



Votes and Proceedings
Tuesday, 28 March 2000 - No. 89

Ten o'clock
President : Mr. Jean-Pierre Charbonneau

The paper version of the Votes and Proceedings takes precedence over its electronic equivalent. The headings under the table of contents are neither all-inclusive nor restrictive.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

The Assembly was called to order at 10.08 o'clock a.m.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Estimates of Expenditure

Supplementary Estimates

On motion by Mr. Brassard, Government House Leader, the Assembly resolved itself into a Committee of the Whole to resume consideration of the Supplementary Estimates # 1 for the fiscal year ending 31 March 2000.

Consideration in Committee of the Whole

Pursuant to the order adopted on 22 March 2000, the Committee of the Whole resumed the consideration of the Supplementary Estimates # 1 for the fiscal year ending 31 March 2000.

The consideration being concluded, the Supplementary Estimates # 1 were adopted on division by the Committee of the Whole.

The Chairman of the Committee of the Whole reported to the Assembly as follows:

The Committee of the Whole has concurred in the Supplementary Estimates # 1 and the Government may take out of the consolidated revenue fund a sum not exceeding \$1,811,444,600.00 to defray a part of the expenses of Québec proposed in the Supplementary Estimates for the fiscal year 1999-2000 as laid before the National Assembly, not otherwise provided for, being the amount of each of the estimates to be voted for various programmes set forth in the Schedule to the Bill to be introduced hereafter.

The report was concurred in.

28 March 2000

Mr. Brassard, Government House Leader, on behalf of Mr. Landry, Minister of Finance, introduced Bill 104, Appropriation Act No. 4, 1999-2000, and moved:

THAT the Bill be brought before the Assembly;

THAT the Bill do pass in principle;

THAT the Bill do pass.

The motion was carried on division.

Accordingly, Bill 104, Appropriation Act No. 4, 1999-2000, was passed.

At 12.20 o'clock p.m., Mr. Brouillet, Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 2.00 o'clock p.m.

The proceedings resumed at 2.01 o'clock p.m.

Moment of reflection

ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS

Introduction of Bills

Mrs. Marois, Minister of Health and Social Services, moved that leave be granted to introduce the following Bill:

107 An Act to provide for balanced budgets in the public health and social services network.

The motion was carried.

28 March 2000

Presenting Papers

Mr. Landry, Minister of Finance, transmitted the following Message from the Honourable the Lieutenant-Governor, which Mr. President communicated to the Assembly:

OFFICE OF THE LIEUTENANT-GOVERNOR

The Honourable the Lieutenant-Governor of Québec transmits to the Assembly, in accordance with the provisions of section 54 of the *Constitution Act, 1867*, the Estimates of Expenditure for the fiscal year ending 31 March 2001, and recommends the said Estimates to the consideration of this Assembly.

Québec City, 17 March 2000

Lise Thibault
(Sessional Paper No. 1009-20000328)

Mr. Landry tabled the following:

The Estimates of Expenditure and additional information, in three volumes, for the fiscal year ending 31 March 2001.

(Sessional Paper No. 1010-20000328)

Mr. Brassard, Government House Leader, then moved:

THAT, pursuant to Standing Order 280, the Estimates of Expenditure for the fiscal year ending 31 March 2001 be referred to a Committee of the Whole for consideration and for concurrence in one quarter of the said Estimates.

This motion was carried.

Mr. Landry, Minister of Finance, then tabled the following:

The Public Accounts of the Government of Québec, in two volumes, for the fiscal year ended 31 March 1999, pursuant to section 71 of the *Financial Administration Act* (R.S.Q., c. A-6).

(Sessional Paper No. 1011-20000328)

Mr. Chevrette, Minister of Transport, tabled the following:

28 March 2000

The agreement between the Régie de l'assurance-maladie du Québec and the Société de l'assurance automobile du Québec, pursuant to the *Act respecting Access to documents held by public bodies and the Protection of personal information*, with a favorable recommendation by the Commission d'accès à l'information.

(Sessional Paper No. 1012-20000328)

Mr. President tabled the following:

A report from the Auditor General on the examination of the consolidated financial statements of the Government of Québec, in addition to chapter 10 of Volume II of the annual report of the Auditor General of Québec to the National Assembly, for the fiscal year ended 31 March 1999 (added to Sessional Paper No. 798-19991209).

(Sessional Paper No. 1013-20000328)

Pursuant to Standing Order 97.1, he then tabled the following:

Copy of the notice of motion by Mr. Tranchemontagne (Mont-Royal) to be placed on the *Order Paper and Notices* of Wednesday, 29 March 2000, under Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition.

(Sessional Paper No. 1014-20000328)

Presenting Reports from Committees

Mr. Simard (Richelieu), chairman, tabled the following:

A report from the Committee on Public Finance, which, on 22, 23 and 28 March 2000, continued the debate on the Budget Speech.

(Sessional Paper No. 1015-20000328)

Mr. Lachance (Bellechasse), chairman, tabled the following:

A report from the Committee on Transportation and the Environment, which, on 2, 3, 8, 9, 10, 23 and 24 February and on 14, 15, 21 and 22 March 2000, held public hearings within the framework of a general consultation on the green paper entitled "La sécurité routière au Québec: un défi collectif".

(Sessional Paper No. 1016-20000328)

28 March 2000

Oral Questions and Answers

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

At the request of Mr. President, Mr. Ouimet (Marquette) withdrew certain words deemed unparliamentary.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 59, Mr. Paradis, Official Opposition House Leader, tabled the following:

Copy of a letter, dated 22 March 2000, sent to all Court of Québec judges by Mrs. Huguette St-Louis, Chief Justice, concerning the Bisson Report II — the Government's answer to the Committee on the remuneration of the judges of the Court of Québec and of the municipal courts of Laval, Montréal and Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1017-20000328)

Deferred Divisions

The Assembly took the division, which had been deferred during Motions Without Notice at the sitting of 23 March 2000, on the motion by Mr. Chevette, Minister for Native Affairs. This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly mark the 15th anniversary of the adoption by the National Assembly of the resolution of 20 March 1985 on the recognition of the rights of Native people, an event which constitutes a turning point in Québec's relations with the Native nations and which, still today, remains the basis of Québec's orientation as regards Native Affairs.

Before the division was taken, the Assembly granted leave for the holding of a brief debate.

The motion was then carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 67 in Appendix)

Yeas: **112** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

28 March 2000

Motions Without Notice

Pursuant to the agreement reached on Thursday, 23 March 2000, the Assembly entered upon the debate on the motion without notice moved by Mr. Julien, Minister for Industry and Trade. This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly mark the Greek national holiday, next 25 March, and extend its best wishes to Quebeckers who belong to the Greek community in Québec.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

Mrs. Maltais, Minister of Culture and Communications, moved:

THAT the National Assembly congratulate the two following Oscar winners at the 72nd Annual Academy Awards last Sunday, 26 March:

Mr. John Corigliano, for best original score for the film "The Red Violin";

Mr. Alexandre Petrov, for best short film (animated) for "The Old Man and the Sea".

By leave of the Assembly under Standing Order 84, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

Mrs. Beauchamp (Sauvé) moved:

THAT the National Assembly mark World Theatre Day.

By leave of the Assembly under Standing Order 84, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

28 March 2000

Notices of Proceedings in Committees

Mr. Boisclair, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following Committees:

- the Committee on Institutions, to continue its public hearings within the framework of a general consultation on Bill 99, An Act respecting the exercise of the fundamental rights and prerogatives of the Québec people and of the Québec State;
- the Committee on Social Affairs, to continue its public hearings within the framework of a general consultation on the report on the assessment of the prescription drug insurance plan.

Mr. Bissonnet, Vice-President, gave the following notice:

- the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries and Food shall hold public hearings within the framework of the examination of the enforcement of the *Act to amend the Act to preserve agricultural land*, and then shall hold a deliberative meeting for the purpose of organizing its proceedings and discussing its mandates.

Information on the Proceedings of the Assembly

Mr. Bissonnet, Vice-President, informed the Assembly that on Wednesday, 29 March 2000, during Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition, a debate will be held on the motion by Mr. Tranchemontagne (Mont-Royal). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly enjoin the Parti Québécois Government to correct immediately its inequitable policy regarding the fabrication of aluminium in the Québec, Centre-du-Québec and Côte-Nord regions by applying the same measures as in the Saguenay-Lac-Saint-Jean region.

28 March 2000

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Business Having Precedence

Debate on the Budget Speech

The Assembly resumed the debate, which had been adjourned at the sitting of Wednesday, 22 March 2000, on the motion by Mr. Landry, Minister of Finance, —That the Assembly approves in general the budgetary policy of the Government, and on the want of confidence motion moved by Mrs. Jérôme-Forget (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), Mr. Laporte (Outremont), Mr. Gautrin (Verdun), Mrs. Houda-Pepin (La Pinière) and Mr. Dumont (Rivière-du-Loup).

The debate on the Budget Speech was concluded.

Recorded divisions were demanded on the want of confidence motions and on the motion by Mr. Landry, Minister of Finance.

The first motion to be put was that moved by Mrs. Jérôme-Forget (Marguerite-Bourgeoys). This want of confidence motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Parti Québécois Government for its 2000-2001 budget, which maintains the tax burden of Québec taxpayers at a level that condemns them to remain the most heavily taxed citizens in North America.

The motion was then negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 68 in Appendix)

Yeas: **42** Nays: **62** Abstentions: **0**

The second motion to be put was that moved by Mr. Laporte (Outremont). This want of confidence motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly express its disapproval regarding the careless performance displayed in the budget of our national State as regards the social evil that poverty represents.

28 March 2000

The motion was then negated on the following vote:

(Division No. 69 in Appendix)

Yeas: **42** Nays: **63** Abstentions: **0**

The next motion to be put was that moved by Mr. Gauthier (Verdun). This want of confidence motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Government for the lack of coherence in the announcements contained in the budget regarding innovation policy.

The motion was then negated on the following vote:

(Division No. 70 in Appendix)

Yeas: **42** Nays: **63** Abstentions: **0**

The following motion to be put was that moved by Mrs. Houde-Pepin (La Pinière). This want of confidence motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Parti Québécois Government for its lack of vision as regards electronic commerce policy.

The motion was then negated on the following vote:

(Division No. 71 in Appendix)

Yeas: **42** Nays: **63** Abstentions: **0**

The following motion to be put was that moved by Mr. Dumont (Rivière-du-Loup). This want of confidence motion reads as follows:

28 March 2000

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Parti Québécois Government for having once more passed a bill on to the new generation of taxpayers by not providing for a debt repayment plan in its 2000-2001 budget.

The motion was then negated on the following vote:

(Division No. 72 in Appendix)

Yeas: **42** Nays: **63** Abstentions: **0**

The next motion to be put was that moved by Mr. Béchard (Kamouraska-Témiscouata). This want of confidence motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Parti Québécois Government for its 2000-2001 budget, which shall perpetuate the underfinancing of our educational system and which shall continue to jeopardize the quality of education at all levels.

The motion was then negated on the following vote:

(Division No. 73 in Appendix)

Yeas: **42** Nays: **63** Abstentions: **0**

The question was then put on the motion moved by Mr. Landry, Minister of Finance, XThat the Assembly approves in general the budgetary policy of the Government.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 74 in Appendix)

Yeas: **63** Nays: **42** Abstentions: **0**

28 March 2000

Debates Upon Adjournment

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 309, the Assembly held three debates upon adjournment:

- the first, on a question by Mr. Gauthrin (Verdun) to Mr. Rochon, Minister of Research, Science and Technology, about the objectives and methods of verification as regards the \$120 million in expenditures made by this Ministry;
- the second, on a question by Mr. Ouimet (Marquette) to Mrs. Goupil, Minister of Justice, about the denials of the Chief Justice of the Court of Québec in the Bisson report matter;
- the third, on a question by Mr. Williams (Nelligan) to Mrs. Marois, Minister of Health and Social Services, about the \$1.2 million cut made by the Minister with regard to prostheses and orthoses.

At 6.25 o'clock p.m., Mr. Pinard, Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Wednesday, 29 March 2000, at 10.00 o'clock a.m.

JEAN-PIERRE CHARBONNEAU

President

28 March 2000

APPENDIX

Recorded Divisions

On the motion moved by Mr. Chevrette, Minister for Native Affairs, during Motions Without Notice, at the sitting of 23 March 2000:

(Division No. 67)

YEAS - 112

Arseneau	Chagnon	Geoffrion	Middlemiss
Barbeau	Charest	Gobé	Morin
Baril	(<i>Rimouski</i>)	Goupil	Mulcair
(<i>Berthier</i>)	Charest	Houda-Pepin	Normandeau
Baril	(<i>Sherbrooke</i>)	Jolivet	Ouimet
(<i>Arthabaska</i>)	Chenail	Julien	Paquin
Beauchamp	Chevrette	Jutras	Paradis
Beaudoin	Cholette	Kelley	Paré
Beaulne	Cliche	Kieffer	Pelletier
Beaumier	Copeman	Labbé	(<i>Chapleau</i>)
Béchar	Côté	Lachance	Pelletier
Bédard	(<i>La Peltrie</i>)	Lafrenière	(<i>Abitibi-Est</i>)
Bélanger	Côté	Lamoureux	Perreault
Benoit	(<i>Dubuc</i>)	Landry	Pinard
Bergeron	Cousineau	Laporte	Poulin
Bergman	Cusano	Laprise	Rioux
Bertrand	Delisle	Leblanc	Robert
(<i>Charlevoix</i>)	Désilets	Leduc	Rochon
Bertrand	Deslières	Legault	Signori
(<i>Portneuf</i>)	Després	Léger	Simard
Bissonnet	Dion	Lelièvre	(<i>Montmorency</i>)
Blanchet	Dionne-Marsolais	Lemieux	Simard
Boisclair	Duguay	Léonard	(<i>Richelieu</i>)
Bordeleau	Dumont	Létourneau	Sirros
Boucher	Facal	Loiselle	St-André
Boulianne	Fournier	MacMillan	Tranchemontagne
Brassard	Gagnon	Maltais	Trudel
Brodeur	Gagnon-Tremblay	Marcoux	Vallières
Brouillet	Gautrin	Marois	Vermette
Caron	Gauvin	Marsan	Whissell
Carrier-Perreault	Gendron	Ménard	Williams

28 March 2000

On the want of confidence motion by Mrs. Jérôme-Forget (Marguerite-Bourgeoys):

(Division No. 68)

YEAS - 42

Beauchamp	Cholette	Houda-Pepin	Normandeu
Béchar	Copeman	Kelley	Ouimet
Bélang	Cusano	Lafrenière	Paradis
Benoit	Delisle	Lamoureux	Pelletier
Bergman	Després	Leblanc	(<i>Chapleau</i>)
Bordeleau	Dumont	Loiselle	Poulin
Brodeur	Fournier	MacMillan	Sirros
Chagnon	Gagnon-Tremblay	Marcoux	Tranchemontagne
Charest	Gautrin	Marsan	Vallières
(<i>Sherbrooke</i>)	Gauvin	Middlemiss	Whissell
Chenail	Gobé	Mulcair	Williams

NAYS - 62

Arseneau	Boulianne	Facal	Marois
Barbeau	Brassard	Gagnon	Ménard
Baril	Caron	Gendron	Morin
(<i>Arthabaska</i>)	Carrier-Perreault	Geoffrion	Paquin
Baril	Charest	Goupil	Paré
(<i>Berthier</i>)	(<i>Rimouski</i>)	Jolivet	Pelletier
Beaudoin	Chevrette	Julien	(<i>Abitibi-Est</i>)
Beaulne	Cliche	Jutras	Rioux
Beaumier	Côté	Kieffer	Robert
Bédard	(<i>Dubuc</i>)	Labbé	Rochon
Bergeron	Côté	Lachance	Signori
Bertrand	(<i>La Peltrie</i>)	Landry	Simard
(<i>Portneuf</i>)	Cousineau	Laprise	(<i>Montmorency</i>)
Bertrand	Désilets	Leduc	Simard
(<i>Charlevoix</i>)	Deslières	Léger	(<i>Richelieu</i>)
Blanchet	Dion	Lelièvre	St-André
Boisclair	Dionne-Marsolais	Lemieux	Trudel
Boucher	Duguay	Maltais	Vermette

28 March 2000

On the want of confidence motion by Mr. Laporte (Outremont):

(Division No. 69)

YEAS - 42

Beauchamp	Cholette	Houda-Pepin	Normandeu
Béchar	Copeman	Kelley	Ouimet
Bélang	Cusano	Lafrenière	Paradis
Benoit	Delisle	Lamoureux	Pelletier
Bergman	Després	Leblanc	(<i>Chapleau</i>)
Bordeleau	Dumont	Loiselle	Poulin
Brodeur	Fournier	MacMillan	Sirros
Chagnon	Gagnon-Tremblay	Marcoux	Tranchemontagne
Charest	Gautrin	Marsan	Vallières
(<i>Sherbrooke</i>)	Gauvin	Middlemiss	Whissell
Chenail	Gobé	Mulcair	Williams

NAYS - 63

Arseneau	Brassard	Gendron	Paquin
Barbeau	Caron	Geoffrion	Paré
Baril	Carrier-Perreault	Goupil	Pelletier
(<i>Arthabaska</i>)	Charest	Jolivet	(<i>Abitibi-Est</i>)
Baril	(<i>Rimouski</i>)	Julien	Perreault
(<i>Berthier</i>)	Chevrette	Jutras	Rioux
Beaudoin	Cliche	Kieffer	Robert
Beaulne	Côté	Labbé	Rochon
Beaumier	(<i>Dubuc</i>)	Lachance	Signori
Bédard	Côté	Landry	Simard
Bergeron	(<i>La Peltrie</i>)	Laprise	(<i>Montmorency</i>)
Bertrand	Cousineau	Leduc	Simard
(<i>Portneuf</i>)	Désilets	Léger	(<i>Richelieu</i>)
Bertrand	Deslières	Lelièvre	St-André
(<i>Charlevoix</i>)	Dion	Lemieux	Trudel
Blanchet	Dionne-Marsolais	Maltais	Vermette
Boisclair	Duguay	Marois	
Boucher	Facal	Ménard	
Boulianne	Gagnon	Morin	

28 March 2000

On the want of confidence motion by Mr. Gauthrin (Verdun):

(Division No. 70)

(Identical to Division No. 69)

On the want of confidence motion by Mrs. Houda-Pepin (La Pinière):

(Division No. 71)

(Identical to Division No. 69)

On the want of confidence motion by Mr. Dumont (Rivière-du-Loup):

(Division No. 72)

(Identical to Division No. 69)

On the want of confidence motion by Mr. Béchard (Kamouraska-Témiscouata):

(Division No. 73)

(Identical to Division No. 69)

28 March 2000

On the motion moved by Mr. Landry, Minister of Finance, XThat the Assembly approves in general the budgetary policy of the Government:

(Division No. 74)

YEAS - 63

Arseneau	Brassard	Gendron	Paquin
Barbeau	Caron	Geoffrion	Paré
Baril	Carrier-Perreault	Goupil	Pelletier
<i>(Arthabaska)</i>	Charest	Jolivet	<i>(Abitibi-Est)</i>
Baril	<i>(Rimouski)</i>	Julien	Perreault
<i>(Berthier)</i>	Chevrette	Jutras	Rioux
Beaudoin	Cliche	Kieffer	Robert
Beaulne	Côté	Labbé	Rochon
Beaumier	<i>(Dubuc)</i>	Lachance	Signori
Bédard	Côté	Landry	Simard
Bergeron	<i>(La Peltrie)</i>	Laprise	<i>(Montmorency)</i>
Bertrand	Cousineau	Leduc	Simard
<i>(Portneuf)</i>	Désilets	Léger	<i>(Richelieu)</i>
Bertrand	Deslières	Lelièvre	St-André
<i>(Charlevoix)</i>	Dion	Lemieux	Trudel
Blanchet	Dionne-Marsolais	Maltais	Vermette
Boisclair	Duguay	Marois	
Boucher	Facal	Ménard	
Boulianne	Gagnon	Morin	

NAYS - 42

Beauchamp	Cholette	Houda-Pepin	Normandeau
Béchar	Copeman	Kelley	Ouimet
Bélanger	Cusano	Lafrenière	Paradis
Benoit	Delisle	Lamoureux	Pelletier
Bergman	Després	Leblanc	<i>(Chapleau)</i>
Bordeleau	Dumont	Loiselle	Poulin
Brodeur	Fournier	MacMillan	Sirros
Chagnon	Gagnon-Tremblay	Marcoux	Tranchemontagne
Charest	Gautrin	Marsan	Vallières
<i>(Sherbrooke)</i>	Gauvin	Middlemiss	Whissell
Chenail	Gobé	Mulcair	Williams

28 March 2000
