

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF QUÉBEC

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-SECOND LEGISLATURE

## **Votes and Proceedings**

of the Assembly

Thursday, 12 November 2020 - No. 144

President of the National Assembly: Mr. François Paradis

The Assembly was called to order at 9:40 a.m.

\_\_\_\_\_

#### **ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

### **Statements by Members**

Ms. Hébert (Saint-François) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Martin Giroux for his 35 years of volunteering with the organization Sercovie.

\_\_\_\_\_

Mr. Ciccone (Marquette) made a statement to pay tribute to entrepreneur, music lover and philanthropist E. Noël Spinelli.

\_\_\_\_\_

Ms. Jeannotte (Labelle) made a statement to pay tribute to writer Francine Ouellette.

Ms. Maccarone (Westmount-Saint-Louis) made a statement to pay tribute to Father John Walsh for his social commitment and community involvement.

Mr. Tardif (Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata) made a statement to pay tribute to Ms. France M. Lavoie, founder of the Le Tremplin song and comedy festival in Dégelis.

Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine) made a statement to underline the success of Au Vieux Treuil's performing arts and theatre summer program.					
Mr. Provençal (Beauce-Nord) made a statement to pay tribute to Ms. Andrée Roy on her 40-year career dedicated to young children.					
Ms. Lessard-Therrien (Rouyn-Noranda-Témiscamingue) made a statement to underline the 10th anniversary of La Marche verte.					
Mr. Boulet (Trois-Rivières) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Philippe Parent-Simard, award recipient at the Forces AVENIR gala.					
Mr. Jacques (Mégantic) made a declaration to underline the work of emergency medical technicians during the COVID-19 pandemic.					
By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 54.1 and 54.3, Mr. Ouellet (René-Lévesque) made a statement to pay tribute to Ms. Claudette Roussel, recipient of the Prix Hommage Aînés award.					
At 9:54 a.m., Ms. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.					
The proceedings resumed at 10:02 a.m.					
2698					

Moment of reflection

#### **Introduction of Bills**

Ms. Lessard-Therrien (Rouyn-Noranda-Témiscamingue) moved that leave be granted to introduce the following bill:

#### 491 An Act to combat food waste

The question was put on this motion; in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 20 October 2020, a vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **598** in Appendix)

Yeas: 119 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 0

Accordingly, Bill 491 was introduced in the Assembly.

The President communicated to the Assembly, and then tabled, the Law Clerk's report on the following private bill:

#### 214 An Act respecting Ville de Sutton

The report states that the notice was drafted and published in accordance with the Rules for the Conduct of Proceedings governing private bills.

(Sessional Paper No. 2082-20201112)

Ms. Hébert, Deputy Government Whip, on behalf of Mr. Bachand (Richmond), moved that leave be granted to introduce Private Bill°214, An Act respecting Ville de Sutton.

The question was put on this motion; in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 20 October 2020, a vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **599** in Appendix)

Yeas: 119 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 0

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, moved that Private Bill° 214 be referred to the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain for consultation and clause-by-clause consideration and that the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing be a member of the said Committee during its proceedings with respect to this order of reference.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **600** in Appendix)

Yeas: 119 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 0

The President communicated to the Assembly, and then tabled, the Law Clerk's report on the following private bill:

#### 215 An Act respecting Municipalité de Nominingue

The report states that the notice was drafted and published in accordance with the Rules for the Conduct of Proceedings governing private bills.

(Sessional Paper No. 2083-20201112)

Ms. Hébert, Deputy Government Whip, on behalf of Ms. Jeannotte (Labelle), moved that leave be granted to introduce Private Bill°215, An Act respecting Municipalité de Nominingue.

The question was put on this motion; in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 20 October 2020, a vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 601 in Appendix)

Yeas: 119 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 0

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, moved that Private Bill°215 be referred to the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain for consultation and clause-by-clause consideration and that the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing be a member of the said Committee during its proceedings with respect to this order of reference.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **602** in Appendix)

Yeas: 119 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 0

The President communicated to the Assembly, and then tabled, the Law Clerk's report on the following private bill:

218 An Act respecting Municipalité des Îles-de-la-Madeleine

The report states that the notice was drafted and published in accordance with the Rules for the Conduct of Proceedings governing private bills.

(Sessional Paper No. 2084-20201112)

Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine) moved that leave be granted to introduce Private Bill 218, An Act respecting Municipalité des Îles-de-la-Madeleine.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **603** in Appendix)

Yeas: 119 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 0

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, moved that Private Bill 218 be referred to the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain for consultation and clause-by-clause consideration and that the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing be a member of the said Committee during its proceedings with respect to this order of reference.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **604** in Appendix)

Yeas: 119 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 0

#### **Presenting Papers**

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, tabled the following on behalf of Mr. Roberge, Minister of Education:

The 2019–2020 review of the implementation of kindergarten for four-year-olds. (Sessional Paper No. 2085-20201112)

The President tabled the following:

A letter, dated 10 November 2020, he had received from Mr. Larbi El Hadj Ali, Algerian ambassador to Canada, in response to the motion on the climate of repression in which the referendum on the Algerian constitution was conducted, carried by the Assembly on 1 November 2020.

(Sessional Paper No. 2086-20201112)

#### **Presenting Reports from Committees**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 174, the President tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Institutions, which held public hearings on 5, 10 and 11 November 2020 within the framework of special consultations on Bill 72, An Act to amend various legislative provisions concerning mainly bodies in the field of public safety;

(Sessional Paper No. 2087-20201112)

The report from the Committee on Transportation and the Environment, which held public hearings on 10 and 11 November 2020 within the framework of special consultations on Bill 71, An Act respecting off-highway vehicles.

(Sessional Paper No. 2088-20201112)

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 4.4, he then tabled the following:

The report from the steering committee of the Committee on the National Assembly, which met on 11 November 2020 to make changes to the list of temporary Chairs.

(Sessional Paper No. 2089-20201112)

#### **Presenting Petitions**

Ms. Maccarone (Westmount–Saint-Louis) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on a reform of the support system for seniors, persons with disabilities, and informal caregivers, signed by 1,713 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 2090-20201112)

#### **Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 53, Mr. Roberge, Minister of Education, tabled the following:

Copies of three letters, sent to the directors general of the school service centres, school boards and private educational institutions, concerning a request to assess the quality of air and ventilation systems; the first, dated 29 June 2020, from Mr. Patrick Lachapelle, Director General of Infrastructure at the Ministère de l'Éducation et de l'Enseignement supérieur; the second, dated 21 August 2020, from Mr. Eric Blackburn, Deputy Minister at the Ministère de l'Éducation; the third, dated 28 September 2020, from Mr. Roberge, Minister of Education, and Ms. Charest, Minister for Education and Minister Responsible for the Status of Women.

(Sessional Paper No. 2091-20201112)

#### **Deferred Divisions**

Pursuant to section 103 of the *Code of ethics and conduct of the Members of the National Assembly*, the Assembly took the division on the report from the Ethics Commissioner to the President of the National Assembly on Mr. Pierre Fitzgibbon entitled "Rapport d'enquête du Commissaire à l'éthique et à la déontologie au président de l'Assemblée nationale au sujet de monsieur Pierre Fitzgibbon, ministre de l'Économie et de l'Innovation et député de Terrebonne".

The question was put on this motion; in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 20 October 2020, a vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside the motion carried on 20 October 2020, Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, recorded the votes of independent Members.

The report was concurred in on the following vote:

(Division No. 605 in Appendix)

Yeas: 120 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 1

#### **Motions Without Notice**

Ms. Gaudreault (Jonquière), together with Ms. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent), Ms. Lessard-Therrien (Rouyn-Noranda—Témiscamingue), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved a motion on the relocation of jobs to the regions; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

\_\_\_\_

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Ms. Roy, Minister of Culture and Communications, together with Ms. Melançon (Verdun), Ms. Ghazal (Mercier), Mr. Bérubé, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly of Québec pay tribute to the recently deceased Mr. Jacques Godin, one of the most influential figures in Québec theatre, radio, television and cinema;

THAT it underline Mr. Godin's outstanding career of more than six decades, during which he played hundreds of roles that made a lasting impression in the hearts of Quebecers;

THAT it underscore his major contribution to Québec's cultural landscape;

THAT it recall that Mr. Godin was a Knight of the Ordre national du Québec;

THAT it convey its sincere condolences to his family, his friends and his peers, and to his many admirers throughout Québec;

THAT, lastly, it observe a moment of silence in his memory.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the question was put on this motion; in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 20 October 2020, a vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 606 in Appendix)

Yeas: 119 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 0

At the request of the President, the Assembly observed a minute of silence.

\_\_\_\_\_

Mr. Derraji (Nelligan), together with Mr. Roy (Bonaventure), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved a motion on high-speed Internet access in the regions; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

Ms. Ghazal (Mercier), together with Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved a motion on the psychosocial impacts of the Québec LNG project on Quebecers; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

#### **Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

 the Committee on Public Finance, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 66, An Act respecting the acceleration of certain infrastructure projects;

- the Committee on Citizen Relations, to undertake clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 70, An Act to protect persons from conversion therapy provided to change their sexual orientation, gender identity or gender expression;
- the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain, to continue its clauseby-clause consideration of Bill 67, An Act to establish a new development regime for the flood zones of lakes and watercourses, to temporarily grant municipalities powers enabling them to respond to certain needs and to amend various provisions;
- the Committee on Transportation and the Environment, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 46, An Act to amend the Natural Heritage Conservation Act and other provisions;
- the Committee on Culture and Education, to undertake public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 69, An Act to amend the Cultural Heritage Act and other legislative provisions;
- the Committee on Institutions, to undertake public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 75, An Act to improve justice accessibility and efficiency, in particular to address consequences of the COVID-19 pandemic.

The President gave the following notice:

 the Committee on Citizen Relations shall hold a deliberative meeting to discuss the possibility of examining a petition.

#### **Information on the Proceedings of the Assembly**

The President informed the Assembly that on Friday, 27 November 2020, Ms. Massé, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, would question Mr. Dubé, Minister of Health and Social Services, during an interpellation on gaps in the provision of health care and social services for Indigenous peoples in Québec.

\_\_\_\_\_

#### ORDERS OF THE DAY

At 11:20 a.m., the President suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

\_\_\_\_

The proceedings resumed at 11:29 a.m.

#### **Private Bills**

Passage in Principle

Mr. Lemay (Masson) moved that Private Bill 210, An Act respecting the subdivision of a lot located in the Maison Roussil protection area in Terrebonne and partly in the Maison Bélisle protection area in Terrebonne, do now pass in principle.

The question was put on this motion; at 11:31 a.m., in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 20 October 2020, Ms. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for no longer than 10 minutes so that a recorded division could be held.

\_\_\_\_

The proceedings resumed at 11:32 a.m.
A vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.
The motion was carried on the following vote:
(Division No. 607 in Appendix)
Yeas: 120 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 0
Accordingly, Bill 210 was passed in principle.
Passage
Mr. Lemay (Masson) moved the passage of Private Bill 210, An Act respecting the subdivision of a lot located in the Maison Roussil protection area in Terrebonne and partly in the Maison Bélisle protection area in Terrebonne.
The debate being concluded, the question was put on this motion; at 11:42 a.m., in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 20 October 2020, Ms. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for no longer than 10 minutes so that a recorded division could be held.
The proceedings resumed at 11:43 a.m.
A vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 608 in Appendix)

Yeas: 120 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 0

Accordingly, Bill 210 was passed.

\_\_\_\_\_

At 11:44 a.m., at the request of Mr. Caire, Deputy Government House Leader, Ms. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 1:00 p.m.

#### **Debates upon Adjournment**

At 1:00 p.m., in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 20 October 2020, the Assembly held three debates upon adjournment:

- the first, on a question from Ms. Robitaille (Bourassa-Sauvé) to Ms. Rouleau, Minister Responsible for the Metropolis and the Montréal Region, about the measures required from the CAQ government following an increase in violence and insecurity in Montréal-Nord;
- the second, on a question from Ms. Labrie (Sherbrooke) to Mr. Roberge, Minister of Education, about safe ventilation in schools;
- the third, on a question from Ms. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent) to Mr. Roberge, Minister of Education, about the Minister of Health and Social Services' admission that the CAQ government has neglected to deal with the issue of ventilation in schools.

\_\_\_\_

Mr. Roberge, Minister of Education, moved the adjournment of the Assembly until Tuesday, 24 November 2020 at 1:40 p.m.

The question was put on this motion; in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 20 October 2020, a vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 609 in Appendix)

Yeas: 110 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 0

At 1:39 p.m., Mr. Picard, First Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Thursday, 24 November 2020 at 1:40 p.m.

#### **ROYAL ASSENT**

On Thursday, 12 November 2020 at 12:05 p.m. in the Office of the Lieutenant-Governor, in the presence of Mr. Lemay (Masson), Delegate of the Premier, and of Ms. Beauregard, Director of Sittings and Parliamentary Procedure and Delegate of the Secretary General, the Honourable J. Michel Doyon, Lieutenant-Governor of Québec, was pleased to assent to the following bill:

An Act respecting the subdivision of a lot located in the Maison Roussil protection area in Terrebonne and partly in the Maison Bélisle protection area in Terrebonne

FRANÇOIS PARADIS

President

2711

#### **APPENDIX**

### **Recorded Divisions**

On the motion moved by Ms. Lessard-Therrien (Rouyn-Noranda-Témiscamingue):

### (Division No. 598)

YEAS - 119					
Allaire (CAQ)	Dufour $(CAQ)$	LeBel (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)		
Anglade (QLP)	Émond ( <i>CAQ</i> )	(Champlain)	(Berthier)		
Arcand (QLP)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)		
Arseneau (PQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Reid (CAQ)		
Asselin (CAQ)	Fortin (QLP)	Lecours (CAQ)	Richard $(PQ)$		
Bachand (CAQ)	Foster (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	Rizqy ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Barrette (QLP)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Leduc (QS)	Roberge (CAQ)		
Bélanger (CAQ)	(Jonquière)	Lefebvre ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Robitaille ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Benjamin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Ghazal (QS)	Legault (CAQ)	Rotiroti ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Bérubé (PQ)	Girard $(CAQ)$	Leitão (QLP)	Rouleau (CAQ)		
Birnbaum (QLP)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Lemay (CAQ)	Rousselle ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Blais $(CAQ)$	Girard $(CAQ)$	Lemieux (CAQ)	Roy(PQ)		
(Prévost)	(Groulx)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	(Bonaventure)		
Blais $(CAQ)$	Girault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Roy $(CAQ)$		
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Grondin (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	(Montarville)		
Bonnardel ( $CAQ$ )	Guilbault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Samson $(CAQ)$		
Boulet $(CAQ)$	Guillemette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	(Chapleau)	Sauvé ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Boutin $(CAQ)$	Hébert (CAQ)	Maccarone (QLP)	Schneeberger $(CAQ)$		
Bussière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Hivon (PQ)	Marissal (QS)	Simard ( <i>CAQ</i> )		
Caire $(CAQ)$	Isabelle ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Martel $(CAQ)$	Skeete ( $CAQ$ )		
Campeau (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Massé (QS)	St-Pierre ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Carmant ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Jeannotte ( $CAQ$ )	McCann (CAQ)	Tanguay (QLP)		
Caron $(CAQ)$	Jolin-Barrette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Melançon (QLP)	Tardif $(CAQ)$		
Charbonneau (QLP)	Julien ( $CAQ$ )	Ménard (QLP)	(Laviolette–Saint-Maurice)		
Charest $(CAQ)$	Kelley ( <i>QLP</i> )	Montpetit ( <i>QLP</i> )	Tardif $(CAQ)$		
Charette ( $CAQ$ )	Labrie (QS)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	(Rivière-du-Loup–Témiscouata)		
Chassé (CAQ)	Lachance $(CAQ)$	Nichols (QLP)	Thériault ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Chassin (CAQ)	Lacombe ( $CAQ$ )	Ouellet $(PQ)$	Thouin $(CAQ)$		
Ciccone (QLP)	Laforest (CAQ)	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	Tremblay $(CAQ)$		
D'Amours ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Laframboise (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	Weil ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Dansereau (CAQ)	Lafrenière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	(Soulanges)	Zanetti (QS)		
David ( <i>QLP</i> )	Lamontagne $(CAQ)$	Polo $(QLP)$			
Derraji (QLP)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)			
Dorion $(QS)$	Lavallée ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Proulx $(CAQ)$			
Dubé (CAQ)	LeBel $(PQ)$	(Côte-du-Sud)			
	(Rimouski)				

	On the motion moved	by Ms.	Hébert,	Deputy	Government	Whip,	on	behalf	of
Mr.	Bachand (Richmond):								

(Division No. 599)

(Identical to Division No. 598)

On the motion moved by Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader:

(Division No. 600)

(Identical to Division No. 598)

\_\_\_\_\_

On the motion moved by Ms. Hébert, Deputy Government Whip, on behalf of Ms. Jeannotte (Labelle):

(Division No. 601)

(Identical to Division No. 598)

\_\_\_\_

On the motion moved by Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader:

(Division No. 602)

(Identical to Division No. 598)

\_\_\_\_\_

On the motion moved by Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine):

(Division No. 603)

(Identical to Division No. 598)

\_\_\_\_

On the motion moved by Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader:

(Division No. 604)

(Identical to Division No. 598)

\_\_\_\_

On the investigation report from the Ethics Commissioner to the President of the National Assembly concerning Mr. Pierre Fitzgibbon, Minister of Economy and Innovation and Member for Terrebonne:

### (Division No. 605)

YEAS - 120					
Allaire (CAQ)	Dufour (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)		
Anglade (QLP)	Émond (CAQ)	(Champlain)	(Berthier)		
Arcand (QLP)	Fontecilla (QS)	Lecours (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)		
Arseneau (PQ)	Fortin (QLP)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Reid (CAQ)		
Asselin (CAQ)	Foster $(CAQ)$	Lecours (CAQ)	Richard (PQ)		
Bachand (CAQ)	Fournier (IND)	(Les Plaines)	Rizqy ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Barrette (QLP)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Leduc $(QS)$	Roberge (CAQ)		
Bélanger (CAQ)	(Jonquière)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Robitaille ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Benjamin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Ghazal $(QS)$	Legault (CAQ)	Rotiroti ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Bérubé (PQ)	Girard ( $CAQ$ )	Leitão (QLP)	Rouleau (CAQ)		
Birnbaum ( <i>QLP</i> )	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Lemay $(CAQ)$	Rousselle ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Blais (CAQ)	Girard ( $CAQ$ )	Lemieux (CAQ)	Roy(PQ)		
(Prévost)	(Groulx)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	(Bonaventure)		
Blais $(CAQ)$	Girault ( $CAQ$ )	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Roy(CAQ)		
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Grondin ( $CAQ$ )	(Chauveau)	(Montarville)		
Bonnardel ( $CAQ$ )	Guilbault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Samson $(CAQ)$		
Boulet $(CAQ)$	Guillemette ( $CAQ$ )	(Chapleau)	Sauvé ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Boutin (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Maccarone (QLP)	Schneeberger ( $CAQ$ )		
Bussière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Hivon (PQ)	Marissal (QS)	Simard $(CAQ)$		
Caire $(CAQ)$	Isabelle $(CAQ)$	Martel $(CAQ)$	Skeete (CAQ)		
Campeau (CAQ)	Jacques $(CAQ)$	Massé (QS)	St-Pierre ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Carmant $(CAQ)$	Jeannotte (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)	Tanguay (QLP)		
Caron (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Melançon (QLP)	Tardif $(CAQ)$		
Charbonneau (QLP)	Julien (CAQ)	Ménard (QLP)	(Laviolette–Saint-Maurice)		
Charest (CAQ)	Kelley (QLP)	Montpetit (QLP)	Tardif (CAQ)		
Charette ( $CAQ$ )	Labrie (QS)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	(Rivière-du-Loup-		
<b>G</b>			Témiscouata)		
Chassé (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Nichols (QLP)	Thériault ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Chassin (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	Thouin (CAQ)		
Ciccone (QLP)	Laforest (CAQ)	Ouellette (IND)	Tremblay (CAQ)		
D'Amours (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Perry Mélançon ( <i>PQ</i> )	Weil (QLP)		
Dansereau (CAQ)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	Zanetti (QS)		
David (QLP)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	(Soulanges)			
Derraji (QLP)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Polo (QLP)			
Dorion (QS)	Lavallée ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Prouly (CAQ)			
Dubé (CAQ)	LeBel (PQ) (Rimouski)	Proulx $(CAQ)$ $(C\hat{o}te-du-Sud)$			
	(Kimouski)	(Coie-au-sua)			

### **ABSTENTIONS - 1**

Fitzgibbon (*CAQ*)

On the motion moved by Ms. Roy, Minister of Culture and Communications, together with Ms. Melançon (Verdun), Ms. Ghazal (Mercier), Mr. Bérubé, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin):

### (Division No. 606)

### **YEAS - 119**

Allaire $(CAQ)$	Dufour $(CAQ)$	LeBel (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)
Anglade $(QLP)$	Émond $(CAQ)$	(Champlain)	(Berthier)
Arcand $(QLP)$	Fitzgibbon $(CAQ)$	Lecours (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Arseneau $(PQ)$	Fontecilla ( <i>QS</i> )	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Reid $(CAQ)$
Asselin $(\widetilde{CAQ})$	Fortin $(QLP)$	Lecours (CAQ)	Richard $(PQ)$
Bachand $(CAQ)$	Foster $(CAQ)$	(Les Plaines)	Rizqy $(QLP)$
Barrette $(QLP)$	Gaudreault (PQ)	Leduc (QS)	Roberge $(CAQ)$
Bélanger ( <i>CAQ</i> )	(Jonquière)	Lefebvre ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Robitaille $(QLP)$
Benjamin (QLP)	Ghazal (QS)	Legault $(CAQ)$	Rotiroti (QLP)
Bérubé ( $PQ$ )	Girard $(\widetilde{CAQ})$	Leitão (QLP)	Rouleau $(CAQ)$
Birnbaum (QLP)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Lemay $(CAQ)$	Rousselle $(QLP)$
Blais $(CAQ)$	Girard (CAQ)	Lemieux $(\widetilde{CAQ})$	Roy(PQ)
(Prévost)	(Groulx)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	(Bonaventure)
Blais (CAQ)	Girault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Roy(CAQ)
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Grondin $(\widetilde{CAQ})$	(Chauveau)	(Montarville)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Guilbault ( $\overrightarrow{CAQ}$ )	Lévesque (CAQ)	Samson (CAQ)
Boulet $(CAQ)$	Guillemette $(\widetilde{CAQ})$	(Chapleau)	Sauvé (QLP)
Boutin $(CAQ)$	Hébert (CAQ)	Maccarone (QLP)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Bussière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Hivon $(PQ)$	Marissal (QS)	Simard $(CAQ)$
Caire (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Skeete ( $CAQ$ )
Campeau (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Massé (QS)	St-Pierre ( <i>QLP</i> )
Carmant (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)	Tanguay (QLP)
Caron $(CAQ)$	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Melançon (QLP)	Tardif $(CAQ)$
Charbonneau (QLP)	Julien (CAQ)	Ménard (QLP)	(Laviolette-Saint-Maurice)
Charest (CAQ)	Kelley (QLP)	Montpetit ( <i>QLP</i> )	Tardif $(CAQ)$
Charette (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	(Rivière-du-Loup–Témiscouata)
Chassé (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Nichols (QLP)	Thériault (QLP)
Chassin ( $CAQ$ )	Lacombe $(CAQ)$	Ouellet $(PQ)$	Thouin $(CAQ)$
Ciccone (QLP)	Laforest (CAQ)	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)
D'Amours (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	Weil (QLP)
Dansereau (CAQ)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	(Soulanges)	Zanetti ( <i>QS</i> )
David (QLP)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Polo (QLP)	
Derraji (QLP)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Poulin ( $CAQ$ )	
Dorion $(QS)$	Lavallée (CAQ)	Proulx ( $CAQ$ )	
Dubé (CAQ)	LeBel $(PQ)$	(Côte-du-Sud)	
	(Rimouski)		

## On the motion moved by Mr. Lemay (Masson):

## (Division No. 607)

### **YEAS - 120**

	1 LAG - 12	10	
Allaire $(CAQ)$	Dufour $(CAQ)$	LeBel $(PQ)$	Proulx $(CAQ)$
Anglade (QLP)	Émond ( <i>CAQ</i> )	(Rimouski)	(Côte-du-Sud)
Arcand (QLP)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Proulx $(CAQ)$
Arseneau (PQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	(Champlain)	(Berthier)
Asselin (CAQ)	Fortin (QLP)	Lecours (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Bachand (CAQ)	Foster ( <i>CAQ</i> )	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Reid ( $CAQ$ )
Barrette (QLP)	Fournier ( <i>IND</i> )	Lecours (CAQ)	Richard (PQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Gaudreault (PQ)	(Les Plaines)	Rizqy (QLP)
Benjamin (QLP)	(Jonquière)	Leduc $(QS)$	Roberge (CAQ)
Bérubé (PQ)	Ghazal (QS)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Robitaille ( <i>QLP</i> )
Birnbaum ( <i>QLP</i> )	Girard (CAQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Blais (CAQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Leitão (QLP)	Rouleau (CAQ)
(Prévost)	Girard ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lemay (CAQ)	Rousselle ( <i>QLP</i> )
Blais (CAQ)	(Groulx)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Roy(PQ)
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Girault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	(Bonaventure)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Roy(CAQ)
Boulet (CAQ)	Guilbault (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	(Montarville)
Boutin ( $CAQ$ )	Guillemette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lévesque (CAQ)	Samson (CAQ)
Bussière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Hébert (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Sauvé (QLP)
Caire $(CAQ)$	Hivon(PQ)	Maccarone (QLP)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Campeau (CAQ)	Isabelle ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Marissal (QS)	Simard $(CAQ)$
Carmant (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Skeete (CAQ)
Caron (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Massé (QS)	St-Pierre ( <i>QLP</i> )
Charbonneau (QLP)	Jolin-Barrette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	McCann (CAQ)	Tanguay (QLP)
Charest (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Melançon (QLP)	Tardif (CAQ)
Charette (CAQ)	Kelley (QLP)	Ménard (QLP)	(Laviolette-Saint-Maurice)
Chassé (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Montpetit ( <i>QLP</i> )	Tardif $(CAQ)$
Chassin $(CAQ)$	Lachance (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	(Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata)
Ciccone (QLP)	Lacombe $(CAQ)$	Nichols (QLP)	Thériault (QLP)
D'Amours (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Ouellet $(PQ)$	Thouin (CAQ)
Dansereau (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)
David ( <i>QLP</i> )	Lafrenière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Picard (CAQ)	Weil (QLP)
Derraji (QLP)	Lamontagne $(CAQ)$	(Soulanges)	Zanetti (QS)
Dorion $(QS)$	Lamothe (CAQ)	Polo (QLP)	
Dubé (CAQ)	Lavallée ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Poulin (CAQ)	

On the motion moved by Mr. Lemay (Masson):

(Division No. 608)

(Identical to Division No. 607)

### On the motion moved by Mr. Roberge, Minister of Education:

### (Division No. 609)

YEAS - 110						
Allaire ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Dubé (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Proulx $(CAQ)$			
Anglade (QLP)	Dufour $(CAQ)$	(Champlain)	(Berthier)			
Arcand (QLP)	Émond (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)			
Asselin (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Reid ( $CAQ$ )			
Bachand (CAQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	Lecours (CAQ)	Rizqy (QLP)			
Barrette (QLP)	Fortin ( <i>QLP</i> )	(Les Plaines)	Roberge (CAQ)			
Bélanger (CAQ)	Foster $(CAQ)$	Leduc $(QS)$	Robitaille ( <i>QLP</i> )			
Benjamin (QLP)	Ghazal (QS)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Rotiroti (QLP)			
Birnbaum (QLP)	Girard (CAQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)			
Blais $(CAQ)$	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Leitão (QLP)	Rousselle ( <i>QLP</i> )			
(Prévost)	Girard $(CAQ)$	Lemay $(CAQ)$	Roy(CAQ)			
Blais $(CAQ)$	(Groulx)	Lemieux (CAQ)	(Montarville)			
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Girault (CAQ)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	Samson (CAQ)			
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Sauvé ( <i>QLP</i> )			
Boulet $(CAQ)$	Guilbault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	(Chauveau)	Schneeberger (CAQ)			
Boutin (CAQ)	Guillemette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lévesque (CAQ)	Simard $(CAQ)$			
Bussière (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Skeete ( $CAQ$ )			
Caire (CAQ)	Isabelle ( $CAQ$ )	Maccarone (QLP)	St-Pierre ( <i>QLP</i> )			
Campeau (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Marissal (QS)	Tanguay (QLP)			
Carmant (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Tardif $(CAQ)$			
Caron $(CAQ)$	Jolin-Barrette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Massé (QS)	(Laviolette–Saint-Maurice)			
Charbonneau (QLP)	Julien ( $CAQ$ )	McCann (CAQ)	Tardif $(CAQ)$			
Charest (CAQ)	Kelley ( <i>QLP</i> )	Melançon (QLP)	(Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata)			
Charette (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Ménard (QLP)	Thériault ( <i>QLP</i> )			
Chassé (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Montpetit ( <i>QLP</i> )	Thouin $(CAQ)$			
Chassin ( $CAQ$ )	Lacombe ( $CAQ$ )	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	Tremblay (CAQ)			
Ciccone (QLP)	Laforest (CAQ)	Nichols (QLP)	Weil ( <i>QLP</i> )			
D'Amours ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Laframboise (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	Zanetti (QS)			
Dansereau (CAQ)	Lafrenière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	(Soulanges)				
David ( <i>QLP</i> )	Lamontagne ( $CAQ$ )	Polo ( <i>QLP</i> )				
Derraji (QLP)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)				
Dorion (QS)	Lavallée ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Proulx (CAQ)				
		(Côte-du-Sud)				