



---

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF QUÉBEC

---

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-SECOND LEGISLATURE

## **Votes and Proceedings**

**of the Assembly**

**Wednesday, 9 October 2019 — No. 69**

**President of the National Assembly:  
Mr. François Paradis**

---



The Assembly was called to order at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

---

## **ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

### **Statements by Members**

Mr. Lévesque (Chauveau) made a statement to pay tribute to the volunteers, workers and management of the organization Aide à la communauté et services à domicile.

---

Mrs. Nichols (Vaudreuil) made a statement to congratulate the organization A Horse Tale on winning the Hero of the Horse Award.

---

Mr. Lévesque (Chapleau) made a statement to underline the 40th anniversary of Coopérative funéraire de l'Outaouais.

---

Mrs. Robitaille (Bourassa-Sauvé) made a statement to underline the 10th anniversary of Montréal-Nord's neighbourhood round table and the publication of its white paper "Oser ensemble le changement".

---

**9 October 2019**

---

Mrs. Chassé (Châteauguay) made a statement to underline the 75th anniversary of the Royal Canadian Legion – Branch 108.

---

Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) made a statement to support Rimouski's bid to host the Jeux du Québec.

---

Mrs. Hébert (Saint-François) made a statement to congratulate the company Fromagerie La Station, winner of numerous competitions.

---

Mr. Tardif (Rivière-du-Loup–Témiscouata) made a statement to pay tribute to the Rivière-du-Loup 3L hockey team for raising funds for the Quebec Breast Cancer Foundation.

---

Mr. Allaire (Maskinongé) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Réjean Beaudoin, Grand Master of the Confrérie des Sarrasins.

---

At 9.51 o'clock a.m., Mrs. Soucy, Second Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

---

The proceedings resumed at 10.01 o'clock a.m.

---

9 October 2019

---

Moment of reflection

### Introduction of Bills

Mrs. McCann, Minister of Health and Social Services, moved that leave be granted to introduce the following bill:

- 43      An Act to amend the Nurses Act and other provisions in order to facilitate access to health services

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, Bill 43 was introduced in the Assembly.

### Presenting Papers

Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, tabled the following:

The 2018–2019 annual management report of the Institut de la statistique du Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1055-20191009)

---

Mr. Dubé, Minister Responsible for Government Administration and Chair of the Conseil du trésor, tabled the following:

The report concerning the application of the *Act respecting contracting by public bodies*, for the period from 1 April 2014 to 31 March 2019;

(Sessional Paper No. 1056-20191009)

The independent report on implementation of the *Act respecting contracting by public bodies*, dated 8 March 2019.

(Sessional Paper No. 1057-20191009)

---

**9 October 2019**

---

Mr. Boulet, Minister of Labour, Employment and Social Solidarity, tabled the following:

The 2018–2019 activity report of the Fonds de développement et de reconnaissance des compétences de la main-d'œuvre;  
(Sessional Paper No. 1058-20191009)

The 2018–2019 activity report of the Comité consultatif de lutte contre la pauvreté et l'exclusion sociale;  
(Sessional Paper No. 1059-20191009)

The 2018–2019 annual report of the Commission des partenaires du marché du travail.  
(Sessional Paper No. 1060-20191009)

---

The President tabled the following:

The 2018–2019 activity and management report of the Commission des droits de la personne et des droits de la jeunesse.  
(Sessional Paper No. 1061-20191009)

### **Presenting Reports from Committees**

Mr. Simard (Montmorency), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Public Finance, which met on 8 October 2019 for clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 36, An Act to amend the Companies Act concerning participation in and decision making at meetings of legal persons without share capital. The report does not contain amendments to the bill.  
(Sessional Paper No. 1062-20191009)

---

**9 October 2019**

---

Mr. Provençal (Beauce-Nord), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Health and Social Services, which held public hearings on 2, 3 and 8 October 2019 within the framework of special consultations on Bill 31, An Act to amend mainly the Pharmacy Act to facilitate access to certain services.

(Sessional Paper No. 1063-20191009)

### **Presenting Petitions**

Mr. Laframboise (Blainville) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on the flood management and assistance program for Oka and Saint-Placide victims, signed by 122 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1064-20191009)

### **Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

At the end of Oral Question Period, the President made a statement to reiterate the importance of respecting the Assembly's rules of conduct that prohibit applause or any other form of demonstrativeness in order to maintain decorum.

### **Motions Without Notice**

Mrs. Dorion (Taschereau), together with Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved a motion on section 1 of Bill 104, An Act to amend the Charter of the French language; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

**9 October 2019**

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mrs. Hivon (Joliette), together with Mrs. Laforest, Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing, Mrs. St-Pierre (Acadie), Mr. Fontecilla (Laurier-Dorion) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly reiterate that Québec has exclusive jurisdiction over housing and that Québec is therefore best positioned to understand social housing needs within its boundaries;

THAT it denounce the Federal Government's meddling in Québec's exclusive area of jurisdiction;

THAT the National Assembly reiterate its wish that the Federal Government commit to transferring, without conditions, the sums provided for in the National Housing Strategy to Québec programs so they can be used in accordance with the priorities that Québec has established in this area.

The question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **193** in Appendix)

Yeas: **109**   Nays: **0**   Abstentions: **0**

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Roberge, Minister of Education and Higher Education, together with Mrs. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent), Mrs. Labrie (Sherbrooke), Mrs. Hivon (Joliette) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly mark the 10th anniversary of the Semaine pour l'école publique, whose theme is "Notre école publique, on l'aime!", organized by the Fédération autonome de l'enseignement;



**9 October 2019**

---

That it join the federation's spokesperson, Philippe Laprise, in celebrating the successes, big and small, of public school staff members and students – both children and adults;

THAT the National Assembly recognize public schools' essential role as a vehicle for equal opportunity and social justice in Québec by providing free, accessible and universal education;

THAT the National Assembly recognize the exceptional contribution of public schools toward developing Québec society.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

---

Mr. Birnbaum (D'Arcy-McGee), together with Mr. Roy (Bonaventure) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved a motion on the tabling of the report from the Public Inquiry Commission on relations between Indigenous Peoples and certain public services in Québec; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

---

Pursuant to Standing Order 186, Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, moved:

THAT the order adopted by the Assembly on 8 October 2019 instructing the Committee on Public Finance to hold special consultations and public hearings within the framework of the consideration of Bill 38, An Act amending certain Acts establishing public sector pension plans, be rescinded.

The motion was carried.

**9 October 2019**

---

**Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

- the Committee on Culture and Education, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 5, An Act to amend the Education Act and other provisions regarding preschool education services for students 4 years of age;
- the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 16, An Act mainly to regulate building inspections and divided co-ownership, to replace the name and improve the rules of operation of the Régie du logement and to amend the Act respecting the Société d’habitation du Québec and various legislative provisions concerning municipal affairs;
- the Committee on Transportation and the Environment, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 17, An Act respecting remunerated passenger transportation by automobile.

---

The President gave the following notice:

- the Committee on Public Administration shall hold a deliberative meeting to prepare the hearing on Chapter 5 entitled “Computer Recovery” and Chapter 7 entitled “Information Technology Contracts – Follow-Up on a Special Audit” of the Auditor General of Québec’s May 2018 report; then, hold a public meeting to hear the Auditor General of Québec; and finally, hold a deliberative meeting to discuss the Committee’s observations, conclusions and recommendations, if any, following this hearing.
-

9 October 2019

---

## ORDERS OF THE DAY

### Government Bills

#### *Passage in Principle*

The Assembly resumed the debate, which had been adjourned on 8 October 2019, on the motion moved by Mr. Julien, Minister of Energy and Natural Resources, that Bill 34, An Act to simplify the process for establishing electricity distribution rates, do now pass in principle.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 100, Mr. Nadeau-Dubois, House Leader of the Second Opposition Group, moved the adjournment of the debate.

A debate arose thereon.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 53 and 59, Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière) tabled the following:

A copy of a graph showing the evolution of inflation and energy prices in Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1065-20191009)

The debate being concluded, the question was put on the motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **194** in Appendix)

Yeas: **39**   Nays: **67**   Abstentions: **0**

The Assembly continued the debate on the motion moved by Mr. Julien, Minister of Energy and Natural Resources, that Bill 34, An Act to simplify the process for establishing electricity distribution rates, do now pass in principle.

**9 October 2019**

---

A debate arose thereon.

At 1.00 o'clock p.m., Mrs. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 3.00 o'clock p.m.

Accordingly, pursuant to Standing Order 97, the debate on the motion moved by Mr. Julien, Minister of Energy and Natural Resources, was adjourned in the name of Mrs. Richard (Duplessis).

---

The proceedings resumed at 3.00 o'clock p.m.

---

### **Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition**

Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin) moved:

THAT the National Assembly pledge to endow Québec with a formal Québec constitution before the end of the current legislature.

Mrs. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, informed the Assembly of the allocation of speaking time for the proceedings with respect to this limited debate: 10 minutes to the mover of the motion for her reply; 48 minutes 30 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Government; 28 minutes 54 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition; 10 minutes 19 seconds to the Second Opposition Group; 9 minutes 17 seconds to the Third Opposition Group; and 13 minutes to independent Members. However, the Member for Chomedey is allotted a speaking time of 1 minute 30 seconds. Within this framework, any time not used by the independent Members or by a parliamentary group shall be redistributed among the parliamentary groups in the proportions established above. Lastly, individual addresses shall not be limited.

A debate arose thereon.

**9 October 2019**

---

At the end of her address, Mrs. LeBel, Minister of Justice, moved:

THAT the motion moved by the Member for Marie-Victorin be amended as follows:

- 1) By replacing the words “pledge to” by “ask the Government to assess the proposal to”;
- 2) By removing the words “formal” and “before the end of the current legislature”.

The motion, as amended, would read as follows:

THAT the National Assembly ask the Government to assess the proposal to endow Québec with a Québec constitution.

The debate continued on the main motion moved by Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin) and on the amendment motion moved by Mrs. LeBel, Minister of Justice, subject to the permission of its author.

At the end of her address, Mrs. St-Pierre (Acadie) moved:

THAT the motion moved by the Member for Marie-Victorin be amended as follows:

By replacing the words “before the end of the current legislature” after the word “constitution” in the second line by the words “adopted unanimously by the Members of the National Assembly, following a process also determined unanimously by the Members of the National Assembly”.

The motion, as amended, would read as follows:

THAT the National Assembly pledge to endow Québec with a formal Québec constitution adopted unanimously by the Members of the National Assembly, following a process also determined unanimously by the Members of the National Assembly.

The debate continued on the main motion moved by Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin) and on the amendment motions moved by Mrs. LeBel, Minister of Justice, and Mrs. St-Pierre (Acadie), subject to the permission of its author.

**9 October 2019**

---

At the end of his address, Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage) moved:

THAT the motion moved by the Member for Marie-Victorin be amended as follows:

By adding the following paragraph after the first paragraph: “THAT it consequently pass an Act establishing a constituent assembly mandated to draft the constitution for an independent Québec”.

The motion, as amended, would read as follows:

THAT the National Assembly pledge to endow Québec with a formal Québec constitution before the end of the current legislature;

THAT it consequently pass an Act establishing a constituent assembly mandated to draft the constitution for an independent Québec.

The debate continued on the main motion moved by Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin) and on the amendment motions moved by Mrs. LeBel, Minister of Justice, Mrs. St-Pierre (Acadie) and Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), subject to the permission of its author.

Pursuant to Standing Order 98.1, Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin) refused the amendments proposed by Mrs. St-Pierre (Acadie) and Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage) and accepted the amendment proposed by Mrs. LeBel, Minister of Justice.

The debate being concluded, the question was put on this motion; a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

At the request of Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, the divisions on the amendment motion moved by Mrs. LeBel, Minister of Justice, and on the motion moved by Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin) were deferred until Routine Proceedings on the next sitting day.

**9 October 2019**

---

**Government Bills**

*Passage in Principle*

Mr. Fitzgibbon, Minister of Economy and Innovation, moved that Bill 27, An Act respecting mainly government organization as regards the economy and innovation, do now pass in principle.

A debate arose thereon.

The debate was adjourned in the name of Mrs. Anglade (Saint-Henri–Sainte-Anne).

---

Accordingly, at 18.00 o'clock p.m., Mr. Picard, First Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Thursday, 10 October 2019 at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

**FRANÇOIS PARADIS**

*President*

9 October 2019

## APPENDIX

### Recorded Divisions

On the motion moved by Mrs. Hivon (Joliette), together with Mrs. Laforest, Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing, Mrs. St-Pierre (Acadie), Mr. Fontecilla (Laurier-Dorion) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin):

#### (Division No. 193)

#### YEAS - 109

Allaire (CAQ)	Dubé (CAQ)	LeBel (PQ)	Proulx (CAQ)
Anglade (QLP)	Dufour (CAQ)	(Rimouski)	(Côte-du-Sud)
Arcand (QLP)	Émond (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Arseneau (PQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Reid (CAQ)
Asselin (CAQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	Lecours (CAQ)	Richard (PQ)
Bachand (CAQ)	Foster (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	Rizqy (QLP)
Barrette (QLP)	Fournier (IND)	Leduc (QS)	Roberge (CAQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Robitaille (QLP)
Benjamin (QLP)	(Jonquière)	Leitão (QLP)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Bérubé (PQ)	Ghazal (QS)	Lemay (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)
Birnbaum (QLP)	Girard (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Rousselle (QLP)
Blais (CAQ)	(Groulx)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	Roy (CAQ)
(Prévost)	Girault (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	(Montarville)
Blais (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Samson (CAQ)
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Sauvé (QLP)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Boulet (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Maccarone (QLP)	Simard (CAQ)
Bussière (CAQ)	Hivon (PQ)	Marissal (QS)	St-Pierre (QLP)
Caire (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Tanguay (QLP)
Campeau (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Massé (QS)	Tardif (CAQ)
Carmant (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)	(Laviolette-Saint-Maurice)
Caron (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Ménard (QLP)	Tardif (CAQ)
Charbonneau (QLP)	Julien (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	(Rivière-du-Loup- Témiscouata)
Charest (CAQ)	Kelley (QLP)	Nichols (QLP)	Thériault (QLP)
Charette (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Ouellet (PQ)	Thouin (CAQ)
Chassé (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Chassin (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	Weil (QLP)
Ciccone (QLP)	Laframboise (CAQ)	(Soulanges)	Zanetti (QS)
D'Amours (CAQ)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Polo (QLP)	
Dansereau (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)	
Derraji (QLP)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)	
Dorion (QS)	LeBel (CAQ)	(Berthier)	
	(Champlain)		



9 October 2019

---

On the motion moved by Mr. Nadeau-Dubois, House Leader of the Second Opposition Group:

**(Division No. 194)**

**YEAS - 39**

Anglade ( <i>QLP</i> )	Ghazal ( <i>QS</i> )	Massé ( <i>QS</i> )	Rousselle ( <i>QLP</i> )
Arcand ( <i>QLP</i> )	Hivon ( <i>PQ</i> )	Ménard ( <i>QLP</i> )	Sauvé ( <i>QLP</i> )
Arseneau ( <i>PQ</i> )	Kelley ( <i>QLP</i> )	Nadeau-Dubois ( <i>QS</i> )	St-Pierre ( <i>QLP</i> )
Barrette ( <i>QLP</i> )	Labrie ( <i>QS</i> )	Nichols ( <i>QLP</i> )	Tanguay ( <i>QLP</i> )
Benjamin ( <i>QLP</i> )	LeBel ( <i>PQ</i> )	Ouellet ( <i>PQ</i> )	Thériault ( <i>QLP</i> )
Charbonneau ( <i>QLP</i> )	( <i>Rimouski</i> )	Perry Mélançon ( <i>PQ</i> )	Weil ( <i>QLP</i> )
Ciccone ( <i>QLP</i> )	Leduc ( <i>QS</i> )	Polo ( <i>QLP</i> )	Zanetti ( <i>QS</i> )
Derraji ( <i>QLP</i> )	Leitão ( <i>QLP</i> )	Richard ( <i>PQ</i> )	
Dorion ( <i>QS</i> )	Lessard-Therrien ( <i>QS</i> )	Rizqy ( <i>QLP</i> )	
Fontecilla ( <i>QS</i> )	Maccarone ( <i>QLP</i> )	Robitaille ( <i>QLP</i> )	
Gaudreault ( <i>PQ</i> )	Marissal ( <i>QS</i> )	Rotiroti ( <i>QLP</i> )	
( <i>Jonquière</i> )			

**NAYS - 67**

Allaire ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Dubé ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lamontagne ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Proulx ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Asselin ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Dufour ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lamothe ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Berthier</i> )
Bachand ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Émond ( <i>CAQ</i> )	LeBel ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Provençal ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Bélanger ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Fitzgibbon ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Champlain</i> )	Reid ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Blais ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Foster ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lecours ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Roberge ( <i>CAQ</i> )
( <i>Prévost</i> )	Girard ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Lotbinière-Frontenac</i> )	Rouleau ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Blais ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Groulx</i> )	Lecours ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Roy ( <i>CAQ</i> )
( <i>Abitibi-Ouest</i> )	Girault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Les Plaines</i> )	( <i>Montarville</i> )
Bonnardel ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Grondin ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lefebvre ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Samson ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Boulet ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Guilbault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Legault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Schneeberger ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Bussière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Guillemette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lemay ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Simard ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Caire ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Hébert ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lemieux ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Tardif ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Campeau ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Isabelle ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Laviolette-Saint-Maurice</i> )
Carmant ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Jacques ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Chauveau</i> )	Tardif ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Caron ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Jeannotte ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata</i> )
Charest ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Jolin-Barrette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Chapleau</i> )	Thouin ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Charette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Julien ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Martel ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Tremblay ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Chassé ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lacombe ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Picard ( <i>CAQ</i> )	
Chassin ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Laforest ( <i>CAQ</i> )	( <i>Soulanges</i> )	
D'Amours ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Laframboise ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Poulin ( <i>CAQ</i> )	
Dansereau ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lafrenière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Proulx ( <i>CAQ</i> )	
		( <i>Côte-du-Sud</i> )	