



*Votes and Proceedings*  
*Thursday, 2 December 1999 - No. 72*

*Ten o'clock*  
**President : Mr. Jean-Pierre Charbonneau**

---

*The paper version of the Votes and Proceedings takes precedence over its electronic equivalent. The headings under the table of contents are neither all-inclusive nor restrictive.*

#### **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

The Assembly was called to order at 10.04 o'clock a.m.

Moment of reflection

### **ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

#### **Introduction of Bills**

Mrs. Charest (Rimouski) moved that leave be granted to introduce the following Bill:

199 An Act respecting animal breeds forming part of Québec's agricultural heritage.

The motion was carried.

#### **Presenting Papers**

Mr. Chevrette, Minister of Transport, tabled the following:

The green paper entitled "La sécurité routière au Québec: un défi collectif" (Road safety in Québec: a collective challenge).

(Sessional Paper No. 771-19991202)

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 53 and 188, Mr. Brassard, Government House Leader, moved:

THAT the Committee on Transportation and the Environment hold a general consultation on the green paper entitled "La sécurité routière au Québec: un défi collectif", beginning on Tuesday, 1 February 2000;

THAT all briefs be submitted to the Secrétariat des commissions by 18 January 2000;

The Minister of Transport shall be a member of the said Committee during its proceedings with respect to this order of reference.

This motion was carried.

### **Presenting Reports from Committees**

Mr. Simard (Richelieu), chairman, tabled the following:

A report from the Committee on Public Finance, which met on 1 December 1999 for clause-by-clause consideration of the following Bill:

84 An Act to amend the Act respecting the Société des loteries du Québec  
— Reported without amendment.

(Sessional Paper No. 772-19991202)

### **Complaints of Breach of Privilege or Contempt and Personal Explanations**

Mr. President informed the Assembly that he had received a request from Mr. Lelièvre (Gaspé) to rise on a personal matter in relation to comments concerning him that were made by Mrs. Normandeau (Bonaventure) during Question Period at the sitting of Wednesday, 1 December 1999.

Mr. President ruled this request in order and, consequently, allowed Mr. Lelièvre (Gaspé) to give explanations.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 59, Mr. Paradis, Official Opposition House Leader, tabled the following:

Copy of a letter, dated 2 December 1999, sent to Mrs. Nathalie Normandeau, the Member for Bonaventure, from Mr. Gilles Deraiche, mayor of Saint-François-de-Pabos, concerning a correction to the comments made by the Member for Bonaventure.

(Sessional Paper No. 773-19991202)

### **Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

At the request of Mr. President, Mr. Dupuis (Saint-Laurent) withdrew certain words deemed unparliamentary.

**2 December 1999**

---

### **Deferred Divisions**

The Assembly took the division, which had been deferred at the sitting of 1 December 1999, on the motion by Mrs. Harel, Minister of Municipal Affairs and Greater Montréal, for the passage in principle of Bill 81, An Act respecting the amalgamation of Municipalité de Mont-Tremblant, Ville de Saint-Jovite, Municipalité de Lac-Tremblant-Nord and Paroisse de Saint-Jovite.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 53 in Appendix)

Yeas: **62**   Nays: **44**   Abstentions: **0**

Accordingly, Bill 81 was passed in principle.

On motion by Mr. Brassard, Government House Leader, Bill 81 was referred for clause-by-clause consideration to the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain.

### **Motions Without Notice**

Mr. Trudel, Minister of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, moved:

THAT the Québec National Assembly congratulate the award winners of the 1999 Ordre du mérite agricole du Québec and that it also congratulate the women who were named Woman Farmer of the Year, Woman Farmer Entrepreneur of the Year, and Young Woman Farmer of the Year for 1999 by the Fédération des agricultrices du Québec.

By leave of the Assembly under Standing Order 84, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the question was put on this motion; a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 54 in Appendix)

Yeas: **90**   Nays: **0**   Abstentions: **0**

**2 December 1999**

---

Mr. Poulin (Beauce-Nord) moved a motion concerning an extended public hearing on the management and administration of Emploi-Québec; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

—————

Mr. Brassard, Government House Leader, moved:

THAT the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain hold special consultations on Bill 81, An Act respecting the amalgamation of Municipalité de Mont-Tremblant, Ville de Saint-Jovite, Municipalité de Lac-Tremblant-Nord and Paroisse de Saint-Jovite, on Friday, 3 December 1999, and for this purpose hear the following groups:

11.00 a.m. to 11.15 a.m.	Opening statements by the Government followed by those of the Official Opposition
11.15 a.m. to 12.00 p.m.	Ville de Saint-Jovite
12.00 p.m. to 12.45 p.m.	Municipalité de Mont-Tremblant
3.00 p.m. to 3.45 p.m.	Paroisse de Saint-Jovite
3.45 p.m. to 4.30 p.m.	Municipalité de Lac-Tremblant-Nord
4.30 p.m. to 5.15 p.m.	Municipalité régionale de comté des Laurentides
5.15 p.m. to 6.00 p.m.	Centre local de développement des Laurentides
8.00 p.m. to 8.45 p.m.	Association du Lac-Tremblant
8.45 p.m. to 9.30 p.m.	Association pour la protection du Lac Maskinongé
9.30 p.m. to 10.15 p.m.	Unions des municipalités de banlieue sur l'île de Montréal
10.15 p.m. to 11.00 p.m.	Ville de Rosemère
11.00 p.m. to 11.45 p.m.	Chambre de commerce de Saint-Jovite and Bureau touristique du secteur de Saint-Jovite

**2 December 1999**

---

11.45 p.m. to 12.00 a.m. Closing statements by the Official Opposition followed by those of the Government

A period of 15 minutes shall be allotted for the opening statements, which time shall be shared equally among the members of the parliamentary group forming the Government and the Members sitting in Opposition;

A period of 15 minutes shall be allotted for the closing statements, which time shall be shared equally among the members of the parliamentary group forming the Government and the Members sitting in Opposition;

The presentation by each group shall not last more than 15 minutes and the exchange with the members of the Committee shall not last more than 30 minutes, which time shall be shared equally among the members of the parliamentary group forming the Government and the Members sitting in Opposition;

The Minister of State for Municipal Affairs and Greater Montréal shall be a member of the said Committee during its proceedings with respect to this order of reference.

By leave of the Assembly under Standing Order 84, the motion was carried.

### **Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

Mr. Boisclair, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following Committees:

- the Committee on Labour and the Economy, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 78, An Act to again amend the James Bay Region Development Act, and of Bill 67, An Act to amend the Act respecting labour standards as regards differences in treatment;
- the Committee on Transportation and the Environment, to give clause-by-clause consideration to Bill 91, An Act to amend the Environment Quality Act concerning the procedure for environmental impact assessment and review of certain projects, and to Bill 58, An Act to amend the Highway Safety Code and other legislative provisions;

**2 December 1999**

---

- the Committee on Public Finance, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 82, Public Administration Act;
- the Committee on Social Affairs, to give clause-by-clause consideration to Bill 83, An Act to amend the Health Insurance Act and other legislative provisions.

---

**ORDERS OF THE DAY**

**Government Bills**

*Passage in Principle*

Mrs. Harel, Minister of Municipal Affairs and Greater Montréal, moved, —That Bill 95, An Act to amend various legislative provisions respecting municipal affairs, do now pass in principle.

After debate thereon, the motion was carried and Bill 95 was accordingly passed in principle.

On motion by Mr. Boisclair, Deputy Government House Leader, Bill 95 was referred for clause-by-clause consideration to the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain.

*Report Stage*

The Assembly took into consideration the report from the Committee on Public Finance on its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 92, An Act respecting the Ministère des Finances.

After debate thereon, the report was concurred in.

**Government Motions**

The Assembly resumed the debate on the amendment by Mr. Charest, Leader of the Official Opposition, to the motion by Mr. Landry, Minister of State for the Economy and Finance.

**2 December 1999**

---

The motion by Mr. Landry, Minister of State for the Economy and Finance, reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly demand that the Federal Government adjust the tax disparity between the provinces and the Federal Government, by reducing its tax level, by re-establishing, within the framework of the Canada Health and Social Transfer (CHST), the financial transfers to the provinces at the level at which they were prior to the 1994-1995 cutbacks, and by proposing a new tax apportionment, particularly by means of a transfer of tax points, which will respect the responsibilities held by the provinces under the Canadian Constitution.

The amendment by Mr. Charest, Leader of the Official Opposition, reads as follows:

THAT the motion under discussion be amended:

- 1° by replacing the two first lines of the motion as well as the words "Federal Government, by reducing its tax level," in the third line by the words "THAT the National Assembly demand that the Federal Government and the Provincial Government adjust the tax disparity between them, by reducing their tax levels now";
- 2° by adding to the eighth line, after the word "provinces", the words "and the Federal".

The motion, as amended, reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly demand the Federal Government and the Provincial Government adjust the tax disparity between them, by reducing their tax levels now, by re-establishing, within the framework of the Canada Health and Social Transfer (CHST), the financial transfers to the provinces at the level at which they were prior to the 1994-1995 cutbacks, and by proposing a new tax apportionment, particularly by means of a transfer of tax points, which will respect the responsibilities held by the provinces and the Federal under the Canadian Constitution.

---

At 12.59 o'clock p.m., Mr. Bissonnet, Vice-President, having left the Chair, the proceedings were suspended until 3.00 o'clock p.m.

---

**2 December 1999**

---

The proceedings resumed at 3.03 o'clock p.m.

---

And debate continuing on the amendment by Mr. Charest, Leader of the Official Opposition, to the motion by Mr. Landry, Minister of State for the Economy and Finance;

On motion by Mr. Boisclair, Deputy Government House Leader, the debate was adjourned.

---

At 4.58 o'clock p.m., on motion by Mr. Boisclair, Deputy Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned until Friday, 3 December 1999, at 10.00 o'clock a.m.

**JEAN-PIERRE CHARBONNEAU**

*President*

2 December 1999

---

APPENDIX

Recorded Divisions

On the motion by Mrs. Harel, Minister of Municipal Affairs and Greater Montréal, for the passage in principle of Bill 81:

(Division No. 53)

YEAS - 62

Arseneau	Brassard	Gendron	Paquin
Barbeau	Caron	Geoffrion	Paré
Baril	Charest	Harel	Payne
<i>(Arthabaska)</i>	<i>(Rimouski)</i>	Jolivet	Pelletier
Baril	Chevrette	Labbé	<i>(Abitibi-Est)</i>
<i>(Berthier)</i>	Cliche	Lachance	Perreault
Beaulne	Côté	Landry	Rioux
Beaumier	<i>(Dubuc)</i>	Laprise	Robert
Bédard	Côté	Leduc	Rochon
Bégin	<i>(La Peltrie)</i>	Léger	Signori
Bergeron	Cousineau	Lelièvre	Simard
Bertrand	Désilets	Lemieux	<i>(Montmorency)</i>
<i>(Portneuf)</i>	Deslières	Léonard	Simard
Blanchet	Dion	Létourneau	<i>(Richelieu)</i>
Boisclair	Dionne-Marsolais	Marois	St-André
Boucher	Doyer	Ménard	Trudel
Boulerice	Duguay	Morin	Vermette
Boulianne	Gagnon	Papineau	

NAYS - 44

Beauchamp	Delisle	Lamoureux	Pelletier
Béchar	Després	Lamquin-Éthier	<i>(Chapleau)</i>
Bélanger	Dumont	Laporte	Poulin
Bergman	Dupuis	Leblanc	Tranchemontagne
Bordeleau	Fournier	Maciocia	Vallières
Brodeur	Gagnon-Tremblay	MacMillan	Whissell
Chagnon	Gautrin	Marcoux	Williams
Charest	Gauvin	Marsan	
<i>(Sherbrooke)</i>	Gobé	Middlemiss	
Chenail	Houda-Pepin	Mulcair	
Cholette	Jérôme-Forget	Normandeau	
Copeman	Kelley	Ouimet	
Cusano	Lafrenière	Paradis	

2 December 1999

---

On the Motion Without Notice by Mr. Trudel, Minister of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food:

(Division No. 54)

YEAS - 90

Arseneau	Copeman	Jérôme-Forget	Paquin
Barbeau	Côté	Jolivet	Paradis
Beauchamp	(Dubuc)	Kelley	Payne
Beaulne	Côté	Labbé	Pelletier
Béchar	(La Peltrie)	Lachance	(Abitibi-Est)
Bédard	Cousineau	Lafrenière	Pelletier
Bégin	Cusano	Lamoureux	(Chapleau)
Bélanger	Delisle	Lamquin-Éthier	Poulin
Bergeron	Désilets	Landry	Rioux
Bergman	Deslières	Laporte	Robert
Bertrand	Després	Laprise	Rochon
(Portneuf)	Dion	Leblanc	Signori
Blanchet	Dionne-Marsolais	Leduc	Simard
Boisclair	Doyer	Léger	(Richelieu)
Bordeleau	Duguay	Lelièvre	Simard
Boucher	Dupuis	Létourneau	(Montmorency)
Boulerice	Fournier	Maciocia	St-André
Boulianne	Gagnon	MacMillan	Tranchemontagne
Brassard	Gautrin	Marcoux	Trudel
Brodeur	Gauvin	Marsan	Vallières
Caron	Gendron	Morin	Vermette
Carrier-Perreault	Geoffrion	Mulcair	Williams
Chagnon	Gobé	Normandeau	
Cholette	Harel	Ouimet	
Cliche	Houda-Pepin	Papineau	