



---

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF QUÉBEC

---

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-THIRD LEGISLATURE

## **Votes and Proceedings**

**of the Assembly**

**Wednesday, 8 February 2023 — No. 13**

**President of the National Assembly:  
Madam Nathalie Roy**

---



The Assembly was called to order at 9:40 a.m.

---

## **ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

### **Statements by Members**

Ms. Boivin Roy (Anjou–Louis-Riel) made a statement to underline the 45th anniversary of Meals on Wheels Anjou.

---

Ms. Hébert (Saint-François) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Lawrence Desbiens, the busiest man in Dixville.

---

Mr. Nadeau-Dubois (Gouin) made a statement to underline the 50th anniversary of Centre N A Rive in Montréal.

---

Ms. Bourassa (Charlevoix–Côte-de-Beaupré) made a statement to underline the work of “Les sentinelles”, guardian angels of the Centre de prévention du suicide de Charlevoix.

---

Ms. Prass (D’Arcy-McGee) made a statement to underline Suicide Prevention Week.

---

**8 February 2023**

---

Ms. Dionne (Rivière-du-Loup–Témiscouata) made a statement to pay tribute to Ms. Gilberte Côté for her political and social involvement.

---

Ms. Duranceau (Bertrand) made a statement to applaud the work of the snow clearers of the Bertrand riding.

---

Mr. Fitzgibbon (Terrebonne) made a statement to underline the widespread support of the citizens of Terrebonne for Mr. Alexis Carboni in his fight against cancer.

---

Mr. Drainville (Lévis) made a statement to underline Mr. Michel Gagné's contribution to the success of the Tournoi international Atome M11 Desjardins de Lévis.

---

Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys) made a statement to underline World Cancer Day.

---

Mr. Lemieux (Saint-Jean) made a statement to underline the establishment of the organization Passe-moi la puck.

---

Mr. Carmant (Taillon) made a statement to underline National Suicide Prevention Week.

---

**8 February 2023**

---

At 9:55 a.m., Mr. Lévesque, Second Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

---

The proceedings resumed at 10:04 a.m.

---

Moment of reflection

### **Presenting Papers**

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Minister of Justice, tabled the following:

The response of the 2019–2023 Committee on the remuneration of judges to the request for clarification made by the government on the recommendation regarding compensation for municipal judges paid on a per-sitting basis due to the COVID-19 pandemic, dated 30 August 2022;

(Sessional Paper No. 345-20230208)

The response of the 2019–2023 Committee on the remuneration of judges to the request for clarification made by the Conférence des juges municipaux du Québec on the interpretation of the scope of the indemnity for the absence of pension and group insurance plans in respect of work done at an hourly rate (\$300/hr) and at the Conseil de la magistrature, dated 27 January 2023.

(Sessional Paper No. 346-20230208)

---

Ms. Déry, Minister of Higher Education, tabled the 2021–2022 financial statements, salary statements and reports on the performance and development prospects of the following institutions:

Royal Military College Saint-Jean	(Sessional Paper No. 347-20230208)
École de technologie supérieure	(Sessional Paper No. 348-20230208)
École nationale d'administration publique	(Sessional Paper No. 349-20230208)
HEC Montréal	(Sessional Paper No. 350-20230208)
Institut national de la recherche scientifique	(Sessional Paper No. 351-20230208)
Polytechnique Montréal	(Sessional Paper No. 352-20230208)
Bishop's University	(Sessional Paper No. 353-20230208)
Concordia University	(Sessional Paper No. 354-20230208)
Université de Montréal	(Sessional Paper No. 355-20230208)
Université de Sherbrooke	(Sessional Paper No. 356-20230208)
Université du Québec (head office)	(Sessional Paper No. 357-20230208)
Université du Québec à Chicoutimi	(Sessional Paper No. 358-20230208)
Université du Québec à Montréal	(Sessional Paper No. 359-20230208)
Université du Québec à Rimouski	(Sessional Paper No. 360-20230208)
Université du Québec à Trois-Rivières	(Sessional Paper No. 361-20230208)
Université du Québec en Abitibi-Témiscamingue	(Sessional Paper No. 362-20230208)
Université du Québec en Outaouais	(Sessional Paper No. 363-20230208)
Université Laval	(Sessional Paper No. 364-20230208)

**8 February 2023**

---

McGill University

(Sessional Paper No. 365-20230208)

Université TÉLUQ.

(Sessional Paper No. 366-20230208)

---

Ms. Rouleau, Minister Responsible for Social Solidarity and Community Action, tabled the following:

The 2021–2022 activity report of the Comité consultatif de lutte contre la pauvreté et l'exclusion sociale.

(Sessional Paper No. 367-20230208)

### **Presenting Reports from Committees**

Mr. Simard (Montmorency), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Public Finance, which held public hearings on 31 January and on 1, 2 and 7 February 2023 within the framework of special consultations on Bill 3, An Act respecting health and social services information and amending various legislative provisions.

(Sessional Paper No. 368-20230208)

### **Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

8 February 2023

---

### Motions Without Notice

After consultation with the opposition parties and the independent Member, Mr. Legault, Premier, moved the following:

THAT, in accordance with sections 185 and 187 of the *Charter of the French Language* (chapter C-11), Mr. Benoît Dubreuil, Acting Director General of Regional Operations for Eastern Canada at the Impact Assessment Agency of Canada, be appointed French Language Commissioner for a seven-year term effective 1 March 2023 and that his remuneration and other conditions of employment be those contained in the document tabled herewith.

He then tabled the following:

The remuneration and other conditions of employment of Mr. Benoît Dubreuil as French Language Commissioner.

(Sessional Paper No. 369-20230208)

The question was put on this motion, and for the purposes of section 185 of the *Charter of the French language*, a recorded division requiring the approval of two thirds of the Members of the National Assembly was held thereupon.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 27 in Appendix)

Yeas: **95**   Nays: **17**   Abstentions: **0**

---

Mr. Roberge, Minister of the French Language, together with Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia), moved a motion on the debate concerning the *Act respecting French, the official and common language of Québec*; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

---



**8 February 2023**

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Ms. Lakhoyan Olivier (Chomedey), together with Ms. Setlakwe (Mont-Royal-Outremont), Ms. Haytayan (Laval-des-Rapides), Mr. Bouazzi (Maurice-Richard), Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine) and Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil), moved:

THAT the National Assembly bring attention to the fact that Azerbaijan has been blocking the road connecting Nagorno-Karabakh with Armenia since 12 December 2022, thereby disrupting access to multiple goods and services for Armenians living in this area and hindering citizens' freedom of movement;

THAT it take note that by cutting off the natural gas supply to Nagorno-Karabakh, Azerbaijan is depriving homes, hospitals and schools in the region of essential heating;

THAT it take note that this closure is plunging the region into a humanitarian crisis affecting the entire population, which is particularly at risk of famine and whose access to basic health care has been compromised;

THAT it encourage Azerbaijan to respect the ceasefire statement of 9 November 2020, under which Azerbaijan must guarantee the security of persons, vehicles and cargo moving along the Lachin corridor;

THAT it condemn the aggressive actions taken by the Azerbaijan government against the Armenian people and express the wish that the Canadian government would do likewise;

THAT it encourage the parties to negotiate a peaceful resolution to this conflict, in accordance with the trilateral agreement of 9 November 2020, thereby allowing freedom of movement to be restored to the region;

THAT, lastly, the National Assembly endorse the concerns of Quebecers of Armenian descent for their loved ones and compatriots and offer them its full support.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

**8 February 2023**

---

The debate being concluded, the question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **28** in Appendix)

Yeas: **110**   Nays: **0**   Abstentions: **0**

---

Mr. Bouazzi (Maurice-Richard), together with Ms. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent), Mr. St-Pierre Plamondon, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, and Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil), moved a motion on increasing the minimum age of eligibility for the Québec Pension Plan; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

---

Mr. St-Pierre Plamondon, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, together with Ms. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent), Mr. Bouazzi (Maurice-Richard) and Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil), moved a motion on increasing the minimum age of eligibility for the Québec Pension Plan; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

### **Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

Mr. Lévesque, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committee:

- the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries, Energy and Natural Resources, to undertake clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 2, An Act mainly to cap the indexation rate for Hydro-Québec domestic distribution rate prices and to further regulate the obligation to distribute electricity.

**8 February 2023**

---

And, by leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 143, he convened the following committee:

- the Committee on Public Finance, to undertake public hearings within the framework of special consultations on the Québec Pension Plan consultation document on a plan adapted to 21st century challenges entitled “Un régime adapté aux défis du 21<sup>e</sup> siècle”.

---

**ORDERS OF THE DAY**

At 11:21 a.m., at the request of Mr. Lévesque, Deputy Government House Leader, Mr. Lévesque, Second Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 3:00 p.m.

---

The proceedings resumed at 3:00 p.m.

**Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition**

Ms. Dufour (Mille-Îles) moved:

THAT the National Assembly note that the housing situation and access to property have deteriorated over the past five years;

**8 February 2023**

---

THAT it acknowledge that Quebecers who are lessees face multiple factors that apply significant pressure on rent costs, including:

- the housing shortage, as demonstrated by the general decline in the rental property vacancy rate in Québec in 2022;
- the rising cost of living;
- the decreasing affordability of housing throughout Québec;
- the shortage of housing adapted to the needs of families;

THAT it also note the shortage of social housing throughout Québec intended for lower-income earners as well as the increasing obsolescence of a number of these buildings;

THAT it acknowledge that a generation of Quebecers' access to property is currently compromised by the rising cost of property, the reduction in the number of housing starts, the increase in construction costs, the labour shortage in the construction sector and the increase in interest rates;

THAT it note that the measures implemented by the CAQ government to curb the housing crisis in Québec have so far been insufficient;

THAT it recognize that the many processes of the different government levels, including housing organizations, are too lengthy and complex, and that streamlining programs is necessary;

**8 February 2023**

---

THAT, lastly, it demand that the Québec government take on this mission of the State by establishing a true national housing strategy to simultaneously address the availability of social housing, the affordability of rental housing and access to property.

Mr. Benjamin, Third Vice-President, informed the Assembly of the allocation of speaking time for the proceedings with respect to this limited debate: 10 minutes to the mover of the motion for her reply; 54 minutes 15 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Government; 30 minutes 34 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition; 17 minutes 42 seconds to the Second Opposition Group; 6 minutes to the Third Opposition Group; and 1 minute 30 seconds to the independent Member. Within this framework, any time not used by the independent Member or by a parliamentary group shall be redistributed among the parliamentary groups in the proportions established above. Lastly, individual addresses shall not be limited.

A debate arose thereon.

At the end of her address, Ms. Duranceau, Minister Responsible for Housing, moved:

THAT the motion moved by the Member for Mille-Îles be amended as follows:

1. By striking out the fifth paragraph;
2. By replacing the words “a true national housing strategy” in the seventh paragraph by the words “a housing action plan”.

The motion, as amended, would read as follows:

THAT the National Assembly note that the housing situation and access to property have deteriorated over the past five years;

THAT it acknowledge that Quebecers who are lessees face multiple factors that apply significant pressure on rent costs, including:

**8 February 2023**

---

- the housing shortage, as demonstrated by the general decline in the rental property vacancy rate in Québec in 2022;
- the rising cost of living;
- the decreasing affordability of housing throughout Québec;
- the shortage of housing adapted to the needs of families;

THAT it also note the shortage of social housing throughout Québec intended for lower-income earners as well as the increasing obsolescence of a number of these buildings;

THAT it acknowledge that a generation of Quebecers' access to property is currently compromised by the rising cost of property, the reduction in the number of housing starts, the increase in construction costs, the labour shortage in the construction sector and the increase in interest rates;

THAT it recognize that the many processes of the different government levels, including housing organizations, are too lengthy and complex, and that streamlining programs is necessary;

THAT, lastly, it demand that the Québec government take on this mission of the State by establishing a housing action plan to simultaneously address the availability of social housing, the affordability of rental housing and access to property.

The debate continued on the main motion moved by Ms. Dufour (Mille-Îles) and on the amendment motion moved by Ms. Duranceau, Minister Responsible for Housing, subject to the permission of its author.

**8 February 2023**

---

At the end of his address, Mr. Fontecilla (Laurier-Dorion) moved:

THAT the motion moved by the Member for Mille-Îles be amended as follows:

By adding the following paragraph after the sixth paragraph:

“THAT it ask the Québec government to tackle the housing crisis, in particular by abolishing Section F of the lease to allow the Tribunal administratif du logement to fix the amount of rent for dwellings built or converted for rental purposes less than five years ago;”.

The motion, as amended, would read as follows:

THAT the National Assembly note that the housing situation and access to property have deteriorated over the past five years;

THAT it acknowledge that Quebecers who are lessees face multiple factors that apply significant pressure on rent costs, including:

- the housing shortage, as demonstrated by the general decline in the rental property vacancy rate in Québec in 2022;
- the rising cost of living;
- the decreasing affordability of housing throughout Québec;
- the shortage of housing adapted to the needs of families;

THAT it also note the shortage of social housing throughout Québec intended for lower-income earners as well as the increasing obsolescence of a number of these buildings;

**8 February 2023**

---

THAT it acknowledge that a generation of Quebecers' access to property is currently compromised by the rising cost of property, the reduction in the number of housing starts, the increase in construction costs, the labour shortage in the construction sector and the increase in interest rates;

THAT it note that the measures implemented by the CAQ government to curb the housing crisis in Québec have so far been insufficient;

THAT it recognize that the many processes of the different government levels, including housing organizations, are too lengthy and complex, and that streamlining programs is necessary;

THAT it ask the Québec government to tackle the housing crisis, in particular by abolishing Section F of the lease to allow the Tribunal administratif du logement to fix the amount of rent for dwellings built or converted for rental purposes less than five years ago;

THAT, lastly, it demand that the Québec government take on this mission of the State by establishing a true national housing strategy to simultaneously address the availability of social housing, the affordability of rental housing and access to property.

The debate continued on the main motion moved by Ms. Dufour (Mille-Îles) and on the amendment motions moved by Ms. Duranceau, Minister Responsible for Housing, and Mr. Fontecilla (Laurier-Dorion), subject to the permission of its author.

Pursuant to Standing Order 98.1, Ms. Dufour (Mille-Îles) accepted the amendment proposed by Ms. Duranceau, Minister Responsible for Housing, and refused the amendment proposed by Mr. Fontecilla (Laurier-Dorion).

The debate being concluded, the question was put on this amendment motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.



**8 February 2023**

---

At the request of Mr. Lévesque, Deputy Government House Leader, the divisions on the amendment motion moved by Ms. Duranceau, Minister Responsible for Housing, and on the main motion moved by Ms. Charbonneau (Mille-Îles) were deferred until Routine Proceedings on the next sitting day.

Mr. Benjamin, Third Vice-President, informed the Assembly that he had received a request for a debate upon adjournment to be held on Thursday, 9 February 2023 on a question from Ms. Labrie (Sherbrooke) to Ms. Bélanger, Minister for Health and for Seniors, about the ratio of orderlies in CHSLDs and seniors' homes, in particular in Sherbrooke.

Mr. Lévesque, Deputy Government House Leader, moved the adjournment of the Assembly until Thursday, 9 February 2023 at 9:40 a.m.

The motion was carried.

---

Accordingly, at 5:03 p.m., Mr. Benjamin, Third Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Thursday, 9 February 2023 at 9:40 a.m.

**NATHALIE ROY**

*President*

8 February 2023

---

## APPENDIX

### Recorded Divisions

On the motion moved by Mr. Legault, Premier:

(Division No. 27)

#### YEAS - 95

Abou-Khalil (CAQ)	Charette (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Montigny (CAQ)
Allaire (CAQ)	Chassin (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)
Arseneau (PQ)	D'Amours (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Nichols (IND)
Asselin (CAQ)	Déry (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)
Bachand (CAQ)	Dionne (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Poulet (CAQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Dorismond (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)
(Prévost)	Drainville (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Dubé (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
(Orford)	Dufour (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Reid (CAQ)
Bernard (CAQ)	(Abitibi-Est)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Rivest (CAQ)
Bérubé (PQ)	Duranceau (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Roberge (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	Émond (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)
Blanchette Vézina (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Sainte-Croix (CAQ)
Blouin (CAQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	(Les Plaines)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Bogemans (CAQ)	Fréchette (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Simard (CAQ)
Boivin Roy (CAQ)	Gagnon (CAQ)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	St-Louis (CAQ)
Bouazzi (QS)	Gendron (CAQ)	Leduc (QS)	St-Pierre Plamondon (PQ)
Boulet (CAQ)	Ghazal (QS)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)
Bourassa (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Legault (CAQ)	Thouin (CAQ)
Boutin (CAQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Lemay (CAQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Bussière (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	(Dubuc)
Caire (CAQ)	(Groulx)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Carmant (CAQ)	Grandmont (QS)	(Chapleau)	(Hull)
Caron (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	Mallette (CAQ)	Zaga Mendez (QS)
(Portneuf)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Marissal (QS)	Zanetti (QS)
Champagne Jourdain	Guillemette (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	
(CAQ)			
Charest (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Massé (QS)	

#### NAYS - 17

Beauchemin (QLP)	Dufour (QLP)	McGraw (QLP)	Tanguay (QLP)
Cadet (QLP)	(Mille-Îles)	Morin (QLP)	
Caron (QLP)	Fortin (QLP)	Prass (QLP)	
(La Pinière)	Garceau (QLP)	Rizqy (QLP)	
Ciccione (QLP)	Kelley (QLP)	Rotiroti (QLP)	
Derriaji (QLP)	Lakhoyan Olivier (QLP)	Setlakwe (QLP)	

8 February 2023

---

On the motion moved by Ms. Lakhoyan Olivier (Chomedey), together with Ms. Setlakwe (Mont-Royal–Outremont), Ms. Haytayan (Laval-des-Rapides), Mr. Bouazzi (Maurice-Richard), Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine) and Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil):

**(Division No. 28)**

**YEAS – 110**

Abou-Khalil (CAQ)	Charette (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)
Allaire (CAQ)	Chassin (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Poulet (CAQ)
Arseneau (PQ)	Ciccone (QLP)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)
Asselin (CAQ)	D'Amours (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Prass (QLP)
Bachand (CAQ)	Derraji (QLP)	Kelley (QLP)	Proulx (CAQ)
Beauchemin (QLP)	Déry (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Provençal (CAQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Dionne (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Reid (CAQ)
(Orford)	Dorismond (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Rivest (CAQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Drainville (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Rizqy (QLP)
(Prévost)	Dubé (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Roberge (CAQ)
Benjamin (QLP)	Dufour (QLP)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Bernard (CAQ)	(Mille-Îles)	Lakhoyan Olivier (QLP)	Rouleau (CAQ)
Bérubé (PQ)	Dufour (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Sainte-Croix (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	(Abitibi-Est)	LeBel (CAQ)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Blanchette Vézina (CAQ)	Duranceau (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Setlakwe (QLP)
Blouin (CAQ)	Émond (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	Simard (CAQ)
Bogemans (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	St-Louis (CAQ)
Boivin Roy (CAQ)	Fortin (QLP)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	St-Pierre Plamondon (PQ)
Bouazzi (QS)	Fréchette (CAQ)	Leduc (QS)	Tanguay (QLP)
Boulet (CAQ)	Gagnon (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)
Bourassa (CAQ)	Garceau (QLP)	Lemay (CAQ)	Thouin (CAQ)
Boutin (CAQ)	Gendron (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Bussière (CAQ)	Ghazal (QS)	Lévesque (CAQ)	(Dubuc)
Cadet (QLP)	Girard (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Caire (CAQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Mallette (CAQ)	(Hull)
Carmant (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Marissal (QS)	Zaga Mendez (QS)
Caron (CAQ)	(Groulx)	Martel (CAQ)	Zanetti (QS)
(Portneuf)	Grandmont (QS)	Massé (QS)	
Caron (QLP)	Grondin (CAQ)	McGraw (QLP)	
(La Pinière)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Montigny (CAQ)	
Champagne Jourdain	Guillemette (CAQ)	Morin (QLP)	
(CAQ)			
Charest (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Nichols (IND)	