



NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF QUÉBEC

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-SECOND LEGISLATURE

Votes and Proceedings

of the Assembly

Friday, 29 November 2019 — No. 89

**President of the National Assembly:
Mr. François Paradis**

The Assembly was called to order at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS

Statements by Members

Mrs. LeBel (Champlain) made a statement to pay tribute to the 30-year career of Mr. Jean-Claude Milot as Mayor of Saint-Luc-de-Vincennes.

Mrs. Gaudreault (Hull) made a statement to underline the 45th anniversary of the organization L'Arche Agapè.

Mr. Julien (Charlesbourg) made a statement to congratulate Mr. Christian Pageau on receiving an award at the Forces Avenir gala.

Mrs. Weil (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce) made a statement to underline the creation of the SHIFT Centre for Social Transformation.

Mr. Dufour (Abitibi-Est) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Eberhard "Ebe" Scherkus for his induction into the Canadian Mining Hall of Fame.

29 November 2019

Mrs. Perry Mélançon (Gaspé) made a statement to underline the success of Garage à musique workshops.

Mrs. Dansereau (Verchères) made a statement to congratulate speed skater Alexandre Migner, gold medalist at the Alta Valtellina Trophy in Italy.

Mr. Bachand (Richmond) made a statement to congratulate Camping McKenzie Beach on winning the “Prix Camping de l’année – Leclerc Assurances” award.

Mrs. IsaBelle (Huntingdon) made a statement to pay tribute to Mrs. Joanie Primeau for having saved a man’s life.

At 9.51 o’clock a.m., Mrs. Soucy, Second Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

The proceedings resumed at 10.03 o’clock a.m.

29 November 2019

Moment of reflection

Presenting Papers

Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, tabled the following:

The report on the application of the *Act to foster the financial health and sustainability of municipal defined benefit pension plans*.

(Sessional Paper No. 1196-20191129)

Mr. Charette, Minister of the Environment and the Fight Against Climate Change, tabled the following:

The 2018–2019 annual report of the Kativik Environmental Advisory Committee.

(Sessional Paper No. 1197-20191129)

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, tabled the following:

The Government's reply to a petition tabled on 5 November 2019 by Mr. Fortin (Pontiac) on abolishing hospital and CHSLD parking fees.

(Sessional Paper No. 1198-20191129)

Complaints of Breach of Privilege or Contempt and Personal Explanations

The President informed the Assembly that he had, within the prescribed time, received a request from Mr. Nadeau-Dubois, House Leader of the Second Opposition Group.

29 November 2019

In his notice, the House Leader of the Second Opposition Group alleged that the Minister of the Environment and the Fight Against Climate Change was in contempt of Parliament for failing to table in the National Assembly, within the time required by law, the strategic plan of the Conseil de gestion du Fonds vert.

The notice further stated the Official Opposition House Leader's intention to move a motion under Standing Orders 315 and following.

The President took the matter under advisement.

Oral Questions and Answers

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

Motions Without Notice

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), together with Mrs. Sauvé (Fabre), Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) and Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey), moved:

THAT the National Assembly remind the Government of Québec that a serious shortage of orderlies is currently affecting the health and social services network;

THAT it note that the office of the Minister of Health and Social Services has informed the media of the existence of an internal document to address this shortage;

THAT the National Assembly request that the Minister table an action plan in the Assembly before the end of the current sessional period.

The question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

29 November 2019

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **256** in Appendix)

Yeas: **100** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

Mr. Bérubé, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, moved:

THAT the National Assembly affirm that it is the duty of every MNA elected by Quebecers to defend the legitimacy of the laws passed by Parliament;

THAT it enjoin the Premier of Québec to express, during his meeting with Ontario Premier Doug Ford, his disapproval of the Legislative Assembly of Ontario's passage of a motion calling for the immediate repeal of Bill 21 and urging the Government of Ontario to intervene to challenge the law before the Supreme Court.

The question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **257** in Appendix)

Yeas: **100** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Boulet, Minister of Labour, Employment and Social Solidarity, together with Mrs. Sauvé (Fabre), Mr. Leduc (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve), Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) and Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey), moved:

29 November 2019

THAT the National Assembly mark the passage of the *Social Aid Act* by the Québec Government 50 years ago in order to introduce the right to social aid;

THAT it recognize the importance of this piece of legislation not only for those in need, but for society as a whole;

THAT it ensure that this legislation evolves with the passage of time so that the economic inclusion and social participation of low-income individuals and families continue.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mrs. Weil (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce), together with Mrs. Dorion (Taschereau), Mr. Bérubé, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, and Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey), moved:

THAT the National Assembly mark the first anniversary of the Franco-Ontarian community's historic mobilization on 1 December 2018;

THAT it recall that this mobilization was aimed at defending the linguistic rights of this community of some 600,000 individuals;

THAT it applaud the fact that this mobilization has resulted in a federal-provincial agreement on funding for the Université de l'Ontario français;

THAT it nevertheless note that concerns remain within the community following the abolition of the position of French Language Services Commissioner;

29 November 2019

THAT it recall the unanimous support for the motion moved by the Member for Joliette on 30 November 2018 denouncing infringements by the Ontario Government on the rights of the Franco-Ontarian community;

THAT, lastly, it recall that defending Canada's Francophone communities requires sustained vigilance and that Québec must play an ongoing leadership role in this sense.

The question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **258** in Appendix)

Yeas: **98** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

Notices of Proceedings in Committees

Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

- the Committee on Labour and the Economy, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 15, An Act respecting the Société de développement et de mise en valeur du Parc olympique;
- the Committee on Labour and the Economy, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 27, An Act respecting mainly government organization as regards the economy and innovation;
- the Committee on Public Finance, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 37, An Act mainly to establish the Centre d'acquisitions gouvernementales and Infrastructures technologiques Québec;
- the Committee on Culture and Education, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 40, An Act to amend mainly the Education Act with regard to school organization and governance;

29 November 2019

- the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain, to undertake clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 47, An Act to ensure the implementation of certain measures of the 2020–2024 partnership agreement between the Gouvernement du Québec and the municipalities.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Government Bills

Report Stage

The Assembly took into consideration the report from the Committee on Health and Social Services on its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 31, An Act to amend mainly the Pharmacy Act to facilitate access to certain services, together with the amendment transmitted by Mr. Fortin (Pontiac).

The amendment proposed by Mr. Fortin (Pontiac) was declared in order.

After debate thereon, the question was put on the amendment by Mr. Fortin (Pontiac), and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

At the request of Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, the divisions on the amendment motion moved by Mr. Fortin (Pontiac) and on the report from the Committee on Health and Social Services were deferred until Routine Proceedings on the next sitting day.

29 November 2019

Debates on Reports from Committees

The Assembly took into consideration the report from the Committee on Public Administration, which met on 9 and 30 October and on 14 November 2019, to hear deputy ministers and heads of public bodies on Chapter 5 entitled “Computer Recovery” and Chapter 7 entitled “Information Technology Contracts – Follow-Up on a Special Audit” of the Auditor General of Québec’s May 2018 report; on the administrative management and financial commitments of the Ministère de la Santé et des Services sociaux; and on the administrative management and financial commitments of the Ministère de l’Éducation et de l’Enseignement supérieur. The report contains observations, conclusions and nine recommendations.

Mrs. Soucy, Second Vice-President, informed the Assembly of the allocation of speaking time for the proceedings with respect to this debate: 58 minutes 30 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Government; 34 minutes 51 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition; 12 minutes 27 seconds to the Second Opposition Group; 11 minutes 12 seconds to the Third Opposition Group, and 1 minute 30 seconds to each independent Member. However, if only one independent Member takes part in the debate, that Member’s speaking time is 2 minutes. Within this framework, any time not used by the independent Members or by a parliamentary group shall be redistributed among the parliamentary groups in the proportions established above. Lastly, individual addresses shall not be limited.

A debate arose thereon.

The debate was adjourned in the name of Mr. Leitão (Robert-Baldwin).

At 1.00 o’clock p.m., Mrs. Soucy, Second Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Tuesday, 3 December 2019 at 1.40 o’clock p.m.

FRANÇOIS PARADIS

President

1533

29 November 2019

APPENDIX

Recorded Divisions

On the motion moved by Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), together with Mrs. Sauvé (Fabre), Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) and Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey):

(Division No. 256)

YEAS - 100

Allaire (CAQ)	Dubé (CAQ)	LeBel (PQ)	Proulx (CAQ)
Anglade (QLP)	Dufour (CAQ)	(Rimouski)	(Berthier)
Arcand (QLP)	Émond (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Arseneau (PQ)	Fortin (QLP)	(Les Plaines)	Reid (CAQ)
Asselin (CAQ)	Foster (CAQ)	Leduc (QS)	Richard (PQ)
Bachand (CAQ)	Ghazal (QS)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Rizqy (QLP)
Barrette (QLP)	Girard (CAQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Roberge (CAQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Leitão (QLP)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Benjamin (QLP)	Girard (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)
Bérubé (PQ)	(Groulx)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Rousselle (QLP)
Birnbaum (QLP)	Grondin (CAQ)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	Roy (PQ)
Blais (CAQ)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	(Bonaventure)
(Prévost)	Guillemette (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	Roy (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	(Montarville)
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Hivon (PQ)	(Chapleau)	Sauvé (QLP)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	Maccarone (QLP)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Boulet (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Marissal (QS)	Simard (CAQ)
Bussière (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)	Skeete (CAQ)
Caire (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Melançon (QLP)	St-Pierre (QLP)
Carmant (CAQ)	Kelley (QLP)	Ménard (QLP)	Tanguay (QLP)
Caron (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Montpetit (QLP)	Tardif (CAQ)
Charbonneau (QLP)	Lachance (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	(Rivière-du-Loup- Témiscouata)
Charest (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Nichols (QLP)	Thériault (QLP)
Charette (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	Thouin (CAQ)
Chassin (CAQ)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)
D'Amours (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	Weil (QLP)
Dansereau (CAQ)	Lamothe (CAQ)	(Soulanges)	Zanetti (QS)
Derraji (QLP)	LeBel (CAQ)	Polo (QLP)	
Dorion (QS)	(Champlain)	Poulin (CAQ)	

29 November 2019

On the motion moved by Mr. Bérubé, Leader of the Third Opposition Group:

(Division No. 257)

YEAS - 100

Allaire (CAQ)	Dubé (CAQ)	LeBel (PQ)	Proulx (CAQ)
Anglade (QLP)	Dufour (CAQ)	(Rimouski)	(Berthier)
Arcand (QLP)	Émond (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Arseneau (PQ)	Fortin (QLP)	(Les Plaines)	Reid (CAQ)
Asselin (CAQ)	Foster (CAQ)	Leduc (QS)	Richard (PQ)
Bachand (CAQ)	Ghazal (QS)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Rizqy (QLP)
Barrette (QLP)	Girard (CAQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Roberge (CAQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Leitão (QLP)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Benjamin (QLP)	Girard (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)
Bérubé (PQ)	(Groulx)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Rousselle (QLP)
Birnbaum (QLP)	Grondin (CAQ)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	Roy (PQ)
Blais (CAQ)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	(Bonaventure)
(Prévost)	Guillemette (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	Roy (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	(Montarville)
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Hivon (PQ)	(Chapleau)	Sauvé (QLP)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	Maccarone (QLP)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Boulet (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Marissal (QS)	Simard (CAQ)
Bussière (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)	Skeete (CAQ)
Caire (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Melançon (QLP)	St-Pierre (QLP)
Carmant (CAQ)	Kelley (QLP)	Ménard (QLP)	Tanguay (QLP)
Caron (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Montpetit (QLP)	Tardif (CAQ)
Charbonneau (QLP)	Lachance (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	(Rivière-du-Loup– Témiscouata)
Charest (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Nichols (QLP)	Thériault (QLP)
Charette (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	Thouin (CAQ)
Chassin (CAQ)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)
D'Amours (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	Weil (QLP)
Dansereau (CAQ)	Lamothe (CAQ)	(Soulanges)	Zanetti (QS)
Derraji (QLP)	LeBel (CAQ)	Polo (QLP)	
Dorion (QS)	(Champlain)	Poulin (CAQ)	

29 November 2019

On the motion moved by Mrs. Weil (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce), together with Mrs. Dorion (Taschereau), Mr. Bérubé, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, and Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey):

(Division No. 258)

YEAS - 98

Allaire (CAQ)	Dubé (CAQ)	LeBel (PQ)	Proulx (CAQ)
Arcand (QLP)	Dufour (CAQ)	(Rimouski)	(Berthier)
Arseneau (PQ)	Émond (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Asselin (CAQ)	Fortin (QLP)	(Les Plaines)	Reid (CAQ)
Bachand (CAQ)	Foster (CAQ)	Leduc (QS)	Richard (PQ)
Barrette (QLP)	Ghazal (QS)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Rizqy (QLP)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Roberge (CAQ)
Benjamin (QLP)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Leitão (QLP)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Bérubé (PQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)
Birnbaum (QLP)	(Groulx)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Rousselle (QLP)
Blais (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	Roy (PQ)
(Prévost)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	(Bonaventure)
Blais (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Roy (CAQ)
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Hébert (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	(Montarville)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Hivon (PQ)	(Chauveau)	Sauvé (QLP)
Boulet (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	Maccarone (QLP)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Bussière (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)	Simard (CAQ)
Caire (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Melançon (QLP)	Skeete (CAQ)
Carmant (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Ménard (QLP)	St-Pierre (QLP)
Caron (CAQ)	Kelley (QLP)	Montpetit (QLP)	Tanguay (QLP)
Charbonneau (QLP)	Labrie (QS)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	Tardif (CAQ)
Charest (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Nichols (QLP)	(Rivière-du-Loup– Témiscouata)
Charette (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	Thériault (QLP)
Chassin (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	Thouin (CAQ)
D'Amours (CAQ)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Dansereau (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	(Soulanges)	Weil (QLP)
Derraji (QLP)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Polo (QLP)	Zanetti (QS)
Dorion (QS)	LeBel (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)	
	(Champlain)		