

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF QUÉBEC

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-THIRD LEGISLATURE

# **Votes and Proceedings**

of the Assembly

Thursday, 1 December 2022 — No. 3

President of the National Assembly: Madam Nathalie Roy

The Assembly was called to order at 9:50 a.m.

#### **ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

# **Statements by Members**

Mr. Lefebvre (Arthabaska) made a statement to congratulate Fromagerie Rang 9, winner at the World Cheese Awards.

\_\_\_\_\_

Ms. Lakhoyan Olivier (Chomedey) made a statement to underline the work of the organization Élan politique jeunesse.

\_\_\_\_\_

Ms. Dionne (Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata) made a statement to underline the 40th anniversary of the MRC de Rivière-du-Loup.

\_\_\_\_\_

Mr. Leduc (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve) made a statement to underline the 50th anniversary of the Pavillon d'éducation communautaire Hochelaga-Maisonneuve.

\_\_\_\_\_

Mr. Lemay (Masson) made a statement to invite citizens to contribute to the community project Arbre de joie Les Moulins.

\_\_\_\_\_

| Ms. Maccarone (Westmount–Saint-Louis) made a statement to underline World AIDS Day.  |
|--|
| Ms. Hébert (Saint-François) made a statement to underline the 70th anniversary of the company Waterville TG.   |
| Mr. Dufour (Abitibi-Est) made a statement to underline the 75th anniversary of the company Les Chaussures R. Leclerc.  |
| Ms. Lachance (Bellechasse) made a statement to congratulate the company Belvédère du Lac, recipient of the Prix Implication Sociale award from Regroupement québécois des résidences pour aînés. |
| Mr. Lévesque (Chapleau) made a statement to congratulate Ms. Micheline Robinson Huard for her election as International Regent of the Daughters of Isabella.                                     |
| Mr. Lemieux (Saint-Jean) made a statement to underline the retirement of Ms. Jacqueline Massé, equipment assistant for the Géants football team.   |
| Mr. Lacombe (Papineau) made a statement to congratulate the recipients of the Prix du Québec awards.   |

At 10:04 a.m., Ms. Soucy, First Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

\_\_\_\_

The proceedings resumed at 10:11 a.m.

\_\_\_\_\_

At the request of the President, the Assembly observed a moment of silence in memory of Mr. Clovis Gagnon, former Member for Matapédia, Mr. Yvon Lafrance, former Member for Iberville, Mr. André Spénard, former Member for Beauce-Nord, and Mr. Léandre Dion, former Member for Saint-Hyacinthe.

The President then tabled the following:

A copy of a private ruling rendered on 1 November 2022 concerning the refusal to take the oath of allegiance.

(Sessional Paper No. 25-20221201)

She then ruled the following:

#### **RULING FROM THE CHAIR**

Rulings from the Chair are made by the presiding officers, in full independence and within the framework of their duties, with the aim of ensuring the proper functioning of the institution they serve and of all the Members who make up the institution. Rulings are not made in a personal capacity or in response to any order.

The ruling tabled is no exception to these principles. Rendering a private ruling was the only option so that everyone would know what to expect for the opening of the 43rd Legislature, pending the election of a Member to the position of President of the Assembly.

It is important to distinguish between the political debate on the issue and the current legal situation. For instance, while it is debatable whether the oath to the King should be abolished or made optional, current parliamentary law requires every Member of the National Assembly to take an oath of allegiance in order to participate in parliamentary proceedings. This is not a matter of opinion, but of the state of the law. In this respect, the principle of the rule of law is fundamental.

It is not the responsibility of the Chair to change this rule: this is the role of the elected Members of the National Assembly, in their capacity as legislators.

The Chair recalls the principle that the National Assembly cannot, by motion or unanimous consent, override a legislative provision. Indeed, the legislative provisions applicable to parliamentary procedure take precedence over any other internal rule of procedure.

It is for this reason that the Assembly cannot, for example, set aside by simple motion or consent section 8 of the *Act respecting the National Assembly*, which provides for the quorum necessary for the Assembly to function. If this is true for any legislative provision, it cannot be otherwise for section 128 of the *Constitution Act, 1867*. Thus, any motion that seeks, by its effects, to circumvent the application of this section would be declared inadmissible. Indeed, Standing Order 193 provides that the President of the Assembly must rule out of order any motion or notice of motion that is contrary to the Standing Orders.

In their book on constitutional law, authors Brun, Tremblay and Brouillet explicitly give as an example the obligation for Members to take the oath of allegiance.

In short, they conclude that, assuming a complex constitutional amendment is not required, a simple motion cannot remove the obligation to take the oath of allegiance and that, at a minimum, an Act of Parliament is required to do so. The Chair comes to the same conclusion.

The Chair makes the following points: first, the current law provides that Members must take the oath of allegiance in order to sit; second, the Chair can neither change the state of the law, nor choose to exempt Members from the application of the law; third, a motion may not set aside the obligation to take the oath of allegiance enshrined in a legislative provision, which is a constitutional one on top of that; fourth, assuming that a complex constitutional amendment is not required, at a minimum, legislation is required for the National Assembly to modify the obligation to take the oath of allegiance.

As for the possibility of allowing Members who have not taken the oath to sit, pending the passage of a retroactive law making the oath optional, it is highly questionable. Indeed, parliamentary jurisprudence has always recognised that the fact of availing oneself of a legislative provision not yet passed could constitute contempt of Parliament. It would be risky, to say the least, to behave otherwise here, thus going against the long-standing jurisprudence on the matter.

For these reasons, the Chair reiterates that Members who have not taken the oath of allegiance provided for in section 128 of the *Constitution Act, 1867* will not be able to take part in the Assembly's proceedings or in its committees. This is a final decision that is not open to discussion, in accordance with Standing Order 41.

Lastly, the President tabled the following:

A letter, dated 1 December 2022, she had received from Ms. Dominique Anglade, Member for Saint-Henri–Saint-Anne, informing the President of her resignation.

(Sessional Paper No. 26-20221201)

#### **Introduction of Bills**

Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, moved that leave be granted to introduce the following bill:

1 An Act to limit the indexation of several government tariffs

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, Bill 1 was introduced in the Assembly.

Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage) moved that leave be granted to introduce the following bill:

An Act to recognize the Members' oath to the people of Québec as the sole oath required for Members to take office

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, Bill 190 was introduced in the Assembly.

### **Presenting Papers**

Ms. Guilbault, Minister of Transport and Sustainable Mobility, tabled the following:

The 2021–2022 annual management report of the Société des traversiers du Québec;

(Sessional Paper No. 27-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual management report of the Commission des transports du Québec;

(Sessional Paper No. 28-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual management report of the Ministère des Transports et de la Mobilité durable.

(Sessional Paper No. 29-20221201)

Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, tabled the following:

The 2021–2022 annual report of the Autorité des marchés financiers; (Sessional Paper No. 30-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual report of the Financial Markets Administrative Tribunal; (Sessional Paper No. 31-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual management report of the Ministère des Finances; (Sessional Paper No. 32-20221201)

The 2021–2022 activity report of Financement-Québec;

(Sessional Paper No. 33-20221201)

The 2022 activity report of the Société de financement des infrastructures locales du Québec for the fiscal year ending 31 March 2022;

(Sessional Paper No. 34-20221201)

Public Accounts 2021–2022 – Consolidated Financial Statements of the Gouvernement du Québec, Volume 1 (French and English versions);

(Sessional Paper No. 35-20221201)

Public Accounts 2021–2022 – Financial Information on the Consolidated Revenue Fund: General Fund and Special Funds, Volume 2 (French and English versions). (Sessional Paper No. 36-20221201)

Mr. Dubé, Minister of Health, tabled the 2021–2022 annual management reports of the following integrated university health and social services centres:

Capitale-Nationale

(Sessional Paper No. 37-20221201)

West-Central Montréal

(Sessional Paper No. 38-20221201)

Centre-Sud-de-l'Île-de-Montréal

(Sessional Paper No. 39-20221201)

Est-de-l'Île-de-Montréal

(Sessional Paper No. 40-20221201)

Estrie – Centre hospitalier universitaire de Sherbrooke

(Sessional Paper No. 41-20221201)

Mauricie-et-du-Centre-du-Québec

(Sessional Paper No. 42-20221201)

Nord-de-l'Île-de-Montréal

(Sessional Paper No. 43-20221201)

Ouest-de-l'Île-de-Montréal

(Sessional Paper No. 44-20221201)

Saguenay-Lac-Saint-Jean

(Sessional Paper No. 45-20221201)

He then tabled the 2021–2022 annual reports on the implementation of the complaints examination procedure, user satisfaction and respect of user rights of the following integrated health and social services centres:

| Capitale-Nationale                             |                                    |
|--|------------------------------------|
|  | (Sessional Paper No. 46-20221201)  |
| West-Central Montréal                          | •                                  |
|  | (Sessional Paper No. 47-20221201)  |
| Centre-Sud-de-l'Île-de-Montréal                | (2                                 |
| Contro Suu de 1 110 de 1/10/10/10              | (Sessional Paper No. 48-20221201)  |
| Est-de-l'Île-de-Montréal                       | (Bessional Laper 140: 40-20221201) |
| Est-de-i ne-de-ivioniteai                      | (Sessional Denom No. 40 20221201)  |
|  | (Sessional Paper No. 49-20221201)  |
| Estrie – Centre hospitalier universitaire de S | Sherbrooke                         |
|  | (Sessional Paper No. 50-20221201)  |
| Mauricie-et-du-Centre-du-Québec                | _                                  |
| •  | (Sessional Paper No. 51-20221201)  |
| Nord-de-l'Île-de-Montréal                      | ,                                  |
|  | (Sessional Paper No. 52-20221201)  |
| Ouest-de-l'Île-de-Montréal                     | (Sessional Laper 140. 32-20221201) |
| Ouest-de-1 He-de-Montreal                      |                                    |
|  | (Sessional Paper No. 53-20221201)  |
| Saguenay-Lac-Saint-Jean                        |                                    |

He then tabled the 2021–2022 annual management reports of the following integrated health and social services centres:

(Sessional Paper No. 54-20221201)

| Abitibi-Témiscamingue |                                    |
|-----------------------|------------------------------------|
| -                     | (Sessional Paper No. 55-20221201)  |
| Bas-Saint-Laurent     | (G : 1D N 56 20221201)             |
| Chaudière-Appalaches  | (Sessional Paper No. 56-20221201)  |
| Chaudiere-Apparaenes  | (Sessional Paper No. 57-20221201)  |
| Côte-Nord             | •                                  |
| Coománia              | (Sessional Paper No. 58-20221201)  |
| Gaspésie              | (Sessional Paper No. 59-20221201)  |
| Îles                  | (Bessional Laper Ivo. 35 20221201) |
|                       | (Sessional Paper No. 60-20221201)  |
| Lanaudière            | (Carrianal Danas No. (1.20221201)  |
|                       | (Sessional Paper No. 61-20221201)  |

Laurentides

(Sessional Paper No. 62-20221201)

Laval

(Sessional Paper No. 63-20221201)

Montérégie-Centre

(Sessional Paper No. 64-20221201)

Montérégie-Est

(Sessional Paper No. 65-20221201)

Montérégie-Ouest

(Sessional Paper No. 66-20221201)

Outaouais

(Sessional Paper No. 67-20221201)

He then tabled the 2021–2022 annual reports on the implementation of the complaints examination procedure, user satisfaction and respect of user rights of the following integrated health and social services centres:

Abitibi-Témiscamingue

(Sessional Paper No. 68-20221201)

Bas-Saint-Laurent

(Sessional Paper No. 69-20221201)

Chaudière-Appalaches

(Sessional Paper No. 70-20221201)

Côte-Nord

(Sessional Paper No. 71-20221201)

Gaspésie

(Sessional Paper No. 72-20221201)

Îles

(Sessional Paper No. 73-20221201)

Lanaudière

(Sessional Paper No. 74-20221201)

Laurentides

(Sessional Paper No. 75-20221201)

Laval

(Sessional Paper No. 76-20221201)

Montérégie-Centre

(Sessional Paper No. 77-20221201)

Montérégie-Est

(Sessional Paper No. 78-20221201)

Outaouais

(Sessional Paper No. 79-20221201

Lastly, he tabled the following:

The 2021–2022 annual management report of the Centre hospitalier de l'Université de Montréal;

(Sessional Paper No. 80-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual management report of the Institut national de psychiatrie légale Philippe-Pinel;

(Sessional Paper No. 81-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual management report of the Institut universitaire de cardiologie et de pneumologie de Québec – Université Laval;

(Sessional Paper No. 82-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual management report of the Centre hospitalier universitaire de Québec – Université Laval;

(Sessional Paper No. 83-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual management report of the McGill University Health Centre:

(Sessional Paper No. 84-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual management report of the Centre hospitalier universitaire Sainte-Justine;

(Sessional Paper No. 85-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual management report of the Centre régional de santé et de services sociaux de la Baie-James;

(Sessional Paper No. 86-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual management report of the Institut national de santé publique du Québec;

(Sessional Paper No. 87-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual management report of Urgences-Santé;

(Sessional Paper No. 88-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual report of Héma-Québec;

(Sessional Paper No. 89-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual management report of the Health and Welfare Commissioner;

(Sessional Paper No. 90-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual management report of the Institut national d'excellence en santé et en services sociaux:

(Sessional Paper No. 91-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual management report of the Régie de l'assurance maladie du Québec;

(Sessional Paper No. 92-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual management report of the Ministère de la Santé et des Services sociaux:

(Sessional Paper No. 93-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual report on the implementation of the complaints examination procedure, user satisfaction and respect of user rights of the Centre hospitalier de l'Université de Montréal;

(Sessional Paper No. 94-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual report on the implementation of the complaints examination procedure, user satisfaction and respect of user rights of the Institut national de psychiatrie légale Philippe-Pinel;

(Sessional Paper No. 95-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual report on the implementation of the complaints examination procedure, user satisfaction and respect of user rights of the Institut universitaire de cardiologie et de pneumologie de Québec – Université Laval;

(Sessional Paper No. 96-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual report on the implementation of the complaints examination procedure, user satisfaction and respect of user rights of the McGill University Health Centre;

(Sessional Paper No. 97-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual report on the implementation of the complaints examination procedure, user satisfaction and respect of user rights of the Centre hospitalier universitaire Sainte-Justine;

(Sessional Paper No. 98-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual report of the Institut de cardiologie de Montréal;

(Sessional Paper No. 99-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual report on the implementation of the complaints examination procedure, user satisfaction and respect of user rights of the Institut de cardiologie de Montréal;

(Sessional Paper No. 100-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual report of the Nunavik Regional Board of Health and Social Services (English, French and Inuktitut versions);

(Sessional Paper No. 101-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual report of the Cree Board of Health and Social Services of James Bay.

(Sessional Paper No. 102-20221201)

The President tabled letters, dated 29 November 2022, she had received from Mr. Nadeau-Dubois, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, informing her of the following appointments effective as of 12 October 2022:

Mr. Gabriel Nadeau-Dubois, Member for Gouin, as Leader of the Second Opposition Group;

(Sessional Paper No. 103-20221201)

Mr. Alexandre Leduc, Member for Hochelaga-Maisonneuve, as House Leader of the Second Opposition Group;

(Sessional Paper No. 104-20221201)

Ms. Ruba Ghazal, Member for Mercier, as Whip of the Second Opposition Group. (Sessional Paper No. 105-20221201)

The President then tabled the following, pursuant to section 91 of the *Act respecting the National Assembly*:

The list of Coalition avenir Québec Members designated members and substitute members of the Office of the National Assembly:

Mr. Lefebvre (Arthabaska), Ms. Gendron (Châteauguay), Mr. Montigny (René-Lévesque), Mr. Bussière (Gatineau) and Mr. Laframboise (Blainville) as members;

Ms. Hébert (Saint-François), Mr. Lévesque (Chapleau), Mr. Reid (Beauharnois), Ms. Guillemette (Roberval) and Mr. Jacques (Mégantic) as substitute members. (Sessional Paper No. 106-20221201)

The list of Quebec Liberal Party Members designated members and substitute members of the Office of the National Assembly:

Ms. Setlakwe (Mont-Royal—Outremont), Ms. Lakhoyan Olivier (Chomedey) and Ms. McGraw (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce) as members;

Ms. Rotiroti (Jeanne-Mance-Viger), Mr. Ciccone (Marquette) and Ms. Cadet (Bourassa-Sauvé) as substitute members.

(Sessional Paper No. 107-20221201)

The list of Québec solidaire Members designated members and substitute members of the Office of the National Assembly:

Ms. Ghazal (Mercier) as member;

Mr. Leduc (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve) as substitute member.

(Sessional Paper No. 108-20221201)

Ms. Soucy, First Vice-President, moved that this list of members and substitute members of the Office of the National Assembly be adopted.

The motion was carried.

The President then tabled the following:

The Pre-election Report on the State of Québec's Public Finances – August 2022 (French and English versions);

(Sessional Paper No. 109-20221201)

The detailed analysis of the Auditor General of Québec on the 2022 pre-election report;

(Sessional Paper No. 110-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual activity report of the Public Protector (Québec Ombudsman) (French and English versions);

(Sessional Paper No. 111-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual management report of the Public Protector (Québec Ombudsman);

(Sessional Paper No. 112-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual management report of Élections Québec and of the Commission de la représentation électorale du Québec;

(Sessional Paper No. 113-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual management report of the Auditor General of Québec; (Sessional Paper No. 114-20221201)

The 2021–2022 activity report of Lobbyisme Québec;

(Sessional Paper No. 115-20221201)

The 2022–2026 strategic plan of Lobbyisme Québec;

(Sessional Paper No. 116-20221201)

The 2021–2022 activity report of the Ethics Commissioner;

(Sessional Paper No. 117-20221201)

The 2021–2022 annual report of the Commission de la fonction publique;

(Sessional Paper No. 118-20221201)

The 2021–2022 activity report on the National Assembly's interparliamentary and international relations;

(Sessional Paper No. 119-20221201)

A letter, dated 4 August 2022, to the Chair, from Mr. Jean Villeneuve, substitute member of the Commission de la fonction publique, informing the Chair of his resignation as of that date;

(Sessional Paper No. 120-20221201)

A letter, dated 30 August 2022, to the Chair, from Mr. Philippe-André Tessier, president of the Commission des droits de la personne et des droits de la jeunesse, informing the President of the resignation of Ms. Isa Iasenza as a member of the Commission, effective 1 September 2022, accompanied by a letter to Mr. Tessier from Ms. Iasenza;

(Sessional Paper No. 121-20221201)

A letter, dated 31 August 2022, to the Chair, from Me Lina Desbiens, Vice-Chair of the Commission d'accès à l'information du Québec, informing the President of her resignation as Commission Vice-Chair and member, effective 24 November 2022;

(Sessional Paper No. 122-20221201)

A letter, dated 26 August 2022, to the Chair, from Ms. Anne Bourhis, Chair of the Board of Directors of Héma-Québec, and Nathalie Fagnan, President and Chief Executive Officer of Héma-Québec, in response to the motion carried by the Assembly on 3 June 2022 on the change to the blood donation eligibility criteria; (Sessional Paper No. 123-20221201)

The seating plan of the National Assembly, dated 1 December 2022. (Sessional Paper No. 124-20221201)

#### **Presenting Petitions**

Ms. Caron (La Pinière) tabled the following on behalf of Ms. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent):

The abstract of a petition on a request to make dementia prevention a health priority, signed by 127 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 125-20221201)

# **Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

#### **Motions Without Notice**

Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, moved a motion on the indexation of government tariffs; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

\_\_\_\_

Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), together with Mr. Bouazzi (Maurice-Richard) and Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil), moved a motion on the situation of food banks; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Leduc (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve) moved:

THAT the Assembly take note that all the Members of the 43rd Legislature have declared under oath that they will be loyal to the people of Québec and that they will perform their duties as Members honestly and justly in conformity with the constitution of Québec;

THAT the Assembly recall that the Government has committed to tabling a bill to make the oath of allegiance to the King optional and the decision to take it or not up to each Member;

THAT the Assembly express its wish that the oath of allegiance to the King become optional following the swift adoption of a bill, so that Members who have taken the sole oath of allegiance provided for in section 15 of and the schedule to the *Act respecting the National Assembly* may take their seats in the Assembly as soon as possible.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

\_\_\_\_\_

#### ORDERS OF THE DAY

# **Business Having Precedence**

Opening Speech Debate

Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition, opened the debate on the Opening Speech of the Session and on the motion moved by Mr. Legault, Premier, that the Assembly approve the Government's general policy presented at the sitting of 30 November 2022.

At the end of his address, Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition, moved the following motion stating a grievance:

THAT the National Assembly denounce the CAQ government's lack of vision to resolve the most pressing issues that Quebecers are facing, in particular the labour shortage, the fight against inflation and access to quality health care.

The debate continued on the Opening Speech of the Session, on the motion moved by Mr. Legault, Premier, and on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition, subject to the receivability of this motion.

\_\_\_\_\_

At 12:59 p.m., the President suspended the proceedings until 3:00 p.m.

\_\_\_\_\_

The proceedings resumed at 3:02 p.m.

The debate continued on the Opening Speech of the Session, on the motion moved by Mr. Legault, Premier, and on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition, subject to the receivability of this motion.

The President informed the Assembly of the allocation of speaking time for the proceedings with respect to this debate: 60 minutes to the Government representative for his reply; 12 hours to the parliamentary group forming the Government; 6 hours 53 minutes 32 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition; 3 hours 52 minutes 56 seconds to the Second Opposition Group; 1 hour 3 minutes 32 seconds to the Third Opposition Group; and 10 minutes to the Member for Vaudreuil. Within this framework, any time not used by the independent Member or by a parliamentary group shall be redistributed according to the provisions of the agreement tabled on 29 November 2022. Lastly, individual addresses shall not be limited.

The debate continued.

At the end of his address, Mr. Marissal (Rosemont) moved the following motion stating a grievance:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Coalition avenir Québec government for its lack of political will to take action against the institutional violence experienced by our health professionals by putting an end to mandatory overtime and to the use of private agencies as well as by proposing a bill introducing nursing ratios.

The debate continued on the Opening Speech of the Session, on the motion moved by Mr. Legault, Premier, and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition, and Mr. Marissal (Rosemont), subject to the receivability of these motions.

At the end of her address, Ms. Maccarone (Westmount–Saint-Louis) moved the following motion stating a grievance:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ government for its silence on and lack of recognition of the 2SLGBTQIA community.

The debate continued on the Opening Speech of the Session, on the motion moved by Mr. Legault, Premier, and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Marissal (Rosemont) and Ms. Maccarone (Westmount–Saint-Louis), subject to the receivability of these motions.

At the end of his address, Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys) moved the following motion stating a grievance:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ government for its lack of targeted measures to help Quebecers fight the rising cost of living.

At 5:58 p.m., Mr. Benjamin, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 7:30 pm.

| The | proceedings | resumed | at | 7:30 | p.m. |
|-----|-------------|---------|----|------|------|
|     |             |         |    |      |      |

\_\_\_\_

The debate continued on the Opening Speech of the Session, on the motion moved by Mr. Legault, Premier, and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Marissal (Rosemont), Ms. Maccarone (Westmount—Saint-Louis) and Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), subject to the receivability of these motions.

At the end of her address, Ms. Dufour (Mille-Îles) moved the following motion stating a grievance:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ government for not mentioning the housing crisis that continues to plague Québec, affecting thousands of vulnerable families in search of decent and affordable housing.

The debate continued on the Opening Speech of the Session, on the motion moved by Mr. Legault, Premier, and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Marissal (Rosemont), Ms. Maccarone (Westmount–Saint-Louis), Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys) and Ms. Dufour (Mille-Îles), subject to the receivability of these motions.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 21, the proceedings continued past 10:30 p.m.

\_\_\_\_

At 10:36 p.m., Mr. Lévesque, Second Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Friday, 2 December at 9:40 a.m.

**NATHALIE ROY** 

President