



NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF QUÉBEC

FIRST SESSION

FORTY-THIRD LEGISLATURE

Votes and Proceedings

of the Assembly

Thursday, 5 December 2024 — No. 172

**President of the National Assembly:
Madam Nathalie Roy**

The Assembly was called to order at 9:40 a.m.

ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS

Statements by Members

Ms. Soucy (Saint-Hyacinthe) made a statement to congratulate La Ferme Yves-Barré, finalist for Canada's Outstanding Young Farmers competition.

Ms. Rizqy (Saint-Laurent) made a statement to underline the 40th anniversary of Moisson Montréal.

Mr. St-Louis (Joliette) made a statement to invite the population to visit the Joliette Christmas Market.

Ms. Zaga Mendez (Verdun) made a statement to applaud the generational chair project, an initiative for a sustainable future.

Ms. Mallette (Huntingdon) made a statement to pay tribute to young Gerry_McAdam.

5 December 2024

Ms. Lakhoyan Olivier (Chomedey) made a statement to underline the 50th anniversary of the Armenian school Sourp Hagop.

Mr. Lemay (Masson) made a statement to pay tribute to Mr. Pierre Decelles.

Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine) made a statement to underline the 35th anniversary of Maison d'aide et d'hébergement l'Accalmie.

Mr. Montigny (René-Lévesque) made a statement to underline the 10th anniversary of the organization Droits et Recours en Santé Mentale de la Côte-Nord.

Ms. Biron (Chutes-de-la-Chaudière) made a statement to pay tribute to Ms. Bernadette Roy-Couture.

Mr. Roberge (Chambly) made a statement to underline the work of the organization Intégration Compétences.

Ms. Rouleau (Pointe-aux-Trembles) made a statement to underline International Volunteer Day.

5 December 2024

At 9:55 a.m., Ms. D'Amours, Second Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

The proceedings resumed at 10:06 a.m.

Moment of reflection

Introduction of Bills

Mr. Lamontagne, Minister of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, moved that leave be granted to introduce the following bill:

86 An Act to ensure the long-term preservation and vitality of agricultural land

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, Bill 86 was introduced in the Assembly.

Presenting Papers

Mr. Bonnardel, Minister of Public Security, tabled the following:

The 2023–2024 annual management report of the École nationale de police du Québec;

(Sessional Paper No. 2130-20241205)

The second report on the implementation of the 2021–2026 government action plan in response to recommendations by the Select Committee on the Sexual Exploitation of Minors;

(Sessional Paper No. 2131-20241205)

5 December 2024

The revised 2021–2026 strategic plan of the Commission québécoise des libérations conditionnelles.

(Sessional Paper No. 2132-20241205)

Ms. Blanchette Vézina, Minister of Natural Resources and Forests, tabled the following:

The 2018–2023 five-year review of the sustainable development of forests.

(Sessional Paper No. 2133-20241205)

Mr. Jolin-Barrette, Government House Leader, tabled the following:

The reply to a written question from Ms. Caron (La Pinière) on intermediate housing resources – Question No. 187, *Order Paper and Notices* of 24 October 2024;

(Sessional Paper No. 2134-20241205)

The reply to a written question from Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia) on pay equity in the public service – Question No. 190, *Order Paper and Notices* of 30 October 2024;

(Sessional Paper No. 2135-20241205)

The Government's reply to a petition tabled on 23 October 2024 by Ms. Prass (D'Arcy-McGee) on compliance with the Cavendish-Cavendish road connection project schedule submitted to the BAPE.

(Sessional Paper No. 2136-20241205)

The President tabled the following:

The 2023–2024 annual management report of the Auditor General of Québec;

(Sessional Paper No. 2137-20241205)

5 December 2024

The 2023–2024 follow-up report on the implementation of the recommendations of the Auditor General of Québec and the Sustainable Development Commissioner.

(Sessional Paper No. 2138-20241205)

Presenting Petitions

Ms. Tardif (Laviolette–Saint-Maurice) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition requesting the implementation of a renewal and development committee for the Rivière-aux-Rats sawmill, signed by 113 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 2139-20241205)

Mr. Cliche-Rivard (Saint-Henri–Sainte-Anne) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition on access to francization services for newcomers to Québec, signed by 12,286 citizens of Québec;

(Sessional Paper No. 2140-20241205)

The abstract of a petition on strengthening the presence of social services on Santé Québec's board of directors, signed by 2,324 citizens of Québec.

(Sessional Paper No. 2141-20241205)

Complaints of Breach of Privilege or Contempt and Personal Explanations

The President ruled on the admissibility of the point of privilege or contempt raised by the Official Opposition House Leader concerning the tabling of the 2023 annual management report of the Société de l'assurance automobile du Québec.

5 December 2024

RULING FROM THE CHAIR

The requirement to table the report originates from section 19 of the *Act respecting the Société de l'assurance automobile du Québec* which clearly states that the Société must submit its documents to the Minister not later than 30 April each year. The Minister must then table the report in the National Assembly within 15 days of receiving it. If the Assembly is not sitting at the time the period expires, the Minister must table the report within 15 days of resumption.

The latest annual report of the Société was tabled on 26 September 2023 and concerned the year 2022. The annual management report for the year 2023 should have been tabled in the National Assembly during the month of May 2024 at the latest. As such, it is established that the report was not tabled within the time prescribed by section 19 of the Act.

The Chair has had to rule several times in the past on points of privilege relating to failure to table a document required by law to be tabled in the National Assembly. Each time, the Chair ruled that failure to table a document within the time prescribed by law constituted prima facie contempt of Parliament.

In one case, which occurred in 1993, 21 government departments and agencies failed to table their activity reports in the Assembly within the time prescribed by their constituting Act. On that occasion, the Chair ruled it a case of prima facie contempt, explaining that the reports tabled by government departments and agencies are essential to the parliamentary duties of Members, and that failure to table the reports could have hindered their ability to perform their duties.

The report currently at issue is no less important than those of past cases. The information it contains is just as important for Members in the performance of their essential duty as overseers of government action. The Assembly must be informed of what is happening within the state apparatus in a timely manner. The legally prescribed period is not a suggestion to government departments and agencies, but a performance requirement.

As such, there is no doubt that failure to table a document in the Assembly when required by law constitutes prima facie contempt.

5 December 2024

Regarding the argument that the Minister was acting in good faith and had not yet received the documents provided for under section 19 of the Act, explaining why she was unable to table the report in the Assembly within the prescribed time limit, this justification does not alter the Minister's responsibility regarding the requirement provided for in the Act to table the documents in the Assembly within the prescribed time limit. Under section 25 of the *Act respecting the Société de l'assurance automobile du Québec*, the Minister of Transport and Sustainable Mobility is responsible for the carrying out of the Act, which includes the requirement to oversee the production and tabling of the required documents within the prescribed period.

Furthermore, the doctrine consistently recognizes that, in accordance with the principle of individual ministerial responsibility, a minister is accountable to Parliament not only for their actions, but also those of the public servants in their department and of the public bodies under their responsibility. As such, the Minister mentioning that she has not received the document is not sufficient to absolve her of her obligation to the Assembly.

When, for any reason, it is not possible for a government department or agency to complete a document within the legally prescribed time limit, the Assembly is entitled to expect the minister responsible for the application of the Act to follow up and provide the reasons for the delay. It is a matter of basic deference, which government departments and agencies must show to the Assembly and its Members.

This is what occurred in 2019, when the SAAQ was unable to complete its 2018 annual management report within the legally prescribed time limit. The Minister of Transport at the time had tabled a preliminary annual management report, together with a letter from the chair of the organization's board of directors to explain the reasons behind the delay of the final report's tabling.

The then Minister had acted in a diligent manner by following up with his parliamentary colleagues on the report's progress and the reasons behind the delay of the final version. However, in this case, nothing of the sort has been done, despite the many months that have passed since the expiry of the prescribed time limit.

Ministers are responsible for ensuring that the documents required by law to be tabled in the National Assembly within a prescribed period are produced and tabled within that time. It is fundamental that Members take the legal obligations to produce and table these documents in the National Assembly seriously. It is also important that each stakeholder play its role adequately so that these obligations are complied with.

5 December 2024

In a ruling made in 2019, the Chair stated its wish that the case at issue serve as a warning for all ministers, as well as the departments and agencies concerned by a legal obligation to table documents in the Assembly. The Chair again asks that government departments and agencies strictly adhere to this legal obligation. The legal requirements for the tabling of documents by parliamentarians must be taken seriously.

The tabling of documents in the National Assembly must not be considered a simple routine administrative task. It is an important exercise of the public administration's transparency with regard to the legislative branch, which must be able to rely on receiving information in a timely manner, that is, within the time limits prescribed by law, to exercise oversight of state activity.

For all of these reasons, the Chair rules that the point of privilege raised by the Official Opposition House Leader to be *prima facie* admissible.

Oral Questions and Answers

By leave of the Assembly, the speaking time for Question Period available to Mr. Nadeau-Dubois, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, was allotted to Ms. Ghazal (Mercier) for the duration of the replacement of the Leader of the Second Opposition Group.

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

Deferred Divisions

The Assembly took the division, which had been deferred at the sitting of 4 December 2024, on the motion moved by Mr. Roberge, Minister of Immigration, Francization and Integration, for the passage of Bill 74, An Act mainly to improve the regulatory scheme governing international students.

5 December 2024

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **367** in Appendix)

Yeas: **78** Nays: **27** Abstentions: **1**

Accordingly, Bill 74 was passed.

The Assembly took the division, which had been deferred at the sitting of 4 December 2024, on the motion moved by Mr. Lafrenière, Minister Responsible for Relations with the First Nations and the Inuit, for the passage of Bill 32, An Act to establish the cultural safety approach within the health and social services network.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **368** in Appendix)

Yeas: **80** Nays: **27** Abstentions: **0**

Accordingly, Bill 32 was passed.

Motions Without Notice

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Ms. Garceau (Robert-Baldwin), together with Ms. Ghazal (Mercier), Mr. St-Pierre Plamondon, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil) and Mr. Chassin (Saint-Jérôme), moved:

THAT the National Assembly deplore that, as of 25 November 2024, 24 femicides have occurred in Québec;

5 December 2024

THAT it recognize the importance of implementing activities to train and raise awareness among workers who come in contact with cases of violence of all forms, in particular domestic violence, including coercive control;

THAT it take note of the tabling by the Bureau du coroner of the third review from the domestic violence death review committee and its 32 recommendations;

THAT, lastly, it ask the CAQ government to commit to implementing all of the report's recommendations.

The question was put on this motion, and an electronic division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **369** in Appendix)

Yeas: **106** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Ms. Ghazal (Mercier), together with Mr. Legault, Premier, Ms. Garceau (Robert-Baldwin), Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil) and Mr. Chassin (Saint-Jérôme), moved:

THAT the National Assembly remember the tragedy that occurred at École polytechnique de Montréal 35 years ago, on 6 December 1989;

THAT it ask everyone in this House to unite their voices with those of the affected families to honour the memory of the fourteen women victims of this femicide: Geneviève, Maryse, Annie, Hélène, Nathalie, Barbara, Anne-Marie, Maryse, Annie, Sonia, Anne-Marie, Michèle, Maud and Barbara;

5 December 2024

THAT it remember the thirteen people who were injured in this tragedy, and the many other indirect victims;

THAT it applaud the PolySeSouvient collective's determination in honouring the memory of the victims for 35 years by proposing concrete measures to improve public safety, and the Polytechnique Montréal community's ongoing commitment to promoting science and engineering studies for young women;

THAT it acknowledge that the PolySeSouvient collective is still campaigning for a total ban on private possession of assault weapons in Canada, which are the weapons most often used in mass killings such as the one on 6 December 1989, and that, in this regard, the National Assembly affirm its support for this demand;

THAT, lastly, the National Assembly denounce all forms of violence against women, including coercive control and cyberviolence, which are at the heart of the current 12 Days of Action to End Violence Against Women campaign, and that it observe a minute of silence in memory of the victims.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the question was put on this motion, and an electronic division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. **370** in Appendix)

Yeas: **107** Nays: **0** Abstentions: **0**

At the request of Ms. Soucy, First Vice-President, the Assembly observed a minute of silence.

5 December 2024

Mr. Arseneau (Îles-de-la-Madeleine), together with Ms. Prass (D'Arcy-McGee), Ms. Labrie (Sherbrooke), Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil) and Mr. Chassin (Saint-Jérôme), moved a motion on the Société d'habitation du Québec's Residential Adaptation Assistance Program; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

Mr. Roberge, Minister of the French Language, together with Mr. Bérubé (Matane-Matapédia), moved a motion on the *Charter of the French Language*; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

Mr. Chassin (Saint-Jérôme) moved a motion on the Centre d'acquisitions gouvernementales; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

Notices of Proceedings in Committees

Mr. Caire, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following committee:

- the Committee on Health and Social Services, to hear the interested parties and undertake clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 212, An Act to amend the Act to incorporate Foyer Wales - The Wales Home.

And, by leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 143.1, he convened the following committee:

- the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain, to continue its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 79, An Act to enact the Act respecting contracting by municipal bodies and to amend various provisions mainly for the purpose of reducing the administrative burden of municipal bodies.

5 December 2024

Ms. Soucy, First Vice-President, gave the following notices:

- the Committee on Institutions shall hold a deliberative meeting to discuss the possibility of carrying out an order of initiative on the surge of armed violence and the escalation of the street gang phenomenon and its recruiting methods, which particularly target young people;
- the Committee on Health and Social Services shall hold a deliberative meeting to discuss the possibility of examining a petition on the implementation of a program for free access to contraception;
- the Committee on Citizen Relations shall hold a deliberative meeting to discuss the possibility of examining a petition on the official recognition of sign languages in Québec and improvement of accessibility for deaf and hard-of-hearing individuals.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Private Bills

Passage in Principle

Ms. Boivin Roy (Anjou–Louis-Riel) moved that Private Bill 211, An Act respecting the École Polytechnique de Montréal, do now pass in principle.

After debate thereon, the motion was carried, and Private Bill 211 was accordingly passed in principle.

5 December 2024

Passage

Ms. Boivin Roy (Anjou–Louis-Riel) moved the passage of Private Bill 211, An Act respecting the École Polytechnique de Montréal.

After debate thereon, the motion was carried and, accordingly, Private Bill 211 was passed.

Debates on Reports from Committees

The Assembly took into consideration the report from the Committee on Public Administration, which met on 10 October 2024 to hear the Tribunal administratif du logement on its administrative management and financial commitments, as well as on the annual report of the Public Protector. The report contains observations, conclusions and four recommendations.

Ms. Soucy, First Vice-President, informed the Assembly of the allocation of speaking time for the proceedings with respect to this debate: 57 minutes to the parliamentary group forming the Government; 31 minutes 4 seconds to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition; 20 minutes 34 seconds to the Second Opposition Group; 6 minutes 51 seconds to the Third Opposition Group; and 1 minute 30 seconds to each independent Member. Within this framework, any time not used by the independent Members or by a parliamentary group shall be redistributed among the parliamentary groups in the proportions established above. Lastly, individual addresses shall not be limited.

A debate arose thereon.

At 1:00 p.m., Ms. Soucy, First Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 2:00 p.m., pursuant to the order adopted on 19 November 2024.

The proceedings resumed at 2:00 p.m.

5 December 2024

The Assembly continued the debate on the consideration of the report from the Committee on Public Administration, which met on 10 October 2024 to hear the Tribunal administratif du logement on its administrative management and financial commitments, as well as on the annual report of the Public Protector. The report contains observations, conclusions and four recommendations.

The debate expired and, pursuant to Standing Order 95, no question was put.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 53, the Assembly proceeded with the tabling of a committee report.

Presenting Reports from Committees

Ms. Blouin (Bonaventure), Committee member, tabled the following:

The report from the Committee on Health and Social Services, which met on 5 December 2024 to hear the interested parties and give clause-by-clause consideration to Private Bill 212, An Act to amend the Act to incorporate Foyer Wales - The Wales Home. The report contains amendments to the bill.

(Sessional Paper No. 2142-20241205)

The report was concurred in.

Private Bills

Passage in Principle

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 268, Mr. Bachand (Richmond) moved that Private Bill 212, An Act to amend the Act to incorporate Foyer Wales - The Wales Home, do now pass in principle.

The motion was carried and Private Bill 212 was accordingly passed in principle.

5 December 2024

Passage

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 22 and section 35 of the *Rules for the Conduct of Proceedings*, Mr. Bachand (Richmond) moved the passage of Private Bill 212, An Act to amend the Act to incorporate Foyer Wales - The Wales Home.

After debate thereon, the motion was carried and, accordingly, Private Bill 212 was passed.

Mr. Caire, Deputy Government House Leader, moved the adjournment of the Assembly until Friday, 6 December 2024 at 9:40 a.m.

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, at 3:19 p.m., Mr. Benjamin, Third Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Friday, 6 December 2024 at 9:40 a.m.

ROYAL ASSENT

On Thursday, 5 December 2024 at 11:35 a.m. in the Office of the Lieutenant-Governor, in the presence of Mr. Montigny (René-Lévesque), Delegate of the Premier, and of Ms. Aubé,ittings and Parliamentary Procedure Advisor and Delegate of the Secretary General, the Honourable Manon Jeannotte, Lieutenant-Governor of Québec, was pleased to assent to the following bills:

- 61 An Act enacting the Act respecting Mobilité Infra Québec and amending certain provisions relating to shared transportation
- 75 An Act to give effect to fiscal measures announced in the Budget Speech delivered on 12 March 2024 and to certain other measures

5 December 2024

Then, at 2:10 p.m. in the Office of the Lieutenant-Governor, in the presence of Mr. Lafrenière, Minister Responsible for Relations with the First Nations and the Inuit, Mr. Lemieux (Saint-Jean), Mr. Asselin (Vanier-Les Rivières) and Mr. St-Louis (Joliette), Delegates of the Premier, and of Ms. Beauregard, Director of Sitings and Parliamentary Procedure and Delegate of the Secretary General, the Honourable Manon Jeannotte, Lieutenant-Governor of Québec, was pleased to assent to the following bill:

- 32 An Act to establish the cultural safety approach within the health and social services network

NATHALIE ROY

President

5 December 2024

APPENDIX

Electronic Divisions

On the motion moved by Mr. Roberge, Minister of Immigration, Francization and Integration, for the passage of Bill 74, An Act mainly to improve the regulatory scheme governing international students:

(Division No. 367)

YEAS - 78

| | | | |
|-----------------------------|--------------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|
| Abou-Khalil (CAQ) | Champagne Jourdain (CAQ) | Jolin-Barrette (CAQ) | Picard (CAQ) |
| Allaire (CAQ) | Charest (CAQ) | Julien (CAQ) | Poulet (CAQ) |
| Arseneau (PQ) | Charette (CAQ) | Lachance (CAQ) | Proulx (CAQ) |
| Asselin (CAQ) | Déry (CAQ) | Laforest (CAQ) | Reid (CAQ) |
| Bachand (CAQ) | Dionne (CAQ) | Laframboise (CAQ) | Rivest (CAQ) |
| Bélanger (CAQ) (Orford) | Dorismond (CAQ) | Lafrenière (CAQ) | Roberge (CAQ) |
| Bélanger (CAQ) (Prévost) | Dubé (CAQ) | Lamontagne (CAQ) | Rouleau (CAQ) |
| Bernard (CAQ) | Dufour (CAQ) | Lamothe (CAQ) | Roy (CAQ) |
| Bérubé (PQ) | (Abitibi-Est) | LeBel (CAQ) | Sainte-Croix (CAQ) |
| Biron (CAQ) | Duranceau (CAQ) | Lecours (CAQ) | Schmaltz (CAQ) |
| Blais (CAQ) | Émond (CAQ) | (Les Plaines) | Schneeberger (CAQ) |
| Blanchette Vézina (CAQ) | Gagnon (CAQ) | Lecours (CAQ) | Simard (CAQ) |
| Blouin (CAQ) | Girard (CAQ) | (Lotbinière-Frontenac) | Skeete (CAQ) |
| Bogemans (CAQ) | (Groulx) | Legault (CAQ) | St-Louis (CAQ) |
| Boivin Roy (CAQ) | Grondin (CAQ) | Lemay (CAQ) | St-Pierre Plamondon (PQ) |
| Bonnardel (CAQ) | Guilbault (CAQ) | Lemieux (CAQ) | Tardif (CAQ) |
| Boulet (CAQ) | Guillemette (CAQ) | Lévesque (CAQ) | Thouin (CAQ) |
| Caire (CAQ) | Haytayan (CAQ) | (Chauveau) | Tremblay (CAQ) |
| Carmant (CAQ) | Hébert (CAQ) | Lévesque (CAQ) | (Hull) |
| Caron (CAQ) (Portneuf) | Jacques (CAQ) | (Chapleau) | Tremblay (CAQ) |
| | Jeannotte (CAQ) | Malette (CAQ) | (Dubuc) |
| | | Martel (CAQ) | |
| | | Paradis (PQ) | |

NAYS - 27

| | | | |
|-----------------------------|------------------------|-----------------|------------------|
| Beauchemin (QLP) | Fontecilla (QS) | Maccarone (QLP) | Rotiroti (QLP) |
| Cadet (QLP) | Fortin (QLP) | Marissal (QS) | Setlakwe (QLP) |
| Caron (QLP) (La Pinière) | Garceau (QLP) | Massé (QS) | Tanguay (QLP) |
| Ciccone (QLP) | Ghazal (QS) | McGraw (QLP) | Zaga Mendez (QS) |
| Cliche-Rivard (QS) | Grandmont (QS) | Morin (QLP) | Zanetti (QS) |
| Dufour (QLP) | Labrie (QS) | Nichols (IND) | |
| (Mille-Îles) | Lakhoyan Olivier (QLP) | Prass (QLP) | |
| | Leduc (QS) | Rizqy (QLP) | |

ABSTENTIONS - 1

Chassin (IND)

5 December 2024

On the motion moved by Mr. Lafrenière, Minister Responsible for Relations with the First Nations and the Inuit, for the passage of Bill 32, An Act to establish the cultural safety approach within the health and social services network:

(Division No. 368)

YEAS - 80

| | | | |
|-------------------------|--------------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|
| Abou-Khalil (CAQ) | Champagne Jourdain (CAQ) | Jeannotte (CAQ) | Paradis (PQ) |
| Allaire (CAQ) | Charest (CAQ) | Jolin-Barrette (CAQ) | Picard (CAQ) |
| Arseneau (PQ) | Charette (CAQ) | Julien (CAQ) | Poulet (CAQ) |
| Asselin (CAQ) | Chassin (IND) | Lachance (CAQ) | Proulx (CAQ) |
| Bachand (CAQ) | Déry (CAQ) | Laforest (CAQ) | Reid (CAQ) |
| Bélanger (CAQ) | Dionne (CAQ) | Laframboise (CAQ) | Rivest (CAQ) |
| (Orford) | Dorismond (CAQ) | Lafrenière (CAQ) | Roberge (CAQ) |
| Bélanger (CAQ) | Dubé (CAQ) | Lamontagne (CAQ) | Rouleau (CAQ) |
| (Prévost) | Dufour (CAQ) | Lamothe (CAQ) | Roy (CAQ) |
| Bernard (CAQ) | (Abitibi-Est) | LeBel (CAQ) | Sainte-Croix (CAQ) |
| Bérubé (PQ) | Duranceau (CAQ) | Lecours (CAQ) | Schmaltz (CAQ) |
| Biron (CAQ) | Émond (CAQ) | (Les Plaines) | Schneeberger (CAQ) |
| Blais (CAQ) | Gagnon (CAQ) | Lecours (CAQ) | Simard (CAQ) |
| Blanchette Vézina (CAQ) | Girard (CAQ) | (Lotbinière-Frontenac) | Skeete (CAQ) |
| Blouin (CAQ) | (Lac-Saint-Jean) | Legault (CAQ) | St-Louis (CAQ) |
| Bogemans (CAQ) | Girard (CAQ) | Lemay (CAQ) | St-Pierre Plamondon (PQ) |
| Boivin Roy (CAQ) | (Groulx) | Lemieux (CAQ) | Tardif (CAQ) |
| Bonnardel (CAQ) | Grondin (CAQ) | Lévesque (CAQ) | Thouin (CAQ) |
| Boulet (CAQ) | Guilbault (CAQ) | (Chauveau) | Tremblay (CAQ) |
| Bussière (CAQ) | Guillemette (CAQ) | Lévesque (CAQ) | (Hull) |
| Caire (CAQ) | Haytayan (CAQ) | (Chapleau) | Tremblay (CAQ) |
| Carmant (CAQ) | Hébert (CAQ) | Malette (CAQ) | (Dubuc) |
| Caron (CAQ) | Jacques (CAQ) | Martel (CAQ) | |
| (Portneuf) | | | |

NAYS - 27

| | | | |
|--------------------|------------------------|-----------------|------------------|
| Beauchemin (QLP) | Fontecilla (QS) | Maccarone (QLP) | Rotiroti (QLP) |
| Cadet (QLP) | Fortin (QLP) | Marissal (QS) | Setlakwe (QLP) |
| Caron (QLP) | Garceau (QLP) | Massé (QS) | Tanguay (QLP) |
| (La Pinière) | Ghazal (QS) | McGraw (QLP) | Zaga Mendez (QS) |
| Ciccone (QLP) | Grandmont (QS) | Morin (QLP) | Zanetti (QS) |
| Cliche-Rivard (QS) | Labrie (QS) | Nichols (IND) | |
| Dufour (QLP) | Lakhoyan Olivier (QLP) | Prass (QLP) | |
| (Mille-Îles) | Leduc (QS) | Rizqy (QLP) | |

5 December 2024

On the motion moved by Ms. Garceau (Robert-Baldwin), together with Ms. Ghazal (Mercier), Mr. St-Pierre Plamondon, Leader of the Third Opposition Group, Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil) and Mr. Chassin (Saint-Jérôme):

(Division No. 369)

YEAS - 106

| | | | |
|-----------------------------|--------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Abou-Khalil (CAQ) | Chassin (IND) | Jolin-Barrette (CAQ) | Nichols (IND) |
| Allaire (CAQ) | Ciccone (QLP) | Julien (CAQ) | Paradis (PQ) |
| Arseneau (PQ) | Cliche-Rivard (QS) | Labrie (QS) | Picard (CAQ) |
| Asselin (CAQ) | Déry (CAQ) | Lachance (CAQ) | Poulet (CAQ) |
| Bachand (CAQ) | Dionne (CAQ) | Laforest (CAQ) | Prass (QLP) |
| Beauchemin (QLP) | Dorismond (CAQ) | Laframboise (CAQ) | Proulx (CAQ) |
| Bélanger (CAQ) (Prévost) | Dubé (CAQ) | Lafrenière (CAQ) | Reid (CAQ) |
| | Dufour (CAQ) | Lakhoyan Olivier (QLP) | Rivest (CAQ) |
| Bélanger (CAQ) (Orford) | (Abitibi-Est) | Lamontagne (CAQ) | Rizqy (QLP) |
| Bernard (CAQ) | Dufour (QLP) | Lamothe (CAQ) | Roberge (CAQ) |
| Bérubé (PQ) | (Mille-Îles) | LeBel (CAQ) | Rotiroti (QLP) |
| Biron (CAQ) | Duranceau (CAQ) | Lecours (CAQ) | Rouleau (CAQ) |
| Blais (CAQ) | Émond (CAQ) | (Les Plaines) | Roy (CAQ) |
| Blanchette Vézina (CAQ) | Fontecilla (QS) | Lecours (CAQ) | Sainte-Croix (CAQ) |
| | Fortin (QLP) | (Lotbinière-Frontenac) | Schmaltz (CAQ) |
| Blouin (CAQ) | Gagnon (CAQ) | Leduc (QS) | Schneeberger (CAQ) |
| Bogemans (CAQ) | Garceau (QLP) | Legault (CAQ) | Setlakwe (QLP) |
| Bonnardel (CAQ) | Ghazal (QS) | Lemay (CAQ) | Simard (CAQ) |
| Boulet (CAQ) | Girard (CAQ) | Lemieux (CAQ) | Skeete (CAQ) |
| Bussière (CAQ) | (Groulx) | Lévesque (CAQ) | St-Louis (CAQ) |
| Cadet (QLP) | Girard (CAQ) | (Chapleau) | St-Pierre Plamondon (PQ) |
| Caire (CAQ) | (Lac-Saint-Jean) | Lévesque (CAQ) | Tanguay (QLP) |
| Carmant (CAQ) | Grandmont (QS) | (Chauveau) | Tardif (CAQ) |
| Caron (CAQ) (Portneuf) | Groncin (CAQ) | Maccarone (QLP) | Thouin (CAQ) |
| Caron (QLP) (La Pinière) | Guilbault (CAQ) | Mallette (CAQ) | Tremblay (CAQ) |
| Champagne Jourdain (CAQ) | Guillemette (CAQ) | Marissal (QS) | (Dubuc) |
| | Haytayan (CAQ) | Martel (CAQ) | Tremblay (CAQ) |
| Charest (CAQ) | Hébert (CAQ) | Massé (QS) | (Hull) |
| Charette (CAQ) | Jacques (CAQ) | McGraw (QLP) | Zaga Mendez (QS) |
| | Jeannotte (CAQ) | Morin (QLP) | Zanetti (QS) |

5 December 2024

On the motion moved by Ms. Ghazal (Mercier), together with Mr. Legault, Premier, Ms. Garceau (Robert-Baldwin), Ms. Nichols (Vaudreuil) and Mr. Chassin (Saint-Jérôme):

(Division No. 370)

YEAS - 107

| | | | |
|--------------------------|--------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|
| Abou-Khalil (CAQ) | Charette (CAQ) | Jolin-Barrette (CAQ) | Picard (CAQ) |
| Allaire (CAQ) | Chassin (IND) | Julien (CAQ) | Poulet (CAQ) |
| Arseneau (PQ) | Cicccone (QLP) | Labrie (QS) | Prass (QLP) |
| Asselin (CAQ) | Cliche-Rivard (QS) | Laforest (CAQ) | Proulx (CAQ) |
| Bachand (CAQ) | Déry (CAQ) | Laframboise (CAQ) | Reid (CAQ) |
| Beauchemin (QLP) | Dionne (CAQ) | Lafrenière (CAQ) | Rivest (CAQ) |
| Bélanger (CAQ) | Dorismond (CAQ) | Lakhoyan Olivier (QLP) | Rizqy (QLP) |
| (Prévost) | Dubé (CAQ) | Lamontagne (CAQ) | Roberge (CAQ) |
| Bélanger (CAQ) | Dufour (CAQ) | Lamothe (CAQ) | Rotiroti (QLP) |
| (Orford) | (Abitibi-Est) | LeBel (CAQ) | Rouleau (CAQ) |
| Benjamin (QLP) | Dufour (QLP) | Lecours (CAQ) | Roy (CAQ) |
| Bernard (CAQ) | (Mille-Îles) | (Les Plaines) | Sainte-Croix (CAQ) |
| Bérubé (PQ) | Duranceau (CAQ) | Lecours (CAQ) | Schmaltz (CAQ) |
| Biron (CAQ) | Émond (CAQ) | (Lotbinière-Frontenac) | Schneeberger (CAQ) |
| Blais (CAQ) | Fontecilla (QS) | Leduc (QS) | Setlakwe (QLP) |
| Blanchette Vézina (CAQ) | Fortin (QLP) | Legault (CAQ) | Simard (CAQ) |
| Blouin (CAQ) | Gagnon (CAQ) | Lemay (CAQ) | Skeete (CAQ) |
| Bogemans (CAQ) | Garceau (QLP) | Lemieux (CAQ) | St-Louis (CAQ) |
| Boivin Roy (CAQ) | Ghazal (QS) | Lévesque (CAQ) | St-Pierre Plamondon (PQ) |
| Bonnardel (CAQ) | Girard (CAQ) | (Chapleau) | Tanguay (QLP) |
| Boulet (CAQ) | (Groulx) | Lévesque (CAQ) | Tardif (CAQ) |
| Bussière (CAQ) | Girard (CAQ) | (Chauveau) | Thouin (CAQ) |
| Cadet (QLP) | (Lac-Saint-Jean) | Maccarone (QLP) | Tremblay (CAQ) |
| Caire (CAQ) | Grandmont (QS) | Malette (CAQ) | (Dubuc) |
| Carmant (CAQ) | Grondin (CAQ) | Marissal (QS) | Tremblay (CAQ) |
| Caron (CAQ) | Guilbault (CAQ) | Martel (CAQ) | (Hull) |
| (Portneuf) | Guillemette (CAQ) | Massé (QS) | Zaga Mendez (QS) |
| Caron (QLP) | Haytayan (CAQ) | McGraw (QLP) | Zanetti (QS) |
| (La Pinière) | Hébert (CAQ) | Morin (QLP) | |
| Champagne Jourdain (CAQ) | Jacques (CAQ) | Nichols (IND) | |
| Charest (CAQ) | Jeannotte (CAQ) | Paradis (PQ) | |