



NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF QUÉBEC

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-SECOND LEGISLATURE

Votes and Proceedings

of the Assembly

Wednesday, 4 December 2019 — No. 91

**President of the National Assembly:
Mr. François Paradis**

The Assembly was called to order at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS

Statements by Members

Mr. Lemay (Masson) made a statement to wish Voltizone centre athletes success at the Ultimate Ninja Athlete Association's regional championship.

Mr. Ciccone (Marquette) made a statement to pay tribute to École Catherine-Soumillard students for creating the enterprise Les Abeilles emballées.

Mr. Caron (Portneuf) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Richard Pearson, person in charge of the toy exchange organization Kiosque de Noël.

Mrs. Lecours (Lotbinière-Frontenac) made a statement to congratulate Gala Jeunes Personnalités Desjardins award winners.

Mr. Fontecilla (Laurier-Dorion) made a statement to deplore the discrepancies in file processing times at the Régie du logement.

4 December 2019

Mr. Lévesque (Chauveau) made a statement to underline the performances of paralympic athlete Ms. Marylou Martineau.

Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia) made a statement to underline the career of Mr. Charles Truchon, member of Les Remparts de Québec hockey team.

Mr. Campeau (Bourget) made a statement to underline the concert put on by the organization La gang à Rambrou.

Mr. Émond (Richelieu) made a statement to congratulate Cégep de Sorel-Tracy students, award winners at the Startup Weekend in Shawinigan.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 54.1, Mrs. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques) made a statement to underline the founding of the organization Espace LGBTQ+.

At 9.53 o'clock a.m., Mrs. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

The proceedings resumed at 10.03 o'clock a.m.

4 December 2019

Moment of reflection

Introduction of Bills

Mr. Bonnardel, Minister of Transport, moved that leave be granted to introduce the following bill:

54 An Act concerning the prohibition against bringing certain actions related to the operation of off-highway vehicles on trails forming part of the interregional network

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, Bill 54 was introduced in the Assembly.

Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) moved that leave be granted to introduce the following bill:

497 An Act to amend the Charter of human rights and freedoms in order to strengthen the protection of seniors' rights and create the office of Seniors Ombudsperson

The question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **264** in Appendix)

Yeas: **113** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

Accordingly, Bill 497 was introduced in the Assembly.

4 December 2019

Mr. Kelley (Jacques-Cartier) moved that leave be granted to introduce the following bill:

590 An Act to amend the Charter of the French language to establish free French instruction services for every person who resides in Québec

The question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **265** in Appendix)

Yeas: **114** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

Accordingly, Bill 590 was introduced in the Assembly.

The President communicated to the Assembly, and then tabled, the Law Clerk's report on the following private bill:

210 An Act respecting the subdivision of a lot located in the Maison Roussil protection area in Terrebonne and partly in the Maison Bélisle protection area in Terrebonne

The report states that the notice was drafted and published in accordance with the Rules for the Conduct of Proceedings governing private bills.

(Sessional Paper No. 1209-20191204)

Mr. Lemay (Masson) moved that leave be granted to introduce Private Bill 210, An Act respecting the subdivision of a lot located in the Maison Roussil protection area in Terrebonne and partly in the Maison Bélisle protection area in Terrebonne.

The motion was carried.

4 December 2019

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, moved that Private Bill 210 be referred to the Committee on Culture and Education for consultation and clause-by-clause consideration and that the Minister of Culture and Communications be a member of the said Committee during its proceedings with respect to this order of reference.

The motion was carried.

The President communicated to the Assembly, and then tabled, the Law Clerk's report on the following private bill:

209 An Act respecting Ville de Saint-Tite

The report states that the notice was drafted and published in accordance with the Rules for the Conduct of Proceedings governing private bills.

(Sessional Paper No. 1210-20191204)

Mr. Allaire (Maskinongé) then moved that leave be granted to introduce Private Bill 209, An Act respecting Ville de Saint-Tite.

The motion was carried.

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, moved that Private Bill 209 be referred to the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain for consultation and clause-by-clause consideration and that the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing be a member of the said Committee during its proceedings with respect to this order of reference.

The motion was carried.

Presenting Papers

Mr. Legault, Premier, tabled the following:

The 2019–2023 strategic plan of the Ministère du Conseil exécutif.

(Sessional Paper No. 1211-20191204)

4 December 2019

Mrs. Guilbault, Minister of Public Security, tabled the following:

The 2019–2023 strategic plan of the Ministère de la Sécurité publique.
(Sessional Paper No. 1212-20191204)

Mr. Roberge, Minister of Education and Higher Education, tabled the following:

The 2019–2023 strategic plan of the Ministère de l'Éducation et de l'Enseignement supérieur.
(Sessional Paper No. 1213-20191204)

Mrs. McCann, Minister of Health and Social Services, tabled the following:

The 2019–2023 strategic plan of the Ministère de la Santé et des Services sociaux.
(Sessional Paper No. 1214-20191204)

Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, tabled the following:

The 2019–2023 strategic plan of the Ministère des Finances. This document is accompanied by a presentation table;

(Sessional Paper No. 1215-20191204)

The 2019–2023 strategic plan of Retraite Québec;

(Sessional Paper No. 1216-20191204)

The Actuarial Valuation of the Québec Pension Plan as at 31 December 2018.

(Sessional Paper No. 1217-20191204)

4 December 2019

Mr. Charette, Minister of the Environment and the Fight Against Climate Change, tabled the following:

The 2019–2023 strategic plan of the Ministère de l'Environnement et de la Lutte contre les changements climatiques.

(Sessional Paper No. 1218-20191204)

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Minister of Immigration, Francization and Integration, tabled the following:

The 2019–2023 strategic plan of the Ministère de l'Immigration, de la Francisation et de l'Intégration.

(Sessional Paper No. 1219-20191204)

Mr. Bonnardel, Minister of Transport, tabled the following:

The 2019–2023 strategic plan of the Ministère des Transports.

(Sessional Paper No. 1220-20191204)

Mrs. LeBel, Minister of Justice, tabled the following:

The 2019–2023 strategic plan of the Ministère de la Justice.

(Sessional Paper No. 1221-20191204)

Mr. Lacombe, Minister of Families, tabled the following:

The 2019–2023 strategic plan of the Ministère de la Famille.

(Sessional Paper No. 1222-20191204)

4 December 2019

Mrs. Girault, Minister of International Relations and La Francophonie, tabled the following:

The 2019–2023 strategic plan of the Ministère des Relations internationales et de la Francophonie.

(Sessional Paper No. 1223-20191204)

Mrs. Laforest, Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing, tabled the following:

The 2019–2023 strategic plan of the Ministère des Affaires municipales et de l'Habitation.

(Sessional Paper No. 1224-20191204)

Mr. Lamontagne, Minister of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, tabled the following:

The 2019–2023 strategic plan of the Ministère de l'Agriculture, des Pêcheries et de l'Alimentation.

(Sessional Paper No. 1225-20191204)

Mr. Julien, Minister of Energy and Natural Resources, tabled the following:

The 2019–2023 strategic plan of the Ministère de l'Énergie et des Ressources naturelles.

(Sessional Paper No. 1226-20191204)

4 December 2019

Mr. Dufour, Minister of Forests, Wildlife and Parks, tabled the following:

The 2019–2023 strategic plan of the Ministère des Forêts, de la Faune et des Parcs.

(Sessional Paper No. 1227-20191204)

Mr. Boulet, Minister of Labour, Employment and Social Solidarity, tabled the following:

The 2019–2023 strategic plan of the Ministère du Travail, de l'Emploi et de la Solidarité sociale.

(Sessional Paper No. 1228-20191204)

Mrs. Roy, Minister of Culture and Communications, tabled the following:

The 2019–2023 strategic plan of the Ministère de la Culture et des Communications.

(Sessional Paper No. 1229-20191204)

Mrs. Proulx, Minister of Tourism, tabled the following:

The 2019–2023 strategic plan of the Ministère du Tourisme. This document is accompanied by a presentation table.

(Sessional Paper No. 1230-20191204)

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, tabled the following:

The reply to a written question from Mrs. Melançon (Verdun) on the 2016–2020 sustainable development action plan of the Ministère de la Culture et des Communications – Question No. 92, *Order Paper and Notices* of 31 October 2019;

(Sessional Paper No. 1231-20191204)

4 December 2019

The reply to a written question from Mrs. Melançon (Verdun) on the rate increase to the services the Centre de conservation du Québec (CCQ) provides to private non-profit community organizations – Question No. 93, *Order Paper and Notices* of 31 October 2019;

(Sessional Paper No. 1232-20191204)

The Government's reply to a petition tabled on 30 October 2019 by Mr. Lefebvre (Arthabaska) on the process for compensating road accident victims.

(Sessional Paper No. 1233-20191204)

The President tabled the following:

The 2018–2019 annual management report of the Auditor General of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1234-20191204)

Presenting Reports from Committees

Mrs. Charbonneau (Mille-Îles), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain, which met on 29 November and on 3 December 2019 for clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 47, An Act to ensure the implementation of certain measures of the 2020–2024 partnership agreement between the Gouvernement du Québec and the municipalities. The report does not contain amendments to the bill.

(Sessional Paper No. 1235-20191204)

4 December 2019

Mrs. IsaBelle (Huntingdon), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Labour and the Economy, which met on 24, 29, 30 and 31 October; on 5, 13, 14, 19, 20, 26 and 27 November; and on 3 December 2019 for clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 27, An Act respecting mainly government organization as regards the economy and innovation. The report contains amendments to the bill.

(Sessional Paper No. 1236-20191204)

Presenting Petitions

Mrs. Tardif (Laviolette–Saint-Maurice) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on the evaluation system for vacation resort leases, signed by 561 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1237-20191204)

Oral Questions and Answers

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

At the request of the President, Mr. Charette, Minister of the Environment and the Fight Against Climate Change, withdrew certain words deemed unparliamentary.

Motions Without Notice

Mr. Roberge, Minister of Education and Higher Education, moved:

THAT the National Assembly reaffirm the paramount importance of freedom of expression in any democratic society;

4 December 2019

THAT it recognize the right of all of those involved in the education field, including school administrators, to publicly give their opinion on Bill 40, An Act to amend mainly the Education Act with regard to school organization and governance;

THAT it encourage school administrators and all stakeholders in the network to denounce any pressure deemed undue and aimed at undermining their right to freely express their opinion on the legislative modifications provided for in Bill 40.

The question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 266 in Appendix)

Yeas: **111** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

Mrs. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent), together with Mr. Marissal (Rosemont), Mr. Ouellet (René-Lévesque), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved a motion on the protection of personal information; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mrs. Massé, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, together with Mrs. Montpetit (Maurice-Richard), Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly remind the CAQ Government that Québec officially declared a climate emergency on 25 September 2019;

4 December 2019

THAT it recall that the motion passed unanimously asked the Québec Government “to bring all of its political choices into line with this emergency situation”;

THAT it recall that the role of the Premier of Québec is to defend the values of Quebecers and the consensus of the National Assembly;

THAT the National Assembly urge the Premier to put the fight against climate change at the heart of his discussions with his counterparts from other Canadian provinces and with the Prime Minister of Canada.

The question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **267** in Appendix)

Yeas: **110** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Roy (Bonaventure), together with Mrs. Proulx, Minister Responsible for the Chaudière-Appalaches Region, the Bas-Saint-Laurent Region and the Gaspésie-Îles-de-la-Madeleine Region, Mrs. Lessard-Therrien (Rouyn-Noranda-Témiscamingue), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly recognize Gaspésie-Îles-de-la-Madeleine as an administrative region with significant differences;

THAT it underscore the fact that these differences result in major challenges, particularly in view of the region’s size, remoteness and the insular reality of the Magdalen Islands;

4 December 2019

THAT it recognize that, in recent years, the Gaspésie–Îles-de-la-Madeleine region has fallen significantly behind with respect to public funding in health, transportation, education and culture;

THAT it recall that this situation has had a far-reaching impact on the region’s economic development and its ability to establish its own institutions in many areas of Québec jurisdiction;

THAT, lastly, it emphasize the importance of supporting the Gaspésie–Îles-de-la-Madeleine region, including by taking into consideration these significant differences.

The question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **268** in Appendix)

Yeas: **109** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

Notices of Proceedings in Committees

Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

- the Committee on Labour and the Economy, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 15, An Act respecting the Société de développement et de mise en valeur du Parc olympique;
- the Committee on Public Finance, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 37, An Act mainly to establish the Centre d’acquisitions gouvernementales and Infrastructures technologiques Québec;

4 December 2019

- the Committee on Culture and Education, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 40, An Act to amend mainly the Education Act with regard to school organization and governance;
- the Committee on Labour and the Economy, to hear the interested parties and undertake clause-by-clause consideration of Private Bill 206, An Act to amend the Act respecting the charter of the Coopérative fédérée de Québec;
- the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain, to hear the interested parties and undertake clause-by-clause consideration of these private bills in the following order: Bill 205, An Act respecting Ville de Gaspé; Bill 207, An Act respecting Ville de Murdochville; Bill 204, An Act respecting the establishment of a special taxation scheme for Port of Havre-Saint-Pierre; and Bill 208, An Act concerning the transfer of a right of emphyteusis to the Ville d’Alma.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Government Bills

Report Stage

The Assembly resumed the debate, which had been adjourned on 3 December 2019, on consideration of the report from the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain on its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 16, An Act mainly to regulate building inspections and divided co-ownership, to replace the name and improve the rules of operation of the Régie du logement and to amend the Act respecting the Société d’habitation du Québec and various legislative provisions concerning municipal affairs, together with the amendments transmitted by Mrs. Thériault (Anjou–Louis-Riel).

4 December 2019

The debate being concluded, by leave of the Assembly, Mrs. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, put the question on the amendments individually and on the reading thereof.

First, the question was put on the first amendment proposed by Mrs. Thériault (Anjou–Louis-Riel) introducing section 2.0.1; a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

At the request of Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, the divisions on the amendments moved by Mrs. Thériault (Anjou–Louis-Riel) and on the report from the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain were deferred until Routine Proceedings on the next sitting day.

Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, moved the adjournment of the Assembly until Thursday, 5 December 2019 at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, at 12.16 o'clock p.m., Mrs. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Thursday, 5 December 2019 at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

FRANÇOIS PARADIS

President

4 December 2019

APPENDIX

Recorded Divisions

On the motion moved by Mr. LeBel (Rimouski):

(Division No. 264)

YEAS - 113

| | | | |
|-------------------|----------------------|------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Allaire (CAQ) | Fitzgibbon (CAQ) | LeBel (PQ) | Provençal (CAQ) |
| Anglade (QLP) | Fontecilla (QS) | (Rimouski) | Reid (CAQ) |
| Arcand (QLP) | Fortin (QLP) | Lecours (CAQ) | Rizqy (QLP) |
| Arseneau (PQ) | Foster (CAQ) | (Lotbinière-Frontenac) | Roberge (CAQ) |
| Asselin (CAQ) | Fournier (IND) | Lecours (CAQ) | Robitaille (QLP) |
| Bachand (CAQ) | Gaudreault (PQ) | (Les Plaines) | Rotiroti (QLP) |
| Barrette (QLP) | (Jonquière) | Leduc (QS) | Rouleau (CAQ) |
| Bélanger (CAQ) | Ghazal (QS) | Lefebvre (CAQ) | Rousselle (QLP) |
| Benjamin (QLP) | Girard (CAQ) | Legault (CAQ) | Roy (PQ) |
| Bérubé (PQ) | (Lac-Saint-Jean) | Leitão (QLP) | (Bonaventure) |
| Birnbaum (QLP) | Girard (CAQ) | Lemay (CAQ) | Roy (CAQ) |
| Blais (CAQ) | (Groulx) | Lemieux (CAQ) | (Montarville) |
| (Prévost) | Girault (CAQ) | Lessard-Therrien (QS) | Samson (CAQ) |
| Blais (CAQ) | Grondin (CAQ) | Lévesque (CAQ) | Sauvé (QLP) |
| (Abitibi-Ouest) | Guilbault (CAQ) | (Chapleau) | Schneeberger (CAQ) |
| Bonnardel (CAQ) | Guillemette (CAQ) | Lévesque (CAQ) | Simard (CAQ) |
| Boulet (CAQ) | Hébert (CAQ) | (Chauveau) | Skeete (CAQ) |
| Bussière (CAQ) | Hivon (PQ) | MacCarone (QLP) | St-Pierre (QLP) |
| Caire (CAQ) | Isabelle (CAQ) | Marissal (QS) | Tanguay (QLP) |
| Campeau (CAQ) | Jacques (CAQ) | Martel (CAQ) | Tardif (CAQ) |
| Carmant (CAQ) | Jeannotte (CAQ) | Massé (QS) | (Lavolette-Saint-Maurice) |
| Caron (CAQ) | Jolin-Barrette (CAQ) | McCann (CAQ) | Tardif (CAQ) |
| Charbonneau (QLP) | Julien (CAQ) | Melançon (QLP) | (Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata) |
| Charette (CAQ) | Kelley (QLP) | Montpetit (QLP) | Thériault (QLP) |
| Chassé (CAQ) | Labrie (QS) | Nadeau-Dubois (QS) | Thouin (CAQ) |
| Chassin (CAQ) | Lachance (CAQ) | Ouellet (PQ) | Tremblay (CAQ) |
| Ciccione (QLP) | Lacombe (CAQ) | Perry Mélançon (PQ) | Weil (QLP) |
| D'Amours (CAQ) | Laforest (CAQ) | Picard (CAQ) | Zanetti (QS) |
| Dansereau (CAQ) | Laframboise (CAQ) | (Soulanges) | |
| Derraji (QLP) | Lafrenière (CAQ) | Polo (QLP) | |
| Dorion (QS) | Lamontagne (CAQ) | Poulin (CAQ) | |
| Dubé (CAQ) | Lamothe (CAQ) | Proulx (CAQ) | |
| Dufour (CAQ) | LeBel (CAQ) | (Côte-du-Sud) | |
| Émond (CAQ) | (Champlain) | Proulx (CAQ) | |
| | | (Berthier) | |

4 December 2019

On the motion moved by Mr. Kelley (Jacques-Cartier):

(Division No. 265)

YEAS - 114

| | | | |
|-------------------|----------------------|------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Allaire (CAQ) | Émond (CAQ) | LeBel (CAQ) | Proulx (CAQ) |
| Anglade (QLP) | Fitzgibbon (CAQ) | (Champlain) | (Côte-du-Sud) |
| Arcand (QLP) | Fontecilla (QS) | LeBel (PQ) | Proulx (CAQ) |
| Arseneau (PQ) | Fortin (QLP) | (Rimouski) | (Berthier) |
| Asselin (CAQ) | Foster (CAQ) | Lecours (CAQ) | Provençal (CAQ) |
| Bachand (CAQ) | Fournier (IND) | (Lotbinière-Frontenac) | Reid (CAQ) |
| Barrette (QLP) | Gaudreault (PQ) | Lecours (CAQ) | Rizqy (QLP) |
| Bélanger (CAQ) | (Jonquière) | (Les Plaines) | Roberge (CAQ) |
| Benjamin (QLP) | Ghazal (QS) | Leduc (QS) | Robitaille (QLP) |
| Bérubé (PQ) | Girard (CAQ) | Lefebvre (CAQ) | Rotiroti (QLP) |
| Birnbaum (QLP) | (Lac-Saint-Jean) | Legault (CAQ) | Rouleau (CAQ) |
| Blais (CAQ) | Girard (CAQ) | Leitão (QLP) | Rousselle (QLP) |
| (Prévost) | (Groulx) | Lemay (CAQ) | Roy (PQ) |
| Blais (CAQ) | Girault (CAQ) | Lemieux (CAQ) | (Bonaventure) |
| (Abitibi-Ouest) | Grondin (CAQ) | Lessard-Therrien (QS) | Roy (CAQ) |
| Bonnardel (CAQ) | Guilbault (CAQ) | Lévesque (CAQ) | (Montarville) |
| Boulet (CAQ) | Guillemette (CAQ) | (Chapleau) | Samson (CAQ) |
| Bussière (CAQ) | Hébert (CAQ) | Lévesque (CAQ) | Sauvé (QLP) |
| Caire (CAQ) | Hivon (PQ) | (Chauveau) | Schneeberger (CAQ) |
| Campeau (CAQ) | Isabelle (CAQ) | Maccarone (QLP) | Simard (CAQ) |
| Carmant (CAQ) | Jacques (CAQ) | Marissal (QS) | Skeete (CAQ) |
| Caron (CAQ) | Jeannotte (CAQ) | Martel (CAQ) | Soucy (CAQ) |
| Charbonneau (QLP) | Jolin-Barrette (CAQ) | Massé (QS) | St-Pierre (QLP) |
| Charette (CAQ) | Julien (CAQ) | McCann (CAQ) | Tanguay (QLP) |
| Chassé (CAQ) | Kelley (QLP) | Melançon (QLP) | Tardif (CAQ) |
| Chassin (CAQ) | Labrie (QS) | Montpetit (QLP) | (Lavolette-Saint-Maurice) |
| Ciccone (QLP) | Lachance (CAQ) | Nadeau-Dubois (QS) | Tardif (CAQ) |
| D'Amours (CAQ) | Lacombe (CAQ) | Ouellet (PQ) | (Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata) |
| Dansereau (CAQ) | Laforest (CAQ) | Perry Melançon (PQ) | Thériault (QLP) |
| Derraji (QLP) | Laframboise (CAQ) | Picard (CAQ) | Thouin (CAQ) |
| Dorion (QS) | Lafrenière (CAQ) | (Soulanges) | Tremblay (CAQ) |
| Dubé (CAQ) | Lamontagne (CAQ) | Polo (QLP) | Weil (QLP) |
| Dufour (CAQ) | Lamothe (CAQ) | Poulin (CAQ) | Zanetti (QS) |

4 December 2019

On the motion moved by Mr. Roberge, Minister of Education and Higher Education:

(Division No. 266)

YEAS - 111

| | | | |
|-------------------|----------------------|------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Allaire (CAQ) | Émond (CAQ) | LeBel (CAQ) | Proulx (CAQ) |
| Anglade (QLP) | Fitzgibbon (CAQ) | (Champlain) | (Berthier) |
| Arcand (QLP) | Fontecilla (QS) | LeBel (PQ) | Proulx (CAQ) |
| Arseneau (PQ) | Fortin (QLP) | (Rimouski) | (Côte-du-Sud) |
| Asselin (CAQ) | Foster (CAQ) | Lecours (CAQ) | Provençal (CAQ) |
| Bachand (CAQ) | Fournier (IND) | (Lotbinière-Frontenac) | Reid (CAQ) |
| Barrette (QLP) | Gaudreault (PQ) | Lecours (CAQ) | Rizqy (QLP) |
| Bélanger (CAQ) | (Jonquière) | (Les Plaines) | Roberge (CAQ) |
| Benjamin (QLP) | Ghazal (QS) | Leduc (QS) | Robitaille (QLP) |
| Bérubé (PQ) | Girard (CAQ) | Lefebvre (CAQ) | Rotiroti (QLP) |
| Birnbaum (QLP) | (Lac-Saint-Jean) | Legault (CAQ) | Rouleau (CAQ) |
| Blais (CAQ) | Girard (CAQ) | Leitão (QLP) | Rousselle (QLP) |
| (Prévost) | (Groulx) | Lemay (CAQ) | Roy (PQ) |
| Blais (CAQ) | Girault (CAQ) | Lemieux (CAQ) | (Bonaventure) |
| (Abitibi-Ouest) | Grondin (CAQ) | Lessard-Therrien (QS) | Roy (CAQ) |
| Bonnardel (CAQ) | Guilbault (CAQ) | Lévesque (CAQ) | (Montarville) |
| Boulet (CAQ) | Guillemette (CAQ) | (Chapleau) | Samson (CAQ) |
| Bussière (CAQ) | Hébert (CAQ) | Lévesque (CAQ) | Sauvé (QLP) |
| Caire (CAQ) | Hivon (PQ) | (Chauveau) | Schneeberger (CAQ) |
| Campeau (CAQ) | Isabelle (CAQ) | Maccarone (QLP) | Simard (CAQ) |
| Carmant (CAQ) | Jacques (CAQ) | Marissal (QS) | St-Pierre (QLP) |
| Caron (CAQ) | Jeannotte (CAQ) | Martel (CAQ) | Tanguay (QLP) |
| Charbonneau (QLP) | Jolin-Barrette (CAQ) | Massé (QS) | Tardif (CAQ) |
| Charette (CAQ) | Julien (CAQ) | McCann (CAQ) | (Lavolette-Saint-Maurice) |
| Chassé (CAQ) | Kelley (QLP) | Melançon (QLP) | Tardif (CAQ) |
| Chassin (CAQ) | Labrie (QS) | Montpetit (QLP) | (Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata) |
| Ciccone (QLP) | Lachance (CAQ) | Nadeau-Dubois (QS) | Thouin (CAQ) |
| D'Amours (CAQ) | Lacombe (CAQ) | Ouellet (PQ) | Tremblay (CAQ) |
| Dansereau (CAQ) | Laforest (CAQ) | Perry Melançon (PQ) | Weil (QLP) |
| Derraji (QLP) | Laframboise (CAQ) | Picard (CAQ) | Zanetti (QS) |
| Dorion (QS) | Lafrenière (CAQ) | (Soulanges) | |
| Dubé (CAQ) | Lamontagne (CAQ) | Polo (QLP) | |
| Dufour (CAQ) | Lamothe (CAQ) | Poulin (CAQ) | |

4 December 2019

On the motion moved by Mrs. Massé, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, together with Mrs. Montpetit (Maurice-Richard), Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin):

(Division No. 267)

YEAS - 110

| | | | |
|-------------------|----------------------|------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Allaire (CAQ) | Émond (CAQ) | Lamothe (CAQ) | Polo (QLP) |
| Anglade (QLP) | Fitzgibbon (CAQ) | LeBel (CAQ) | Poulin (CAQ) |
| Arcand (QLP) | Fontecilla (QS) | (ChAMPLAIN) | Proulx (CAQ) |
| Arseneau (PQ) | Fortin (QLP) | LeBel (PQ) | (Berthier) |
| Asselin (CAQ) | Foster (CAQ) | (Rimouski) | Proulx (CAQ) |
| Bachand (CAQ) | Fournier (IND) | Lecours (CAQ) | (Côte-du-Sud) |
| Bélanger (CAQ) | Gaudreault (PQ) | (Lotbinière-Frontenac) | Provençal (CAQ) |
| Benjamin (QLP) | (Jonquière) | Lecours (CAQ) | Reid (CAQ) |
| Bérubé (PQ) | Ghazal (QS) | (Les Plaines) | Rizqy (QLP) |
| Birnbaum (QLP) | Girard (CAQ) | Leduc (QS) | Roberge (CAQ) |
| Blais (CAQ) | (Lac-Saint-Jean) | Lefebvre (CAQ) | Robitaille (QLP) |
| (Prévost) | Girard (CAQ) | Legault (CAQ) | Rotiroti (QLP) |
| Blais (CAQ) | (Groulx) | Leitão (QLP) | Rouleau (CAQ) |
| (Abitibi-Ouest) | Girault (CAQ) | Lemay (CAQ) | Rousselle (QLP) |
| Bonnardel (CAQ) | Grondin (CAQ) | Lemieux (CAQ) | Roy (PQ) |
| Boulet (CAQ) | Guilbault (CAQ) | Lessard-Therrien (QS) | (Bonaventure) |
| Bussière (CAQ) | Guillemette (CAQ) | Lévesque (CAQ) | Roy (CAQ) |
| Caire (CAQ) | Hébert (CAQ) | (Chapleau) | (Montarville) |
| Campeau (CAQ) | Hivon (PQ) | Lévesque (CAQ) | Samson (CAQ) |
| Carmant (CAQ) | Isabelle (CAQ) | (Chauveau) | Sauvé (QLP) |
| Caron (CAQ) | Jacques (CAQ) | Maccarone (QLP) | Schneeberger (CAQ) |
| Charbonneau (QLP) | Jeannotte (CAQ) | Marissal (QS) | Simard (CAQ) |
| Charette (CAQ) | Jolin-Barrette (CAQ) | Martel (CAQ) | St-Pierre (QLP) |
| Chassé (CAQ) | Julien (CAQ) | Massé (QS) | Tanguay (QLP) |
| Chassin (CAQ) | Kelley (QLP) | McCann (CAQ) | Tardif (CAQ) |
| Ciccione (QLP) | Labrie (QS) | Melançon (QLP) | (Lavolette-Saint-Maurice) |
| D'Amours (CAQ) | Lachance (CAQ) | Montpetit (QLP) | Tardif (CAQ) |
| Dansereau (CAQ) | Lacombe (CAQ) | Nadeau-Dubois (QS) | (Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata) |
| Derraji (QLP) | Laforest (CAQ) | Ouellet (PQ) | Thouin (CAQ) |
| Dorion (QS) | Laframboise (CAQ) | Perry Melançon (PQ) | Tremblay (CAQ) |
| Dubé (CAQ) | Lafrenière (CAQ) | Picard (CAQ) | Weil (QLP) |
| Dufour (CAQ) | Lamontagne (CAQ) | (Soulanges) | Zanetti (QS) |

4 December 2019

On the motion moved by Mr. Roy (Bonaventure), together with Mrs. Proulx, Minister Responsible for the Chaudière-Appalaches Region, the Bas-Saint-Laurent Region and the Gaspésie-Îles-de-la-Madeleine Region, Mrs. Lessard-Therrien (Rouyn-Noranda-Témiscamingue), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Mrs. Fournier (Marie-Victorin):

(Division No. 268)

YEAS - 109

| | | | |
|-------------------|----------------------|------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Allaire (CAQ) | Fitzgibbon (CAQ) | LeBel (PQ) | Provençal (CAQ) |
| Anglade (QLP) | Fontecilla (QS) | (Rimouski) | Reid (CAQ) |
| Arcand (QLP) | Fortin (QLP) | Lecours (CAQ) | Rizqy (QLP) |
| Arseneau (PQ) | Foster (CAQ) | (Lotbinière-Frontenac) | Roberge (CAQ) |
| Asselin (CAQ) | Fournier (IND) | Lecours (CAQ) | Robitaille (QLP) |
| Bachand (CAQ) | Gaudreault (PQ) | (Les Plaines) | Rotiroti (QLP) |
| Bélanger (CAQ) | (Jonquière) | Leduc (QS) | Rouleau (CAQ) |
| Benjamin (QLP) | Ghazal (QS) | Lefebvre (CAQ) | Rousselle (QLP) |
| Bérubé (PQ) | Girard (CAQ) | Leitão (QLP) | Roy (PQ) |
| Birnbaum (QLP) | (Lac-Saint-Jean) | Lemay (CAQ) | (Bonaventure) |
| Blais (CAQ) | Girard (CAQ) | Lemieux (CAQ) | Roy (CAQ) |
| (Prévost) | (Groulx) | Lessard-Therrien (QS) | (Montarville) |
| Blais (CAQ) | Girault (CAQ) | Lévesque (CAQ) | Samson (CAQ) |
| (Abitibi-Ouest) | Groncin (CAQ) | (Chauveau) | Sauvé (QLP) |
| Bonnardel (CAQ) | Guilbault (CAQ) | Lévesque (CAQ) | Schneeberger (CAQ) |
| Boulet (CAQ) | Guillemette (CAQ) | (Chapleau) | Simard (CAQ) |
| Bussière (CAQ) | Hébert (CAQ) | Maccarone (QLP) | St-Pierre (QLP) |
| Caire (CAQ) | Hivon (PQ) | Marissal (QS) | Tanguay (QLP) |
| Campeau (CAQ) | Isabelle (CAQ) | Martel (CAQ) | Tardif (CAQ) |
| Carmant (CAQ) | Jacques (CAQ) | Massé (QS) | (Laviolette-Saint-Maurice) |
| Caron (CAQ) | Jeannotte (CAQ) | McCann (CAQ) | Tardif (CAQ) |
| Charbonneau (QLP) | Jolin-Barrette (CAQ) | Melançon (QLP) | (Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata) |
| Charette (CAQ) | Julien (CAQ) | Montpetit (QLP) | Thouin (CAQ) |
| Chassé (CAQ) | Kelley (QLP) | Nadeau-Dubois (QS) | Tremblay (CAQ) |
| Chassin (CAQ) | Labrie (QS) | Ouellet (PQ) | Weil (QLP) |
| Ciccione (QLP) | Lachance (CAQ) | Perry Mélançon (PQ) | Zanetti (QS) |
| D'Amours (CAQ) | Lacombe (CAQ) | Picard (CAQ) | |
| Dansereau (CAQ) | Laforest (CAQ) | (Soulanges) | |
| Derraji (QLP) | Laframboise (CAQ) | Polo (QLP) | |
| Dorion (QS) | Lafrenière (CAQ) | Poulin (CAQ) | |
| Dubé (CAQ) | Lamontagne (CAQ) | Proulx (CAQ) | |
| Dufour (CAQ) | Lamothe (CAQ) | (Côte-du-Sud) | |
| Émond (CAQ) | LeBel (CAQ) | Proulx (CAQ) | |
| | (Champlain) | (Berthier) | |