



NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-FIRST LEGISLATURE

Votes and Proceedings

of the Assembly

Wednesday, 15 March 2017 — No. 234

**President of the National Assembly:
Mr. Jacques Chagnon**

QUÉBEC

The Assembly was called to order at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS

Statements by Members

Mr. Habel (Sainte-Rose) made a statement to underline the École Curé-Antoine-Labelle students' community involvement.

Mrs. Léger (Pointe-aux-Trembles) made a statement to underline the 35th anniversary of Coopérative d'Habitation Le Colombier in Pointe-aux-Trembles.

Mr. Poëti (Marguerite-Bourgeoys) made a statement to congratulate Mrs. Jennifer Damiani and Mrs. Martine Mimeault, recipients of the Medal of the National Assembly.

Mr. Lemay (Masson) made a statement to pay tribute to Mrs. Josée Forest for her 35-career as a dance teacher.

Mr. Iracà (Papineau) made a statement to pay tribute to Mrs. Manon Cyr for her 45 years of volunteer service.

15 March 2017

Mrs. Ouellet (Vachon) made a statement to underline the event “Jazzfest des jeunes du Québec”.

Mr. Bolduc (Mégantic) made a statement to congratulate the Cité-école Louis-Saint-Laurent students, who participated in the activity “Un lunch presque parfait”.

Mr. Laframboise (Blainville) made a statement to underline Ms. Florence Dargis’ figure skating performance at the Québec Games.

Mr. Fortin (Sherbrooke) made a statement to underline the Estrie delegation’s participation in the Québec Games finals.

Mrs. Jean (Chicoutimi) made a statement to underline the 30th anniversary of Café-Jeunesse de Chicoutimi.

At 9.52 o’clock a.m., Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

The proceedings resumed at 10.00 o’clock a.m.

15 March 2017

Moment of reflection

Introduction of Bills

Mr. Jolin-Barrette (Borduas) moved that leave be granted to introduce the following bill:

792 An Act respecting the procedure for selecting, appointing and reappointing independent administrative decision-makers

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, Bill 792 was introduced in the Assembly.

Presenting Papers

Mr. Fournier, Government House Leader, tabled the following:

The reply to a written question from Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques) on increasing funding for independent community organizations and complying with the Government’s Policy on the Recognition and Support of Community Action – Question No. 220, *Order Paper and Notices* of 7 February 2017;
(Sessional Paper No. 3027-20170315)

The reply to a written question from Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin) on the “pink tax” phenomenon – Question No. 224, *Order Paper and Notices* of 21 February 2017.
(Sessional Paper No. 3028-20170315)

15 March 2017

Presenting Petitions

Mr. Bonnardel (Granby) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on establishing a home care service provider referral framework, signed by 286 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 3029-20170315)

Mr. Bonnardel (Granby) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on revising criteria for setting accommodation rates in residential and long-term care centres, signed by 72 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 3030-20170315)

Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on re-establishing 65 as the age of admissibility for the senior's tax credit, signed by 27,909 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 3031-20170315)

Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on increasing the solidarity tax credit to offset the rise in food prices, signed by 1,383 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 3032-20170315)

15 March 2017

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mr. Bonnardel (Granby) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on revising criteria for setting accommodation rates in residential and long-term care centres, signed by 871 citizens of Québec.
(Sessional Paper No. 3033-20170315)

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on increasing the solidarity tax credit to offset the rise in food prices, signed by 450 citizens of Québec.
(Sessional Paper No. 3034-20170315)

Oral Questions and Answers

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

Motions Without Notice

After consultation with the Opposition parties and independent Members, Mr. Couillard, Premier, moved:

THAT, in accordance with sections 1 and 2 of the *Public Protector Act* (chapter P-32), Me Marie Rinfret, Vice-Chair of the Commission des normes, de l'équité, de la santé et de la sécurité du travail, be appointed Public Protector for a five-year term, effective 27 March 2017, and that her remuneration and other conditions of employment be those contained in the document tabled herewith.

15 March 2017

Mr. Couillard, Premier, then tabled the following:

Me Marie Rinfret's resumé, her conditions of employment and an excerpt from the *Public Protector Act*.

(Sessional Paper No. 3035-20170315)

The question was put on the motion, and a recorded division was taken as required for the application of section 1 of the *Public Protector Act*.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **293** in Appendix)

Yeas: **87** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **16**

Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia), together with Mr. Bonnardel, Second Opposition Group House Leader, Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques), Mr. Surprenant (Groulx) and Mrs. Ouellet (Vachon), moved a motion on the presence of Members during government announcements in electoral divisions; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

Mr. Jolin-Barrette (Borduas), together with Mr. Surprenant (Groulx) and Mrs. Ouellet (Vachon), moved a motion on the federal-provincial government agreement on health transfers; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mrs. Vallée, Minister of Justice, together with Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), Mr. Jolin-Barrette (Borduas), Mr. Surprenant (Groulx), Mr. Sklavounos (Laurier-Dorion) and Mrs. Ouellet (Vachon), moved:

15 March 2017

THAT the National Assembly mark World Consumer Rights Day, whose theme this year, “Building a Digital World Consumers can Trust”, highlights consumers’ four basic rights: the right to safety, the right to choose, the right to information and the right to be heard;

THAT it recognize the work of consumer associations, which, for the last 50 years, have offered budget consulting services to Quebecers;

Lastly, that it recall that Québec is a leader in consumer protection, particularly with respect to online contracts.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques), together with Mr. LeBel (Rimouski), Mr. Paradis (Lévis), Mr. Surprenant (Groulx) and Mrs. Ouellet (Vachon), moved a motion on housing couples in the same residential or long-term care centre; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

Notices of Proceedings in Committees

Mr. Tanguay, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

- the Committee on Citizen Relations, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 115, An Act to combat maltreatment of seniors and other persons of full age in vulnerable situations;

15 March 2017

- the Committee on Transportation and the Environment, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 102, An Act to amend the Environment Quality Act to modernize the environmental authorization scheme and to amend other legislative provisions, in particular to reform the governance of the Green Fund;
 - the Committee on Institutions, to undertake clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 63, An Act respecting inmate identity verification through fingerprinting; and then, continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 98, An Act to amend various legislation mainly with respect to admission to professions and the governance of the professional system.
-

Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, gave the following notice:

- the Committee on Public Administration shall hold a deliberative meeting to prepare the hearing of La Financière agricole on the Sustainable Development Commissioner's spring 2015 report, entitled "La Financière agricole du Québec: Measures to Assess Effectiveness and Performance"; then, hold a public meeting to hear La Financière agricole; and finally, hold a deliberative meeting to discuss the observations, conclusions and recommendations, if any, following this hearing.
-

15 March 2017

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Government Bills

Passage in Principle

Mr. Moreau, Minister responsible for Government Administration and Ongoing Program Review and Chair of the Conseil du trésor, informed the Assembly that the Honourable J. Michel Doyon, Lieutenant-Governor of Québec, recommended Bill 126, An Act to foster the financial health and sustainability of the Pension Plan of Management Personnel and to amend various legislative provisions, for its consideration, and then moved that this bill do now pass in principle.

After debate thereon, the motion was carried on division, and Bill 126 was accordingly passed in principle.

Mr. Tanguay, Deputy Government House Leader, moved that Bill 126 be referred to the Committee on Public Finance.

The motion was carried.

At 12.22 o'clock p.m., at the request of Mr. Tanguay, Deputy Government House Leader, and by leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 20, Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 3.00 o'clock p.m.

The proceedings resumed at 3.01 o'clock p.m.

15 March 2017

Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition

Mr. Bonnardel (Granby) moved:

THAT the National Assembly acknowledge that Québec ranks lowest among Canadian provinces in terms of per capita disposable income;

THAT it recall the considerable increase in the tax burden on Québec families resulting from several years of a Liberal Government;

THAT it demand that the 2017–2018 budget contain substantial tax cuts to provide immediate relief for Québec families.

Mr. Ouimet, First Vice-President, informed the Assembly of the allocation of speaking time for the proceedings with respect to this limited debate: 10 minutes to the mover of the motion for his reply; approximately 51 minutes 30 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Government; approximately 30 minutes 30 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition; approximately 21 minutes to the Second Opposition Group; and 7 minutes to the independent Members, subject to a maximum, based on the number of Members who indicated their intention to speak, of 2 minutes each for the Member for Groulx and the Member for Vachon, and 6 minutes for the two Members of Québec solidaire. Within this framework, any time not used by the independent Members or by a parliamentary group shall be redistributed among the parliamentary groups in the proportions established above. Lastly, individual addresses shall not be limited.

A debate arose thereon.

15 March 2017

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 53, Mr. Leitão, Minister of Finance, tabled the following:

A copy of a document on taxes paid and public services received by Québec households entitled “Portrait des impôts payés et des services publics reçus par les ménages québécois”;

(Sessional Paper No. 3036-20170315)

A copy of a table on tax relief granted to Quebecers since the 2015–2016 budget entitled “Allègements fiscaux accordés aux particuliers québécois depuis le budget 2015-2016”.

(Sessional Paper No. 3037-20170315)

At the end of his address, Mr. Marceau (Rousseau) moved:

THAT the motion moved by the Member for Granby be amended as follows:

By replacing “substantial tax cuts to provide immediate relief for Québec families” in the third paragraph by “targeted measures to increase the buying power of families and the less affluent”.

The motion, as amended, would read as follows:

THAT the National Assembly acknowledge that Québec ranks lowest among Canadian provinces in terms of per capita disposable income;

THAT it recall the considerable increase in the tax burden on Québec families resulting from several years of a Liberal Government;

THAT it demand that the 2017–2018 budget contain targeted measures to increase the buying power of families and the less affluent.

The debate continued on the main motion by Mr. Bonnardel (Granby) and on the amendment moved by Mr. Marceau (Rousseau), subject to the permission of its author.

15 March 2017

At the end of her address, Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques) moved:

THAT the motion moved by the Member for Granby be amended as follows:

By replacing “substantial tax cuts” by “fairer tax measures” and inserting “middle-class” before “Québec families” in the third paragraph.

The motion, as amended, would read as follows:

THAT the National Assembly acknowledge that Québec ranks lowest among Canadian provinces in terms of per capita disposable income;

THAT it recall the considerable increase in the tax burden on Québec families resulting from several years of a Liberal Government;

THAT it demand that the 2017–2018 budget contain fairer tax measures increasing the buying power of middle-class Québec families.

The debate continued on the main motion by Mr. Bonnardel (Granby) and on the amendment motions moved by Mr. Marceau (Rousseau) and Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques), subject to the permission of its author.

Pursuant to Standing Order 98.1, Mr. Bonnardel (Granby) refused the amendments proposed by Mr. Marceau (Rousseau) and Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques).

The debate being concluded, the question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

15 March 2017

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **294** in Appendix)

Yeas: **19** Nays: **80** Abstentions: **0**

Mr. Tanguay, Deputy Government House Leader, moved the adjournment of the Assembly until Thursday, 16 March 2017 at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, at 5.15 o'clock p.m., Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Thursday, 16 March 2017 at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

JACQUES CHAGNON

President

15 March 2017

APPENDIX

Recorded Divisions

On the motion moved by Mr. Couillard, Premier:

(Division No. 293)

YEAS - 87

Arcand (<i>QLP</i>)	Fortin (<i>QLP</i>)	Leclair (<i>PQ</i>)	Poirier (<i>PQ</i>)
Auger (<i>QLP</i>)	(<i>Pontiac</i>)	Léger (<i>PQ</i>)	Proulx (<i>QLP</i>)
Barrette (<i>QLP</i>)	Fortin (<i>QLP</i>)	Leitão (<i>QLP</i>)	Reid (<i>QLP</i>)
Bérubé (<i>PQ</i>)	(<i>Sherbrooke</i>)	Lelièvre (<i>PQ</i>)	Richard (<i>PQ</i>)
Billette (<i>QLP</i>)	Fournier (<i>QLP</i>)	Lessard (<i>QLP</i>)	Rochon (<i>PQ</i>)
Birnbaum (<i>QLP</i>)	(<i>Saint-Laurent</i>)	Lisée (<i>PQ</i>)	Rotiroti (<i>QLP</i>)
Blais (<i>QLP</i>)	Fournier (<i>PQ</i>)	Maltais (<i>PQ</i>)	Roy (<i>PQ</i>)
Blanchette (<i>QLP</i>)	(<i>Marie-Victorin</i>)	Marceau (<i>PQ</i>)	(<i>Bonaventure</i>)
Bolduc (<i>QLP</i>)	Gaudreault (<i>PQ</i>)	Massé (<i>IND</i>)	Sauvé (<i>QLP</i>)
Boucher (<i>QLP</i>)	(<i>Jonquière</i>)	Matte (<i>QLP</i>)	Simard (<i>QLP</i>)
Boulet (<i>QLP</i>)	Giguère (<i>QLP</i>)	Melançon (<i>QLP</i>)	(<i>Dubuc</i>)
Bourcier (<i>PQ</i>)	Girard (<i>QLP</i>)	Ménard (<i>QLP</i>)	Simard (<i>QLP</i>)
Bourgeois (<i>QLP</i>)	Habel (<i>QLP</i>)	Merlini (<i>QLP</i>)	(<i>Charlevoix-Côte-de-Beaupré</i>)
Busque (<i>QLP</i>)	Hamad (<i>QLP</i>)	Montpetit (<i>QLP</i>)	Sklavounos (<i>IND</i>)
Carrière (<i>QLP</i>)	Hardy (<i>QLP</i>)	Moreau (<i>QLP</i>)	St-Denis (<i>QLP</i>)
Charbonneau (<i>QLP</i>)	Heurtel (<i>QLP</i>)	Morin (<i>QLP</i>)	St-Pierre (<i>QLP</i>)
Charlebois (<i>QLP</i>)	Hivon (<i>PQ</i>)	Nichols (<i>QLP</i>)	Tanguay (<i>QLP</i>)
Chevarie (<i>QLP</i>)	Huot (<i>QLP</i>)	Ouellet (<i>IND</i>)	Tremblay (<i>QLP</i>)
Cloutier (<i>PQ</i>)	Iracà (<i>QLP</i>)	(<i>Vachon</i>)	Vallée (<i>QLP</i>)
Coiteux (<i>QLP</i>)	Jean (<i>PQ</i>)	Ouellet (<i>PQ</i>)	Vien (<i>QLP</i>)
Couillard (<i>QLP</i>)	Kelley (<i>QLP</i>)	(<i>René-Lévesque</i>)	Villeneuve (<i>PQ</i>)
D'Amour (<i>QLP</i>)	Khadir (<i>IND</i>)	Ouellette (<i>QLP</i>)	Weil (<i>QLP</i>)
David (<i>QLP</i>)	Kotto (<i>PQ</i>)	Pagé (<i>PQ</i>)	
de Santis (<i>QLP</i>)	Lamarre (<i>PQ</i>)	Plante (<i>QLP</i>)	
Drolet (<i>QLP</i>)	LeBel (<i>PQ</i>)	Poëti (<i>QLP</i>)	

ABSTENTIONS - 16

Bonnardel (<i>CAQ</i>)	Lavallée (<i>CAQ</i>)	Picard (<i>CAQ</i>)	Soucy (<i>CAQ</i>)
Charette (<i>CAQ</i>)	Lefebvre (<i>CAQ</i>)	Roberge (<i>CAQ</i>)	Spénard (<i>CAQ</i>)
D'Amours (<i>CAQ</i>)	Legault (<i>CAQ</i>)	Roy (<i>CAQ</i>)	
Jolin-Barrette (<i>CAQ</i>)	Lemay (<i>CAQ</i>)	(<i>Montarville</i>)	
Laframboise (<i>CAQ</i>)	Martel (<i>CAQ</i>)	Samson (<i>CAQ</i>)	

15 March 2017

On the motion moved by Mr. Bonnardel (Granby):

(Division No. 294)

YEAS - 19

Bonnardel (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	Soucy (CAQ)
Charette (CAQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Roberge (CAQ)	Spénard (CAQ)
D'Amours (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	Roy (CAQ)	Surprenant (IND)
Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	(Montarville)	
Laframboise (CAQ)	Paradis (CAQ)	Samson (CAQ)	
Lavallée (CAQ)	(Lévis)	Schneeberger (CAQ)	

NAYS - 80

Arcand (QLP)	David (QLP)	Lamarre (PQ)	Poëti (QLP)
Auger (QLP)	de Santis (QLP)	LeBel (PQ)	Poirier (PQ)
Barrette (QLP)	Drolet (QLP)	Leclair (PQ)	Proulx (QLP)
Bergeron (PQ)	Fortin (QLP)	Léger (PQ)	Reid (QLP)
Bérubé (PQ)	(Sherbrooke)	Leitão (QLP)	Richard (PQ)
Billette (QLP)	Fortin (QLP)	Lelièvre (PQ)	Rochon (PQ)
Birnbaum (QLP)	(Pontiac)	Lessard (QLP)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Blais (QLP)	Fournier (QLP)	Lisée (PQ)	Roy (PQ)
Blanchette (QLP)	(Saint-Laurent)	Maltais (PQ)	(Bonaventure)
Bolduc (QLP)	Fournier (PQ)	Marceau (PQ)	Sauvé (QLP)
Boucher (QLP)	(Marie-Victorin)	Massé (IND)	Simard (QLP)
Boulet (QLP)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Matte (QLP)	(Dubuc)
Bourcier (PQ)	(Jonquière)	Melançon (QLP)	Simard (QLP)
Bourgeois (QLP)	Giguère (QLP)	Ménard (QLP)	(Charlevoix-Côte-de-Beaupré)
Busque (QLP)	Girard (QLP)	Merlini (QLP)	St-Denis (QLP)
Carrière (QLP)	Habel (QLP)	Montpetit (QLP)	Tanguay (QLP)
Charbonneau (QLP)	Hardy (QLP)	Morin (QLP)	Tremblay (QLP)
Charlebois (QLP)	Heurtel (QLP)	Nichols (QLP)	Vallée (QLP)
Chevarie (QLP)	Huot (QLP)	Ouellet (IND)	Villeneuve (PQ)
Cloutier (PQ)	Iracà (QLP)	(Vachon)	Weil (QLP)
Coiteux (QLP)	Jean (PQ)	Ouellette (QLP)	
Couillard (QLP)	Kelley (QLP)	Pagé (PQ)	
D'Amour (QLP)	Kotto (PQ)	Plante (QLP)	