



---

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

---

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-FIRST LEGISLATURE

## **Votes and Proceedings**

**of the Assembly**

**Wednesday, 16 November 2016 — No. 209**

**President of the National Assembly:  
Mr. Jacques Chagnon**

---

**QUÉBEC**



The Assembly was called to order at 9.41 o'clock a.m.

---

## **ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

### **Statements by Members**

Mrs. Tremblay (Chauveau) made a statement to underline the publication of Les Banques alimentaires du Québec's annual report, Bilan-Faim.

---

Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia) made a statement to underline École des Alizés's initiative in developing a program for teaching empathy.

---

Mr. Polo (Laval-des-Rapides) made a statement to underline the 15th anniversary of Ballet Raices de Colombia.

---

Mr. Paradis (Lévis) made a statement to underline Crohn's and Colitis Awareness Month.

---

Mr. D'Amour (Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata) made a statement to underline the 15th anniversary of the organization Logis-Aide des Basques.

**16 November 2016**

---

Mr. Villeneuve (Berthier) made a statement to congratulate the elected officials and citizens of the regional county municipality of Matawinie, who promote their region's living heritage.

---

Mrs. Anglade (Saint-Henri–Sainte-Anne) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Cyril Morgan, President and CEO of Welcome Hall Mission.

---

Mr. Proulx (Jean-Talon) made a statement to underline the importance of the Québec Literacy Foundation's "The Gift of Reading" program.

---

Mr. Blais (Charlesbourg) made a statement to underline the performance of sports teams from the Capitale-Nationale region.

---

Mr. Bergeron (Verchères) made a statement to underline the 15th anniversary of La Maison des enfants of Montérégie.

---

At 9.52 o'clock a.m., Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

---

The proceedings resumed at 10.00 o'clock a.m.

---

Moment of reflection

### **Introduction of Bills**

The President communicated to the Assembly, and then tabled, the Law Clerk's report on the following private bill:

220     An Act respecting Ville de Saint-Augustin-de-Desmaures

The report states that the notice was drafted and published in accordance with the Rules for the Conduct of Proceedings governing private bills.

(Sessional Paper No. 2759-20161116)

Mr. Hamad (Louis-Hébert) moved that leave be granted to introduce Private Bill 220, An Act respecting Ville de Saint-Augustin-de-Desmaures.

The motion was carried.

Mr. Fournier, Government House Leader, moved that Private Bill 220 be referred to the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain for consultation and clause-by-clause consideration and that the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Land Occupancy be a member of the said Committee during its proceedings with respect to this order of reference.

The motion was carried.

---

The President communicated to the Assembly, and then tabled, the Law Clerk's report on the following private bill:

221     An Act respecting Ville de Salaberry-de-Valleyfield

The report states that the notice was drafted and published in accordance with the Rules for the Conduct of Proceedings governing private bills.

(Sessional Paper No. 2760-20161116)

**16 November 2016**

---

Mrs. Nichols (Vaudreuil) moved that leave be granted to introduce Private Bill 221, An Act respecting Ville de Salaberry-de-Valleyfield.

The motion was carried.

Mr. Fournier, Government House Leader, moved that Private Bill 221 be referred to the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain for consultation and clause-by-clause consideration and that the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Land Occupancy be a member of the said Committee during its proceedings with respect to this order of reference.

The motion was carried.

### **Presenting Papers**

The President tabled three decisions of the Office of the National Assembly, dated 3 November 2016:

Decision 1880 concerning the Règlement modifiant le Règlement sur le Plan d'organisation administrative de l'Assemblée nationale (regulation to amend the regulation respecting the administrative organization plan of the National Assembly);

(Sessional Paper No. 2761-20161116)

Decision 1881 concerning the Règlement concernant la promotion de la directrice des ressources financières, de l'approvisionnement et de la vérification (regulation respecting the promotion of the Director of Financial Resources, Procurement and Audit);

(Sessional Paper No. 2762-20161116)

Decision 1882 concerning the Règlement modifiant le Règlement sur la détermination du contingentement des emplois de complexité supérieure à l'Assemblée nationale (regulation to amend the regulation on determining the quota of higher complexity jobs at the National Assembly).

(Sessional Paper No. 2763-20161116)

### **Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

**16 November 2016**

---

At the request of the President, Mr. Leitão, Minister of Finance, twice withdrew certain words deemed unparliamentary.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 53 and 59, Mr. Bonnardel, Second Opposition Group House Leader, tabled the following:

A bundle of letters addressed to Mr. Carlos J. Leitão, Minister of Finance; Mr. Pierre Paradis, Minister of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food; Mr. Stéphane Billette, Chief Government Whip; Mr. André Villeneuve, Parti québécois agriculture critic; and Mrs. Sylvie D'Amours, Coalition avenir Québec agriculture critic, on the impact of changes to the farm property tax credit program.

(Sessional Paper No. 2764-20161116)

### **Motions Without Notice**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Lisée, Leader of the Official Opposition, together with Mr. Fortin, Minister of Culture and Communications, Mr. Birnbaum (D'Arcy-McGee), Mrs. Ouellet (Vachon), Mr. Legault, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, and Mrs. David (Gouin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly pay tribute to the life and exceptional work of Mr. Leonard Cohen;

THAT the Assembly underline this poet-singer-songwriter's enormous contribution to the cultural heritage of Québec and the world;

THAT it acknowledge his special attachment to the city of Montréal and to Québec, and his significant contribution to their visibility;

THAT the National Assembly express its most sincere condolences to the family and friends of Mr. Leonard Cohen;

THAT, lastly, the Members of the Assembly observe a minute of silence in his memory.

**16 November 2016**

---

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

At the request of Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, the Assembly observed a minute of silence.

---

Mr. Bonnardel, Second Opposition Group House Leader, moved a motion concerning the Société des alcools du Québec; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mrs. Thériault, Minister responsible for Small and Medium Enterprises, Regulatory Streamlining and Regional Economic Development, together with Mrs. Jean (Chicoutimi), Mr. Bonnardel, Second Opposition Group House Leader, and Mr. Khadir (Mercier), moved:

THAT the National Assembly officially recognize Global Entrepreneurship Week, held from 14 to 20 November 2016;

THAT the Assembly highlight the important, invaluable contribution entrepreneurs make to the vitality of all of Québec's regional economies;

THAT it reiterate the key, leading role entrepreneurs play in creating jobs, wealth and economic growth;

THAT, lastly, the National Assembly pay tribute to the audacity, innovation and creativity of the entrepreneurs whose activities highlight Québec know-how throughout the world.



**16 November 2016**

---

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

---

Mrs. David (Gouin), together with Mr. LeBel (Rimouski), moved a motion concerning increasing the hourly minimum wage to \$15; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

#### **Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

Mr. Tanguay, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

- the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries, Energy and Natural Resources, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 106, An Act to implement the 2030 Energy Policy and to amend various legislative provisions;
  - the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain, to continue and conclude its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 109, An Act to grant Ville de Québec national capital status and increase its autonomy and powers;
  - the Committee on Public Finance, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 87, An Act to facilitate the disclosure of wrongdoings within public bodies.
- 

Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, gave the following notices:

- the Committee on Labour and the Economy shall hold a deliberative meeting to discuss its draft report and determine the observations, conclusions and recommendations, if any, concerning the process that led to the sale of RONA shares by Investissement Québec;

16 November 2016

---

- the Committee on Public Finance shall hold a deliberative meeting to discuss the possibility of carrying out an order of initiative.

---

## ORDERS OF THE DAY

### Government Motions

The Assembly resumed the debate, which had been adjourned on 15 November 2016, on the motion that arose from the tabling of the Paris Agreement of the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change, on 8 November 2016, by Mrs. St-Pierre, Minister of International Relations and La Francophonie.

This motion reads as follows:

THAT, pursuant to section 22.3 of the *Act respecting the Ministère des Relations internationales*, the National Assembly approve the Paris Agreement of the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change.

The debate being concluded, the question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **258** in Appendix)

Yeas: **103**   Nays: **0**   Abstentions: **0**

Accordingly, this commitment was approved.

16 November 2016

---

## **Government Bills**

### *Adoption*

Mr. Proulx, Minister of Education, Recreation and Sports, moved the passage of Bill 105, An Act to amend the Education Act.

After debate thereon, the question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

At the request of Mr. Tanguay, Deputy Government House Leader, the division was deferred until Routine Proceedings on the next sitting day.

---

At 12.22 o'clock p.m., at the request of Mr. Tanguay, Deputy Government House Leader, and by leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 20, Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 3.00 o'clock p.m.

---

The proceedings resumed at 3.00 o'clock p.m.

---

## **Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition**

Mr. Caire (La Peltre) moved:

THAT the National Assembly mandate the Auditor General of Québec to audit the optimization of resources linked to the Société immobilière du Québec's sale of assets between 2003 and 2012;

**16 November 2016**

---

THAT the Assembly also mandate the Auditor General of Québec to audit all contracts and agreements, including leases, entered into between Québec Government departments and bodies and Mr. Georges Gantcheff's companies.

Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, informed the Assembly of the allocation of speaking time for the proceedings with respect to this limited debate: 10 minutes to the mover of the motion for his reply; approximately 52 minutes to the parliamentary group forming the Government; approximately 30 minutes 20 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition; approximately 21 minutes 40 seconds to the Second Opposition Group; and 6 minutes to the independent Members. Within this framework, any time not used by the independent Members or by a parliamentary group shall be redistributed among the parliamentary groups in the proportions established above. Lastly, individual addresses shall not be limited.

A debate arose thereon.

At the end of his address, Mr. Leitão, Minister of Finance, moved:

THAT the motion by the Member for La Peltre be amended as follows:

By adding the following paragraph after the second paragraph: "THAT, lastly, as part of his audit and the publication of his report, the Auditor General of Québec ensure that police investigations currently underway are not compromised."

The motion, as amended, would read as follows:

THAT the National Assembly mandate the Auditor General of Québec to audit the optimization of resources linked to the Société immobilière du Québec's sale of assets between 2003 and 2012;

**16 November 2016**

---

THAT the Assembly also mandate the Auditor General of Québec to audit all contracts and agreements, including leases, entered into between Québec Government departments and bodies and Mr. Georges Gantcheff's companies;

THAT, lastly, as part of his audit and the publication of his report, the Auditor General of Québec ensure that police investigations currently underway are not compromised.

The debate continued on the main motion moved by Mr. Caire (La Peltre) and on the amendment motion moved by Mr. Leitão, Minister of Finance, subject to the permission of its author.

At the end of her address, Mrs. Maltais (Taschereau) moved:

THAT the motion by the Member for La Peltre be amended as follows:

By adding the following paragraph after the second paragraph: "THAT, lastly, it demand that the Government of Québec table, in the National Assembly, no later than 18 November 2016, the forensic accounting report commissioned by the Société immobilière du Québec on the sale of immovables, as well as any in-house investigation report on this subject."

The motion, as amended, would read as follows:

THAT the National Assembly mandate the Auditor General of Québec to audit the optimization of resources linked to the Société immobilière du Québec's sale of assets between 2003 and 2012;

THAT the Assembly also mandate the Auditor General of Québec to audit all contracts and agreements, including leases, entered into between Québec Government departments and bodies and Mr. Georges Gantcheff's companies;

**16 November 2016**

---

THAT, lastly, it demand that the Government of Québec table, in the National Assembly, no later than 18 November 2016, the forensic accounting report commissioned by the Société immobilière du Québec on the sale of immovables, as well as any in-house investigation report on this subject.

The debate continued on the main motion moved by Mr. Caire (La Peltrie) and on the amendment motions moved by Mr. Leitão, Minister of Finance, and Mrs. Maltais (Taschereau), subject to the permission of its author.

Pursuant to Standing Order 98.1, Mr. Caire (La Peltrie) refused the amendment proposed by Mr. Leitão, Minister of Finance, and accepted the amendment proposed by Mrs. Maltais (Taschereau).

The debate being concluded, the question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

At the request of Mrs. Vien, Deputy Government House Leader, the divisions on the amendment motion moved by Mrs. Maltais (Taschereau) and on the motion moved by Mr. Caire (La Peltrie) were deferred until Routine Proceedings on the next sitting day.

#### **Private Members' Public Bills**

##### *Passage in Principle*

Mr. Habel (Sainte-Rose) moved that Bill 693, An Act to amend the Act respecting the governance of state-owned enterprises to promote the presence of young people on the boards of directors of such enterprises, do now pass in principle.

After debate thereon, the motion was carried, and Bill 693 was accordingly passed in principle.

**16 November 2016**

---

Mrs. Vien, Deputy Government House Leader, moved that Bill 693 be referred to the Committee on Public Finance for clause-by-clause consideration.

The motion was carried.

---

Mrs. Vien, Deputy Government House Leader, moved the adjournment of the Assembly until Thursday, 17 November 2016 at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

The motion was carried.

---

Accordingly, at 5.25 o'clock p.m., Mrs. Gaudreault, Second Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Thursday, 17 November 2016 at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

**JACQUES CHAGNON**

*President*

16 November 2016

---

## APPENDIX

### Recorded Divisions

On the motion moved by Mrs. St-Pierre, Minister of International Relations and La Francophonie:

#### (Division No. 258)

#### YEAS - 103

Anglade ( <i>QLP</i> )	David ( <i>QLP</i> )	Léger ( <i>PQ</i> )	Reid ( <i>QLP</i> )
Arcand ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Outremont</i> )	Leitão ( <i>QLP</i> )	Richard ( <i>PQ</i> )
Auger ( <i>QLP</i> )	de Santis ( <i>QLP</i> )	Lelièvre ( <i>PQ</i> )	Roberge ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Barrette ( <i>QLP</i> )	Drolet ( <i>QLP</i> )	Lemay ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Rochon ( <i>PQ</i> )
Bergeron ( <i>PQ</i> )	Fortin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Lessard ( <i>QLP</i> )	Rotiroti ( <i>QLP</i> )
Bérubé ( <i>PQ</i> )	( <i>Sherbrooke</i> )	Lisée ( <i>PQ</i> )	Rousselle ( <i>QLP</i> )
Billette ( <i>QLP</i> )	Fortin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Maltais ( <i>PQ</i> )	Roy ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Birnbaum ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Pontiac</i> )	Marceau ( <i>PQ</i> )	( <i>Montarville</i> )
Blais ( <i>QLP</i> )	Fournier ( <i>QLP</i> )	Martel ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Samson ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Blanchette ( <i>QLP</i> )	Giguère ( <i>QLP</i> )	Massé ( <i>IND</i> )	Sauvé ( <i>QLP</i> )
Bolduc ( <i>QLP</i> )	Girard ( <i>QLP</i> )	Matte ( <i>QLP</i> )	Schneeberger ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Bonnardel ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Habel ( <i>QLP</i> )	Ménard ( <i>QLP</i> )	Simard ( <i>QLP</i> )
Boucher ( <i>QLP</i> )	Hamad ( <i>QLP</i> )	Merlini ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Charlevoix-Côte-de-Beaupré</i> )
Boulet ( <i>QLP</i> )	Hardy ( <i>QLP</i> )	Montpetit ( <i>QLP</i> )	Simard ( <i>QLP</i> )
Bourgeois ( <i>QLP</i> )	Hivon ( <i>PQ</i> )	Morin ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Dubuc</i> )
Busque ( <i>QLP</i> )	Huot ( <i>QLP</i> )	Nichols ( <i>QLP</i> )	Spénard ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Caire ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Iracà ( <i>QLP</i> )	Ouellet ( <i>PQ</i> )	St-Pierre ( <i>QLP</i> )
Carrière ( <i>QLP</i> )	Jean ( <i>PQ</i> )	( <i>René-Lévesque</i> )	Surprenant ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Charbonneau ( <i>QLP</i> )	Jolin-Barrette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Ouellette ( <i>QLP</i> )	Tanguay ( <i>QLP</i> )
Charlebois ( <i>QLP</i> )	Kelley ( <i>QLP</i> )	Pagé ( <i>PQ</i> )	Thériault ( <i>QLP</i> )
Chevarie ( <i>QLP</i> )	Khadir ( <i>IND</i> )	Paradis ( <i>QLP</i> )	Therrien ( <i>PQ</i> )
Cloutier ( <i>PQ</i> )	Kotto ( <i>PQ</i> )	( <i>Brome-Missisquoi</i> )	Traversy ( <i>PQ</i> )
Coiteux ( <i>QLP</i> )	Laframboise ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Picard ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Tremblay ( <i>QLP</i> )
Cousineau ( <i>PQ</i> )	Lamarre ( <i>PQ</i> )	Plante ( <i>QLP</i> )	Turcotte ( <i>PQ</i> )
D'Amour ( <i>QLP</i> )	Lavallée ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Poëti ( <i>QLP</i> )	Vallée ( <i>QLP</i> )
D'Amours ( <i>CAQ</i> )	LeBel ( <i>PQ</i> )	Poirier ( <i>PQ</i> )	Vien ( <i>QLP</i> )
David ( <i>IND</i> )	Leclair ( <i>PQ</i> )	Polo ( <i>QLP</i> )	Villeneuve ( <i>PQ</i> )
( <i>Gouin</i> )	Legault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Proulx ( <i>QLP</i> )	Weil ( <i>QLP</i> )