



---

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF QUÉBEC

---

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-SECOND LEGISLATURE

## **Votes and Proceedings**

**of the Assembly**

**Thursday, 9 May 2019 — No. 41**

**President of the National Assembly:  
Mr. François Paradis**

---



The Assembly was called to order at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

---

**ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

**Statements by Members**

Mr. Tardif (Rivière-du-Loup–Témiscouata) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Gilles Lortie, recipient of the Medal of the National Assembly.

---

Mr. Leitão (Robert-Baldwin) made a statement to congratulate the participants in the Bourse des députés contest.

---

Mr. Fitzgibbon (Terrebonne) made a statement to underline Mrs. Annette Thouin's 100th birthday.

---

Mr. Benjamin (Viau) made a statement to underline the 20th edition of the Gala des nouveau-nés du quartier Saint-Michel.

---

Mr. Leduc (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve) made a statement to underline the success of the event Troc N'roll.

**9 May 2019**

---

Mrs. Hébert (Saint-François) made a statement to underline the Service d'aide aux Néo-Canadiens's 65th anniversary.

---

Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) made a statement on behalf of Mrs. Perry Mélançon (Gaspé) to pay tribute to Mr. Alan Côté on being named Compagnon des arts et des lettres du Québec.

---

Mrs. Laforest (Chicoutimi) made a statement to congratulate Mr. Donald Dubois, winner of the "Prix du bénévolat en loisir et en sport Dollard-Morin" award.

---

Mrs. Dansereau (Verchères) made a statement to underline the Cercle de fermières de Saint-Amable's 60th anniversary.

---

Mrs. Jeannotte (Labelle) made a statement to pay tribute to Mrs. Thérèse Barrette, recipient of the Lieutenant-Governor's Medal.

---

At 9.52 o'clock a.m., Mr. Picard, First Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

---

The proceedings resumed at 10.01 o'clock a.m.

---

9 May 2019

---

Moment of reflection

### **Introduction of Bills**

Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin) moved that leave be granted to introduce the following bill:

392 An Act respecting the selection of Québec senators

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, Bill 392 was introduced in the Assembly.

---

Mr. Marissal (Rosemont) moved that leave be granted to introduce the following bill:

198 An Act to facilitate disclosure of wrongdoings

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, Bill 198 was introduced in the Assembly.

### **Presenting Papers**

Mr. Fitzgibbon, Minister of Economy and Innovation, tabled the following:

The 2018–2022 strategic plans of the Fonds de recherche du Québec:

Nature et technologies

(Sessional Paper No. 587-20190509)

Santé

(Sessional Paper No. 588-20190509)

9 May 2019

---

Société et culture

(Sessional Paper No. 589-20190509)

---

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, tabled the following:

The Government's reply to petitions tabled on 28 March 2019 by Mrs. Blais (Abitibi-Ouest) on opposition to closing the La Sarre birth centre.

(Sessional Paper No. 590-20190509)

### **Presenting Reports from Committees**

Mr. Tanguay (LaFontaine), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Culture and Education, which met on 9, 10 and 11 April and 8 May 2019 for clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 12, An Act to clarify the scope of the right to free education and to allow the regulation of certain financial contributions that may be required. The report contains amendments to the bill.

(Sessional Paper No. 591-20190509)

### **Complaints of Breach of Privilege or Contempt and Personal Explanations**

Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) requested a directive on the application of parliamentary privilege concerning written questions on the *Order Paper and Notices*.

The President took the matter under advisement.

9 May 2019

---

### Oral Questions and Answers

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 53 and 59, Mrs. Melançon (Verdun) tabled the following:

A bundle of documents concerning the examination of the 2019–2020 estimates of expenditure of the Ministère de la Culture et des Communications.  
(Sessional Paper No. 592-20190509)

### Deferred Divisions

The Assembly took the division, which had been deferred at the sitting of 8 May 2019, on the several reports together from the committees that examined the estimates of expenditure for the 2019–2020 fiscal year.

The reports were concurred in on the following vote:

(Division No. 93 in Appendix)

Yeas: 67   Nays: 46   Abstentions: 0

### Appropriation Bills

By leave of the Assembly, Mr. Dubé, Minister Responsible for Government Administration and Chair of the Conseil du trésor, moved the introduction, passage in principle and passage of Bill 24, Appropriation Act No. 2, 2019–2020.

The question was put on the motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

**9 May 2019**

---

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **94** in Appendix)

Yeas: **67** Nays: **46** Abstentions: **0**

Accordingly, Bill 24, Appropriation Act No. 2, 2019–2020, was passed.

---

The Assembly took the divisions, which had been deferred at the sitting of 8 May 2019, on the motion moved by Mr. Leitão (Robert-Baldwin) and on the amendment motion moved by Mr. Ouellet (René-Lévesque) during Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition.

First, the question was put on the amendment motion moved by Mr. Ouellet (René-Lévesque).

This motion reads as follows:

THAT the motion moved by the Member for Robert-Baldwin be amended as follows:

By adding the following paragraph after the second paragraph: “THAT the SAQ privatization scenario be excluded from this mandate;”.

The amendment motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **95** in Appendix)

Yeas: **46** Nays: **66** Abstentions: **0**

The question was then put on the motion moved by Mr. Leitão (Robert-Baldwin).



**9 May 2019**

---

This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly instruct the Committee on Public Finance to examine the report by PricewaterhouseCoopers (PwC) on the evolution of the SAQ business model entitled “Évolution du modèle d’affaires de la SAQ”, submitted to the Government on 12 September 2018, and, if necessary, make the appropriate recommendations to modernize the SAQ business model and promote Québec product sales;

THAT, within the framework of this mandate, the Committee hold special consultations and public hearings and that, for this purpose, it hear the authors of the said report, the Société des alcools du Québec, the Association des marchands dépanneurs et épiciers du Québec, Mr. Frédéric Laurin, Professor at UQTR’s Finance and Economy Department, and any individuals or organizations it deems necessary to convene;

THAT the organization of the mandate be entrusted to the members of the Committee;

THAT the Committee report to the Assembly not later than 1 November 2019, unless the Committee decides otherwise;

THAT, lastly, this motion become an order of the Assembly.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **96** in Appendix)

Yeas: **36** Nays: **76** Abstentions: **0**

9 May 2019

---

**Motions Without Notice**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mrs. McCann, Minister of Health and Social Services, together with Mr. Fortin (Pontiac), Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), Mrs. Hivon (Joliette), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly underline National Hospice Palliative Care Week, held from 5 to 11 May 2019;

THAT it highlight the creation of the working group on improving fair and quality access to palliative and end-of-life care, whose mission for improvement takes a multidisciplinary approach.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Leitão (Robert-Baldwin), together with Mr. Marissal (Rosemont), Mr. Ouellet (René-Lévesque), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

WHEREAS, following the unanimous passing of Bill 150 on 12 June 2018, Québec collects the Québec sales tax from suppliers of services purchased online outside Québec since 1 January 2019;

THAT it call on the Government of Canada to put an end to the unfair tax treatment relating to e-commerce by making it mandatory for service suppliers to collect the federal sales tax (GST) on services purchased online outside the country.

The question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

**9 May 2019**

---

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **97** in Appendix)

Yeas: **111** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Leduc (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve), together with Mr. Boulet, Minister of Labour, Employment and Social Solidarity, Mrs. Sauvé (Fabre), Mr. LeBel (Rimouski), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly mark Québec's 46th "Semaine de la dignité des personnes assistées sociales";

THAT, on this occasion, the Assembly acknowledge that Québec social assistance recipients are sometimes isolated and have to face negative stereotypes;

THAT it acknowledge the fact that people do not voluntarily become, nor do they seek to become, social assistance recipients;

THAT the National Assembly further recognize that social assistance recipients are full-fledged contributing members of Québec society, including through their volunteer work.

After debate thereon, the question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **98** in Appendix)

Yeas: **112** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

---

9 May 2019

---

Mrs. Hivon (Joliette), together with Mrs. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent), Mr. Nadeau-Dubois (Gouin), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved a motion on kindergarten classes for four-year-olds; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

---

Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey), together with Mrs. Thériault (Anjou–Louis-Riel), Mrs. Ghazal (Mercier), Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved a motion on planned obsolescence; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

#### **Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

- the Committee on Institutions, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 21, An Act respecting the laicity of the State; and then, undertake clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 6, An Act to transfer responsibility for the registry of lobbyists to the Lobbyists Commissioner and to implement the Charbonneau Commission recommendation on the prescription period for bringing penal proceedings;
- the Committee on Transportation and the Environment, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 17, An Act respecting remunerated passenger transportation by automobile;
- the Committee on Public Finance, to undertake clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 13, An Act to amend the Taxation Act, the Act respecting the Québec sales tax and other legislative provisions; and then, hold public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 14, An Act to facilitate the public administration's digital transformation;

9 May 2019

---

- the Committee on Citizen Relations, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 9, An Act to increase Québec's socio-economic prosperity and adequately meet labour market needs through successful immigrant integration.

And, by leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 143, he convened the following committee:

- the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 16, An Act mainly to regulate building inspections and divided co-ownership, to replace the name and improve the rules of operation of the Régie du logement and to amend the Act respecting the Société d'habitation du Québec and various legislative provisions concerning municipal affairs.

---

## ORDERS OF THE DAY

### Government Bills

#### *Report Stage*

The Assembly resumed the debate, which had been adjourned on 8 May 2019, on consideration of the report from the Committee on Institutions on its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 1, An Act to amend the rules governing the appointment and dismissal of the Anti-Corruption Commissioner, the Director General of the Sûreté du Québec and the Director of Criminal and Penal Prosecutions, together with the amendments transmitted by Mr. Tanguay (LaFontaine) and Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey).

The debate being concluded, the question was put on the amendment by Mr. Tanguay (LaFontaine), and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

9 May 2019

---

At the request of Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, the divisions on the amendments moved by Mr. Tanguay (LaFontaine) and Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and on the report from the Committee on Institutions were deferred until Routine Proceedings on the next sitting day.

*Passage in Principle*

The Assembly resumed the debate, which had been adjourned on 11 May 2019, on the hoist motion moved by Mr. Benjamin (Viau) within the framework of the debate on the passage in principle of Bill 2, An Act to tighten the regulation of cannabis, introduced by Mr. Carmant, Minister for Health and Social Services.

---

At 1.00 o'clock p.m., Mr. Picard, First Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 3.00 o'clock p.m.

---

The proceedings resumed at 3.00 o'clock p.m.

---

The Assembly continued the debate on the hoist motion.

The debate being concluded, the question was put on the hoist motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 99 in Appendix)

Yeas: **31** Nays: **56** Abstentions: **0**

9 May 2019

---

The Assembly continued the debate on the motion moved by Mr. Carmant, Minister for Health and Social Services, for the passage in principle of Bill 2, An Act to tighten the regulation of cannabis.

The debate being concluded, the question was put on the motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

At the request of Mr. Caire, Deputy Government House Leader, the division was deferred until Routine Proceedings on the next sitting day

#### *Report Stage*

The Assembly took into consideration the report from the Committee on Health and Social Services on its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 7, An Act respecting certain terms of employment applicable to officers of the health and social services network.

A debate arose thereon.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 53, the Assembly took Notices of Proceedings in Committees.

#### **Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside section 40 of the Rules for the Conduct of Proceedings governing private bills, Mr. Caire, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committee:

- the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain, to hear the interested parties and give clause-by-clause consideration to Private Bill 200, An Act respecting certain immovables situated on a mining concession of the cadastre of Canton de Bourlamaque, registration division of Abitibi.

9 May 2019

---

The debate continued.

The debate being concluded, the report was concurred in.

*Passage in Principle*

Mrs. LeBel, Minister of Justice, moved that Bill 20, An Act to implement certain recommendations of the 20 August 2018 report of the committee on the remuneration of judges and justices of the peace for 2016–2019, do now pass in principle.

A debate arose thereon.

The debate was adjourned in the name of Mr. Tanguay (LaFontaine).

**Debates upon Adjournment**

At 6.00 o'clock p.m., the Assembly held two debates upon adjournment:

- the first, on a question from Mrs. Melançon (Verdun) to Mrs. Roy, Minister of Culture and Communications, about the Minister's lack of will to defend the interests of Québec creators and artists;
- the second, on a question from Mr. Barrette (La Pinière) to Mr. Bonnardel, Minister of Transport, about the lack of consideration for paratransit users in Bill 17.



**9 May 2019**

---

At 6.25 o'clock p.m., Mrs. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Tuesday, 14 May 2019, at 1.40 o'clock p.m.

**FRANÇOIS PARADIS**

*President*

9 May 2019

---

## APPENDIX

### Recorded Divisions

On the reports from the committees that examined the estimates of expenditure for the fiscal year ending 31 March 2020:

#### (Division No. 93)

##### YEAS - 67

Allaire (CAQ)	Émond (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)
Asselin (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)
Bachand (CAQ)	Foster (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	(Côte-du-Sud)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lavallée (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	(Groulx)	Lecours (CAQ)	(Berthier)
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Girard (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	Provençal (CAQ)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Lecours (CAQ)	Reid (CAQ)
Boulet (CAQ)	Girault (CAQ)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Roberge (CAQ)
Caire (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)
Campeau (CAQ)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Roy (CAQ)
Carmant (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	(Montarville)
Caron (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Charest (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Simard (CAQ)
Charette (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	Skeete (CAQ)
Chassé (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)
Chassin (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	(Lavolette-Saint-Maurice)
D'Amours (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)
Dansereau (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)	(Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata)
Dubé (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	Thouin (CAQ)
Dufour (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	(Soulanges)	Tremblay (CAQ)

##### NAYS - 46

Arcand (QLP)	Fournier (IND)	Massé (QS)	Robitaille (QLP)
Arseneau (PQ)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Melançon (QLP)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Barrette (QLP)	(Jonquière)	Ménard (QLP)	Rousselle (QLP)
Benjamin (QLP)	Ghazal (QS)	Montpetit (QLP)	Roy (PQ)
Bérubé (PQ)	Hivon (PQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	(Bonaventure)
Bimbaum (QLP)	Kelley (QLP)	Nichols (QLP)	Sauvé (QLP)
Charbonneau (QLP)	LeBel (PQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	St-Pierre (QLP)
Ciccone (QLP)	(Rimouski)	Ouellette (IND)	Tanguay (QLP)
David (QLP)	Leduc (QS)	Polo (QLP)	Thériault (QLP)
Derraji (QLP)	Leitão (QLP)	Proulx (QLP)	Weil (QLP)
Dorion (QS)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	(Jean-Talon)	Zanetti (QS)
Fontecilla (QS)	Maccarone (QLP)	Richard (PQ)	
Fortin (QLP)	Marissal (QS)	Rizqy (QLP)	

9 May 2019

---

On the motion moved by Mr. Dubé, Minister Responsible for Government Administration and Chair of the Conseil du trésor:

**(Division No. 94)**

**YEAS - 67**

Allaire (CAQ)	Émond (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)
Asselin (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)
Bachand (CAQ)	Foster (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	(Côte-du-Sud)
Bélangier (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lavallée (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	(Groulx)	Lecours (CAQ)	(Berthier)
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Girard (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	Provençal (CAQ)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Lecours (CAQ)	Reid (CAQ)
Boulet (CAQ)	Girault (CAQ)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Roberge (CAQ)
Caire (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Rouveau (CAQ)
Campeau (CAQ)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Roy (CAQ)
Carmant (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	(Montarville)
Caron (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Charest (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Simard (CAQ)
Charette (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	Skeete (CAQ)
Chassé (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)
Chassin (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	(Lavolette-Saint-Maurice)
D'Amours (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)
Dansereau (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)	(Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata)
Dubé (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	Thouin (CAQ)
Dufour (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	(Soulanges)	Tremblay (CAQ)

**NAYS - 46**

Arcand (QLP)	Fournier (IND)	Massé (QS)	Robitaille (QLP)
Arseneau (PQ)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Melançon (QLP)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Barrette (QLP)	(Jonquière)	Ménard (QLP)	Rousselle (QLP)
Benjamin (QLP)	Ghazal (QS)	Montpetit (QLP)	Roy (PQ)
Bérubé (PQ)	Hivon (PQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	(Bonaventure)
Bimbaum (QLP)	Kelley (QLP)	Nichols (QLP)	Sauvé (QLP)
Charbonneau (QLP)	LeBel (PQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	St-Pierre (QLP)
Ciccone (QLP)	(Rimouski)	Ouellette (IND)	Tanguay (QLP)
David (QLP)	Leduc (QS)	Polo (QLP)	Thériault (QLP)
Derraji (QLP)	Leitão (QLP)	Proulx (QLP)	Weil (QLP)
Dorion (QS)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	(Jean-Talon)	Zanetti (QS)
Fontecilla (QS)	Maccarone (QLP)	Richard (PQ)	
Fortin (QLP)	Marissal (QS)	Rizqy (QLP)	

9 May 2019

---

On the amendment motion moved by Mr. Ouellet (René-Lévesque):

**(Division No. 95)**

**YEAS - 46**

Arcand ( <i>QLP</i> )	Fournier ( <i>IND</i> )	Massé ( <i>QS</i> )	Robitaille ( <i>QLP</i> )
Arseneau ( <i>PQ</i> )	Gaudreault ( <i>PQ</i> )	Melançon ( <i>QLP</i> )	Rotiroti ( <i>QLP</i> )
Barrette ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Jonquière</i> )	Ménard ( <i>QLP</i> )	Rousselle ( <i>QLP</i> )
Benjamin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Ghazal ( <i>QS</i> )	Montpetit ( <i>QLP</i> )	Roy ( <i>PQ</i> )
Bérubé ( <i>PQ</i> )	Hivon ( <i>PQ</i> )	Nadeau-Dubois ( <i>QS</i> )	( <i>Bonaventure</i> )
Birbaum ( <i>QLP</i> )	Kelley ( <i>QLP</i> )	Nichols ( <i>QLP</i> )	Sauvé ( <i>QLP</i> )
Charbonneau ( <i>QLP</i> )	LeBel ( <i>PQ</i> )	Ouellet ( <i>PQ</i> )	St-Pierre ( <i>QLP</i> )
Cicccone ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Rimouski</i> )	Ouellette ( <i>IND</i> )	Tanguay ( <i>QLP</i> )
David ( <i>QLP</i> )	Leduc ( <i>QS</i> )	Polo ( <i>QLP</i> )	Thériault ( <i>QLP</i> )
Derraji ( <i>QLP</i> )	Leitão ( <i>QLP</i> )	Proulx ( <i>QLP</i> )	Weil ( <i>QLP</i> )
Dorion ( <i>QS</i> )	Lessard-Therrien ( <i>QS</i> )	( <i>Jean-Talon</i> )	Zanetti ( <i>QS</i> )
Fontecilla ( <i>QS</i> )	Maccarone ( <i>QLP</i> )	Richard ( <i>PQ</i> )	
Fortin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Marissal ( <i>QS</i> )	Rizqy ( <i>QLP</i> )	

**NAYS - 66**

Allaire ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Fitzgibbon ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lamontagne ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Provençal ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Asselin ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Foster ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lavallée ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Reid ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Bachand ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Girard ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lecours ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Roberge ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Bélanger ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Groulx</i> )	( <i>Les Plaines</i> )	Rouleau ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Blais ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Girard ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lecours ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Roy ( <i>CAQ</i> )
( <i>Abitibi-Ouest</i> )	( <i>Lac-Saint-Jean</i> )	( <i>Lotbinière-Frontenac</i> )	( <i>Montarville</i> )
Bonnardel ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Girault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lefebvre ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Schneeberger ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Boulet ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Grondin ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lemay ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Simard ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Caire ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Guilbault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lemieux ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Skeete ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Campeau ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Guillemette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Tardif ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Carmant ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Hébert ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Chauveau</i> )	( <i>Laviolette-Saint-Maurice</i> )
Caron ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Isabelle ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Tardif ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Charest ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Jacques ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Chapleau</i> )	( <i>Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata</i> )
Charette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Jeannotte ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Martel ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Thouin ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Chassé ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Jolin-Barrette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	McCann ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Tremblay ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Chassin ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Julien ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Picard ( <i>CAQ</i> )	
D'Amours ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lachance ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Soulanges</i> )	
Dansereau ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lacombe ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Poulin ( <i>CAQ</i> )	
Dubé ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Laforest ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Proulx ( <i>CAQ</i> )	
Dufour ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Laframboise ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Côte-du-Sud</i> )	
Émond ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lafrenière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Proulx ( <i>CAQ</i> )	
		( <i>Berthier</i> )	

9 May 2019

---

On the motion moved by Mr. Leitão (Robert-Baldwin):

**(Division No. 96)**

**YEAS - 36**

Arcand ( <i>QLP</i> )	Fortin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Ménard ( <i>QLP</i> )	Robitaille ( <i>QLP</i> )
Arseneau ( <i>PQ</i> )	Gaudreault ( <i>PQ</i> )	Montpetit ( <i>QLP</i> )	Rotiroti ( <i>QLP</i> )
Barrette ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Jonquière</i> )	Nichols ( <i>QLP</i> )	Rousselle ( <i>QLP</i> )
Benjamin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Hivon ( <i>PQ</i> )	Ouellet ( <i>PQ</i> )	Roy ( <i>PQ</i> )
Bérubé ( <i>PQ</i> )	Kelley ( <i>QLP</i> )	Ouellette ( <i>IND</i> )	( <i>Bonaventure</i> )
Birnbaum ( <i>QLP</i> )	LeBel ( <i>PQ</i> )	Polo ( <i>QLP</i> )	Sauvé ( <i>QLP</i> )
Charbonneau ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Rimouski</i> )	Proulx ( <i>QLP</i> )	St-Pierre ( <i>QLP</i> )
Ciccione ( <i>QLP</i> )	Leitão ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Jean-Talon</i> )	Tanguay ( <i>QLP</i> )
David ( <i>QLP</i> )	Maccarone ( <i>QLP</i> )	Richard ( <i>PQ</i> )	Thériault ( <i>QLP</i> )
Derraji ( <i>QLP</i> )	Melançon ( <i>QLP</i> )	Rizqy ( <i>QLP</i> )	Weil ( <i>QLP</i> )

**NAYS - 76**

Allaire ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Fontecilla ( <i>QS</i> )	Lamontagne ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Proulx ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Asselin ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Foster ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lavallée ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Berthier</i> )
Bachand ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Fournier ( <i>IND</i> )	Lecours ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Proulx ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Bélanger ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Ghazal ( <i>QS</i> )	( <i>Les Plaines</i> )	( <i>Côte-du-Sud</i> )
Blais ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Girard ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lecours ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Provençal ( <i>CAQ</i> )
( <i>Abitibi-Ouest</i> )	( <i>Lac-Saint-Jean</i> )	( <i>Lotbinière-Frontenac</i> )	Reid ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Bonnardel ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Girard ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Leduc ( <i>QS</i> )	Roberge ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Boulet ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Groulx</i> )	Lefebvre ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Rouleau ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Caire ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Girault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lemay ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Roy ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Campeau ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Grondin ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lemieux ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Montarville</i> )
Carmant ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Guilbault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lessard-Therrien ( <i>QS</i> )	Schneeberger ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Caron ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Guillemette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Simard ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Charest ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Hébert ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Chauveau</i> )	Skeete ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Charette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Isabelle ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Tardif ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Chassé ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Jacques ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Chapleau</i> )	( <i>Laviolette-Saint-Maurice</i> )
Chassin ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Jeannotte ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Marissal ( <i>QS</i> )	Tardif ( <i>CAQ</i> )
D'Amours ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Jolin-Barrette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Martel ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata</i> )
Dansereau ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Julien ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Massé ( <i>QS</i> )	Thouin ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Dorion ( <i>QS</i> )	Lachance ( <i>CAQ</i> )	McCann ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Tremblay ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Dubé ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lacombe ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Nadeau-Dubois ( <i>QS</i> )	Zanetti ( <i>QS</i> )
Dufour ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Laforest ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Picard ( <i>CAQ</i> )	
Émond ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Laframboise ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Soulanges</i> )	
Fitzgibbon ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lafrenière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Poulin ( <i>CAQ</i> )	

9 May 2019

---

On the motion moved by Mr. Leitão (Robert-Baldwin), together with Mr. Marissal (Rosemont), Mr. Ouellet (René-Lévesque), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin):

**(Division No. 97)**

**YEAS - 111**

Allaire (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)
Arcand (QLP)	Fontecilla (QS)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	(Côte-du-Sud)
Arseneau (PQ)	Fortin (QLP)	Lecours (CAQ)	Proulx (QLP)
Asselin (CAQ)	Foster (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	(Jean-Talon)
Bachand (CAQ)	Fournier (IND)	Leduc (QS)	Provençal (CAQ)
Barrette (QLP)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Reid (CAQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)	(Jonquière)	Leitão (QLP)	Rizqy (QLP)
Benjamin (QLP)	Ghazal (QS)	Lemay (CAQ)	Roberge (CAQ)
Bérubé (PQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Robitaille (QLP)
Bimbaum (QLP)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Blais (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)
(Abitibi-Ouest)	(Groulx)	(Chauveau)	Rousselle (QLP)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Girault (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Roy (PQ)
Boulet (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	(Bonaventure)
Caire (CAQ)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Maccarone (QLP)	Roy (CAQ)
Campeau (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	Marissal (QS)	(Montarville)
Carmant (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Sauvé (QLP)
Caron (CAQ)	Hivon (PQ)	Massé (QS)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Charbonneau (QLP)	Isabelle (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)	Simard (CAQ)
Charest (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Melançon (QLP)	Skeete (CAQ)
Charette (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Ménard (QLP)	St-Pierre (QLP)
Chassé (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Montpetit (QLP)	Tanguay (QLP)
Chassin (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	Tardif (CAQ)
Ciccone (QLP)	Kelley (QLP)	Nichols (QLP)	(Lavolette-Saint-Maurice)
D'Amours (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	Tardif (CAQ)
Dansereau (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Ouellette (IND)	(Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata)
David (QLP)	Laforest (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	Thériault (QLP)
Derraji (QLP)	Laframboise (CAQ)	(Soulanges)	Thouin (CAQ)
Dorion (QS)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Polo (QLP)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Dubé (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)	Weil (QLP)
Dufour (CAQ)	Lavallée (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)	Zanetti (QS)
Émond (CAQ)	LeBel (PQ)	(Berthier)	
	(Rimouski)		

9 May 2019

On the motion moved by Mr. Leduc (Hochelega-Maisonneuve), together with Mr. Boulet, Minister of Labour, Employment and Social Solidarity, Mrs. Sauvé (Fabre), Mr. LeBel (Rimouski), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin):

(Division No. 98)

YEAS - 112

Allaire (CAQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	Lecours (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Arcand (QLP)	Fortin (QLP)	(Les Plaines)	Reid (CAQ)
Arseneau (PQ)	Foster (CAQ)	Leduc (QS)	Richard (PQ)
Asselin (CAQ)	Fournier (IND)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Rizqy (QLP)
Bachand (CAQ)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Leitão (QLP)	Roberge (CAQ)
Barrette (QLP)	(Jonquière)	Lemay (CAQ)	Robitaille (QLP)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Ghazal (QS)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Benjamin (QLP)	Girard (CAQ)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	Rouleau (CAQ)
Bérubé (PQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Rousselle (QLP)
Birnbaum (QLP)	Girard (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	Roy (PQ)
Blais (CAQ)	(Groulx)	Lévesque (CAQ)	(Bonaventure)
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Girault (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Roy (CAQ)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	Maccarone (QLP)	(Montarville)
Boulet (CAQ)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Marissal (QS)	Sauvé (QLP)
Caire (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Campeau (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Massé (QS)	Simard (CAQ)
Carmant (CAQ)	Hivon (PQ)	McCann (CAQ)	Skeete (CAQ)
Caron (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	Melançon (QLP)	St-Pierre (QLP)
Charbonneau (QLP)	Jacques (CAQ)	Ménard (QLP)	Tanguay (QLP)
Charest (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Montpetit (QLP)	Tardif (CAQ)
Charette (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	(Lavolette-Saint-Maurice)
Chassé (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Nichols (QLP)	Tardif (CAQ)
Chassin (CAQ)	Kelley (QLP)	Ouellet (PQ)	(Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata)
Ciccone (QLP)	Lachance (CAQ)	Ouellette (IND)	Thériault (QLP)
D'Amours (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	Thouin (CAQ)
Dansereau (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	(Soulanges)	Tremblay (CAQ)
David (QLP)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Polo (QLP)	Weil (QLP)
Derraji (QLP)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)	Zanetti (QS)
Dorion (QS)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)	
Dubé (CAQ)	Lavallée (CAQ)	(Berthier)	
Dufour (CAQ)	LeBel (PQ)	Proulx (CAQ)	
Émond (CAQ)	(Rimouski)	(Côte-du-Sud)	
Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Proulx (QLP)	
	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	(Jean-Talon)	

9 May 2019

---

On the hoist motion moved by Mr. Benjamin (Viau):

**(Division No. 99)**

**YEAS - 31**

Arseneau (PQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	Montpetit (QLP)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Barrette (QLP)	Ghazal (QS)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	Rousselle (QLP)
Benjamin (QLP)	Kelley (QLP)	Ouellet (PQ)	Sauvé (QLP)
Birnbaum (QLP)	Leduc (QS)	Polo (QLP)	St-Pierre (QLP)
Charbonneau (QLP)	Leitão (QLP)	Proulx (QLP)	Tanguay (QLP)
Ciccone (QLP)	Maccarone (QLP)	(Jean-Talon)	Thériault (QLP)
David (QLP)	Melançon (QLP)	Rizqy (QLP)	Weil (QLP)
Derraji (QLP)	Ménard (QLP)	Robitaille (QLP)	Zanetti (QS)

**NAYS - 56**

Allaire (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Roberge (CAQ)
Bachand (CAQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Rouleau (CAQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Roy (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	(Montarville)
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Hébert (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Simard (CAQ)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Skeete (CAQ)
Boulet (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Tardif (CAQ)
Caire (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	(Lavolette-Saint-Maurice)
Campeau (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)
Caron (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	(Rivière-du-Loup- Témiscouata)
Chassé (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	(Soulanges)	Thouin (CAQ)
Chassin (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)
D'Amours (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)	
Dansereau (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	(Côte-du-Sud)	
Dubé (CAQ)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)	
Dufour (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	(Berthier)	
Émond (CAQ)	Lavallée (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)	
Foster (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Reid (CAQ)	
	(Les Plaines)		