



---

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF QUÉBEC

---

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-THIRD LEGISLATURE

## **Votes and Proceedings**

**of the Assembly**

**Wednesday, 29 March 2023 — No. 28**

**President of the National Assembly:  
Madam Nathalie Roy**

---



The Assembly was called to order at 9:40 a.m.

---

## **ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

### **Statements by Members**

Ms. Mallette (Huntingdon) made a statement to congratulate young Zackary Nadeau, winner of three gold medals at the World Karate Championships.

---

Ms. Maccarone (Westmount–Saint-Louis) made a statement to underline World Autism Month.

---

Ms. Bourassa (Charlevoix–Côte-de-Beaupré) made a statement to congratulate Mr. Mathieu Gélinas for completing the Crinqué contre la SP challenge.

---

Mr. Leduc (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve) made a statement to underline the 40th anniversary of the organization L'Avenue hébergement communautaire.

---

Ms. Hébert (Saint-François) made a statement to pay tribute to Ms. Rita Morin and Mr. Roger Hébert on their 60th wedding anniversary.

---

**29 March 2023**

---

Ms. Dufour (Mille-Îles) made a statement to congratulate the athletes of the Laval delegation who participated in the Québec Games.

---

Mr. Lemieux (Saint-Jean) made a statement to underline the importance of Canadian francophone forces coming together to reverse the decline of the French language in the country.

---

Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine) made a statement to commemorate the 15th anniversary of the sinking of *L'Acadien II*.

---

Ms. Charest (Brome-Missisquoi) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Mario Demers, inventor of kinball.

---

Ms. Jeannotte (Labelle) made a statement to underline the athletic performance of swimmer Madeleine Sévigny Lanthier.

---

Ms. Dionne (Rivière-du-Loup-Témiscouata) made a statement to underline the awareness days held by the Association Hôtellerie Québec and the Association québécoise des spas.

---

**29 March 2023**

---

Mr. Drainville (Lévis) made a statement to congratulate Ms. Doriana Tesa Basilua Londa, recipient of the Council of the Federation Literacy Award.

---

At 9:55 a.m., Ms. Soucy, First Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

---

The proceedings resumed at 10:02 a.m.

---

Moment of reflection

The President tabled the following:

A letter, dated 28 March 2023, she had received from Mr. Lefebvre, Chief Government Whip, informing her that Ms. Marie-Louise Tardif, Member for Laviolette–Saint-Maurice, had rejoined the caucus of the parliamentary group forming the Government.

(Sessional Paper No. 474-20230329)

### **Introduction of Bills**

Mr. Dubé, Minister of Health, moved that leave be granted to introduce the following bill:

15      An Act to make the health and social services system more effective

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, Bill 15 was introduced in the Assembly.

29 March 2023

---

### Presenting Papers

Ms. Déry, Minister of Higher Education, tabled the following:

The financial statements of the Fondation universitaire de l'Université de Montréal, dated 11 May 2022.

(Sessional Paper No. 475-20230329)

---

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, tabled the following:

The reply to a written question from Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia) on the timeline for replacing the Olympic Stadium roof – Question No. 10, *Order Paper and Notices* of 22 February 2023.

(Sessional Paper No. 476-20230329)

---

The President tabled the following:

Tables indicating the distribution of measures and the allocation of speaking times for Question Period, Statements by Members, limited debates and Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition;

(Sessional Paper No. 477-20230329)

The new seating plan of the National Assembly, dated 29 March 2023.

(Sessional Paper No. 478-20230329)

**29 March 2023**

---

### **Reports from Committees**

Mr. Simard (Montmorency), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Public Finance, which met on 28 March 2023 for clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 9, An Act amending mainly certain Acts establishing public sector pension plans. The report does not contain amendments to the bill.

(Sessional Paper No. 479-20230329)

### **Presenting Petitions**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Ms. Labrie (Sherbrooke) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on increasing financial compensation for family-type resources for adults to counter inflation, signed by 819 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 480-20230329)

### **Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

29 March 2023

---

### Motions Without Notice

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia), together with Ms. Setlakwe (Mont-Royal–Outremont), Ms. Ghazal (Mercier) and Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil), moved:

THAT the National Assembly affirm that built heritage is an important witness of our national history;

THAT it underline the significant difficulties encountered by heritage building owners to insure their properties;

THAT it underline that the preservation and protection of our heritage is in the collective interest of Quebecers;

THAT the National Assembly ask the Government to undertake actions to promote the insurability of Québec's heritage buildings in order to protect and preserve our built heritage for future generations.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Bonnardel, Minister of Public Security, together with Ms. Maccarone (Westmount–Saint-Louis), Mr. Fontecilla (Laurier-Dorion), Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine) and Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil), moved:

THAT the National Assembly pay tribute to Sergeant Maureen Breau of the Sûreté du Québec, who died in the line of duty;

THAT it underline the essential work done by the thousands of men and women within our police forces, and that it reiterate its unwavering support for them;



**29 March 2023**

---

THAT, lastly, it observe a minute of silence in her memory.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

At the invitation of Ms. Soucy, First Vice-President, the Assembly observed a minute of silence.

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Ms. Setlakwe (Mont-Royal–Outremont), together with Mr. Bouazzi (Maurice-Richard), Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine) and Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil), moved:

THAT the National Assembly take note of the computer issues affecting the remuneration of Québec public servants, such as unpaid hours, unpaid salary increases or overpayments;

THAT it recognize that these computer problems have a significant impact on the employees affected;

THAT it take note that the SAGIR system is under the direct responsibility of the Minister of Cybersecurity and Digital Technology;

THAT, lastly, it demand that the Government commit to taking the actions necessary to correct the remuneration problems some employees are currently experiencing as soon as possible, and to continue the work required to modernize the governmental payroll system.

**29 March 2023**

---

The question was put on this motion; a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **43** in Appendix)

Yeas: **103**   Nays: **0**   Abstentions: **0**

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Ms. Zaga Mendez (Verdun), together with Mr. Charette, Minister of the Environment, the Fight Against Climate Change, Wildlife and Parks, Ms. McGraw (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce), Mr. St-Pierre Plamondon, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, and Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil), moved:

THAT the National Assembly express its concern that the increase in Canadian oil and gas production will interfere with global efforts to fight climate change;

THAT it reiterate its request to the Canadian government, as unanimously carried by motion on 22 September 2021, to stop subsidizing, directly or indirectly, oil and gas companies with Quebecers' money.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

---

Pursuant to Standing Order 129, Mr. Lefebvre, Chief Government Whip, moved:

THAT the Member for Laviolette–Saint-Maurice be named a permanent member of the Committee on Citizen Relations in substitution for the Member for Laporte.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

**29 March 2023**

---

### **Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

Mr. Lévesque, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

- the Committee on Citizen Relations, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 11, An Act to amend the Act respecting end-of-life care and other legislative provisions;
- the Committee on Institutions, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 12, An Act to reform family law with regard to filiation and to protect children born as a result of sexual assault and the victims of that assault as well as the rights of surrogates and of children born of a surrogacy project.

---

### **ORDERS OF THE DAY**

#### **Business Having Precedence**

##### *Debate on the Budget Speech*

The Assembly resumed the debate, which had been adjourned on 28 March 2023, on the motion moved by Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), Mr. Bouazzi (Maurice-Richard), Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), Ms. Dufour (Mille-Îles), Ms. Caron (La Pinière), Ms. Massé (Sainte-Marie-Saint-Jacques), Ms. Zaga Mendez (Verdun) and Mr. Leduc, House Leader of the Second Opposition Group, subject to the receivability of these motions.

**29 March 2023**

---

At the end of her address, Ms. Garceau (Robert-Baldwin) moved the following motion stating a grievance:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ government for planning to convert only 8% of all non-subsidized spaces in Québec into subsidized spaces.

The debate continued on the motion moved by Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), Mr. Bouazzi (Maurice-Richard), Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), Ms. Dufour (Mille-Îles), Ms. Caron (La Pinière), Ms. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques), Ms. Zaga Mendez (Verdun), Mr. Leduc, House Leader of the Second Opposition Group, and Ms. Garceau (Robert-Baldwin), subject to the receivability of these motions.

At the end of her address, Ms. McGraw (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce) moved the following motion stating a grievance:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ government for its lack of ambition in its 2023–2024 budget, which does not contain sufficient investments to fully deal with the climate crisis and provide real and adequate protection for biodiversity and water in Québec.

The debate continued on the motion moved by Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), Mr. Bouazzi (Maurice-Richard), Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), Ms. Dufour (Mille-Îles), Ms. Caron (La Pinière), Ms. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques), Ms. Zaga Mendez (Verdun), Mr. Leduc, House Leader of the Second Opposition Group, Ms. Garceau (Robert-Baldwin) and Ms. McGraw (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce), subject to the receivability of these motions.

At the beginning of his address, Mr. Grandmont (Taschereau) moved the following motion stating a grievance:

THAT the National Assembly censure the CAQ government for the unacceptable imbalance between investments in public transit and those in the road network in the 2023–2024 budget.

**29 March 2023**

---

The debate continued on the motion moved by Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), Mr. Bouazzi (Maurice-Richard), Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), Ms. Dufour (Mille-Îles), Ms. Caron (La Pinière), Ms. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques), Ms. Zaga Mendez (Verdun), Mr. Leduc, House Leader of the Second Opposition Group, Ms. Garceau (Robert-Baldwin), Ms. McGraw (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce) and Mr. Grandmont (Taschereau), subject to the receivability of these motions.

At the end of her address, Ms. Prass (D’Arcy-McGee) moved the following motion stating a grievance:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ government for its 2023–2024 budget, which does not address the current social crises, particularly mental health and homelessness, and which does not sufficiently take into account the needs of persons with disabilities or autism spectrum disorder.

The debate continued on the motion moved by Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), Mr. Bouazzi (Maurice-Richard), Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), Ms. Dufour (Mille-Îles), Ms. Caron (La Pinière), Ms. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques), Ms. Zaga Mendez (Verdun), Mr. Leduc, House Leader of the Second Opposition Group, Ms. Garceau (Robert-Baldwin), Ms. McGraw (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce), Mr. Grandmont (Taschereau) and Ms. Prass (D’Arcy-McGee), subject to the receivability of these motions.

At the beginning of her address, Ms. Ghazal (Mercier) moved the following motion stating a grievance:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Coalition avenir Québec government for its 2023–2024 budget, which does not meet the huge challenges in the education system that are undermining student success, such as the labour shortage, the dilapidated schools and the three-tiered system causing school segregation.

**29 March 2023**

---

The debate continued on the motion moved by Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), Mr. Bouazzi (Maurice-Richard), Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), Ms. Dufour (Mille-Îles), Ms. Caron (La Pinière), Ms. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques), Ms. Zaga Mendez (Verdun), Mr. Leduc, House Leader of the Second Opposition Group, Ms. Garceau (Robert-Baldwin), Ms. McGraw (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce), Mr. Grandmont (Taschereau), Ms. Prass (D’Arcy-McGee) and Ms. Ghazal (Mercier), subject to the receivability of these motions.

At the end of his address, Mr. Fortin (Pontiac) moved the following motion stating a grievance:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ government for its fifth consecutive budget, which does not include any funding to implement a safe nurse-to-patient ratio in the health and social services network.

The debate continued on the motion moved by Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), Mr. Bouazzi (Maurice-Richard), Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), Ms. Dufour (Mille-Îles), Ms. Caron (La Pinière), Ms. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques), Ms. Zaga Mendez (Verdun), Mr. Leduc, House Leader of the Second Opposition Group, Ms. Garceau (Robert-Baldwin), Ms. McGraw (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce), Mr. Grandmont (Taschereau), Ms. Prass (D’Arcy-McGee), Ms. Ghazal (Mercier) and Mr. Fortin (Pontiac), subject to the receivability of these motions.

At 1:00 p.m., Ms. Soucy, First Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 3:00 p.m.

\_\_\_\_\_

The proceedings resumed at 3:00 p.m.

\_\_\_\_\_

**29 March 2023**

---

The debate continued on the motion moved by Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), Mr. Bouazzi (Maurice-Richard), Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), Ms. Dufour (Mille-Îles), Ms. Caron (La Pinière), Ms. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques), Ms. Zaga Mendez (Verdun), Mr. Leduc, House Leader of the Second Opposition Group, Ms. Garceau (Robert-Baldwin), Ms. McGraw (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce), Mr. Grandmont (Taschereau), Ms. Prass (D’Arcy-McGee), Ms. Ghazal (Mercier) and Mr. Fortin (Pontiac), subject to the receivability of these motions.

At the end of her address, Ms. Labrie (Sherbrooke) moved the following motion stating a grievance:

THAT the National Assembly censure the Coalition  
avenir Québec government for its budget, which does not provide  
the sums necessary to address the mental health crisis.

The debate continued on the motion moved by Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), Mr. Bouazzi (Maurice-Richard), Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), Ms. Dufour (Mille-Îles), Ms. Caron (La Pinière), Ms. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques), Ms. Zaga Mendez (Verdun), Mr. Leduc, House Leader of the Second Opposition Group, Ms. Garceau (Robert-Baldwin), Ms. McGraw (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce), Mr. Grandmont (Taschereau), Ms. Prass (D’Arcy-McGee), Ms. Ghazal (Mercier), Mr. Fortin (Pontiac) and Ms. Labrie (Sherbrooke), subject to the receivability of these motions.

At the beginning of his address, Mr. Fontecilla (Laurier-Dorion) moved the following motion stating a grievance:

THAT the National Assembly censure the CAQ  
government for its 2023–2024 budget, which heralds the end of  
social housing development in Québec and the privatization of  
public investments in housing.

**29 March 2023**

---

The debate continued on the motion moved by Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), Mr. Bouazzi (Maurice-Richard), Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), Ms. Dufour (Mille-Îles), Ms. Caron (La Pinière), Ms. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques), Ms. Zaga Mendez (Verdun), Mr. Leduc, House Leader of the Second Opposition Group, Ms. Garceau (Robert-Baldwin), Ms. McGraw (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce), Mr. Grandmont (Taschereau), Ms. Prass (D’Arcy-McGee), Ms. Ghazal (Mercier), Mr. Fortin (Pontiac), Ms. Labrie (Sherbrooke) and Mr. Fontecilla (Laurier-Dorion), subject to the receivability of these motions.

Given that 13 hours and 30 minutes had elapsed since Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, had begun the budget speech, the debate thereon was suspended in the Assembly to be resumed by the Committee on Public Finance, in accordance with the provisions of Standing Order 275.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 97, the debate on the motion moved by the Second Opposition Group under Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition was deferred to Wednesday, 5 April 2023.

## **Government Bills**

### *Passage*

Mr. Caire, Minister of Cybersecurity and Digital Technology, moved the passage of Bill 3, An Act respecting health and social services information and amending various legislative provisions.

After debate thereon, the motion was carried and, accordingly, Bill 3 was passed.



**29 March 2023**

---

*Report Stage*

The Assembly took into consideration the report from the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries, Energy and Natural Resources on its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 13, An Act respecting the Hertel-New York interconnection line.

The debate was adjourned in the name of Ms. McGraw (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce).

---

At 6:30 p.m., Mr. Lévesque, Second Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Thursday, 30 March 2023 at 9:40 a.m.

**NATHALIE ROY**

*President*

29 March 2023

## APPENDIX

### Recorded Divisions

On the motion moved by Ms. Setlakwe (Mont-Royal–Outremont), together with Mr. Bouazzi (Maurice-Richard), Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine) and Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil):

#### (Division No. 43)

#### YEAS - 103

Allaire (CAQ)	Cliche-Rivard (QS)	Jacques (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)
Arseneau (PQ)	D'Amours (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Nichols (IND)
Asselin (CAQ)	Derraji (QLP)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Poulet (CAQ)
Bachand (CAQ)	Déry (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)
Beauchemin (QLP)	Dionne (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Prass (QLP)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Dorismond (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)
(Orford)	Dufour (QLP)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Bernard (CAQ)	(Mille-Îles)	Laforest (CAQ)	Reid (CAQ)
Biron (CAQ)	Dufour (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Rivest (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	(Abitibi-Est)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Roberge (CAQ)
Blouin (CAQ)	Duranceau (CAQ)	Lakhoyan Olivier (QLP)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Bogemans (CAQ)	Émond (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	LeBel (CAQ)	Roy (CAQ)
Bouazzi (QS)	Fortin (QLP)	Lecours (CAQ)	(Verchères)
Boulet (CAQ)	Fréchette (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	Sainte-Croix (CAQ)
Bourassa (CAQ)	Gagnon (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Schmaltz (CAQ)
Bussière (CAQ)	Garceau (QLP)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Cadet (QLP)	Gendron (CAQ)	Leduc (QS)	Setlakwe (QLP)
Caire (CAQ)	Ghazal (QS)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Simard (CAQ)
Carmant (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	St-Louis (CAQ)
Caron (CAQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	(Chapleau)	Tanguay (QLP)
(Portneuf)	Girard (CAQ)	Maccarone (QLP)	Tardif (CAQ)
Caron (QLP)	(Groulx)	Mallette (CAQ)	Thouin (CAQ)
(La Pinière)	Grandmont (QS)	Marissal (QS)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Champagne Jourdain (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	(Dubuc)
Charest (CAQ)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Massé (QS)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Charette (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	McGraw (QLP)	(Hull)
Chassin (CAQ)	Haytayan (CAQ)	Montigny (CAQ)	Zaga Mendez (QS)
Ciccone (QLP)	Hébert (CAQ)	Morin (QLP)	Zanetti (QS)