

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF QUÉBEC

SECOND SESSION

FORTY-SECOND LEGISLATURE

# **Votes and Proceedings**

of the Assembly

Wednesday, 23 February 2022 - No. 34

President of the National Assembly: Mr. François Paradis

The Assembly was called to order at 9:40 a.m. ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS **Statements by Members** Mr. Lemay (Masson) made a statement to congratulate the students in accounting and management technology at Cégep régional de Lanaudière on their fundraising for the Multiple Sclerosis Society of Canada. Mr. Lévesque (Chauveau) made a statement to congratulate the Chauveau riding athletes who participated in the Beijing Olympic Games. Mr. Leitão (Robert-Baldwin) made a statement to underline Tamil Heritage Month. Ms. IsaBelle (Huntingdon) made a statement to underline the retirement of Mr. Michel Charbonneau, Director General of the Centre local de développement des Jardins-de-Napierville. Mr. Lévesque (Chapleau) made a statement to pay tribute to Ms. Yolande Gravel,

founder of the Société Alzheimer de l'Outaouais.

Mr. Roy (Bonaventure) made a statement to underline the work of the Maisons des jeunes (youth centres) during the COVID-19 pandemic.					
Ms. Lachance (Bellechasse) made a statement to pay tribute to the Congrégation des Sœurs de Notre-Dame du Perpétuel Secours.					
Ms. Girault (Bertrand) made a statement to pay tribute to ski pioneer Mr. Louis Dufour for his contribution to the development of the Laurentides region.					
Ms. David (Marguerite-Bourgeoys) made a statement to underline the 60th anniversary of Club Richelieu LaSalle.					
By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 54.1 and 54.3, Mr. Nadeau-Dubois (Gouin) made a statement to underline Mr. Jimmy Rancourt's 20 years of involvement with the youth centre L'Hôte Maison.					
At 9:54 a.m., Ms. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.					
The proceedings resumed at 10:03 a.m.					

Moment of reflection

#### **Presenting Papers**

Mr. Charette, Minister of the Environment and the Fight Against Climate Change, tabled the following:

The financial statements of the Fonds de protection de l'environnement et du domaine hydrique de l'État for the fiscal year ending 31 March 2019;

(Sessional Paper No. 294-20220223)

The financial statements of the Conseil de gestion du Fonds vert for the fiscal period ending 31 October 2020.

(Sessional Paper No. 295-20220223)

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, tabled the following:

The Government's reply to a petition tabled on 2 February 2022 by Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine) on ending work on the REM de l'Est and analyzing public transportation needs;

(Sessional Paper No. 296-20220223)

The reply to a written question from Ms. Ghazal (Mercier) on using the tool for measuring changes in Quebecers' well-being developed by the G15+ collective – Question No. 55, *Order Paper and Notices* of 3 February 2022.

(Sessional Paper No. 297-20220223)

#### **Presenting Petitions**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on ending work on the REM de l'Est and analyzing public transportation needs, signed by 1,710 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 298-20220223)

#### **Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

#### **Motions Without Notice**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Fontecilla (Laurier-Dorion), together with Ms. Girault, Minister of International Relations and La Francophonie, Ms. Ménard (Laporte), Mr. Arseneau, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, Mr. Roy (Bonaventure), Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) and Ms. Montpetit (Maurice-Richard), moved:

THAT the National Assembly be concerned about the escalation of the armed conflict in Ukraine;

THAT it affirm its solidarity with the Ukrainian people and with the very large diaspora in Québec, especially in Montréal:

THAT it support the right of the Ukrainian people to live in a peaceful, prosperous and sovereign country;

THAT the National Assembly express its hope for a peaceful resolution based on negotiation and respect for international law.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the question was put on this motion; in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 1 February 2022, a vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **247** in Appendix)

Yeas: 117 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 0

Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière), together with Mr. Arcand (Mont-Royal-Outremont), Ms. Ghazal (Mercier), Mr. Roy (Bonaventure) and Mr. LeBel (Rimouski), moved a motion on freezing the rates of all state-owned enterprises for 2022; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Ms. Charest, Minister for Education, together with Mr. Ciccone (Marquette), Ms. Labrie, House Leader of the Second Opposition Group, Ms. Perry Mélançon (Gaspé), Mr. Roy (Bonaventure), Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) and Ms. Montpetit (Maurice-Richard), moved:

THAT the National Assembly mark the closing of the Beijing Olympic Games, which took place from 4 to 20 February 2022;

THAT it recall that the context surrounding these Games presented many additional challenges for the athletes due to the COVID-19 pandemic, in particular the fact that they had to compete without the support of their entourage on the premises;

THAT it recognize the tremendous work of the athletes and their coaches as well as the officials during the last Olympic cycle; THAT it recall that an Olympic performance is the achievement not only of an athlete, but also of a whole community, with the support of a family, friends, coaches, volunteers, a federation and the entire sports community;

THAT it underscore the importance of the displays of sportsmanship and team spirit that we were fortunate to see in Beijing;

THAT it congratulate all the athletes for their performance and their determination;

THAT it underscore that Québec athletes performed particularly well, obtaining 13 medals;

THAT, lastly, it reiterate the importance of facilitating access to sports for young people and how our athletes are a source of pride for Quebecers.

The question was put on this motion; in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 1 February 2022, a vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **248** in Appendix)

Yeas: 117 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 0

Mr. Barrette (La Pinière), together with Mr. Marissal (Rosemont), Mr. Ouellet, House Leader of the Third Opposition Group, Mr. Roy (Bonaventure), Ms. Samson (Iberville) and Mr. LeBel (Rimouski), moved a motion on the breaches of the Code of ethics recognized by the Ethics Commissioner during Coalition Avenir Québec's term; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

#### **Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

- the Committee on Culture and Education, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 96, An Act respecting French, the official and common language of Québec;
- the Committee on Citizen Relations, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 1, An Act to amend the Educational Childcare Act to improve access to the educational childcare services network and complete its development;
- the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries, Energy and Natural Resources, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 21, An Act mainly to end petroleum exploration and production and the public financing of those activities;
- the Committee on Health and Social Services, to continue its clause-byclause consideration of Bill 15, An Act to amend the Youth Protection Act and other legislative provisions;
- the Committee on Citizen Relations, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 101, An Act to strengthen the fight against maltreatment of seniors and other persons of full age in vulnerable situations as well as the monitoring of the quality of health services and social services.

#### ORDERS OF THE DAY

At 11:16 a.m., the President suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

The proceedings resumed at 11:25 a.m.

Ms. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, informed the Assembly that she had received a request for a debate upon adjournment to be held on Thursday, 24 February 2022 on a question from Ms. Lessard-Therrien (Rouyn-Noranda—Témiscamingue) to Mr. Dubé, Minister of Health and Social Services, about the Government's workforce management plan for the health sector, in particular in Abitibi-Témiscamingue.

#### **Government Bills**

Report stage

The Assembly took into consideration the report from the Committee on Labour and the Economy on its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 14, An Act to ensure the protection of trainees in the workplace, together with the amendment transmitted by Mr. Leduc (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve).

The amendment was declared in order.

After debate thereon, the question was put on the amendment proposed by Mr. Leduc (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve); at 12:03 p.m., in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 1 February 2022, Ms. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for no longer than 10 minutes so that a recorded division could be held.

The proceedings resumed at 12:13 p.m.

\_\_\_\_

A vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The amendment was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 249 in Appendix)

Yeas: 43 Nays: 72 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the report from the Committee on Labour and the Economy; in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 1 February 2022, a vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The report was concurred in on the following vote:

(Division No. 250 in Appendix)

Yeas: 115 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 0

Passage

Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, moved the passage of Bill 17, An Act respecting the implementation of certain provisions of the Budget Speech of 25 March 2021 and amending other provisions.

The debate being concluded, the question was put on this motion; at 12:37 p.m., in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 1 February 2022, Ms. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for no longer than 10 minutes so that a recorded division could be held.

\_\_\_\_

The proceedings resumed at 12:44 p.m.

671

A vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 251 in Appendix)

Yeas: 72 Nays: 43 Abstentions: 0

Accordingly, Bill 17 was passed.

At 12:46 p.m., at the request of Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, and by leave of the Assembly to set aside the motion carried by the Assembly on 1 February 2022, Ms. Gaudreault, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 3:00 p.m.

\_\_\_\_\_

The proceedings resumed at 3:02 p.m.

#### **Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition**

Mr. Derraji (Nelligan) moved:

THAT the National Assembly acknowledge that the public health emergency was declared on 13 March 2020 and that since then it has been renewed repeatedly by the CAQ government;

THAT it recall that section 123 of the *Public Health Act* provides that, while the public health emergency is in effect, the Government may without delay and without further formality incur such expenses and enter into such contracts as are considered necessary;

THAT it note that since 13 March 2020, by virtue of this power, the Government has entered into thousands of untendered contracts:

THAT it voice its concern that using such a power over such a long period of time exempts billions of dollars of public funds from the usual rules for awarding public contracts and opens the door to potential ethical abuse;

THAT it demand that the CAQ government end the public health emergency immediately;

THAT, lastly, it demand that the Government table the event report provided for in section 129 of the *Public Health Act* in the National Assembly by 3 May 2022, that it include the justification for all the untendered public contracts awarded under the public health emergency and that the report be studied by the competent committee of the National Assembly before the end of the current parliamentary sessional period.

Mr. Picard, First Vice-President, informed the Assembly of the allocation of speaking time for the proceedings with respect to this limited debate: 10 minutes to the mover of the motion for his reply; 51 minutes 15 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Government; 31 minutes 27 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition; 11 minutes 39 seconds to the Second Opposition Group; 8 minutes 9 seconds to the Third Opposition Group; and 7 minutes 30 seconds to the independent Members, subject to a maximum of 2 minutes each. Within this framework, any time not used by the independent Members or by a parliamentary group shall be redistributed among the parliamentary groups in the proportions established above. Lastly, individual addresses shall not be limited.

A debate arose thereon.

At the end of her address, Ms. Hébert (Saint-François) moved:

THAT the motion moved by the Member for Nelligan be amended as follows:

- 1. In the first paragraph, by replacing "CAQ government" by "Government";
- 2. In the third paragraph, by adding ", thereby protecting the health of the population and of our health care workers during the health crisis" after "contracts";
- 3. By striking out the fourth, fifth and sixth paragraphs;
- 4. By adding the following two paragraphs at the end of the motion:

"THAT it declare that it is necessary to end the public health emergency as soon as possible, while ensuring that the fight against the COVID-19 pandemic and the protection of Quebecers continue;

THAT, lastly, it demand that the CAQ government commit to tabling the event report provided for in section 129 of the *Public Health Act*, which is required at the end of the public health emergency, and to doing so before the end of the current parliamentary sessional period."

The motion, as amended, would read as follows:

THAT the National Assembly acknowledge that the public health emergency was declared on 13 March 2020 and that since then it has been renewed repeatedly by the Government;

THAT it recall that section 123 of the *Public Health Act* provides that, while the public health emergency is in effect, the Government may without delay and without further formality incur such expenses and enter into such contracts as are considered necessary;

THAT it note that since 13 March 2020, by virtue of this power, the Government has entered into thousands of untendered contracts, thereby protecting the health of the population and of our health care workers during the health crisis;

THAT it declare that it is necessary to end the public health emergency as soon as possible, while ensuring that the fight against the COVID-19 pandemic and the protection of Quebecers continue:

THAT, lastly, it demand that the CAQ government commit to tabling the event report provided for in section 129 of the *Public Health Act*, which is required at the end of the public health emergency, and to doing so before the end of the current parliamentary sessional period.

The debate continued on the main motion moved by Mr. Derraji (Nelligan) and on the amendment motion moved by Ms. Hébert (Saint-François), subject to the permission of its author.

At the end of her address, Ms. Ghazal (Mercier) moved:

THAT the motion moved by the Member for Nelligan be amended as follows:

1. By adding the following paragraph after the fourth paragraph: "THAT it order the Committee on Public Administration to examine the awarding of these contracts;".

The motion, as amended, would read as follows:

THAT the National Assembly acknowledge that the public health emergency was declared on 13 March 2020 and that since then it has been renewed repeatedly by the CAQ government;

THAT it recall that section 123 of the *Public Health Act* provides that, while the public health emergency is in effect, the Government may without delay and without further formality incur such expenses and enter into such contracts as are considered necessary;

THAT it note that since 13 March 2020, by virtue of this power, the Government has entered into thousands of untendered contracts:

THAT it voice its concern that using such a power over such a long period of time exempts billions of dollars of public funds from the usual rules for awarding public contracts and opens the door to potential ethical abuse;

THAT it order the Committee on Public Administration to examine the awarding of these contracts;

THAT it demand that the CAQ government end the public health emergency immediately;

THAT, lastly, it demand that the Government table the event report provided for in section 129 of the *Public Health Act* in the National Assembly by 3 May 2022, that it include the justification for all the untendered public contracts awarded under the public health emergency and that the report be studied by the competent committee of the National Assembly before the end of the current parliamentary sessional period.

The debate continued on the main motion moved by Mr. Derraji (Nelligan) and on the amendment motions moved by Ms. Hébert (Saint-François) and Ms. Ghazal (Mercier), subject to the permission of its author.

Pursuant to Standing Order 98.1, Mr. Derraji (Nelligan) refused the amendment proposed by Ms. Hébert (Saint-François) and accepted the amendment proposed by Ms. Ghazal (Mercier).

The debate being concluded, the question was first put on the amendment motion moved by Ms. Ghazal (Mercier); in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 1 February 2022, a vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The amendment was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **252** in Appendix)

Yeas: 43 Nays: 72 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion moved by Mr. Derraji (Nelligan); in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 1 February 2022, a vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **253** in Appendix)

Yeas: 43 Nays: 72 Abstentions: 0

Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader, moved the adjournment of the Assembly until Thursday, 24 February 2022 at 9:40 a.m.

After debate thereon, the question was put on this motion; in accordance with the motion carried by the Assembly on 1 February 2022, a vote was held in accordance with the procedure for recorded divisions.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 254 in Appendix)

Yeas: 72 Nays: 43 Abstentions: 0

\_\_\_\_\_

At 5:30 p.m., Ms. Soucy, Second Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Thursday, 24 February 2022 at 9:40 a.m.

## FRANÇOIS PARADIS

President

#### **APPENDIX**

#### **Recorded Divisions**

On the motion moved by Mr. Fontecilla (Laurier-Dorion), together with Ms. Girault, Minister of International Relations and La Francophonie, Ms. Ménard (Laporte), Mr. Arseneau, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, Mr. Roy (Bonaventure), Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) and Ms. Montpetit (Maurice-Richard):

### (Division No. 247)

#### **YEAS - 117**

1EAS - 117					
Allaire (CAQ)	Dufour (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)		
Anglade (QLP)	Émond (CAQ)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Reid (CAQ)		
Arcand (QLP)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Richard (PQ)		
Arseneau (PQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	(Les Plaines)	Rizqy ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Asselin (CAQ)	Fortin (QLP)	Leduc (QS)	Roberge (CAQ)		
Bachand (CAQ)	Foster (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Robitaille ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Barrette (QLP)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Rotiroti (QLP)		
Bélanger (CAQ)	(Jonquière)	Leitão (QLP)	Rouleau (CAQ)		
Benjamin (QLP)	Ghazal ( <i>QS</i> )	Lemay (CAQ)	Rousselle ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Bérubé (PQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Roy (IND)		
Birnbaum (QLP)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	(Bonaventure)		
Blais (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Roy(CAQ)		
(Prévost)	(Groulx)	(Chauveau)	(Montarville)		
Blais (CAQ)	Girault (CAQ)	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Sauvé (QLP)		
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Grondin (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Schneeberger (CAQ)		
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Maccarone (QLP)	Simard (CAQ)		
Boulet (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	Marissal (QS)	Skeete ( <i>CAQ</i> )		
Boutin (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	St-Pierre ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Bussière (CAQ)	Hivon(PQ)	Massé (QS)	Tanguay (QLP)		
Caire (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)		
Campeau (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Melançon (QLP)	(Laviolette–Saint-Maurice)		
Carmant (CAQ)	Jeannotte ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Ménard (QLP)	Tardif (CAQ)		
Caron (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Montpetit (IND)	(Rivière-du-Loup–Témiscouata)		
Charbonneau (QLP)	Julien (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	Thériault ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Charest (CAQ)	Kelley ( <i>QLP</i> )	Nichols (QLP)	Thouin (CAQ)		
Charette (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Ouellet $(PQ)$	Tremblay (CAQ)		
Chassé (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	Weil (QLP)		
Chassin ( $CAQ$ )	Lacombe $(CAQ)$	Picard (CAQ)	Zanetti ( <i>QS</i> )		
Ciccone (QLP)	Laforest (CAQ)	(Soulanges)			
D'Amours ( $CAQ$ )	Laframboise (CAQ)	Polo ( <i>QLP</i> )			
Dansereau (CAQ)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)			
David ( <i>QLP</i> )	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)			
Derraji ( <i>QLP</i> )	Lamothe $(CAQ)$	(Côte-du-Sud)			
Dorion (QS)	Lavallée (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)			
Dubé ( <i>CAQ</i> )	LeBel $(CAQ)$	(Berthier)			
	(Champlain)				

On the motion moved by Ms. Charest, Minister for Education, together with Mr. Ciccone (Marquette), Ms. Labrie, House Leader of the Second Opposition Group, Ms. Perry Mélançon (Gaspé), Mr. Roy (Bonaventure), Mr. LeBel (Rimouski) and Ms. Montpetit (Maurice-Richard):

(Division No. 248)

(Identical to Division No. 247)

On the amendment proposed by Mr. Leduc (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve) introducing section 17.1:

# (Division No. 249)

#### **YEAS - 43**

1 EAS - 43					
Anglade (QLP)	Dorion (QS)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	Richard (PQ)		
Arcand (QLP)	Fontecilla (QS)	Maccarone (QLP)	Rizqy ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Arseneau (PQ)	Fortin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Marissal (QS)	Robitaille ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Barrette (QLP)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Massé (QS)	Rotiroti (QLP)		
Benjamin ( <i>QLP</i> )	(Jonquière)	Melançon (QLP)	Rousselle ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Bérubé (PQ)	Ghazal $(QS)$	Ménard (QLP)	Sauvé ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Birnbaum ( <i>QLP</i> )	Hivon $(PQ)$	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	St-Pierre ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Charbonneau (QLP)	Kelley ( <i>QLP</i> )	Nichols (QLP)	Tanguay (QLP)		
Ciccone (QLP)	Labrie (QS)	Ouellet $(PQ)$	Thériault (QLP)		
David ( <i>QLP</i> )	Leduc $(QS)$	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	Weil (QLP)		
Derraji (QLP)	Leitão (QLP)	Polo ( <i>QLP</i> )	Zanetti (QS)		
	NAYS - 7	12.			
Allaire ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Dufour (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)		
Asselin ( $CAQ$ )	Émond (CAQ)	Lamothe (CAQ)	(Berthier)		
Bachand (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lavallée ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Provençal ( <i>CAQ</i> )		
Bélanger ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Foster ( $CAQ$ )	LeBel (CAQ)	Reid ( <i>CAQ</i> )		
Blais (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	(Champlain)	Roberge ( <i>CAQ</i> )		
(Prévost)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Lecours (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)		
Blais $(CAQ)$	Girard (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	Roy $(CAQ)$		
(Abitibi-Ouest)	(Groulx)	Lecours (CAQ)	(Montarville)		
Bonnardel ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Girault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Schneeberger ( <i>CAQ</i> )		
Boulet ( $CAQ$ )	Grondin (CAQ)	Lefebvre ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Simard $(CAQ)$		
Boutin $(CAQ)$	Guilbault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Legault $(CAQ)$	Skeete ( $CAQ$ )		
Bussière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Guillemette ( $CAQ$ )	Lemay $(CAQ)$	Tardif $(CAQ)$		
Caire $(CAQ)$	Hébert (CAQ)	Lemieux ( $CAQ$ )	(Laviolette–Saint-		
(2)	( <del>2</del> )	(	Maurice)		
Campeau (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Tardif $(CAQ)$		
Carmant (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	(Rivière-du-Loup–		
			Témiscouata)		
Caron $(CAQ)$	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Thouin $(CAQ)$		
Charest (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Tremblay $(CAQ)$		
Charette (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)			
Chassé (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)			
Chassin (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)			
D'Amours (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	(Soulanges)			
Dansereau (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)			
Dubé (CAQ)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)			
		(CA: 1 C D			

(Côte-du-Sud)

# On the report from the Committee on Labour and the Economy:

# (Division No. 250)

YEAS - 115				
Allaire $(CAQ)$	Dubé (CAQ)	Lavallée (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)	
Anglade (QLP)	Dufour $(CAQ)$	LeBel (CAQ)	(Berthier)	
Arcand (QLP)	Émond (CAQ)	(Champlain)	Provençal (CAQ)	
Arseneau (PQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Reid $(CAQ)$	
Asselin (CAQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Richard (PQ)	
Bachand (CAQ)	Fortin (QLP)	Lecours (CAQ)	Rizqy (QLP)	
Barrette (QLP)	Foster (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	Roberge (CAQ)	
Bélanger (CAQ)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Leduc $(QS)$	Robitaille ( <i>QLP</i> )	
Benjamin (QLP)	(Jonquière)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Rotiroti ( <i>QLP</i> )	
Bérubé (PQ)	Ghazal (QS)	Legault (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)	
Birnbaum ( <i>QLP</i> )	Girard $(CAQ)$	Leitão (QLP)	Rousselle ( <i>QLP</i> )	
Blais $(CAQ)$	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Lemay (CAQ)	Roy(CAQ)	
(Abitibi-Ouest)	Girard (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	(Montarville)	
Blais $(CAQ)$	(Groulx)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	Sauvé (QLP)	
(Prévost)	Girault ( $CAQ$ )	Lévesque (CAQ)	Schneeberger (CAQ)	
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	Simard (CAQ)	
Boulet $(CAQ)$	Guilbault (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Skeete (CAQ)	
Boutin (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	St-Pierre ( <i>QLP</i> )	
Bussière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Hébert (CAQ)	Maccarone (QLP)	Tanguay (QLP)	
Caire $(CAQ)$	Hivon (PQ)	Marissal (QS)	Tardif $(CAQ)$	
Campeau (CAQ)	Isabelle ( $CAQ$ )	Martel (CAQ)	(Laviolette-Saint-Maurice)	
Carmant (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Massé (QS)	Tardif $(CAQ)$	
Caron $(CAQ)$	Jeannotte (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)	(Rivière-du-Loup–Témiscouata)	
Charbonneau (QLP)	Jolin-Barrette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Melançon (QLP)	Thériault ( <i>QLP</i> )	
Charest (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Ménard (QLP)	Thouin $(CAQ)$	
Charette ( $CAQ$ )	Kelley ( <i>QLP</i> )	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	Tremblay $(CAQ)$	
Chassé (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Nichols (QLP)	Weil (QLP)	
Chassin $(CAQ)$	Lachance (CAQ)	Ouellet $(PQ)$	Zanetti (QS)	
Ciccone (QLP)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Perry Mélançon (PQ)		
D'Amours (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)		
Dansereau (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	(Soulanges)		
David (QLP)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Polo (QLP)		
Derraji (QLP)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Poulin ( $CAQ$ )		
Dorion $(QS)$	Lamothe (CAQ)	Proulx $(CAQ)$		
		(Côte-du-Sud)		

# On the motion moved by Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance:

# (Division No. 251)

YEAS - 72				
Allaire $(CAQ)$	Dufour $(CAQ)$	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Proulx $(CAQ)$	
Asselin $(CAQ)$	Émond $(CAQ)$	Lamothe (CAQ)	(Berthier)	
Bachand (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lavallée (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)	
Bélanger ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Foster $(CAQ)$	LeBel (CAQ)	Reid $(CAQ)$	
Blais (CAQ)	Girard $(CAQ)$	(Champlain)	Roberge $(CAQ)$	
(Prévost)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Lecours (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)	
Blais (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	Roy $(CAQ)$	
(Abitibi-Ouest)	(Groulx)	Lecours (CAQ)	(Montarville)	
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Girault (CAQ)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Schneeberger (CAQ)	
Boulet $(CAQ)$	Grondin (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Simard $(CAQ)$	
Boutin (CAQ)	Guilbault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Legault (CAQ)	Skeete ( $CAQ$ )	
Bussière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Guillemette (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	Tardif $(CAQ)$	
Caire $(CAQ)$	Hébert (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	(Laviolette-Saint-	
			Maurice)	
Campeau (CAQ)	Isabelle ( $CAQ$ )	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Tardif $(CAQ)$	
Carmant (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	(Rivière-du-Loup–	
			Témiscouata)	
Caron (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Thouin $(CAQ)$	
Charest $(CAQ)$	Jolin-Barrette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	(Chapleau)	Tremblay $(CAQ)$	
Charette ( $CAQ$ )	Julien (CAQ)	Martel $(CAQ)$		
Chassé (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)		
Chassin $(CAQ)$	Lacombe (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)		
D'Amours ( $CAQ$ )	Laforest (CAQ)	(Soulanges)		
Dansereau (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)		
Dubé (CAQ)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)		
		(Côte-du-Sud)		
NAYS - 43				
Anglade (QLP)	Dorion $(QS)$	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	Richard (PQ)	
Arcand (QLP)	Fontecilla (QS)	Maccarone (QLP)	Rizqy ( <i>QLP</i> )	
Arseneau (PQ)	Fortin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Marissal (QS)	Robitaille ( <i>QLP</i> )	
Barrette (QLP)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Massé (QS)	Rotiroti ( <i>QLP</i> )	
Benjamin (QLP)	(Jonquière)	Melançon (QLP)	Rousselle ( <i>QLP</i> )	
Bérubé (PQ)	Ghazal (QS)	Ménard (QLP)	Sauvé (QLP)	
Birnbaum ( <i>QLP</i> )	Hivon $(PQ)$	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	St-Pierre ( <i>QLP</i> )	
Charbonneau (QLP)	Kelley (QLP)	Nichols (QLP)	Tanguay (QLP)	
Ciccone (QLP)	Labrie (QS)	Ouellet $(PQ)$	Thériault ( <i>QLP</i> )	
David (QLP)	Leduc (QS)	Perry Mélançon ( <i>PQ</i> )	Weil (QLP)	
Derraji (QLP)	Leitão (QLP)	Polo (QLP)	Zanetti ( <i>QS</i> )	

# On the amendment motion moved by Ms. Ghazal (Mercier):

#### (Division No. 252)

### **YEAS - 43**

1 LAS - 43					
Anglade ( <i>QLP</i> )	Dorion $(QS)$	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	Richard (PQ)		
Arcand (QLP)	Fontecilla (QS)	Maccarone (QLP)	Rizqy ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Arseneau (PQ)	Fortin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Marissal (QS)	Robitaille ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Barrette (QLP)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Massé (QS)	Rotiroti (QLP)		
Benjamin (QLP)	(Jonquière)	Melançon (QLP)	Rousselle ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Bérubé (PQ)	Ghazal $(QS)$	Ménard (QLP)	Sauvé ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Birnbaum ( <i>QLP</i> )	Hivon $(PQ)$	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	St-Pierre ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Charbonneau (QLP)	Kelley (QLP)	Nichols (QLP)	Tanguay (QLP)		
Ciccone (QLP)	Labrie (QS)	Ouellet $(PQ)$	Thériault (QLP)		
David ( <i>QLP</i> )	Leduc $(QS)$	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	Weil (QLP)		
Derraji (QLP)	Leitão (QLP)	Polo (QLP)	Zanetti (QS)		
	NAYS - 7	72			
Allaire ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Dufour (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Proulx ( $CAQ$ )		
Asselin $(CAQ)$	Émond (CAQ)	Lamothe $(CAQ)$	(Berthier)		
Bachand $(CAQ)$	Fitzgibbon ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lavallée ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Provençal (CAQ)		
Bélanger ( $CAQ$ )	Foster ( $CAQ$ )	LeBel $(CAQ)$	Reid ( $CAQ$ )		
Blais $(CAQ)$	Girard $(CAQ)$	(Champlain)	Roberge $(CAQ)$		
(Prévost)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Lecours (CAQ)	Rouleau ( $CAQ$ )		
Blais (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	Roy(CAQ)		
(Abitibi-Ouest)	(Groulx)	Lecours (CAQ)	(Montarville)		
Bonnardel ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Girault (CAQ)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Schneeberger (CAQ)		
Boulet $(CAQ)$	Grondin ( $\overrightarrow{CAQ}$ )	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Simard $(CAQ)$		
Boutin $(CAQ)$	Guilbault (CAQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Skeete ( $CAQ$ )		
Bussière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Guillemette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lemay $(CAQ)$	Tardif $(CAQ)$		
Caire $(CAQ)$	Hébert ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lemieux ( $CAQ$ )	(Laviolette-Saint-		
		· · · · · ·	Maurice)		
Campeau (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Tardif (CAQ)		
Carmant (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	(Rivière-du-Loup-		
	_		Témiscouata)		
Caron (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Thouin $(CAQ)$		
Charest (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Tremblay (CAQ)		
Charette (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)			
Chassé (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)			
Chassin ( $CAQ$ )	Lacombe (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)			
D'Amours ( $CAQ$ )	Laforest (CAQ)	(Soulanges)			
Dansereau (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)			
Dubé (CAQ)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Proulx $(CAQ)$			
*	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	$(C^{\wedge}, i, C^{\wedge})$			

(Côte-du-Sud)

On the motion moved by Mr. Derraji (Nelligan):

(Division No. 253)

(Identical to Division No. 252)

On the motion moved by Mr. Schneeberger, Deputy Government House Leader:

# (Division No. 254)

# **YEAS - 72**

Allaire (CAQ)	Dufour (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)		
Asselin ( $CAQ$ )	Émond (CAQ)	Lamothe $(CAQ)$	(Berthier)		
Bachand (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	Lavallée (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)		
Bélanger (CAQ)	Foster $(CAQ)$	LeBel $(CAQ)$	Reid ( $CAQ$ )		
Blais $(CAQ)$	Girard ( $CAQ$ )	(Champlain)	Roberge $(CAQ)$		
(Prévost)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Lecours $(CAQ)$	Rouleau (CAQ)		
Blais $(CAQ)$	Girard ( $CAQ$ )	(Les Plaines)	Roy(CAQ)		
(Abitibi-Ouest)	(Groulx)	Lecours (CAQ)	(Montarville)		
Bonnardel ( $CAQ$ )	Girault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Schneeberger (CAQ)		
Boulet ( $CAQ$ )	Grondin (CAQ)	Lefebvre ( $CAQ$ )	Simard (CAQ)		
Boutin $(CAQ)$	Guilbault (CAQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Skeete ( <i>CAQ</i> )		
Bussière (CAQ)	Guillemette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lemay $(CAQ)$	Tardif $(CAQ)$		
Caire $(CAQ)$	Hébert (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	(Laviolette-Saint-Maurice)		
Campeau (CAQ)	Isabelle (CAQ)	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Tardif $(CAQ)$		
Carmant (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	(Chauveau)	(Rivière-du-Loup–Témiscouata)		
Caron $(CAQ)$	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Thouin (CAQ)		
Charest (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Tremblay (CAQ)		
Charette (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	•		
Chassé (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	McCann (CAQ)			
Chassin (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)			
D'Amours ( $CAQ$ )	Laforest (CAQ)	(Soulanges)			
Dansereau (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)			
Dubé (CAQ)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Proulx $(CAQ)$			
		(Côte-du-Sud)			
NAYS - 43					
Anglade (QLP)	Dorion (QS)	Lessard-Therrien (QS)	Richard $(PQ)$		
Arcand (QLP)	Fontecilla (QS)	Maccarone (QLP)	Rizqy ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Arseneau (PQ)	Fortin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Marissal (QS)	Robitaille ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Barrette (QLP)	Gaudreault (PQ)	Massé (QS)	Rotiroti ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Benjamin (QLP)	(Jonquière)	Melançon (QLP)	Rousselle ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Bérubé (PQ)	Ghazal (QS)	Ménard (QLP)	Sauvé ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Birnbaum ( <i>QLP</i> )	Hivon $(PQ)$	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	St-Pierre ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Charbonneau (QLP)	Kelley (QLP)	Nichols (QLP)	Tanguay (QLP)		
Ciccone (QLP)	Labrie (QS)	Ouellet $(PQ)$	Thériault (QLP)		
David (QLP)	Leduc $(QS)$	Perry Mélançon (PQ)	Weil (QLP)		
Derraji (QLP)	Leitão (QLP)	Polo (QLP)	Zanetti (QS)		