



---

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF QUÉBEC

---

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-SECOND LEGISLATURE

## **Votes and Proceedings**

**of the Assembly**

**Friday, 4 December 2020 — No. 151**

**President of the National Assembly:  
Mr. François Paradis**

---



The Assembly was called to order at 9:40 a.m.

---

## **ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

### **Statements by Members**

Ms. IsaBelle (Huntingdon) made a statement to underline the success of Grant's Bakery.

---

Ms. Maccarone (Westmount–Saint-Louis) made a statement to underline the 95th birthday of Ms. Sheila Barshay Goldbloom.

---

Ms. Grondin (Argenteuil) made a statement to applaud the establishment of an outdoor class for the students of École du Triolet.

---

Mr. Rousselle (Vimont) made a statement to congratulate the Vimont-Auteuil Coureurs de boisés walking club on being awarded the Hosia award.

---

Ms. Girault (Bertrand) made a statement to congratulate the municipality of Saint-Donat, new member of the Village-relais network.

---

**4 December 2020**

---

Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia) made a statement to underline the career of notary Serge Bernier as well as his community involvement.

---

Mr. Poulin (Beauce-Sud) made a statement to underline the release of a new album by singer Maxime Landry.

---

Mr. Skeete (Sainte-Rose) made a statement to underline the work of the organization Opération Père Noël.

---

Mr. Carmant (Taillon) made a statement to underline the International Day of Persons with Disabilities.

---

At 9:50 a.m., Mr. Picard, First Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

---

The proceedings resumed at 10:03 a.m.

---

Moment of reflection

### Presenting Papers

Mr. Caire, Deputy Government House Leader, tabled the following on behalf of Mr. Roberge, Minister of Education:

The 2018–2020 report of the Conseil supérieur de l'éducation on the state and needs of education.

(Sessional Paper No. 2150-20201204)

He then tabled the following on behalf of Ms. McCann, Minister of Higher Education:

The 2019–2020 financial statements, salary statements and reports on the performance and development prospects of the following institutions:

École nationale d'administration publique

(Sessional Paper No. 2151-20201204)

École de technologie supérieure

(Sessional Paper No. 2152-20201204)

HEC Montréal

(Sessional Paper No. 2153-20201204)

Institut national de recherche scientifique

(Sessional Paper No. 2154-20201204)

Polytechnique Montréal

(Sessional Paper No. 2155-20201204)

Bishop's University

(Sessional Paper No. 2156-20201204)

Concordia University

(Sessional Paper No. 2157-20201204)

Université de Montréal

(Sessional Paper No. 2158-20201204)

Université de Sherbrooke

(Sessional Paper No. 2159-20201204)

Université du Québec (head office)

(Sessional Paper No. 2160-20201204)

**4 December 2020**

---

Université du Québec en Abitibi-Témiscamingue	(Sessional Paper No. 2161-20201204)
Université du Québec à Chicoutimi	(Sessional Paper No. 2162-20201204)
Université du Québec à Montréal	(Sessional Paper No. 2163-20201204)
Université du Québec en Outaouais	(Sessional Paper No. 2164-20201204)
Université du Québec à Rimouski	(Sessional Paper No. 2165-20201204)
Université du Québec à Trois-Rivières	(Sessional Paper No. 2166-20201204)
Université Laval	(Sessional Paper No. 2167-20201204)
McGill University	(Sessional Paper No. 2168-20201204)
Télé-Université du Québec (TÉLUQ).	(Sessional Paper No. 2169-20201204)

He then tabled the following on behalf of Ms. Laforest, Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing:

The 2020–2023 strategic plan of the Tribunal administratif du logement.  
(Sessional Paper No. 2170-20201204)

---

The President tabled the following:

A letter, dated 3 December 2020, he had received from Mr. Serge Courville, Commission de la représentation électorale du Québec commissioner, informing him of his resignation, effective 3 December 2020.  
(Sessional Paper No. 2171-20201204)

**Presenting Reports from Committees**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 61 and 174, the President tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Health and Social Services, which held public hearings on 6, 7, 8 and 13 November 2019 within the framework of special consultations on the order of initiative on the alarming increase in the use by children and youth of psychostimulants in relation to attention deficit hyperactivity disorder (ADHD). The report contains conclusions and 17 recommendations;  
(Sessional Paper No. 2172-20201204)

The report from the Committee on Transportation and the Environment, which met on 1, 2 and 3 December 2020 for clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 71, An Act respecting off-highway vehicles. The report contains amendments to the bill.  
(Sessional Paper No. 2173-20201204)

**Presenting Petitions**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mr. Benjamin (Viau) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on the humanized landscape project for L'Île-Bizard, signed by 147 citizens of L'Île-Bizard.  
(Sessional Paper No. 2174-20201204)

**Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 53 and 59, Mr. Ciccone (Marquette) tabled the following:

A copy of a document on the recovery plan for sports and recreation by the sports, recreation and physical activity directorate (DSLAP) entitled “Plan de relance en loisir et en sport de la Direction du sport, du loisir et de l’activité physique, DSLAP – 20 octobre 2020”.

(Sessional Paper No. 2175-20201204)

**Motions Without Notice**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 184.1 and 185, Ms. Anglade, Leader of the Official Opposition, together with Ms. Guilbault, Deputy Premier, Ms. Labrie (Sherbrooke), Mr. Bérubé, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly of Québec remember the tragedy that occurred at École polytechnique de Montréal 31 years ago today, on 6 December 1989;

THAT it honour the memory of the 14 young women who lost their lives during this femicide and that it remember the many others who were wounded;

THAT it strongly denounce all forms of violence perpetrated against women;

THAT it reiterate that gender equality and respect between women and men are fundamental values of our society;



**4 December 2020**

---

THAT each of its members contribute to making Québec a society in which women can live without fear that their dignity and safety may be compromised;

THAT it again bring attention to the 12 Days of Action to End Violence against Women, an initiative encouraging the reporting of such violence and the promoting of actions to prevent all forms of this violence, so as to support the victims;

THAT it ask all of the political parties to unite their voices in commemorating these 14 young women and their bereaved families;

THAT, lastly, the National Assembly observe a minute of silence in their memory.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the question was put on this motion; in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 20 October 2020, a vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **639** in Appendix)

Yeas: **120**   Nays: **0**   Abstentions: **0**

At the request of the President, the Assembly observed a minute of silence.

---

Mr. Leduc (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve), together with Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved a motion on organizing a working meeting on the criminalization of drug users; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

---

**4 December 2020**

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière), together with Ms. Roy, Minister of Culture and Communications, Ms. Melançon (Verdun), Ms. Ghazal (Mercier), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly pay tribute to the great Québec actor Mr. Michel Dumont, who passed away on 13 August at the age of 79;

THAT it applaud his long career as an actor, and also as the artistic director of the Jean-Duceppe institution;

THAT it also underscore his outstanding commitment to making theatre accessible to all, as well as to the French language and Québec culture;

THAT the National Assembly extend its deepest condolences to his family and loved ones, and that it observe a minute of silence in his memory.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the question was put on this motion; in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 20 October 2020, a vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **640** in Appendix)

Yeas: **120**   Nays: **0**   Abstentions: **0**

At the request of the President, the Assembly observed a minute of silence.

---

**4 December 2020**

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Ms. Girault, Minister of International Relations and La Francophonie, together with Ms. Ménard (Laporte), Mr. Fontecilla (Laurier-Dorion), Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), moved:

THAT the National Assembly commemorate the 11th anniversary of the 12 January 2010 earthquake that struck Haiti, causing the deaths of more than 200,000 people and injuring hundreds of thousands;

THAT it pay tribute to the thousands of people who went missing and were injured during this earthquake;

THAT it reiterate its compassion for the families and communities directly affected by this catastrophe;

THAT it underscore the resilience and dignity of the Haitian people with regard to the hardships they have had to overcome in the wake of this tragedy;

THAT it reiterate its unwavering solidarity with the Haitian people and the nearly 150,000 Haitian Quebecers;

THAT, lastly, the Members of the National Assembly observe a minute of silence in memory of the victims.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the question was put on this motion; in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 20 October 2020, a vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **641** in Appendix)

Yeas: **120**   Nays: **0**   Abstentions: **0**

**4 December 2020**

---

At the request of the President, the Assembly observed a minute of silence.

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), together with Ms. Charest, Minister Responsible for the Status of Women, Ms. Melançon (Verdun), Ms. Labrie (Sherbrooke), Ms. Perry Mélançon (Gaspé) and Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey), moved:

THAT the National Assembly acknowledge the Scottish Parliament's unanimous support for the passage, last 24 November, of a law giving women the right to obtain feminine hygiene products free of charge;

THAT it take note that all public schools in the British Columbia school system are required to make feminine hygiene products available to their students;

THAT it take note of the subsidy programs established by Québec municipalities aimed at encouraging the purchase of sustainable and reusable feminine hygiene products;

THAT it ask the Québec government to examine the possibility of making feminine hygiene products available free of charge in all public institutions, including schools.

The question was put on this motion; in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 20 October 2020, a vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **642** in Appendix)

Yeas: **120** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

**Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

Mr. Caire, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

- the Committee on Public Finance, to undertake clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 68, An Act mainly to allow the establishment of target benefit pension plans;
- the Committee on Transportation and the Environment, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 46, An Act to amend the Natural Heritage Conservation Act and other provisions;
- the Committee on Institutions, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 75, An Act to improve justice accessibility and efficiency, in particular to address consequences of the COVID-19 pandemic;
- the Committee on Public Finance, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 66, An Act respecting the acceleration of certain infrastructure projects;
- the Committee on Health and Social Services, to hold public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 73, An Act to amend various provisions relating to assisted procreation.

**Information on the Proceedings of the Assembly**

The President issued his directive on the question raised by the Second Opposition Group House Leader on 3 December 2020 concerning the disclosure of content of the report of the Select Committee on the Sexual Exploitation of Minors before its tabling in the Assembly.

### RULING FROM THE CHAIR

There is no evidence showing that the report in question was prematurely disclosed. However, the confusion generated by this situation requires a reminder of the basic principles applicable in this area.

Members must be the first to be apprised of information that is intended for them. It is not only a matter of respecting parliamentarians, but also of respecting the important duties of their office and the essential role they play in society as legislators.

Parliamentary jurisprudence has oftentimes affirmed that it is crucial for Members, and not journalists, to be informed first of the information that is intended for them. This is true for bills, reports to be tabled in the Assembly and written questions to be entered on the *Order Paper and Notices*. Journalists have no special status in this respect and therefore cannot be given documents that Members should be apprised of first.

The content of the final reports to be tabled by parliamentary committees must be disclosed first and foremost to parliamentarians, in particular because they themselves are the main instigators.

A distinction must be made between, on the one hand, a committee's work that is conducted in public, which can be the subject of comments at any time in the public sphere, and, on the other hand, the final report of a select committee containing specific observations, conclusions and recommendations, which reflect work conducted in working sessions, which, while not public, are also not in camera. The purpose of the private nature of these deliberative meetings is to establish an environment in which committee members may speak openly and frankly. The Chair relies on committee members to conduct themselves in a manner that serves that purpose and asks that they measure the impact of their actions in public.

The report from the Select Committee is the product of the collective efforts of its members, and its findings wholly belong to the Committee. The Committee should be able to table its report and make its content public before media articles cover its content.

When the members of a committee agree in advance on when the contents of a report are to be released to the media, it is their collective and individual responsibility to honour that commitment. Caution should therefore be exercised, especially when a member has an important role within the committee.

**4 December 2020**

---

The fact that a parliamentarian speaks to the media on the very morning of a report being tabled could be confusing to both MNAs and the public. Associating one's name to an article dealing with certain aspects of a report may create the impression, rightly or wrongly, that a parliamentarian may have given a journalist access to the contents of a report before it is tabled in the House. For this reason, the Chair urges Members to act with caution.

---

**ORDERS OF THE DAY**

**Estimates of expenditure**

*Supplementary estimates*

Pursuant to the order adopted on 3 December 2020, the Assembly resolved itself into a Committee of the Whole in order to examine the Supplementary Estimates No. 1 for the fiscal year ending 31 March 2021.

At 11:55 a.m., the President suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

---

The proceedings resumed at 12:04 p.m.

*Consideration in Committee of the Whole*

Pursuant to the order adopted on 3 December 2020, the Committee of the Whole resumed its examination of the Supplementary Estimates No. 1 for the fiscal year ending 31 March 2021.

**4 December 2020**

---

With the permission of Mr. Picard, Chair of the Committee of the Whole, Ms. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent) tabled the following:

An article entitled “Testing mobile air purifiers in a school classroom: Reducing the airborne transmission risk for SARS-CoV-2”.

(Sessional Paper No. 2176-20201204)

The examination being concluded, the question was put on concurrence in Supplementary Estimates No. 1 for the fiscal year ending 31 March 2021; in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 20 October 2020, a vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The Supplementary Estimates No. 1 were concurred in on the following vote:

(Division No. **643** in Appendix)

Yeas: **73**   Nays: **46**   Abstentions: **0**

---

At 1:06 p.m., Mr. Picard, Chair of the Committee of the Whole, suspended the committee proceedings for a few minutes.

---

The proceedings resumed at 1:12 p.m.

---



**4 December 2020**

---

Mr. Girard (Lac-Saint-Jean), member of the Committee of the Whole, reported to the Assembly as follows:

The Committee of the Whole adopted all of the Supplementary Estimates No. 1 and the Government is authorized to take from the Consolidated Revenue Fund a maximum amount of \$5,151,300,000.00 to cover Québec's supplementary estimates for expenses presented in the National Assembly for the fiscal year 2020–2021, which were not otherwise provided for, that is, the amount for the estimates to be voted for each of the different programs listed in the appendix of the bill presented hereafter.

The question was put on concurrence in the report; at 1:13 p.m., in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 20 October 2020, Mr. Picard, First Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for no longer than 10 minutes so that a recorded division could be held.

---

The proceedings resumed at 1:16 p.m.

---

A vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The report was concurred in on the following vote:

(Division No. **644** in Appendix)

Yeas: **73**   Nays: **46**   Abstentions: **0**

### **Appropriation Bills**

Ms. LeBel, Minister Responsible for Government Administration and Chair of the Conseil du trésor, moved:

THAT Bill 76, Appropriation Act No. 4, 2020–2021, be  
brought before the Assembly;

**2845**

**4 December 2020**

---

THAT this bill do pass in principle;

THAT this bill do pass.

The debate being concluded, the question was put on this motion; in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 20 October 2020, a vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The motion was carried on the following vote:  
(Division No. **645** in Appendix)

Yeas: **73**   Nays: **46**   Abstentions: **0**

Accordingly, Bill 76, Appropriation Act No. 4, 2020–2021, was passed.

---

At 1:17 p.m., Mr. Picard, First Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Tuesday, 8 December 2020 at 1:40 p.m.

**ROYAL ASSENT**

On Friday, 4 December 2020 at 2:00 p.m. in the Office of the Lieutenant-Governor, in the presence of Ms. Beauregard, Director ofittings and Parliamentary Procedure and Delegate of the Secretary General, the Honourable J. Michel Doyon, Lieutenant-Governor of Québec, was pleased to assent to the following bill:

76      Appropriation Act No. 4, 2020–2021

**FRANÇOIS PARADIS**

*President*

## APPENDIX

### Recorded Divisions

On the motion moved by Ms. Anglade, Leader of the Official Opposition, together with Ms. Guilbault, Deputy Premier, Ms. Labrie (Sherbrooke), Mr. Bérubé, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin):

#### (Division No. 639)

#### YEAS - 120

Allaire (CAQ)	Dufour (CAQ)	LeBel (PQ)	Proulx (CAQ)
Anglade (QLP)	Émond (CAQ)	(Rimouski)	(Côte-du-Sud)
Arcand (QLP)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)
Arseneau (PQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	(Champlain)	(Berthier)
Asselin (CAQ)	Fortin (QLP)	Lecours (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Bachand (CAQ)	Foster (CAQ)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Reid (CAQ)
Barrette (QLP)	Fournier (IND)	Lecours (CAQ)	Richard (PQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Gaudreault (PQ)	(Les Plaines)	Rizqy (QLP)
Benjamin (QLP)	(Jonquière)	Leduc (QS)	Roberge (CAQ)
Bérubé (PQ)	Ghazal (QS)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Robitaille (QLP)
Birnbaum (QLP)	Girard (CAQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Blais (CAQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Leitão (QLP)	Rouleau (CAQ)
(Prévost)	Girard (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	Rousselle (QLP)
Blais (CAQ)	(Groulx)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Roy (PQ)
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Girault (CAQ)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	(Bonaventure)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Roy (CAQ)
Boulet (CAQ)	Guilbault (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	(Montarville)
Boutin (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Samson (CAQ)
Bussière (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Sauvé (QLP)
Caire (CAQ)	Hivon (PQ)	Maccarone (QLP)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Campeau (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	Marissal (QS)	Simard (CAQ)
Carmant (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Skeete (CAQ)
Caron (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Massé (QS)	St-Pierre (QLP)
Charbonneau (QLP)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)	Tanguay (QLP)
Charest (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Melançon (QLP)	Tardif (CAQ)
Charette (CAQ)	Kelley (QLP)	Ménard (QLP)	(Lavolette-Saint-Maurice)
Chassé (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Montpetit (QLP)	Tardif (CAQ)
Chassin (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	(Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata)
Ciccone (QLP)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Nichols (QLP)	Thériault (QLP)
D'Amours (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	Thouin (CAQ)
Dansereau (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Perry Melançon (PQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)
David (QLP)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	Weil (QLP)
Derraji (QLP)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	(Soulanges)	Zanetti (QS)
Dorion (QS)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Polo (QLP)	
Dubé (CAQ)	Lavallée (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)	

**4 December 2020**

---

On the motion moved by Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière), together with Ms. Roy, Minister of Culture and Communications, Ms. Melançon (Verdun), Ms. Ghazal (Mercier), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin):

**(Division No. 640)**

*(Identical to Division No. 639)*

---

On the motion moved by Ms. Girault, Minister of International Relations and La Francophonie, together with Ms. Ménard (Laporte), Mr. Fontecilla (Laurier-Dorion), Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine), Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey) and Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin):

**(Division No. 641)**

*(Identical to Division No. 639)*

---

On the motion moved by Ms. Fournier (Marie-Victorin), together with Ms. Charest, Minister Responsible for the Status of Women, Ms. Melançon (Verdun), Ms. Labrie (Sherbrooke), Ms. Perry Mélançon (Gaspé) and Mr. Ouellette (Chomedey):

**(Division No. 642)**

*(Identical to Division No. 639)*

---

4 December 2020

On the Supplementary Estimates No. 1 for the fiscal year ending 31 March 2021:

**(Division No. 643)**

**YEAS - 73**

Allaire (CAQ)	Dubé (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)
Asselin (CAQ)	Dufour (CAQ)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)
Bachand (CAQ)	Émond (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	(Côte-du-Sud)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	Foster (CAQ)	Lavallée (CAQ)	(Berthier)
(Prévost)	Girard (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	(Champlain)	Reid (CAQ)
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Girard (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Roberge (CAQ)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	(Groulx)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Rouleau (CAQ)
Boulet (CAQ)	Girault (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Roy (CAQ)
Boutin (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	(Montarville)
Bussière (CAQ)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Samson (CAQ)
Caire (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Campeau (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	Simard (CAQ)
Carmant (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Skeete (CAQ)
Caron (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)
Charest (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	(Lavolette-Saint-Maurice)
Charette (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)
Chassé (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	(Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata)
Chassin (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Thouin (CAQ)
D'Amours (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Dansereau (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	
		(Soulanges)	

**NAYS - 46**

Anglade (QLP)	Fortin (QLP)	Marissal (QS)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Arcand (QLP)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Massé (QS)	Rousselle (QLP)
Arseneau (PQ)	(Jonquière)	Melançon (QLP)	Roy (PQ)
Barrette (QLP)	Ghazal (QS)	Ménard (QLP)	(Bonaventure)
Benjamin (QLP)	Hivon (PQ)	Montpetit (QLP)	Sauvé (QLP)
Bérubé (PQ)	Kelley (QLP)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	St-Pierre (QLP)
Birnbaum (QLP)	Labrie (QS)	Nichols (QLP)	Tanguay (QLP)
Charbonneau (QLP)	LeBel (PQ)	Ouellet (PQ)	Thériault (QLP)
Ciccone (QLP)	(Rimouski)	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	Weil (QLP)
David (QLP)	Leduc (QS)	Polo (QLP)	Zanetti (QS)
Derraji (QLP)	Leitão (QLP)	Richard (PQ)	
Dorion (QS)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	Rizqy (QLP)	
Fontecilla (QS)	Maccarone (QLP)	Robitaille (QLP)	

**4 December 2020**

---

On the report of the Committee of the Whole:

**(Division No. 644)**

*(Identical to Division No. 643)*

---

On the motion moved by Ms. LeBel, Minister Responsible for Government  
Administration and Chair of the Conseil du trésor:

**(Division No. 645)**

*(Identical to Division No. 643)*

---