



NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF QUÉBEC

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-SECOND LEGISLATURE

Votes and Proceedings

of the Assembly

Thursday, 14 November 2019 — No. 82

**President of the National Assembly:
Mr. François Paradis**

The Assembly was called to order at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS

Statements by Members

Mr. Lacombe (Papineau) made a statement to underline the 100th anniversary of the Knights of Columbus of Buckingham – Council 2056.

Mr. Bonnardel (Granby) made a statement to underline the 35th anniversary of the Centre de prévention du suicide de la Haute-Yamaska.

Mr. Picard (Chutes-de-la-Chaudière) made a statement to underline the success of the Friendship breakfasts held by the Knights of Columbus of Charny – Council 6852.

Mrs. Ménard (Laporte) made a statement to underline the Association des retraitées et retraités de l'éducation et des autres services publics du Québec's public awareness activity on recycling.

Mrs. Robitaille (Bourassa-Sauvé) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. J. René Labelle, World War II veteran.

14 November 2019

Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) made a statement to underline Social Economy Month.

Mrs. Guilbault (Louis-Hébert) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Alexandre Thivierge for his community involvement.

Mr. Marissal (Rosemont) made a statement to underline the 40th anniversary of the Association québécoise de défense des droits des personnes retraitées et préretraitées.

Mr. Lévesque (Chapleau) made a statement to underline the 40th anniversary of the Académie de danse de l'Outaouais.

Mrs. Lecours (Les Plaines) made a statement to pay tribute to the members of the Cercle de fermières La Plaine for their community involvement.

At 9.52 o'clock a.m., Mrs. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

The proceedings resumed at 10.02 o'clock a.m.

14 November 2019

Moment of reflection

Introduction of Bills

Mr. Charette, Minister of the Environment and the Fight Against Climate Change, moved that leave be granted to introduce the following bill:

46 An Act to amend the Natural Heritage Conservation Act and other provisions

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, Bill 46 was introduced in the Assembly.

Mrs. Nichols (Vaudreuil) moved that leave be granted to introduce the following bill:

397 An Act to reinforce oversight of the processes to select, renew a term of or dismiss directors of municipal police forces

The question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **243** in Appendix)

Yeas: **106** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

Accordingly, Bill 397 was introduced in the Assembly.

14 November 2019

Mr. Marissal (Rosemont) moved that leave be granted to introduce the following bill:

496 Parliamentary Budget Officer Act

The question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **244** in Appendix)

Yeas: **108** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

Accordingly, Bill 496 was introduced in the Assembly.

The President communicated to the Assembly, and then tabled, the Law Clerk's report on the following private bill:

207 An Act respecting Ville de Murdochville

The report states that the notice was drafted and published in accordance with the Rules for the Conduct of Proceedings governing private bills.

(Sessional Paper No. 1169-2091114)

Mrs. Perry Mélançon (Gaspé) moved that leave be granted to introduce Private Bill 207, An Act respecting Ville de Murdochville.

The motion was carried.

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, moved that Private Bill 207 be referred to the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain for consultation and clause-by-clause consideration and that the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing be a member of the said Committee during its proceedings with respect to this order of reference.

The motion was carried.

Presenting Reports from Committees

Mrs. Thériault (Anjou–Louis-Riel), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Culture and Education, which held public hearings on 4, 5, 6, 7, 11, 12 and 13 November 2019 within the framework of special consultations on Bill 40, An Act to amend mainly the Education Act with regard to school organization and governance.

(Sessional Paper No. 1170-20191114)

Mr. Provençal (Beauce-Nord), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Health and Social Services, which held public hearings on 12 and 13 November 2019 within the framework of special consultations on Bill 43, An Act to amend the Nurses Act and other provisions in order to facilitate access to health services.

(Sessional Paper No. 1171-20191114)

Presenting Petitions

Mrs. Melançon (Verdun) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on an intervention in the municipal management of Saint-Élie-de-Caxton, signed by 802 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1172-20191114)

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mrs. Melançon (Verdun) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on an intervention in the municipal management of Saint-Élie-de-Caxton, signed by 262 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1173-20191114)

14 November 2019

Complaints of Breach of Privilege or Contempt and Personal Explanations

The President ruled on the point of privilege or contempt raised on 29 October 2019 by Mr. Ouellet, House Leader of the Third Opposition Group, in respect of the arguments Hydro-Québec presented before the Régie de l'énergie with regard to Bill 34, An Act to simplify the process for establishing electricity distribution rates, within the context of a request for an adjustment of electricity rates for the year 2020–2021.

RULING FROM THE CHAIR

The Standing Orders provide that a Member may not refer to any matter that is under adjudication before a court of law where such reference may be prejudicial to the interest of any person or party. Civil or administrative cases may be referred to in a general manner, but it is prohibited to make remarks that could be prejudicial to any person when broaching the core of the matter.

This rule stems from parliamentary tradition and establishes the deference the Assembly is committed to demonstrating regarding ongoing litigation, in keeping with the principle of the separation of powers. However, the Assembly must be able to fulfill its constitutional role and exercise its jurisdiction in relation to violations of rights and privileges.

Indeed, parliamentarians must be allowed to examine the evidence submitted in support of a question raised on a violation of rights and privileges, even documents produced in court. However, such an examination must be limited to what is necessary to rule on the questions raised and should avoid, as much as possible, broaching the core of the matter under litigation in any way that could be prejudicial to one of the parties.

Our intention is not to determine an issue to be adjudicated by the Régie de l'énergie. However, the Chair may analyze the manner in which the Assembly's role is characterized within the context of proceedings before the court. The analysis of an issue relating to contempt of Parliament is under the exclusive jurisdiction of the Assembly, regardless of the forum in which it is alleged that an act of contempt has been committed.

According to parliamentary jurisprudence, contempt of Parliament is any act or omission that has the effect of undermining the authority or dignity of the Assembly or of its Members or that has the effect of discrediting them. More specifically, parliamentary jurisprudence recognizes that there may be contempt when persons knowingly prevail themselves of legislative provisions yet to be assented to or act manifestly as if a bill had come into force.

First of all, the press release issued by Hydro-Québec on 29 October 2019 was published in reaction to information released by a stakeholder regarding the effects of Bill 34. The text of the press release does nothing more than set out what is provided for in the bill, without ever insinuating that the bill was assented to. It is, therefore, simply part of the debate in which differing points of view are expressed on the bill's appropriateness. This does not constitute contempt of Parliament.

Moreover, the representations mentioned by the House Leader of the Third Opposition Group came from one of the Régie de l'énergie's files, which had been opened following the request of three associations to set electricity rates for the 2020–2021 tariff year.

The first of the representations quoted by the Leader was taken from a letter, dated 3 October 2019, sent by Hydro-Québec's attorneys to the Régie de l'énergie. In the letter, Hydro-Québec states that it wants to present arguments before the Régie regarding Bill 34's potential legal impact in the context of the request to set electricity rates. More specifically, it announces that Hydro-Québec intends to ask the Régie to declare that the request is not receivable or, alternatively, to suspend its examination of the request. The Chair indicates that it is commonplace, in quasi-judicial proceedings, to present a main argument and an alternative argument in such a manner. These representations must be considered as a whole, since they were made in the course of a single proceeding.

Hydro-Québec's position is specified in a second letter, dated 7 October 2019, in which it affirms that passage of Bill 34 is imminent and that, once passed, the associations' request to set electricity rates for 2020–2021 will be void.

Finally, the essence of the state-owned enterprise's representations is expressed in a third document—the argumentation outline—tabled at the 24 October 2019 hearing before the Régie de l'énergie. The House Leader of the Third Opposition Group quoted many excerpts from that argumentation outline.

On reading these passages, the Chair understands that certain parliamentarians felt indignation and viewed the passages as lacking consideration for and discrediting the important work they accomplish when considering a bill in the Assembly. Implying that a bill has force of law while it has not yet been passed or invoking legislative provisions that are still undergoing consideration could constitute *prima facie* contempt of Parliament. In addition, presenting the passage of a bill as a *fait accompli*, thereby entirely ignoring parliamentarians' role, could be considered as an act that undermines the dignity and authority of the Assembly and its Members.

When examining such an issue, the Chair must take into account the circumstances surrounding the communication of information, as contempt should only pertain to serious actions. In a case where a minister issued a press release about a motion being carried unanimously while the vote on the motion was still underway, the Chair put this incident down to bungling rather than a deliberate attempt to undermine the authority and dignity of the Assembly and its Members. The Chair must therefore thoroughly analyze the facts and the actions regarding the communication of information before concluding, *prima facie*, that contempt of Parliament occurred.

In the case at hand, the context specific to the case before the Régie must be taken into account. In its argumentation outline, Hydro-Québec also sets out the criteria that the Régie must consider in its analysis of a tariff application, namely, the timeliness of the application, whether it is in the public interest and whether it is likely to have a significant impact on the stakeholders concerned.

The excerpts mentioned above must therefore be read in the context of a targeted argumentation on a point of law, presented in support of an argument before the adjudicating officers of an administrative tribunal. The latter are fully capable of sorting out and weighing contradictory representations made before them. Accordingly, the lack of restraint in the contentions put forth by the representative of Hydro-Québec does not, in any way, result in giving immediate effect to the provisions contained in the bill.

The Chair would like to recall that a bill will produce legal effects only once it has passed all the stages of the legislative process and has come into force. It was therefore inappropriate to state that Bill 34 sets any rates whatsoever. At best, one could say that it proposes to set those rates, but even that statement would have to specifically mention that the latter is subject to the decision of the Assembly.

14 November 2019

As regards the time at which the legislative process is slated to end, the Assembly has sole jurisdiction in determining the conduct of its proceedings. To assert anything else is not only disrespectful toward parliamentarians, but also toward the citizens who elected their representatives to exercise the important function of legislator. While the bill might be passed within the time period mentioned by Hydro-Québec, it is also possible that it will only be passed later on, or maybe not at all. It is solely the prerogative of parliamentarians, as the voice of democracy expresses itself through their proceedings.

Moreover, the state-owned enterprise itself recognizes that the fate of the bill remains unknown to this day. It would have been preferable for the state-owned enterprise to adopt this tone, namely with the necessary restraint, throughout its representations.

This holds true with regard to the description of the text of the bill presented in the argumentation outline, which implies that the content of a number of sections will be the same at the outcome of the legislative process. This point of view shows a blatant ignorance of the way in which Parliament operates, given that it nonetheless plays a central and essential role in legislative matters.

Indeed, almost all bills are the object of proposed amendments during the legislative process. Not all are adopted, but the vast majority of bills see their text modified at various levels between introduction and passage, which is also true in the context of a majority government. It is therefore unwise to make representations that lack nuance and that are founded solely on the bill's content upon its introduction.

As there can be no certainty that a bill introduced in the Assembly will be passed or as to its contents at the time of its passage, communications regarding the legislative process should be worded with restraint and clearly specify the role to be played by the Assembly and its Members.

In a letter tabled at the sitting of 5 November 2019, Me Pierre Gagnon, Vice-President of Hydro-Québec, presented apologies on behalf of the state-owned enterprise. He also contended that their representations, taken as a whole, showed that Hydro-Québec representatives demonstrated the expected deference many times.

14 November 2019

The Chair acknowledges the apologies made by the state-owned enterprise and the points raised in response to the concerns voiced by parliamentarians. If Hydro-Québec had used the tone found in the excerpts put forth in the 5 November 2019 letter throughout its representations, the issue likely would not have been taken up by the Chair.

For these reasons, the facts analyzed do not give rise to contempt of Parliament.

However, the Chair gives two warnings.

Firstly, it is quite possible to vigorously argue a position such as the position Hydro-Québec wished to defend, but it is then necessary to carefully choose the terms used so as to underscore the role Parliament plays rather than mention it in passing. Anyone who, in the future, is called upon to defend such a position is therefore invited to do so with consideration for and deference to the proceedings of the National Assembly at all times, as the function of legislator that is conferred on parliamentarians is essential in a democracy.

Secondly, the persons called on to represent a state-owned enterprise of Hydro-Québec's stature must assume their responsibilities, in particular that of acting respectfully as regards the Parliament and its Members. One must never underestimate the role entrusted to them by the citizens who elected them to exercise the legislative function of the State.

Oral Questions and Answers

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

14 November 2019

Motions Without Notice

Mr. Ouellet, House Leader of the Third Opposition Group, together with Mr. Leitão (Robert-Baldwin), Mr. Marissal (Rosemont), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved a motion on special consultations by the Committee on Public Finance; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Legault, Premier, together with Mr. Arcand, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mrs. Massé, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, Mrs. Perry Mélançon (Gaspé), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly congratulate the finalists in the Forum des jeunes de la fonction publique québécoise's 17th "Prix reconnaissance" awards competition;

THAT it highlight the professional skills and leadership of these young adults dedicated to the public service;

THAT it applaud the contribution of the managers and mentors who help develop the talent, creativity and spirit of initiative of these young people working for the State of Québec.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

Mr. Derraji (Nelligan), together with Mrs. Ghazal (Mercier), Mr. Ouellet (René-Lévesque) and Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey), moved a motion on Québec SMEs; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

14 November 2019

Mr. Leduc (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve), together with Mrs. Nichols (Vaudreuil), Mr. Bérubé, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved a motion on the Bureau des enquêtes indépendantes (BEI); this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

Pursuant to Standing Order 186, Mr. Caire, Deputy Government House Leader, moved:

THAT the order referring Private Bill 206, An Act to amend the Act respecting the charter of the Coopérative fédérée de Québec, to the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain and providing that the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Land Occupancy be a member of the said Committee be rescinded.

The motion was carried.

Mr. Caire, Deputy Government House Leader, moved:

THAT Private Bill 206, An Act to amend the Act respecting the charter of the Coopérative fédérée de Québec, be referred to the Committee on Labour and the Economy for consultation and clause-by-clause consideration and that the Minister of Economy and Innovation be a member of the said Committee during its proceedings.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

Notices of Proceedings in Committees

Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

- the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 16, An Act mainly to regulate building inspections and divided co-ownership, to replace the name and improve the rules of operation of the Régie du logement and to amend the Act respecting the Société d'habitation du Québec and various legislative provisions concerning municipal affairs;
 - the Committee on Labour and the Economy, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 27, An Act respecting mainly government organization as regards the economy and innovation;
 - the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries, Energy and Natural Resources, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 34, An Act to simplify the process for establishing electricity distribution rates;
 - the Committee on Institutions, to undertake clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 32, An Act mainly to promote the efficiency of penal justice and to establish the terms governing the intervention of the Court of Québec with respect to applications for appeal;
 - the Committee on Public Finance, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 37, An Act mainly to establish the Centre d'acquisitions gouvernementales and Infrastructures technologiques Québec.
-

14 November 2019

Mrs. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, gave the following notice:

- the Committee on Public Administration shall hold a deliberative meeting to prepare the hearing of the Ministère de l'Éducation et de l'Enseignement supérieur on its administrative management and financial commitments; then, hold a public meeting to hear the Ministère de l'Éducation et de l'Enseignement supérieur; and finally, hold a deliberative meeting to discuss its observations, conclusions and recommendations, if any, following this hearing.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 53 and pursuant to Standing Order 186, Mr. Caire, Deputy Government House Leader, moved:

THAT the order adopted by the Assembly on 12 November 2019 instructing the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain to hold special consultations and public hearings within the framework of the consideration of Bill 47, An Act to ensure the implementation of certain measures of the 2020–2024 partnership agreement between the Gouvernement du Québec and the municipalities, be rescinded.

The motion was carried.

Information on the Proceedings of the Assembly

Mrs. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, informed the Assembly that on Friday, 22 November 2019, Mrs. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent) would question Mr. Roberge, Minister of Education and Higher Education, during an interpellation on the CAQ Government's alarming lack of vision with regard to higher education.

14 November 2019

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Government Motions

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, moved:

THAT, pursuant to Standing Order 146 of the National Assembly, the Committee on Public Finance hold special consultations and public hearings on the leak of personal information from Desjardins on Thursday, 21 November 2019, after Routine Proceedings, approximately from 11.15 o'clock a.m. to 1.00 o'clock p.m. and from 3.00 o'clock p.m. to 6.00 o'clock p.m.;

THAT, for this purpose, the Committee hear the following:

Desjardins
Autorité des marchés financiers
Equifax
Sûreté du Québec
Canadian Bankers Association
Benoit Dupont, Université de Montréal, Scientific
Director of the Smart Cybersecurity Network (SERENE-
RISC) and Canada Research Chair in Security and
Technology;

THAT the individual and organizations be summoned and heard in the order in which they appear in this motion;

THAT a period of 12 minutes be set aside for opening statements, allocated as follows: 6 minutes to the parliamentary group forming the Government, 4 minutes to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition, 1 minute to the Second Opposition Group and 1 minute to the Third Opposition Group;

14 November 2019

THAT the presentation by each individual or organization last no longer than 10 minutes and the exchange with the Committee members last no longer than 35 minutes, allocated as follows: 17 minutes 30 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Government, 11 minutes 40 seconds to the Official Opposition, 2 minutes 55 seconds to the Second Opposition Group and 2 minutes 55 seconds to the Third Opposition Group.

At 12.14 o'clock p.m., after hearing arguments from all sides regarding the receivability of the motion moved by Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, Mrs. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, took the matter under advisement and suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

The proceedings resumed at 12.29 o'clock p.m.

Mrs. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, issued a directive on a question raised by the Official Opposition House Leader on the receivability of the motion to hold special consultations and public hearings on the leak of personal information from Desjardins placed on the *Order Paper and Notices* by the Government House Leader.

RULING FROM THE CHAIR

To rule that a motion is out of order, it must be demonstrated that the motion has a defect and that it does not comply with the Standing Orders.

14 November 2019

For its part, the question raised on how proceedings are to be conducted in committee has no bearing on the receivability of the motion. If the motion is carried, the Committee Chair will be responsible for chairing the proceedings and ruling on how the deliberations are to be conducted. This manner of doing things is not unusual given that the question raised is hypothetical and that there is no indication, at the present time, that there will be a problem. If a group withdraws, as sometimes happens, the management of that situation is assumed by the committee and the person who chairs its proceedings in accordance with what is provided for in Standing Order 138.

As for the question raised concerning the summoning of witnesses to appear before a committee, it also has no bearing on the receivability of the motion. The practice in committee consists of first sending an invitation to the persons and the groups called to appear in accordance with what is set out in the motion, once the motion has been carried. If the persons called to participate in proceedings fail to appear, it is possible to summon them by adopting an order under section 51 of the *Act respecting the National Assembly*.

Mrs. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, informed the Assembly of the allocation of speaking time for the proceedings with respect to this limited debate: 5 minutes to the mover of the motion for his reply; 26 minutes 45 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Government; 15 minutes 56 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition; 5 minutes 41 seconds to the Second Opposition Group; 5 minutes 7 seconds to the Third Opposition Group; and 45 seconds to each independent Member. However, if only one independent Member takes part in the debate, that Member's speaking time is 1 minute. Within this framework, any time not used by the independent Members or by a parliamentary group shall be redistributed among the parliamentary groups in the proportions established above. Lastly, individual addresses shall not be limited.

A debate arose thereon.

At 1.00 o'clock p.m., Mrs. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 3.00 o'clock p.m.

The proceedings resumed at 3.00 o'clock p.m.

14 November 2019

The Assembly continued the debate on the motion moved by Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, proposing that special consultations and public hearings on the leak of personal information at Desjardins be held.

Pursuant to Standing Order 100, Mr. Tanguay, Official Opposition House Leader, moved the adjournment of the debate.

A debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **245** in Appendix)

Yeas: **30** Nays: **54** Abstentions: **0**

The Assembly continued the debate on the motion moved by Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader.

The debate being concluded, the question was put on the motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **246** in Appendix)

Yeas: **54** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **30**

At 4.57 o'clock p.m., at the request of Mr. Caire, Deputy Government House Leader, Mr. Picard, First Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 6.00 o'clock p.m.

The proceedings resumed at 6.00 o'clock p.m.

14 November 2019

Debates upon Adjournment

At 6.00 o'clock p.m., the Assembly held two debates upon adjournment:

- the first, on a question from Mr. Barrette (La Pinière) to Mr. Dubé, Minister Responsible for Government Administration and Chair of the Conseil du trésor, about problems with the application of the register of enterprises ineligible for public contracts (RENA);
- the second, on a question from Mrs. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent) to Mr. Roberge, Minister of Education and Higher Education, about the absence of funds dedicated to repairs resulting from the detection of lead in the water of Québec schools. Mrs. Guilbault, Minister of Public Security, replaced the Minister for this debate.

At 6.26 o'clock p.m., Mr. Picard, First Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Tuesday, 19 November 2019, at 1.40 o'clock p.m.

14 November 2019

ROYAL ASSENT

On Thursday, 14 November 2019, at 12.10 o'clock p.m. in the Office of the Lieutenant-Governor, in the presence of Mr. Dubé, Minister Responsible for Government Administration and Chair of the Conseil du trésor, and Mr. Thouin (Rousseau), Delegates of the Premier, and of Mrs. Durepos, Director of the Sitings Service and Delegate of the Secretary General, the Honourable J. Michel Doyon, Lieutenant-Governor of Québec, was pleased to assent to the following bill:

38 An Act amending certain Acts establishing public sector pension plans

FRANÇOIS PARADIS

President

14 November 2019

APPENDIX

Recorded Divisions

On the motion moved by Mrs. Nichols (Vaudreuil):

(Division No. 243)

YEAS - 106

Allaire (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	LeBel (PQ)	Proulx (CAQ)
Anglade (QLP)	Fortin (QLP)	(Rimouski)	(Berthier)
Arcand (QLP)	Foster (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Arseneau (PQ)	Fournier (IND)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Reid (CAQ)
Asselin (CAQ)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Rizqy (QLP)
Bachand (CAQ)	(Jonquière)	(Les Plaines)	Roberge (CAQ)
Barrette (QLP)	Ghazal (QS)	Leduc (QS)	Robitaille (QLP)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Benjamin (QLP)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Legault (CAQ)	Rousselle (QLP)
Bérubé (PQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Leitão (QLP)	Roy (PQ)
Birnbaum (QLP)	(Groulx)	Lemay (CAQ)	(Bonaventure)
Blais (CAQ)	Girault (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Roy (CAQ)
(Prévost)	Grondin (CAQ)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	(Montarville)
Blais (CAQ)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Sauvé (QLP)
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Guillemette (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Simard (CAQ)
Boulet (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	Skeete (CAQ)
Bussière (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Marissal (QS)	St-Pierre (QLP)
Caire (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Tanguay (QLP)
Campeau (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Massé (QS)	Tardif (CAQ)
Caron (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)	(Rivière-du-Loup– Témiscouata)
Charbonneau (QLP)	Kelley (QLP)	Melançon (QLP)	Thériault (QLP)
Charette (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Ménard (QLP)	Thouin (CAQ)
Chassé (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Montpetit (QLP)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Chassin (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	Weil (QLP)
Ciccone (QLP)	Laforest (CAQ)	Nichols (QLP)	Zanetti (QS)
Dansereau (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	
Derraji (QLP)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	
Dorion (QS)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	(Soulanges)	
Dubé (CAQ)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Polo (QLP)	
Dufour (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)	
Émond (CAQ)	(Champlain)	Proulx (CAQ)	
		(Côte-du-Sud)	

14 November 2019

On the motion moved by Mr. Marissal (Rosemont):

(Division No. 244)

YEAS - 108

Allaire (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	LeBel (PQ)	Proulx (CAQ)
Anglade (PLQ)	Fortin (PLQ)	(Rimouski)	(Côte-du-Sud)
Arcand (PLQ)	Foster (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)
Arseneau (PQ)	Fournier (IND)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	(Berthier)
Asselin (CAQ)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Bachand (CAQ)	(Jonquière)	(Les Plaines)	Reid (CAQ)
Barrette (PLQ)	Ghazal (QS)	Leduc (QS)	Rizqy (PLQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Roberge (CAQ)
Benjamin (PLQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Legault (CAQ)	Robitaille (PLQ)
Bérubé (PQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Leitão (PLQ)	Rotiroti (PLQ)
Birnbaum (PLQ)	(Groulx)	Lemay (CAQ)	Rousselle (PLQ)
Blais (CAQ)	Girault (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Roy (PQ)
(Prévost)	Grondin (CAQ)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	(Bonaventure)
Blais (CAQ)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Roy (CAQ)
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Guillemette (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	(Montarville)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Sauvé (PLQ)
Boulet (CAQ)	Hivon (PQ)	(Chapleau)	Schneeberger
			(CAQ)
Bussière (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	Marissal (QS)	Simard (CAQ)
Caire (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Skeete (CAQ)
Campeau (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Massé (QS)	St-Pierre (PLQ)
Caron (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)	Tanguay (PLQ)
Charbonneau (PLQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Melançon (PLQ)	Tardif (CAQ)
Charette (CAQ)	Kelley (PLQ)	Ménard (PLQ)	(Rivière-du-Loup- Témiscouata)
			Thériault (PLQ)
Chassé (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Montpetit (PLQ)	Thouin (CAQ)
Chassin (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Ciccone (PLQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Nichols (PLQ)	Weil (PLQ)
Dansereau (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	Zanetti (QS)
Derraji (PLQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	
Dorion (QS)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	
Dubé (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	(Soulanges)	
Dufour (CAQ)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Polo (PLQ)	
Émond (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)	
	(Champlain)		

14 November 2019

On the motion to adjourn moved by Mr. Tanguay, Official Opposition House Leader:

(Division No. 245)

YEAS - 30

Anglade (PLQ)	Fortin (PLQ)	Montpetit (PLQ)	Sauvé (PLQ)
Arcand (PLQ)	Ghazal (QS)	Nichols (PLQ)	Tanguay (PLQ)
Arseneau (PQ)	Hivon (PQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	Thériault (PLQ)
Barrette (PLQ)	Labrie (QS)	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	
Benjamin (PLQ)	Leitão (PLQ)	Polo (PLQ)	
Bérubé (PQ)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	Rizqy (PLQ)	
Birnbaum (PLQ)	Marissal (QS)	Robitaille (PLQ)	
Charbonneau (PLQ)	Mélançon (PLQ)	Rousselle (PLQ)	
Derraji (PLQ)	Ménard (PLQ)	Roy (PQ)	
		(Bonaventure)	

NAYS - 54

Allaire (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Asselin (CAQ)	(Groulx)	(Les Plaines)	Roy (CAQ)
Bachand (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	(Montarville)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Guilbault (CAQ)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Simard (CAQ)
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Hébert (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	Skeete (CAQ)
Bussière (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)
Caire (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	(Laviolette-Saint-Maurice)
Campeau (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Tardif (CAQ)
Caron (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	(Rivière-du-Loup–
			Témiscouata)
Chassin (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	Thouin (CAQ)
Dansereau (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Dubé (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)	
Dufour (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	
Émond (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	(Soulanges)	
Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)	
Foster (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)	
Girard (CAQ)	(Champlain)	(Côte-du-Sud)	
(Lac-Saint-Jean)			

14 November 2019

On the motion moved by Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader:

(Division No. 246)

YEAS - 54

Allaire (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Asselin (CAQ)	(Groulx)	(Les Plaines)	Roy (CAQ)
Bachand (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	(Montarville)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Guilbault (CAQ)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Simard (CAQ)
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Hébert (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	Skeete (CAQ)
Bussière (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)
Caire (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	(Lavolette-Saint-Maurice)
Campeau (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Tardif (CAQ)
Caron (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	(Rivière-du-Loup- Témiscouata)
Chassin (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	Thouin (CAQ)
Dansereau (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Dubé (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)	
Dufour (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	
Émond (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	(Soulanges)	
Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)	
Foster (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)	
Girard (CAQ)	(Champlain)	(Côte-du-Sud)	
(Lac-Saint-Jean)			

ABSTENTIONS - 30

Anglade (PLQ)	Fortin (PLQ)	Montpetit (PLQ)	Sauvé (PLQ)
Arcand (PLQ)	Ghazal (QS)	Nichols (PLQ)	Tanguay (PLQ)
Arseneau (PQ)	Hivon (PQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	Thériault (PLQ)
Barrette (PLQ)	Labrie (QS)	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	
Benjamin (PLQ)	Leitão (PLQ)	Polo (PLQ)	
Bérubé (PQ)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	Rizqy (PLQ)	
Birnbaum (PLQ)	Marissal (QS)	Robitaille (PLQ)	
Charbonneau (PLQ)	Mélançon (PLQ)	Rousselle (PLQ)	
Derraji (PLQ)	Ménard (PLQ)	Roy (PQ)	
		(Bonaventure)	