



NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF QUÉBEC

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-SECOND LEGISLATURE

Votes and Proceedings

of the Assembly

Thursday, 6 February 2020 — No. 97

**President of the National Assembly:
Mr. François Paradis**

The Assembly was called to order at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS

Statements by Members

Ms. Chassé (Châteauguay) made a statement to underline the 10th anniversary of the organization Bistro culturel Cœur de village.

Mr. Kelley (Jacques-Cartier) made a statement to underline the contributions of the Lester B. Pearson and Marguerite-Bourgeoys school boards to the Jacques-Cartier community.

Mr. Fitzgibbon (Terrebonne) made a statement to underline the 25th anniversary of the Association Olo des Moulins.

Mr. Arcand (Mont-Royal–Outremont) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Pierre-Étienne Laporte, former Member of the National Assembly.

Ms. Hébert (Saint-François) made a statement to pay tribute to murder victim Mr. Thomas Cameron.

6 February 2020

Ms. Hivon (Joliette) made a statement to denounce the shortage of respite services in the Lanaudière region.

Mr. Nadeau-Dubois (Gouin) made a statement to underline the 60th anniversary of the organization Compagnons de Montréal.

Ms. Soucy (Saint-Hyacinthe) made a statement to underline the success of the Notre Monde Magique de Noël illuminated path.

Ms. Samson (Iberville) made a statement to pay tribute to the municipality of Mont-Saint-Grégoire with the recitation of a poem.

Ms. Grondin (Argenteuil) made a statement to underline the work of the organization Ressources communautaires Sophie.

At 9.53 o'clock a.m., Ms. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

The proceedings resumed at 10.02 o'clock a.m.

6 February 2020

Moment of reflection

Introduction of Bills

Mr. Julien, Minister of Energy and Natural Resources, moved that leave be granted to introduce the following bill:

50 An Act respecting the leasing of part of the water power of the Shipshaw River

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, Bill 50 was introduced in the Assembly.

Presenting Papers

Ms. LeBel, Minister of Justice, tabled the 2018–2019 annual reports of the following professional orders:

Barreau du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1324-20200206)
Collège des médecins du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1325-20200206)
Chambre des huissiers de justice du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1326-20200206)
Chambre des notaires du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1327-20200206)
Ordre des acupuncteurs du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1328-20200206)
Ordre des administrateurs agréés	(Sessional Paper No. 1329-20200206)
Ordre des agronomes du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1330-20200206)
Ordre des architectes du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1331-20200206)
Ordre des arpenteurs-géomètres du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1332-20200206)

6 February 2020

Ordre des audioprothésistes du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1333-20200206)
Ordre des chimistes du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1334-20200206)
Ordre des chiropraticiens du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1335-20200206)
Ordre des comptables professionnels agréés du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1336-20200206)
Ordre des conseillers et conseillères d'orientation du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1337-20200206)
Ordre des conseillers en ressources humaines agréés	(Sessional Paper No. 1338-20200206)
Ordre des dentistes du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1339-20200206)
Ordre des denturologistes du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1340-20200206)
Ordre des ergothérapeutes du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1341-20200206)
Ordre des évaluateurs agréés du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1342-20200206)
Ordre des géologues du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1343-20200206)
Ordre des hygiénistes dentaires du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1344-20200206)
Ordre des infirmières et infirmiers du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1345-20200206)
Ordre des infirmières et infirmiers auxiliaires du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1346-20200206)
Ordre des ingénieurs du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1347-20200206)
Ordre des ingénieurs forestiers du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1348-20200206)
Ordre des médecins vétérinaires du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1349-20200206)
Ordre des opticiens d'ordonnances du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1350-20200206)
Ordre des optométristes du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1351-20200206)
Ordre des orthophonistes et audiologistes du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1352-20200206)

6 February 2020

Ordre des pharmaciens du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1353-20200206)
Ordre des podiatres du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1354-20200206)
Ordre des psychologues du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1355-20200206)
Ordre professionnel des criminologues du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1356-20200206)
Ordre professionnel des diététistes du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1357-20200206)
Ordre professionnel des inhalothérapeutes du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1358-20200206)
Ordre professionnel de la physiothérapie du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1359-20200206)
Ordre professionnel des technologistes médicaux du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1360-20200206)
Ordre des psychoéducateurs et psychoéducatrices du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1361-20200206)
Ordre des sages-femmes du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1362-20200206)
Ordre professionnel des sexologues du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1363-20200206)
Ordre des techniciens et techniciennes dentaires du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1364-20200206)
Ordre des technologues en imagerie médicale, en radio-oncologie et en électrophysiologie médicale du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1365-20200206)
Ordre des technologues professionnels du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1366-20200206)
Ordre des traducteurs, terminologues et interprètes agréés du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1367-20200206)
Ordre des travailleurs sociaux et des thérapeutes conjugaux et familiaux du Québec	(Sessional Paper No. 1368-20200206)
Ordre des urbanistes du Québec.	(Sessional Paper No. 1369-20200206)

6 February 2020

The President tabled the following:

A letter, dated 5 February 2020, he had received from Mr. François Legault, Premier, asking that the President take the necessary measures for the National Assembly to meet for extraordinary sittings on Friday, 7 February 2020, beginning at 8.00 o'clock a.m., according to the calendar and timetable established by the Assembly, to conclude the consideration of Bill 40, An Act to amend mainly the Education Act with regard to school organization and governance;

(Sessional Paper No. 1370-20200206)

A copy of a letter, dated 6 February 2020, he had sent to Mr. Tanguay, Official Opposition House Leader, in reply to his letter, dated 4 February 2020, concerning the remarks made by Mr. Roberge, Minister of Education and Higher Education, and Mr. Legault, Premier, concerning work carried out by Members from the Official Opposition within the framework of the consideration of Bill 20, An Act to amend mainly the Education Act with regard to school organization and governance.

(Sessional Paper No. 1371-20200206)

Presenting Reports from Committees

Ms. IsaBelle (Huntingdon), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Labour and the Economy, which met on 10, 22 and 23 October, 28 and 29 November and 4, 5 and 6 December 2019 and on 4 and 5 February 2020 for clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 15, An Act respecting the Société de développement et de mise en valeur du Parc olympique. The report contains amendments to the bill.

(Sessional Paper No. 1372-20200206)

6 February 2020

Mr. Simard (Montmorency), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Public Finance, which met on 12, 13, 19, 20, 26, 27, 28 and 29 November and 3, 4, 5 and 6 December 2019 and on 21, 22 and 23 January and 4 and 5 February 2020 for clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 37, An Act mainly to establish the Centre d'acquisitions gouvernementales and Infrastructures technologiques Québec. The report contains amendments to the bill.

(Sessional Paper No. 1373-20200206)

Ms. St-Pierre (Acadie), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Transportation and the Environment, which held public hearings on 21, 22 and 23 January and 4 and 5 February 2020 within the framework of special consultations on Bill 44, An Act mainly to ensure effective governance of the fight against climate change and to promote electrification.

(Sessional Paper No. 1374-20200206)

Presenting Petitions

Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on maintaining the quality of dental care in Québec, signed by 734 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1375-20200206)

Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière) tabled the abstracts of two petitions on restricting the use and manufacturing of Styrofoam:

- The first, being the abstract of a petition signed by 2,091 citizens of Québec;

(Sessional Paper No. 1376-20200206)

6 February 2020

- The second, being the abstract of a petition signed by 128 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1377-20200206)

Mr. Fortin (Pontiac) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on establishing a shingles vaccination program, signed by 7,883 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1378-20200206)

Mr. Nadeau-Dubois (Gouin) tabled the abstracts of two petitions on amending Bill 29 to permit dental hygienists to work without a prescription and to provide frontline services:

- The first, being the abstract of a petition signed by 131 citizens of Québec;

(Sessional Paper No. 1379-20200206)

- The second, being the abstract of a petition signed by 80 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1380-20200206)

Mr. Campeau (Bourget) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on changes to the eligibility criteria for the Mobility Assistance Dog Reimbursement Program, signed by 309 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1381-20200206)

6 February 2020

Mr. Nadeau-Dubois (Gouin) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on amending Bill 29 to permit dental hygienists to work without a prescription and to provide frontline services, signed by 1,612 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1382-20200206)

Ms. Blais (Abitibi-Ouest) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on reforming the compulsory mathematics examination at the end of Grade 6, signed by 1,123 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1383-20200206)

Mr. Chassin (Saint-Jérôme) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on adding a link between Route 117 and Route 333 allowing access to Autoroute 15, signed by 1,326 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1384-20200206)

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 64, Rizqy (Saint-Laurent) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on detailed labelling of fish and seafood sold in Québec, signed by 535 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1385-20200206)

6 February 2020

Oral Questions and Answers

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

At the request of the President, Ms. Massé, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, withdrew certain words deemed unparliamentary.

At the request of the President, Mr. Legault, Premier, withdrew certain words deemed unparliamentary.

Deferred Divisions

The Assembly took the division, which had been deferred on 5 February 2020, on the motion moved by Mr. Fortin (Pontiac) during Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition.

The motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly acknowledge that there are currently not enough health professionals in most of Québec's health care institutions;

THAT it recognize that the lack of health professionals has an impact on the quality of care provided to patients;

THAT it recognize that health professionals experience dissatisfaction, distress and burnout, and that they are more often absent and at greater risk of workplace accidents;

THAT it take note that many sit-ins have been held in numerous health care institutions in various regions of Québec to deplore the understaffing and work overload;

6 February 2020

THAT it acknowledge that the pilot projects designed to test the implementation of new staff-to-patient ratios have ended and that their findings are conclusive, for both staff and patients;

THAT the National Assembly ask the CAQ Government to establish new staff-to-patient ratios immediately and to include the necessary funding in the 2020–2021 budget.

(Division No. **284** in Appendix)

Yeas: **46** Nays: **68** Abstentions: **0**

Motions Without Notice

Mr. Marissal (Rosemont), together with Mr. Ouellet (René-Lévesque), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved a motion concerning the investment of public funds in Bombardier; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

Mr. Bérubé, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, together with Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Minister Responsible for Laicity and Parliamentary Reform, Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved a motion concerning the Court Challenges Program; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Legault, Premier, together with Mr. Arcand, Leader of the Official Opposition, Ms. Massé, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, Mr. Bérubé, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

6 February 2020

THAT the National Assembly mark the 18th anniversary of the signing of the Paix des braves agreement;

THAT it applaud this historic agreement, which marked a turning point in the relationship between Québec and the Cree Nation;

THAT it recognize that this treaty is a source of inspiration for deepening, on the basis of respect, trust, partnership and collaboration, nation-to-nation relations between Québec and Indigenous peoples;

Lastly, that it underline the vision and bravery of the intrepid Bernard Landry and Ted Moses, who ratified this historic agreement.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Polo (Laval-des-Rapides), together with Ms. McCann, Minister of Health and Social Services, Mr. Fortin (Pontiac), Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), Mr. LeBel (Rimouski), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly mark the 30th annual Suicide Prevention Week organized by the Quebec Association for Suicide Prevention under the theme “Talking about suicide saves lives”;

THAT it bring to the attention of all the fact that suicide is a major global public health problem and that, as such, acting in prevention, detection, intervention and post-intervention is imperative;

THAT it recall the importance of working together in order to raise awareness and mobilize the entire population around the issues related to suicide;

6 February 2020

THAT it encourage all members of civil society to take concrete action for suicide prevention, knowing that every day in Québec three people commit suicide and approximately 75 try to end their own lives;

THAT, lastly, it ask that the Minister of Health and Social Services honour, before the end of the current mandate, the commitment she made at the Forum Adultes et santé mentale regarding the development of a national suicide prevention strategy.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

Notices of Proceedings in Committees

Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

- the Committee on Citizen Relations, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 18, An Act to amend the Civil Code, the Code of Civil Procedure, the Public Curator Act and various provisions as regards the protection of persons;
- the Committee on Institutions, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 39, An Act to establish a new electoral system;
- the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries, Energy and Natural Resources, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 48, An Act mainly to control the cost of the farm property tax and to simplify access to the farm property tax credit;
- the Committee on Public Finance, to undertake clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 42, An Act to give effect to fiscal measures announced in the Budget Speech delivered on 21 March 2019 and to various other measures;

6 February 2020

- the Committee on Health and Social Services, to undertake its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 43, An Act to amend the Nurses Act and other provisions in order to facilitate access to health services.

Ms. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, gave the following notice:

- the Committee on Transportation and the Environment shall hold a deliberative meeting to discuss the possibility of examining a petition on bringing train service back to Gaspé.

Information on the Proceedings of the Assembly

Ms. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, informed the Assembly that on Friday, 14 February 2020, Mr. Birnbaum (D'Arcy-McGee) would question Mrs. D'Amours, Minister Responsible for Indigenous Affairs, during an interpellation on the need for the CAQ Government to table tangible policy directions and show strong, consensus-building leadership to address the 142 calls to action from the Public Inquiry Commission on relations between Indigenous Peoples and certain public services.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

At 11.57 o'clock a.m., at the request of Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, Ms. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 6.00 o'clock p.m.

6 February 2020

The proceedings resumed at 6.00 o'clock p.m.

Debates upon Adjournment

At 6.00 o'clock p.m., the Assembly held two debates upon adjournment:

- the first, on a question from Ms. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent) to Mr. Roberge, Minister of Education and Higher Education, about the CAQ Government's decision to impose a legislative "gag order" on Bill 40, An Act to amend mainly the Education Act with regard to school organization and governance;
 - the second, on a question from Mr. Fortin (Pontiac) to Ms. McCann, Minister of Health and Social Services, about the CAQ Government's inexplicable refusal to call for a debate in the House for the purpose of passing Bill 31, An Act to amend mainly the Pharmacy Act for the purpose of facilitating access to certain services and to authorize the communication of personal information concerning certain missing or deceased Aboriginal children to their families.
-

At 6.17 o'clock p.m., Ms. Soucy, Second Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Friday, 7 February 2020 at 8.00 o'clock a.m.

FRANÇOIS PARADIS

President

6 February 2020

APPENDIX
Recorded Divisions

On the motion moved by Mr. Fortin (Pontiac) during Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition:

(Division No. 284)

YEAS - 46

Anglade (PLQ)	Fournier (IND)	Marissal (QS)	Robitaille (PLQ)
Arcand (PLQ)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Massé (QS)	Rousselle (PLQ)
Arseneau (PQ)	(Jonquière)	Melançon (PLQ)	Roy (PQ)
Barrette (PLQ)	Ghazal (QS)	Ménard (PLQ)	(Bonaventure)
Benjamin (PLQ)	Hivon (PQ)	Montpetit (PLQ)	Sauvé (PLQ)
Bérubé (PQ)	Kelley (PLQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	St-Pierre (PLQ)
Birnbaum (PLQ)	Labrie (QS)	Nichols (PLQ)	Tanguay (PLQ)
Charbonneau (PLQ)	LeBel (PQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	Thériault (PLQ)
Ciccone (PLQ)	(Rimouski)	Ouellette (IND)	Weil (PLQ)
Derraji (PLQ)	Leduc (QS)	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	Zanetti (QS)
Dorion (QS)	Leitão (PLQ)	Polo (PLQ)	
Fontecilla (QS)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	Richard (PQ)	
Fortin (PLQ)	Maccarone (PLQ)	Rizqy (PLQ)	

NAYS - 68

Allaire (CAQ)	Émond (CAQ)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)
Bachand (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	(Berthier)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Foster (CAQ)	(Champlain)	Provençal (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Reid (CAQ)
(Prévost)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Roberge (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)
(Abitibi-Ouest)	(Groulx)	(Les Plaines)	Roy (CAQ)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Girault (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	(Montarville)
Boutin (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Samson (CAQ)
Bussière (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Caire (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Simard (CAQ)
Campeau (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)
Carmant (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	(Lavolette-Saint-Maurice)
Caron (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)
Charest (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	(Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata)
Charette (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Thouin (CAQ)
Chassé (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Chassin (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	
D'Amours (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	(Soulanges)	
Dansereau (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)	
Dubé (CAQ)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)	
Dufour (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	(Côte-du-Sud)	