



Votes and Proceedings
Tuesday, 24 April 2001 - No. 12

Ten o'clock
President : Mr. Jean-Pierre Charbonneau

The paper version of the Votes and Proceedings takes precedence over its electronic equivalent. The headings under the table of contents are neither all-inclusive nor restrictive.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

The Assembly was called to order at 10.07 o'clock a.m.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Business Having Precedence

Opening Speech Debate of the Session

The Assembly resumed the debate, adjourned on 12 April 2001, on the Opening Speech of the Session delivered by Mr. Landry, Premier, at the sitting of Monday, 22 March 2001, and on the want of confidence motions by Mr. Charest, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mrs. Normandeau (Bonaventure), Mr. Sirros (Laurier-Dorion), Mr. Dumont (Rivière-du-Loup), Mr. Béchard (Kamouraska-Témiscouata) and Mr. Gauthrin (Verdun).

At the end of his speech, Mr. Williams (Nelligan) moved the following want of confidence motion:

THAT the National Assembly condemn the Parti Québécois Government for its lack of foresight and its failure to act in the social programmes field, particularly in the pre-hospital emergency services and front-line intervention sector.

And debate continuing on the Opening Speech of the Session and on the want of confidence motions;

At the end of her speech, Mrs. Houda-Pepin (La Pinière) moved the following want of confidence motion:

THAT the National Assembly condemn the Parti Québécois Government and more particularly the Premier designate for his failure to act in the field of the knowledge economy of the use of information technologies as a tool in the development of a modern society.

24 April 2001

And debate continuing on the Opening Speech of the Session and on the want of confidence motions;

At 12.01 o'clock p.m., Mr. Brouillet, Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 2.00 o'clock p.m.

The proceedings resumed at 2.03 o'clock p.m.

Moment of reflection

Mr. President communicated to the Assembly and then tabled the following:

Copy of a letter, dated 17 April 2001, that the Secretary General of the National Assembly had received from the Chief Electoral Officer of Québec regarding the by-election held, on 9 April 2001, in the Electoral Division of Mercier, accompanied by a notice proclaiming Mrs. Nathalie Rochefort the candidate returned in the Electoral Division of Mercier.

(Sessional Paper No. 181-20010424)

At the invitation of Mr. President, Mr. Charest, Leader of the Official Opposition, introduced to the Assembly the new Member for Mercier, Mrs. Nathalie Rochefort. Mr. Charest, Mr. Landry, Premier, Mr. Dumont (Rivière-du-Loup) and Mrs. Rochefort (Mercier) then took the floor.

Mr. President then welcomed the new Member.

24 April 2001

ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS

Introduction of Bills

Mrs. Blanchet (Crémazie) moved that leave be granted to introduce the following Bill:

191 An Act to proclaim the Armenian Genocide Memorial Day.

The motion was carried.

Presenting Papers

Mr. Legault, Minister of State for Education and Youth, tabled the following:

The annual report of the École nationale d'administration publique, for the fiscal year ended 31 May 2000;

(Sessional Paper No. 182-20010424)

The annual report of the École des hautes études commerciales de Montréal for the fiscal year ended 31 May 2000;

(Sessional Paper No. 183-20010424)

The annual report of the École polytechnique de Montréal for the fiscal year ended 31 May 2000;

(Sessional Paper No. 184-20010424)

The annual report of the École de technologie supérieure, for the fiscal year ended 31 May 2000;

(Sessional Paper No. 185-20010424)

The annual report of the Institut national de la recherche scientifique, for the fiscal year ended 31 May 2000;

(Sessional Paper No. 186-20010424)

24 April 2001

The annual report of Télé-Université, for the fiscal year ended 31 May 2000;
(Sessional Paper No. 187-20010424)

The annual report of Bishop's University for the fiscal year ended 30 June 2000;
(Sessional Paper No. 188-20010424)

The annual report of Concordia University for the fiscal year ended 31 May 2000;
(Sessional Paper No. 189-20010424)

The annual report of Université Laval for the fiscal year ended 31 May 2000;
(Sessional Paper No. 190-20010424)

The annual report of McGill University for the fiscal year ended 31 May 2000;
(Sessional Paper No. 191-20010424)

The annual report of Université de Montréal for the fiscal year ended 31 May 2000;
(Sessional Paper No. 192-20010424)

The annual report of Université de Sherbrooke for the fiscal year ended 31 May 2000;
(Sessional Paper No. 193-20010424)

The annual report of Université du Québec, for the fiscal year ended 31 May 2000;
(Sessional Paper No. 194-20010424)

The annual report of Université du Québec en Abitibi-Témiscamingue, for the fiscal year ended 31 May 2000;
(Sessional Paper No. 195-20010424)

The annual report of Université du Québec à Chicoutimi, for the fiscal year ended 31 May 2000;
(Sessional Paper No. 196-20010424)

The annual report of Université du Québec à Hull, for the fiscal year ended 31 May 2000;
(Sessional Paper No. 197-20010424)

24 April 2001

The annual report of Université du Québec à Montréal, for the fiscal year ended 31 May 2000;

(Sessional Paper No. 198-20010424)

The annual report of Université du Québec à Rimouski, for the fiscal year ended 31 May 2000;

(Sessional Paper No. 199-20010424)

The annual report of Université du Québec à Trois-Rivières, for the fiscal year ended 31 May 2000.

(Sessional Paper No. 200-20010424)

Mrs. Goupil, Minister of State for Child and Family Welfare, tabled the following:

The Strategic Plan, 2001-2004, of the Conseil des aînés.

(Sessional Paper No. 201-20010424)

Mr. Chagnon (Westmount–Saint-Louis) Mr. Paradis, Official Opposition House Leader, and Mr. Dupuis (Saint-Laurent) commented on the transmission delay, by the Ministries, of documents concerning the consideration of the estimates.

Mr. President stated that it was not for him to decide what constitutes reasonable delay. He indicated that the Standing Orders of the National Assembly do not give any information regarding this matter, the Government being under no obligation to provide these documents. He further noted that it is up to the Members of the Assembly to establish the rules of procedure and, therefore, if need be, to eventually provide for the appropriate details. Finally, he stated that the consideration of such issue could take place in the appropriate forum, namely the Sub-Committee on Parliamentary Reform.

Mr. Beaulne (Marguerite-D'Youville), deputy chairman of the Québec section of the Parliamentary Conference of the Americas, tabled the following:

24 April 2001

The Parliamentary Declaration of Québec made during the meeting of the executive committee of the Parliamentary Conference of the Americas held on 18 and 19 April 2001.

(Sessional Paper No. 202-20010424)

Copy of a letter, dated 19 April 2001, addressed to the heads of State and Government of the Americas, concerning the resolution adopted by the Parliamentary Conference of the Americas on 19 April 2001.

(Sessional Paper No. 203-20010424)

Mrs. Leduc (Mille-Îles), chairman of the Network of Women Parliamentarians of the Americas, tabled the following:

The Declaration, by the executive committee of the Network of Women Parliamentarians of the Americas, on the effects of the Free Trade Area of the Americas and hemispheric integration on the life of women.

(Sessional Paper No. 204-20010424)

Finally, Mr. President tabled the following:

The new seating plan of the National Assembly, dated 24 April 2001.

(Sessional Paper No. 205-20010424)

Oral Questions and Answers

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 53, Mrs. Harel, Minister of State for Municipal Affairs and Greater Montréal, tabled the following:

24 April 2001

An information note, dated 5 April 2001, concerning the Programme de départs volontaires for the new City of Montreal, with an assessment of the potential costs and savings in the medium term.

(Sessional Paper No. 206-20010424)

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 59, Mr. Dupuis (Saint-Laurent) tabled the following:

Copy of Order-in-Council No. 659-98 of the Government of Québec, dated 13 May 1998, concerning the appointment of the Mr. Serge Barbeau as member and vice-chairman of the Commission québécoise des libérations conditionnelles, accompanied by a document indicating the conditions of employment of Mr. Barbeau.

(Sessional Paper No. 207-20010424)

Copy of an agreement, dated 21 May 1998, reached between the Commission québécoise des libérations conditionnelles and Mr. Serge Barbeau.

(Sessional Paper No. 208-20010424)

Deferred Divisions

The Assembly took the divisions, which had been deferred at the sitting of 12 April 2001, on the want of confidence motions moved during the debate on Budget Speech and on the motion by Mrs. Marois, Minister of State for the Economy and Finance, –That the Assembly approves in general the budgetary policy of the Government.

Firstly, the question was put on the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Charest, Leader of the Official Opposition. This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly condemn the Parti Québécois Government for having presented a budget that indicates an obvious lack of transparency in the management of public funds and that causes Québec taxpayers to unfortunately remain the most highly-taxed citizens in North America.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

24 April 2001

(Division No. 3 in Appendix)

Yeas: **39** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

Secondly, the question was put on the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Williams (Nelligan). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly condemn the Parti Québécois Government, who has neglected and overlooked the entire social services sector in its 2001-2002 Budget, particularly with regard to youth protection, the disabled and front-line services.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. 4 in Appendix)

Yeas: **39** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

The question was then put on the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Marsan (Robert-Baldwin). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly condemn the Parti Québécois Government for its 2001-2002 Budget and Estimates for the ministries and agencies, which maintains the financial burden of taxpayers at a level that continues to make them the highest tax-paying citizens in North America, which maintains hospitals in unacceptable cutback situations regarding the sick and the elderly, which has not kept its word with regard to the poor and community organizations devoted to fighting poverty, which ignores the regions of Québec and their development, and, finally, which sets aside reserves for purely electoral purposes.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. 5 in Appendix)

Yeas: **39** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

24 April 2001

The question was put on the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Gauthrin (Verdun). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly condemn the Parti Québécois Government for its lack of transparency and its lack of foresight in the field of research and science.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. 6 in Appendix)

Yeas: **39** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

The question was then put on the want of confidence motion moved by Mrs. Houde-Pepin (La Pinière). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly condemn the Parti Québécois Government, which, in its Budget, missed the opportunity to introduce a global economic strategy that takes into account the new economy within the context of globalization.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. 7 in Appendix)

Yeas: **39** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

The question was then put on the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Dumont (Rivière-du-Loup). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly condemn the Parti Québécois Government for its budget policy, which does not provide for an amortization plan with regard to the debt inherited from the Liberal and Parti Québécois Governments of the past thirty years.

24 April 2001

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. 8 in Appendix)

Yeas: **1** Nays: **99** Abstentions: **0**

Finally, the question was put on the motion by Mrs. Marois, Minister of State for the Economy and Finance, –That the Assembly approves in general the budgetary policy of the Government.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 9 in Appendix)

Yeas: **61** Nays: **39** Abstentions: **0**

Motions Without Notice

Mr. Bordeleau (Acadie) moved:

THAT, on the occasion of the 86th anniversary of the Armenian genocide that took place on 24 April 1915, the National Assembly commemorate this painful event, in respect of the memory of those who died, by extending our deepest sympathy and compassion to the Armenian community of Québec.

By leave of the Assembly under Standing Order 84, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

At the invitation of Mr. President, the Assembly then observed a minute of silence.

24 April 2001

Mrs. Beauchamp (Sauvé) moved:

THAT the National Assembly of Québec pay tribute to Mrs. Françoise Labbé, an artist who shall have made an outstanding contribution to visual arts in Québec and more particularly in her home region of Charlevoix.

By leave of the Assembly under Standing Order 84, the motion was carried.

Notices of Proceedings in Committees

Mr. Brassard, Government House Leader, convened the following Committees for the consideration of the Estimates of Expenditure:

- X the Committee on Education, for those of the Ministère de l'Éducation;
- X the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain, for those of the Ministère des Affaires municipales et de la Métropole;
- X the Committee on Culture, for those of the Ministère de la Culture et des Communications;
- X the Committee on Labour and the Economy, for those of the Ministère de l'Industrie et du Commerce and for those granted to Tourism, Recreation and Sport;
- X the Committee on Institutions, for those of the Ministère des Affaires intergouvernementales canadiennes and for those granted to Youth;
- X the Committee on Social Affairs, for those of the Ministère de la Santé et des Services sociaux.

Mr. Paradis, Official Opposition House Leader, raised a point of order in which he stated that, in view of the fact that, according to the Standing Orders, the debate on the opening speech of the session is a matter having precedence, it must be concluded before entering upon the consideration of the budgetary estimates. He stated that, following the meeting with the House leaders convened by the President under Standing Order 285 in order to specify how the consideration of the budgetary estimates was to be proceeded with and following the tabling of the calendar resulting from this meeting, the question was never put to the National Assembly with regard to this calendar in order to make it an order of the Assembly.

24 April 2001

Mr. President took the question under advisement and, for this purpose, suspended the proceedings during pleasure.

After a suspension of twenty-eight minutes, the sitting resumed.

Mr. President ruled as follows on the point of order raised by Mr. Paradis, Leader of the Official Opposition, seeking to know whether the Assembly was required to finish the debate on the opening speech of the session before the committees undertook the consideration of the budgetary estimates, in view of the fact that business relating to the opening speech was a matter having precedence.

RULING FROM THE CHAIR

It is during a meeting convened in pursuance of Standing Order 285 that the House leaders arrived at an understanding under which the consideration of the budgetary estimates was to begin today. This agreement is not an order of the Assembly but rather an agreement that may be further clarified if need be, as provided in accordance with the mechanism envisaged in Standing Order 285. The notice given by the Government House Leader in pursuance of Standing Order 147 initiates the procedure for the consideration of estimates in committee. Consequently, the last paragraph of Standing Order 282 must therefore be applied, and the Assembly may take only the Routine Proceedings. The inability of the Assembly to enter upon the Orders of the Day consequently precludes the holding of any of the debates otherwise envisaged at that stage of the proceedings, that is to say the debate on the opening speech of the session and debates upon adjournment.

Mr. President then heard additional remarks, after which he convened the House leaders for a meeting in order to clarify the calendar established for the consideration of the budgetary estimates at the meeting of April 12 last; and for that purpose he once again suspended the proceedings during pleasure.

24 April 2001

After a suspension of eighteen minutes, the sitting resumed.

Mr. President reiterated the ruling he had given previously.

At 6.00 o'clock p.m., Mr. President adjourned the Assembly until Wednesday, 25 April 2001, at 2.00 o'clock p.m.

JEAN-PIERRE CHARBONNEAU

President

24 April 2001

APPENDIX

Recorded Divisions

On the want of confidence motion by Mr. Charest, Leader of the Official Opposition:

(Division No. 3)

YEAS - 39

Beauchamp	Copeman	Gobé	Marsan
Bélanger	Cusano	Houda-Pepin	Middlemiss
Benoit	Delisle	Jérôme-Forget	Mulcair
Bergman	Després	Kelley	Ouimet
Bordeleau	Dumont	Lamoureux	Paradis
Chagnon	Dupuis	Lamquin-Éthier	Poulin
Charest	Fournier	Laporte	Rochefort
(<i>Sherbrooke</i>)	Gagnon-Tremblay	Loiselle	Sirros
Chenail	Gautrin	MacMillan	Tranchemontagne
Cholette	Gauvin	Marcoux	Williams

NAYS - 61

Arseneau	Boulerice	Gagnon	Papineau
Barbeau	Boulianne	Geoffrion	Paquin
Baril	Brassard	Goupil	Paré
(<i>Berthier</i>)	Caron	Harel	Payne
Baril	Carrier-Perreault	Julien	Pelletier
(<i>Arthabaska</i>)	Charest	Kieffer	(<i>Abitibi-Est</i>)
Beaulne	(<i>Rimouski</i>)	Labbé	Rioux
Beaumier	Cliche	Landry	Robert
Bédard	Côté	Laprise	Rochon
Bégin	(<i>La Peltrie</i>)	Leduc	Simard
Bergeron	Cousineau	Legault	(<i>Richelieu</i>)
Bertrand	Désilets	Léger	Simard
(<i>Charlevoix</i>)	Deslières	Lelièvre	(<i>Montmorency</i>)
Bertrand	Dion	Lemieux	St-André
(<i>Portneuf</i>)	Dionne-Marsolais	Létourneau	Trudel
Blanchet	Doyer	Maltais	Vermette
Boisclair	Duguay	Ménard	
Boucher	Facal	Morin	

24 April 2001

On the want of confidence motion by Mr. Williams (Nelligan):

(Division No. 4)

(Identical to Division No. 3)

On the want of confidence motion by Mr. Marsan (Robert-Baldwin):

(Division No. 5)

(Identical to Division No. 3)

On the want of confidence motion by Mr. Gauthier (Verdun):

(Division No. 6)

(Identical to Division No. 3)

On the want of confidence motion by Mrs. Houde-Pepin (La Pinière):

(Division No. 7)

(Identical to Division No. 3)

24 April 2001

On the want of confidence motion by Mr. Dumont (Rivière-du-Loup):

(Division No. 8)

YEAS - 1

Dumont

NAYS - 99

Arseneau	Chagnon	Geoffrion	Morin
Barbeau	Charest	Gobé	Mulcair
Baril	<i>(Rimouski)</i>	Goupil	Ouimet
<i>(Berthier)</i>	Charest	Harel	Papineau
Baril	<i>(Sherbrooke)</i>	Houda-Pepin	Paquin
<i>(Arthabaska)</i>	Chenail	Jérôme-Forget	Paradis
Beauchamp	Cholette	Julien	Paré
Beaulne	Cliche	Kelley	Payne
Beaumier	Copeman	Kieffer	Pelletier
Bédard	Côté	Labbé	<i>(Abitibi-Est)</i>
Bégin	<i>(La Peltrie)</i>	Lamoureux	Poulin
Bélanger	Cousineau	Lamquin-Éthier	Rioux
Benoit	Cusano	Landry	Robert
Bergeron	Delisle	Laporte	Rocheffort
Bergman	Désilets	Laprise	Rochon
Bertrand	Deslières	Leduc	Simard
<i>(Charlevoix)</i>	Després	Legault	<i>(Richelieu)</i>
Bertrand	Dion	Léger	Simard
<i>(Portneuf)</i>	Dionne-Marsolais	Lelièvre	<i>(Montmorency)</i>
Blanchet	Doyer	Lemieux	Sirros
Boisclair	Duguay	Létourneau	St-André
Bordeleau	Dupuis	Loiselle	Tranchemontagne
Boucher	Facal	MacMillan	Trudel
Boulerice	Fournier	Maltais	Vermette
Boulianne	Gagnon	Marcoux	Williams
Brassard	Gagnon-Tremblay	Marsan	
Caron	Gautrin	Ménard	
Carrier-Perreault	Gauvin	Middlemiss	

24 April 2001

On the motion by Mrs. Marois, Minister of State for the Economy and Finance,
—That the Assembly approves in general the budgetary policy of the Government:

(Division No. 9)

YEAS - 61

Arseneau	Boulerice	Gagnon	Papineau
Barbeau	Boulianne	Geoffrion	Paquin
Baril	Brassard	Goupil	Paré
<i>(Berthier)</i>	Caron	Harel	Payne
Baril	Carrier-Perreault	Julien	Pelletier
<i>(Arthabaska)</i>	Charest	Kieffer	<i>(Abitibi-Est)</i>
Beaulne	<i>(Rimouski)</i>	Labbé	Rioux
Beaumier	Cliche	Landry	Robert
Bédard	Côté	Laprise	Rochon
Bégin	<i>(La Peltrie)</i>	Leduc	Simard
Bergeron	Cousineau	Legault	<i>(Richelieu)</i>
Bertrand	Désilets	Léger	Simard
<i>(Charlevoix)</i>	Deslières	Lelièvre	<i>(Montmorency)</i>
Bertrand	Dion	Lemieux	St-André
<i>(Portneuf)</i>	Dionne-Marsolais	Létourneau	Trudel
Blanchet	Doyer	Maltais	Vermette
Boisclair	Duguay	Ménard	
Boucher	Facal	Morin	

NAYS - 39

Beauchamp	Copeman	Gobé	Marsan
Bélanger	Cusano	Houda-Pepin	Middlemiss
Benoit	Delisle	Jérôme-Forget	Mulcair
Bergman	Després	Kelley	Ouimet
Bordeleau	Dumont	Lamoureux	Paradis
Chagnon	Dupuis	Lamquin-Éthier	Poulin
Charest	Fournier	Laporte	Rocheport
<i>(Sherbrooke)</i>	Gagnon-Tremblay	Loiselle	Sirros
Chenail	Gautrin	MacMillan	Tranchemontagne
Cholette	Gauvin	Marcoux	Williams