



---

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

---

FIRST SESSION

THIRTY-SEVENTH LEGISLATURE

## **Votes and Proceedings**

**of the Assembly**

**Wednesday, 16 November 2005 — No. 184**

**President of the National Assembly:  
Mr. Michel Bissonnet**

---

**QUÉBEC**

The Assembly was called to order at 10.07 o'clock a.m.

---

**ORDERS OF THE DAY**

**Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition**

Mr. Charbonneau (Borduas) moved:

THAT the National Assembly of Québec support the remarks made by the Minister of Health to the effect that a parallel private health system would be socially unacceptable and operationally inefficient.

Following a meeting with the House leaders, Mr. Cusano, First Vice-President, announced that he had apportioned the speaking time for the proceedings with respect to this motion as follows: ten minutes shall be allotted for a reply by its mover and ten minutes shall be set aside for the independent Members; the two parliamentary groups shall share equally the rest of the time allotted for this debate; within this framework, any time not used by a parliamentary group may be added to that of the other group, while any time not used by the independent Members will be redistributed equally amongst the parliamentary groups, it having been agreed that this apportionment may not be carried out before the time allotted to both parliamentary groups has entirely expired; and individual addresses shall not be limited.

And debate arising on the motion moved by Mr. Charbonneau (Borduas);

By leave of the Assembly, the motion by Mr. Charbonneau (Borduas) was corrected as follows: by adding, after the words "Minister of Health", the words "and Social Services".

**16 November 2005**

---

The motion, as corrected, reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly of Québec support the remarks made by the Minister of Health and Social Services to the effect that a parallel private health system would be socially unacceptable and operationally inefficient

The debate continued on the motion by Mr. Charbonneau (Borduas), as corrected.

The debate being concluded, the question was put on this motion, as corrected; a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

At the request of Mr. Moreau, Deputy Government House Leader, the division was deferred until Routine Proceedings later in today's sitting.

---

At 11.58 o'clock a.m., Mr. Cusano, First Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 2.00 o'clock p.m.

---

The proceedings resumed at 2.06 o'clock p.m.

---

Moment of reflection

## **ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

### **Presenting Papers**

Mr. Audet, Minister of Finance, tabled the following:

**16 November 2005**

---

The consolidated financial statements of the Société nationale du cheval de course for the fiscal year ended 31 December 2004.

(Sessional Paper No. 2349-20051116)

---

Mr. Fournier, Minister of Education, Recreation and Sports, tabled the following:

The annual report of the Comité d'agrément des programmes de formation à l'enseignement for the fiscal year ended 31 May 2005.

(Sessional Paper No. 2350-20051116)

---

Mr. Marcoux, Minister of Justice, tabled the following:

The annual management report of the Société québécoise d'information juridique for the fiscal year ended 31 March 2005.

(Sessional Paper No. 2351-20051116)

---

Mr. Béchard, Minister of Economic Development, Innovation and Export Trade, tabled the following:

The annual activity report of the Conseil de la science et de la technologie for the fiscal year ended 31 March 2005;

(Sessional Paper No. 2352-20051116)

The annual management report of the Conseil de la science et de la technologie for the fiscal year ended 31 March 2005.

(Sessional Paper No. 2353-20051116)

---

Mrs. Normandeau, Minister of Municipal Affairs and Regions, tabled the following:

**16 November 2005**

---

The Agreement between the Canada Mortgage and Housing Corporation and the Société d'habitation du Québec to amend the Agreement relating to the Government assistance program for owners of residential buildings damaged by pyrite.

(Sessional Paper No. 2354-20051116)

---

Mrs. Beauchamp, Minister of Culture and Communications, tabled the following:

The annual report of Télé-Québec for the fiscal year ended 31 March 2005;

(Sessional Paper No. 2355-20051116)

The annual management report of the Office québécois de la langue française for the fiscal year ended 31 March 2005.

(Sessional Paper No. 2356-20051116)

---

Mr. Dupuis, Government House Leader, on behalf of Mr. Lessard, Interim Minister of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, tabled the following:

The annual management report of the Centre québécois d'inspection des aliments et de santé animale for the fiscal year ended 31 March 2005.

(Sessional Paper No. 2357-20051116)

### **Presenting Reports from Committees**

Mr. Jutras (Drummond), chairman, tabled the following:

A report from the Committee on Labour and the Economy, which met on 10 and 15 November 2005 for clause-by-clause consideration of the following Bill:

119 An Act respecting the Ministère du Tourisme

The report contains certain amendments to the bill.

(Sessional Paper No. 2358-20051116)

16 November 2005

---

### **Presenting Petitions**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mr. Copeman (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition respecting an increase in motorcyclists' insurance fees, and signed by 974 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 2359-20051116)

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mr. Côté (Dubuc) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition respecting negotiations with teachers, and signed by 159 citizens of Ville de Saguenay.

(Sessional Paper No. 2360-20051116)

### **Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

At the request of Mr. President, Mr. Charest, Premier, withdrew certain words deemed unparliamentary.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 53 and 59, Mr. Bouchard (Vachon) tabled the following:

An information document prepared by the Ministère de la Famille, des Aînés et de la Condition féminine, dated 19 September 2005, entitled "Guide de planification de la réduction des effectifs";

(Sessional Paper No. 2361-20051116)

An information document prepared by the Ministère de la Famille, des Aînés et de la Condition féminine, dated 7 October 2005, entitled "Comment se préparer à une rencontre avec un employé visé par une mise à pied ou un licenciement".

(Sessional Paper No. 2362-20051116)

**16 November 2005**

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 53 and 59, Mr. Charbonneau (Borduas) tabled the following:

Copy of the contribution agreement reached between the Government of Canada and the Government of Québec, concerning the Fonds pour l'adaptation des soins de santé primaires.

(Sessional Paper No. 2363-20051116)

### **Deferred Divisions**

The Assembly took the division, which had been deferred during Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition earlier in today's sitting, on the motion moved by Mr. Charbonneau (Borduas), as corrected.

This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly of Québec support the remarks made by the Minister of Health and Social Services to the effect that a parallel private health system would be socially unacceptable and operationally inefficient.

The motion, as corrected, was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **196** in Appendix)

Yeas: **102**    Nays: **0**    Abstentions: **0**

### **Motions Without Notice**

Mr. Charest, Premier, moved a motion concerning the *Charter of Human Rights and Freedoms*; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 53, the Assembly immediately took Notices of Proceedings in Committees.

**16 November 2005**

---

### **Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 145, Mr. Dupuis, Government House Leader, convened the following Committee:

- the Committee on Social Affairs, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 124, Educational Childcare Act.

### **Motions Without Notice**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Lessard, Interim Minister of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, Mr. Grondin (Beauce-Nord) and Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine) jointly moved:

THAT, within the framework of the World Trade Organization negotiations, the National Assembly reiterate its unfailing support to supply management, an agricultural products marketing model that is equitable for consumers, taxpayers, processors and producers who live thereon, that it ascertain that the Federal Government maintain its support to the current supply management system and that the National Assembly ask the Federal Government to mandate its negotiators, at the conclusion of the present round of negotiations, to obtain results that will enable supply management sectors to avoid a decrease in tariffs and an increase in tariff quotas.

By leave of the Assembly under Standing Order 84, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 53, the Assembly took Notices of Proceedings in Committees.



**16 November 2005**

---

**Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 145, Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, gave the following notices:

- the Committee on Culture shall continue its public hearings within the framework of the general consultation on Québec's religious heritage;
- the Committee on Transportation and the Environment shall hold deliberative meetings to discuss the possibility of undertaking an order of initiative on the issue relating to the environment in Northern Québec and to organize the Committee's proceedings in relation to its order of initiative on road safety in Québec.

**Motions Without Notice**

Mr. Couillard, Minister of Health and Social Services, moved:

THAT the National Assembly mark World Day for  
Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease.

By leave of the Assembly under Standing Order 84, the motion was carried.

\_\_\_\_\_

Mrs. Thériault, Minister of Immigration and Cultural Communities, moved:

THAT the National Assembly mark International Day  
for Tolerance, which is being held today, 16 November 2005.

By leave of the Assembly under Standing Order 84, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

\_\_\_\_\_

**16 November 2005**

---

Mr. Moreau, Deputy Government House Leader, moved:

THAT, within the framework of the consideration of Bill 107, An Act to amend the Environment Quality Act, the Committee on Transportation and the Environment hold special consultations and public hearings on 22 November 2005, in Louis-Joseph-Papineau Room, and that, for this purpose, it hear the following groups:

- Barreau du Québec
- Front commun québécois pour une gestion écologique des déchets
- Centre de Tri Gaudreau inc.
- Centre québécois de droit en environnement

A period of 20 minutes shall be allotted for the opening statements, which time period shall be divided as follows: 10 minutes for the members of the parliamentary group forming the Government and 10 minutes for the Members sitting in Opposition;

The presentation by each group shall last no more than 15 minutes and the exchange with the members of the Committee shall last no more than 30 minutes, which time shall be shared equally among the members of the parliamentary group forming the Government and the Members sitting in Opposition;

A period of 20 minutes shall be allotted for the closing statements, which time period shall be divided as follows: 10 minutes for the Members sitting in Opposition and 10 minutes for the members of the parliamentary group forming the Government;

The Minister of Sustainable Development, the Environment and Parks shall be a member of the said Committee during its proceedings with respect to this order of reference.

By leave of the Assembly under Standing Order 84, the motion was carried.

16 November 2005

---

### **Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

Mr. Moreau, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following Committee:

- the Committee on Labour and the Economy, to hold public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 122, An Act to amend the Act respecting the lands in the domain of the State and other legislative provisions.

---

### **ORDERS OF THE DAY**

#### **Government Bills**

##### *Report Stage*

The Assembly resumed the debate, which had been adjourned on 15 November 2005, on the consideration of the report from the Committee on Social Affairs relating to Bill 83, An Act to amend the Act respecting health services and social services and other legislative provisions, together with the amendment handed in by Mr. Couillard, Minister of Health and Social Services.

The debate being concluded, the amendment was carried.

The report, as amended, was concurred in.

##### *Passage in Principle*

Mr. Bergman, Minister of Revenue, moved, —That Bill 126, Budget Act giving effect to the Budget Speech delivered on 21 April 2005 and to certain other budget statements, do now pass in principle.

**16 November 2005**

---

And debate arising;

The debate was adjourned in the name of Mr. Valois (Joliette).

---

At 6.00 o'clock p.m., Mrs. Leblanc, Second Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Thursday, 17 November 2005, at 10.00 o'clock a.m.

**MICHEL BISSONNET**

*President*

APPENDIX

Recorded Divisions

On the motion moved by Mr. Charbonneau (Borduas) during Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition, as corrected, concerning a parallel private health system:

(Division No. 196)

YEAS - 102

Arseneau	Chenail	Jérôme-Forget	Ouimet
Auclair	Cholette	Jutras	Pagé
Audet	Copeman	Kelley	Papineau
Bachand	Corbeil	Lafrenière	Paquet
Beauchamp	Côté	Lefebvre	Paquin
Beaudoin	Couillard	Légaré	Paradis
Béchar	Courchesne	Legault	Pelletier
Bergman	Cousineau	<i>[Rousseau]</i>	Picard
Bernard	Delisle	Legendre	Pinard
Bernier	Deslières	Léger	Reid
Bertrand	Després	Lelièvre	Richard
Bordeleau	Dion	Lemieux	Rioux
Bouchard	Dionne-Marsolais	Lessard	Robert
<i>[Vachon]</i>	Doyer	Létourneau	Roy
Boucher	Dubuc	Loiselle	Simard
Boulet	Dufour	MacMillan	Soucy
Bourdeau	Dupuis	Maltais	Théberge
Brodeur	Fournier	Marcoux	Thériault
Caron	Gabias	Marois	<i>[Masson]</i>
Champagne	Gagnon-Tremblay	Marsan	Thériault
Charbonneau	Gaudet	Mercier	<i>[Anjou]</i>
Charest	Gauthier	Moreau	Tomassi
<i>[Matane]</i>	Girard	Morin	Tremblay
Charest	Grondin	<i>[Nicolet-Yamaska]</i>	Valois
<i>[Sherbrooke]</i>	Hamad	Morin	Vermette
Charest	Hamel	<i>[Montmagny-L'Islet]</i>	Vien
<i>[Rimouski]</i>	Harel	Mulcair	Whissell
Charlebois	James	Normandeau	