform citizens as regards the major policies contained in a bill. That being said, the Members must be the first to be informed of the details of a bill and not journalists, with all due respect for the fundamental role played by the latter in our democracy.

The Chair insists on the importance for parliamentarians to have priority over any information that they may require in the performance of their duties as legislators. However, an important distinction must be made regarding the case of 2007 that was referred to. Indeed, in 2007, the point of privilege concerned a press release issued by a minister to provide detailed explanations regarding his bill.

In this case, unlike the one in 2007, no formal communication aiming to reveal the bill was made by the minister. But first and foremost, when reading the provisions of the bill, the Chair cannot conclude that the published article was based on the text as introduced in the Assembly. Certain specific elements of the bill are included in the article, which is not insignificant. On the other hand, it is impossible to affirm that the final version of the text of the bill was disclosed before its introduction. For this reason, in light of the facts and parliamentary law, the Chair cannot conclude that the minister was, at first glance, in contempt of parliament.

Although it is not a case in support of a point of privilege, the Chair recalls that, when a bill is involved, everyone must be aware of the essential role of the parliamentary institution and its Members. The Chair therefore issues a reminder to ministers and the persons involved directly or indirectly in the process leading to the introduction of a bill in the Assembly: Members are the only ones who enjoy the legitimacy of assessing whether the content of a bill is in the public interest.

In conclusion, even if the content of a bill is not entirely revealed, the Chair hopes that the elements contained in a bill will not slowly be made public before its introduction. This would do indirectly that which is not permitted to do directly. It is a matter of respect for the fundamental role played by Members in our parliamentary democracy.

13 June 2014

Oral Questions and Answers

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 53, Mrs. Thériault, Minister of Public Security, tabled the following:

Copy of a press release, dated 8 June 2014, entitled "Évasion à l'Établissement de détention de Québec – Tous les efforts sont mis de l'avant pour retracer les évadés".

(Sessional Paper No. 166-20140613)

Motions Without Notice

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 84.3 and 185, Mr. Bédard, Leader of the Official Opposition, together with Mr. Couillard, Premier, Mr. Legault, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, and Mr. Khadir (Mercier), moved:

THAT the National Assembly underline Québec's National Holiday, whose theme this year is "Nous sommes le Québec!";

THAT it take this opportunity to celebrate the creativity, vitality and successes of Quebecers here and abroad;

THAT it invite Quebecers to take part in the hundreds of activities that will be held in all regions of Québec.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

13 June 2014

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Picard (Chutes-de-la-Chaudière), together with Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia), moved:

THAT the National Assembly ask the Premier and the Minister of Public Security to reiterate their confidence in the senior management of the Ministère de la Sécurité publique, including Mr. Martin Prud'homme, Deputy Minister at the Ministère de la Sécurité publique, Mrs. Johanne Beausoleil, Associate Deputy Minister of the Correctional Services General Directorate, and Mr. Mario Laprise, Director General of the Sûreté du Québec.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

Pursuant to Standing Order 146, Mr. Sklavounos, Deputy Government House Leader, moved:

THAT, within the framework of the examination of Bill 3, An Act to foster the financial health and sustainability of municipal defined benefit pension plans, the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain hold special consultations on 20, 21 and 22 and on 25 and 26 August 2014 in the Legislative Council Room and that, for this purpose, it hear the following groups:

Mr. Alban D'Amours
Ville de Montréal
Ville de Québec
Union des municipalités du Québec
Fédération québécoise des municipalités
Fédération des travailleurs et travailleuses du Québec
Confédération des syndicats nationaux
Regroupement des associations de pompiers du Québec
Association québécoise des retraités des secteurs public et parapublic
Centrale des syndicats démocratiques
Fédération indépendante des syndicats autonomes

13 June 2014

Fédération des policiers et policières municipaux du Québec
Fraternité des policiers et policières de Montréal
Association des pompiers de Montréal
Syndicat des pompiers et pompières du Québec
PBI conseillers en actuariat
Barreau du Québec
Régie des rentes
Ville de Longueuil
Ville de Gatineau
Ville de Saguenay
Ville de Drummondville
Ville de Sherbrooke
Canadian Union of Public Employees
FADOQ
Association québécoise de défense des droits des personnes
retraitées et préretraitées
Force Jeunesse

THAT a period of 12 minutes be set aside for opening statements, allocated as follows: 6 minutes to the parliamentary group forming the Government, 3 minutes 30 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition, and 2 minutes 30 seconds to the Second Opposition Group;

THAT the presentation by each organization last no longer than 10 minutes and the exchange with the Committee members last no longer than 50 minutes, allocated as follows: 25 minutes to the parliamentary group forming the Government, 15 minutes to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition, and 10 minutes to the Second Opposition Group;

THAT the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Land Occupancy be a member of the said Committee during its proceedings with respect to this order of reference.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

13 June 2014

Mr. Khadir (Mercier), together with Mr. Marceau (Rousseau), moved a motion concerning tax solidarity day; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 84.1 and 185, Mrs. Charbonneau, Minister of Families and Minister responsible for Seniors, together with Mrs. Richard (Duplessis), Mrs. Lavallée (Repentigny) and Mr. Khadir (Mercier), moved:

THAT the National Assembly underline World Elder Abuse Awareness Day, which will be held 15 June 2014;

THAT it commend the activities carried out in all regions of Québec to counter elder abuse and that it encourage everyone to wear the purple ribbon to mark this day.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 84.1 and 185, Mr. Surprenant (Groulx), together with Mrs. David, Minister of Culture and Communications, and Mrs. Hivon (Joliette), moved:

THAT the National Assembly underline the 50th anniversary of the *Journal de Montréal*, which began publication on 15 June 1964;

THAT it underline its outstanding contribution, and that of its artisans, to our economy and to Québec society as a whole.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

13 June 2014

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Business Having Precedence

Debate on the Budget Speech

The Assembly resumed the debate, suspended at the sitting of 11 June 2014, on the motion by Mr. Leitão, Minister of Finance, –That this Assembly approves in general the budgetary policy of the Government, and on the motions stating a grievance by Mr. Marceau (Rousseau), Mr. Dubé (Lévis), Mrs. David (Gouin), Mr. Turcotte (Saint-Jean), Mr. Drainville (Marie-Victorin), Mr. Therrien (Sanguinet), Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques), Mrs. Poirier (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve) and Mr. Bergeron (Verchères), subject to the receivability of these motions.

The debate being concluded, Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, declared that the motions stating a grievance were receivable.

First, the question was put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Marceau (Rousseau). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the
Liberal Government for having presented an outrageous
financial framework in the last election campaign.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 13 in Appendix)

Yeas: 44 Nays: 62 Abstentions: 0

13 June 2014

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Dubé (Lévis). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Liberal Government for the lack of ambitious economic recovery and tax relief measures for families and the middle class in its 2014-2015 budget.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **14** in Appendix)

Yeas: **44** Nays: **62** Abstentions: **0**

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. David (Gouin). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Liberal Government for the overly hasty return to a balanced budget in its 2014-2015 budget, for the permanent austerity that will have a negative impact on quality and accessibility of public services, and for the under-financing and the general hiring freeze in the public and parapublic sectors.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **15** in Appendix)

Yeas: **2** Nays: **80** Abstentions: **24**

13 June 2014

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Turcotte (Saint-Jean). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Liberal Government for having presented the 2014-2015 Liberal-Coalition Avenir Québec budget, which foresees a decline in job creation in Québec.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **16** in Appendix)

Yeas: **26** Nays: **80** Abstentions: **0**

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Therrien (Sanguinet). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Liberal Government for having presented the 2014-2015 Liberal-Coalition Avenir Québec budget, which abandons the Putting Jobs First economic policy.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **17** in Appendix)

Yeas: **26** Nays: **80** Abstentions: **0**

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Drainville (Marie-Victorin). This motion reads as follows:

13 June 2014

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Liberal Government for having presented the 2014-2015 Liberal-Coalition Avenir Québec budget, which relaunches the shale gas industry in the St. Lawrence Valley.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **18** in Appendix)

Yeas: **26** Nays: **80** Abstentions: **0**

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Liberal Government for its 2014-2015 budget, which fails to initiate Québec's economic transition; limits its actions to support private and traditionally male-dominated economic sectors; does not significantly support the social economy; and directly attacks the education, health and social services networks representing the public economy.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **19** in Appendix)

Yeas: **26** Nays: **80** Abstentions: **0**

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Poirier (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve). This motion reads as follows:

13 June 2014

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Liberal Government for having presented the 2014-2015 Liberal-Coalition Avenir Québec budget, which dismantles Québec's offices abroad.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **20** in Appendix)

Yeas: **26** Nays: **80** Abstentions: **0**

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Bergeron (Verchères). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Liberal Government for having presented the 2014-2015 Liberal-Coalition Avenir Québec budget, which sets out expectations with regard to the federal government without indicating how it plans to deliver concrete results.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **21** in Appendix)

Yeas: **26** Nays: **80** Abstentions: **0**

Finally, the question was put on the motion moved by Mr. Leitão, Minister of Finance, –That this Assembly approves in general the budgetary policy of the Government.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

13 June 2014

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **22** in Appendix)

Yeas: **62** Nays: **44** Abstentions: **0**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 21, the proceedings continued beyond 1.00 o'clock p.m.

Government Bills

Report Stage

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 252 and 253, the Assembly took into consideration the report from the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries, Energy and Natural Resources on its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 5, An Act to amend the Act to limit oil and gas activities and other legislative provisions.

After debate thereon, the report was concurred in on division.

Passage

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 22 and 230, Mr. Arcand, Minister of Energy and Natural Resources, moved the passage of Bill 5, An Act to amend the Act to limit oil and gas activities and other legislative provisions.

After debate thereon, the motion was carried on division and, accordingly, Bill 5 was passed.

13 June 2014

At 1.25 o'clock p.m., Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Tuesday, 16 September 2014, at 1.45 o'clock p.m.

ROYAL ASSENT

On Friday, 13 June 2014, at 1.14 o'clock p.m., in the Office of the Lieutenant-Governor, in the presence of Mr. Moreau, Minister of Municipal Affairs and Land Occupancy and Delegate of the Premier, and of Mr. Arsenault, Director of Parliamentary Proceedings and Delegate of the Secretary General, the Honourable Pierre Duchesne, Lieutenant-Governor of Québec, was pleased to assent to the following Bills:

- 1 An Act respecting the inspector general of Ville de Montréal
- 4 An Act to amend the Act authorizing the making of collective agreements with a term of more than three years in the public and parapublic sectors
- 7 An Act to ratify the agreement relating to the conduct of proceedings in the National Assembly and in parliamentary committees as well as to parliamentary offices and budgetary aspects for the duration of the 41st Legislature

And, at 1.50 o'clock p.m., in the presence of Mr. Arsenault, Director of Parliamentary Proceedings and Delegate of the Secretary General, the Honourable Pierre Duchesne, Lieutenant-Governor of Québec, was pleased to assent to the following Bill:

- 5 An Act to amend the Act to limit oil and gas activities and other legislative provisions

JACQUES CHAGNON

President

APPENDIX

Recorded Divisions

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Marceau (Rousseau):

(Division No. 13)

YEAS - 44

Bédard (<i>PQ</i>)	Laframboise (<i>CAQ</i>)	Martel (<i>CAQ</i>)	Soucy (<i>CAQ</i>)
Bergeron (<i>PQ</i>)	Lamarre (<i>PQ</i>)	Massé (<i>IND</i>)	Spénard (<i>CAQ</i>)
Bérubé (<i>PQ</i>)	Lamontagne (<i>CAQ</i>)	Ouellet (<i>PQ</i>)	Surprenant (<i>CAQ</i>)
Caire (<i>CAQ</i>)	Lavallée (<i>CAQ</i>)	Picard (<i>CAQ</i>)	Therrien (<i>PQ</i>)
Cousineau (<i>PQ</i>)	LeBel (<i>PQ</i>)	Poirier (<i>PQ</i>)	Traversy (<i>PQ</i>)
D'Amours (<i>CAQ</i>)	Leclair (<i>PQ</i>)	Roberge (<i>CAQ</i>)	Turcotte (<i>PQ</i>)
Drainville (<i>PQ</i>)	Legault (<i>CAQ</i>)	Roy (<i>PQ</i>)	Villeneuve (<i>PQ</i>)
Dubé (<i>CAQ</i>)	Léger (<i>PQ</i>)	(<i>Bonaventure</i>)	Zakaïb (<i>PQ</i>)
Dufour (<i>PQ</i>)	Lelièvre (<i>PQ</i>)	Roy (<i>CAQ</i>)	
Hivon (<i>PQ</i>)	Lemay (<i>CAQ</i>)	(<i>Montarville</i>)	
Jolin-Barrette (<i>CAQ</i>)	Lisée (<i>PQ</i>)	Roy (<i>CAQ</i>)	
Khadir (<i>IND</i>)	Maltais (<i>PQ</i>)	(<i>Arthabaska</i>)	
Kotto (<i>PQ</i>)	Marceau (<i>PQ</i>)	Samson (<i>CAQ</i>)	

NAYS - 62

Arcand (<i>QLP</i>)	Daoust (<i>QLP</i>)	Leitão (<i>QLP</i>)	Simard (<i>QLP</i>)
Auger (<i>QLP</i>)	David (<i>QLP</i>)	Lessard (<i>QLP</i>)	(<i>Dubuc</i>)
Barrette (<i>QLP</i>)	(<i>Outremont</i>)	Matte (<i>QLP</i>)	Simard (<i>QLP</i>)
Bernier (<i>QLP</i>)	de Santis (<i>QLP</i>)	Ménard (<i>QLP</i>)	(<i>Charlevoix-Côte-de-Beaupré</i>)
Birnbaum (<i>QLP</i>)	Dutil (<i>QLP</i>)	Merlini (<i>QLP</i>)	Sklavounos (<i>QLP</i>)
Blais (<i>QLP</i>)	Fortin (<i>QLP</i>)	Montpetit (<i>QLP</i>)	St-Denis (<i>QLP</i>)
(<i>Saint-Henri-Sainte-Anne</i>)	(<i>Pontiac</i>)	Moreau (<i>QLP</i>)	St-Pierre (<i>QLP</i>)
Blanchette (<i>QLP</i>)	Fortin (<i>QLP</i>)	Morin (<i>QLP</i>)	Tanguay (<i>QLP</i>)
Bolduc (<i>QLP</i>)	(<i>Sherbrooke</i>)	Nichols (<i>QLP</i>)	Thériault (<i>QLP</i>)
(<i>Jean-Talon</i>)	Fournier (<i>QLP</i>)	Ouellette (<i>QLP</i>)	Vallée (<i>QLP</i>)
Boucher (<i>QLP</i>)	Giguère (<i>QLP</i>)	Ouimet (<i>QLP</i>)	Vallières (<i>QLP</i>)
Boulet (<i>QLP</i>)	Girard (<i>QLP</i>)	(<i>Fabre</i>)	Vien (<i>QLP</i>)
Carrière (<i>QLP</i>)	Habel (<i>QLP</i>)	Paradis (<i>QLP</i>)	Weil (<i>QLP</i>)
Charbonneau (<i>QLP</i>)	Hamad (<i>QLP</i>)	H. Plante (<i>QLP</i>)	
Charlebois (<i>QLP</i>)	Hardy (<i>QLP</i>)	Poëti (<i>QLP</i>)	
Chevarie (<i>QLP</i>)	Heurtel (<i>QLP</i>)	Polo (<i>QLP</i>)	
Coiteux (<i>QLP</i>)	Huot (<i>QLP</i>)	Reid (<i>QLP</i>)	
Couillard (<i>QLP</i>)	Iracà (<i>QLP</i>)	Rotiroti (<i>QLP</i>)	
D'Amour (<i>QLP</i>)	Kelley (<i>QLP</i>)	Rousselle (<i>QLP</i>)	

13 June 2014

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Dubé (Lévis):

(Division No. 14)

(Identical to Division No. 13)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. David (Gouin):

(Division No. 15)

YEAS - 2

Khadir (*IND*)

Massé (*IND*)

NAYS - 80

Arcand (*QLP*)

Auger (*QLP*)

Barrette (*QLP*)

Bernier (*QLP*)

Birnbaum (*QLP*)

Blais (*QLP*)

(*Saint-Henri-Sainte-Anne*)

Blanchette (*QLP*)

Bolduc (*QLP*)

(*Jean-Talon*)

Boucher (*QLP*)

Boulet (*QLP*)

Caire (*CAQ*)

Carrière (*QLP*)

Charbonneau (*QLP*)

Charlebois (*QLP*)

Chevarie (*QLP*)

Coiteux (*QLP*)

Couillard (*QLP*)

D'Amour (*QLP*)

D'Amours (*CAQ*)

Daoust (*QLP*)

David (*QLP*)

(*Outremont*)

de Santis (*QLP*)

Dubé (*CAQ*)

Dutil (*QLP*)

Fortin (*QLP*)

(*Pontiac*)

Fortin (*QLP*)

(*Sherbrooke*)

Fournier (*QLP*)

Giguère (*QLP*)

Girard (*QLP*)

Habel (*QLP*)

Hamad (*QLP*)

Hardy (*QLP*)

Heurtel (*QLP*)

Huot (*QLP*)

Iracà (*QLP*)

Jolin-Barrette (*CAQ*)

Kelley (*QLP*)

Laframboise (*CAQ*)

Lamontagne (*CAQ*)

Lavallée (*CAQ*)

Legault (*CAQ*)

Leitão (*QLP*)

Lemay (*CAQ*)

Lessard (*QLP*)

Martel (*CAQ*)

Matte (*QLP*)

Ménard (*QLP*)

Merlini (*QLP*)

Montpetit (*QLP*)

Moreau (*QLP*)

Morin (*QLP*)

Nichols (*QLP*)

Ouellette (*QLP*)

Ouimet (*QLP*)

(*Fabre*)

Paradis (*QLP*)

Picard (*CAQ*)

H. Plante (*QLP*)

Poëti (*QLP*)

Polo (*QLP*)

Reid (*QLP*)

Roberge (*CAQ*)

Rotiroti (*QLP*)

Rousselle (*QLP*)

Roy (*CAQ*)

(*Montarville*)

Roy (*CAQ*)

(*Arthabaska*)

Samson (*CAQ*)

Simard (*QLP*)

(*Charlevoix-Côte-de-Beaupré*)

Simard (*QLP*)

(*Dubuc*)

Sklavounos (*QLP*)

Soucy (*CAQ*)

Spénard (*CAQ*)

St-Denis (*QLP*)

St-Pierre (*QLP*)

Surprenant (*CAQ*)

Tanguay (*QLP*)

Thériault (*QLP*)

Vallée (*QLP*)

Vallières (*QLP*)

Vien (*QLP*)

Weil (*QLP*)

ABSTENTIONS - 24

Bédard (*PQ*)

Bergeron (*PQ*)

Bérubé (*PQ*)

Cousineau (*PQ*)

Drainville (*PQ*)

Dufour (*PQ*)

Hivon (*PQ*)

Kotto (*PQ*)

Lamarre (*PQ*)

LeBel (*PQ*)

Leclair (*PQ*)

Léger (*PQ*)

Lelièvre (*PQ*)

Lisée (*PQ*)

Maltais (*PQ*)

Marceau (*PQ*)

Ouellet (*PQ*)

Poirier (*PQ*)

Roy (*PQ*)

(*Bonaventure*)

Therrien (*PQ*)

Traversy (*PQ*)

Turcotte (*PQ*)

Villeneuve (*PQ*)

Zakaïb (*PQ*)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Turcotte (Saint-Jean):

(Division No. 16)

YEAS - 26

Bédard (<i>PQ</i>)	Kotto (<i>PQ</i>)	Marceau (<i>PQ</i>)	Turcotte (<i>PQ</i>)
Bergeron (<i>PQ</i>)	Lamarre (<i>PQ</i>)	Massé (<i>IND</i>)	Villeneuve (<i>PQ</i>)
Bérubé (<i>PQ</i>)	LeBel (<i>PQ</i>)	Ouellet (<i>PQ</i>)	Zakaïb (<i>PQ</i>)
Cousineau (<i>PQ</i>)	Leclair (<i>PQ</i>)	Poirier (<i>PQ</i>)	
Drainville (<i>PQ</i>)	Léger (<i>PQ</i>)	Roy (<i>PQ</i>)	
Dufour (<i>PQ</i>)	Lelièvre (<i>PQ</i>)	(<i>Bonaventure</i>)	
Hivon (<i>PQ</i>)	Lisée (<i>PQ</i>)	Therrien (<i>PQ</i>)	
Khadir (<i>IND</i>)	Maltais (<i>PQ</i>)	Traversy (<i>PQ</i>)	

NAYS - 80

Arcand (<i>QLP</i>)	de Santis (<i>QLP</i>)	Leitão (<i>QLP</i>)	Rousselle (<i>QLP</i>)
Auger (<i>QLP</i>)	Dubé (<i>CAQ</i>)	Lemay (<i>CAQ</i>)	Roy (<i>CAQ</i>)
Barrette (<i>QLP</i>)	Dutil (<i>QLP</i>)	Lessard (<i>QLP</i>)	(<i>Montarville</i>)
Bernier (<i>QLP</i>)	Fortin (<i>QLP</i>)	Martel (<i>CAQ</i>)	Roy (<i>CAQ</i>)
Birnbaum (<i>QLP</i>)	(<i>Pontiac</i>)	Matte (<i>QLP</i>)	(<i>Arthabaska</i>)
Blais (<i>QLP</i>)	Fortin (<i>QLP</i>)	Ménard (<i>QLP</i>)	Samson (<i>CAQ</i>)
(<i>Saint-Henri-Sainte-Anne</i>)	(<i>Sherbrooke</i>)	Merlini (<i>QLP</i>)	Simard (<i>QLP</i>)
Blanchette (<i>QLP</i>)	Fournier (<i>QLP</i>)	Montpetit (<i>QLP</i>)	(<i>Charlevoix-Côte-de-Beaupré</i>)
Bolduc (<i>QLP</i>)	Giguère (<i>QLP</i>)	Moreau (<i>QLP</i>)	Simard (<i>QLP</i>)
(<i>Jean-Talon</i>)	Girard (<i>QLP</i>)	Morin (<i>QLP</i>)	(<i>Dubuc</i>)
Boucher (<i>QLP</i>)	Habel (<i>QLP</i>)	Nichols (<i>QLP</i>)	Sklavounos (<i>QLP</i>)
Boulet (<i>QLP</i>)	Hamad (<i>QLP</i>)	Ouellette (<i>QLP</i>)	Soucy (<i>CAQ</i>)
Caire (<i>CAQ</i>)	Hardy (<i>QLP</i>)	Ouimet (<i>QLP</i>)	Spénard (<i>CAQ</i>)
Carrière (<i>QLP</i>)	Heurtel (<i>QLP</i>)	(<i>Fabre</i>)	St-Denis (<i>QLP</i>)
Charbonneau (<i>QLP</i>)	Huot (<i>QLP</i>)	Paradis (<i>QLP</i>)	St-Pierre (<i>QLP</i>)
Charlebois (<i>QLP</i>)	Iracà (<i>QLP</i>)	Picard (<i>CAQ</i>)	Surprenant (<i>CAQ</i>)
Chevarie (<i>QLP</i>)	Jolin-Barrette (<i>CAQ</i>)	H. Plante (<i>QLP</i>)	Tanguay (<i>QLP</i>)
Coiteux (<i>QLP</i>)	Kelley (<i>QLP</i>)	Poëti (<i>QLP</i>)	Thériault (<i>QLP</i>)
Couillard (<i>QLP</i>)	Laframboise (<i>CAQ</i>)	Polo (<i>QLP</i>)	Vallée (<i>QLP</i>)
D'Amour (<i>QLP</i>)	Lamontagne (<i>CAQ</i>)	Reid (<i>QLP</i>)	Vallièrès (<i>QLP</i>)
D'Amours (<i>CAQ</i>)	Lavallée (<i>CAQ</i>)	Roberge (<i>CAQ</i>)	Vien (<i>QLP</i>)
Daoust (<i>QLP</i>)	Legault (<i>CAQ</i>)	Rotiroti (<i>QLP</i>)	Weil (<i>QLP</i>)
David (<i>QLP</i>)			
(<i>Outremont</i>)			

13 June 2014

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Therrien (Sanguinet):

(Division No. 17)

(Identical to Division No. 16)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Drainville (Marie-Victorin):

(Division No. 18)

(Identical to Division No. 16)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques):

(Division No. 19)

(Identical to Division No. 16)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Poirier (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve):

(Division No. 20)

(Identical to Division No. 16)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Bergeron (Verchères):

(Division No. 21)

(Identical to Division No. 16)

On the motion moved by Mr. Leitão, Minister of Finance, –That this Assembly approves in general the budgetary policy of the Government:

(Division No. 22)

YEAS - 62

Arcand (<i>QLP</i>)	Daoust (<i>QLP</i>)	Leitão (<i>QLP</i>)	Simard (<i>QLP</i>)
Auger (<i>QLP</i>)	David (<i>QLP</i>)	Lessard (<i>QLP</i>)	(<i>Dubuc</i>)
Barrette (<i>QLP</i>)	(<i>Outremont</i>)	Matte (<i>QLP</i>)	Simard (<i>QLP</i>)
Bernier (<i>QLP</i>)	de Santis (<i>QLP</i>)	Ménard (<i>QLP</i>)	(<i>Charlevoix–Côte-de-Beaupré</i>)
Birnbaum (<i>QLP</i>)	Dutil (<i>QLP</i>)	Merlini (<i>QLP</i>)	Sklavounos (<i>QLP</i>)
Blais (<i>QLP</i>)	Fortin (<i>QLP</i>)	Montpetit (<i>QLP</i>)	St-Denis (<i>QLP</i>)
(<i>Saint-Henri-Sainte-Anne</i>)	(<i>Pontiac</i>)	Moreau (<i>QLP</i>)	St-Pierre (<i>QLP</i>)
Blanchette (<i>QLP</i>)	Fortin (<i>QLP</i>)	Morin (<i>QLP</i>)	Tanguay (<i>QLP</i>)
Bolduc (<i>QLP</i>)	(<i>Sherbrooke</i>)	Nichols (<i>QLP</i>)	Thériault (<i>QLP</i>)
(<i>Jean-Talon</i>)	Fournier (<i>QLP</i>)	Ouellette (<i>QLP</i>)	Vallée (<i>QLP</i>)
Boucher (<i>QLP</i>)	Giguère (<i>QLP</i>)	Ouimet (<i>QLP</i>)	Vallières (<i>QLP</i>)
Boulet (<i>QLP</i>)	Girard (<i>QLP</i>)	(<i>Fabre</i>)	Vien (<i>QLP</i>)
Carrière (<i>QLP</i>)	Habel (<i>QLP</i>)	Paradis (<i>QLP</i>)	Weil (<i>QLP</i>)
Charbonneau (<i>QLP</i>)	Hamad (<i>QLP</i>)	H. Plante (<i>QLP</i>)	
Charlebois (<i>QLP</i>)	Hardy (<i>QLP</i>)	Poëti (<i>QLP</i>)	
Chevarie (<i>QLP</i>)	Heurtel (<i>QLP</i>)	Polo (<i>QLP</i>)	
Coiteux (<i>QLP</i>)	Huot (<i>QLP</i>)	Reid (<i>QLP</i>)	
Couillard (<i>QLP</i>)	Iracà (<i>QLP</i>)	Rotiroti (<i>QLP</i>)	
D'Amour (<i>QLP</i>)	Kelley (<i>QLP</i>)	Rousselle (<i>QLP</i>)	

NAYS - 44

Bédard (<i>PQ</i>)	Laframboise (<i>CAQ</i>)	Martel (<i>CAQ</i>)	Soucy (<i>CAQ</i>)
Bergeron (<i>PQ</i>)	Lamarre (<i>PQ</i>)	Massé (<i>IND</i>)	Spénard (<i>CAQ</i>)
Bérubé (<i>PQ</i>)	Lamontagne (<i>CAQ</i>)	Ouellet (<i>PQ</i>)	Surprenant (<i>CAQ</i>)
Caire (<i>CAQ</i>)	Lavallée (<i>CAQ</i>)	Picard (<i>CAQ</i>)	Therrien (<i>PQ</i>)
Cousineau (<i>PQ</i>)	LeBel (<i>PQ</i>)	Poirier (<i>PQ</i>)	Traversy (<i>PQ</i>)
D'Amours (<i>CAQ</i>)	Leclair (<i>PQ</i>)	Roberge (<i>CAQ</i>)	Turcotte (<i>PQ</i>)
Drainville (<i>PQ</i>)	Legault (<i>CAQ</i>)	Roy (<i>PQ</i>)	Villeneuve (<i>PQ</i>)
Dubé (<i>CAQ</i>)	Léger (<i>PQ</i>)	(<i>Bonaventure</i>)	Zakaïb (<i>PQ</i>)
Dufour (<i>PQ</i>)	Lelièvre (<i>PQ</i>)	Roy (<i>CAQ</i>)	
Hivon (<i>PQ</i>)	Lemay (<i>CAQ</i>)	(<i>Montarville</i>)	
Jolin-Barrette (<i>CAQ</i>)	Lisée (<i>PQ</i>)	Roy (<i>CAQ</i>)	
Khadir (<i>IND</i>)	Maltais (<i>PQ</i>)	(<i>Arthabaska</i>)	
Kotto (<i>PQ</i>)	Marceau (<i>PQ</i>)	Samson (<i>CAQ</i>)	