



*Votes and Proceedings*  
*Wednesday, 16 October 2002 - No. 119*

*Ten o'clock*  
**President : Mrs. Louise Harel**

---

*The paper version of the Votes and Proceedings takes precedence over its electronic equivalent. The headings under the table of contents are neither all-inclusive nor restrictive.*

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

The Assembly was called to order at 10.07 o'clock a.m.

---

**ORDERS OF THE DAY**

**Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition**

Mr. Béchard (Kamouraska-Témiscouata) moved:

THAT the Governments of Québec and of Canada help the workers and forest industries of Québec affected by the softwood lumber conflict by immediately implementing efficient measures particularly, concerning the Government of Québec: by establishing specific training programmes for workers, by intensifying forestry operations, by adopting a moratorium on any new measure that would adversely affect the industry and by developing alternatives for the use of softwood lumber and particularly, concerning the Government of Canada: by improving the employment insurance programme, by facilitating credit access for businesses and by evaluating the possibility of creating a Crown corporation that could import wood in the United States.

Following a meeting with the House leaders, Mr. Beaulne, Second Vice-President, informed the Assembly that he had apportioned the speaking time for the proceedings with respect to this motion as follows: ten minutes shall be allotted for a reply by its mover and ten minutes shall be set aside for the independent Members; the two parliamentary groups shall share equally the rest of the time allotted for this debate; within this framework, any time not used by a parliamentary group may be added to that of the other group, while any time not used by the independent Members may be redistributed amongst the parliamentary groups, and individual addresses shall not be limited.

And debate arising on the motion moved by Mr. Béchard (Kamouraska-Témiscouata);

**16 October 2002**

---

The debate being concluded, the question was put on this motion; a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

At the request of Mrs. Vermette, Deputy Government House Leader, the division was deferred until Routine Proceedings on the present sitting day.

---

At 12.05 o'clock p.m., Mr. Beaulne, Second Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 2.00 o'clock p.m.

---

The proceedings resumed at 2.06 o'clock p.m.

---

Moment of reflection

## **ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

### **Statements by Ministers**

Mr. Bégin, Minister of Justice, made a statement about the bill amending the Act respecting Attorney General's prosecutors.

Mr. Paradis, Official Opposition House Leader, commented on behalf of the Official Opposition.

16 October 2002

---

## Introduction of Bills

Mr. Bégin, Minister of Justice, moved that leave be granted to introduce the following Bill:

119 An Act to amend the Act respecting Attorney General's prosecutors.

The motion was carried.

---

Mr. Boisclair, Government House Leader, moved:

THAT the Committee on Institutions hold a special consultation on Bill 119, An Act to amend the Act respecting Attorney General's prosecutors, on Thursday, 17 October 2002, beginning at 10:30 o'clock a.m., and, for this purpose, hear the Association des substituts du procureur général according to the following schedule:

10.30 a.m. to 10.45 a.m.	Opening statements by the parliamentary group forming the Government
10.45 a.m. to 11.00 a.m.	Opening statements by the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition
11.00 a.m. to 11.05 a.m.	Opening statements by the independent Members of the Action démocratique
11.05 a.m. to 12.00 p.m.	Association des substituts du procureur général
12.00 p.m. to 12.05 p.m.	Closing statements by the independent Members of the Action démocratique

**16 October 2002**

---

12.05 p.m. to 12.20 p.m. Closing statements by the  
parliamentary group forming the  
Official Opposition

12.20 p.m. to 12.35 p.m. Closing statements by the  
parliamentary group forming the  
Official Opposition

A period of thirty minutes shall be allotted for both the opening and closing statements, which time shall be shared equally among the members of the parliamentary group forming the Government and the Members sitting in Opposition;

The presentation by each group shall last no more than twenty minutes and the exchange with the members of the Committee shall last no more than forty minutes, which time shall be shared equally among the members of the parliamentary group forming the Government and the Members sitting in Opposition;

The Minister of Justice shall be a member of the said Committee during its proceedings with respect to this order of reference.

The motion was carried.

\_\_\_\_\_

Mr. Ménard, Minister of Transport, moved that leave be granted to introduce the following Bill:

118 An Act to amend the Act to prohibit commercial advertising along certain thoroughfares.

The motion was carried.

**16 October 2002**

---

Mr. Roger Bertrand, Minister for Health, Social Services, Youth Protection and Prevention, moved that leave be granted to introduce the following Bill:

- 117 An Act to amend the Act respecting the Institut national de santé publique du Québec and the Act respecting the Ministère de la Santé et des Services sociaux.

The motion was carried.

### **Presenting Papers**

Mr. Sylvain Simard, Minister of State for Education and Employment, tabled the following:

The annual report of the Commission consultative de l'enseignement privé for the fiscal year ended 31 March 2002.

(Sessional Paper No. 1399-20021016)

The annual report of the Conseil supérieur de l'éducation for the fiscal year ended 31 March 2002.

(Sessional Paper No. 1400-20021016)

---

Mrs. Goupil, Minister of State for Social Solidarity and Child and Family Welfare, tabled the following:

The annual report of the Ministère de la Famille et de l'Enfance for the fiscal year ended 31 March 2002.

(Sessional Paper No. 1401-20021016)

The strategic plan and orientation, 2002-2005, of the Conseil de la famille et de l'enfance.

(Sessional Paper No. 1402-20010523)

**16 October 2002**

---

Mr. Facal, Minister of State for Administration and the Public Service, tabled the following:

The annual report of the Société immobilière du Québec for the fiscal year ended 31 March 2002.

(Sessional Paper No. 1403-20021016)

---

Mr. Boisclair, Government House Leader, tabled the following:

Answer to a written question by Mr. Vallières (Richmond) concerning the expenses incurred for the removal of asbestos from Québec public buildings – Question No. 64, *Order Paper and Notices* of 8 May 2002.

(Sessional Paper No. 1404-20021016)

Answer to a petition presented on 23 May 2002 by Mr. Fournier (Châteauguay) concerning the banks of the Châteauguay river.

(Sessional Paper No. 1405-20021016)

Answer to a petition presented on 6 June 2002 by Mr. Labbé (Masson) concerning the advisability of establishing a commuter train service between Mascouche and Montréal.

(Sessional Paper No. 1406-20021016)

Answer to a petition presented on 12 June 2002 by Mrs. Lamquin-Éthier (Bourassa) concerning the exchange of information with regard to the location of sexual predators and pedophiles.

(Sessional Paper No. 1407-20021016)

### **Presenting Reports from Committees**

Mr. Beaumier (Champlain), chairman, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Culture, which, on 20 March 2002, heard the head officers of Télé-Québec within the framework of an order of surveillance of public agencies. The Committee held deliberative meetings within the framework of this mandate.

(Sessional Paper No. 1408-20021016)

16 October 2002

---

### **Complaints of Breach of Privilege or Contempt and Personal Explanations**

Madam President rendered her decision as regards the matter of privilege or contempt raised by Mr. Williams (Nelligan). According to the latter, the Minister of State for Health and Social Services acted in contempt of Parliament. He alleged that the Saguenay—Lac-Saint-Jean Regional Board availed itself of legislative provisions that had not been adopted by causing the emergency calls centre of this region to be transferred to the Québec health communication centre, while the National Assembly had not concluded its consideration of Bill 96, An Act respecting pre-hospital emergency services and amending various legislative provisions, which provides for such a measure. In his opinion, the Minister is responsible for this contempt of Parliament, since the Government appoints the members of the regional boards in pursuance of the *Act respecting health and social services*.

#### **RULING FROM THE CHAIR**

The facts adduced by the Official Opposition Member do not constitute, *prima facie*, contempt of Parliament. None of the facts lead us to believe that a regional board acted as if a bill had force of law.

Furthermore, these facts have no bearing on the adoption procedure of the bill. Members may still introduce amendments to the bill or not give final passage thereto.

Finally, notwithstanding that the Chair had reached the conclusion that the board availed itself of a provision of the bill, the link between the act carried out by the board and the responsibility of the Minister would be too tenuous to assert that the Minister had acted in contempt of Parliament.

### **Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

During his speech, by leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 53, Mr. Legault, Minister of Health and Social Services, tabled the following:



**16 October 2002**

---

Copy of a letter, dated 16 October 2002, addressed to Mr. Legault, Minister of Health and Social Services, by Mr. Jean Bartkowiak, Director General of the Vallées de l'Outaouais Hospital Centre, concerning the emergency unit of Hull Hospital Centre.

(Sessional Paper No. 1409-20021016)

### **Deferred Divisions**

The Assembly took the division, which had been deferred during Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition earlier in today's sitting, on the motion moved by Mr. Bécharde (Kamouraska-Témiscouata). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the Governments of Québec and of Canada help the workers and forest industries of Québec affected by the softwood lumber conflict by immediately implementing efficient measures particularly, concerning the Government of Québec: by establishing specific training programmes for workers, by intensifying forestry operations, by adopting a moratorium on any new measure that would adversely affect the industry and by developing alternatives for the use of softwood lumber and particularly, concerning the Government of Canada: by improving the employment insurance programme, by facilitating credit access for businesses and by evaluating the possibility of creating a Crown corporation that could import wood in the United States.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 112 in Appendix)

Yeas: **93**    Nays: **0**    Abstentions: **0**

### **Motions Without Notice**

Mr. Landry, Premier, moved:

**16 October 2002**

---

THAT the National Assembly reiterate its attachment to the Francophonie on the occasion of Québec's participation in the 9<sup>th</sup> Sommet de la francophonie, which will be held in Beirut, Lebanon, on 18, 19 and 20 October 2002, and whose theme is cultures dialogue.

By leave of the Assembly under Standing Order 84, a debate arose thereon.

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 53, the Assembly immediately took Notices of Proceedings in Committees.

#### **Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

Mr. Boisclair, Government House Leader, convened the following Committee:

- the Committee on Social Affairs, to continue its public hearings within the framework of the general consultation on Bill 112, An Act to combat poverty and social exclusion.

#### **Motions Without Notice**

And debate continuing on the motion moved by Mr. Landry, Premier;

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

#### **Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

Mrs. Vermette, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following Committee:

**16 October 2002**

---

- the Committee on Institutions, to hold a special consultation on Bill 119, An Act to amend the Act respecting Attorney General's prosecutors.

---

Mr. Bissonnet, Third Vice-President, gave the following notices:

- the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain shall hold special consultations on the working paper concerning the order of initiative on affordable welfare housing;
- the Committee on Public Administration shall hold a deliberative meeting for the purpose of preparing its hearing with the Deputy Minister of Health and Social Services concerning home care services.

---

## **ORDERS OF THE DAY**

### **Debates on Reports from Committees**

At the request of Mrs. Vermette, Deputy Government House Leader, and by leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 94, the Assembly deferred the debate on the report from the Committee on Labour and the Economy, which held public hearings within the framework of the general consultation on the issue of gasoline price variations and their impact on Québec's economy. This report contains recommendations.

### **Government Bills**

#### *Passage in Principle*

Mr. Legault, Minister of Health and Social Services, moved, —That Bill 113, An Act to amend the Act respecting health services and social services as regards the safe provision of health services and social services, do now pass in principle.

**16 October 2002**

---

And debate arising;

The debate was adjourned in the name of Mr. Gobé (LaFontaine).

---

At 6.02 o'clock p.m., Mr. Brouillet, First Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Thursday, 17 October 2002, at 10.00 o'clock a.m.

**LOUISE HAREL**

*President*

16 October 2002

---

**APPENDIX**

**Recorded Divisions**

On the motion moved by Mr. Béchard (Kamouraska-Témiscouata) during Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition:

**(Division No. 112)**

**YEAS - 93**

Arseneau	Charest	Houda-Pépin	Ouimet
Baril	<i>(Rimouski)</i>	Julien	Pagé
Beaulne	Charest	Jutras	Papineau
Beaumier	<i>(Sherbrooke)</i>	Kelley	Paradis
Béchard	Chenail	Kieffer	Paré
Bégin	Corriveau	Labbé	Payne
Bélanger	Côté	Lachance	Pelletier
Benoît	<i>(Dubuc)</i>	Lafrenière	<i>(Chapleau)</i>
Bergeron	Côté	Landry	Pelletier
Bergman	<i>(La Peltrie)</i>	Laporte	<i>(Abitibi-Est)</i>
Bertrand	Cousineau	Laprise	Pinard
<i>(Charlevoix)</i>	Delisle	Leblanc	Poulin
Bertrand	Désilets	Legault	Rioux
<i>(Portneuf)</i>	Dion	Legendre	Robert
Bissonnet	Doyer	Léger	Simard
Blanchet	Duguay	Lespérance	<i>(Richelieu)</i>
Boisclair	Facal	Létourneau	Simard
Bordeleau	Gagnon-Tremblay	Loiselle	<i>(Montmorency)</i>
Boulerice	Gaudreau	MacMillan	Sirros
Boulianne	Gautrin	Maltais	Thériault
Bourbeau	Gauvin	Mancuso	Tranchemontagne
Brodeur	Gendron	Marois	Tremblay
Brouillet	Geoffrion	Ménard	Vallières
Carrier-Perreault	Gobé	Middlemiss	Vermette
Chagnon	Goupil	Morin	Williams
Charbonneau	Grégoire	Mulcair	