

# **Votes and Proceedings**

of the Assembly

Tuesday, 8 March 2016 — No. 148

President of the National Assembly: Mr. Jacques Chagnon

The Assembly was called to order at 1.40 o'clock p.m.

\_\_\_\_\_

#### **ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

## **Statements by Members**

Mr. Bolduc (Mégantic) made a statement to congratulate Polyvalente Montignac, winner of the "Prix Essor" award.

\_\_\_\_

Mr. Gendron (Abitibi-Ouest) made a statement to congratulate Mrs. Madeleine Lévesque, winner of the "Hommage Aînés" award.

\_\_\_\_\_

Mr. Poëti (Marguerite-Bourgeoys) made a statement to congratulate the women who received the Medal of the National Assembly on International Women's Day.

Mr. Spénard (Beauce-Nord) made a statement to congratulate Mr. Paul-André Rodrigue, recipient of the Medal of Bravery.

\_\_\_\_\_

Mrs. Simard (Charlevoix-Côte-de-Beaupré) made a statement to invite citizens to discover the spas of the Côte-de-Beaupré region.

Mrs. Lamarre (Taillon) made a statement to pay tribute to the Centre des femmes de Longueuil.
Mr. Polo (Laval-des-Rapides) made a statement to underline Laval-des-Rapides students' visit to the National Assembly.
Mr. Surprenant (Groulx) made a statement to underline the work done in economic development and job creation by Mrs. France Sylvain and Mrs. Mona Beaulieu.
Mr. Habel (Sainte-Rose) made a statement to congratulate the Curé-Antoine-Labelle secondary school students who participated in a soup kitchen project.
Mr. Blais (Charlesbourg) made a statement to pay tribute to Charlesbourg's Association féminine d'éducation et d'action sociale.
At 1.52 o'clock p.m., Mr. Ouimet, First Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.
The proceedings resumed at 2.00 o'clock p.m.

Moment of reflection

#### **Presenting Papers**

Mrs. Weil, Minister of Immigration, Diversity and Inclusiveness, tabled the following:

The Québec policy on immigration, participation and inclusion entitled "Ensemble, nous sommes le Québec" and its 2016–2021 action strategy.

(Sessional Paper No. 1935-20160308)

\_\_\_\_

Mr. Fortin, Minister of Culture and Communications, tabled the following:

The 2014–2015 annual report of the Société de la Place des Arts de Montréal; (Sessional Paper No. 1936-20160308)

The 2014–2015 annual report of the Société de télédiffusion du Québec (Télé-Québec);

(Sessional Paper No. 1937-20160308)

The 2014–2015 annual report of the Société du Grand Théâtre de Québec; (Sessional Paper No. 1938-20160308)

The 2014–2015 annual report of the Montreal Museum of Fine Arts, including the financial statements of the Museum and of the Museum Foundation.

(Sessional Paper No. 1939 -20160308)

Mr. Fournier, Government House Leader, tabled the following:

The Government's reply to a petition tabled on 18 November 2015 by Mrs. Léger (Pointe-aux-Trembles) on the recognition and adequate funding of public schools in Québec;

(Sessional Paper No. 1940-20160308)

The Government's reply to a petition tabled on 26 November 2015 by Mr. Rochon (Richelieu) on creating genuine student ombudsmen on each school board;

(Sessional Paper No. 1941-20160308)

The Government's reply to a petition tabled on 2 December 2015 by Mrs. Léger (Pointe-aux-Trembles) on maintaining community-based services in Pointe-aux-Trembles and in Montréal-Est;

(Sessional Paper No. 1942-20160308)

The Government's reply to a petition tabled on 3 December 2015 by Mr. Jolin-Barrette (Borduas) on reinvesting in school budgets to support student success:

(Sessional Paper No. 1943-20160308)

The Government's reply to a petition tabled on 3 December 2015 by Mrs. Ouellet (Vachon) on amending the *Environment Quality Act* in favour of mobile home park tenants; (Sessional Paper No. 1944-20160308)

The Government's reply to petitions tabled on 10 February 2016 by Mr. Birnbaum (D'Arcy-McGee) on making the study of genocide mandatory in Québec's secondary schools;

(Sessional Paper No. 1945-20160308)

The reply to a written question from Mr. Jolin-Barrette (Borduas) on the implementation of amendments to the "Lottery Schemes Regulation" and to the "Lottery Scheme Rules" — Question No. 142, *Order Paper and Notices* of 10 February 2016;

(Sessional Paper No. 1946-20160308)

The reply to a written question from Mr. Martel (Nicolet-Bécancour) on passenger and vehicle traffic on the Québec-Lévis, Sorel-Tracy-Saint-Ignace-de-Loyola, Matane-Baie-Comeau-Godbout and Tadoussac-Baie-Sainte-Catherine ferries — Question No. 132, *Order Paper and Notices* of 10 February 2016;

(Sessional Paper No. 1947-20160308)

The reply to a written question from Mr. Roberge (Chambly) on public schools' purchase of electronic tablets as school material — Question No. 144, *Order Paper and Notices* of 11 February 2016.

(Sessional Paper No. 1948-20160308)

The reply to written questions from Mrs. Lavallée (Repentigny) on the number and nature of mobilization activities carried out with child care service providers in 2013–2014, 2014–2015 and 2015–2016, the follow-up inspections with child care service providers and the percentage of child care services operating illegally that complied with the Act after having been uncovered for the 2014–2015 fiscal period – Question Nos. 145 to 147, *Order Paper and Notices* of 11 February 2016.

(Sessional Paper No. 1949-20160308)

The President tabled the following:

A letter, dated 28 February 2016, he had received from Mrs. Hélène Simard informing the President of her resignation as a member of the Commission des droits de la personne et des droits de la jeunesse du Québec;

(Sessional Paper No. 1950-20160308)

A copy of the notice of motion by Mr. Marceau (Rousseau) to be placed on the *Order Paper and Notices* of Wednesday, 9 March 2016 under Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition.

(Sessional Paper No. 1951-20160308)

#### **Presenting Reports from Committees**

Mr. Auger (Champlain), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain, which held public hearings on 23 and 25 February and on 8 March 2016 within the framework of special consultations on Bill 83, An Act to amend various municipal-related legislative provisions concerning such matters as political financing.

(Sessional Paper No. 1952-20160308)

#### **Presenting Petitions**

Mr. Drolet (Jean-Lesage) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on adopting measures designed to protect the Québec taxi industry, signed by 2,949 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1953-20160308)

The President made a statement on the subject of applause, unparliamentary language and words inadmissible in debate during Oral Questions and Answers.

#### STATEMENT FROM THE CHAIR

During Oral Questions and Answers on Thursday, 25 February 2016, the Official Opposition House Leader asked a question about a Member belonging to the parliamentary group forming the Government. Following an answer from the Government House Leader, several Members belonging to the parliamentary group forming the Government stood up and applauded.

After the proceedings were suspended, the three House Leaders reiterated the importance of respecting the no-applause rule. The Government House Leader also stressed the importance of respecting Standing Order 35, which deals with unparliamentary language and words inadmissible in debate.

Both rules of procedure must be respected. However, there is no cause-and-effect link between them. Furthermore, a somewhat nuanced approach is needed as to their application.

Application of the rule prohibiting applause entails the Chair simply noting, rather than interpreting, actual fact. The Chair's role is to determine whether or not there has been applause. On 25 February, this observation was unequivocal. Since applause during Oral Questions and Answers has been prohibited without exception since 15 September 2015, the Chair's role did not include questioning the reasons for the applause.

However, the rule governing unparliamentary language and words inadmissible in debate, set out in Standing Order 35, requires nuancing as to its application. In other words, it is a rule whose application increasingly involves interpretation by the Chair. Unlike application of the no-applause rule, the Chair must note the facts and analyze the situation. A list of words deemed unparliamentary exists and can be used as a guide by the Chair in applying Standing Order 35. However, this is a grey area and the Chair's ruling depends on the nature of the words and, especially, the context in which they are spoken. Standing Order 35 is the very heart of parliamentary debate in that it provides the parameters within which Members' addresses can be made. In particular, it stipulates that no Member speaking shall cast reflections upon the conduct of another Member, unless he or she presents a motion impugning that conduct, or impute improper motives to another Member or refuse to take another Member at his or her word.

A sensitive, well-balanced approach to applying this Standing Order is crucial in the context of parliamentary proceedings, as it provides the framework for Members to exercise their constitutional parliamentary privilege of freedom of speech. This privilege is the most fundamental tool Members use in exercising their parliamentary duties and an important bulwark in safeguarding a democratic society. Since this privilege has such a broad scope, it must be exercised with care. Hence, legislatures' guidelines for its application, witness the Assembly's Standing Order 35. It is the Chair's role to find a way to allow vigorous and healthy democratic debate to take place.

In the 24 February sitting, this issue was addressed during Oral Questions and Answers. The Chair had made a cautionary remark to avoid a Member's conduct being called into question, which did not, in fact, occur. During Oral Questions and Answers on 25 February, no point of order was raised under Standing Order 35.

However, a point of order need not be raised by a Member for words to be deemed inadmissible or unparliamentary. It is the Chair's constant duty to ensure that the Standing Orders are respected.

In the case at hand, questioning the Government about a Member is not prohibited. However, casting reflections upon the conduct of another Member is.

In the discussions preceding the amendments to the Standing Orders, the clear goal was to improve decorum through two specific measures: starting proceedings on time and eliminating applause during Oral Questions and Answers. The Standing Orders were subsequently amended accordingly by the Assembly's Members without dissentient voice and their will to do so was thus unequivocally asserted. Since then, the Chair has done everything possible to ensure that there is no applause and to avoid such applause being replaced by other forms of demonstrativeness.

It is also important that failure to respect the no-applause rule not become a political tool used to emphasize the importance a certain group of Members accords to a subject discussed in Oral Questions and Answers. This would run contrary to the goals targeted when this rule was adopted.

No one seems to be questioning the fact that applause is prohibited during Oral Questions and Answers. So that proceedings are courteous, the Chair counts on the cooperation of all Members and on their sense of commitment to ensure that this rule is respected and that the words spoken in the House comply with Standing Order 35.

This way, we will achieve the goal of improving decorum in the Assembly and of projecting a better image of it.

#### **Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

At the request of the President, Mr. Barrette, Minister of Health and Social Services, withdrew certain words deemed unparliamentary.

#### **Motions Without Notice**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mrs. Thériault, Minister responsible for the Status of Women, together with Mr. Couillard, Premier, Mr. Péladeau, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Legault, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques) and Mrs. Roy (Arthabaska), moved:

THAT the National Assembly mark International Women's Day today, 8 March 2016;

THAT it reiterate the importance of maintaining the gains made by the feminists past and present;

THAT the National Assembly recall that, despite the significant progress that has marked Québec's recent history, women still face many obstacles and that it pledge to unite its efforts to remedy this situation by:

Promoting greater numbers of women in decision-making bodies;

Supporting the fight against sexual and gender-based stereotypes that perpetuate traditional roles and models;

Encouraging the fight against all forms of violence against women and denouncing such violence;

Promoting a holistic view of women's health reflecting the socio-economic factors that affect health;

THAT, lastly, it reaffirm the importance of continuing to advance the cause of equality between women and men, a fundamental value of Ouébec society.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mrs. Hivon (Joliette), together with Mr. Jolin-Barrette (Borduas), moved:

THAT the National Assembly reaffirm the primacy of the Civil Code of Québec and of its provisions governing the solemnization of marriage;

THAT the National Assembly confirm that officiants must transmit all declarations of marriage, without exception, to the Registrar of Civil Status, in accordance with article 118 of the Civil Code of Québec, in order to guarantee spouses the full enjoyment of the rights and protections enacted by the Code.

The question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 170 in Appendix)

Yeas: **106** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0** 

Mr. Martel (Nicolet-Bécancour), together with Mr. Ouellet (René-Lévesque) and Mr. Khadir (Mercier), moved a motion concerning the Société des traversiers du Québec; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie-Saint-Jacques), together with Mr. Bergeron (Verchères), moved a motion concerning firearm registration in Québec; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 84.1 and pursuant to Standing Order 146, Mr. Sklavounos, Deputy Government House Leader, moved:

THAT the National Assembly give effect to the order of reference given to the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries, Energy and Natural Resources within the framework of the consideration of the Green Paper on social acceptability entitled "Orientations du ministère de l'Énergie et des Ressources naturelles en matière d'acceptabilité sociale" tabled in the National Assembly on 16 February 2016 by the Minister of Energy and Natural Resources and Minister responsible for the Northern Plan to hold special consultations and public hearings on 15, 16, 17, 22, 23 and 24 March and on 5 April 2016;

THAT, for this purpose, the Committee hear the following:

Union des municipalités du Québec

Fédération québécoise des municipalités

Me Pierre Renaud, Counsel and Head of the Environmental Law Group at McCarthy Tétrault

Quebec Business Council on the Environment

Association québécoise de la production d'énergie renouvelable

Canadian Wind Energy Association

Association minière du Ouébec

Quebec Oil and Gas Association

Quebec Mineral Exploration Association

Conseil du patronat du Québec

Fédération des chambres de commerce du Québec

Union des producteurs agricoles

Assembly of the First Nations of Quebec and Labrador

Cree Nation Government

Canadian Federation of Independent Business

MRC de la Minganie

Ouebec Environmental Law Centre

Coalition "Pour que le Québec ait meilleure mine!"

Social Responsibility and Sustainable Development Research Chair, Université du Québec à Montréal

Regroupement des organismes de bassins versants du Québec

Regroupement national des conseils régionaux en environnement du Québec

Manicouagan-Uapishka Biosphere Reserve

MRC de Caniapiscau

Hydro-Québec

Pétrolia

Corporation de développement économique de Port-Cartier

Mrs. Marie-Josée Fortin

Junex

Gaz Métro

Conseil régional de l'environnement de la Côte-Nord

Union des consommateurs

Nature Québec

Chamber of Commerce and Tourism of Gaspé

Ville de Gaspé

Ville d'Amqui

Développement économique Sept-Îles

Communauté métropolitaine de Montréal

Institut du Nouveau Monde

Mr. John Hanger

Raymond Chabot Grant Thornton

Transfert Environment and Society

Mrs. Stéphanie Yates

Équiterre;

THAT a period of 12 minutes be set aside for opening statements, allocated as follows: 6 minutes to the parliamentary group forming the Government, 3 minutes 30 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition, and 2 minutes 30 seconds to the Second Opposition Group;

THAT the presentation by each individual or organization last no longer than 10 minutes and the exchange with the Committee members last no longer than 35 minutes, allocated as follows: 17 minutes 30 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Government, 10 minutes 30 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition, and 7 minutes to the Second Opposition Group;

THAT the Minister of Energy and Natural Resources and Minister responsible for the Northern Plan be a member of the said Committee during its proceedings with respect to this order of reference.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

## **Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

Mr. Sklavounos, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

- the Committee on Health and Social Services, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 81, An Act to reduce the cost of certain medications covered by the basic prescription drug insurance plan by allowing calls for tender;
- the Committee on Citizen Relations, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 77, Québec Immigration Act;
- the Committee on Institutions, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 59, An Act to enact the Act to prevent and combat hate speech and speech inciting violence and to amend various legislative provisions to better protect individuals.

And, by leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 143, he convened:

— the Committee on Culture and Education, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 86, An Act to modify the organization and governance of school boards to give schools a greater say in decision-making and ensure parents' presence within each school board's decision-making body.

## Information on the Proceedings of the Assembly

Mr. Bonnardel, Second Opposition Group House Leader, requested a directive on the Government's replies to the written questions placed on the *Order Paper and Notices*.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 53 and 59, Mr. Bonnardel, Second Opposition Group House Leader, tabled the following:

The Government's reply and the written questions placed on the *Order Paper and Notices* of 10 February 2016 by Mr. Martel (Nicolet-Bécancour).

(Sessional Paper No. 1954-20160308)

After having heard arguments from all sides, Mr. Ouimet, First Vice-President, took the matter under advisement.

Mr. Ouimet, First Vice-President, informed the Assembly that on Wednesday, 9 March 2016, during Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition, a debate would be held on the motion moved by Mr. Marceau (Rousseau).

This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly denounce the \$1,500 increase in the tax burden on Québec families resulting from the last two Liberal Government budgets;

THAT it demand that the Liberal Government's 2016–2017 budget not increase families' tax burden in any way.

1954

#### ORDERS OF THE DAY

## **Debates on Reports from Committees**

The Assembly took into consideration the report from the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain, which, on 29 September 2015, examined the 2011, 2012, 2013 and 2014 reports on the implementation of the *Municipal Ethics and Good Conduct Act*. The report contains conclusions and two recommendations.

Mr. Ouimet, First Vice-President, informed the Assembly of the allocation of speaking time for the proceedings with respect to this debate: 56 minutes 30 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Government; 33 minutes 30 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition; 23 minutes to the parliamentary group forming the Second Opposition Group; and 7 minutes to the independent Members, subject to a maximum of 2 minutes to the Member for Arthabaska. Within this framework, any time not used by the independent Members or by a parliamentary group shall be redistributed among the parliamentary groups in the proportions established above. Lastly, individual addresses shall not be limited.

A debate arose thereon.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 20, the proceedings continued beyond 6.00 o'clock p.m.

The debate expired and, pursuant to Standing Order 95, no question was put.

#### **Debates upon Adjournment**

At 6.03 o'clock p.m., the Assembly held two debates upon adjournment:

- the first, on a question from Mrs. Maltais (Taschereau) to Mrs. Vallée, Minister of Justice, about the contradiction between the position the Minister defended before the Superior Court concerning the Civil Code's application to religious marriages and her position on forced marriages in the context of Bill 59, An Act to enact the Act to prevent and combat hate speech and speech inciting violence and to amend various legislative provisions to better protect individuals;
- the second, on a question from Mr. Lelièvre (Gaspé) to Mr. Daoust, Minister of Transport, Sustainable Mobility and Transport Electrification, about the Commission des transports du Québec's hearings on the reduction in regional bus service by Orléans Express.

At 6.30 o'clock p.m., Mrs. Gaudreault, Second Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 7.30 o'clock p.m.

The proceedings resumed at 7.30 o'clock p.m.

#### **Government Bills**

Passage in Principle

The Assembly resumed the debate, which had been adjourned on 25 February 2016, on the motion to divide moved by Mr. Drainville, Official Opposition House Leader, within the framework of the passage in principle of Bill 70, An Act to allow a better match between training and jobs and to facilitate labour market entry, moved by Mr. Blais, Minister of Employment and Social Solidarity.

The debate being concluded, the question was put on this motion to divide, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 171 in Appendix)

Yeas: 31 Nays: 57 Abstentions: 0

The Assembly continued the debate on the motion moved by Mr. Blais, Minister of Employment and Social Solidarity, that Bill 70, An Act to allow a better match between training and jobs and to facilitate labour market entry, do now pass in principle.

The debate was adjourned in the name of Mr. Cousineau (Bertrand).

\_\_\_\_\_

At 9.29 o'clock p.m., Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Wednesday, 9 March 2016 at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

**JACQUES CHAGNON** 

President

## **APPENDIX**

## **Recorded Divisions**

On the motion moved by Mrs. Hivon (Joliette), together with Mr. Jolin-Barrette (Borduas):

# (Division No. 170)

# **YEAS - 106**

	ILAS - I	LUU	
Anglade (QLP)	Fortin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Marceau (PQ)	Roy(PQ)
Arcand (QLP)	(Pontiac)	Martel (CAQ)	(Bonaventure)
Auger (QLP)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Massé (IND)	Sauvé (QLP)
Barrette (QLP)	(Jonquière)	Ménard (QLP)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Bérubé (PQ)	Giguère (QLP)	Merlini (QLP)	Simard (QLP)
Billette ( <i>QLP</i> )	Girard (QLP)	Morin (QLP)	(Charlevoix–Côte-de- Beaupré)
Birnbaum ( <i>QLP</i> )	Habel (QLP)	Nichols (QLP)	Simard (QLP)
Blais (QLP)	Hamad (QLP)	Ouellet $(PQ)$	(Dubuc)
Bolduc (QLP)	Hardy (QLP)	(René-Lévesque)	Sklavounos (QLP)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Heurtel (QLP)	Ouellette ( <i>QLP</i> )	Soucy $(CAQ)$
Boucher (QLP)	Hivon $(PQ)$	Pagé (PQ)	Spénard (CAQ)
Boulet (QLP)	Huot (QLP)	Paradis (QLP)	St-Denis (QLP)
Bourgeois (QLP)	Iracà (QLP)	(Brome-Missisquoi)	St-Pierre ( <i>QLP</i> )
Caire $(CAQ)$	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Paradis (CAQ)	Surprenant (CAQ)
Carrière ( <i>QLP</i> )	Kelley (QLP)	(Lévis)	Tanguay (QLP)
Charbonneau (QLP)	Khadir (IND)	Péladeau (PQ)	Thériault (QLP)
Charlebois (QLP)	Kotto (PQ)	Picard (CAQ)	Therrien $(PQ)$
Cloutier $(PQ)$	Laframboise (CAQ)	Plante (QLP)	Traversy $(PQ)$
Coiteux (QLP)	Lamarre (PQ)	Poëti (QLP)	Tremblay (QLP)
Couillard (QLP)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Poirier (PQ)	Turcotte (PQ)
Cousineau (PQ)	Lavallée (CAQ)	Polo ( <i>QLP</i> )	Vallée (QLP)
D'Amour ( <i>QLP</i> )	LeBel $(PQ)$	Proulx (QLP)	Vallières (QLP)
D'Amours (CAQ)	Leclair (PQ)	Reid (QLP)	Vien (QLP)
Daoust (QLP)	Legault (CAQ)	Roberge (CAQ)	Villeneuve $(PQ)$
David (QLP)	Léger (PQ)	Rochon (PQ)	Weil (QLP)
(Outremont)	Leitão (QLP)	Rotiroti (QLP)	
de Santis (QLP)	Lelièvre (PQ)	Rousselle (QLP)	
Drainville ( $PQ$ )	Lemay (CAQ)	Roy (IND)	
Drolet (QLP)	Lessard (QLP)	(Arthabaska)	
Fortin (QLP)	Lisée (PQ)	Roy(CAQ)	
(Sherbrooke)	Maltais $(PQ)$	(Montarville)	

On the motion to divide moved by Mr. Drainville, Official Opposition House Leader:

# (Division No. 171)

## **YEAS - 31**

	1110	V <b>-</b>	
Bérubé (PQ)	Kotto (PQ)	Pagé (PQ)	Surprenant (CAQ)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Lamarre (PQ)	Roberge ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Traversy $(PQ)$
Cloutier $(PQ)$	Lavallée (CAQ)	Rochon $(PQ)$	Turcotte ( $PQ$ )
Cousineau (PQ)	LeBel $(PQ)$	Roy(PQ)	Villeneuve $(PQ)$
D'Amours (CAQ)	Léger (PQ)	(Bonaventure)	
Drainville (PQ)	Lelièvre (PQ)	Roy(CAQ)	
Gaudreault (PQ)	Lisée (PQ)	(Montarville)	
(Jonquière)	Maltais $(PQ)$	Samson (CAQ)	
Jolin-Barrette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Massé (IND)	Schneeberger (CAQ)	
Khadir (IND)	Ouellet $(PQ)$	Soucy (CAQ)	
	(René-Lévesque)		
	NAYS -	57	
Anglade (QLP)	de Santis (QLP)	Matte (QLP)	Sklavounos (QLP)
Arcand (QLP)	Drolet (QLP)	Ménard (QLP)	St-Denis (QLP)
Auger (QLP)	Fortin (QLP)	Merlini (QLP)	St-Pierre ( <i>QLP</i> )
Barrette (QLP)	(Sherbrooke)	Morin (QLP)	Tanguay (QLP)
Bernier ( <i>QLP</i> )	Fortin (QLP)	Nichols (QLP)	Thériault (QLP)
Birnbaum ( <i>QLP</i> )	(Pontiac)	Ouellette ( <i>QLP</i> )	Tremblay (QLP)
Blais (QLP)	Giguère (QLP)	Plante (QLP)	Vallée (QLP)
Bolduc (QLP)	Girard (QLP)	Poëti (QLP)	Vien (QLP)
Boucher (QLP)	Habel (QLP)	Polo (QLP)	Weil (QLP)
Bourgeois (QLP)	Hamad (QLP)	Proulx (QLP)	
Carrière ( <i>QLP</i> )	Hardy (QLP)	Reid (QLP)	
Charbonneau (QLP)	Heurtel (QLP)	Rotiroti (QLP)	
Charlebois (QLP)	Huot(QLP)	Rousselle ( <i>QLP</i> )	
Chevarie (QLP)	Iracà (QLP)	Sauvé (QLP)	
Coiteux ( <i>QLP</i> )	Kelley (QLP)	Simard (QLP)	
D'Amour ( <i>QLP</i> )	Leitão (QLP)	(Dubuc)	
David (QLP)	Lessard (QLP)	Simard (QLP)	
(Outremont)		(Charlevoix–Côte-de-	

Beaupré)