



---

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF QUÉBEC

---

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-SECOND LEGISLATURE

## **Votes and Proceedings**

**of the Assembly**

**Thursday, 12 March 2020 — No. 107**

**President of the National Assembly:  
Mr. François Paradis**

---



The Assembly was called to order at 9.40 o'clock a.m.

---

## ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS

### Statements by Members

Mr. Lefebvre (Arthabaska) made a statement to pay tribute to the members of the Club FADOQ Cercle de la joie d'Arthabaska.

---

Mr. Fortin (Pontiac) made a statement to underline the 40th anniversary of the Association des professionnels industriels et commerçants du secteur Aylmer.

---

Mr. Jacques (Mégantic) made a statement to underline the creation of the "Produit étoile du Granit" signature, to promote buying local products.

---

Ms. Hébert (Saint-François) made a statement to underline Laiterie de Coaticook dairy farm's 80th anniversary.

---

Mr. Roy (Bonaventure) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Danick Paquet for saving a woman's life.

**12 March 2020**

---

Mr. Allaire (Maskinongé) made a statement to pay tribute to Ms. Sylvie Noël for her community involvement and volunteering.

\_\_\_\_\_

Ms. Dorion (Taschereau) made a statement to underline the 40th anniversary of the Comité d'action des personnes vivant des situations de handicap.

\_\_\_\_\_

Mr. Lévesque (Chauveau) made a statement to pay tribute to Mgr. Martin Laliberté, appointed Auxiliary Bishop of Québec City.

\_\_\_\_\_

Ms. Blais (Prévost) made a statement to underline the work of the organization Entraidons-nous.

\_\_\_\_\_

At 9.51 o'clock a.m., Ms. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

\_\_\_\_\_

The proceedings resumed at 10.03 o'clock a.m.

\_\_\_\_\_

**12 March 2020**

---

Moment of reflection

**Presenting Papers**

Mr. Boulet, Minister of Labour, Employment and Social Solidarity, tabled the following:

The proposed amendments to Bill 51, An Act mainly to improve the flexibility of the parental insurance plan in order to promote family-work balance (French and English versions).

(Sessional Paper No. 1473-20200312)

---

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, tabled the following:

The Government's reply to a petition tabled on 21 November 2019 by Ms. Charbonneau (Mille-Îles) on the establishment of a central photo identification database for transactions and financing;

(Sessional Paper No. 1474-20200312)

The Government's reply to a petition tabled on 6 February 2020 by Ms. Blais (Abitibi-Ouest) on reforming the compulsory mathematics examination at the end of Grade 6.

(Sessional Paper No. 1475-20200312)

---

The President tabled the following decisions of the Office of the National Assembly, dated 20 February 2020:

Decision 2071 concerning the Règlement modifiant le Règlement sur les ressources financières attribuées à la Commission spéciale sur l'exploitation sexuelle des mineurs (regulation to amend the regulation on the financial resources allocated to the Select Committee on the Sexual Exploitation of Minors);

(Sessional Paper No. 1476-20200312)

**12 March 2020**

---

Decision 2072 concerning the Règlement modifiant le Règlement sur la gestion financière et administrative (regulation to amend the regulation respecting financial and administrative management).

(Sessional Paper No. 1477-20200312)

### **Presenting Reports from Committees**

Mr. Lemay (Masson), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries, Energy and Natural Resources, which met on 18 and 20 February and on 10 and 11 March 2020 for clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 48, An Act mainly to control the cost of the farm property tax and to simplify access to the farm property tax credit. The report contains amendments to the bill.

(Sessional Paper No. 1478-20200312)

### **Presenting Petitions**

Mr. Lemay (Masson) tabled the following on behalf of Ms. Lavallée (Repentigny):

The abstract of a petition on the evaluation and implementation of the Policy on Special Education, signed by 199 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1479-20200312)

---

Ms. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on amending the *Charter of human rights and freedoms* so that it includes all forms of physical appearance-related discrimination, signed by 1,114 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1480-20200312)

**12 March 2020**

---

Mr. Ouellet (René-Lévesque) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on saving the ferry “L’Héritage 1” and maintaining ferry service between Trois-Pistoles and Les Escoumins, signed by 1,622 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1481-20200312)

---

Mr. Thouin (Rousseau) tabled the following on behalf of Ms. Lecours (Les Plaines):

The abstract of a petition on permanently maintaining daylight saving time, signed by 158 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1482-20200312)

---

Mr. Marissal (Rosemont) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on reviewing the policies and orders relating to bonuses, premiums and remuneration in the public and parapublic sector, signed by 286 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1483-20200312)

---

Mr. Marissal (Rosemont) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on implementing measures to counter fraud, identity theft and theft of personal information, signed by 552 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1484-20200312)

---

**12 March 2020**

---

Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on reviewing the policies of the Office municipal d'habitation de Québec, signed by 1,259 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1485-20200312)

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mr. Ouellet (René-Lévesque) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on saving the L'Héritage 1 ferry and maintaining ferry service between Trois-Pistoles and Les Escoumins, signed by 4,989 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1486-20200312)

### **Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 53 and 59, Ms. Sauvé (Fabre) tabled the following:

A copy of a letter, dated 19 March 2019, addressed to Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, by Ms. Blais, Minister Responsible for Seniors and Informal Caregivers, concerning tax assistance for persons experiencing loss of autonomy, informal caregivers and those most in need.

(Sessional Paper No. 1487-20200312)

12 March 2020

---

### Motions Without Notice

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Bérubé, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, together with Ms. McCann, Minister of Health and Social Services, Mr. Arcand, Leader of the Official Opposition, Ms. Massé, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly ask the Government of Canada to put in place a genuine coronavirus (COVID-19) detection protocol for all individuals entering Canada, equipping border services personnel in particular.

The question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **308** in Appendix)

Yeas: **106**    Nays: **0**    Abstentions: **0**

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Ms. Grondin (Argenteuil), together with Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil), Ms. Labrie (Sherbrooke), Ms. Hivon (Joliette) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly convey its most heartfelt sympathy to the family and friends of Océane Boyer, who died under tragic circumstances on 26 February 2020;

THAT it express its solidarity with the communities of Argenteuil and especially that of Lachute, which have been deeply shaken by this tragic event;

THAT it reiterate that it is the duty of all of us to protect our children;

**12 March 2020**

---

THAT, lastly, the Members of this Assembly observe a minute of silence in her memory.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

At the request of Ms. Grondin (Argenteuil), the Assembly observed a minute of silence.

---

Ms. Thériault (Anjou–Louis-Riel), together with Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved a motion on the housing sector; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

---

Ms. Ghazal (Mercier), together with Mr. Barrette (La Pinière), Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved a motion on the Mount Royal Tunnel closure; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 84.1 and pursuant to Standing Order 146, Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, moved:

THAT, within the framework of the consideration of Bill 50, An Act respecting the leasing of part of the water power of the Shipshaw River, the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries, Energy and Natural Resources hold special consultations and public hearings on Wednesday, 25 March 2020 after Routine Proceedings until 12.30 o'clock p.m., and then from 3.00 o'clock p.m. to 6.00 o'clock p.m.;

**12 March 2020**

---

THAT, for this purpose, the Committee hear the following individuals and organizations:

Ville de Saguenay  
MRC du Fjord-du-Saguenay  
Syndicat Unifor  
Renewable Materials Research Centre  
Resolute Forest Products;

THAT a period of 12 minutes be set aside for opening statements, allocated as follows: 6 minutes to the parliamentary group forming the Government, 4 minutes to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition, 1 minute to the Second Opposition Group and 1 minute to the Third Opposition Group;

THAT the presentation by each organization last no longer than 10 minutes and the exchange with the Committee members last no longer than 35 minutes, allocated as follows: 17 minutes 30 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Government, 11 minutes 40 seconds to the Official Opposition, 2 minutes 55 seconds to the Second Opposition Group and 2 minutes 55 seconds to the Third Opposition Group;

THAT the Minister of Energy and Natural Resources be a member of the said Committee during its proceedings with respect to this order of reference.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

### **Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

- the Committee on Public Finance, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 23, An Act respecting the names and responsibilities of certain ministers and government departments and to enact the Act respecting the Ministère des Forêts, de la Faune et des Parcs;

12 March 2020

---

- the Committee on Health and Social Services, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 43, An Act to amend the Nurses Act and other provisions in order to facilitate access to health services;
- the Committee on Transportation and the Environment, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 44, An Act mainly to ensure effective governance of the fight against climate change and to promote electrification;
- the Committee on Labour and the Economy, to undertake public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 51, An Act mainly to improve the flexibility of the parental insurance plan in order to promote family-work balance.

---

Ms. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, gave the following notices:

- the Select Committee on the Sexual Exploitation of Minors shall hold a deliberative meeting to organize its proceedings;
- the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain shall hold a deliberative meeting to prepare the public hearings within the framework of the order on the examination of the report on the implementation of the *Municipal Ethics and Good Conduct Act* tabled in the National Assembly in February 2020; and then, hold a public meeting to hold special consultations and public hearings on that report.

12 March 2020

---

### **Information on the Proceedings of the Assembly**

Ms. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, informed the Assembly that on Friday, 20 March 2020, Ms. Lessard-Therrien (Rouyn-Noranda–Témiscamingue) would question Mr. Dufour, Minister of Forests, Wildlife and Parks, during an interpellation on the need to protect woodland caribou in Québec.

---

### **ORDERS OF THE DAY**

#### **Business Having Precedence**

##### *Debate on the Budget Speech*

The Assembly entered upon the debate on the motion moved by Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, that the Assembly approve the Government's budgetary policy.

At the end of his address, Mr. Leitão (Robert-Baldwin) moved the following motion stating a grievance:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ Government for its budget, which did not take into account the economic impact of COVID-19.

The debate continued on the motion moved by Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, and on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Leitão (Robert-Baldwin), subject to the receivability of this motion.

**12 March 2020**

---

At 1.00 o'clock p.m., Ms. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 3.00 o'clock p.m.

---

The proceedings resumed at 3.00 o'clock p.m.

---

The Assembly continued the debate on the motion moved by Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, and on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Leitão (Robert-Baldwin), subject to the receivability of this motion.

Following a meeting with the House leaders, Ms. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, informed the Assembly of the allocation of speaking time for the proceedings with respect to this debate: 6 hours 37 minutes 30 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Government, including the Budget Speech; 3 hours 56 minutes 49 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition, including the comments made by its critic on 10 March 2020 and his address during today's proceedings; 1 hour 24 minutes 34 seconds to the Second Opposition Group, including the comments made by its critic on 10 March 2020 and his address during today's proceedings; 1 hour 16 minutes 7 seconds to the Third Opposition Group, including the comments made by its critic on 10 March 2020 and its Leader's address during today's proceedings; 15 minutes jointly to the independent Members, subject to a maximum of 7 minutes 30 seconds each. Within this framework, any time not used by the independent Members or by a parliamentary group shall be redistributed among the parliamentary groups in the proportions established above. Lastly, individual addresses shall not be limited.

The debate continued.

**12 March 2020**

---

At the end of his address, Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage) moved the following motion stating a grievance:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ Government for its 2020–2021 budget, which does not meet the recommendations made by the Special Commission on the Rights of the Child and Youth Protection and does not invest enough to give the appropriate means to Youth Protection workers who wish to protect Québec’s vulnerable children.

The debate continued on the motion moved by Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Leitão (Robert-Baldwin) and Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), subject to the receivability of these motions.

At the end of his address, Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) moved the following motion stating a grievance:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Government for its lack of vision as to the impact of population aging, resulting in the lack of a concrete plan to adapt our practices and investments so as to enable Quebecers to age well in their own towns and regions.

The debate continued on the motion moved by Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Leitão (Robert-Baldwin), Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage) and Mr. LeBel (Rimouski), subject to the receivability of these motions.

The debate was adjourned in the name of Mr. Chassin (Saint-Jérôme).

**12 March 2020**

---

### **Debates upon Adjournment**

At 6 o'clock p.m., the Assembly held two debates upon adjournment:

- the first, on a question from Mr. Benjamin (Viau) to Mr. Carmant, Minister for Health and Social Services, about the CAQ Government's leisurely approach to updating the regulatory provisions on alcohol consumption by young people. Ms. Guilbeault, Minister of Public Security, replaced the Minister for this debate;
- the second, on a question from Ms. St-Pierre (Acadie) to Mr. Bonnardel, Minister of Transport, about the specific situation of a road accident victim. Ms. Rouleau, Minister for Transport, replaced the Minister for this debate.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 53 and 59, Ms. St-Pierre (Acadie) tabled the following:

A copy of a letter, dated 11 December 2019, addressed to Mr. Bonnardel, Minister of Transport, by Ms. St-Pierre, Member for Acadie, concerning the situation of a citizen from her riding with regard to the Société de l'assurance automobile du Québec;

(Sessional Paper No. 1488-20200312)

A copy of a letter, dated 11 November 2019, addressed to Mr. Marcel Bubeau, by Ms. Lana Labrecque of the administrative review directorate, about an application for the review of a decision rendered on 5 April 2019 by the Société de l'assurance automobile du Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1489-20200312)

---

At 6.25 o'clock p.m., Ms. Soucy, Second Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Tuesday, 17 March 2020 at 1.40 o'clock p.m.

**12 March 2020**

---

**ROYAL ASSENT**

On Thursday, 12 March 2020 at 2.05 o'clock p.m. in the Office of the Lieutenant-Governor, in the presence of Ms. Beauregard, Director ofittings and Parliamentary Procedure and Delegate of the Secretary General, the Honourable Dominique Bélanger, Administrator of the Government of Québec, was pleased to assent to the following bill:

57      Appropriation Act No. 1, 2020–2021

**FRANÇOIS PARADIS**

*President*

12 March 2020

---

## APPENDIX

### Recorded Divisions

On the motion moved by Mr. Bérubé, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, together with Ms. McCann, Minister of Health and Social Services, Mr. Arcand, Leader of the Official Opposition, Ms. Massé, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin):

#### (Division No. 308)

#### YEAS - 106

|                   |                      |                        |                               |
|-------------------|----------------------|------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Allaire (CAQ)     | Dubé (CAQ)           | LeBel (PQ)             | Proulx (CAQ)                  |
| Arcand (QLP)      | Dufour (CAQ)         | (Rimouski)             | (Berthier)                    |
| Arseneau (PQ)     | Émond (CAQ)          | Lecours (CAQ)          | Provençal (CAQ)               |
| Asselin (CAQ)     | Fitzgibbon (CAQ)     | (Lotbinière-Frontenac) | Reid (CAQ)                    |
| Bachand (CAQ)     | Fortin (QLP)         | Leduc (QS)             | Rizqy (QLP)                   |
| Barrette (QLP)    | Foster (CAQ)         | Lefebvre (CAQ)         | Roberge (CAQ)                 |
| Bélanger (CAQ)    | Fournier (IND)       | Leitão (QLP)           | Robitaille (QLP)              |
| Benjamin (QLP)    | Gaudreault (PQ)      | Lemay (CAQ)            | Rouleau (CAQ)                 |
| Bérubé (PQ)       | (Jonquière)          | Lemieux (CAQ)          | Rousselle (QLP)               |
| Birnbaum (QLP)    | Ghazal (QS)          | Lessard-Therrien (QS)  | Roy (PQ)                      |
| Blais (CAQ)       | Girard (CAQ)         | Lévesque (CAQ)         | (Bonaventure)                 |
| (Prévost)         | (Lac-Saint-Jean)     | (Chauveau)             | Roy (CAQ)                     |
| Blais (CAQ)       | Girard (CAQ)         | Lévesque (CAQ)         | (Montarville)                 |
| (Abitibi-Ouest)   | (Groulx)             | (Chapleau)             | Samson (CAQ)                  |
| Bonnardel (CAQ)   | Girault (CAQ)        | Maccarone (QLP)        | Sauvé (QLP)                   |
| Boutin (CAQ)      | Grondin (CAQ)        | Marissal (QS)          | Schneeberger (CAQ)            |
| Bussière (CAQ)    | Guilbault (CAQ)      | Martel (CAQ)           | Simard (CAQ)                  |
| Caire (CAQ)       | Guillemette (CAQ)    | Massé (QS)             | Skeete (CAQ)                  |
| Campeau (CAQ)     | Hébert (CAQ)         | McCann (CAQ)           | St-Pierre (QLP)               |
| Carmant (CAQ)     | Hivon (PQ)           | Melançon (QLP)         | Tanguay (QLP)                 |
| Caron (CAQ)       | Isabelle (CAQ)       | Ménard (QLP)           | Tardif (CAQ)                  |
| Charbonneau (QLP) | Jacques (CAQ)        | Montpetit (QLP)        | (Lavolette-Saint-Maurice)     |
| Charest (CAQ)     | Jeannotte (CAQ)      | Nadeau-Dubois (QS)     | Tardif (CAQ)                  |
| Charette (CAQ)    | Jolin-Barrette (CAQ) | Nichols (QLP)          | (Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata) |
| Chassé (CAQ)      | Kelley (QLP)         | Ouellet (PQ)           | Thériault (QLP)               |
| Chassin (CAQ)     | Labrie (QS)          | Picard (CAQ)           | Thouin (CAQ)                  |
| Ciccone (QLP)     | Lachance (CAQ)       | (Soulanges)            | Tremblay (CAQ)                |
| D'Amours (CAQ)    | Lacombe (CAQ)        | Polo (QLP)             | Weil (QLP)                    |
| Dansereau (CAQ)   | Laforest (CAQ)       | Poulin (CAQ)           | Zanetti (QS)                  |
| Derraji (QLP)     | Laframboise (CAQ)    | Proulx (CAQ)           |                               |
| Dorion (QS)       | Lamontagne (CAQ)     | (Côte-du-Sud)          |                               |