

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF QUÉBEC

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-THIRD LEGISLATURE

# **Votes and Proceedings**

of the Assembly

Wednesday, 7 December 2022 - No. 6

President of the National Assembly: Madam Nathalie Roy

The Assembly was called to order at 9:40 a.m.

#### **ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

#### **Statements by Members**

Mr. Caron (Portneuf) made a statement to underline the presence of Mr. Yves Nadeau, who was visiting the National Assembly.

Mr. Ciccone (Marquette) made a statement to pay tribute to hockey player Robert "Bobby" Rousseau.

Mr. Lévesque (Chapleau) made a statement to congratulate the Maison de la culture de Gatineau on winning a Félix Award.

Mr. Marissal (Rosemont) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. André Lavallée for his contribution to the development of Ville de Montréal.

Mr. Fitzgibbon (Terrebonne) made a statement to underline the 350th anniversary of Ville de Terrebonne.

Ms. McGraw (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce) made a statement, in the context of COP15, to underline the importance of biodiversity protection and the fight against climate change.

Ms. Biron (Chutes-de-la-Chaudière) made a statement to underline the importance of the contribution of mobilized citizens to help those in need.

Ms. Gendron (Châteauguay) made a statement to underline the 50th anniversary of the Centre de la petite enfance Les Lutins.

Mr. Boulet (Trois-Rivières) made a statement to congratulate Mr. Patrick Charlebois, winner of the Volcano Marathon.

Ms. Tremblay (Hull) made a statement to underline the 90th anniversary of the Association athlétique et sociale Hull-Volant.

Mr. Roberge (Chambly) made a statement to applaud the opening of a locker room for women by the Association de hockey mineur de Chambly.

Ms. Schmaltz (Vimont) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Germain Lafrenière, President of the organization Autisme Laval.

At 9:55 a.m., Ms. Soucy, First Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

The proceedings resumed at 10:03 a.m.

Moment of reflection

**Introduction of Bills** 

bill:

Mr. Caire, Minister of Cybersecurity and Digital Technology, moved that leave be granted to introduce the following bill:

3 An Act respecting health and social services information and amending various legislative provisions

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, Bill 3 was introduced in the Assembly.

Ms. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent) moved that leave be granted to introduce the following

192 An Act to ensure student health and safety in the classroom by regulating ambient air quality in schools

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, Bill 192 was introduced in the Assembly.

#### **Presenting Papers**

Ms. Déry, Minister of Higher Education, tabled the following:

The 2021–2022 annual management report of the Institut de tourisme et d'hôtellerie du Québec;

(Sessional Paper No. 158-20221207)

The 2021–2022 annual management report of the Ministère de l'Enseignement supérieur.

(Sessional Paper No. 159-20221207)

Mr. Bonnardel, Minister of Public Security, tabled the following:

The first report on the implementation of the 2021–2026 government action plan in response to recommendations by the Select Committee on the Sexual Exploitation of Minors.

(Sessional Paper No. 160-20221207)

Ms. Proulx, Minister of Tourism, tabled the following:

The 2021–2022 annual management report of the Ministère du Tourisme; (Sessional Paper No. 161-20221207)

The 2021–2022 annual management report of the Société du Centre des congrès de Québec;

(Sessional Paper No. 162-20221207)

The 2021–2022 annual report of the Palais des congrès de Montréal; (Sessional Paper No. 163-20221207)

The 2021–2022 annual report of the Parc olympique. (Sessional Paper No. 164-20221207) Ms. Blanchette Vézina, Minister of Natural Resources and Forests, tabled the following:

The 2021–2022 activity report of the Société du Plan Nord;

(Sessional Paper No. 165-20221207)

The 2021–2022 activity report of the Chief Forester; (Sessional Paper No. 166-20221207)

The 2021–2022 annual management report of the Ministère des Forêts, de la Faune et des Parcs;

(Sessional Paper No. 167-20221207)

The 2021–2022 annual management report of the Ministère de l'Énergie et des Ressources naturelles.

(Sessional Paper No. 168-20221207)

Ms. Biron, Minister of International Relations and La Francophonie, tabled the following:

The 2021–2022 annual management report of the Ministère des Relations internationales et de la Francophonie;

(Sessional Paper No. 169-20221207)

The 2021–2022 annual report of the Offices jeunesse internationaux du Québec. (Sessional Paper No. 170-20221207)

The President tabled the following:

The Report of the Auditor General of Québec to the National Assembly for 2022–2023 – December 2022;

(Sessional Paper No. 171-20221207)

The 2021–2022 follow-up report on the implementation of the recommendations of the Auditor General of Québec and the Sustainable Development Commissioner;

(Sessional Paper No. 172-20221207)

The 2021–2022 annual activity report of the Unité Permanente Anticorruption Oversight Committee.

(Sessional Paper No. 173-20221207)

#### **Presenting Reports from Committees**

Ms. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Public Administration, which elected its Chair and Vice-Chairs on 6 December 2022.

(Sessional Paper No. 174-20221207)

Mr. Ciccone (Marquette), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries, Energy and Natural Resources, which elected its Chair and Vice-Chair on 6 December 2022. (Sessional Paper No. 175-20221207)

Mr. Schneeberger (Drummond-Bois-Francs), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain, which elected its Chair and Vice-Chair on 6 December 2022.

(Sessional Paper No. 176-20221207)

Mr. Fortin (Pontiac), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Culture and Education, which elected its Chair and Vice-Chair on 6 December 2022.

(Sessional Paper No. 177-20221207)

Ms. D'Amours (Mirabel), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Labour and the Economy, which elected its Chair and Vice-Chair on 6 December 2022.

(Sessional Paper No. 178-20221207)

Mr. Simard (Montmorency), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Public Finance, which elected its Chair and Vice-Chair on 6 December 2022.

(Sessional Paper No. 179-20221207)

Mr. Bachand (Richmond), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Institutions, which elected its Chair and Vice-Chair on 6 December 2022.

(Sessional Paper No. 180-20221207)

Ms. Lecours (Les Plaines), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Citizen Relations, which elected its Chair and Vice-Chairs on 6 December 2022.

(Sessional Paper No. 181-20221207)

Mr. Provençal (Beauce-Nord), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Health and Social Services, which elected its Chair and Vice-Chair on 6 December 2022.

(Sessional Paper No. 182-20221207)

Ms. Maccarone (Westmount-Saint-Louis), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Transportation and the Environment, which elected its Chair and Vice-Chair on 6 December 2022.

(Sessional Paper No. 183-20221207)

#### **Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

## **Motions Without Notice**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Ms. Déry, Minister of Higher Education, together with Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil), moved:

THAT the National Assembly express its concern regarding the exclusion of certain candidates from obtaining Canada Research Chairs on the basis of criteria that are not related to competence;

THAT it reiterate the importance of academic freedom and academics' independence from granting agencies;

THAT it recall that promoting greater representation of under-represented target groups must always be done on the basis of equal competence;

THAT it denounce the interference by the federal government, that finances Research Chairs programs according to certain criteria that do not reflect Québec's specificity.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Ms. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent), together with Ms. Ghazal, Whip of the Second Opposition Group, and Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil), moved:

THAT the National Assembly note that Québec is currently experiencing a serious labour shortage;

THAT it underline that this situation is affecting many services under the responsibility of the State;

THAT it note that the number of teachers who are not legally qualified has reached historic highs;

THAT it recall that there is still a shortage of teachers in the education network, even three months into the school year;

THAT it underline that some students are enduring high teacher turnover in their classrooms;

THAT it recall that this situation can, in some cases, affect the quality of teaching and that this has an impact on teaching staff;

THAT, lastly, it ask the Québec government to implement additional measures to improve the quality of education provided to Québec students.

The question was put on this motion; a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **3** in Appendix)

Yeas: 102 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 0

Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage) moved:

THAT the National Assembly affirm its support for democracy and the right of peoples to choose their own future and that, accordingly, it recognize the Scottish people's right to freely organize a democratic consultation on their future.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

#### **ORDERS OF THE DAY**

#### **Business Having Precedence**

#### **Opening Speech Debate**

The Assembly resumed the debate, which had been adjourned on 6 December 2022, on the Opening Speech of the Session, on the motion moved by Mr. Legault, Premier, and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Marissal (Rosemont), Ms. Maccarone (Westmount–Saint-Louis), Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), Ms. Dufour (Mille-Îles), Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), Mr. Grandmont (Taschereau), Ms. Zaga Mendez (Verdun), Ms. Caron (La Pinière) and Mr. Fontecilla (Laurier-Dorion), subject to the receivability of these motions.

At the end of his address, Mr. Morin (Acadie) moved the following motion stating a grievance:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ government for its lack of leadership in the field of justice in Québec and for its lack of urgency in addressing the labour shortage in courthouses.

The debate continued on the Opening Speech of the Session, on the motion moved by Mr. Legault, Premier, and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Marissal (Rosemont), Ms. Maccarone (Westmount– Saint-Louis), Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), Ms. Dufour (Mille-Îles), Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), Mr. Grandmont (Taschereau), Ms. Zaga Mendez (Verdun), Ms. Caron (La Pinière), Mr. Fontecilla (Laurier-Dorion) and Mr. Morin (Acadie), subject to the receivability of these motions.

At 1:00 p.m., Ms. Soucy, First Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 3:00 p.m.

The proceedings resumed at 3:00 p.m.

The debate continued on the Opening Speech of the Session, on the motion moved by Mr. Legault, Premier, and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Marissal (Rosemont), Ms. Maccarone (Westmount– Saint-Louis), Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), Ms. Dufour (Mille-Îles), Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), Mr. Grandmont (Taschereau), Ms. Zaga Mendez (Verdun), Ms. Caron (La Pinière), Mr. Fontecilla (Laurier-Dorion) and Mr. Morin (Acadie), subject to the receivability of these motions.

At the end of her address, Ms. Cadet (Bourassa-Sauvé) moved the following motion stating a grievance:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ government for having underestimated the negative effects of the labour shortage on the Québec economy and on the delivery of public services, as well as for the absence of measures strong enough to address them.

The debate continued on the Opening Speech of the Session, on the motion moved by Mr. Legault, Premier, and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Marissal (Rosemont), Ms. Maccarone (Westmount– Saint-Louis), Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), Ms. Dufour (Mille-Îles), Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), Mr. Grandmont (Taschereau), Ms. Zaga Mendez (Verdun), Ms. Caron (La Pinière), Mr. Fontecilla (Laurier-Dorion), Mr. Morin (Acadie) and Ms. Cadet (Bourassa-Sauvé), subject to the receivability of these motions.

At the end of her address, Ms. Labrie (Sherbrooke) moved the following motion stating a grievance:

THAT the National Assembly censure the Coalition avenir Québec government for its inability to offer public sector workers remuneration and working conditions that are respectful and worthy of their essential contribution to Québec society, thereby jeopardizing the quality of our public services. The debate continued on the Opening Speech of the Session, on the motion moved by Mr. Legault, Premier, and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Marissal (Rosemont), Ms. Maccarone (Westmount– Saint-Louis), Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), Ms. Dufour (Mille-Îles), Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), Mr. Grandmont (Taschereau), Ms. Zaga Mendez (Verdun), Ms. Caron (La Pinière), Mr. Fontecilla (Laurier-Dorion), Mr. Morin (Acadie), Ms. Cadet (Bourassa-Sauvé) and Ms. Labrie (Sherbrooke), subject to the receivability of these motions.

At the end of her address, Ms. McGraw (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce) moved the following motion stating a grievance:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ government for having identified only 51% of measures necessary to achieve the greenhouse gas reduction target of 37.5% below 1990 levels by 2030, as well as for the lack of a plan to reach carbon neutrality in 2050.

The debate continued on the Opening Speech of the Session, on the motion moved by Mr. Legault, Premier, and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Marissal (Rosemont), Ms. Maccarone (Westmount– Saint-Louis), Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), Ms. Dufour (Mille-Îles), Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), Mr. Grandmont (Taschereau), Ms. Zaga Mendez (Verdun), Ms. Caron (La Pinière), Mr. Fontecilla (Laurier-Dorion), Mr. Morin (Acadie), Ms. Cadet (Bourassa-Sauvé), Ms. Labrie (Sherbrooke) and Ms. McGraw (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce), subject to the receivability of these motions.

At the end of her address, Ms. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques) moved the following motion stating a grievance:

THAT the National Assembly censure the Coalition avenir Québec government for continuing to erase the role, past and present, that the First Nations and Inuit play in the construction of our society. The debate continued on the Opening Speech of the Session, on the motion moved by Mr. Legault, Premier, and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Marissal (Rosemont), Ms. Maccarone (Westmount– Saint-Louis), Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), Ms. Dufour (Mille-Îles), Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), Mr. Grandmont (Taschereau), Ms. Zaga Mendez (Verdun), Ms. Caron (La Pinière), Mr. Fontecilla (Laurier-Dorion), Mr. Morin (Acadie), Ms. Cadet (Bourassa-Sauvé), Ms. Labrie (Sherbrooke), Ms. McGraw (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce) and Ms. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques), subject to the receivability of these motions.

The debate was adjourned in the name of Ms. Guillemette (Roberval).

At 6:00 p.m., Mr. Benjamin, Third Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Thursday, 8 December 2022 at 9:40 a.m.

#### NATHALIE ROY

#### President

# APPENDIX

## **Recorded Divisions**

On the motion moved by Ms. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent), together with Ms. Ghazal, Whip of the Second Opposition Group, and Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil):

# (Division No. 3)

#### **YEAS - 102**

1 EAS - 102			
Abou-Khalil (CAQ)	D'Amours (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Poulet ( $CAQ$ )
Allaire (CAQ)	Derraji (QLP)	Lachance (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)
Asselin (CAQ)	Déry (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Prass (QLP)
Bachand (CAQ)	Dionne (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)
Beauchemin (QLP)	Dorismond (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Drainville (CAQ)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Reid $(CAQ)$
(Orford)	Dufour (CAQ)	Lakhoyan Olivier	Rizqy (QLP)
		(QLP)	
Bélanger (CAQ)	(Abitibi-Est)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Roberge (CAQ)
(Prévost)	Dufour ( <i>QLP</i> )	Lamothe $(CAQ)$	Rotiroti (QLP)
Bernard (CAQ)	(Mille-Îles)	LeBel (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)
Biron (CAQ)	Duranceau (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Roy (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	Émond (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	(Verchères)
Blanchette Vézina	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Sainte-Croix (CAQ)
(CAQ)			
Blouin (CAQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Schmaltz (CAQ)
Bogemans (CAQ)	Fortin (QLP)	Leduc $(QS)$	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Boivin Roy (CAQ)	Fréchette (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Setlakwe (QLP)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Gagnon (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Simard (CAQ)
Bouazzi (QS)	Gendron (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	St-Louis (CAQ)
Boulet (CAQ)	Ghazal (QS)	(Chapleau)	Tanguay (QLP)
Bussière (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Maccarone (QLP)	Tardif (CAQ)
Cadet (QLP)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Mallette (CAQ)	Thouin (CAQ)
Carmant (CAQ)	Grandmont (QS)	Marissal (QS)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Caron (QLP)	Guillemette (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	(Dubuc)
(La Pinière)	Hébert (CAQ)	Massé (QS)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Champagne Jourdain	Jacques (CAQ)	McGraw (QLP)	(Hull)
(CAQ)			
Charest (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Montigny (CAQ)	Zaga Mendez (QS)
Charette (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Morin (QLP)	Zanetti (QS)
Chassin (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	
Ciccone (QLP)	Kelley (QLP)	Nichols (IND)	