



NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

SECOND SESSION

THIRTY-FIFTH LEGISLATURE

Votes and Proceedings

of the Assembly

Thursday, 4 April 1996— No. 7

**President of the National Assembly:
Mr. Jean-Pierre Charbonneau**

QUÉBEC

Thursday, 4 April 1996

No. 7

The Assembly was called to order at 2.03 o'clock p.m.

Moment of reflection

ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS

Introduction of Bills

Mrs. Carrier-Perreault, Minister for Mines, Lands and Forests, on behalf of Mr. Chevrete, Minister of Natural Resources, moved that leave be granted to introduce the following Bill:

- 4 An Act to amend the Forest Act and other legislative provisions.

The motion was carried.

Presenting Papers

Mr. Bouchard, Prime Minister, tabled the following:

The report, dated 2 April 1996, prepared by the working group under the supervision of the

Secretary General of the Ministère du Conseil exécutif, on dual remuneration.
(Sessional Paper No. 39-960404)

Mrs. Harel, Minister of Income Security, tabled the following:

The annual report of the Cree Hunters and Trappers Income Security Board for the fiscal year ended 30 June 1995 (French, English and Cree versions).
(Sessional Paper No. 40-960404)

Mr. Bertrand, Minister for Revenue, tabled the following:

The state of the remission of taxes, duties and penalties granted under section 94 of the *Act respecting the Ministère du Revenu*, from 29 November 1994 to 24 March 1996.
(Sessional Paper No. 41-960404)

Presenting Petitions

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 62 to 64, Mr. Marsan (Robert-Baldwin) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition respecting the mission of Grace Dart Hospital Centre and signed by 2826 residents, friends and neighbours of that hospital.
(Sessional Paper No. 42-960404)

Oral Questions and Answers

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

4 April 1996

Notices of Proceedings in Committees

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 53, the Assembly took Notices of Proceedings in Committees.

Mr. Bélanger, Government House Leader, convened the following Committee:

- X the Committee on the Budget and Administration, to give clause-by-clause consideration to Bill 118, An Act to amend the Act respecting government services to departments and public bodies.

And, by leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 53 and 285, Mr. Bélanger convened the following Committees for the consideration of the Estimates of Expenditure:

- X the Committee on Labour and the Economy, for those of the Mines and Lands programmes;
- X the Committee on Culture, for those of the Commission d'accès à l'information;
- X the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, for those of Fisheries and Agriculture.

Motions Without Notice

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 59, Mr. Farrah, Chief Opposition Whip, tabled:

The modified list of members of the Standing Committees of the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition.

(Sessional Paper No. 43-960404)

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 127, Mr. Farrah (Îles-de-la-Madeleine) then moved:

4 April 1996

THAT this list be approved.

The motion was carried.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 127, Mr. Jolivet, Chief Government Whip, moved:

THAT the composition of the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries and Food be modified by adding a Member, namely the Member for Rousseau, Mr. Lévis Brien, and that, accordingly, the numerical composition of the parliamentary group forming the Government in this Committee be of ten members henceforth.

By leave of the Assembly under Standing Order 84, the motion was carried.

Mr. Rochon, Minister of Health and Social Services, moved a motion concerning World Health Day; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

Mr. Poulin (Beauce-Nord) moved a motion concerning the results of the referendum held on 30 October 1995; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

Mr. Julien, Minister of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, moved:

THAT the National Assembly of Québec mark the extraordinary concerted efforts made by over one hundred partners of the fisheries sector on the occasion of the Forum on fisheries which took place in Gaspé, last 1 and 2 April.

By leave of the Assembly under Standing Order 84, a debate arose thereon.

4 April 1996

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

Mr. Fillion (Montmorency) moved a motion concerning the research budgets granted to Members; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

Information on the Proceedings of the Assembly

Mr. President informed the Assembly that, subject to the conditions that will be specified regarding the consideration of the Estimates, on Friday, 19 April 1996, Mr. Williams (Nelligan) would question Mr. Bertrand, Minister for Revenue, during an interpellation on "reassessment with respect to research and development projects".

He then convened a meeting of the House Leaders of the parliamentary groups in order to specify how the consideration of the Estimates of Expenditure is to be proceeded with.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Business Having Precedence

Opening Speech Debate of the Session

The Assembly resumed the debate on the Opening Speech of the Session, delivered by Mr. Bouchard, Prime Minister, at the sitting of Monday, 25 March 1996, and on the want of

4 April 1996

confidence motions moved by Mr. Johnson, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Middlemiss (Pontiac), Mr. Copeman (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce), Mr. Chagnon (Westmount—Saint-Louis), Mr. Williams (Nelligan), Mrs. Frulla (Marguerite-Bourgeoys) and Mr. Bordeleau (Acadie).

At the end of his speech, Mr. Fournier (Châteauguay) moved the following want of confidence motion:

THAT the National Assembly condemn the Parti Québécois Government and its leader for their persistent refusal to establish a select committee to shed light fully on the political responsibility of the members of the Cabinet regarding the granting of certain contracts by the Secrétariat à la restructuration.

And debate continuing on the Opening Speech of the Session and on the want of confidence motions;

At the end of his speech, Mr. Filion (Montmorency) moved the following want of confidence motion:

THAT this Assembly blame the Parti Québécois Government for its lack of transparency regarding the management of public funds by granting, amongst other things, a research budget of \$67,500 to the Member for Rivière-du-Loup in comparison to \$11,500 for all other Members of this Assembly.

And debate continuing on the Opening Speech of the Session and on the want of confidence motions;

At the end of her speech, Mrs. Gagnon-Tremblay (Saint-François) moved the following want of confidence motion:

THAT the National Assembly blame the Parti Québécois Government for having concealed from the taxpayers the new taxes they will have to pay following the expenditure budget of Prime Minister Bouchard.

And debate continuing on the Opening Speech of the Session and on the want of confidence motions;

4 April 1996

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 20, the debate continued beyond 6.00 o'clock p.m.

And debate continuing on the Opening Speech of the Session and on the want of confidence motions;

Following the meeting with the House Leaders of the parliamentary groups, Mr. President informed the Assembly that the consideration of the Estimates would begin on Tuesday, 16 April 1996, and that, by leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 282, it would continue until Tuesday, 30 April 1996, according to the schedule agreed to.

If necessary, Mr. President will, at the request of a House Leader, reconvene the House Leaders to make additional arrangements. Upon conclusion of the consideration of the Estimates for the Ministries, a sitting of the Committee of the Whole will be set aside for the consideration of the Estimates of the National Assembly, for not more than three hours.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 282, the interpellation previously announced between the Member for Nelligan and the Minister for Revenue regarding the reassessment with respect to research and development projects will be held, as scheduled, on Friday, 19 April 1996.

And debate continuing on the Opening Speech of the Session and on the want of confidence motions;

At the end of her speech, Mrs. Houda-Pepin (La Pinière) moved the following want of confidence motion:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Government of the Parti Québécois and more specifically its leader, who approved new concealed taxes to be defrayed by taxpayers by allowing Hydro-Québec to increase its residential rate by 2.5 % and to claim fees, beginning 1 May 1996, for services previously offered free of charge, well before the Crown corporation had reorganized its management.

And debate continuing on the Opening Speech of the Session and on the want of confidence

4 April 1996

motions;

At the end of his speech, Mr. Paradis, Official Opposition House Leader, moved the following want of confidence motion:

THAT the National Assembly condemn the Parti Québécois Government and its leader, who, by their attitude, systematically refuse to accept and to respect the democratic vote of Quebeckers on 30 October last, thus leaving Québec in a state of political and economic instability and uncertainty.

The debate concluded with the reply by Mr. Bouchard, Prime Minister.

The question was then put by the President on the want of confidence motions moved during the debate on the Opening Speech of the Session; recorded divisions were thereupon demanded.

The Assembly first took the division on the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Johnson, Leader of the Official Opposition. This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly condemn the Government of the Parti Québécois for the lack of concrete measures to revitalize employment and the economy of Québec and for the lack of priority actions for Quebeckers.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

Yeas: **31** Nays: **62** Abstentions: **0**

(Division No. 4 in Appendix)

The Assembly then took the division on the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Middlemiss (Pontiac). This motion reads as follows:

THAT this Assembly severely blame the Parti Québécois Government, more particularly the Minister of Transport, who is encouraging the dilapidation of the

4 April 1996

road network by cutting millions of dollars from the budget of the Ministry of Transport, which risks imperilling the safety of Québec motorists as well as the economic development of Québec and its regions.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

Yeas: **31** Nays: **62** Abstentions: **0**

(Division No. 5 in Appendix)

Next, the Assembly took the division on the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Copeman (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce). This motion reads as follows:

THAT this Assembly blame the Parti Québécois Government for having sown the seeds of uncertainty and insecurity amongst handicapped persons who are on social welfare, by acting inconsistently regarding the transfer of the cases of welfare recipients deemed "unable to work" to the Ministry of Health and Social Services.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

Yeas: **31** Nays: **62** Abstentions: **0**

(Division No. 6 in Appendix)

The Assembly then took the division on the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Chagnon (Westmount—Saint-Louis). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly blame the Parti Québécois Government for the total lack of consistency between the Opening Speech and the Estimates tabled last week.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

4 April 1996

Yeas: **31** Nays: **62** Abstentions: **0**

(Division No. 7 in Appendix)

The Assembly then took the division on the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Williams (Nelligan). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly blame the Parti Québécois Government for its failure to act and its want of foresight and for the lack of concrete programmes, specifically with regard to the underground economy, to provide Quebecers with a fair and balanced fiscal system.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

Yeas: **31** Nays: **62** Abstentions: **0**

(Division No. 8 in Appendix)

The Assembly took the division on the want of confidence motion moved by Mrs. Frulla (Marguerite-Bourgeoys). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly deplore the lack of foresight and denounce the absence of concrete measures, in the Opening Speech and in the 1996-97 Estimates of the Government of Québec, to encourage job creation and the social and economic development of the greater Montréal region.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

Yeas: **31** Nays: **62** Abstentions: **0**

(Division No. 9 in Appendix)

The Assembly then took the division on the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Bordeleau (Acadie). This motion reads as follows:

4 April 1996

THAT this Assembly condemn the Government for having set aside, on several occasions, the usual rules of allocation of government contracts in the Le Hir case, having thus kept the population of Québec from obtaining a clear picture with regard to the administration of public funds.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

Yeas: **31** Nays: **62** Abstentions: **0**

(Division No. 10 in Appendix)

The Assembly then took the division on the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Fournier (Châteauguay). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly condemn the Parti Québécois Government and its leader for their persistent refusal to establish a select committee to shed light fully on the political responsibility of the members of the Cabinet regarding the granting of certain contracts by the Secrétariat à la restructuration.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

Yeas: **31** Nays: **62** Abstentions: **0**

(Division No. 11 in Appendix)

—————

The Assembly then took the division on the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Filion (Montmorency). This motion reads as follows:

THAT this Assembly blame the Parti Québécois Government for its lack of transparency regarding the management of public funds by granting, amongst other things, a research budget of \$67,500 to the Member for Rivière-du-Loup in comparison to \$11,500 for all other Members of this Assembly.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

Yeas: **32** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

4 April 1996

(Division No. 12 in Appendix)

The Assembly then took the division on the want of confidence motion moved by Mrs. Gagnon-Tremblay (Saint-François). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly blame the Parti Québécois Government for having concealed from the taxpayers the new taxes they will have to pay following the expenditure budget of Prime Minister Bouchard.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

Yeas: **32** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

(Division No. 13 in Appendix)

The Assembly then took the division on the want of confidence motion moved by Mrs. Houda-Pepin (La Pinière). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Government of the Parti Québécois and more specifically its leader, who approved new concealed taxes to be defrayed by taxpayers by allowing Hydro-Québec to increase its residential rate by 2.5 % and to claim fees, beginning 1 May 1996, for services previously offered free of charge, well before the Crown corporation had reorganized its management.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

Yeas: **32** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

(Division No. 14 in Appendix)

Finally, the Assembly took the division on the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Paradis, Official Opposition House Leader. This motion reads as follows:

4 April 1996

4 April 1996

THAT the National Assembly condemn the Parti Québécois Government and its leader, who, by their attitude, systematically refuse to accept and to respect the democratic vote of Quebecers on 30 October last, thus leaving Québec in a state of political and economic instability and uncertainty.

The motion was negatived on the following vote:

Yeas: **31** Nays: **62** Abstentions: **0**

(Division No. 15 in Appendix)

Debates Upon Adjournment

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 309, the Assembly held the debate upon adjournment, previously announced, between Mr. Fournier (Châteauguay) and Mr. Léonard, Minister for Administration and the Public Service, Chairman of the Conseil du Trésor, on behalf of Mr. Bouchard, Prime Minister, about the report of the Auditor General on the contracts granted by the Secrétariat à la restructuration.

At 8.53 o'clock p.m., on the motion by Mr. Bélanger, Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned until Tuesday, 16 April 1996, at 2.00 o'clock p.m.

JEAN-PIERRE CHARBONNEAU

President

4 April 1996

APPENDIX

Recorded Divisions

On the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Johnson, Leader of the Official Opposition:

(Division No. 4)

YEAS - 31

Bélanger (<i>Mégantic-Compton</i>)	Gagnon-Tremblay	Maciocia	Sirroos
Bissonnet	Gautrin	MacMillan	Thérien
Chagnon	Gauvin	Marsan	Vaive
Cusano	Houda-Pepin	Middlemiss	Vallières
Delisle	Johnson	Mulcair	Williams
Dionne	Kelley	Ouimet	
Farrah	Lafrenière	Paradis	
Fournier	Lefebvre	Parent	
	Loiselle	Poulin	

NAYS - 62

Barbeau	Boisclair	Dion	Laprise
Baril	Bouchard	Dionne-Marsolais	Laurin
(<i>Berthier</i>)	Boucher	Doyer	Léonard
Beaudoin	Boulerice	Facal	Létourneau
Beaulne	Bourdon	Filion	Malavoy
Beaumier	Brassard	Gagnon	Marois
Bégin	Brien	Gaulin	Morin
Bélanger	Campeau	Gendron	(<i>Nicolet-Yamaska</i>)
(<i>Anjou</i>)	Caron	Harel	Paillé
Bertrand	Carrier-Perreault	Jolivet	Paquin
(<i>Charlevoix</i>)	Charest	Julien	Paré
Bertrand	Cliche	Jutras	Payne
(<i>Portneuf</i>)	Côté	Lachance	Pelletier
Blackburn	Désilets	Landry	Perreault
Blais	Deslières	(<i>Bonaventure</i>)	Perron

4 April 1996

Rioux
Robert
Rochon

Signori
Simard
(*La Prairie*)

Simard
(*Richelieu*)
Trudel

Vermette

ABSTENTIONS - 0

On the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Middlemiss (Pontiac):

(Division No. 5)

(*Identical to Division No. 4*)

On the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Copeman (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce):

(Division No. 6)

(*Identical to Division No. 4*)

On the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Chagnon (Westmount–Saint-Louis):

(Division No. 7)

(*Identical to Division No. 4*)

On the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Williams (Nelligan):

(Division No. 8)

4 April 1996

(Identical to Division No. 4)

On the want of confidence motion moved by Mrs. Frulla (Marguerite-Bourgeoys):

(Division No. 9)

(Identical to Division No. 4)

On the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Bordeleau (Acadie):

(Division No. 10)

(Identical to Division No. 4)

On the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Fournier (Châteauguay):

(Division No. 11)

(Identical to Division No. 4)

On the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Filion (Montmorency):

(Division No. 12)

YEAS - 32

Bélanger	Farrah	Johnson	Marsan
(<i>Mégantic-Compton</i>)	Filion	Kelley	Middlemiss
Bissonnet	Fournier	Lafrenière	Mulcair
Chagnon	Gagnon-Tremblay	Lefebvre	Ouimet
Cusano	Gautrin	Loiselle	Paradis
Delisle	Gauvin	Maciocia	Parent
Dionne	Houda-Pepin	MacMillan	Poulin

4 April 1996

Sirros
Thérien
Vaive
Vallières
Williams

4 April 1996

NAYS - 61

Barbeau	Boulerice	Gendron	Paré
Baril	Bourdon	Harel	Payne
(Berthier)	Brassard	Jolivet	Pelletier
Beaudoin	Brien	Julien	Perreault
Beaulne	Campeau	Jutras	Perron
Beaumier	Caron	Lachance	Rioux
Bégin	Carrier-Perreault	Landry	Robert
Bélanger	Charest	(Bonaventure)	Rochon
(Anjou)	Cliche	Laprise	Signori
Bertrand	Côté	Laurin	Simard
(Charlevoix)	Désilets	Léonard	(La Prairie)
Bertrand	Deslières	Létourneau	Simard
(Portneuf)	Dion	Malavoy	(Richelieu)
Blackburn	Dionne-Marsolais	Marois	Trudel
Blais	Doyer	Morin	Vermette
Boisclair	Facal	(Nicolet-Yamaska)	
Bouchard	Gagnon	Paillé	
Boucher	Gaulin	Paquin	

ABSTENTIONS - 0

On the want of confidence motion moved by Mrs. Gagnon-Tremblay (Saint-François):

(Division No. 13)

(Identical to Division No. 12)

On the want of confidence motion moved by Mrs. Houda-Pepin (La Pinière):

(Division No. 14)

(Identical to Division No. 12)

4 April 1996

On the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Paradis, Official Opposition House Leader:

(Division No. 15)

(Identical to Division No. 4)