

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF QUÉBEC

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-THIRD LEGISLATURE

Votes and Proceedings

of the Assembly

Tuesday, 31 January 2023 - No. 9

President of the National Assembly: Madam Nathalie Roy

The Assembly was called to order at 10:00 a.m.

Moment of reflection

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Government Bills

Passage in Principle

Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, moved that Bill 6, An Act to give effect to fiscal measures announced in the Budget Speech delivered on 22 March 2022 and to certain other measures, do now pass in principle.

After debate thereon, the motion was carried on division and, accordingly, Bill 6 was passed in principle.

Mr. Lévesque, Deputy Government House Leader, moved that Bill 6 be referred to the Committee on Public Finance for clause-by-clause consideration.

The motion was carried.

At 10:17 a.m., at the request of Mr. Lévesque, Deputy Government House Leader, Mr. Lévesque, Second Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 1:40 p.m.

The proceedings resumed at 1:40 p.m.

ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS

Statements by Members

Ms. Dionne (Rivière-du-Loup–Témiscouata) made a statement to underline the 75th anniversary of Lepage Millwork.

Ms. Garceau (Robert-Baldwin) made a statement to underline the 30th anniversary of the Associazione Italo-Canadese del West Island.

Ms. Lachance (Bellechasse) made a statement to pay tribute to Dr. Jean Falardeau for his contribution to the community of Bellechasse.

Ms. Labrie (Sherbrooke) made a statement requesting that the Government adopt measures to curb the housing crisis.

Ms. Champagne Jourdain (Duplessis) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Octave Deraps for his contribution to the development of the Côte-Nord region.

Ms. Dufour (Mille-Îles) made a statement to underline the 350th anniversary of Ville de Terrebonne.

Ms. Tardif (Laviolette–Saint-Maurice) made a statement to pay tribute to Ms. Claudette Auchu, pianist and organist.

Mr. Rivest (Côte-du-Sud) made a statement to underline the work of the organizing committee of the Tournoi provincial Opti M13 de Montmagny.

Ms. Laforest (Chicoutimi) made a statement to pay tribute to Dr. Charles Morin for his contribution to research on lactic acidosis.

Mr. Dufour (Abitibi-Est) made a statement to underline the 30th anniversary of the Val-d'Or Foreurs hockey team.

Mr. Reid (Beauharnois) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Michel Choinière for his social and community involvement.

Mr. Lefebvre (Arthabaska) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Jean Marcotte for his professional career and for his social and community involvement.

At 1:55 p.m., Mr. Benjamin, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

The proceedings resumed at 2:04 p.m.

At the request of the President, the Assembly observed a moment of silence in memory of Mr. Maximilien Polak, former Member for Sainte-Anne, and Mr. Roger Pilote, former Member for Lac-Saint-Jean.

Presenting Papers

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Minister of Justice, tabled the following:

The 2019–2023 budgetary forecasts of the Comité de la rémunération des juges for the periods ending on 31 March 2022 and on 31 March 2023. (Sessional Paper No. 271-20230131)

Ms. Déry, Minister of Higher Education, tabled the following:

The 2021–2022 annual management report of the Commission d'évaluation de l'enseignement collégial.

(Sessional Paper No. 272-20230131)

Mr. Lamontagne, Minister of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, tabled the following:

The 2021–2022 annual report of the Régie des marchés agricoles et alimentaires du Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 273-20230131)

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, tabled the following:

The reply to a written question from Ms. Labrie (Sherbrooke) on access to public contracts for social economy enterprises – Question No. 1, *Order Paper and Notices* of 29 November 2022;

(Sessional Paper No. 274-20230131)

The reply to a written question from Mr. Leduc (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve) on the extension of the Pie-IX bus rapid transit to Notre-Dame Street – Question No. 2, *Order Paper and Notices* of 30 November 2022;

(Sessional Paper No. 275-20230131)

The reply to a written question from Ms. Rotiroti (Jeanne-Mance–Viger) on access times for francization courses in the Capitale-Nationale region – Question No. 3, *Order Paper and Notices* of 30 November 2022.

(Sessional Paper No. 276-20230131)

The President tabled the following:

The detailed report of the Chief Electoral Officer of Québec on the results of the general election held on 3 October 2022.

(Sessional Paper No. 277-20230131)

The President then tabled the following decisions of the Office of the National Assembly, dated 15 December 2022:

Decision 2246 concerning the Règlement modifiant le Règlement sur la rémunération et les conditions de travail du personnel d'un député et d'autres dispositions réglementaires (regulation to amend the regulation respecting the remuneration and conditions of employment of members of a Member's staff and other regulatory provisions);

(Sessional Paper No. 278-20230131)

Decision 2247 concerning the Règlement modifiant le Règlement sur le pavoisement et l'éclairage extérieur des édifices de l'Assemblée nationale (regulation respecting exterior flags and lights of the National Assembly buildings).

(Sessional Paper No. 279-20230131)

Lastly, the President tabled the following:

Tables indicating the allocation of speaking times for limited debates and debates on Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition;

(Sessional Paper No. 280-20230131)

The new seating plan of the National Assembly, dated 31 January 2023; (Sessional Paper No. 281-20230131)

A copy of the notice of motion by Mr. Fortin (Pontiac) to be placed on the *Order Paper and Notices* of Wednesday, 1 February 2023 under Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition.

(Sessional Paper No. 282-20230131)

Presenting Reports from Committees

The President tabled the following:

The report from the steering committee of the Committee on the National Assembly, which met on 30 January 2023 to discuss a request from the Members of the Parti québécois to sit on a standing committee.

(Sessional Paper No. 283-20230131)

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 129 and section 4.4 of the Rules for the Conduct of Proceedings, Mr. Lévesque, Second Vice-President, moved:

THAT the changes in the membership of the standing committees as provided for in the report from the steering committee of the Committee on the National Assembly be adopted.

The motion was carried.

Presenting Petitions

Mr. Fortin (Pontiac) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on access to food allergy desensitization clinics, signed by 5,295 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 284-20230131)

Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on the priority contracting of the CHSLD Plaisance des Îles, signed by 47 workers from the CHSLD Plaisance des Îles. (Sessional Paper No. 285-20230131)

Oral Questions and Answers

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

Motions Without Notice

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 84.3 and 185, Mr. Derraji, Official Opposition House Leader, together with Mr. Legault, Premier, Mr. Nadeau-Dubois, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, Mr. St-Pierre Plamondon, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, and Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil), moved:

> THAT the National Assembly honour the memory of Quebecers Ibrahima Barry, Mamadou Tanou Barry, Khaled Belkacemi, Abdelkrim Hassane, Azzeddine Soufiane and Aboubaker Thabti, who lost their lives on 29 January 2017 at the Grand Mosque in Québec City;

THAT it extend its deepest condolences to the families and loved ones of these victims;

THAT it express its solidarity with these women and men forever marked by this tragic event, as well as with the entire Muslim community of Québec;

THAT it recall also the burden carried by first responders and honour the memory of Andréanne Leblanc, for whom the tragedy was too great to bear;

THAT it unequivocally condemn all hateful speech and actions, racism and discrimination against the Muslim community, as well as all forms of xenophobia and Islamophobia;

THAT it invite the Government of Québec to step up its initiatives to put a stop to these phenomena;

THAT, lastly, the National Assembly observe a moment of silence to honour the memory of those who died.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the question was put on the motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 21 in Appendix)

Yeas: **119** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

At the request of Mr. Benjamin, Third Vice-President, the Assembly observed a minute of silence.

Mr. Bouazzi (Maurice-Richard), together with Mr. Kelley (Jacques-Cartier), Mr. St-Pierre Plamondon, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, and Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil), moved a motion on the examination of Hydro-Québec's Strategic Plan 2022– 2026 in parliamentary committee; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. St-Pierre Plamondon, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, together with Ms. Biron, Minister of International Relations and La Francophonie, and Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), moved:

THAT the National Assembly recognize the right of Québec to determine its own future;

THAT it affirm that the Québec people are free and able to assume their destiny and development;

THAT it condemn all forms of attacks and manoeuvres to call into question this principle;

THAT it recognize the primacy of Québec democracy and of its Parliament.

The question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 22 in Appendix)

Yeas: 119 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 0

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Roberge, Minister Responsible for Laicity, together with Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition, and Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia), moved:

THAT the National Assembly acknowledge the unacceptable remarks made in the past by Ms. Amira Elghawaby concerning Quebecers and Islamophobia;

THAT the National Assembly denounce these remarks and note that Ms. Elghawaby has yet to apologize to Quebecers;

THAT it reiterate that Québec is a secular State that promotes equality and freedom of conscience and religion for all Quebecers;

THAT, lastly, the National Assembly ask the federal government to terminate Amira Elghawaby's mandate as Canada's Special Representative on Combatting Islamophobia.

The question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 23 in Appendix)

Yeas: 108 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 11

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 84.1 and pursuant to Standing Order 146, Mr. Lévesque, Deputy Government House Leader, moved:

THAT the National Assembly give effect to the order of reference given to the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries, Energy and Natural Resources within the framework of the consideration of Bill 2, An Act mainly to cap the indexation rate for Hydro-Québec domestic distribution rate prices and to further regulate the obligation to distribute electricity, to hold special consultations and public hearings on Tuesday, 31 January 2023 from 9:45 a.m. to 12:25 p.m. and from 3:30 p.m. to 6:45 p.m., and on Wednesday, 1 February 2023 from 11:30 a.m. to 1:05 p.m. and from 3:00 p.m. to 4:35 p.m.;

THAT, for this purpose, the Committee hear the following individuals and organizations:

Hydro-Québec Canadian Federation of Independent Business Fédération des chambres de commerce du Québec Jean-Pierre Finet, energy analyst Option consommateurs Union des consommateurs Jean-François Blain, ACEF Canadian Taxpayers Federation Fondation Rivières Association québécoise des consommateurs industriels d'électricité Association des redistributeurs d'électricité du Québec;

THAT a period of 12 minutes be set aside for opening statements, allocated as follows: 6 minutes to the parliamentary group forming the Government, 4 minutes 30 seconds to the Official Opposition and 1 minute 30 seconds to the Second Opposition Group;

THAT the presentation by each individual or organization last no longer than 10 minutes and the exchange with the Committee members last no longer than 35 minutes, allocated as follows: 17 minutes 30 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Government, 13 minutes 8 seconds to the Official Opposition and 4 minutes 23 seconds to the Second Opposition Group;

THAT a 5-minute interval be scheduled between discussions with each individual or organization;

THAT those being heard be permitted to testify by video conference;

THAT the Minister of Economy, Innovation and Energy be a member of the said Committee during its proceedings with respect to this order of reference.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 84.1 and pursuant to Standing Order 146, Mr. Lévesque, Deputy Government House Leader, moved:

THAT the National Assembly give effect to the order of reference given to the Committee on Transportation and the Environment to hold special consultations and public hearings with reference to the draft of the Government's 2023–2028 sustainable development strategy on Tuesday, 31 January 2023 from 9:45 a.m. to 12:25 p.m. and after Notices of Proceedings in Committees from approximately 3:15 p.m. to 7:20 p.m., on Wednesday, 1 February 2023 after Notices of Proceedings in Committees from approximately 11:15 a.m. to 12:50 p.m. and from 3:00 p.m. to 6:15 p.m., on Thursday, 2 February 2023 after Notices of Proceedings in Committees from approximately 11:15 a.m. to 12:50 p.m. and from 2:00 p.m. to 4:25 p.m., and on Tuesday, 7 February 2023 from 9:45 a.m. to 12:10 p.m.;

THAT, for this purpose, the Committee hear the following individuals and organizations:

Alliance pour une économie verte au Québec SWITCH Le collectif G15+ Quebec Business Council on the Environment Regroupement national des conseils régionaux de l'environnement du Québec Assembly of First Nations Quebec-Labrador Union des municipalités du Québec Fédération québécoise des municipalités Nature Ouébec Sustainable Development Commissioner Vivre en Ville Pierre Gosselin, research associate at CHU de Québec and research associate at INSPQ Réseau des femmes en environnement Advisory Committee on Climate Change Center for Intersectoral Studies and Research on the Circular Economy Équiterre **Environnement Jeunesse** Centre québécois du droit à l'environnement Fonds d'action québécois pour le développement durable David Suzuki Foundation Association québécoise des médecins pour l'environnement Climate Action Network Centre québécois de développement durable;

THAT a period of 12 minutes be set aside for opening statements, allocated as follows: 6 minutes to the parliamentary group forming the Government, 4 minutes 30 seconds to the Official Opposition and 1 minute 30 seconds to the Second Opposition Group;

THAT the presentation by each organization last no longer than 10 minutes and the exchange with the Committee members last no longer than 35 minutes, allocated as follows: 17 minutes 30 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Government, 13 minutes 8 seconds to the Official Opposition and 4 minutes 23 seconds to the Second Opposition Group;

THAT a 5-minute interval be scheduled between discussions with each individual or organization;

THAT the Minister of the Environment, the Fight Against Climate Change, Wildlife and Parks be a member of the said Committee during its proceedings with respect to this order of reference.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 84.1 and pursuant to Standing Order 146, Mr. Lévesque, Deputy Government House Leader, moved:

THAT the National Assembly give effect to the order of reference given to the Committee on Public Finance within the framework of the consideration of Bill 3, An Act respecting health and social services information and amending various legislative provisions, to hold special consultations and public hearings on Tuesday, 31 January 2023 from 9:45 a.m. to 12:25 p.m. and after Notices of Proceedings in Committees from approximately 3:15 p.m. to 7:20 p.m., on Wednesday, 1 February 2023 after Notices of Proceedings in Committees from approximately 11:15 a.m. to 12:50 p.m. and from 3:00 p.m. to 6:15 p.m., on Thursday, 2 February 2023 after Notices of Proceedings in Committees for Proceedings in Committees from approximately 11:15 a.m. to 12:50 p.m. and from 3:00 p.m. to 12:50 p.m. and from 2:00 p.m. to 4:25 p.m., and on Tuesday, 7 February 2023 from 10:00 a.m. to 12:25 p.m. and after Notices of Proceedings in Committees for Proceedings in Committees from approximately 3:15 p.m. to 12:50 p.m. and from 2:00 p.m. to 4:25 p.m., and on Tuesday, 7 February 2023 from 10:00 a.m. to 12:25 p.m. and after Notices of Proceedings in Committees from approximately 3:15 p.m. to 4:50 p.m.;

THAT, for this purpose, the Committee hear the following individuals and organizations:

Commission d'accès à l'information du Québec Ms. Joanne Castonguay, Commissaire à la santé et au bien-être Mr. Rémi Quirion, Québec's Chief Scientist Fédération des médecins omnipraticiens du Québec Canadian Cancer Society and the Cancer Research Society Régie de l'assurance maladie du Québec Association des gestionnaires des établissements de santé et de services sociaux Consortium pour l'accès aux données en santé du Québec Conseil de protection des malades Mr. Vincent Dumez, from the Center of Excellence on Partnership with Patients and the Public Fédération des médecins spécialistes du Québec Fédération interprofessionnelle de la santé Association des gestionnaires de l'information de la santé du Québec Association des établissements privés conventionnés santé services sociaux Regroupement provincial des comités d'usagers Héma-Québec BioOuébec Ms. Aude Motulsky, Consortium Santé Numérique Ms. Anne-Sophie Le Tellier, CRISIS Mr. Steven Lachance, expert in cybersecurity Institut de la statistique du Québec Association des pharmaciens des établissements de santé du Ouébec Protecteur du citoyen Institut de la gouvernance numérique du Québec;

THAT a period of 12 minutes be set aside for opening statements, allocated as follows: 6 minutes to the parliamentary group forming the Government, 4 minutes 30 seconds to the Official Opposition and 1 minute 30 seconds to the Second Opposition Group;

THAT the presentation by each organization last no longer than 10 minutes and the exchange with the Committee members last no longer than 35 minutes, allocated as follows: 17 minutes 30 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Government, 13 minutes 8 seconds to the Official Opposition and 4 minutes 23 seconds to the Second Opposition Group;

THAT a 5-minute interval be scheduled between discussions with each individual or organization;

THAT the Minister of Cybersecurity and Digital Technology be a member of the said Committee during its proceedings with respect to this order of reference.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 84.1 and pursuant to Standing Order 146, Mr. Lévesque, Deputy Government House Leader, moved:

THAT the National Assembly give effect to the order of reference given to the Committee on Public Finance to hold special consultations and public hearings on the consultation document tabled by the Minister of Finance on 9 December 2022 on the Québec Pension Plan entitled "Un régime adapté aux défis du 21^e siècle" (a regime adapted to the challenges of the 21st century) on Wednesday, 8 February 2023 after Notices of Proceedings in Committees from approximately 11:15 a.m. to 1:05 p.m. and from 3:00 p.m. to 6:15 p.m., on Thursday, 9 February 2023 after Notices of Proceedings in Committees from approximately 11:15 a.m. to 12:50 p.m. and from 2:00 p.m. to 4:25 p.m., and on Tuesday, 14 February 2023 from 9:45 a.m. to 12:10 p.m. and after Notices of Proceedings in Committees from approximately 3:15 p.m. to 4:00 p.m.;

THAT, for this purpose, the Committee hear the following individuals and organizations:

Canadian Institute of Actuaries (11:30 a.m. to 12:15 p.m.) Alban d'Amours, René Beaudry, Bernard Morency and Luc Godbout, members of the Expert Committee on the Future of the Québec Retirement System Confédération des syndicats nationaux Fédération des travailleurs et travailleuses du Québec Réseau FADOQ Force jeunesse Conseil du statut de la femme Centrale des syndicats du Québec Jean-Claude Ménard (former Chief Actuary of Canada and international expert on social security) and Denis Latulippe (ULaval - Professor of Actuarial Science and expert on social security), together Conseil du patronat du Québec Bonnie-Jeanne MacDonald (Ryerson University -Professor of Actuarial Science and expert on retirement and social security) and Barbara Sanders (Simon Fraser University - Professor of Actuarial Science and expert on retirement and social security), together F. Hubert Tremblay, Senior Adviser for Wealth Business, Mercer Caisse de dépôt et placement du Québec Institut de recherche en économie contemporaine Association québécoise des retraité(e)s des secteurs public et parapublic;

THAT a period of 12 minutes be set aside for opening statements, allocated as follows: 6 minutes to the parliamentary group forming the Government, 4 minutes 30 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition and 1 minute 30 seconds to the Second Opposition Group;

THAT the presentation by each organization last no longer than 10 minutes and the exchange with the Committee members last no longer than 35 minutes, allocated as follows: 17 minutes 30 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Government, 13 minutes 8 seconds to the Official Opposition and 4 minutes 23 seconds to the Second Opposition Group;

THAT a 5-minute interval be scheduled between discussions with each individual or organization;

THAT the Minister of Finance be a member of the said Committee during its proceedings with respect to this order of reference.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

Notices of Proceedings in Committees

Mr. Lévesque, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

- the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries, Energy and Natural Resources, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 2, An Act mainly to cap the indexation rate for Hydro-Québec domestic distribution rate prices and to further regulate the obligation to distribute electricity;
- the Committee on Transportation and the Environment, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on the draft of the Government's 2023–2028 sustainable development strategy.

And, by leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 143, he convened the following committee:

 the Committee on Public Finance, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 3, An Act respecting health and social services information and amending various legislative provisions.

Mr. Benjamin, Third Vice-President, gave the following notice:

 the Committee on Transportation and the Environment shall hold a deliberative meeting to inform the members on the activities and operation of the Committee and to organize its proceedings.

Information on the Proceedings of the Assembly

Mr. Benjamin, Third Vice-President, informed the Assembly that on Wednesday, 1 February 2023, during Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition, a debate would be held on the motion moved by Mr. Fortin (Pontiac).

This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly take note that as the CAQ government begins its 5th year in office, Québec is experiencing an unacceptable deterioration in its wait times for access to primary care;

THAT it note that under the CAQ government:

- the average time spent on a stretcher has more than doubled in the last 4 years, from 14.2 hours to 29.31 hours;
- 163,991 patients are waiting for surgery, 20,649 of whom have been waiting for more than 12 months;

- another 608 cancer patients are waiting for surgery, despite the Minister of Health's commitments to reduce delays;
- vacancies for orderlies in the health network have risen from 2,700 in 2020 to 4,200 in 2022, and vacancies for nurses have risen from 4,300 to more than 5,000 over the same period;

THAT it recall that the Government wishes to be judged on its results and that these results show a major setback in access to health care in Québec;

THAT, lastly, it ask the CAQ government to commit to making the necessary adjustments and to respond to the fundamental mission of the State, which is to offer quality care and services in a timely manner to all Quebecers.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

At 3:49 p.m., at the request of Mr. Lévesque, Deputy Government House Leader, Mr. Benjamin, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 6:30 p.m.

Debates upon Adjournment

At 6:30 p.m., the Assembly held two debates upon adjournment:

- the first, on a question from Ms. Caron (La Pinière) to Ms. Bélanger, Minister for Health and for Seniors, about the significant increase in cases of maltreatment of seniors;
- the second, on a question from Ms. Dufour (Mille-Îles) to Ms. Duranceau, Minister Responsible for Housing, about Quebecers facing increasing difficulties to find housing.

At 6:54 p.m., Mr. Lévesque, Second Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Wednesday, 1 February 2023 at 9:40 a.m.

NATHALIE ROY

President

APPENDIX

Recorded Divisions

On the motion moved by Mr. Derraji, Official Opposition House Leader, together with Mr. Legault, Premier, Mr. Nadeau-Dubois, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, Mr. St-Pierre Plamondon, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, and Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil):

(Division No. 21)

YEAS - 119

YEAS - 119					
Abou-Khalil (CAQ)	Chassin (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)		
Allaire (CAQ)	Ciccone (QLP)	Julien (CAQ)	Poulet (CAQ)		
Arseneau (PQ)	Derraji (QLP)	Kelley (QLP)	Poulin (CAQ)		
Asselin (CAQ)	Déry (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Prass (QLP)		
Bachand (CAQ)	Dionne (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)		
Beauchemin (QLP)	Dorismond (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)		
Bélanger (CAQ)	Drainville (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Reid (CAQ)		
(Orford)	Dubé (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Rivest (CAQ)		
Bélanger (CAQ)	Dufour (CAQ)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Rizqy (QLP)		
(Prévost)	(Abitibi-Est)	Lakhoyan Olivier (QLP)	Roberge (CAQ)		
Bernard (CAQ)	Dufour (QLP)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Rotiroti (QLP)		
Bérubé (PQ)	(Mille-Îles)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)		
Biron (CAQ)	Duranceau (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Roy (CAQ)		
Blais (CAQ)	Émond (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	(Verchères)		
Blanchette Vézina (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	Sainte-Croix (CAQ)		
Blouin (CAQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	Lecours (CAQ)	Schmaltz (CAQ)		
Bogemans (CAQ)	Fortin (<i>QLP</i>)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Schneeberger (CAQ)		
Boivin Roy (CAQ)	Fréchette (CAQ)	Leduc (QS)	Setlakwe (<i>QLP</i>)		
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Gagnon (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Simard (CAQ)		
Bouazzi (QS)	Garceau (QLP)	Legault (CAQ)	Skeete (CAQ)		
Boulet (CAQ)	Gendron (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	St-Louis (CAQ)		
Bourassa (CAQ)	Ghazal (QS)	Lemieux (CAQ)	St-Pierre Plamondon (PQ)		
Boutin (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Tanguay (<i>QLP</i>)		
Bussière (CAQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	(Chapleau)	Tardif (CAQ)		
Cadet (QLP)	Girard (CAQ)	Maccarone (QLP)	Thouin (CAQ)		
Caire (CAQ)	(Groulx)	Mallette (CAQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)		
Carmant (CAQ)	Grandmont (QS)	Marissal (QS)	(Dubuc)		
Caron (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)		
(Portneuf)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Massé (QS)	(Hull)		
Caron (QLP)	Guillemette (CAQ)	McGraw (QLP)	Zaga Mendez (QS)		
(La Pinière)	Haytayan (CAQ)	Montigny (CAQ)	Zanetti (QS)		
Champagne Jourdain (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Morin (QLP)			
Charest (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)			
Charette (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Nichols (IND)			

On the motion moved by Mr. St-Pierre Plamondon, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, together with Ms. Biron, Minister of International Relations and La Francophonie, and Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage):

(Division No. 22)

YEAS - 119						
Abou-Khalil (CAQ)	Chassin (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)			
Allaire (CAQ)	Ciccone (<i>QLP</i>)	Julien (CAQ)	Poulet (CAQ)			
Arseneau (PQ)	Derraji (QLP)	Kelley (<i>QLP</i>)	Poulin (CAQ)			
Asselin (CAQ)	Déry (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Prass (QLP)			
Bachand (CAQ)	Dionne (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)			
Beauchemin (QLP)	Dorismond (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)			
Bélanger (CAQ)	Drainville (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Reid (CAQ)			
(Orford)	Dubé (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Rivest (CAQ)			
Bélanger (CAQ)	Dufour (CAQ)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Rizqy (QLP)			
(Prévost)	(Abitibi-Est)	Lakhoyan Olivier (QLP)	Roberge (CAQ)			
Bernard (CAQ)	Dufour (<i>QLP</i>)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Rotiroti (QLP)			
Bérubé (PQ)	(Mille-Îles)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)			
Biron (CAQ)	Duranceau (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Roy (CAQ)			
Blais (CAQ)	Émond (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	(Verchères)			
Blanchette Vézina (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	Sainte-Croix (CAQ)			
Blouin (CAQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	Lecours (CAQ)	Schmaltz (CAQ)			
Bogemans (CAQ)	Fortin (<i>QLP</i>)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Schneeberger (CAQ)			
Boivin Roy (CAQ)	Fréchette (CAQ)	Leduc (QS)	Setlakwe (QLP)			
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Gagnon (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Simard (CAQ)			
Bouazzi (QS)	Garceau (QLP)	Legault (CAQ)	Skeete (CAQ)			
Boulet (CAQ)	Gendron (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	St-Louis (CAQ)			
Bourassa (CAQ)	Ghazal (QS)	Lemieux (CAQ)	St-Pierre Plamondon			
$\mathbf{D} = (\mathbf{C} + \mathbf{C})$	C' = 1(C(A))		(PQ)			
Boutin (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Tanguay (QLP)			
Bussière (CAQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	(Chapleau)	Tardif (CAQ)			
Cadet (<i>QLP</i>)	Girard (CAQ)	Maccarone (<i>QLP</i>)	Thouin (CAQ)			
Caire (CAQ)	(Groulx)	Mallette (CAQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)			
Carmant (CAQ)	Grandmont (QS)	Marissal (QS)	(Dubuc)			
Caron (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)			
(Portneuf)	Guilbault (<i>CAQ</i>)	Massé (QS)	(Hull)			
Caron (<i>QLP</i>)	Guillemette (CAQ)	McGraw (QLP)	Zaga Mendez (QS)			
(La Pinière)	Haytayan (CAQ)	Montigny (CAQ)	Zanetti (QS)			
Champagne Jourdain (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Morin (<i>QLP</i>)				
Charest (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)				
Charette (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Nichols (IND)				

YEAS - 119

On the motion moved by Mr. Roberge, Minister Responsible for Laicity, together with Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition, and Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia):

(Division No. 23)

YEAS - 108

1 EAS - 100						
Abou-Khalil (CAQ)	Charest (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)			
Allaire (CAQ)	Charette (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Poulet (CAQ)			
Arseneau (PQ)	Chassin (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)			
Asselin (CAQ)	Ciccone (<i>QLP</i>)	Julien (CAQ)	Prass (QLP)			
Bachand (CAQ)	Derraji (QLP)	Kelley (QLP)	Proulx (CAQ)			
Beauchemin (QLP)	Déry (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)			
Bélanger (CAQ)	Dionne (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Reid (CAQ)			
(Orford)	Dorismond (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Rivest (CAQ)			
Bélanger (CAQ)	Drainville (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Rizqy (QLP)			
(Prévost)	Dubé (CAQ)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Roberge (CAQ)			
Bernard (CAQ)	Dufour (CAQ)	Lakhoyan Olivier (QLP)	Rotiroti (QLP)			
Bérubé (PQ)	(Abitibi-Est)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)			
Biron (CAQ)	Dufour (<i>QLP</i>)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Roy (CAQ)			
Blais (CAQ)	(Mille-Îles)	LeBel (CAQ)	(Verchères)			
Blanchette Vézina (CAQ)	Duranceau (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Sainte-Croix (CAQ)			
Blouin (CAQ)	Émond (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	Schmaltz (CAQ)			
Bogemans (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Schneeberger (CAQ)			
Boivin Roy (CAQ)	Fortin (<i>QLP</i>)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Setlakwe (QLP)			
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Fréchette (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Simard (CAQ)			
Boulet (CAQ)	Gagnon (CAQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Skeete (CAQ)			
Bourassa (CAQ)	Garceau (QLP)	Lemay (CAQ)	St-Louis (CAQ)			
Boutin (CAQ)	Gendron (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	St-Pierre Plamondon			
			(PQ)			
Bussière (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Tanguay (QLP)			
Cadet (QLP)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	(Chapleau)	Tardif (CAQ)			
Caire (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Maccarone (QLP)	Thouin (CAQ)			
Carmant (CAQ)	(Groulx)	Mallette (CAQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)			
Caron (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	(Dubuc)			
(Portneuf)	Guilbault (CAQ)	McGraw (QLP)	Tremblay (CAQ)			
Caron (<i>QLP</i>)	Guillemette (CAQ)	Montigny (CAQ)	(Hull)			
(La Pinière)	Haytayan (CAQ)	Morin (QLP)				
Champagne Jourdain	Hébert (CAQ)	Nichols (IND)				
(CAQ)						
ABSTENTIONS - 11						
Bouazzi (QS)	Labrie (QS)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)				
Fontecilla (QS)	Leduc (QS)	Zaga Mendez (QS)				
Ghazal (QS)	Marissal (QS)	Zanetti (QS)				
Grandmont (QS)	Massé (QS)					