



NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF QUÉBEC

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-THIRD LEGISLATURE

Votes and Proceedings

of the Assembly

Wednesday, 5 April 2023 — No. 31

**President of the National Assembly:
Madam Nathalie Roy**

The Assembly was called to order at 9:40 a.m.

ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS

Statements by Members

Ms. Bourassa (Charlevoix–Côte-de-Beaupré) made a statement to underline the distribution of new defibrillators in the Charlevoix region by the Coopérative des techniciens ambulanciers du Québec.

Ms. Garceau (Robert-Baldwin) made a statement to underline the anniversary of the Valorisons ma Profession movement.

Ms. Hébert (Saint-François) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Serge Audet, former director general of the Fondation pour les élèves du centre de services scolaire de la Région-de-Sherbrooke.

Ms. Labrie (Sherbrooke) made a statement requesting that the Government improve support for caregivers.

5 April 2023

Mr. Montigny (René-Lévesque) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Serge Lepage for his 25 years of volunteer work with Opération Enfant Soleil.

Ms. Caron (La Pinière) made a statement to congratulate the handball players of École internationale Lucille-Teasdale on their performance in the regional championship.

Ms. Dionne (Rivière-du-Loup–Témiscouata) made a statement to pay tribute to hockey player Mario Rouillard.

Mr. St-Pierre Plamondon (Camille-Laurin) made a statement to underline the 25th anniversary of La Maison des familles de Mercier-Est and the 60th anniversary of Service des Loisirs Ste-Claire.

Ms. Soucy (Saint-Hyacinthe) made a statement to pay tribute to Miss Québec finalist Océane Laflamme.

Mr. Bonnardel (Granby) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Robert Desmarais, executive director of the MRC de Brome-Missisquoi.

Ms. Tardif (Laviolette–Saint-Maurice) made a statement to pay tribute to Ms. Marie-Josée Gervais, founder and executive director of the organization Défis du Parc.

5 April 2023

Mr. St-Louis (Joliette) made a statement to underline the work of the Fondation Richelieu de Joliette.

At 9:55 a.m., Mr. Benjamin, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

The proceedings resumed at 10:04 a.m.

Moment of reflection

Presenting Papers

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 143, the President tabled the following:

The calendar for consideration of the 2023–2024 estimates of expenditure.
(Sessional Paper No. 493-20230405)

Presenting Reports from Committees

Mr. Simard (Montmorency), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Public Finance, which met on 30 March and 4 April 2023 to continue the debate on the budget speech in accordance with Standing Order 275.

(Sessional Paper No. 494-20230405)

5 April 2023

Mr. Provençal (Beauce-Nord), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Health and Social Services, which met on 16, 22 and 23 March and on 4 April 2023 for clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 10, An Act limiting the use of personnel placement agencies' services and independent labour in the health and social services sector. The report contains amendments to the bill.

(Sessional Paper No. 495-20230405)

Presenting Petitions

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mr. Bussière (Gatineau) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on building a high school in Val-des-Monts, signed by 2,453 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 496-20230405)

Oral Questions and Answers

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

Motions Without Notice

Mr. Bouazzi (Maurice-Richard), together with Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine) and Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil), moved a motion on the development of artificial intelligence; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

5 April 2023

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia), together with Mr. Drainville, Minister of Education, moved:

THAT the National Assembly reiterate that Québec is a secular State;

THAT it recall that public schools are not places of worship;

THAT it affirm that setting up places to pray, regardless of the religious denomination, on public school premises goes against the principle of secularism.

The question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 48 in Appendix)

Yeas: **104** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Drainville, Minister of Education, together with Ms. Setlakwe (Mont-Royal–Outremont), Ms. Ghazal (Mercier), Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia) and Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil), moved:

THAT the National Assembly denounce all forms of censorship in the field of education;

THAT it affirm that no reason or context justifies the cultural censorship, in whole or in part, of important works by great Québec authors;

THAT it reiterate that acclaimed works, such as “Speak White” by Michèle Lalonde, form part of our history and must continue to be shared;

5 April 2023

THAT, lastly, it affirm that Québec's culture is not to be suppressed by censorship.

The question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **49** in Appendix)

Yeas: **102** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Ms. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent), together with Ms. Cadet (Bourassa-Sauvé), Mr. Drainville, Minister of Education, Ms. Ghazal (Mercier), Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia) and Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil), moved:

THAT the National Assembly be concerned about the sharp drop in the success rate of students taking the written Secondary 5 French examination in 2022, compared to the results for 2019;

THAT it take note that, in 2022, one out of three students in the public system failed this exam and that sadly this proportion rose to 40% among boys;

THAT it declare that proficiency in the French language and literacy skills are essential for academic success;

THAT it declare that French, our common and official language, must be fully mastered by the time students obtain their high-school diplomas;

5 April 2023

THAT it recall that nothing is more beautiful and influential than the power of words and that the French language...

“C’est une langue belle à qui sait la défendre
Elle offre des trésors de richesse infinie
Les mots qui nous manquaient pour pouvoir nous
comprendre
Et la force qu’il faut pour vivre en harmonie”;

THAT, lastly, it ask the CAQ government to implement additional measures aimed at improving and supporting the teaching of French in the school system by drawing inspiration from the best practices developed in the field.

The question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **50** in Appendix)

Yeas: **101** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 84.1 and pursuant to Standing Order 146, Mr. Lévesque, Deputy Government House Leader, moved:

THAT, within the framework of the consideration of Bill 19, An Act respecting the regulation of work by children, the Committee on Labour and the Economy hold special consultations and public hearings on Tuesday, 18 April 2023 from 9:45 a.m. to 12:25 p.m. and after Notices of Proceedings in Committees from approximately 3:15 p.m. to 7:20 p.m., on Wednesday, 19 April 2023 after Notices of Proceedings in Committees from approximately 11:15 a.m. to 12:50 p.m. and from 3:00 p.m. to 6:15 p.m., and on Thursday, 20 April 2023 after Notices of Proceedings in Committees from approximately 11:15 a.m. to 12:50 p.m.;

5 April 2023

THAT, for this purpose, the Committee hear the following individuals and organizations:

Conseil du patronat du Québec
Canadian Federation of Independent Business
Fédération des chambres de commerce du Québec
Manufacturiers et exportateurs du Québec
Confédération des syndicats nationaux
Fédération des travailleurs et travailleuses du Québec
Centrale des syndicats du Québec
Centrale des syndicats démocratiques
Réseau québécois pour la réussite éducative
Ordre des conseillers en ressources humaines agréés
Commission des normes, de l'équité, de la santé et de la sécurité du travail
Association des restaurateurs du Québec
Coalition Interjeunes
Union des producteurs agricoles
Fédération autonome de l'enseignement
Force Jeunesse;

THAT a period of 12 minutes be set aside for opening statements, allocated as follows: 6 minutes to the parliamentary group forming the Government, 4 minutes 30 seconds to the Official Opposition and 1 minute 30 seconds to the Second Opposition Group;

THAT the presentation by each organization last no longer than 10 minutes and the exchange with the Committee members last no longer than 35 minutes, allocated as follows: 17 minutes 30 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Government, 13 minutes 8 seconds to the Official Opposition and 4 minutes 23 seconds to the Second Opposition Group;

THAT a 5-minute interval be scheduled between discussions with each individual or organization;

5 April 2023

THAT the Minister of Labour be a member of the said Committee during its proceedings with respect to this order of reference.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

Notices of Proceedings in Committees

Mr. Lévesque, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committee:

- the Committee on Institutions, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 14, An Act to amend various provisions relating to public security and to enact the Act to assist in locating missing persons.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Business Having Precedence

Debate on the Budget Speech

The Assembly resumed the debate, which had been adjourned on 29 March 2023, on the motion moved by Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), Mr. Bouazzi (Maurice-Richard), Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage), Ms. Dufour (Mille-Îles), Ms. Caron (La Pinière), Ms. Massé (Sainte-Marie–Saint-Jacques), Ms. Zaga Mendez (Verdun), Mr. Leduc, House Leader of the Second Opposition Group, Ms. Garceau (Robert-Baldwin), Ms. McGraw (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce), Mr. Grandmont (Taschereau), Ms. Prass (D’Arcy-McGee), Ms. Ghazal (Mercier), Mr. Fortin (Pontiac), Ms. Labrie (Sherbrooke) and Mr. Fontecilla (Laurier-Dorion), subject to the receivability of these motions.

5 April 2023

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 276, Mr. Bouazzi (Maurice-Richard) commented on behalf of the Second Opposition Group.

The debate being concluded, Mr. Benjamin, Third Vice-President, declared that the motions stating a grievance were receivable.

He then proceeded to put the question on the motions stating a grievance moved during the debate and on the motion moved by Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, that the Assembly approve the budgetary policy of the Government; recorded divisions were thereupon demanded.

At the request of Mr. Lévesque, Deputy Government House Leader, the recorded divisions were deferred until Routine Proceedings on the next sitting day.

Government Bills

Passage

Ms. LeBel, Minister Responsible for Government Administration and Chair of the Conseil du trésor, moved the passage of Bill 9, An Act amending mainly certain Acts establishing public sector pension plans.

After debate thereon, the motion was carried and, accordingly, Bill 9 was passed.

At 12:41 p.m., at the request of Mr. Lévesque, Deputy Government House Leader, Mr. Benjamin, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 3:00 p.m.

The proceedings resumed at 3:00 p.m.

5 April 2023

Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition

Mr. Marissal (Rosemont) moved:

THAT the National Assembly recognize that the fundamental mission of local community service centres (CLSC) includes the provision of services to the local population based on their needs in their living environment, at school, at work or at home;

THAT the National Assembly ask the Government to maintain the entirety of the current mission of CLSCs in Bill 15, in particular the populational responsibility.

Ms. Soucy, First Vice-President, informed the Assembly of the allocation of speaking time for the proceedings with respect to this limited debate: 10 minutes to the mover of the motion for his reply; 49 minutes 15 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Government; 24 minutes 34 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition; 28 minutes 41 seconds to the Second Opposition Group; 6 minutes to the Third Opposition Group; and 1 minute 30 seconds to the independent Member. Within this framework, any time not used by the independent Member or by a parliamentary group shall be redistributed among the parliamentary groups in the proportions established above. Lastly, individual addresses shall not be limited.

A debate arose thereon.

During his address, Mr. Dubé, Minister of Health, moved:

THAT the motion moved by the Member for Rosemont be amended as follows:

1. By adding the following paragraph after the first paragraph:

“THAT the National Assembly recognize that access to primary care services requires the provision of complementary services, in particular home care, CLSCs, specialized nurse practitioner clinics, family medicine groups (FMG) and community organizations;”;

2. By removing the words “the entirety of” in the last paragraph.

The motion, as amended, would read as follows:

THAT the National Assembly recognize that the fundamental mission of local community service centres (CLSC) includes the provision of services to the local population based on their needs in their living environment, at school, at work or at home;

THAT the National Assembly recognize that access to primary care services requires the provision of complementary services, in particular home care, CLSCs, specialized nurse practitioner clinics, family medicine groups (FMG) and community organizations;

THAT the National Assembly ask the Government to maintain the current mission of CLSCs in Bill 15, in particular the populational responsibility.

The debate continued on the main motion moved by Mr. Marissal (Rosemont) and on the amendment motion moved by Mr. Dubé, Minister of Health, subject to the permission of its author.

Pursuant to Standing Order 98.1, Mr. Marissal (Rosemont) refused the amendment proposed by Mr. Dubé, Minister of Health.

The debate being concluded, the question was put on this motion, and a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

At the request of Mr. Lévesque, Deputy Government House Leader, the division on the motion moved by Mr. Marissal (Rosemont) was deferred until Routine Proceedings on the next sitting day.

Mr. Lévesque, Deputy Government House Leader, moved the adjournment of the Assembly until Thursday, 6 April 2023 at 9:40 a.m.

The motion was carried.

5 April 2023

At 4:59 p.m., Ms. Soucy, First Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Thursday, 6 April 2023 at 9:40 a.m.

NATHALIE ROY

President

5 April 2023

APPENDIX

Recorded Divisions

On the motion moved by Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia), together with Mr. Drainville, Minister of Education:

(Division No. 48)

YEAS - 104

Allaire (CAQ)	Chassin (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)
Arseneau (PQ)	Ciccone (QLP)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)
Asselin (CAQ)	Cliche-Rivard (QS)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Bachand (CAQ)	D'Amours (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Reid (CAQ)
Beauchemin (QLP)	Derraji (QLP)	Lachance (CAQ)	Rizqy (QLP)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Dionne (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Roberge (CAQ)
(Orford)	Dorismond (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Drainville (CAQ)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)
(Prévost)	Dufour (CAQ)	Lakhoyan Olivier (QLP)	Roy (CAQ)
Bernard (CAQ)	(Abitibi-Est)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	(Verchères)
Bérubé (PQ)	Dufour (QLP)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Sainte-Croix (CAQ)
Biron (CAQ)	(Mille-Îles)	LeBel (CAQ)	Schmaltz (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	Émond (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Blanchette Vézina (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	Setlakwe (QLP)
Bogemans (CAQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	Lecours (CAQ)	Simard (CAQ)
Boivin Roy (CAQ)	Fortin (QLP)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Skeete (CAQ)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Fréchette (CAQ)	Leduc (QS)	St-Louis (CAQ)
Bouazzi (QS)	Gagnon (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	St-Pierre Plamondon (PQ)
Boulet (CAQ)	Garceau (QLP)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Tanguay (QLP)
Bourassa (CAQ)	Gendron (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Tardif (CAQ)
Boutin (CAQ)	Ghazal (QS)	Maccarone (QLP)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Bussière (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Mallette (CAQ)	(Dubuc)
Cadet (QLP)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Marissal (QS)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Caire (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Massé (QS)	(Hull)
Carmant (CAQ)	(Groulx)	McGraw (QLP)	Zaga Mendez (QS)
Caron (CAQ)	Grandmont (QS)	Montigny (CAQ)	
(Portneuf)	Gronin (CAQ)	Morin (QLP)	
Caron (QLP)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	
(La Pinière)	Guillemette (CAQ)	Nichols (IND)	
Champagne Jourdain (CAQ)	Haytayan (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	
Charette (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Poulet (CAQ)	

5 April 2023

On the motion moved by Mr. Drainville, Minister of Education, together with Ms. Setlakwe (Mont-Royal–Outremont), Ms. Ghazal (Mercier), Mr. Bérubé (Matane–Matapédia) and Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil):

(Division No. 49)

YEAS - 102

Allaire (CAQ)	Charette (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	Morin (QLP)
Arseneau (PQ)	Chassin (CAQ)	Haytayan (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)
Asselin (CAQ)	Ciccione (QLP)	Hébert (CAQ)	Nichols (IND)
Bachand (CAQ)	Cliche-Rivard (QS)	Jacques (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)
Beauchemin (QLP)	D'Amours (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Poulet (CAQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Derraji (QLP)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)
(Orford)	Dionne (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Proulx (CAQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Dorismond (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
(Prévost)	Drainville (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Reid (CAQ)
Bernard (CAQ)	Dufour (QLP)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Rizqy (QLP)
Biron (CAQ)	(Mille-Îles)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Roberge (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	Dufour (CAQ)	Lakhoyan Olivier (QLP)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Blanchette Vézina (CAQ)	(Abitibi-Est)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)
Bogemans (CAQ)	Émond (CAQ)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Roy (CAQ)
Boivin Roy (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	(Verchères)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	Lecours (CAQ)	Sainte-Croix (CAQ)
Bouazzi (QS)	Fortin (QLP)	(Les Plaines)	Schmaltz (CAQ)
Boulet (CAQ)	Fréchette (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Bourassa (CAQ)	Gagnon (CAQ)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Setlakwe (QLP)
Boutin (CAQ)	Garceau (QLP)	Leduc (QS)	Simard (CAQ)
Bussière (CAQ)	Gendron (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Skeete (CAQ)
Cadet (QLP)	Ghazal (QS)	Lévesque (CAQ)	St-Louis (CAQ)
Caire (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Tanguay (QLP)
Carmant (CAQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Maccarone (QLP)	Tardif (CAQ)
Caron (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Mallette (CAQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)
(Portneuf)	(Groulx)	Marissal (QS)	(Dubuc)
Caron (QLP)	Grandmont (QS)	Massé (QS)	Tremblay (CAQ)
(La Pinière)	Grondin (CAQ)	McGraw (QLP)	(Hull)
Champagne Jourdain (CAQ)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Montigny (CAQ)	Zaga Mendez (QS)

5 April 2023

On the motion moved by Ms. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent), together with Ms. Cadet (Bourassa-Sauvé), Mr. Drainville, Minister of Education, Ms. Ghazal (Mercier), Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia) and Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil):

(Division No. 50)

YEAS - 101

Allaire (CAQ)	Chassin (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Poulet (CAQ)
Arseneau (PQ)	Ciccone (QLP)	Jacques (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)
Asselin (CAQ)	Cliche-Rivard (QS)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)
Bachand (CAQ)	D'Amours (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Beauchemin (QLP)	Derraji (QLP)	Labrie (QS)	Reid (CAQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Dionne (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Rizqy (QLP)
(Orford)	Dorismond (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Roberge (CAQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Drainville (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Rotiroti (QLP)
(Prévost)	Dufour (QLP)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)
Bernard (CAQ)	(Mille-Îles)	Lakhoyan Olivier (QLP)	Roy (CAQ)
Biron (CAQ)	Dufour (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	(Verchères)
Blais (CAQ)	(Abitibi-Est)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Sainte-Croix (CAQ)
Blanchette Vézina (CAQ)	Émond (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Schmaltz (CAQ)
Bogemans (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Boivin Roy (CAQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	(Les Plaines)	Setlakwe (QLP)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Fortin (QLP)	Lecours (CAQ)	Simard (CAQ)
Bouazzi (QS)	Fréchette (CAQ)	(Lothbinière-Frontenac)	Skeete (CAQ)
Boulet (CAQ)	Gagnon (CAQ)	Leduc (QS)	St-Louis (CAQ)
Bourassa (CAQ)	Garceau (QLP)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Tanguay (QLP)
Boutin (CAQ)	Gendron (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)
Bussière (CAQ)	Ghazal (QS)	(Chapleau)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Cadet (QLP)	Girard (CAQ)	Maccarone (QLP)	(Dubuc)
Caire (CAQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Mallette (CAQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Carmant (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Marissal (QS)	(Hull)
Caron (CAQ)	(Groulx)	McGraw (QLP)	Zaga Mendez (QS)
(Portneuf)	Grandmont (QS)	Montigny (CAQ)	
Caron (QLP)	Grondin (CAQ)	Morin (QLP)	
(La Pinière)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	
Champagne Jourdain (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	Nichols (IND)	
Charette (CAQ)	Haytayan (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)	