



NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF QUÉBEC

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-THIRD LEGISLATURE

Votes and Proceedings

of the Assembly

Wednesday, 29 November 2023 — No. 84

**President of the National Assembly:
Madam Nathalie Roy**

The Assembly was called to order at 9:40 a.m.

ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS

Statements by Members

Mr. St-Louis (Joliette) made a statement to underline the 85th anniversary of Camp Papillon.

Ms. Hébert (Saint-François) made a statement to pay tribute to the founders of Centre communautaire Partage Saint-François.

Ms. Ghazal (Mercier) made a statement to ask the Government to preserve the site of the former Institution des Sourdes in Montréal for the sake of the Deaf community.

Mr. Laframboise (Blainville) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. François Girard.

Mr. Lemieux (Saint-Jean) made a statement to underline the appointment of Ms. Andrée Bouchard to the position of prefect of the MRC du Haut-Richelieu.

29 November 2023

Ms. Poulet (Laporte) made a statement to pay tribute to Ms. Josée Dugas.

Mr. Chassin (Saint-Jérôme) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Claude Bincette.

Ms. Champagne Jourdain (Duplessis) made a statement to congratulate Ms. Karen Pinette Fontaine, also known as Kanen, recipient of two Félix Awards.

Ms. Charest (Brome-Missisquoi) made a statement to underline the 20th anniversary of the Brome-Missisquoi Wine Route.

Mr. Jolin-Barrette (Borduas) made a statement to pay tribute to Ms. Maryse Pinsonneault.

Ms. Lakhoyan Olivier (Chomedey) made a statement to pay tribute to Ms. Chantal Lachaine.

At 9:53 a.m., Mr. Benjamin, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

29 November 2023

The proceedings resumed at 10:04 a.m.

Moment of reflection

Presenting Papers

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, tabled the following:

The reply to a written question from Mr. Bouazzi (Maurice-Richard) on the development of the battery industry – Question No. 59, *Order Paper and Notices* of 17 October 2023;

(Sessional Paper No. 1145-20231129)

The reply to a written question from Ms. Lakhoyan Olivier (Chomedey) on the Palais des congrès de Montréal – Question No. 61, *Order Paper and Notices* of 18 October 2023;

(Sessional Paper No. 1146-20231129)

The reply to a written question from Mr. Derraji (Nelligan) on Québec immigration files awaiting processing by the federal government – Question No. 64, *Order Paper and Notices* of 24 October 2023.

(Sessional Paper No. 1147-20231129)

Presenting Reports from Committees

Mr. Simard (Montmorency), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Public Finance, which met on 28 November 2023 to hear the interested parties and give clause-by-clause consideration to Private Bill 205, An Act respecting Beneva Mutual. The report contains amendments to the bill.

(Sessional Paper No. 1148-20231129)

The report was concurred in.

29 November 2023

Mr. Bachand (Richmond), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Institutions, which held public hearings on 23 and 28 November 2023 within the framework of special consultations on Bill 40, An Act mainly to reform municipal courts and to improve the justice system's efficiency, accessibility and performance.

(Sessional Paper No. 1149-20231129)

Presenting Petitions

Mr. St-Pierre Plamondon (Camille-Laurin) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on equal treatment between CISSS and CIUSSS lawyers and their counterparts, signed by 1,429 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1150-20231129)

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 63 and 63.1, Ms. Lachance (Bellechasse) moved:

The abstract of a petition on adding pedestrian lights at the intersection of Route du Président-Kennedy and Avenue des Ruisseaux, signed by 375 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1151-20231129)

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mr. St-Pierre Plamondon (Camille-Laurin) moved:

The abstract of a petition on equal treatment between CISSS and CIUSSS lawyers and their counterparts, signed by 420 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 1152-20231129)

29 November 2023

Oral Questions and Answers

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

Motions Without Notice

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Skeete, Minister Responsible for the Fight Against Racism, together with Ms. Maccarone (Westmount–Saint-Louis), Mr. St-Pierre Plamondon, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil) and Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), moved:

THAT the National Assembly recall that the Christmas holiday is a tradition celebrated in Québec;

THAT it denounce the remarks made by the Canadian Human Rights Commission to the effect that “statutory holidays related to Christianity, including Christmas and Easter” are an “obvious example” of “systemic religious discrimination” and that “discrimination against religious minorities in Canada is grounded in Canada’s history of colonialism”;

THAT it denounce any attempt to polarize unifying events that have been part of Québec’s heritage for several generations now;

THAT, lastly, it invite all Quebecers to come together as the Christmas season approaches.

The question was put on this motion, and an electronic division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **163** in Appendix)

Yeas: **109** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

29 November 2023

Ms. Setlakwe (Mont-Royal–Outremont), together with Mr. Bouazzi (Maurice-Richard), Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine), Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil) and Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), moved a motion on the protection of personal information in the health sector; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

Mr. Bouazzi (Maurice-Richard), together with Mr. Paradis (Jean-Talon), moved a motion on maintaining Hydro-Québec’s electricity distribution and transmission monopoly; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine), together with Mr. Morin (Acadie), Mr. Grandmont (Taschereau), Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil) and Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), moved:

Given that maintaining the road network in good condition is essential to ensure the efficient and safe mobility of people and goods, and to promote access to the territory, its occupation and the development of the regions, which are key factors in the development and competitiveness of Québec’s economy;

Given that almost half of these roadways are in poor condition and that a considerable proportion of them have reached the end of their service life;

THAT the National Assembly ask the Minister of Transport and Sustainable Mobility to formally commit to implementing the recommendations made in Chapter 2 of the Report of the Auditor General of Québec to the National Assembly for 2023–2024.

The question was put on this motion, and an electronic division was thereupon demanded.

29 November 2023

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **164** in Appendix)

Yeas: **111** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil), together with Mr. Chassin (Saint-Jérôme), Mr. Fortin (Pontiac), Mr. Cliche-Rivard (Saint-Henri-Sainte-Anne), Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine) and Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), moved:

THAT the National Assembly recall that the Laurentides region has been experiencing exponential population growth over the last thirty years, accelerated by the recent pandemic period. That it consider the rapid aging of the region's population, the considerable increase in vacationers and a steady flow of day trippers using the region's health care services;

THAT the National Assembly acknowledge that on 15 October 2023, 115,266 citizens still lacked access to family medicine services, that the region has not had a significant upgrade of its infrastructure for over 30 years, and that the region suffers from significant historical underfunding;

THAT the National Assembly also recall, for the third time, the urgent need to apply the principles of the health plan and of modernizing its organization, considering that the Laurentides region still ranks among the last in Québec to have accessibility to overall health care;

29 November 2023

THAT, lastly, the National Assembly reiterate the relevance of its resolutions of 6 May 2021 and 11 May 2022 addressed to the Québec government to ensure long-term financial recovery to remedy the health inequity in the Laurentides region compared to the average for Québec regions. Lastly, that it advise the Government to see to it that the implementation of the Saint-Jérôme, Saint-Eustache and Mont-Laurier major hospital projects, as well as the acceptance of functional and technical plans for other health institutions, are included in the 2024–2034 QIP.

The question was put on this motion, and an electronic division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **165** in Appendix)

Yeas: **109** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

Notices of Proceedings in Committees

Mr. Lévesque, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

- the Committee on Labour and the Economy, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 38, An Act to amend the Act respecting the governance and management of the information resources of public bodies and government enterprises and other legislative provisions;
- the Committee on Culture and Education, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 23, An Act to amend mainly the Education Act and to enact the Act respecting the Institut national d'excellence en éducation;
- the Committee on Health and Social Services, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 15, An Act to make the health and social services system more effective;

29 November 2023

- the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain, to undertake clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 39, An Act to amend the Act respecting municipal taxation and other legislative provisions.

Mr. Benjamin, Third Vice-President, gave the following notice:

- the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries, Energy and Natural Resources shall hold a deliberative meeting to discuss the possibility of carrying out an order of initiative to hear the President and Director General of Hydro-Québec.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Government Bills

Passage in Principle

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Minister of Justice, informed the Assembly that the Honourable J. Michel Doyon, Lieutenant-Governor of Québec, recommended Bill 40, An Act mainly to reform municipal courts and to improve the justice system's efficiency, accessibility and performance, for its consideration, and, by leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 236, then moved that this bill do now pass in principle.

After debate thereon, the question was put on this motion, and an electronic division was thereupon demanded.

At the request of Mr. Lévesque, Deputy Government House Leader, the division was deferred until Routine Proceedings on the next sitting day.

29 November 2023

Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, moved that Bill 35, An Act respecting the implementation of certain provisions of the Budget Speech of 21 March 2023 and amending other provisions, do now pass in principle.

A debate arose thereon.

At 1:00 p.m., Mr. Benjamin, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 3:00 p.m.

The proceedings resumed at 3:00 p.m.

The Assembly continued the debate on the motion moved by Mr. Girard, Minister of Finance, that Bill 35, An Act respecting the implementation of certain provisions of the Budget Speech of 21 March 2023 and amending other provisions, do now pass in principle.

After debate thereon, the motion was carried on division, and Bill 35 was accordingly passed in principle.

Mr. Lévesque, Deputy Government House Leader, moved that Bill 35 be referred to the Committee on Public Finance for clause-by-clause consideration.

The motion was carried.

Debates on Reports from Committees

The Assembly took into consideration the report from the Committee on Institutions, which held public hearings on 21 November 2023 within the framework of special consultations on the 2015–2019 report on the implementation of the *Code of ethics and conduct of the Members of the National Assembly* entitled “Incursion au cœur du code d’éthique et de déontologie : de la théorie à la pratique”. The report contains observations and nine recommendations.

29 November 2023

Mr. Lévesque, Second Vice-President, informed the Assembly of the allocation of speaking time for the proceedings with respect to this debate: 60 minutes to the parliamentary group forming the Government; 28 minutes 46 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition; 21 minutes 11 seconds to the Second Opposition Group; 7 minutes 4 seconds to the Third Opposition Group; and 1 minute 30 seconds to each independent Member. Within this framework, any time not used by the independent Members or by a parliamentary group shall be redistributed among the parliamentary groups in the proportions established above. Lastly, individual addresses shall not be limited.

A debate arose thereon.

The debate expired and, pursuant to Standing Order 95, no question was put.

Mr. Lévesque, Deputy Government House Leader, moved the adjournment of the Assembly until Thursday, 30 November 2023 at 9:40 a.m.

The motion was carried.

At 4:35 p.m., Mr. Lévesque, Second Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Thursday, 30 November 2023 at 9:40 a.m.

29 November 2023

ROYAL ASSENT

On Wednesday, 29 November 2023 at 1:15 p.m. in the Office of the Lieutenant-Governor, in the presence of Mr. Montigny (René-Lévesque), Delegate of the Premier, and of Ms. Aubé,ittings and Parliamentary Procedure Advisor and Delegate of the Secretary General, the Honourable J. Michel Doyon, Lieutenant-Governor of Québec, was pleased to assent to the following bill:

22 An Act respecting expropriation

NATHALIE ROY

President

29 November 2023

APPENDIX

Electronic Divisions

On the motion moved by Mr. Skeete, Minister Responsible for the Fight Against Racism, together with Ms. Maccarone (Westmount–Saint-Louis), Mr. St-Pierre Plamondon, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil) and Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys):

(Division No. 163)

YEAS - 109

Abou-Khalil (CAQ)	Ciccone (QLP)	Haytayan (CAQ)	Nichols (IND)
Allaire (CAQ)	Cliche-Rivard (QS)	Hébert (CAQ)	Paradis (PQ)
Arseneau (PQ)	D'Amours (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)
Asselin (CAQ)	Derraji (QLP)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Poulet (CAQ)
Bachand (CAQ)	Déry (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)
Beauchemin (IND)	Dionne (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Prass (QLP)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Dorismond (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Proulx (CAQ)
(Prévost)	Drainville (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Dubé (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Reid (CAQ)
(Orford)	Dufour (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Rivest (CAQ)
Bernard (CAQ)	(Abitibi-Est)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Rizqy (QLP)
Bérubé (PQ)	Dufour (QLP)	Lakhoyan Olivier (QLP)	Roberge (CAQ)
Biron (CAQ)	(Mille-Îles)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Blais (CAQ)	Duranceau (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)
Blouin (CAQ)	Émond (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Sainte-Croix (CAQ)
Bogemans (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	Schmaltz (CAQ)
Boivin Roy (CAQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	Lecours (CAQ)	Setlakwe (QLP)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Fortin (QLP)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Simard (CAQ)
Bouazzi (QS)	Fréchette (CAQ)	Leduc (QS)	Skeete (CAQ)
Boulet (CAQ)	Gagnon (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	St-Louis (CAQ)
Bussièrre (CAQ)	Garceau (QLP)	Lemay (CAQ)	St-Pierre Plamondon (PQ)
Cadet (QLP)	Gendron (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)
Caire (CAQ)	Ghazal (QS)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Thouin (CAQ)
Carmant (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Caron (CAQ)	(Groulx)	Maccarone (QLP)	(Dubuc)
(Portneuf)	Girard (CAQ)	Mallette (CAQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Caron (QLP)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Martel (CAQ)	(Hull)
(La Pinière)	Grandmont (QS)	McGraw (QLP)	Zaga Mendez (QS)
Champagne Jourdain (CAQ)	Groncin (CAQ)	Montigny (CAQ)	Zanetti (QS)
Charest (CAQ)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Morin (QLP)	
Charette (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)	

29 November 2023

On the motion moved by Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine), together with Mr. Morin (Acadie), Mr. Grandmont (Taschereau), Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil) and Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys):

(Division No. 164)

YEAS - 111

Abou-Khalil (CAQ)	Chassin (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	Nadeau-Dubois (QS)
Allaire (CAQ)	Ciccione (QLP)	Haytayan (CAQ)	Nichols (IND)
Arseneau (PQ)	Cliche-Rivard (QS)	Hébert (CAQ)	Paradis (PQ)
Asselin (CAQ)	D'Amours (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)
Bachand (CAQ)	Derraji (QLP)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Poulet (CAQ)
Beauchemin (IND)	Déry (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)
Bélanger (CAQ) (Prévost)	Dionne (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Prass (QLP)
Bélanger (CAQ) (Orford)	Dorismond (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Proulx (CAQ)
Bernard (CAQ)	Drainville (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Bérubé (PQ)	Dubé (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Reid (CAQ)
Biron (CAQ)	Dufour (CAQ) (Abitibi-Est)	Laforest (CAQ)	Rivest (CAQ)
	Dufour (QLP)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Rizqy (QLP)
		Lakhoyan Olivier (QLP)	Roberge (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	(Mille-Îles)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Blouin (CAQ)	Duranceau (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)
Bogemans (CAQ)	Émond (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Sainte-Croix (CAQ)
Boivin Roy (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	Schmaltz (CAQ)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	Lecours (CAQ)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Bouazzi (QS)	Fortin (QLP)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Setlakwe (QLP)
Boulet (CAQ)	Fréchette (CAQ)	Leduc (QS)	Simard (CAQ)
Bussière (CAQ)	Gagnon (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Skeete (CAQ)
Cadet (QLP)	Garceau (QLP)	Lemay (CAQ)	St-Louis (CAQ)
Caire (CAQ)	Gendron (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	St-Pierre Plamondon (PQ)
Carmant (CAQ)	Ghazal (QS)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)
Caron (CAQ) (Portneuf)	Girard (CAQ) (Groulx)	(Chapleau)	Thouin (CAQ)
Caron (QLP) (La Pinière)	Girard (CAQ) (Lac-Saint-Jean)	Maccarone (QLP)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Champagne Jourdain (CAQ)	Grandmont (QS)	Mallette (CAQ)	(Dubuc)
Charest (CAQ)		Martel (CAQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Charette (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	McGraw (QLP)	(Hull)
	Guilbault (CAQ)	Montigny (CAQ)	Zaga Mendez (QS)
		Morin (QLP)	Zanetti (QS)

29 November 2023

On the motion moved by Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil), together with Mr. Chassin (Saint-Jérôme), Mr. Fortin (Pontiac), Mr. Cliche-Rivard (Saint-Henri–Sainte-Anne), Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine) and Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys):

(Division No. 165)

YEAS - 109

Abou-Khalil (CAQ)	Ciccone (QLP)	Haytayan (CAQ)	Paradis (PQ)
Allaire (CAQ)	Cliche-Rivard (QS)	Hébert (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)
Arseneau (PQ)	D'Amours (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Poulet (CAQ)
Asselin (CAQ)	Derraji (QLP)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)
Bachand (CAQ)	Déry (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Prass (QLP)
Beauchemin (IND)	Dionne (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Dorismond (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Provençal (CAQ)
(Prévost)	Drainville (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Reid (CAQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Dubé (CAQ)	Lacombe (CAQ)	Rivest (CAQ)
(Orford)	Dufour (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Rizqy (QLP)
Bernard (CAQ)	(Abitibi-Est)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Roberge (CAQ)
Biron (CAQ)	Dufour (QLP)	Lakhoyan Olivier (QLP)	Rotiroti (QLP)
Blais (CAQ)	(Mille-Îles)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)
Blouin (CAQ)	Duranceau (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Sainte-Croix (CAQ)
Bogemans (CAQ)	Émond (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Schmaltz (CAQ)
Boivin Roy (CAQ)	Fitzgibbon (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	Lecours (CAQ)	Setlakwe (QLP)
Bouazzi (QS)	Fortin (QLP)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Simard (CAQ)
Boulet (CAQ)	Fréchette (CAQ)	Leduc (QS)	Skeete (CAQ)
Bussière (CAQ)	Gagnon (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	St-Louis (CAQ)
Cadet (QLP)	Garceau (QLP)	Lemay (CAQ)	St-Pierre Plamondon (PQ)
Caire (CAQ)	Gendron (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)
Carmant (CAQ)	Ghazal (QS)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Thouin (CAQ)
Caron (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	Tremblay (CAQ)
(Portneuf)	(Groulx)	Maccarone (QLP)	(Dubuc)
Caron (QLP)	Girard (CAQ)	Mallette (CAQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)
(La Pinière)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Martel (CAQ)	(Hull)
Champagne Jourdain (CAQ)	Grandmont (QS)	McGraw (QLP)	Zaga Mendez (QS)
Charest (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	Montigny (CAQ)	Zanetti (QS)
Charette (CAQ)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Morin (QLP)	
Chassin (CAQ)	Guillemette (CAQ)	Nichols (IND)	