



---

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

---

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-FIRST LEGISLATURE

## **Votes and Proceedings**

**of the Assembly**

**Thursday, 17 November 2016 — No. 210**

**President of the National Assembly:  
Mr. Jacques Chagnon**

---

**QUÉBEC**



The Assembly was called to order at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

---

## **ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

### **Statements by Members**

Mr. Carrière (Chapleau) made a statement to congratulate the Conseil québécois du loisir, winner of the World Leisure International Innovation Prize.

---

Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia) made a statement to congratulate Mrs. Sylvie Lacoste, named farmer of the year in the Bas-Saint-Laurent region.

---

Mr. Giguère (Saint-Maurice) made a statement to congratulate three Collège Shawinigan teachers, winners of a "Profession Santé" award.

---

Mr. Jolin-Barrette (Borduas) made a statement to underline the 40th anniversary of Club FADOQ Saint-Marc-sur-Richelieu.

---

Mr. Morin (Côte-du-Sud) made a statement to congratulate Mrs. Lise Morin Vachon, recipient of the Jean Foster award.

**17 November 2016**

---

Mrs. David (Gouin) made a statement to pay tribute to Coalition contre la pauvreté de La Petite-Patrie for its community involvement.

---

Mr. Kelley (Jacques-Cartier) made a statement to underline the visit of a group of young Aboriginal people to the National Assembly.

---

Mr. Spénard (Beauce-Nord) made a statement to congratulate Mr. Donald Brochu on being named a member of the Club des Bâtisseurs de la Nouvelle-Beauce.

---

Mrs. Poirier (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve) made a statement to underline the establishment of the Fondation Maison Gilles-Carle in Hochelaga-Maisonneuve riding.

---

At 9.51 o'clock a.m., Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

---

The proceedings resumed at 10.01 o'clock a.m.

---

17 November 2016

---

Moment of reflection

### **Presenting Papers**

Mr. Barrette, Minister of Health and Social Services, tabled the following:

The 2015–2016 annual report on applying the complaint review procedure and improving service quality of the Centre intégré universitaire de santé et de services sociaux du Saguenay–Lac-Saint-Jean;

(Sessional Paper No. 2765-20161117)

The 2015–2016 annual report on applying the complaint review procedure and improving service quality of the Centre intégré universitaire de santé et de services sociaux de l'Est-de-l'Île-de-Montréal.

(Sessional Paper No. 2766-20161117)

---

Mr. Fournier, Government House Leader, tabled the following:

The Government's reply to a petition tabled on 4 October 2016 by Mr. Jolin-Barrette (Borduas) on reforming legislation governing adoption in Québec with regard to personal information disclosure and adopted persons' status.

(Sessional Paper No. 2767-20161117)

---

The President tabled the following:

A copy of a letter, dated 16 November 2016, he had sent to Me Nour Salah, member of the Commission de la fonction publique, informing her that she had been designated the Commission's Acting President, effective 14 November 2016.

(Sessional Paper No. 2768-20161117)

**17 November 2016**

---

### **Presenting Reports from Committees**

Mr. Auger (Champlain), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain, which held public hearings on 14, 15 and 16 November 2016 within the framework of special consultations on Bill 109, An Act to grant Ville de Québec national capital status and increase its autonomy and powers.

(Sessional Paper No. 2769-20161117)

### **Presenting Petitions**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mr. Jolin-Barrette (Borduas) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on building a new school in Mont-Saint-Hilaire, signed by 894 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 2770-20161117)

### **Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

### **Deferred Divisions**

The Assembly took the division, which had been deferred at the sitting of 16 November 2016, on the motion moved by Mr. Proulx, Minister of Education, Recreation and Sports, for the passage of Bill 105, An Act to amend the Education Act.

**17 November 2016**

---

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **259** in Appendix)

Yeas: **80**    Nays: **16**    Abstentions: **0**

Accordingly, Bill 105 was passed.

---

The Assembly took the divisions, which had been deferred at the sitting of 16 November 2016, on the motion moved by Mr. Caire (La Peltrie) and on the amendment motion moved by Mrs. Maltais (Taschereau) during Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition.

First, the question was put on the amendment motion moved by Mrs. Maltais (Taschereau).

This motion reads as follows:

THAT the motion by the Member for La Peltrie be amended as follows:

By adding the following paragraph after the second paragraph: “THAT, lastly, it demand that the Government of Québec table, in the National Assembly, no later than 18 November 2016, the forensic accounting report commissioned by the Société immobilière du Québec on the sale of immovables, as well as any in-house investigation report on this subject.”

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **260** in Appendix)

Yeas: **36**    Nays: **60**    Abstentions: **0**

**17 November 2016**

---

The question was then put on the motion moved by Mr. Caire (La Peltre).

This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly mandate the Auditor General of Québec to audit the optimization of resources linked to the Société immobilière du Québec's sale of assets between 2003 and 2012;

THAT the Assembly also mandate the Auditor General of Québec to audit all contracts and agreements, including leases, entered into between Québec Government departments and bodies and Mr. Georges Gantcheff's companies.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **261** in Appendix)

Yeas: **96**    Nays: **0**    Abstentions: **0**

### **Motions Without Notice**

Mr. Jolin-Barrette (Borduas), together with Mrs. Hivon (Joliette) and Mr. Khadir (Mercier), moved a motion concerning the report on the administrative inquiry into the ruling to cancel the trial, for conspiracy to commit murder, of five Hells Angels from the Sherbrooke chapter and the report on the time involved in the legal proceedings; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mrs. Vien, Minister responsible for Labour, together with Mrs. Thériault, Minister responsible for the Status of Women, Mrs. Jean (Chicoutimi), Mrs. Poirier (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve), Mr. Picard (Chutes-de-la-Chaudière) and Mrs. David (Gouin), moved:



17 November 2016

---

THAT the National Assembly mark the 20th anniversary of the *Pay Equity Act*, passed unanimously on 21 November 1996;

THAT it recall that Québec is a leader in innovative policies on labour and gender equality issues;

THAT it recognize that the *Pay Equity Act* is a testament to social progress, recognizing women's work at its fair value;

THAT it reiterate that the purpose of the *Pay Equity Act* is to ensure that jobs traditionally or predominantly held by women are assigned the same remuneration as jobs traditionally or predominantly held by men. This is true even if the jobs are different, provided they are of comparable value within the same company;

THAT it highlight the fact that this anniversary provides an opportunity to applaud the work done and to spotlight the advances made by Québec society over the past 20 years;

THAT, lastly, the National Assembly reaffirm that pay equity is, and will remain, a fundamental value within Québec society.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

---

Mr. Turcotte (Saint-Jean), together with Mr. Paradis (Lévis) and Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques), moved a motion concerning the care, living conditions and staff ratio standards in residential and long-term care centres; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

---

**17 November 2016**

---

Mr. Khadir (Mercier), together with Mrs. Léger (Pointe-aux-Trembles) and Mr. Jolin-Barrette (Borduas), moved a motion concerning the labour dispute opposing the Government and public-sector attorneys and notaries; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

### **Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

Mr. Tanguay, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

- the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries, Energy and Natural Resources, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 106, An Act to implement the 2030 Energy Policy and to amend various legislative provisions;
- the Committee on Public Finance, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 87, An Act to facilitate the disclosure of wrongdoings within public bodies;
- the Committee on Institutions, to hold public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 113, An Act to amend the Civil Code and other legislative provisions as regards adoption and the disclosure of information;
- the Committee on Public Finance, to undertake clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 693, An Act to amend the Act respecting the governance of state-owned enterprises to promote the presence of young people on the boards of directors of such enterprises.

### **Information on the Proceedings of the Assembly**

Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, informed the Assembly that on Friday, 25 November 2016, Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia) would question Mr. Coiteux, Minister of Public Security, during an interpellation on the deplorable state of Québec's detention centres.

17 November 2016

---

## ORDERS OF THE DAY

### Government Bills

#### *Passage in Principle*

Mr. Coiteux, Minister of Municipal Affairs and Land Occupancy, moved that Bill 120, An Act to amend various legislative provisions concerning municipal affairs, do now pass in principle.

After debate thereon, the motion was carried, and Bill 120 was accordingly passed in principle.

Mr. Tanguay, Deputy Government House Leader, moved that Bill 120 be referred to the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain for clause-by-clause consideration.

The motion was carried.

---

Mr. Tanguay, Deputy Government House Leader, moved the adjournment of the Assembly until Tuesday, 22 November 2016 at 1.40 o'clock p.m.

The motion was carried.

---

Accordingly, at 12.16 o'clock p.m., Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Tuesday, 22 November 2016 at 1.40 o'clock p.m.

**JACQUES CHAGNON**

*President*

17 November 2016

---

## APPENDIX

### Recorded Divisions

On the motion moved by Mr. Proulx, Minister of Education, Recreation and Sports:

#### (Division No. 259)

##### YEAS - 80

Anglade ( <i>QLP</i> )	David ( <i>IND</i> )	Lamarre ( <i>PQ</i> )	Poirier ( <i>PQ</i> )
Arcand ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Gouin</i> )	Leclair ( <i>PQ</i> )	Polo ( <i>QLP</i> )
Auger ( <i>QLP</i> )	David ( <i>QLP</i> )	Léger ( <i>PQ</i> )	Proulx ( <i>QLP</i> )
Barrette ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Outremont</i> )	Leitão ( <i>QLP</i> )	Reid ( <i>QLP</i> )
Bergeron ( <i>PQ</i> )	de Santis ( <i>QLP</i> )	Lelièvre ( <i>PQ</i> )	Rochon ( <i>PQ</i> )
Bérubé ( <i>PQ</i> )	Drolet ( <i>QLP</i> )	Lessard ( <i>QLP</i> )	Rotiroti ( <i>QLP</i> )
Billette ( <i>QLP</i> )	Fortin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Maltais ( <i>PQ</i> )	Sauvé ( <i>QLP</i> )
Birnbaum ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Sherbrooke</i> )	Massé ( <i>IND</i> )	Simard ( <i>QLP</i> )
Blais ( <i>QLP</i> )	Fortin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Matte ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Dubuc</i> )
Blanchette ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Pontiac</i> )	Ménard ( <i>QLP</i> )	Simard ( <i>QLP</i> )
Bolduc ( <i>QLP</i> )	Fournier ( <i>QLP</i> )	Merlini ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Charlevoix-Côte-de-Beaupré</i> )
Boucher ( <i>QLP</i> )	Giguère ( <i>QLP</i> )	Montpetit ( <i>QLP</i> )	St-Denis ( <i>QLP</i> )
Boulet ( <i>QLP</i> )	Girard ( <i>QLP</i> )	Morin ( <i>QLP</i> )	St-Pierre ( <i>QLP</i> )
Bourgeois ( <i>QLP</i> )	Habel ( <i>QLP</i> )	Nichols ( <i>QLP</i> )	Tanguay ( <i>QLP</i> )
Busque ( <i>QLP</i> )	Hamad ( <i>QLP</i> )	Ouellet ( <i>PQ</i> )	Thériault ( <i>QLP</i> )
Carrière ( <i>QLP</i> )	Hardy ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>René-Lévesque</i> )	Therrien ( <i>PQ</i> )
Charbonneau ( <i>QLP</i> )	Huot ( <i>QLP</i> )	Ouellette ( <i>QLP</i> )	Tremblay ( <i>QLP</i> )
Charlebois ( <i>QLP</i> )	Iracà ( <i>QLP</i> )	Pagé ( <i>PQ</i> )	Turcotte ( <i>PQ</i> )
Chevarie ( <i>QLP</i> )	Jean ( <i>PQ</i> )	Paradis ( <i>QLP</i> )	Vallée ( <i>QLP</i> )
Cloutier ( <i>PQ</i> )	Kelley ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Brome-Missisquoi</i> )	Vien ( <i>QLP</i> )
Coiteux ( <i>QLP</i> )	Khadir ( <i>IND</i> )	Plante ( <i>QLP</i> )	Villeneuve ( <i>PQ</i> )
D'Amour ( <i>QLP</i> )	Kotto ( <i>PQ</i> )	Poëti ( <i>QLP</i> )	Weil ( <i>QLP</i> )

##### NAYS - 16

Bonnardel ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lavallée ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Roberge ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Spénard ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Caire ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Legault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Roy ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Surprenant ( <i>CAQ</i> )
D'Amours ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lemay ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Montarville</i> )	
Jolin-Barrette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Martel ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Samson ( <i>CAQ</i> )	
Laframboise ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Picard ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Schneeberger ( <i>CAQ</i> )	

17 November 2016

---

On the motion moved by Mrs. Maltais (Taschereau):

**(Division No. 260)**

**YEAS - 36**

Bergeron ( <i>PQ</i> )	Kotto ( <i>PQ</i> )	Massé ( <i>IND</i> )	Schneeberger ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Bérubé ( <i>PQ</i> )	Laframboise ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Ouellet ( <i>PQ</i> )	Spénard ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Bonnardel ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lamarre ( <i>PQ</i> )	(René-Lévesque)	Surprenant ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Caire ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lavallée ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Pagé ( <i>PQ</i> )	Therrien ( <i>PQ</i> )
Cloutier ( <i>PQ</i> )	Leclair ( <i>PQ</i> )	Picard ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Turcotte ( <i>PQ</i> )
D'Amours ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Legault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Poirier ( <i>PQ</i> )	Villeneuve ( <i>PQ</i> )
David ( <i>IND</i> )	Léger ( <i>PQ</i> )	Roberge ( <i>CAQ</i> )	
(Gouin)	Lelièvre ( <i>PQ</i> )	Rochon ( <i>PQ</i> )	
Jean ( <i>PQ</i> )	Lemay ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Roy ( <i>CAQ</i> )	
Jolin-Barrette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Maltais ( <i>PQ</i> )	(Montarville)	
Khadir ( <i>IND</i> )	Martel ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Samson ( <i>CAQ</i> )	

**NAYS - 60**

Anglade ( <i>QLP</i> )	Coiteux ( <i>QLP</i> )	Iracà ( <i>QLP</i> )	Reid ( <i>QLP</i> )
Arcand ( <i>QLP</i> )	D'Amour ( <i>QLP</i> )	Kelley ( <i>QLP</i> )	Rotiroti ( <i>QLP</i> )
Auger ( <i>QLP</i> )	David ( <i>QLP</i> )	Leitão ( <i>QLP</i> )	Sauvé ( <i>QLP</i> )
Barrette ( <i>QLP</i> )	(Outremont)	Lessard ( <i>QLP</i> )	Simard ( <i>QLP</i> )
Billette ( <i>QLP</i> )	de Santis ( <i>QLP</i> )	Matte ( <i>QLP</i> )	(Dubuc)
Birnbaum ( <i>QLP</i> )	Drolet ( <i>QLP</i> )	Ménard ( <i>QLP</i> )	Simard ( <i>QLP</i> )
Blais ( <i>QLP</i> )	Fortin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Merlini ( <i>QLP</i> )	(Charlevoix-Côte-de-Beaupré)
Blanchette ( <i>QLP</i> )	(Sherbrooke)	Montpetit ( <i>QLP</i> )	St-Denis ( <i>QLP</i> )
Bolduc ( <i>QLP</i> )	Fortin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Morin ( <i>QLP</i> )	St-Pierre ( <i>QLP</i> )
Boucher ( <i>QLP</i> )	(Pontiac)	Nichols ( <i>QLP</i> )	Tanguay ( <i>QLP</i> )
Boulet ( <i>QLP</i> )	Fournier ( <i>QLP</i> )	Ouellette ( <i>QLP</i> )	Thériault ( <i>QLP</i> )
Bourgeois ( <i>QLP</i> )	Giguère ( <i>QLP</i> )	Paradis ( <i>QLP</i> )	Tremblay ( <i>QLP</i> )
Busque ( <i>QLP</i> )	Girard ( <i>QLP</i> )	(Brome-Missisquoi)	Vallée ( <i>QLP</i> )
Carrière ( <i>QLP</i> )	Habel ( <i>QLP</i> )	Plante ( <i>QLP</i> )	Vien ( <i>QLP</i> )
Charbonneau ( <i>QLP</i> )	Hamad ( <i>QLP</i> )	Poëti ( <i>QLP</i> )	Weil ( <i>QLP</i> )
Charlebois ( <i>QLP</i> )	Hardy ( <i>QLP</i> )	Polo ( <i>QLP</i> )	
Chevarie ( <i>QLP</i> )	Huot ( <i>QLP</i> )	Proulx ( <i>QLP</i> )	

17 November 2016

---

On the motion moved by Mr. Caire (La Peltre):

(Division No. 261)

**YEAS - 96**

Anglade ( <i>QLP</i> )	David ( <i>QLP</i> )	Leitão ( <i>QLP</i> )	Rochon ( <i>PQ</i> )
Arcand ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Outremont</i> )	Lelièvre ( <i>PQ</i> )	Rotiroti ( <i>QLP</i> )
Auger ( <i>QLP</i> )	de Santis ( <i>QLP</i> )	Lemay ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Roy ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Barrette ( <i>QLP</i> )	Drolet ( <i>QLP</i> )	Lessard ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Montarville</i> )
Bergeron ( <i>PQ</i> )	Fortin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Maltais ( <i>PQ</i> )	Samson ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Bérubé ( <i>PQ</i> )	( <i>Sherbrooke</i> )	Martel ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Sauvé ( <i>QLP</i> )
Billette ( <i>QLP</i> )	Fortin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Massé ( <i>IND</i> )	Schneeberger ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Birnbaum ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Pontiac</i> )	Matte ( <i>QLP</i> )	Simard ( <i>QLP</i> )
Blais ( <i>QLP</i> )	Fournier ( <i>QLP</i> )	Ménard ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Dubuc</i> )
Blanchette ( <i>QLP</i> )	Giguère ( <i>QLP</i> )	Merlini ( <i>QLP</i> )	Simard ( <i>QLP</i> )
Bolduc ( <i>QLP</i> )	Girard ( <i>QLP</i> )	Montpetit ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Charlevoix-Côte-de-Beaupré</i> )
Bonnardel ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Habel ( <i>QLP</i> )	Morin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Spénard ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Boucher ( <i>QLP</i> )	Hamad ( <i>QLP</i> )	Nichols ( <i>QLP</i> )	St-Denis ( <i>QLP</i> )
Boulet ( <i>QLP</i> )	Hardy ( <i>QLP</i> )	Ouellet ( <i>PQ</i> )	St-Pierre ( <i>QLP</i> )
Bourgeois ( <i>QLP</i> )	Huot ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>René-Lévesque</i> )	Surprenant ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Busque ( <i>QLP</i> )	Iracà ( <i>QLP</i> )	Ouellette ( <i>QLP</i> )	Tanguay ( <i>QLP</i> )
Caire ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Jean ( <i>PQ</i> )	Pagé ( <i>PQ</i> )	Thériault ( <i>QLP</i> )
Carrière ( <i>QLP</i> )	Jolin-Barrette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Paradis ( <i>QLP</i> )	Therrien ( <i>PQ</i> )
Charbonneau ( <i>QLP</i> )	Kelley ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Brome-Missisquoi</i> )	Tremblay ( <i>QLP</i> )
Charlebois ( <i>QLP</i> )	Khadir ( <i>IND</i> )	Picard ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Turcotte ( <i>PQ</i> )
Chevarie ( <i>QLP</i> )	Kotto ( <i>PQ</i> )	Plante ( <i>QLP</i> )	Vallée ( <i>QLP</i> )
Cloutier ( <i>PQ</i> )	Laframboise ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Poëti ( <i>QLP</i> )	Vien ( <i>QLP</i> )
Coiteux ( <i>QLP</i> )	Lamarre ( <i>PQ</i> )	Poirier ( <i>PQ</i> )	Villeneuve ( <i>PQ</i> )
D'Amour ( <i>QLP</i> )	Lavallée ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Polo ( <i>QLP</i> )	Weil ( <i>QLP</i> )
D'Amours ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Leclair ( <i>PQ</i> )	Proulx ( <i>QLP</i> )	
David ( <i>IND</i> )	Legault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Reid ( <i>QLP</i> )	
( <i>Gouin</i> )	Léger ( <i>PQ</i> )	Roberge ( <i>CAQ</i> )	