



---

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF QUÉBEC

---

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-THIRD LEGISLATURE

## **Votes and Proceedings**

**of the Assembly**

**Friday, 1 December 2023 — No. 86**

**President of the National Assembly:  
Madam Nathalie Roy**



The Assembly was called to order at 9:40 a.m.

---

## **ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

### **Statements by Members**

Mr. Rivest (Côte-du-Sud) made a statement to underline the search for balance in the content offering of Côte-du-Sud's local media.

---

Mr. Derraji (Nelligan) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Robert Gervais.

---

Ms. Poulet (Laporte) made a statement to underline the perseverance of Mr. Alain Charlebois.

---

Ms. Labrie (Sherbrooke) made a statement to invite the Government to make sure that its decisions contribute to the fight against the economic violence experienced by women.

---

Ms. Boivin Roy (Anjou–Louis-Riel) made a statement to congratulate the Université de Montréal Carabins football team, winner of the Vanier Cup.

---

**1 December 2023**

---

Ms. Prass (D’Arcy-McGee) made a statement to underline International Day of Persons with Disabilities.

---

Ms. D’Amours (Mirabel) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Kevin Pagé.

---

Mr. Sainte-Croix (Gaspé) made a statement to deplore the consequences of the moratorium on cod fishery.

---

Ms. Déry (Repentigny) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Florian Chartrand.

---

Ms. Charest (Brome-Missisquoi) made a statement to congratulate Ville de Farnham on its downtown revitalization.

---

Mr. Lafrenière (Vachon) made a statement to underline the athletic achievements of Mr. Saoud Messaoudi.

---

Mr. Lévesque (Chapleau) made a statement to underline the 50th anniversary of École de Musique de l’Outaouais.

---

**1 December 2023**

---

At 9:55 a.m., Mr. Lévesque, Second Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

---

The proceedings resumed at 10:04 a.m.

---

Moment of reflection

### **Presenting Reports from Committees**

Mr. Caron (Portneuf), Committee Vice-Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Public Administration, which met on 5 October and 7 November 2023 to hear the Ministère de la Santé et des Services sociaux, the CIUSSS de la Capitale-Nationale and the CIUSSS de l'Est-de-l'Île-de-Montréal on Chapter 4 of the Auditor General of Québec's May 2023 report entitled "Santé mentale: efficacité du continuum de soins et de services pour les usagers ayant des troubles mentaux graves" (Mental health; Effectiveness of the continuum of care and services for users with serious mental health disorders) and to hear the Ministère de l'Environnement, de la Lutte contre les changements climatiques, de la Faune et des Parcs, the Ministère de la Sécurité publique and the Ministère des Transports et de la Mobilité durable, on Chapter 2 of the Sustainable Development Commissioner's April 2023 report entitled "Adaptation aux changements climatiques : risques liés à l'érosion et à la submersion côtières" (Adapting to climate changes: Risks associated with coastal erosion and flooding). The report contains observations, conclusions and 8 recommendations.

(Sessional Paper No. 1182-20231201)

**1 December 2023**

---

Mr. Ciccone (Marquette), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries, Energy and Natural Resources, which met on 30 November 2023 to hear Hydro-Québec within the framework of the examination of its Strategic Plan 2022–2026 and Action Plan 2035 entitled “Towards a Decarbonized and Prosperous Québec”.

(Sessional Paper No. 1183-20231201)

---

Mr. Simard (Montmorency), Committee Chair, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Public Finance, which met on 30 November 2023 for clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 35, An Act respecting the implementation of certain provisions of the Budget Speech of 21 March 2023 and amending other provisions. The report contains amendments to the bill.

(Sessional Paper No. 1184-20231201)

### **Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

At the request of the President, Mr. Julien, Minister Responsible for Infrastructure, withdrew certain words deemed unparliamentary.

### **Motions Without Notice**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Ms. Labrie (Sherbrooke), together with Ms. Cadet (Bourassa-Sauvé), Mr. Paradis (Jean-Talon), Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil) and Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), moved:

THAT the National Assembly recognize that, according to the Institut de la statistique du Québec report published on 30 November 2023, the total compensation of Québec public sector workers is 7.4% below that of other Québec employees overall;

**1 December 2023**

---

THAT it also recognize that this gap poses a challenge with regard to attracting labour in the public sector.

The question was put on this motion, and an electronic division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **169** in Appendix)

Yeas: **97** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine), together with Ms. McGraw (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce), Ms. Zaga Mendez (Verdun), Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil) and Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), moved:

THAT the National Assembly recognize that it is essential to move away from fossil fuels to achieve our climate goals;

THAT it recall that Canada is a petrostate that spends an average of \$15 billion a year on the Canadian fossil fuel industry;

THAT it ask Québec's Minister of the Environment, the Fight Against Climate Change, Wildlife and Parks and the Minister of Economy, Innovation and Energy to demonstrate active leadership for Canada and the nations at the COP and in the Beyond Oil and Gas Alliance in order to promote a timetable for moving away from fossil fuels.

The question was put on this motion, and an electronic division was thereupon demanded.

**1 December 2023**

---

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **170** in Appendix)

Yeas: **95**   Nays: **0**   Abstentions: **0**

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mr. Lamontagne, Minister of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, together with Mr. Fortin (Pontiac), Ms. Zaga Mendez (Verdun), Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia), Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil) and Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), moved:

THAT the National Assembly congratulate the winners of the 131st Order of Agricultural Merit of Québec competition, which awards the highest distinction one can receive in the farming community in Québec, held on 24 November 2023;

THAT it applaud the winners who, through their excellence, showcase Québec's agri-food sector on the national and international stage;

THAT it also congratulate the recipients of the Prix de la relève agricole 2023, who distinguished themselves through their innovation, expertise and involvement in the community;

THAT it reaffirm the contribution of the men and women who, through agriculture, make their regions proud all across Québec;

THAT it recall their know-how and all the work they carry out for the benefit of Québec's sustainable food self-sufficiency and prosperity;

THAT, lastly, it reiterate that the goals of excellence pursued by the Order of Agricultural Merit of Québec competition and the Prix de la relève agricole must continue to inspire the future of agriculture in Québec.

By leave of the Assembly, the motion was carried.

---



**1 December 2023**

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Ms. Maccarone (Westmount–Saint-Louis), together with Mr. Dubé, Minister of Health, Mr. Cliche-Rivard (Saint-Henri–Sainte-Anne), Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine), Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil) and Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys), moved:

THAT the National Assembly mark World AIDS Day, held annually on 1 December;

THAT it recognize that HIV-AIDS continues to affect thousands of Quebecers and their loved ones;

THAT it highlight that a lot of progress and achievements have been made in the fight against HIV-AIDS since its beginning, including the development of prevention strategies and treatments that improve the quality of life of persons with HIV and prevent transmission;

THAT it applaud the work of community organizations, which are more successful in reaching the most marginalized populations, and persons with HIV who are committed to the fight against this epidemic, which has endured for more than 40 years;

THAT it acknowledge the fruitful collaboration between community organizations and the public health sector in the response to HIV and other sexually transmitted and blood-borne infections;

THAT, lastly, the National Assembly commit to continuing and encouraging cooperation between the public health sector and community organizations to finally put an end to HIV transmission in Québec.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the question was put on this motion, and an electronic division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **171** in Appendix)

Yeas: **94** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

**1305**

**1 December 2023**

---

### **Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

Mr. Lévesque, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committees:

- the Committee on Health and Social Services, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 15, An Act to make the health and social services system more effective;
- the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 39, An Act to amend the Act respecting municipal taxation and other legislative provisions;
- the Committee on Institutions, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 40, An Act mainly to reform municipal courts and to improve the justice system's efficiency, accessibility and performance.

---

### **ORDERS OF THE DAY**

#### **Private Bills**

##### *Passage in Principle*

Mr. Bélanger (Orford) moved that Private Bill 205, An Act respecting Beneva Mutual, do now pass in principle.

The motion was carried and, accordingly, Private Bill 205 was passed in principle.

**1 December 2023**

---

*Passage*

Mr. Bélanger (Orford) moved the passage of Private Bill 205, An Act respecting Beneva Mutual.

After debate thereon, the motion was carried and, accordingly, Private Bill 205 was passed.

**Government Bills**

*Report Stage*

The Assembly took into consideration the report from the Committee on Labour and the Economy on its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 38, An Act to amend the Act respecting the governance and management of the information resources of public bodies and government enterprises and other legislative provisions.

After debate thereon, the report was concurred in.

---

The Assembly took into consideration the report from the Committee on Culture and Education on its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 23, An Act to amend mainly the Education Act and to enact the Act respecting the Institut national d'excellence en éducation, together with the amendments transmitted Ms. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent) and Ms. Ghazal (Mercier).

The amendments were declared in order.

After debate thereon, by leave of the Assembly, Mr. Lévesque, Second Vice-President, put the question individually on the amendments proposed by Ms. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent) and Ms. Ghazal (Mercier) and on the reading thereof.

**1 December 2023**

---

First, the question was put on the amendment proposed by Ms. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent) to section 24.

The amendment was negatived.

The question was then put on the amendment proposed by Ms. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent) to section 27.

The amendment was negatived.

The question was then put on the amendment proposed by Ms. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent) to section 43.

The amendment was negatived.

The question was then put on the amendment proposed by Ms. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent) to section 57.

The amendment was negatived.

The question was then put on the amendment proposed by Ms. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent) to section 60.

The amendment was negatived.

The question was then put on the amendment proposed by Ms. Ghazal (Mercier) introducing section 1.3.

The amendment was negatived.

The question was then put on the amendment proposed by Ms. Ghazal (Mercier) to section 56.2.

The amendment was negatived.

Lastly, the report was concurred in on division.

**1 December 2023**

---

Mr. Lévesque, Deputy Government House Leader, moved the adjournment of the Assembly until Tuesday, 5 December 2023 at 1:40 p.m.

The motion was carried.

---

At 12:53 p.m., Mr. Lévesque, Second Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Tuesday, 5 December 2023 at 1:40 p.m.

**ROYAL ASSENT**

On Friday, 1 December 2023 at 1:00 p.m., in the Office of the Lieutenant-Governor, in the presence of Ms. Aubé,ittings and Parliamentary Procedure Advisor and Delegate of the Secretary General, the Honourable J. Michel Doyon, Lieutenant-Governor of Québec, was pleased to assent to the following bill:

205     An Act respecting Beneva Mutual

**NATHALIE ROY**

*President*

1 December 2023

---

## APPENDIX

### Electronic Divisions

On the motion moved by Ms. Labrie (Sherbrooke), together with Ms. Cadet (Bourassa-Sauvé), Mr. Paradis (Jean-Talon), Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil) and Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys):

#### (Division No. 169)

#### YEAS - 97

Abou-Khalil (CAQ)	Cliche-Rivard (QS)	Jacques (CAQ)	Morin (PLQ)
Allaire (CAQ)	D'Amours (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Nichols (IND)
Arseneau (PQ)	Derraji (PLQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Paradis (PQ)
Asselin (CAQ)	Déry (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Dionne (CAQ)	Kelley (PLQ)	Poulet (CAQ)
(Prévost)	Dorismond (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Poulin (CAQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Dubé (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Prass (PLQ)
(Orford)	Dufour (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Proulx (CAQ)
Bernard (CAQ)	(Abitibi-Est)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Biron (CAQ)	Dufour (PLQ)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Rivest (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	(Mille-Îles)	Lakhoyan Olivier (PLQ)	Roberge (CAQ)
Blouin (CAQ)	Duranceau (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Rotiroti (PLQ)
Bogemans (CAQ)	Émond (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)
Boivin Roy (CAQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	Lecours (CAQ)	Sainte-Croix (CAQ)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Fortin (PLQ)	(Les Plaines)	Schmaltz (CAQ)
Bouazzi (QS)	Fréchette (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Boulet (CAQ)	Gagnon (CAQ)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Setlakwe (PLQ)
Bussière (CAQ)	Garceau (PLQ)	Leduc (QS)	Simard (CAQ)
Cadet (PLQ)	Gendron (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	St-Louis (CAQ)
Carmant (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	Tanguay (PLQ)
Caron (PLQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)
(La Pinière)	Girard (CAQ)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Thouin (CAQ)
Caron (CAQ)	(Groulx)	(Chapleau)	Tremblay (CAQ)
(Portneuf)	Grandmont (QS)	Maccarone (PLQ)	(Dubuc)
Champagne Jourdain (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	Mallette (CAQ)	Zaga Mendez (QS)
Charest (CAQ)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	
Charette (CAQ)	Haytayan (CAQ)	McGraw (PLQ)	
Ciccone (PLQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Montigny (CAQ)	

1 December 2023

---

On the motion moved by Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine), together with Ms. McGraw (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce), Ms. Zaga Mendez (Verdun), Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil) and Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys):

**(Division No. 170)**

**YEAS - 95**

Abou-Khalil (CAQ)	Cliche-Rivard (QS)	Jacques (CAQ)	Nichols (IND)
Allaire (CAQ)	D'Amours (CAQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Paradis (PQ)
Arseneau (PQ)	Derraji (PLQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Picard (CAQ)
Asselin (CAQ)	Déry (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Poulet (CAQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Dionne (CAQ)	Kelley (PLQ)	Poulin (CAQ)
(Orford)	Dorismond (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Prass (PLQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Dubé (CAQ)	Laforest (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
(Prévost)	Dufour (CAQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Rivest (CAQ)
Bernard (CAQ)	(Abitibi-Est)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Roberge (CAQ)
Biron (CAQ)	Dufour (PLQ)	Lakhoyan Olivier (PLQ)	Rotiroti (PLQ)
Blais (CAQ)	(Mille-Îles)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)
Blouin (CAQ)	Duranceau (CAQ)	LeBel (CAQ)	Sainte-Croix (CAQ)
Bogemans (CAQ)	Émond (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Schmaltz (CAQ)
Boivin Roy (CAQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	(Les Plaines)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Bonnardel (CAQ)	Fortin (PLQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Setlakwe (PLQ)
Bouazzi (QS)	Fréchette (CAQ)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Simard (CAQ)
Boulet (CAQ)	Gagnon (CAQ)	Leduc (QS)	St-Louis (CAQ)
Bussière (CAQ)	Garceau (PLQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	Tanguay (PLQ)
Cadet (PLQ)	Gendron (CAQ)	Lemay (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)
Carmant (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Thouin (CAQ)
Caron (PLQ)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Tremblay (CAQ)
(La Pinière)	Girard (CAQ)	(Chapleau)	(Dubuc)
Caron (CAQ)	(Groulx)	Maccarone (PLQ)	Zaga Mendez (QS)
(Portneuf)	Grandmont (QS)	Mallette (CAQ)	
Champagne Jourdain (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	
Charest (CAQ)	Guilbault (CAQ)	McGraw (PLQ)	
Charette (CAQ)	Haytayan (CAQ)	Montigny (CAQ)	
Ciccone (PLQ)	Hébert (CAQ)	Morin (PLQ)	

1 December 2023

---

On the motion moved by Ms. Maccarone (Westmount–Saint-Louis), together with Mr. Dubé, Minister of Health, Mr. Cliche-Rivard (Saint-Henri–Sainte-Anne), Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine), Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil) and Mr. Beauchemin (Marguerite-Bourgeoys):

**(Division No. 171)**

**YEAS - 94**

Abou-Khalil (CAQ)	D'Amours (CAQ)	Jacques (CAQ)	Montigny (CAQ)
Allaire (CAQ)	Derraji (PLQ)	Jeannotte (CAQ)	Morin (PLQ)
Arseneau (PQ)	Dionne (CAQ)	Jolin-Barrette (CAQ)	Nichols (IND)
Asselin (CAQ)	Dorismond (CAQ)	Julien (CAQ)	Paradis (PQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Drainville (CAQ)	Kelley (PLQ)	Picard (CAQ)
(Orford)	Dubé (CAQ)	Labrie (QS)	Poulet (CAQ)
Bélanger (CAQ)	Dufour (CAQ)	Lachance (CAQ)	Poulin (CAQ)
(Prévost)	(Abitibi-Est)	Laforest (CAQ)	Prass (PLQ)
Bernard (CAQ)	Dufour (PLQ)	Laframboise (CAQ)	Provençal (CAQ)
Blais (CAQ)	(Mille-Îles)	Lafrenière (CAQ)	Rivest (CAQ)
Blouin (CAQ)	Duranceau (CAQ)	Lakhoyan Olivier (PLQ)	Roberge (CAQ)
Bogemans (CAQ)	Émond (CAQ)	Lamontagne (CAQ)	Rotiroti (PLQ)
Boivin Roy (CAQ)	Fontecilla (QS)	LeBel (CAQ)	Rouleau (CAQ)
Bouazzi (QS)	Fortin (PLQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Sainte-Croix (CAQ)
Boulet (CAQ)	Fréchette (CAQ)	(Les Plaines)	Schmaltz (CAQ)
Bussière (CAQ)	Gagnon (CAQ)	Lecours (CAQ)	Schneeberger (CAQ)
Cadet (PLQ)	Garceau (PLQ)	(Lotbinière-Frontenac)	Setlakwe (PLQ)
Carmant (CAQ)	Gendron (CAQ)	Leduc (QS)	Simard (CAQ)
Caron (PLQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lefebvre (CAQ)	St-Louis (CAQ)
(La Pinière)	(Lac-Saint-Jean)	Lemay (CAQ)	Tanguay (PLQ)
Caron (CAQ)	Girard (CAQ)	Lemieux (CAQ)	Tardif (CAQ)
(Portneuf)	(Groulx)	Lévesque (CAQ)	Thouin (CAQ)
Champagne Jourdain (CAQ)	Grandmont (QS)	(Chapleau)	Tremblay (CAQ)
Charest (CAQ)	Grondin (CAQ)	Maccarone (PLQ)	(Dubuc)
Charette (CAQ)	Guilbault (CAQ)	Mallette (CAQ)	Zaga Mendez (QS)
Ciccone (PLQ)	Haytayan (CAQ)	Martel (CAQ)	
Cliche-Rivard (QS)	Hébert (CAQ)	McGraw (PLQ)	