



---

---

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

---

---

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-FIRST LEGISLATURE

## **Votes and Proceedings**

**of the Assembly**

**Wednesday, 26 October 2016 — No. 200**

**President of the National Assembly:  
Mr. Jacques Chagnon**

---

**QUÉBEC**



The Assembly was called to order at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

---

## **ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

### **Statements by Members**

Mrs. Sauvé (Fabre) made a statement to pay tribute to the organization Aide aux personnes âgées, défavorisées ou handicapées de Laval.

---

Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia) made a statement to pay tribute to Mrs. Céline Dubé for her contribution to Matapédia's cultural development.

---

Mr. Fortin (Sherbrooke) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Denis Marceau for his involvement in the community of Sherbrooke.

---

Mr. Laframboise (Blainville) made a statement to pay tribute to Temple de la renommée de l'agriculture du Québec inductee Mr. Guy Charbonneau.

---

Mr. Girard (Trois-Rivières) made a statement to underline the entrepreneurship symposium and convention being held at the Université du Québec à Trois-Rivières.

**26 October 2016**

---

Mr. Bergeron (Verchères) made a statement to underline the 35th anniversary of 64° Groupe scout de Saint-Amable.

---

Mr. Bolduc (Mégantic) made a statement to underline the anniversaries of years of service in municipal politics of Mr. Jean-Denis Cloutier (25th) and Mrs. Sonia Cloutier (20th).

---

Mrs. Vallières (Richmond) made a statement to pay tribute to the volunteers of Richmond riding.

---

Mr. Proulx (Jean-Talon) made a statement to underline the 50th anniversary of the Institut des troubles d'apprentissage.

---

Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) made a statement to congratulate Mr. Boucar Diouf, winner of the "Prix d'excellence des diplômés de l'Université du Québec à Rimouski" award.

---

At 9.52 o'clock a.m., Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

---

The proceedings resumed at 10.00 o'clock a.m.

---

26 October 2016

---

Moment of reflection

### **Presenting Reports from Committees**

Mr. Auger (Champlain), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain, which met on 27 and 28 September and on 3, 4, 5, 6, 18, 19, 20 and 25 October 2016 for clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 110, An Act respecting the process of negotiation of collective agreements and the settlement of disputes in the municipal sector. The report contains amendments to the bill.

(Sessional Paper No. 2681-20161026)

### **Presenting Petitions**

Mr. Paradis (Lévis) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on a third link between Québec City and Lévis, signed by 3,915 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 2682-20161026)

### **Complaints of Breach of Privilege or Contempt and Personal Explanations**

The President informed the Assembly that he had, within the prescribed time, received a request from Mr. Caire, Deputy Second Opposition Group House Leader, to be heard on a matter of breach of privilege or contempt.

**26 October 2016**

---

In his notice, the Deputy Second Opposition Group House Leader alleged that the Minister of transport and Mrs. Dominique Savoie, former Deputy Minister of Transport, acted in contempt of Parliament on 18 May 2016, before the Committee on Public Administration, within the framework of the hearing on the administrative management and financial commitments of the Ministère des Transports du Québec and as a follow-up to Chapter 5 of the Auditor General's fall 2015 report. The Deputy Second Opposition Group House Leader also alleged that the Ministère des Transports and Mrs. Dominique Savoie violated sections 55(2), 55(3) and 55(4) of the *Act respecting the National Assembly*.

The President informed the Assembly that he would hear arguments at the next sitting, during Information on the Proceedings of the Assembly.

### **Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 53 and 59, Mr. Bonnardel, Second Opposition Group House Leader, tabled the following:

A copy of a table on the 2016 rate increases for middle-class families with a house and two children entitled "Hausse des tarifs pour une famille de la classe moyenne ayant une maison et deux enfants – 2016".

(Sessional Paper No. 2683-20161026)

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 53 and 59, Mr. Bonnardel, Second Opposition Group House Leader, tabled the following:

A copy of a document on the Québec Liberal Party's financial framework for the 2014 general election entitled "Cadre financier – Parti libéral du Québec – Élections générales 2014".

(Sessional Paper No. 2684-20161026)

26 October 2016

---

### Deferred Divisions

The Assembly took the division, which had been deferred at the sitting of 25 October 2016, on the motion moved by Mr. Heurtel, Minister of Sustainable Development, the Environment and the Fight Against Climate Change, for the passage of Bill 104, An Act to increase the number of zero-emission motor vehicles in Québec in order to reduce greenhouse gas and other pollutant emissions.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 246 in Appendix)

Yeas: **112**   Nays: **0**   Abstentions: **0**

Accordingly, Bill 104 was passed.

### Motions Without Notice

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mrs. Jean (Chicoutimi), together with Mrs. Thériault, Minister responsible for the Status of Women, Mrs. Roy (Montarville) and Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques), moved:

THAT the National Assembly applaud the thousands of people who are demonstrating throughout Québec today to denounce rape culture;

THAT it commend this show of solidarity toward women, which allows them to speak out and raise public awareness so as to put an end to this violence and the silence surrounding it;

THAT the Members of the National Assembly reiterate the urgent need to enlist all means, including budgetary measures, to implement the Government strategy to prevent and fight sexual violence.

**26 October 2016**

---

After the debate thereon, the question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **247** in Appendix)

Yeas: **112**   Nays: **0**   Abstentions: **0**

---

Mr. Martel (Nicolet-Bécancour), together with Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière), moved a motion concerning Oriens Technologies; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

---

Pursuant to Standing Order 129, Mr. Billette, Chief Government Whip, moved:

THAT the Member for La Prairie be named a permanent member of the Committee on Health and Social Services in substitution for the Member for Lafontaine;

THAT the Member for Beauce-Sud be named a permanent member of the Committee on Public Finance in substitution for the Member for La Prairie;

THAT these changes take effect immediately.

The motion was carried.

---

Mr. Khadir (Mercier) moved a motion concerning the Canada-European Union Comprehensive Economic and Trade Agreement; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

26 October 2016

---

**Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

Mr. Tanguay, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

- the Committee on Labour and the Economy, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 70, An Act to allow a better match between training and jobs and to facilitate labour market entry;
- the Committee on Culture and Education, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 105, An Act to amend the Education Act;
- the Committee on Institutions, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 62, An Act to foster adherence to State religious neutrality and, in particular, to provide a framework for religious accommodation requests in certain bodies;
- the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries, Energy and Natural Resources, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 106, An Act to implement the 2030 Energy Policy and to amend various legislative provisions;
- the Committee on Public Finance, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 87, An Act to facilitate the disclosure of wrongdoings within public bodies.

---

Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, gave the following notices:

- the Committee on Health and Social Services shall meet to elect its Chair;
- the Committee on Institutions shall hold a deliberative meeting to discuss the possibility of examining an order of initiative.

26 October 2016

---

## ORDERS OF THE DAY

At 11.31 o'clock a.m., at the request of Mr. Tanguay, Deputy Government House Leader, and by leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 20, Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 3.00 o'clock p.m.

\_\_\_\_\_

The proceedings resumed at 3.02 o'clock p.m.

\_\_\_\_\_

### **Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition**

Mrs. Lamarre (Taillon) moved:

THAT the National Assembly ask the Government of Québec to freeze medical specialists' and general practitioners' remuneration from now until such time as this remuneration reflects Quebecers' capacity to pay;

THAT the National Assembly ask the Government of Québec to reinvest the amounts freed up in health and social services.

Mr. Ouimet, First Vice-President, informed the Assembly of the allocation of speaking time for the proceedings with respect to this limited debate: 10 minutes to the mover of the motion for her reply; approximately 52 minutes to the parliamentary group forming the Government; approximately 30 minutes 20 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition; approximately 21 minutes 40 seconds to the Second Opposition Group; and 6 minutes to the independent Members. Within this framework, any time not used by the independent Members or by a parliamentary group shall be redistributed among the parliamentary groups in the proportions established above. Lastly, individual addresses shall not be limited.

26 October 2016

---

A debate arose thereon.

At the request of Mr. Ouimet, First Vice-President, Mr. Barrette, Minister of Health and Social Services, withdrew certain words deemed unparliamentary.

At the end of his address, Mr. Khadir (Mercier) moved:

THAT the motion moved by the Member for Taillon be amended as follows:

By adding the following paragraph after the second paragraph: “THAT the National Assembly ask the Government to develop a new method of remunerating physicians based on better weighting capitation, salary and fee-for-service payments in order to improve health care quality and increase coverage for all Quebecers.”

The motion, as amended, would read as follows:

THAT the National Assembly ask the Government of Québec to freeze medical specialists’ and general practitioners’ remuneration from now until such time as this remuneration reflects Quebecers’ capacity to pay;

THAT the National Assembly ask the Government of Québec to reinvest the amounts freed up in health and social services;

THAT the National Assembly ask the Government to establish a new method of remunerating physicians based on better weighting capitation, salary and fee-for-service payments in order to improve health care quality and increase coverage for all Quebecers.

The debate continued on the main motion moved by Mrs. Lamarre (Taillon) and on the amendment motion moved by Mr. Khadir (Mercier), subject to the permission of its author.

**26 October 2016**

---

Pursuant to Standing Order 98.1, Mrs. Lamarre (Taillon) refused the amendment proposed by Mr. Khadir (Mercier).

The debate being concluded, the question was put on the motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

At the request of Mr. Tanguay, Deputy Government House Leader, the division was deferred until Routine Proceedings on the next sitting day.

---

Mr. Tanguay, Deputy Government House Leader, moved the adjournment of the Assembly until Thursday, 27 October 2016 at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

The motion was carried.

---

Accordingly, at 5.01 o'clock p.m., Mrs. Gaudreault, Second Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Thursday, 27 October 2016 at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

#### ROYAL ASSENT

On Wednesday, 26 October 2016 at 2.20 o'clock p.m. in the Office of the Lieutenant-Governor, in the presence of Mr. Arsénault, Director of Parliamentary Proceedings and Delegate of the Secretary General, the Honourable J. Michel Doyon, Lieutenant-Governor of Québec, was pleased to assent to the following bill:

- 104 An Act to increase the number of zero-emission motor vehicles in Québec in order to reduce greenhouse gas and other pollutant emissions

**JACQUES CHAGNON**

*President*

**2692**

26 October 2016

---

## APPENDIX

### Recorded Divisions

On the motion moved by Mr. Heurtel, Minister of Sustainable Development, the Environment and the Fight Against Climate Change:

#### (Division No. 246)

#### YEAS - 112

Anglade ( <i>QLP</i> )	David ( <i>IND</i> )	Léger ( <i>PQ</i> )	Roberge ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Arcand ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Gouin</i> )	Leitão ( <i>QLP</i> )	Rochon ( <i>PQ</i> )
Auger ( <i>QLP</i> )	de Santis ( <i>QLP</i> )	Lelièvre ( <i>PQ</i> )	Rotiroti ( <i>QLP</i> )
Barrette ( <i>QLP</i> )	Drolet ( <i>QLP</i> )	Lemay ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Rousselle ( <i>QLP</i> )
Bergeron ( <i>PQ</i> )	Fortin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Lessard ( <i>QLP</i> )	Roy ( <i>PQ</i> )
Bernier ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Sherbrooke</i> )	Lisée ( <i>PQ</i> )	( <i>Bonaventure</i> )
Bérubé ( <i>PQ</i> )	Fortin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Maltais ( <i>PQ</i> )	Roy ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Billette ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Pontiac</i> )	Marceau ( <i>PQ</i> )	( <i>Montarville</i> )
Birnbaum ( <i>QLP</i> )	Fournier ( <i>QLP</i> )	Martel ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Samson ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Blais ( <i>QLP</i> )	Gaudreault ( <i>PQ</i> )	Massé ( <i>IND</i> )	Sauvé ( <i>QLP</i> )
Blanchette ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Jonquière</i> )	Matte ( <i>QLP</i> )	Schneeberger ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Bolduc ( <i>QLP</i> )	Giguère ( <i>QLP</i> )	Ménard ( <i>QLP</i> )	Simard ( <i>QLP</i> )
Bonnardel ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Girard ( <i>QLP</i> )	Merlini ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Charlevoix-Côte-de-Beaupré</i> )
Boucher ( <i>QLP</i> )	Habel ( <i>QLP</i> )	Montpetit ( <i>QLP</i> )	Simard ( <i>QLP</i> )
Boulet ( <i>QLP</i> )	Hamad ( <i>QLP</i> )	Morin ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Dubuc</i> )
Bourgeois ( <i>QLP</i> )	Hardy ( <i>QLP</i> )	Nichols ( <i>QLP</i> )	Soucy ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Busque ( <i>QLP</i> )	Heurtel ( <i>QLP</i> )	Ouellet ( <i>PQ</i> )	Spénard ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Caire ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Hivon ( <i>PQ</i> )	( <i>René-Lévesque</i> )	St-Denis ( <i>QLP</i> )
Carrière ( <i>QLP</i> )	Huot ( <i>QLP</i> )	Ouellette ( <i>QLP</i> )	St-Pierre ( <i>QLP</i> )
Charbonneau ( <i>QLP</i> )	Iracà ( <i>QLP</i> )	Pagé ( <i>PQ</i> )	Surprenant ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Charette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Jean ( <i>PQ</i> )	Paradis ( <i>QLP</i> )	Tanguay ( <i>QLP</i> )
Charlebois ( <i>QLP</i> )	Jolin-Barrette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Brome-Missisquoi</i> )	Thériault ( <i>QLP</i> )
Chevarie ( <i>QLP</i> )	Kelley ( <i>QLP</i> )	Paradis ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Therrien ( <i>PQ</i> )
Cloutier ( <i>PQ</i> )	Khadir ( <i>IND</i> )	( <i>Lévis</i> )	Traversy ( <i>PQ</i> )
Coiteux ( <i>QLP</i> )	Kotto ( <i>PQ</i> )	Picard ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Tremblay ( <i>QLP</i> )
Couillard ( <i>QLP</i> )	Laframboise ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Plante ( <i>QLP</i> )	Turcotte ( <i>PQ</i> )
Cousineau ( <i>PQ</i> )	Lamarre ( <i>PQ</i> )	Poëti ( <i>QLP</i> )	Vallée ( <i>QLP</i> )
D'Amour ( <i>QLP</i> )	Lavallée ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Poirier ( <i>PQ</i> )	Vallières ( <i>QLP</i> )
D'Amours ( <i>CAQ</i> )	LeBel ( <i>PQ</i> )	Polo ( <i>QLP</i> )	Vien ( <i>QLP</i> )
David ( <i>QLP</i> )	Leclair ( <i>PQ</i> )	Proulx ( <i>QLP</i> )	Villeneuve ( <i>PQ</i> )
( <i>Outremont</i> )	Legault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Richard ( <i>PQ</i> )	Weil ( <i>QLP</i> )

26 October 2016

---

On the motion moved by Mrs. Jean (Chicoutimi), together with Mrs. Thériault, Minister responsible for the Status of Women, Mrs. Roy (Montarville) and Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques):

**(Division No. 247)**

**YEAS - 112**

Anglade ( <i>QLP</i> )	David ( <i>IND</i> )	Léger ( <i>PQ</i> )	Roberge ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Arcand ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Gouin</i> )	Leitão ( <i>QLP</i> )	Rochon ( <i>PQ</i> )
Auger ( <i>QLP</i> )	de Santis ( <i>QLP</i> )	Lelièvre ( <i>PQ</i> )	Rotiroti ( <i>QLP</i> )
Barrette ( <i>QLP</i> )	Drolet ( <i>QLP</i> )	Lemay ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Rousselle ( <i>QLP</i> )
Bergeron ( <i>PQ</i> )	Fortin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Lessard ( <i>QLP</i> )	Roy ( <i>PQ</i> )
Bernier ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Sherbrooke</i> )	Lisée ( <i>PQ</i> )	( <i>Bonaventure</i> )
Bérubé ( <i>PQ</i> )	Fortin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Maltais ( <i>PQ</i> )	Roy ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Billette ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Pontiac</i> )	Marceau ( <i>PQ</i> )	( <i>Montarville</i> )
Birnbaum ( <i>QLP</i> )	Fournier ( <i>QLP</i> )	Martel ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Samson ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Blais ( <i>QLP</i> )	Gaudreault ( <i>PQ</i> )	Massé ( <i>IND</i> )	Sauvé ( <i>QLP</i> )
Blanchette ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Jonquière</i> )	Matte ( <i>QLP</i> )	Schneeberger ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Bolduc ( <i>QLP</i> )	Giguère ( <i>QLP</i> )	Ménard ( <i>QLP</i> )	Simard ( <i>QLP</i> )
Bonnardel ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Girard ( <i>QLP</i> )	Merlini ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Charlevoix–Côte-de-Beaupré</i> )
Boucher ( <i>QLP</i> )	Habel ( <i>QLP</i> )	Montpetit ( <i>QLP</i> )	Simard ( <i>QLP</i> )
Boulet ( <i>QLP</i> )	Hamad ( <i>QLP</i> )	Morin ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Dubuc</i> )
Bourgeois ( <i>QLP</i> )	Hardy ( <i>QLP</i> )	Nichols ( <i>QLP</i> )	Soucy ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Busque ( <i>QLP</i> )	Heurtel ( <i>QLP</i> )	Ouellet ( <i>PQ</i> )	Spénard ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Caire ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Hivon ( <i>PQ</i> )	( <i>René-Lévesque</i> )	St-Denis ( <i>QLP</i> )
Carrière ( <i>QLP</i> )	Huot ( <i>QLP</i> )	Ouellette ( <i>QLP</i> )	St-Pierre ( <i>QLP</i> )
Charbonneau ( <i>QLP</i> )	Iracà ( <i>QLP</i> )	Pagé ( <i>PQ</i> )	Surprenant ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Charette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Jean ( <i>PQ</i> )	Paradis ( <i>QLP</i> )	Tanguay ( <i>QLP</i> )
Charlebois ( <i>QLP</i> )	Jolin-Barrette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Brome-Missisquoi</i> )	Thériault ( <i>QLP</i> )
Chevarie ( <i>QLP</i> )	Kelley ( <i>QLP</i> )	Paradis ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Therrien ( <i>PQ</i> )
Cloutier ( <i>PQ</i> )	Khadir ( <i>IND</i> )	( <i>Lévis</i> )	Traversy ( <i>PQ</i> )
Coiteux ( <i>QLP</i> )	Kotto ( <i>PQ</i> )	Picard ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Tremblay ( <i>QLP</i> )
Couillard ( <i>QLP</i> )	Laframboise ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Plante ( <i>QLP</i> )	Turcotte ( <i>PQ</i> )
Cousineau ( <i>PQ</i> )	Lamarre ( <i>PQ</i> )	Poëti ( <i>QLP</i> )	Vallée ( <i>QLP</i> )
D'Amour ( <i>QLP</i> )	Lavallée ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Poirier ( <i>PQ</i> )	Vallières ( <i>QLP</i> )
D'Amours ( <i>CAQ</i> )	LeBel ( <i>PQ</i> )	Polo ( <i>QLP</i> )	Vien ( <i>QLP</i> )
David ( <i>QLP</i> )	Leclair ( <i>PQ</i> )	Proulx ( <i>QLP</i> )	Villeneuve ( <i>PQ</i> )
( <i>Outremont</i> )	Legault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Richard ( <i>PQ</i> )	Weil ( <i>QLP</i> )