



---

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF QUÉBEC

---

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-SECOND LEGISLATURE

## **Votes and Proceedings**

**of the Assembly**

**Thursday, 21 February 2019 — No. 17**

**President of the National Assembly:  
Mr. François Paradis**

---



The Assembly was called to order at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

---

**ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

**Statements by Members**

Mr. Provençal (Beauce-Nord) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Léonide Grenier for his contribution to his community's development.

---

Mr. Derraji (Nelligan) made a statement to pay tribute to Mrs. Akilah Newton for her commitment to the West Island's black community.

---

Mrs. Lavallée (Repentigny) made a statement to underline the 40th anniversary of the organization Les Amis de la déficience intellectuelle Rive-Nord.

---

Mr. Kelley (Jacques-Cartier) made a statement to congratulate Ville de Pointe-Claire, winner of the "Prix du bénévolat en loisir et en sport Dollard-Morin" award.

---

Mr. Allaire (Maskinongé) made a statement to underline the volunteer work of Mr. Marc Bellemare of Maskinongé riding in the context of Operation Red Nose.

**21 February 2019**

---

Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage) made a statement to express solidarity and support for the Catalan people.

---

Mr. Émond (Richelieu) made a statement to pay tribute to Sorel film director Geneviève Dulude-De Celles.

---

Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia) made a statement to ask the Government to apply the provisions for converting stand-by shifts for the regional county municipality of La Matanie paramedics.

---

Mr. Picard (Chutes-de-la-Chaudière) made a statement to underline the 25th anniversary of the organization La Passerelle, a support and self-help group for people with mental health problems.

---

Mrs. Proulx (Côte-du-Sud) made a statement to underline the company Teknion Roy & Breton's dynamism.

---

At 9.52 o'clock a.m., Mrs. Gaudreault, Third Vice President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

---

The proceedings resumed at 10.01 o'clock a.m.

---

21 February 2019

---

Moment of reflection

### **Introduction of Bills**

Mr. Roberge, Minister of Education and Higher Education, moved that leave be granted to introduce the following bill:

- 12      An Act to clarify the scope of the right to free education and to allow the regulation of certain financial contributions that may be required

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, Bill 12 was introduced in the Assembly.

---

Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière) moved that leave be granted to introduce the following bill:

- 194      An Act to ensure compliance with Québec's climate change-related obligations

The question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **30** in Appendix)

Yeas: **113**    Nays: **0**    Abstentions: **0**

Accordingly, Bill 194 was introduced in the Assembly.

21 February 2019

---

### **Presenting Reports from Committees**

Mr. Provençal (Beauce-Nord), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Health and Social Services, which held public hearings on 12, 13, 19 and 20 February 2019 within the framework of special consultations on Bill 2, An Act to tighten the regulation of cannabis.

(Sessional Paper No. 380-20190221)

### **Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

### **Deferred Divisions**

The Assembly took the divisions, which had been deferred at the sitting of 20 February 2019, on the motion moved by Mrs. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent) and the amendment motion moved by Mrs. Labrie (Sherbrooke) during Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition.

First, the question was put on the amendment motion moved by Mrs. Labrie (Sherbrooke).

This motion reads as follows:

THAT the motion moved by the Member for Saint-Laurent be amended as follows:

By replacing the words “and to improving teachers’ working conditions” at the end of the first paragraph by the words “, to improving the working conditions of teachers, professionals and support staff and to upgrading infrastructures”.

**21 February 2019**

---

The amendment motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **31** in Appendix)

Yeas: **113**   Nays: **0**   Abstentions: **0**

The question was then put on the motion by Mrs. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent), as amended.

The motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly ask the Government to allocate the necessary budgetary resources first and foremost to student services, to improving the working conditions of teachers, professionals and support staff and to upgrading infrastructures;

THAT the National Assembly ask the Government not to halt any expansion or renovation projects already approved in accordance with the *Act respecting contracting by public bodies*.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **32** in Appendix)

Yeas: **113**   Nays: **0**   Abstentions: **0**

### **Motions Without Notice**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mrs. McCann, Minister of Health and Social Services, together with Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière) and Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), moved:

21 February 2019

---

THAT the National Assembly support the Québec Government in its willingness to grant additional powers to specialized nurse practitioners, in particular by delegating the power to make certain diagnoses to them.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Proulx, Official Opposition House Leader, together with Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, Mr. Ouellet, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, Mr. Nadeau-Dubois, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, and Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey), moved:

THAT the National Assembly reiterate the need for collaboration among all political parties to ensure the proper functioning of the Assembly and that it reiterate the importance and usefulness of the exercise of holding consultations in committee, in particular on bills introduced by the Government in order to improve them.

The question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 33 in Appendix)

Yeas: **109**    Nays: **0**    Abstentions: **0**

---

Mr. LeBel (Rimouski), together with Mrs. Sauvé (Fabre), Mrs. Dorion (Taschereau) and Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey), moved a motion on private residences for seniors in Québec; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

---



21 February 2019

---

Mrs. Ghazal (Mercier), together with Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière), moved a motion on the Énergie Saguenay natural gas project; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

### **Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

- the Committee on Institutions, to hold public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 8, An Act to amend the Civil Protection Act concerning financial assistance;
- the Committee on Citizen Relations, to hold its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 9, An Act to increase Québec's socio-economic prosperity and adequately meet labour market needs through successful immigrant integration.
- the Committee on Public Finance, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 3, An Act to establish a single school tax rate;
- the Committee on Labour and the Economy, to hold public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 10, An Act to amend the Pay Equity Act mainly to improve the pay equity audit process.

**21 February 2019**

---

Mrs. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, gave the following notice:

- the Committee on Health and Social Services shall hold a deliberative meeting to discuss the possibility of carrying out an order of initiative;
- the Committee on Culture and Education shall hold a deliberative meeting to discuss the possibility of carrying out an order of initiative.

**Information on the Proceedings of the Assembly**

At 11.21 o'clock a.m., Mrs. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

\_\_\_\_\_

The proceedings resumed at 11.27 o'clock a.m.

\_\_\_\_\_

Mr. Proulx, Official Opposition House Leader, raised a point of order concerning a request by the Government House Leader to suspend Assembly proceedings and regarding the organization of Assembly and parliamentary committee proceedings.

At 11.54 o'clock a.m., after having heard arguments from all sides, the President took the matter under advisement and suspended proceedings.

\_\_\_\_\_

The proceedings resumed at 12.27 o'clock p.m.

\_\_\_\_\_

**21 February 2019**

---

The President ruled on the point of order raised by Mr. Proulx, Official Opposition House Leader, concerning a request by the Government House Leader to suspend Assembly proceedings and regarding the organization of Assembly and parliamentary committee proceedings.

#### RULING FROM THE CHAIR

In the Québec parliamentary system, the Government House Leader has significant control over how proceedings are conducted in the Assembly and in committee, because he or she determines which issues will be debated during Orders of the Day and appoints the time when the committees will meet to consider orders of reference from the Assembly.

The Standing Orders give the President the authority to suspend a sitting at any time. This power lies solely with the President, who generally uses it to perform his role of maintaining order and decorum.

The Government House Leader may not move a motion to suspend the Assembly's proceedings. As parliamentary jurisprudence has already established, no such motion exists in our Standing Orders.

The Government House Leader may request that proceedings be suspended under certain specific circumstances. In practice, on Tuesdays and Thursdays during ordinary hours of meeting, the Government House Leader may request that proceedings be suspended if he or she does not plan to include any other business on the Order Paper and if debates upon adjournment are scheduled for 6.00 o'clock p.m. In the absence of debates upon adjournment, the Government House Leader could move a motion to adjourn the proceedings. To avoid having the Government prevent holding debates upon adjournment, by adjourning the proceedings before these debates take place, in practice, the Chair grants the Government House Leader's request to suspend proceedings until these debates are held, at 6.00 o'clock p.m. In this context, unanimous consent of the House is not needed to suspend the proceedings.

However, this is not true in other situations when the Government House Leader intends to include business on the Order Paper in Orders of the Day, but wishes to suspend the House's proceedings for a few minutes or for a set period of time. In such cases, the Government House Leader may ask the Chair to suspend the proceedings, but the Chair must verify whether leave is granted for the suspension. If leave is not granted, the Government House Leader may adjourn the Assembly's proceedings or call business on the Order Paper that he or she wishes to debate, depending on the circumstances.

**21 February 2019**

---

Regarding the organization of parliamentary proceedings, since matters can be referred to both the Assembly and the committees at the same time, the political parties sometimes discuss among themselves to allow each party to be present for the various debates, either in the Assembly or in committee. In such cases, the political parties agree to suspend Assembly proceedings for a certain time. The Chair strongly encourages such discussions for the proper functioning of the Assembly.

The Government House Leader is responsible for organizing Assembly and parliamentary committee proceedings and has considerable latitude as to when he or she wishes each piece of business to be debated. However, it is not desirable that proceedings be held simultaneously in the House and in committee if they involve the same ministers and opposition critics. The solution lies in constructive dialogue. The Chair intends to summon the parliamentary groups' House leaders to begin discussions on this matter.

Since leave to suspend proceedings is not granted, the Chair cannot grant the request to suspend the proceedings.

---

**ORDERS OF THE DAY**

Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, moved the adjournment of the Assembly until Tuesday, 26 February 2019 at 1.40 o'clock p.m.

The motion was carried.

---

Accordingly, at 12.35 o'clock p.m., Mrs. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Tuesday, 26 February 2019 at 1.40 o'clock p.m.

**21 February 2019**

---

**FRANÇOIS PARADIS**

*President*

21 February 2019

---

APPENDIX

Recorded Divisions

On the motion moved by Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière):

(Division No. 30)

YEAS - 113

Allaire (CAQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	LeBel (PQ)	Poulin (CAQ)
Anglade (QLP)	Fortin (QLP)	(Rimouski)	Proulx (CAQ)
Arcand (QLP)	Foster (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	(Berthier)
Arseneau (PQ)	Fournier (PQ)	(Les Plaines)	Proulx (CAQ)
Bachand (CAQ)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	(Côte-du-Sud)
Barrette (QLP)	(Jonquière)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Proulx (QLP)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Ghazal (QS)	Leduc (QS)	(Jean-Talon)
Benjamin (QLP)	Girard (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Bérubé (PQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Legault (CAQ)	Reid (CAQ)
Birnbaum (QLP)	Girard (CAQ)	Leitão (QLP)	Richard (PQ)
Blais (CAQ)	(Groulx)	Lemay (CAQ)	Rizqy (QLP)
(Prévost)	Girault (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Roberge (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	Robitaille (QLP)
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	Rouleau (CAQ)
Boulet (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Rousselle (QLP)
Campeau (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Roy (PQ)
Caron (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Maccarone (QLP)	(Bonaventure)
Charbonneau (QLP)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Marissal (QS)	Roy (CAQ)
Charest (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	(Montarville)
Charette (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Massé (QS)	Sauvé (QLP)
Chassé (CAQ)	Kelley (QLP)	McCann (CAQ)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Chassin (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Melançon (QLP)	Simard (CAQ)
Ciccone (QLP)	Lachance (CAQ)	Ménard (QLP)	Skeete (CAQ)
D'Amours (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Montpetit (QLP)	St-Pierre (QLP)
Dansereau (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	Tanguay (QLP)
David (QLP)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Nichols (QLP)	Tardif (CAQ)
Derraji (QLP)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	(Lavolette-Saint-Maurice)
Dorion (QS)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Ouellette (IND)	Tardif (CAQ)
Dubé (CAQ)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	(Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata)
Dufour (CAQ)	Lavallée (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	Thouin (CAQ)
Émond (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	(Soulanges)	Weil (QLP)
Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	(Champlain)	Polo (QLP)	Zanetti (QS)

21 February 2019

---

On the amendment motion moved by Mrs. Labrie (Sherbrooke):

**(Division No. 31)**

**YEAS - 113**

Allaire (CAQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	LeBel (PQ)	Poulin (CAQ)
Anglade (QLP)	Fortin (QLP)	(Rimouski)	Proulx (CAQ)
Arcand (QLP)	Foster (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	(Berthier)
Arseneau (PQ)	Fournier (PQ)	(Les Plaines)	Proulx (CAQ)
Bachand (CAQ)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	(Côte-du-Sud)
Barrette (QLP)	(Jonquière)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Proulx (QLP)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Ghazal (QS)	Leduc (QS)	(Jean-Talon)
Benjamin (QLP)	Girard (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Bérubé (PQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Legault (CAQ)	Reid (CAQ)
Birnbaum (QLP)	Girard (CAQ)	Leitão (QLP)	Richard (PQ)
Blais (CAQ)	(Groulx)	Lemay (CAQ)	Rizqy (QLP)
(Prévost)	Girault (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Roberge (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	Robitaille (QLP)
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	Rouleau (CAQ)
Boulet (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Rousselle (QLP)
Campeau (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Roy (PQ)
Caron (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Maccarone (QLP)	(Bonaventure)
Charbonneau (QLP)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Marissal (QS)	Roy (CAQ)
Charest (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	(Montarville)
Charette (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Massé (QS)	Sauvé (QLP)
Chassé (CAQ)	Kelley (QLP)	McCann (CAQ)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Chassin (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Melançon (QLP)	Simard (CAQ)
Ciccone (QLP)	Lachance (CAQ)	Ménard (QLP)	Skeete (CAQ)
D'Amours (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Montpetit (QLP)	St-Pierre (QLP)
Dansereau (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	Tanguay (QLP)
David (QLP)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Nichols (QLP)	Tardif (CAQ)
Derraji (QLP)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	(Lavolette-Saint-Maurice)
Dorion (QS)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Ouellette (IND)	Tardif (CAQ)
Dubé (CAQ)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	(Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata)
Dufour (CAQ)	Lavallée (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	Thouin (CAQ)
Émond (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	(Soulanges)	Weil (QLP)
Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	(Champlain)	Polo (QLP)	Zanetti (QS)

**21 February 2019**

---

On the motion moved by Mrs. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent), as amended by the previous division:

**(Division No. 32)**

*(Identical to Division No. 31)*



21 February 2019

---

On the motion moved by Mr. Proulx, Official Opposition House Leader, together with Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, Mr. Ouellet, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, Mr. Nadeau-Dubois, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, and Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey):

**(Division No. 33)**

**YEAS - 109**

Allaire (CAQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	LeBel (PQ)	Poulin (CAQ)
Anglade (QLP)	Fortin (QLP)	(Rimouski)	Proulx (CAQ)
Arcand (QLP)	Foster (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	(Côte-du-Sud)
Arseneau (PQ)	Fournier (PQ)	(Les Plaines)	Proulx (CAQ)
Bachand (CAQ)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	(Berthier)
Barrette (QLP)	(Jonquière)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Proulx (QLP)
Bélangier (CAQ)	Ghazal (QS)	Leduc (QS)	(Jean-Talon)
Benjamin (QLP)	Girard (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Bérubé (PQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Leitão (QLP)	Reid (CAQ)
Birnbaum (QLP)	Girard (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	Richard (PQ)
Blais (CAQ)	(Groulx)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Rizqy (QLP)
(Prévost)	Girault (CAQ)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	Roberge (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	Groncin (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Robitaille (QLP)
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Guilbault (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)
Boulet (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Rousselle (QLP)
Campeau (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	Maccarone (QLP)	Roy (PQ)
Caron (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Marissal (QS)	(Bonaventure)
Charbonneau (QLP)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Roy (CAQ)
Charest (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Massé (QS)	(Montarville)
Charette (CAQ)	Kelley (QLP)	McCann (CAQ)	Sauvé (QLP)
Chassin (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Melançon (QLP)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Ciccone (QLP)	Lachance (CAQ)	Ménard (QLP)	Simard (CAQ)
D'Amours (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Montpetit (QLP)	St-Pierre (QLP)
Dansereau (CAQ)	Lafortest (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	Tanguay (QLP)
David (QLP)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Nichols (QLP)	Tardif (CAQ)
Derraji (QLP)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	(Lavolette-Saint-Maurice)
Dorion (QS)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Ouellette (IND)	Tardif (CAQ)
Dubé (CAQ)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	(Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata)
Dufour (CAQ)	Lavallée (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	Thouin (CAQ)
Émond (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	(Soulanges)	Weil (QLP)
Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	(Champlain)	Polo (QLP)	Zanetti (QS)