



---

---

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

---

---

FIRST SESSION

THIRTY-SEVENTH LEGISLATURE

## **Votes and Proceedings**

**of the Assembly**

**Wednesday, 24 March 2004 — No. 53**

**President of the National Assembly:  
Mr. Michel Bissonnet**

---

**QUÉBEC**

The Assembly was called to order at 10.04 o'clock a.m.

---

## ORDERS OF THE DAY

### Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition

Mrs. Harel (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve) moved:

THAT the National Assembly of Québec demand that the Liberal Government respect its solemn commitment to reinvest \$2.2 billion more in health and social services for the year 2004-2005.

Following a meeting with the House leaders, Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, announced the allocation of speaking time for the proceedings with respect to this motion: ten minutes shall be allotted for a reply by its mover and ten minutes shall be set aside for the independent Members; the two parliamentary groups shall share equally the rest of the time allotted for this debate; within this framework, any time not used by a parliamentary group may be added to that of the other group while any time not used by the independent Members shall be redistributed amongst the parliamentary groups, and individual addresses shall not be limited.

And debate arising on the motion by Mrs. Harel (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve);

At the end of his speech, Mr. Couillard, Minister of Health and Social Services, moved the following amendment motion:

THAT the motion by the Member for Hochelaga be amended as follows: by replacing, in the second line, the word "demand" by the word "ask"; by removing, in the second line, the word "solemn"; by adding, at the end of the fourth line, the words ", including the reinvestment that began in 2003-2004".

**24 March 2004**

---

The motion, as amended, would read as follows:

THAT the National Assembly of Québec ask that the Liberal Government respect its commitment to reinvest \$2.2 billion more in health and social services for the year 2004-2005, including the reinvestment that began in 2003-2004.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 198 and 199, the debate continued on the main motion by Mrs. Harel (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve) and on the amendment by the Minister of Health and Social Services, subject to the receivability of the latter, which Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, took under advisement.

Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, rendered his decision on the receivability of the amendment motion moved by the Minister of Health and Social Services.

#### RULING FROM THE CHAIR

The amendment motion is not receivable. The principle of the main motion is the reinvestment of \$2.2 billion more in health and social services for the year 2004-2005. The amendment moved by the Minister extends the period referred to in two fiscal years while taking into account the amounts invested during another year. This amendment thus has the effect of altering the nature of the main motion, which is contrary to its principle.

And debate continuing on the motion by Mrs. Harel (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve);

At the end of his speech, Mr. Auclair (Vimont) moved the following amendment motion:

THAT the motion by the Member for Hochelaga be amended as follows: by adding, in the first line, after the word "Québec" the words ", while recognizing the reinvestment in 2003-2004,"; by replacing, in the first line, the word "demand"; by the word "ask"; by removing, in the second line, the word "solemn".

The motion, as amended, would read as follows:

THAT the National Assembly of Québec, while recognizing the reinvestment in 2003-2004, ask that the Liberal Government respect its commitment to reinvest \$2.2 billion more in health and social services for the year 2004-2005.

**24 March 2004**

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 198 and 199, the debate continued on the main motion by Mrs. Harel (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve) and on the amendment by Mr. Auclair (Vimont), subject to the receivability of the latter, which Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, took under advisement.

At the request of Mrs. Leblanc, Second Vice-President, Mr. Bouchard (Vachon) withdrew certain words deemed unparliamentary.

Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, rendered his decision on the receivability of the amendment motion moved by Mr. Auclair (Vimont).

#### RULING FROM THE CHAIR

The amendment motion is receivable. It simply aims to extend the scope of the main motion, which is permitted by jurisprudence, but while respecting its principle which is that the Government reinvest \$2.2 billion more in health and social services for the year 2004-2005.

And debate continuing;

The debate being concluded, the question was put on this motion; a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

At the request of Mrs. Lamquin-Éthier, Deputy Government House Leader, the divisions on the amendment motion by Mr. Auclair (Vimont) and on the main motion by Mrs. Harel (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve) were deferred until Routine Proceedings on the present sitting day.

---

At 12.04 o'clock p.m., Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 2.00 o'clock p.m.

---

**24 March 2004**

---

The proceedings resumed at 2.05 o'clock p.m.

---

Moment of reflection

## **ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

### **Introduction of Bills**

Mr. Bellemare, Minister of Justice, moved that leave be granted to introduce the following Bill:

41 An Act to amend the Professional Code.

The motion was carried.

### **Presenting Papers**

Mr. Bellemare, Minister of Justice, tabled the following:

The annual report of the Ordre des acupuncteurs du Québec for the fiscal year ended 31 March 2003.

(Sessional Paper No. 746-20040324)

---

Mr. Chagnon, Minister of Public Security, tabled the following:

The annual report of the École nationale des pompiers du Québec for the fiscal year ended 30 June 2003.

(Sessional Paper No. 747-20040324)

---

**24 March 2004**

---

Mrs. Gauthier, Minister of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, tabled the following:

The annual report of the Bureau d'accréditation des pêcheurs et des aides-pêcheurs du Québec for the fiscal year ended 31 March 2003.

(Sessional Paper No. 748-20040324)

### **Presenting Reports from Committees**

Mrs. Charlebois (Soulanges), member, tabled the following:

A report from the Committee on Social Affairs, which, on 9, 10, 11, 16, 17, 18 and 23 March 2004, held public hearings within the framework of a general consultation on Bill 38, An Act respecting the Health and Welfare Commissioner.

(Sessional Paper No. 749-20040324)

### **Presenting Petitions**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mr. Gendron (Abitibi-Ouest) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition respecting Bill 25, An Act respecting local health and social services network development agencies, and signed by 132 citizens of the Abitibi-Témiscamingue region.

(Sessional Paper No. 750-20040324)

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mrs. Caron (Terrebonne) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition respecting motorcycle registration and licence fees, and signed by 20 citizens of the riding of Terrebonne.

(Sessional Paper No. 751-20040324)

---

**24 March 2004**

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mrs. Perreault (Chauveau) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition respecting the extension of Du Vallon Highway, and signed by 1231 residents of Les Méandres sector, in Québec City.

(Sessional Paper No. 752-20040324)

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mrs. Vien (Bellechasse) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition respecting the funding of Cinémathèque, and signed by 5990 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 753-20040324)

### **Complaints of Breach of Privilege or Contempt and Personal Explanations**

Mr. President informed the Assembly that he had received, within the prescribed time, a request from Mrs. Hamel (La Peltrie) to give personal explanations in relation to comments made during Oral Questions and Answers at the sitting of 23 March 2004 and which were published in certain newspapers.

Mr. President ruled that this request was in order and, consequently, allowed the Member for La Peltrie to give explanations.

### **Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

### **Deferred Divisions**

The Assembly took the divisions, which had been deferred during Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition, on the main motion by Mrs. Harel (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve) and on the amendment motion by Mr. Auclair (Vimont).

**24 March 2004**

---

First, the question was put on the amendment motion moved by Mr. Auclair (Vimont). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the motion by the Member for Hochelaga be amended as follows: by adding, in the first line, after the word "Québec" the words ", while recognizing the reinvestment in 2003-2004,"; by replacing, in the first line, the word "demand"; by the word "ask"; by removing, in the second line, the word "solemn".

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **59** in Appendix)

Yeas: **60**   Nays: **39**   Abstentions: **0**

The question was then put on the motion by Mrs. Harel (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve), as amended by the preceding vote. This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly of Québec, while recognizing the reinvestment in 2003-2004, ask that the Liberal Government respect its commitment to reinvest \$2.2 billion more in health and social services for the year 2004-2005.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **60** in Appendix)

Yeas: **96**   Nays: **3**   Abstentions: **0**

### **Motions Without Notice**

Mr. Reid, Minister of Education, moved:

THAT the National Assembly mark the 125<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the founding of the Université de Montréal as well as its outstanding contribution to building a modern Québec.

**24 March 2004**

---

By leave of the Assembly under Standing Order 84, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

### **Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

Mr. Dupuis, Government House Leader, convened the following Committees:

- the Committee on Education, to continue its public hearings within the framework of a general consultation on the quality, accessibility and funding of Québec universities;
- the Committee on Institutions, to conclude its public hearings within the framework of a general consultation on Bill 38, An Act respecting the Health and Welfare Commissioner;
- the Committee on Public Finance, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 20, An Act to amend the Act respecting the Ministère du Revenu and other legislative provisions.

---

Mrs. Leblanc, Second Vice-President, gave the following notice:

- the Committee on Public Finance shall hold a deliberative meeting for the purpose of organizing its proceedings.
-

24 March 2004

---

## ORDERS OF THE DAY

### Government Bills

#### *Passage in Principle*

Mr. Corbeil, Minister for Forests, Wildlife and Parks, moved, –That Bill 39, An Act to amend the Forest Act, do now pass in principle.

After debate thereon, the motion was carried and Bill 39 was accordingly passed in principle.

Mr. Dupuis, Government House Leader, moved that Bill 39 be referred for clause-by-clause consideration to the Committee on Labour and the Economy.

The motion was carried.

### Debates Upon Adjournment

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 309, the Assembly held the end of sitting debate that had been deferred at the sitting of 23 March 2004 between Mrs. Doyer (Matapédia) and Mr. Hamad, Minister of Natural Resources, Wildlife and Parks, on the increase in private forestry operations. Mr. Corbeil, Minister for Forests, Wildlife and Parks, replaced the Minister of Natural Resources, Wildlife and Parks for this debate.

---

Mr. Dupuis, Government House Leader, moved the adjournment of the Assembly until Thursday, 25 March 2004, at 2.00 o'clock p.m.

The motion was carried.

---

**24 March 2004**

---

Accordingly, at 4.59 o'clock p.m., Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Thursday, 25 March 2004, at 2.00 o'clock p.m.

**MICHEL BISSONNET**

*President*

24 March 2004

---

APPENDIX

Recorded Divisions

On the amendment motion by Mr. Auclair (Vimont):

(Division No. 59)

YEAS - 60

Auclair	Charlebois	Jérôme-Forget	Paradis
Audet	Cholette	Lafrenière	Perreault
Bachand	Clermont	Lamquin-Éthier	Reid
Beauchamp	Corbeil	L'Écuyer	Rioux
Béchar	Couillard	Lessard	Séguin
Bellemare	Courchesne	Loiselle	Soucy
Bergman	Delisle	MacMillan	Théberge
Bernier	Després	Marcoux	Thériault
Blackburn	Dubuc	Marsan	<i>[Anjou]</i>
Bordeleau	Dupuis	Mercier	Tomassi
Boulet	Fournier	Morin	Vallières
Brodeur	Gagnon-Tremblay	<i>[Montmagny-L'Islet]</i>	Vien
Chagnon	Gaudet	Mulcair	Whissell
Charest	Gauthier	Normandeau	
<i>[Matane]</i>	Gautrin	Ouimet	
Charest	Hamad	Paquet	
<i>[Sherbrooke]</i>	Hamel	Paquin	

NAYS - 39

Arseneau	Charest	Landry	Papineau
Beaudoin	<i>[Rimouski]</i>	Legault	Picard
Bédard	Cousineau	<i>[Rousseau]</i>	Pinard
Bertrand	Deslières	Legendre	Richard
Boisclair	Dion	Léger	Simard
Bouchard	Dionne-Marsolais	Lelièvre	St-André
<i>[Vachon]</i>	Doyer	Lemieux	Thériault
Boucher	Dufour	Létourneau	<i>[Masson]</i>
Boulerice	Dumont	Maltais	Tremblay
Caron	Grondin	Marois	Vermette
Champagne	Harel	Pagé	

24 March 2004

---

On the motion by Mrs. Harel (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve), as amended:

**(Division No. 60)**

**YEAS - 96**

Arseneau	Charest	Hamel	Ouimet
Auclair	<i>[Rimouski]</i>	Harel	Pagé
Audet	Charest	Jérôme-Forget	Papineau
Bachand	<i>[Sherbrooke]</i>	Lafrenière	Paquet
Beauchamp	Charlebois	Lamquin-Éthier	Paquin
Beaudoin	Cholette	Landry	Paradis
Béchar	Clermont	L'Écuyer	Perreault
Bédard	Corbeil	Legault	Pinard
Bellemare	Couillard	<i>[Rousseau]</i>	Reid
Bergman	Courchesne	Legendre	Richard
Bernier	Cousineau	Léger	Rioux
Bertrand	Delisle	Lelièvre	Séguin
Blackburn	Deslières	Lemieux	Simard
Boisclair	Després	Lessard	Soucy
Bordeleau	Dion	Létourneau	St-André
Bouchard	Dionne-Marsolais	Loiselle	Théberge
<i>[Vachon]</i>	Doyer	MacMillan	Thériault
Boucher	Dubuc	Maltais	<i>[Anjou]</i>
Boulerice	Dufour	Marcoux	Thériault
Boulet	Dupuis	Marois	<i>[Masson]</i>
Brodeur	Fournier	Marsan	Tomassi
Caron	Gagnon-Tremblay	Mercier	Tremblay
Chagnon	Gaudet	Morin	Vallières
Champagne	Gauthier	<i>[Montmagny-L'Islet]</i>	Vermette
Charest	Gautrin	Mulcair	Vien
<i>[Matane]</i>	Hamad	Normandeau	Whissell

**NAYS - 3**

Dumont	Grondin	Picard
--------	---------	--------