

Votes and Proceedings

of the Assembly

Tuesday, 17 April 2018 — No. 327

President of the National Assembly: Mr. Jacques Chagnon

QUÉBEC

The Assembly was called to order at 1.40 o'clock p.m.

ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS

Statements by Members

Mrs. Simard (Charlevoix–Côte-de-Beaupré) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Charles Warren, founder of the newspaper Le Charlevoisien.

Mr. Leclair (Beauharnois) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Dominic Larocque, sledge hockey silver medalist at the PyeongChang Paralympic Games.

Mr. Chevarie (Îles-de-la-Madeleine) made a statement to underline World Hemophilia Day.

Mr. Roberge (Chambly) made a statement to congratulate the organizers of Karaté Don, a fundraiser for POSA – Source des Monts' program "J'ai faim à tous les jours".

Mrs. Tremblay (Chauveau) made a statement to pay tribute to Mrs. Claudette C. Pelletier and Mr. Georges Delisle for their volunteer work and community involvement.

Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques) made a statement to underline the 30th anniversary of the École nationale de l'humour.

Mrs. David (Outremont) made a statement to underline the 35th anniversary of the Côte-des-Neiges Volunteer Center.

Mrs. D'Amours (Mirabel) made a statement to underline the 10th anniversary of the organization Route des Gerbes d'Angelica.

Mrs. Vallée (Gatineau) made a statement to underline the 45th anniversary of Maniwaki's Club de l'Âge d'Or L'Assomption.

Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) made a statement to congratulate weightlifter Ms. Maude Charron, gold medalist at the Commonwealth Games.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 54.1 and 54.3, Mr. Ouellet (René-Lévesque) made a statement to pay tribute to Mrs. Béatrice Thibault Maltais, former Mayor of Sault-au-Mouton and first woman warden of a regional county municipality.

At 1.53 o'clock p.m., Mrs. Gaudreault, Second Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

The proceedings resumed at 2.02 o'clock p.m.

At the request of the President, the Assembly observed a moment of silence in memory of Mr. Jean-Guy Trépanier, former Member for Saint-Maurice.

The President tabled the following:

A letter, dated 17 April 2018, he had received from Mrs. Filomena Rotiroti, Member for Jeanne-Mance–Viger and Chair of the Government Caucus, informing him that Mr. Yves St-Denis, Member for Argenteuil, is no longer a member of the Government Caucus.

(Sessional Paper No. 4252-20180417)

Presenting Papers

Mr. Leitão, Minister of Finance, tabled the following:

The 2017 annual report of the Caisse de dépôt et placement du Québec, accompanied by supplementary information.

(Sessional Paper No. 4253-20180417)

Mr. Coiteux, Minister of Public Security, tabled the following:

The supplementary agreement amending the agreement on the provision of policing services in the community of Akwesasne, for the period from 1 April 2015 to 31 March 2018 (French and English versions).

(Sessional Paper No. 4254-20180417)

The President tabled the following:

The 2018–2022 strategic plan of the Québec Lobbyists Commissioner; (Sessional Paper No. 4255-20180417) A copy of the notice of motion by Mrs. Poirier (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve) to be placed on the *Order Paper and Notices* of Wednesday, 18 April 2018 under Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition.

(Sessional Paper No. 4256-20180417)

Presenting Reports from Committees

Mrs. de Santis (Bourassa-Sauvé), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Culture and Education, which met on 12 April 2018 to examine the draft Homeschooling Regulation.

(Sessional Paper No. 4257-20180417)

Mr. Reid (Orford), Committee Vice-Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Labour and the Economy, which held public hearings on 10, 11 and 12 April 2018 within the framework of special consultations on Bill 173, An Act mainly to introduce a basic income for persons with a severely limited capacity for employment.

(Sessional Paper No. 4258-20180417)

Mr. Bernier (Montmorency), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Public Finance, which held public hearings on 10 April 2018 within the framework of special consultations on Bill 171, An Act to enact the Act respecting the implementation of the Canadian Free Trade Agreement and to bring measures relating to contracting by public bodies into compliance with that agreement, the Trade and Cooperation Agreement between Ontario and Québec and the Comprehensive Economic and Trade Agreement between Canada and the European Union and its Member States;

(Sessional Paper No. 4259-20180417)

The report from the Committee on Public Finance, which met on 11, 12 and 13 April 2018 to continue the debate on the Budget Speech in accordance with the provisions of Standing Order 275.

(Sessional Paper No. 4260-20180417)

Oral Questions and Answers

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

Motions Without Notice

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Blais, Minister of Employment and Social Solidarity, together with Mr. LeBel (Rimouski), Mr. Schneeberger (Drummond–Bois-Francs), Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques), Mr. Lelièvre (Gaspé), Mr. Surprenant (Groulx) and Mr. Sklavounos (Laurier-Dorion), moved:

THAT the National Assembly mark Volunteer Week, held this year from April 15 to 21;

THAT it congratulate all winners of the 21st edition of the "Hommage bénévolat-Québec" awards, which recognize the outstanding contributions of volunteers and organizations from all Québec regions.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

Mrs. Hivon (Joliette), together with Mr. Jolin-Barrette (Borduas), Mr. Nadeau-Dubois (Gouin) and Mr. Surprenant (Groulx), moved a motion on parliamentarians' right to work in their own language during the legislative process; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent. Mrs. Roy (Montarville), together with Mr. Surprenant (Groulx), moved a motion on asylum seekers; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques) moved a motion on the application of provincial legislation to all projects, including interprovincial pipeline projects; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

Pursuant to Standing Order 129, Mrs. Ménard, Chief Government Whip, moved:

THAT the Member for Saint-François be named a permanent member of the Committee on Labour and the Economy;

THAT the Member for Abitibi-Est be named a permanent member of the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain;

THAT the Member for Vaudreuil be named a permanent member of the Committee on Health and Social Services;

THAT these changes take effect immediately.

The motion was carried.

Notices of Proceedings in Committees

Mr. Tanguay, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

 the Committee on Institutions, to continue and conclude its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 170, An Act to modernize the legal regime applicable to liquor permits and to amend various other legislative provisions with regard to alcoholic beverages;

- the Committee on Labour and the Economy, to continue its clause-byclause consideration of Bill 152, An Act to amend various labour-related legislative provisions mainly to give effect to certain Charbonneau Commission recommendations;
- the Committee on Health and Social Services, to continue its clause-byclause consideration of Bill 157, An Act to constitute the Société québécoise du cannabis, to enact the Cannabis Regulation Act and to amend various highway safety-related provisions;
- the Committee on Public Finance, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 141, An Act mainly to improve the regulation of the financial sector, the protection of deposits of money and the operation of financial institutions.

Information on the Proceedings of the Assembly

Mrs. Gaudreault, Second Vice-President, informed the Assembly that on Wednesday, 18 April 2018, during Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition, a debate would be held on the motion moved by Mrs. Poirier (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve).

This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly affirm its support:

For supply management;

For childcare centres;

For labour-sponsored funds;

For existing parental leave programs;

For maintaining Hydro-Québec and the Société des alcools du Québec as government corporations;

For the public nature of the health network;

For the Green Fund;

THAT it affirm its support for a Québec State serving the common good;

THAT it recall that a generous basket of public services reduces inequality, enhances equal opportunity, accelerates economic growth and is, in general, less costly than the services offered by the private sector.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Business Having Precedence

Debate on the Budget Speech

The Assembly resumed the debate, which had been adjourned on 11 April 2018, on the motion moved by Mr. Leitão, Minister of Finance, that the Assembly approve the Government's budgetary policy and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Marceau (Rousseau), Mr. Bonnardel (Granby), Mr. Ouellet (René-Lévesque), Mr. Caire (La Peltrie), Mrs. Jean (Chicoutimi), Mr. Bourcier (Saint-Jérôme), Mr. Villeneuve (Berthier), Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques), Mrs. Léger (Pointe-aux-Trembles), Mr. Paradis (Lévis), Mr. Nadeau-Dubois (Gouin), Mr. Roberge (Chambly), Mr. Turcotte (Saint-Jean), Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière), Mr. Lemay (Masson), Mrs. Lamarre (Taillon) and Mrs. Hivon (Joliette), subject to the receivability of these motions.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 276, Mr. Bonnardel (Granby) commented on behalf of the Second Opposition Group.

The debate being concluded, Mrs. Gaudreault, Second Vice-President, declared that the motions stating a grievance were receivable, except the motion moved by Mr. Caire (La Peltrie), with respect to which he ruled the following:

RULING FROM THE CHAIR

The motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Caire (La Peltrie) within the framework of the Budget Speech is not receivable on the grounds that it contains certain words deemed unparliamentary.

Mrs. Gaudreault, Second Vice-President, then proceeded to put the question on the motions stating a grievance moved during the debate.

First, the question was put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Marceau (Rousseau). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for having presented a completely irresponsible pre-electoral budget.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **441** in Appendix)

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Bonnardel (Granby). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for its pre-electoral budgetary policy designed to artificially inflate the expenditures resulting from the increased tax burden on Québec families since beginning its term of office in 2014.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 442 in Appendix)

Yeas: 44 Nays: 58 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Ouellet (René-Lévesque). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for having presented a budget that consolidates Air Canada's monopoly, that favours the high cost of airfares in the regions and that penalizes citizens who want to travel throughout Québec at a reasonable price.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 443 in Appendix)

Yeas: 44 Nays: 58 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Jean (Chicoutimi). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for having presented a pre-electoral budget funded by using a stabilization reserve accounting entry to avoid having to post a deficit.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **444** in Appendix)

Yeas: 44 Nays: 58 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Bourcier (Saint-Jérôme). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for having presented a budget that contains no measures to improve electric fast-charging infrastructures.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 445 in Appendix)

Yeas: 44 Nays: 58 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Villeneuve (Berthier). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for having presented a budget that ignores the next generation of Québec farmers.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 446 in Appendix)

Yeas: 44 Nays: 58 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly censure the Liberal Government for its 2018–2019 budget, which perpetuates the unfair tax treatment of Québec businesses compared to digital platforms based abroad as concerns collection of the Québec sales tax.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 447 in Appendix)

Yeas: 44 Nays: 58 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Léger (Pointe-aux-Trembles). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for presenting a budget that will bring about a return to austerity after the general election.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 448 in Appendix)

Yeas: 44 Nays: 58 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Paradis (Lévis). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for underinvesting in health, thereby cutting direct services to persons who are vulnerable, for the alarming state of hospital buildings, long-term senior care facilities and youth centres, and for paying unjustified salary increases to medical specialists while more important needs are not being met.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 449 in Appendix)

Yeas: 44 Nays: 58 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Nadeau-Dubois (Gouin). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly censure the Liberal Government for its 2018–2019 budget which, as a result of the tax reductions granted since the beginning of this Legislature, has deprived public finances of over \$3.5 billion per year.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 450 in Appendix)

Yeas: 26 Nays: 76 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Roberge (Chambly). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for underinvesting in education, thereby cutting direct services to students, and for the alarmingly decrepit state of Québec schools.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **451** in Appendix)

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Turcotte (Saint-Jean). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for presenting a budget that leaves out persons with special needs.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 452 in Appendix)

Yeas: 44 Nays: 58 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for presenting a budget that does not make up for cuts made to environment spending since 2014.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 453 in Appendix)

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Lemay (Masson). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for its inaction in the Centre hospitalier Pierre-Le Gardeur expansion file, which has been stuck at the Québec infrastructure plan (PQI) planning stage since 2014.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **454** in Appendix)

Yeas: 44 Nays: 58 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Lamarre (Taillon). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for presenting a budget that neglects those who are most vulnerable and jeopardizes equal opportunity.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 455 in Appendix)

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Hivon (Joliette). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal Government for presenting a budget that favours private, commercial, for-profit daycare centres to the detriment of early childcare centres.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 456 in Appendix)

Yeas: 26 Nays: 76 Abstentions: 0

Finally, the question was put on the motion moved by Mr. Leitão, Minister of Finance, that the Assembly approve the Government's budgetary policy.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 457 in Appendix)

Yeas: 58 Nays: 44 Abstentions: 0

Government Bills

Passage

Mr. Fortin, Minister of Transport, Sustainable Mobility and Transport Electrification, moved the passage of Bill 165, An Act to amend the Highway Safety Code and other provisions.

A debate arose thereon.

During the debate, Mr. Fortin, Minister of Transport, Sustainable Mobility and Transport Electrification, moved that Bill 165 be referred to a Committee of the Whole for consideration of two amendments that he specified.

The motion was carried.

Mr. Tanguay, Deputy Government House Leader, moved that the Assembly resolve itself into a Committee of the Whole.

The motion was carried.

Committee of the Whole

The amendments to Bill 165 proposed by Mr. Fortin, Minister of Transport, Sustainable Mobility and Transport Electrification, were considered in Committee of the Whole.

The amendments were carried.

Bill 165, as amended, was reported to the Assembly, which concurred in the report of the Committee of the Whole.

The debate continued on the motion for the passage of Bill 165.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried and, accordingly, Bill 165 was passed.

At 5.29 o'clock p.m., at the request of Mr. Tanguay, Deputy Government House Leader, Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 6.00 o'clock p.m.

Debates upon Adjournment

At 6.00 o'clock p.m., the Assembly held a debate upon adjournment on a question from Mr. Therrien (Sanguinet) to Mr. Leitão, Minister of Finance, about Réseau express métropolitain costs. Mr. Fortin, Minister of Transport, Sustainable Mobility and Transport Electrification, replaced the Minister for this debate.

Mr. Fortin, Minister of Transport, Sustainable Mobility and Transport Electrification, moved the adjournment of the Assembly until Wednesday, 18 April 2018 at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, at 6.13 o'clock p.m., Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Wednesday, 18 April 2018 at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

JACQUES CHAGNON

President

APPENDIX

Recorded Divisions

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Marceau (Rousseau):

(Division No. 441)

YEAS - 44

Bergeron (PQ) Bonnardel (CAQ) Bourcier (PQ) Caire (CAQ) Charette (CAQ) D'Amours (CAQ) Fournier (PQ) (Marie-Victorin) Gaudreault (PQ) (Jonquière) Guilbault (CAQ) Hivon (PQ) Jean (PQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ) Khadir (IND) Kotto (PQ) Lamarre (PQ) LeBel (PQ) Leclair (PQ) Lefebvre (CAQ) Legault (CAQ) Léger (PQ) Lelièvre (IND) Lemay (CAQ) Lisée (PQ) Maltais (PQ)	Marceau (PQ) Martel (CAQ) Massé (IND) Nadeau-Dubois (IND) Ouellet (PQ) (René-Lévesque) Pagé (PQ) Paradis (CAQ) (Lévis) Picard (CAQ) Poirier (PQ) Roberge (CAQ) Rochon (PQ)	Roy (PQ) (Bonaventure) Roy (CAQ) (Montarville) Schneeberger (CAQ) Soucy (CAQ) Spénard (CAQ) Surprenant (IND) Therrien (PQ) Traversy (PQ) Villeneuve (PQ)		
Jean(IQ)	Waitais $(I Q)$	Kocholi $(I Q)$			
NAYS - 58					
Anglade (QLP)	Couillard (QLP)	Leitão (QLP)	Sauvé (QLP)		
Arcand (QLP)	D'Amour (QLP)	Lessard (QLP)	Simard (<i>QLP</i>)		
Auger (QLP)	David (<i>QLP</i>)	Matte (QLP)	(Dubuc)		
Barrette (QLP)	de Santis (QLP)	Melançon (QLP)	Simard (<i>QLP</i>)		
Bernier (QLP)	Drolet (QLP)	Ménard (QLP)	(Charlevoix–Côte-de- Beaupré)		
Billette (QLP)	Fortin (QLP)	Merlini (QLP)	Tanguay (QLP)		
Birnbaum (QLP)	(Sherbrooke)	Montpetit (QLP)	Thériault (QLP)		
Blanchette (QLP)	Fortin (QLP)	Moreau (QLP)	Tremblay (QLP)		
Boucher (QLP)	(Pontiac)	Nichols (<i>QLP</i>)	Vallée (QLP)		
Boulet (QLP)	Giguère (QLP)	Ouellette (QLP)	Vien (QLP)		
Bourgeois (QLP)	Girard (QLP)	Plante (QLP)	Weil (QLP)		
Busque (QLP)	Habel (QLP)	Poëti (QLP)			
Carrière (QLP)	Hardy (QLP)	Polo (QLP)			
Charbonneau (QLP)	Heurtel (QLP)	Proulx (QLP)			
Charlebois (QLP)	Huot (QLP)	Reid (QLP)			
Chevarie (QLP)	Iracà (QLP)	Rotiroti (QLP)			
Coiteux (QLP)	Kelley (<i>QLP</i>)	Rousselle (QLP)			

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Bonnardel (Granby):

(Division No. 442)

(Identical to Division No. 441)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Ouellet (René-Lévesque):

(Division No. 443)

(Identical to Division No. 441)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Jean (Chicoutimi):

(Division No. 444)

(Identical to Division No. 441)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Bourcier (Saint-Jérôme):

(Division No. 445)

(Identical to Division No. 441)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Villeneuve (Berthier):

(Division No. 446)

(Identical to Division No. 441)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie-Saint-Jacques):

(Division No. 447)

(Identical to Division No. 441)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Léger (Pointe-aux-Trembles):

(Division No. 448)

(Identical to Division No. 441)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Paradis (Lévis):

(Division No. 449)

(Identical to Division No. 441)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Nadeau-Dubois (Gouin):

(Division No. 450)

YEAS - 26						
Bergeron (PQ)	Kotto (PQ)	Massé (IND)	Therrien (PQ)			
Bourcier (PQ)	Lamarre (PQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (IND)	Traversy (PQ)			
Fournier (PQ)	LeBel (PQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	Villeneuve (PQ)			
(Marie-Victorin)	Leclair (PQ)	(René-Lévesque)				
Gaudreault (PQ)	Léger (PQ)	Pagé (PQ)				
(Jonquière)	Lelièvre (IND)	Poirier (PQ)				
Hivon (PQ)	Lisée (PQ)	Rochon (PQ)				
Jean (PQ)	Maltais (PQ)	Roy (PQ)				
Khadir (IND)	Marceau (PQ)	(Bonaventure)				
NAYS - 76						
Anglade (QLP)	D'Amour (QLP)	Leitão (QLP)	Rotiroti (QLP)			
Arcand (QLP)	D'Amours (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	Rousselle (QLP)			
Auger (QLP)	David (<i>QLP</i>)	Lessard (QLP)	Roy (CAQ)			
Barrette (QLP)	de Santis (QLP)	Martel (CAQ)	(Montarville)			
Bernier (QLP)	Drolet (QLP)	Matte (QLP)	Sauvé (QLP)			
Billette (<i>QLP</i>)	Fortin (QLP)	Melançon (QLP)	Schneeberger (CAQ)			
Birnbaum (QLP)	(Pontiac)	Ménard (QLP)	Simard (QLP)			
Blanchette (QLP)	Fortin (QLP)	Merlini (QLP)	(Charlevoix–Côte-de-			
			Beaupré)			
Bonnardel (CAQ)	(Sherbrooke)	Montpetit (QLP)	Simard (QLP)			
Boucher (QLP)	Giguère (QLP)	Moreau (QLP)	(Dubuc)			
Boulet (QLP)	Girard (QLP)	Nichols (QLP)	Soucy (CAQ)			
Bourgeois (QLP)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Ouellette (<i>QLP</i>)	Spénard (CAQ)			
Busque (QLP)	Habel (QLP)	Paradis (CAQ)	Surprenant (IND)			
Caire (CAQ)	Hardy (QLP)	(Lévis)	Tanguay (QLP)			
Carrière (QLP)	Heurtel (QLP)	Picard (CAQ)	Thériault (QLP)			
Charbonneau (QLP)	Huot (<i>QLP</i>)	Plante (QLP)	Tremblay (QLP)			
Charette (CAQ)	Iracà (QLP)	Poëti (QLP)	Vallée (QLP)			
Charlebois (QLP)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Polo (<i>QLP</i>)	Vien (QLP)			
Chevarie (QLP)	Kelley (QLP)	Proulx (QLP)	Weil (QLP)			
Coiteux (QLP)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Reid (QLP)				
Couillard (QLP)	Legault (CAQ)	Roberge (CAQ)				

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Roberge (Chambly):

(Division No. 451)

(Identical to Division No. 441)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Turcotte (Saint-Jean):

(Division No. 452)

(Identical to Division No. 441)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière):

(Division No. 453)

(Identical to Division No. 441)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Lemay (Masson):

(Division No. 454)

(Identical to Division No. 441)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Lamarre (Taillon):

(Division No. 455)

(Identical to Division No. 441)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Hivon (Joliette):

(Division No. 456)

(Identical to Division No. 450)

On the motion moved by Mr. Leitão, Minister of Finance:

(Division No. 457)

YEAS - 58						
Anglade (QLP)	Couillard (QLP)	Leitão (QLP)	Sauvé (QLP)			
Arcand (QLP)	D'Amour (QLP)	Lessard (QLP)	Simard (QLP)			
Auger (QLP)	David (QLP)	Matte (QLP)	(Dubuc)			
Barrette (QLP)	de Santis (QLP)	Melançon (QLP)	Simard (QLP)			
Bernier (QLP)	Drolet (QLP)	Ménard (QLP)	(Charlevoix–Côte-de-			
			Beaupré)			
Billette (<i>QLP</i>)	Fortin (QLP)	Merlini (QLP)	Tanguay (QLP)			
Birnbaum (QLP)	(Sherbrooke)	Montpetit (QLP)	Thériault (QLP)			
Blanchette (QLP)	Fortin (<i>QLP</i>)	Moreau (QLP)	Tremblay (QLP)			
Boucher (QLP)	(Pontiac)	Nichols (QLP)	Vallée (QLP)			
Boulet (QLP)	Giguère (QLP)	Ouellette (QLP)	Vien (QLP)			
Bourgeois (QLP)	Girard (QLP)	Plante (QLP)	Weil (QLP)			
Busque (QLP)	Habel (QLP)	Poëti (QLP)				
Carrière (QLP)	Hardy (<i>QLP</i>)	Polo (QLP)				
Charbonneau (QLP)	Heurtel (QLP)	Proulx (QLP)				
Charlebois (QLP)	Huot (<i>QLP</i>)	Reid (QLP)				
Chevarie (QLP)	Iracà (QLP)	Rotiroti (QLP)				
Coiteux (QLP)	Kelley (QLP)	Rousselle (<i>QLP</i>)				
NAYS - 44						
Bergeron (PQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Marceau (PQ)	Roy (PQ)			
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Khadir (IND)	Martel (CAQ)	(Bonaventure)			
Bourcier (PQ)	Kotto (PQ)	Massé (IND)	Roy (CAQ)			
Caire (CAQ)	Lamarre (PQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (IND)	(Montarville)			
Charette (CAQ)	LeBel (PQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	Schneeberger (CAQ)			
D'Amours (CAQ)	Leclair (PQ)	(René-Lévesque)	Soucy (CAQ)			
Fournier (PQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Pagé (PQ)	Spénard (CAQ)			
(Marie-Victorin)	Legault (CAQ)	Paradis (CAQ)	Surprenant (IND)			
Gaudreault (PQ)	Léger (PQ)	(Lévis)	Therrien (PQ)			
(Jonquière)	Lelièvre (IND)	Picard (CAQ)	Traversy (PQ)			
Guilbault (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	Poirier (PQ)	Villeneuve (PQ)			
Hivon (PQ)	Lisée (PQ)	Roberge (CAQ)				
Jean (PQ)	Maltais (PQ)	Rochon (PQ)				