

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF QUÉBEC

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-THIRD LEGISLATURE

## **Votes and Proceedings**

of the Assembly

Thursday, 6 April 2023 — No. 32

President of the National Assembly: Madam Nathalie Roy

The Assembly was called to order at 9:40 a.m.

#### **ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

#### **Statements by Members**

Mr. Schneeberger (Drummond–Bois-Francs) made a statement to congratulate the Club d'athlétisme de Drummondville's women's relay team, gold medalist at the provincial indoor track and field championship.

\_\_\_\_

Ms. Maccarone (Westmount-Saint-Louis) made a statement to denounce the vandalizing of the Bagg Street Shul synagogue.

Ms. Mallette (Huntingdon) made a statement to pay tribute to Ms. Linda Janes for her volunteer work and community involvement.

Mr. Grandmont (Taschereau) made a statement to support the citizen movement to ensure road safety around schools.

\_\_\_\_\_

Mr. Sainte-Croix (Gaspé) made a statement to congratulate young Thomas Deschênes, winner of two gold medals at the provincial indoor track and field championship.

487

Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil) made a statement to pay tribute to Ms. Karine Degré and Mr. Alexandro Zarruk on World Health Day.
Ms. Poulet (Laporte) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Robert Lord for his social and community involvement and volunteer work.
Ms. Lecours (Lotbinière-Frontenac) made a statement to underline the work of volunteers at the Cercle de fermières Leclercville and the organization Aide alimentaire Lotbinière.
Ms. Bogemans (Iberville) made a statement to underline the work of the Société d'histoire de la Seigneurie de Monnoir.
Mr. Provençal (Beauce-Nord) made a statement to pay tribute to Ms. Mélanie Gilbert for her 20 years of service at the Beauce-Nord riding office.
Ms. Lecours (Les Plaines) made a statement to underline Daffodil Month

Mr. Lemieux (Saint-Jean) made a statement to underline the review meeting of the Chantier main-d'œuvre Haut-Richelieu.
At 9:55 a.m., Mr. Lévesque, Second Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.
The proceedings resumed at 10:03 a.m.
Moment of reflection
Introduction of Bills
Mr. Charette, Minister of the Environment, the Fight Against Climate Change, Wildlife and Parks, moved that leave be granted to introduce the following bill:
20 An Act to establish the Blue Fund and to amend other provisions
The motion was carried.
Accordingly, Bill 20 was introduced in the Assembly.

Ms. Zaga Mendez (Verdun) moved that leave be granted to introduce the following bill:

393 An Act to combat food waste

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, Bill 393 was introduced in the Assembly.

#### **Presenting Papers**

Ms. Biron, Minister of International Relations and La Francophonie, tabled the following:

The Agreement on social security between Québec and the Republic of Tunisia, signed in Tunis on 20 November 2022, accompanied by a note explaining its contents and effects.

(Sessional Paper No. 497-20230406)

She then tabled the following motion:

THAT the National Assembly approve the Agreement on social security between Québec and the Republic of Tunisia, signed on 20 November 2022.

(Sessional Paper No. 498-20230406)

She then tabled the following:

The Agreement on social security between the Government of Québec and the Government of the Republic of Austria, signed in Montréal on 14 December 2022, accompanied by a note explaining its contents and effects.

(Sessional Paper No. 499-20230406)

Lastly, she tabled the following motion:

THAT the National Assembly approve the Agreement on social security between Québec and the Republic of Austria, signed on 14 December 2022.

(Sessional Paper No. 500-20230406)

\_\_\_\_\_

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, tabled the following:

The Government's reply to a petition tabled on 15 March 2023 by Ms. D'Amours (Mirabel) on the availability of epinephrine auto-injectors (like EpiPen) in Québec preschools and elementary schools.

(Sessional Paper No. 501-20230406)

The President tabled the following:

The 2023–2027 strategic plan of the Auditor General of Québec. This document is accompanied by a presentation table.

(Sessional Paper No. 502-20230406)

#### **Presenting Petitions**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mr. Sainte-Croix (Gaspé) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on revising the health and social services network's User Travel Policy, signed by 2,698 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 503-20230406)

### **Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

#### **Deferred Divisions**

The Assembly took the division, which had been deferred at the sitting of 5 April 2023, to put the question on the motions stating a grievance moved during the debate on the budget speech as well as on the motion moved by Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, that the Assembly approve the Government's budgetary policy.

First, the question was put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ government for putting at risk the ability of future generations to finance the services to which they are entitled by reducing the payments into the Generations Fund.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **51** in Appendix)

Yeas: 16 Nays: 86 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Bouazzi (Maurice-Richard). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly censure the CAQ government for this budget that is unfair, irresponsible and lacking ambition for Québec.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 52 in Appendix)

Yeas: 25 Nays: 77 Abstentions: 0

492

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition. This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ government for tabling a 2023–2024 budget that does not include a comprehensive plan to support the State's essential missions, nor concrete measures to counter the labour shortage, in addition to abandoning future generations by reducing payments into the Generations Fund.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 53 in Appendix)

Yeas: 16 Nays: 86 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly censure the CAQ government for the weakness of its orthodox stance on the Canadian Constitution, which prevents the Québec peoples from achieving their dreams of freedom.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **54** in Appendix)

Yeas: 12 Nays: 90 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Ms. Dufour (Mille-Îles). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ government for tabling a budget that does not help Québec families find housing, meet the expectations of housing organizations or support cities and municipalities in addressing their urgent and growing needs.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **55** in Appendix)

Yeas: 27 Nays: 74 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Ms. Caron (La Pinière). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ government for presenting a budget that continues to penalize persons age 60 and over with disabilities with respect to the benefit they receive from the Régie des rentes du Québec.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **56** in Appendix)

Yeas: 27 Nays: 74 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Ms. Massé (Sainte-Marie-Saint-Jacques). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ government for its inability to offer the community sector working conditions commensurate with the services it provides to communities, while our social safety net is riddled with holes.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 57 in Appendix)

Yeas: 27 Nays: 74 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Ms. Zaga Mendez (Verdun). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly censure the CAQ government for its 2023–2024 budget, which lacks ambition in the fight against climate change and which rolls out the red carpet to multinational corporations that are plundering our subsoil assets.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **58** in Appendix)

Yeas: 11 Nays: 74 Abstentions: 16

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Leduc (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ government for the lack of budgetary measures allowing the remuneration of all work internships within the State apparatus.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **59** in Appendix)

Yeas: 27 Nays: 74 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Ms. Garceau (Robert-Baldwin). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ government for planning to convert only 8% of all non-subsidized spaces in Québec into subsidized spaces.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **60** in Appendix)

Yeas: 27 Nays: 74 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Ms. McGraw (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ government for its lack of ambition in its 2023–2024 budget, which does not contain sufficient investments to fully deal with the climate crisis or provide real and adequate protection for biodiversity and water in Québec.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **61** in Appendix)

Yeas: 27 Nays: 74 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Grandmont (Taschereau). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly censure the CAQ government for the unacceptable imbalance between investments in public transit and those in the road network in the 2023–2024 budget.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 62 in Appendix)

Yeas: 27 Nays: 74 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Ms. Prass (D'Arcy-McGee). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ government for its 2023–2024 budget, which does not address the current social crises, particularly mental health and homelessness, and which does not sufficiently take into account the needs of persons with disabilities or autism spectrum disorder.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 63 in Appendix)

Yeas: 27 Nays: 74 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Ms. Ghazal (Mercier). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Coalition avenir Québec government for its 2023–2024 budget, which does not meet the huge challenges in the education system that are undermining student success, such as the labour shortage, the dilapidated schools and the three-tiered system causing school segregation.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **64** in Appendix)

Yeas: 11 Nays: 74 Abstentions: 16

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Fortin (Pontiac). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the CAQ government for its fifth consecutive budget, which does not include any funding to implement a safe nurse-to-patient ratio in the health and social services network.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 65 in Appendix)

Yeas: 28 Nays: 74 Abstentions: 1

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Ms. Labrie (Sherbrooke). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly censure the Coalition avenir Québec government for its budget, which does not provide the sums necessary to address the mental health crisis.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 66 in Appendix)

Yeas: 27 Nays: 74 Abstentions: 0

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Fontecilla (Laurier-Dorion). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly censure the CAQ government for its 2023–2024 budget, which heralds the end of social housing development in Québec and the privatization of public investments in housing.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. 67 in Appendix)

Yeas: 27 Nays: 74 Abstentions: 0

Lastly, the question was put on the motion moved by Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, that the Assembly approve the Government's budgetary policy.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 68 in Appendix)

Yeas: 74 Nays: 29 Abstentions: 0

The Assembly took the division, which had been deferred on 5 April 2023, on the motion moved by Mr. Marissal (Rosemont) during Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition.

This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly recognize that the fundamental mission of local community service centres (CLSC) includes the provision of services to the local population based on their needs in their living environment, at school, at work or at home;

THAT the National Assembly ask the Government to maintain the entirety of the current mission of CLSCs in Bill 15, in particular the populational responsibility.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **69** in Appendix)

Yeas: 102 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 0

#### **Motions Without Notice**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine), together with Mr. Fortin (Pontiac), Mr. Marissal (Rosemont) and Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil), moved:

THAT the National Assembly recognize that colorectal cancer is the second deadliest cancer in Québec and that early detection of this type of cancer is the key to increasing patient survival rates:

THAT the National Assembly take note that every year, approximately 6,200 Quebecers are diagnosed with colorectal cancer and 2,550 Quebecers die from it;

THAT the National Assembly emphasize that colorectal cancer is a "silent" cancer, as it causes no signs or symptoms at an early stage, and that the survival rate for this type of cancer is 90% at an early stage compared to only 11% at an advanced stage;

THAT, therefore, it ask the Government to implement a systematic colorectal cancer screening program in Québec as quickly as possible by the end of this legislature.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

Mr. Fitzgibbon, Minister of Economy, Innovation and Energy, moved a motion on the electricity supply required to achieve carbon neutrality in 2050; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

\_\_\_\_

Mr. Morin (Acadie), together with Mr. Cliche-Rivard (Saint-Henri–Sainte-Anne) and Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil), moved a motion on pay equity between Crown prosecutors and legal aid lawyers; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Nadeau-Dubois, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, together with Mr. Lacombe, Minister of Culture and Communications, Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia) and Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil), moved:

THAT the National Assembly underline the career of Ms. Jocelyne Richer, parliamentary correspondent and later head of *The Canadian Press* office in Québec City until her retirement;

THAT the National Assembly applaud the contribution to Québec democracy made by Ms. Richer and all those working at the Press Gallery.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

#### **Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

Mr. Lévesque, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

- the Committee on Institutions, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 14, An Act to amend various provisions relating to public security and to enact the Act to assist in locating missing persons;
- the Committee on Labour and the Economy, to undertake public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 19, An Act respecting the regulation of work by children.

And, by leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 143, he convened the following committee:

 the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain, to undertake public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 16, An Act to amend the Act respecting land use planning and development and other provisions.

#### **Information on the Proceedings of the Assembly**

Mr. Lévesque, Second Vice-President, informed the Assembly that on Friday, 21 April 2023, Mr. Grandmont (Taschereau) would question Ms. Guilbault, Minister of Transport and Sustainable Mobility, during an interpellation on the importance of pedestrian safety around schools in Québec.

#### ORDERS OF THE DAY

#### **Government Bills**

The Assembly took into consideration the report from the Committee on Health and Social Services on its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 10, An Act limiting the use of personnel placement agencies' services and independent labour in the health and social services sector.

After debate thereon, the report was concurred in.

At 12:35 p.m., at the request of Mr. Caire, Deputy Government House Leader, Mr. Lévesque, Second Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 1:00 p.m.

#### **Debates upon Adjournment**

The motion was carried.

At 1:00 p.m., the Assembly held a debate upon adjournment on a question by Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys) to Mr. Fitzgibbon, Minister of Economy, Innovation and Energy, about the risks surrounding the evolution of artificial intelligence. Mr. Caire, Minister of Cybersecurity and Digital Technology, replaced the Minister for this debate.

Mr. Caire, Deputy Government House Leader, moved the adjournment of the Assembly until Tuesday, 18 April 2023 at 10:00 a.m.

At 1:13 p.m., Mr. Lévesque, Second Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Tuesday, 18 April 2023 at 10:00 a.m.

#### **ROYAL ASSENT**

On Thursday, 6 April 2023 at 2:00 p.m. in the Office of the Lieutenant-Governor, in the presence of Mr. Simard (Montmorency), Delegate of the Premier, and of Ms. Beauregard, Director of Sittings and Parliamentary Procedure and Delegate of the Secretary General, the Honourable J. Michel Doyon, Lieutenant-Governor of Québec, was pleased to assent to the following bills:

- 9 An Act amending mainly certain Acts establishing public sector pension plans
- An Act respecting the Hertel-New York interconnection line

#### **NATHALIE ROY**

President

### **APPENDIX**

### **Recorded Divisions**

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys):

### (Division No. 51)

#### **YEAS - 16**

1 EAS - 10			
Beauchemin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Derraji ( <i>QLP</i> )	Lakhoyan Olivier (QLP)	Rotiroti ( <i>QLP</i> )
Cadet (QLP)	Dufour (QLP)	Maccarone (QLP)	Setlakwe (QLP)
Caron (QLP)	(Mille-Îles)	McGraw (QLP)	Tanguay (QLP)
(La Pinière)	Fortin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Morin (QLP)	
Ciccone (QLP)	Garceau (QLP)	Nichols (IND)	
	NAYS - 80	6	
Allaire $(CAQ)$	D'Amours ( $CAQ$ )	Jacques (CAQ)	Montigny $(CAQ)$
Arseneau (PQ)	Dionne ( $CAQ$ )	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)
Asselin ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Dorismond ( $CAQ$ )	Jolin-Barrette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Poulet (CAQ)
Bachand $(CAQ)$	Drainville ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Julien ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Poulin ( $CAQ$ )
Bélanger ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Dufour (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Proulx $(CAQ)$
(Orford)	(Abitibi-Est)	Laforest (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Bernard (CAQ)	Duranceau (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Reid ( $CAQ$ )
Bérubé (PQ)	Émond ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lafrenière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Rivest (CAQ)
Biron $(CAQ)$	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Roberge $(CAQ)$
Blais (CAQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)
Blanchette Vézina ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Fréchette (CAQ)	LeBel $(CAQ)$	Roy $(CAQ)$
Bogemans (CAQ)	Gagnon (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	(Verchères)
Boivin Roy (CAQ)	Gendron (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	Sainte-Croix (CAQ)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Ghazal (QS)	Lecours (CAQ)	Schmaltz (CAQ)
Bouazzi (QS)	Girard (CAQ)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Schneeberger ( $CAQ$ )
Boulet $(CAQ)$	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Leduc (QS)	Simard (CAQ)
Boutin (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lefebvre ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Skeete (CAQ)
Bussière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	(Groulx)	Lemay (CAQ)	St-Louis (CAQ)
Caire (CAQ)	Grandmont (QS)	Lemieux ( $CAQ$ )	St-Pierre Plamondon
, ~,	\ <del>-</del>	~ ~,	(PQ)
Carmant (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Tardif $(CAQ)$
Champagne Jourdain	Guilbault (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Tremblay $(CAQ)$
(CAQ)			
Charette (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	Mallette (CAQ)	(Hull)
Chassin $(CAQ)$	Haytayan (CAQ)	Marissal (QS)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Cliche-Rivard (QS)	Hébert (CAQ)	Martel $(CAQ)$	(Dubuc)
·~ /	` ~	` ~	

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Bouazzi (Maurice-Richard):

### (Division No. 52)

### **YEAS - 25**

1 EAS - 25				
Beauchemin (QLP)	Dufour ( <i>QLP</i> )	Lakhoyan Olivier (QLP)	Rotiroti (QLP)	
Bouazzi ( <i>QS</i> )	(Mille-Îles)	Leduc $(QS)$	Setlakwe (QLP)	
Cadet (QLP)	Fontecilla (QS)	Maccarone (QLP)	Tanguay (QLP)	
Caron (QLP)	Fortin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Marissal (QS)		
(La Pinière)	Garceau (QLP)	McGraw (QLP)		
Ciccone (QLP)	Ghazal (QS)	Morin (QLP)		
Cliche-Rivard (QS)	Grandmont (QS)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)		
Derraji ( <i>QLP</i> )	Labrie (QS)	Nichols (IND)		
	NAYS - 7	7		
Allaire ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Dionne ( $CAQ$ )	Julien (CAQ)	Reid (CAQ)	
Arseneau (PQ)	Dorismond ( $CAQ$ )	Laforest (CAQ)	Rivest $(CAQ)$	
Asselin (CAQ)	Drainville ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Laframboise (CAQ)	Roberge $(CAQ)$	
Bachand (CAQ)	Dufour (CAQ)	Lafrenière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Rouleau (CAQ)	
Bélanger ( <i>CAQ</i> )	(Abitibi-Est)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Roy $(CAQ)$	
(Orford)	Duranceau (CAQ)	Lamothe ( $CAQ$ )	(Verchères)	
Bernard ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Émond (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Sainte-Croix ( <i>CAQ</i> )	
Bérubé ( <i>PQ</i> )	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Schmaltz (CAQ)	
Biron $(CAQ)$	Fréchette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	(Les Plaines)	Schneeberger $(CAQ)$	
Blais $(CAQ)$	Gagnon (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Simard (CAQ)	
Blanchette Vézina ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Gendron (CAQ)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Skeete ( <i>CAQ</i> )	
Bogemans $(CAQ)$	Girard (CAQ)	Lefebvre ( <i>CAQ</i> )	St-Louis (CAQ)	
Boivin Roy (CAQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Lemay $(CAQ)$	St-Pierre Plamondon	
zerim nej (eng)	(Zue sum veun)	2011ay (0.12)	(PQ)	
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)	
Boulet (CAQ)	(Groulx)	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Tremblay $(CAQ)$	
Boutin ( $CAQ$ )	Grondin (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	(Hull)	
Bussière ( $\angle CAQ$ )	Guilbault ( $\angle CAQ$ )	Mallette ( $CAQ$ )	Tremblay (CAQ)	
Caire $(CAQ)$	Guillemette ( $\overrightarrow{CAQ}$ )	Martel $(CAQ)$	(Dubuc)	
Carmant $(CAQ)$	Haytayan (CAQ)	Montigny $(\widetilde{CAQ})$	(,	
Champagne Jourdain	Hébert (CAQ)	Poulet $(CAQ)$		
(CAQ)	· •	~ ~~		
Charette (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)		
Chassin $(CAQ)$	Jeannotte $(\widetilde{CAQ})$	Proulx $(CAQ)$		
D'Amours $(\widetilde{CAQ})$	Jolin-Barrette $(CAQ)$	Provençal $(CAQ)$		
· ~	` ~	• • ~		

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Tanguay, Leader of the Official Opposition:

(Division No. 53)

(Identical to Division No. 51)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Zanetti (Jean-Lesage):

### (Division No. 54)

### **YEAS - 12**

	1 EAG - 12	4	
Arseneau (PQ)	Cliche-Rivard ( <i>QS</i> )	Grandmont ( <i>QS</i> )	Marissal (QS)
Bérubé (PQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	Labrie (QS)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)
Bouazzi (QS)	Ghazal (QS)	Leduc $(QS)$	St-Pierre Plamondon
			(PQ)
	NAYS - 90	0	
Allaire $(CAQ)$	Dionne ( $CAQ$ )	Julien (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Asselin (CAQ)	Dorismond (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Reid (CAQ)
Bachand (CAQ)	Drainville ( $CAQ$ )	Laframboise (CAQ)	Rivest (CAQ)
Beauchemin (QLP)	Dufour $(CAQ)$	Lafrenière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Roberge (CAQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)	(Abitibi-Est)	Lakhoyan Olivier	Rotiroti (QLP)
		(QLP)	
(Orford)	Dufour (QLP)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)
Bernard (CAQ)	(Mille-Îles)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Roy $(CAQ)$
Biron $(CAQ)$	Duranceau (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	(Verchères)
Blais (CAQ)	Émond (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Sainte-Croix (CAQ)
Blanchette Vézina	Fitzgibbon ( <i>CAQ</i> )	(Les Plaines)	Schmaltz (CAQ)
(CAQ)			
Bogemans (CAQ)	Fortin (QLP)	Lecours (CAQ)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Boivin Roy (CAQ)	Fréchette (CAQ)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Setlakwe (QLP)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Gagnon (CAQ)	Lefebvre ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Simard $(CAQ)$
Boulet (CAQ)	Garceau (QLP)	Lemay (CAQ)	Skeete ( $CAQ$ )
Boutin ( $CAQ$ )	Gendron $(CAQ)$	Lemieux ( <i>CAQ</i> )	St-Louis (CAQ)
Bussière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Girard (CAQ)	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Tanguay (QLP)
Cadet (QLP)	(Groulx)	(Chapleau)	Tardif $(CAQ)$
Caire (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Maccarone (QLP)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Carmant (CAQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Mallette ( $CAQ$ )	(Dubuc)
Caron (QLP)	Grondin (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)
(La Pinière)	Guilbault (CAQ)	McGraw (QLP)	(Hull)
Champagne Jourdain	Guillemette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Montigny (CAQ)	
(CAQ)			
Charette (CAQ)	Haytayan (CAQ)	Morin (QLP)	
Chassin (CAQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Nichols (IND)	
Ciccone $(QLP)$	Jacques $(\widetilde{CAQ})$	Poulet (CAQ)	
D'Amours (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)	
Derraji (QLP)	Jolin-Barrette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Proulx $(CAQ)$	
•	. ~	•	

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Ms. Dufour (Mille-Îles):

### (Division No. 55)

### **YEAS - 27**

Beauchemin (QLP)	Derraji (QLP)	Labrie (QS)	Nichols (IND)
Bérubé (PQ)	Dufour (QLP)	Lakhoyan Olivier ( <i>QLP</i> )	Rotiroti (QLP)
Bouazzi (QS)	(Mille-Îles)	Leduc (QS)	Setlakwe ( <i>QLP</i> )
Cadet (QLP)	Fontecilla (QS)	Maccarone (QLP)	St-Pierre Plamondon ( <i>PQ</i> )
Caron (QLP)	Fortin (QLP)	Marissal (QS)	Tanguay (QLP)
(La Pinière)	Garceau (QLP)	McGraw (QLP)	υ , « <b>υ</b> ,
Ciccone (QLP)	Ghazal $(QS)$	Morin (QLP)	
Cliche-Rivard (QS)	Grandmont (QS)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	
	NAYS - 7-	4	
Allaire $(CAQ)$	Dionne (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Poulet (CAQ)
Asselin (CAQ)	Dorismond $(CAQ)$	Jolin-Barrette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Poulin ( $CAQ$ )
Bachand (CAQ)	Drainville ( $CAQ$ )	Julien (CAQ)	Proulx $(CAQ)$
Bélanger ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Dufour $(CAQ)$	Laforest ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Provençal (CAQ)
(Orford)	(Abitibi-Est)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Reid (CAQ)
Bernard $(CAQ)$	Duranceau (CAQ)	Lafrenière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Rivest (CAQ)
Biron $(CAQ)$	Émond (CAQ)	Lamontagne $(CAQ)$	Roberge (CAQ)
Blais $(CAQ)$	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)
Blanchette Vézina	Fréchette (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Roy $(CAQ)$
(CAQ)			
Bogemans $(CAQ)$	Gagnon (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	(Verchères)
Boivin Roy (CAQ)	Gendron (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	Sainte-Croix (CAQ)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Schmaltz (CAQ)
Boulet $(CAQ)$	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Schneeberger ( $CAQ$ )
Boutin ( $CAQ$ )	Girard (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Simard (CAQ)
Bussière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	(Groulx)	Lemay (CAQ)	Skeete ( $CAQ$ )
Caire $(CAQ)$	Grondin ( $CAQ$ )	Lemieux ( <i>CAQ</i> )	St-Louis (CAQ)
Carmant (CAQ)	Guilbault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lévesque (CAQ)	Tardif $(CAQ)$
Champagne Jourdain	Guillemette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	(Chapleau)	Tremblay $(CAQ)$
(CAQ)			
Charette ( $CAQ$ )	Haytayan (CAQ)	Mallette (CAQ)	(Hull)
Chassin $(CAQ)$	Hébert (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Tremblay $(CAQ)$
D'Amours (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Montigny (CAQ)	(Dubuc)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Ms. Caron (La Pinière):

### (Division No. 56)

(Identical to Division No. 55)

\_\_\_\_\_

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Ms. Massé (Sainte-Marie-Saint-Jacques):

(Division No. 57)

(Identical to Division No. 55)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Ms. Zaga Mendez (Verdun):

### (Division No. 58)

### **YEAS - 11**

Bérubé ( <i>PQ</i> )	Ghazal ( <i>QS</i> )	Marissal (QS)
Bouazzi (QS)	Grandmont (QS)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)
Cliche-Rivard (QS)	Labrie (QS)	St-Pierre Plamondon
		(PQ)

Fontecilla (QS) Leduc (QS)

#### **NAYS - 74**

NA15 - /4			
Allaire (CAQ)	Dionne ( $CAQ$ )	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Poulet (CAQ)
Asselin (CAQ)	Dorismond ( $CAQ$ )	Jolin-Barrette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Poulin ( $CAQ$ )
Bachand (CAQ)	Drainville ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Julien (CAQ)	Proulx ( $CAQ$ )
Bélanger (CAQ)	Dufour $(CAQ)$	Laforest (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
(Orford)	(Abitibi-Est)	Laframboise ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Reid ( $CAQ$ )
Bernard ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Duranceau (CAQ)	Lafrenière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Rivest $(CAQ)$
Biron (CAQ)	Émond ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Roberge (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	Lamothe ( $CAQ$ )	Rouleau (CAQ)
Blanchette Vézina ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Fréchette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	LeBel $(CAQ)$	Roy $(CAQ)$
Bogemans $(CAQ)$	Gagnon (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	(Verchères)
Boivin Roy $(CAQ)$	Gendron $(CAQ)$	(Les Plaines)	Sainte-Croix ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Schmaltz (CAQ)
Boulet (CAQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Boutin $(CAQ)$	Girard ( $CAQ$ )	Lefebvre $(CAQ)$	Simard (CAQ)
Bussière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	(Groulx)	Lemay $(CAQ)$	Skeete ( $CAQ$ )
Caire $(CAQ)$	Grondin ( $CAQ$ )	Lemieux ( <i>CAQ</i> )	St-Louis (CAQ)
Carmant (CAQ)	Guilbault ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Tardif $(CAQ)$
Champagne Jourdain	Guillemette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	(Chapleau)	Tremblay (CAQ)
(CAQ)			
Charette ( $CAQ$ )	Haytayan (CAQ)	Mallette ( $CAQ$ )	(Hull)
Chassin ( $CAQ$ )	Hébert (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)
D'Amours ( $CAQ$ )	Jacques (CAQ)	Montigny (CAQ)	(Dubuc)

### **ABSTENTIONS - 16**

Beauchemin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Derraji ( <i>QLP</i> )	Lakhoyan Olivier ( <i>QLP</i> )	Rotiroti (QLP)
Cadet (QLP)	Dufour (QLP)	Maccarone (QLP)	Setlakwe (QLP)
Caron (QLP)	(Mille-Îles)	McGraw (QLP)	Tanguay (QLP)
(La Pinière)	Fortin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Morin (QLP)	
Ciccone (QLP)	Garceau (QLP)	Nichols (IND)	

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Leduc (Hochelaga Maisonneuve):
(Division No. 59)
(Identical to Division No. 55)
On the motion stating a grievance moved by Ms. Garceau (Robert-Baldwin):
(Division No. 60)
(Identical to Division No. 55)
On the motion stating a grievance moved by Ms. McGraw (Notre-Dame-de Grâce):
(Division No. 61)
(Identical to Division No. 55)
On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Grandmont (Taschereau):

(Division No. 62)

(Identical to Division No. 55)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Ms. Prass (D'Arcy-McGee):

(Division No. 63)

(Identical to Division No. 55)

\_\_\_\_

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Ms. Ghazal (Mercier):

(Division No. 64)

(Identical to Division No. 58)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Fortin (Pontiac):

#### (Division No. 65)

YEAS - 28				
Arseneau (PQ)	Derraji (QLP)	Lakhoyan Olivier (QLP)	St-Pierre Plamondon	
			(PQ)	
Beauchemin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Dufour ( <i>QLP</i> )	Leduc (QS)	Tanguay (QLP)	
Bérubé (PQ)	(Mille-Îles)	Maccarone (QLP)	Zaga Mendez (QS)	
Bouazzi (QS)	Fontecilla ( <i>QS</i> )	Marissal (QS)		
Cadet (QLP)	Fortin ( <i>QLP</i> )	McGraw (QLP)		
Caron (QLP)	Garceau (QLP)	Morin ( <i>QLP</i> )		
(La Pinière)	Ghazal ( <i>QS</i> )	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)		
Ciccone (QLP)	Grandmont ( <i>QS</i> )	Rotiroti ( <i>QLP</i> )		
Cliche-Rivard ( <i>QS</i> )	Labrie (QS)	Setlakwe ( <i>QLP</i> )		
	NAYS - 74	1		
Allaire ( $CAQ$ )	Dionne ( $CAQ$ )	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Poulet (CAQ)	
Asselin (CAQ)	Dorismond ( $CAQ$ )	Jolin-Barrette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Poulin ( <i>CAQ</i> )	
Bachand ( $CAQ$ )	Drainville ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Julien (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)	
Bélanger (CAQ)	Dufour $(CAQ)$	Laforest (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)	
(Orford)	(Abitibi-Est)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Reid ( $CAQ$ )	
Bernard ( $CAQ$ )	Duranceau (CAQ)	Lafrenière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Rivest $(CAQ)$	
Biron $(CAQ)$	Émond ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Roberge $(CAQ)$	
Blais $(CAQ)$	Fitzgibbon ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Lamothe ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Rouleau (CAQ)	
Blanchette Vézina ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Fréchette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	LeBel $(CAQ)$	Roy(CAQ)	
Bogemans $(CAQ)$	Gagnon (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	(Verchères)	
Boivin Roy ( $CAQ$ )	Gendron $(CAQ)$	(Les Plaines)	Sainte-Croix ( <i>CAQ</i> )	
Bonnardel ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Girard (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Schmaltz (CAQ)	
Boulet ( $CAQ$ )	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Schneeberger ( $CAQ$ )	
Boutin (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Simard (CAQ)	
Bussière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	(Groulx)	Lemay $(CAQ)$	Skeete ( $CAQ$ )	
~	~		~	

Lemieux (*CAQ*)

Lévesque (CAQ)

(Chapleau)

St-Louis (CAQ)

Tremblay (CAQ)

Tardif (CAQ)

### (CAQ)

Caire (CAQ)

Champagne

Carmant (CAQ)

Charette (CAQ) Haytayan (CAQ) Mallette (CAQ) (Hull)Chassin (CAQ) Hébert (CAQ) Martel (CAQ)

Grondin (CAQ)

Jourdain Guillemette (CAQ)

Guilbault (CAQ)

Tremblay (CAQ)

D'Amours (CAQ) Jacques (CAQ) Montigny (CAQ) (Dubuc)

### **ABSTENTIONS - 1**

Nichols (IND)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Ms. Labrie (Sherbrooke):

(Division No. 66)

(Identical to Division No. 55)

\_\_\_\_

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Fontecilla (Laurier-Dorion):

(Division No. 67)

(Identical to Division No. 55)

### On the motion moved by Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance:

### (Division No. 68)

### **YEAS - 74**

Allaire (CAQ) Asselin (CAQ) Bachand (CAQ) Bélanger (CAQ) (Orford) Bernard (CAQ) Biron (CAQ)	Dionne (CAQ) Dorismond (CAQ) Drainville (CAQ) Dufour (CAQ) (Abitibi-Est) Duranceau (CAQ) Émond (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ) Jolin-Barrette (CAQ) Julien (CAQ) Laforest (CAQ) Laframboise (CAQ) Lafrenière (CAQ) Lamontagne (CAQ)	Poulet (CAQ) Poulin (CAQ) Proulx (CAQ) Provençal (CAQ) Reid (CAQ) Rivest (CAQ) Roberge (CAQ)
Blais $(CAQ)$	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)
	Fréchette (CAQ)	LeBel $(CAQ)$	Roy(CAQ)
(CAQ)			
Bogemans $(CAQ)$	Gagnon (CAQ)	Lecours $(CAQ)$	(Verchères)
Boivin Roy ( $CAQ$ )	Gendron $(CAQ)$	(Les Plaines)	Sainte-Croix ( <i>CAQ</i> )
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Schmaltz (CAQ)
Boulet $(CAQ)$	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Boutin (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lefebvre ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Simard (CAQ)
Bussière ( <i>CAQ</i> )	(Groulx)	Lemay (CAQ)	Skeete ( $CAQ$ )
Caire (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	St-Louis (CAQ)
Carmant (CAQ)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Tardif $(CAQ)$
Champagne Jourdain	Guillemette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	(Chapleau)	Tremblay $(CAQ)$
(CAQ)		•	•
Charette (CAQ)	Haytayan (CAQ)	Mallette ( $CAQ$ )	(Hull)
Chassin $(CAQ)$	Hébert (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)
D'Amours $(\widetilde{CAQ})$	Jacques $(CAQ)$	Montigny $(\widetilde{CAQ})$	(Dubuc)
,	-		

### **NAYS - 29**

NA 15 - 27								
	Arseneau (PQ)	Derraji (QLP)	Lakhoyan	Olivier	Setlakwe (	QLP)		
			(QLP)					
	Beauchemin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Dufour (QLP)	Leduc $(QS)$		St-Pierre	Plamondon		
					(PQ)			
	Bérubé (PQ)	(Mille-Îles)	Maccarone (QLP)		Tanguay (QLP)			
	Bouazzi (QS)	Fontecilla (QS)	Marissal (QS)		Zaga Mend	ez(QS)		
	Cadet (QLP)	Fortin (QLP)	McGraw (QLP)					
	Caron (QLP)	Garceau (QLP)	Morin (QLP)					
	(La Pinière)	Ghazal $(QS)$	Nadeau-Dubois	(QS)				
	Ciccone ( <i>QLP</i> )	Grandmont ( <i>QS</i> )	Nichols (IND)					
	Cliche-Rivard (QS)	Labrie (QS)	Rotiroti (QLP)					

### On the motion moved by Mr. Marissal (Rosemont):

### (Division No. 69)

### **YEAS - 102**

Allaire $(CAQ)$	Derraji (QLP)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Nichols (IND)	
Arseneau $(\overrightarrow{PQ})$	Dionne $(CAQ)$	Jolin-Barrette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	Poulet (CAQ)	
Asselin $(CAQ)$	Dorismond $(CAQ)$	Julien (CAQ)	Poulin $(CAQ)$	
Bachand (CAQ)	Drainville ( $CAQ$ )	Labrie (QS)	Proulx $(CAQ)$	
Beauchemin ( <i>QLP</i> )	Dufour (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Provençal $(\widetilde{CAQ})$	
Bélanger ( <i>CAQ</i> )	(Abitibi-Est)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Reid $(CAQ)$	
(Orford)	Dufour (QLP)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Rivest $(\widetilde{CAQ})$	
Bernard (CAQ)	(Mille-Îles)	Lakhoyan Olivier	Roberge $(\widetilde{CAQ})$	
, ~,	,	(QLP)	<b>3</b> \ <b>2</b>	
Bérubé ( <i>PQ</i> )	Duranceau (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Rotiroti ( <i>QLP</i> )	
Biron $(CAQ)$	Émond (CAQ)	Lamothe (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)	
Blais $(CAQ)$	Fitzgibbon $(CAQ)$	LeBel (CAQ)	Roy $(CAQ)$	
Blanchette Vézina	Fontecilla (QS)	Lecours (CAQ)	(Verchères)	
(CAQ)				
Bogemans (CAQ)	Fortin (QLP)	(Les Plaines)	Sainte-Croix (CAQ)	
Boivin Roy (CAQ)	Fréchette (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Schmaltz (CAQ)	
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Gagnon (CAQ)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Schneeberger (CAQ)	
Bouazzi (QS)	Garceau (QLP)	Leduc (QS)	Setlakwe ( <i>QLP</i> )	
Boulet $(CAQ)$	Gendron (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Simard (CAQ)	
Boutin ( $CAQ$ )	Ghazal (QS)	Lemay (CAQ)	Skeete ( $CAQ$ )	
Bussière (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	St-Louis (CAQ)	
Cadet (QLP)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Lévesque ( <i>CAQ</i> )	St-Pierre Plamondon	
			(PQ)	
Caire $(CAQ)$	Girard (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Tanguay (QLP)	
Carmant (CAQ)	(Groulx)	Maccarone (QLP)	Tardif (CAQ)	
Caron (QLP)	Grandmont (QS)	Mallette (CAQ)	Tremblay $(CAQ)$	
(La Pinière)	Grondin ( $CAQ$ )	Marissal (QS)	(Dubuc)	
Champagne Jourdain	Guilbault (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	Tremblay $(CAQ)$	
(CAQ)				
Charette ( $CAQ$ )	Guillemette ( <i>CAQ</i> )	McGraw (QLP)	(Hull)	
Chassin (CAQ)	Haytayan (CAQ)	Montigny $(CAQ)$	Zaga Mendez (QS)	
Cliche-Rivard (QS)	Hébert (CAQ)	Morin (QLP)		
D'Amours (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)		