

SECOND SESSION

THIRTY-FIFTH LEGISLATURE

# **Votes and Proceedings**

of the Assembly

Thursday, 10 April 1997 — No. 87

President of the National Assembly: Mr. Jean-Pierre Charbonneau

**QUÉBEC** 

Thursday, 10 April 1997 No. 87
The Assembly was called to order at 10.09 o'clock a.m.
ORDERS OF THE DAY
Government Bills
Passage
Mr. Brassard, Minister for Canadian Intergovernmental Affairs, moved the passage of Bill 15, An Act respecting the implementation of the Agreement on Internal Trade.
After debate thereon, the motion was carried and, accordingly, Bill 15 was passed.

The Assembly took into consideration the report from the Committee on Labour and the Economy on its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 88, An Act to amend the Act respecting labour standards as regards annual and parental leave.

The report was concurred in.

Report Stage

## Passage

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 230, Mr. Rioux, Minister of Labour, moved the passage of Bill 88, An Act to amend the Act respecting labour standards as regards annual and parental leave.

After debate thereon, the motion was carried and, accordingly, Bill 88 was passed.

## Passage in Principle

Resuming the debate on the motion by Mr. Rioux, Minister of Labour, —That Bill 96, An Act to amend the Act respecting labour standards as regards the duration of a regular work week, do now pass in principle;

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried and Bill 96 was accordingly passed in principle.

On motion by Mr. Brassard, Deputy Government House Leader, Bill 96 was referred for clause-by-clause consideration to the Committee on Labour and the Economy.

\_\_\_\_

Resuming the debate on the motion by Mr. Bégin, Minister of Justice, —That Bill 89, An Act respecting the implementation of the Act respecting administrative justice, do now pass in principle;

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried on division and Bill 89 was accordingly passed in principle.

On motion by Mr. Brassard, Deputy Government House Leader, Bill 89 was referred for clause-by-clause consideration to the Committee on Institutions.

\_\_\_\_\_

At 11.50 o'clock a.m., Mr. Brouillet, Vice-President, having left the Chair, the proceedings were suspended until 2.00 o'clock p.m.

The proceedings resumed at 2.11 o'clock p.m.

\_\_\_\_\_

Moment of reflection

Mr. President communicated to the Assembly and tabled the following:

The document entitled "Proposition de modifications au Règlement et aux Règles de fonctionnement de l=Assemblée nationale" (Proposed amendments to the Standing Orders and to the Rules for the Conduct of Proceedings of the National Assembly).

(Sessional Paper No. 760-970410)

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 116 and 188, Mr. Brouillet, Vice-President, then moved:

THAT the Standing Orders of the National Assembly be amended:

- by replacing Standing Orders 116, 118, 120, 121, 122, 126, 128, 132, 272, 275 and 292 and by replacing sections 4.1, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27, 28, 30 and 31 of the Rules for the Conduct of Proceedings by the Standing Orders and sections contained in the document entitled "Proposition de modifications au Règlement et aux Règles de fonctionnement de l=Assemblée nationale" (Proposed amendments to the Standing Orders and to the Rules for the Conduct of Proceedings of the National Assembly) tabled by the President today in the National Assembly;
- by adding, to the Standing Orders, Section 1.1 to Chapter III of Title I,

Chapter II.1 to Title V, Standing Orders 117.1, 117.2, 117.3, 117.4, 117.5, 117.6, 117.7, 117.8 and 294.1, and, to the Rules for the Conduct of Proceedings, sections 1.1 and 1.2, which are also contained in the aforementioned document;

- by repealing Standing Orders 123 and 293;

THAT these new Standing Orders be effective immediately the present motion is carried and remain in effect until Wednesday, 22 October 1997, notwithstanding the prorogation of the session;

THAT these new Standing Orders be included in the Votes and Proceedings as a constituent of the present motion:

**116.** In addition to such other duties as may be conferred upon it by statute and in these Standing Orders, this committee shall:

- (1) draft the Standing Orders and the Rules for the Conduct of Proceedings in the Assembly and its committees and submit them to the Assembly for its approval;
- (2) coordinate the proceedings of the other committees, in particular by naming the committee before which some public agency shall be answerable and, where necessary, by clarifying the terms of reference of each committee;
- (3) authorize committees to meet in a place other than the Parliament Building;
- (4) consider any matter not expressly referred to some other committee.

# SECTION 1.1 COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION

- **117.1.** The Committee on Public Administration shall consist of:
- (1) ten permanent members, who shall be apportioned as follows:

- (a) six Members from the parliamentary group forming the Government;
- (b) four Members sitting in opposition, not fewer than three of whom shall be Members from the Official Opposition; and
- (2) eight temporary members, who shall be apportioned as follows:
  - (a) five Members from the parliamentary group forming the Government;
  - (b) three Members from the Official Opposition.
- **117.2.** The permanent members of this committee shall be appointed by the Committee on the National Assembly as provided in Standing Order 127; and they shall serve on the committee for two years.

The temporary members of this committee shall be designated by the whips of their respective parliamentary groups, who shall further specify whether each such member is to serve on the committee throughout the proceedings with respect to some particular matter or for a single meeting.

- **117.3.** The temporary members of this committee may take part in all its proceedings, but they may not vote.
- **117.4.** Any independent Member or Member from a parliamentary group sitting in opposition other than the Official Opposition may take part in the proceedings of this committee; but he may not vote or move any motion.
- 117.5. The committee shall, at the opening of the first session of every Legislature and, as the necessity may arise, during the course of a Legislature, elect one of its permanent members to be chairman and another to be vice-chairman; and they shall hold office for two years:

Provided that the chairman shall be chosen among the Members from the Official Opposition, and the vice-chairman shall be chosen among those from the

parliamentary group forming the Government.

#### **117.6.** This committee shall:

- (1) examine the financial commitments;
- (2) examine the auditor general every year with respect to his annual report;
- (3) hear each minister who deems it expedient to be so heard and each deputy minister or the chief executive officer of every public agency, as the case may be, at least once in every year in order to discuss their administrative management and such other administrative matters falling within the terms of reference of these ministries or agencies as shall have been noted in a report from the auditor general or the public protector, pursuant to *An Act respecting the accountability of deputy ministers and chief executive officers of public bodies*; and
- (4) examine any other matter that the Assembly may refer to it.
- 117.7. Unless it is to consider some matter referred to it by the Assembly, this committee shall meet upon notice that its clerk shall send to the members thereof at the request of its chairman. Such notice shall state the purpose, the day, the time, and the place of the meeting, and copies thereof shall be sent to the President, to the chairmen of the other committees, and to the House leaders and the whips of the parliamentary groups.
- **117.8.** The quorum of this committee shall be one third of the number of its permanent members, including its chairman.

The quorum of any subcommittee thereof shall be a majority of its permanent members, including its chairman.

**118.** In addition to the Committee on the National Assembly and the Committee on Public Administration, there shall be nine standing committees of the

Assembly, whose names and terms of reference shall be as follows:

(1) the Committee on Institutions:

The chairmanship of the Conseil exécutif, justice, public security, intergovernmental relations, and the Constitution;

(2) the Committee on Public Finance:

Finance, the budget, the public accounts, the public administration, the public service, and supply and services;

(3) the Committee on Social Affairs:

The family, health, social and community services, the status of women, and income security;

(4) the Committee on Labour and the Economy:

Industry, trade, tourism, labour, science, technology, energy and resources, and manpower;

(5) the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries, and Food:

Agriculture, fisheries, and food;

(6) the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain:

Local communities, municipal planning, housing, and recreation;

(7) the Committee on Education:

Education, vocational training, and consumer protection;

(8) the Committee on Culture:

Culture, communications, cultural communities, immigration, and relations with the citizenry;

(9) the Committee on Transportation and the Environment:

Transportation, public works, the environment, and wildlife.

- **120.** The said committees shall have power, without special reference from the Assembly, to initiate examinations of the following matters:
  - (1) draft regulations and regulations;
  - (2) the orientation, activities, and management of public agencies;
  - (3) any other matter that may be of public interest.
- **121.** Every committee shall consist of ten Members, who shall be appointed for two years and be apportioned as follows:
  - (1) six Members from the parliamentary group forming the Government; and
  - (2) four Members from the Official Opposition.
- **122.** Notwithstanding Standing Order 121, any independent Member or Member from a parliamentary group sitting in opposition other than the Official Opposition may be appointed to serve as a member of a committee; and such committee shall accordingly consist of twelve members, who shall be apportioned as follows:
  - (1) seven Members from the parliamentary group forming the Government;
  - (2) four Members from the Official Opposition; and
  - (3) one Member from a parliamentary group sitting in opposition other than the Official Opposition or one independent Member.

Standing Order 123 is repealed.

- **126.** Six committees shall be chaired by Members from the parliamentary group forming the Government and three shall be chaired by Members sitting in opposition.
- **128.** Failing consensus on the manner in which the chairmanships of the several committees are to be allocated, the parliamentary groups shall select the committees they wish to be chaired by one of their own Members in the following sequence:

First choice: group forming the Government;

Second choice: group forming the Government;

Third choice: Official Opposition;

Fourth choice: group forming the Government;

Fifth choice: Official Opposition;

Sixth choice: group forming the Government;

Seventh choice: group sitting in opposition other than the Official Opposition, if there be any;

Eighth choice: group forming the Government;

Ninth choice: group forming the Government.

**132.** A Member who has not been appointed to serve on some committee of the Assembly may take part in the proceedings of any of its committees; but he may not vote therein.

A Member who has been appointed to serve on some committee of the Assembly may take part in the proceedings of any other committee, by its leave; but he may not vote or move any motion therein:

Provided that leave shall not be required when such committee is to consider estimates of expenditure.

- **272.** The budget speech, the comments by the Finance critics of the parliamentary groups in opposition, and the ensuing debate shall not exceed twenty-five hours, fifteen of which shall take place in the Assembly and ten of which shall take place in the Committee on Public Finance. The orders of the day for the budget speech and for the debate thereon in the Assembly shall have precedence.
- **275.** When all Members wishing to speak have been heard, or when thirteen hours and thirty minutes have elapsed since the Minister of Finance began the budget speech, the debate thereon shall be suspended in the Assembly, and it shall be resumed by the Committee on Public Finance not later than on the next sitting day. The Minister of Finance shall be a member of the said committee during its proceedings with respect to the budget speech.
- **292.** The Committee on Public Finance shall devote one meeting in each fiscal quarter to an examination of the Government's budgetary policy and the evolving state of the public finances.

Any meeting held by the said committee to resume the debate on the budget speech shall be deemed a quarterly meeting for the purposes of this Standing Order.

Standing Order **293** is repealed.

## Chapter II.I

#### PERSONS APPOINTED BY THE ASSEMBLY

**294.1.** The Committee on Institutions shall examine annually the chief electoral officer and the public protector.

\* \* \* \*

#### RULES FOR THE CONDUCT OF PROCEEDINGS IN COMMITTEES

**1.1.** The whip of each parliamentary group, or his representative, shall notify the clerk of the Committee on Public Administration of the members he has designated to serve on this committee for the proceedings with respect to some particular matter.

The clerk shall inform the committee of the members so designated as soon as the first meeting in respect of such matter is called to order.

**1.2.** The whip of each parliamentary group, or his representative, shall notify the clerk of the Committee on Public Administration of the members he has designated to serve on this committee for a single meeting.

The clerk shall inform the committee of the members so designated as soon as each meeting is called to order.

**4.1.** There shall be a steering committee of the Committee on the National Assembly, which shall consist of the President of the National Assembly, the House leaders of the parliamentary groups, and the clerk of the committee.

Between meetings of the Committee on the National Assembly the said steering committee shall:

- (a) authorize committees or steering committees to travel or to meet in a place other than the Parliament Building;
- (b) receive accounts from committees and steering committees respecting their travel:
- (c) approve the establishment of joint committees or subcommittees and appoint their co-chairmen;
- (d) fill vacancies and make permanent substitutions in committee memberships when the Assembly stands prorogued or adjourned for more than five days;

- (e) approve changes to the list of temporary chairmen;
- (f) adjust the budgetary envelope of the committees out of the budgetary reserve of the Committee on the National Assembly;
- (g) determine whether it is appropriate to televise the proceedings of committees:
- (h) designate, on behalf of the Committee on the National Assembly, the committee to which any matter that is to be examined in pursuance of statutory provisions shall be referred;
- (i) coordinate, in respect of calendars, timetables, meeting rooms, and resources, the proceedings of any committees that are to consider matters not having priority, and plan the proceedings of the Committee on the National Assembly.

\* \* \* \*

# RULES FOR THE CONDUCT OF PROCEEDINGS RESPECTING THE EXAMINATION OF FINANCIAL COMMITMENTS

- 17. The Committee on Public Administration shall examine all financial commitments equal to or exceeding \$25,000 that the Conseil du trésor, the Conseil exécutif, or any ministry has authorized within a financial management system.
  - **18.** The said committee shall not have power to examine the following:
  - (1) indemnities paid in respect of expropriations;
  - (2) expenditures of a confidential nature made for the collection of taxes and for national security;
  - (3) expenditures incurred in the conveyance of securities and cash and in the protection of government property where the public interest is

at stake;

- (4) expenditures relating to studies and inquiries undertaken to increase the efficiency of the administration where the public interest is at stake; and
- (5) expenditures relating to the appointment, remuneration, transfer, and retirement of public servants and government employees.
- **19.** The following categories of approvals shall likewise be excluded from the examination of the financial commitments by the said committee:
  - (1) transfers of appropriations;
  - (2) loans from the contingency fund;
  - (3) loan guarantees;
  - (4) a priori approvals.
- **20.** The said committee shall have power to select, in a deliberative meeting, such financial commitments as it may wish to examine in depth in the presence of a minister during a meeting held for this purpose.

In particular, it may choose to examine in depth those financial commitments that relate to such month or ministry as it may designate.

Any financial commitments that the committee may choose not to examine in depth shall be deemed to have been examined.

- **21.** During a deliberative meeting the said committee may determine:
- (1) the number of additional meetings it shall devote to the examination of financial commitments;
- (2) the order in which these commitments are to be examined;
- (3) the financial commitments it shall examine in depth in the presence of

#### a minister;

- (4) the time it shall allot to the examination of the financial commitments envisaged in paragraph (3) of this rule and the manner in which such time is to be allocated;
- (5) the minister in whose presence it wishes to examine in depth certain financial commitments;
- (6) the order of business for any such meeting:

Provided that no motion to the above effect shall be deemed carried unless a majority of the members from each parliamentary group shall have voted in its favour.

- **22.** The secretary of the Conseil du trésor shall, on the fifteenth day of every month, forward to the clerk of the said committee the list of the financial commitments.
- 23. The clerk of the said committee shall, not less than fifteen days before the committee is to hold a meeting for the examination of financial commitments, forward to the members thereof as well as to the House leaders, the whips, and the research services of the parliamentary groups the notice of convocation, the order of business for the meeting, and the financial commitments that are to be examined. He shall likewise forward to the chairmen of the other committees copies of the notice of convocation.

By leave of the committee without any dissentient voice, the notice of convocation, the order of business, and the financial commitments may be forwarded to the concerned parties upon shorter notice.

- **24.** When the said committee wishes to examine financial commitments in depth in the presence of some minister but cannot so notify him fifteen days before his presence is required, he may forgo the fifteen days' notice to which he is entitled under Standing Order 164.
- **25.** A minister who is unable to attend a meeting for the examination of financial commitments may ask another minister who is a member of the Conseil du

trésor to do so in his stead.

**26.** A minister shall have fifteen days in which to provide any information requested by the members of the said committee during the examination of financial commitments.

He shall send his replies to the clerk of the committee, who shall forward copies thereof to all committee members and to the research services of the parliamentary groups.

- **27.** Any request for information made by a member of the said committee may give rise to the production of papers, unless the minister is of the opinion that to produce such papers would be injurious to the public interest.
- **28.** Any member of the said committee may, during a meeting for the examination of financial commitments, ask that a minister provide supplementary information or papers relating to a financial commitment examined at an earlier such meeting.
- **30.** During the examination of financial commitments every member of the said committee may speak as often as he likes but in any case for not longer than twenty minutes.

The said speaking time shall apply to each financial commitment that the chairman shall call during a meeting to examine financial commitments.

**31.** The said committee, having concluded the examination of the financial commitments, shall lay upon the Table of the Assembly a report thereon.

Such report shall consist of the minutes of the committee's deliberative meetings and of its meetings for the examination of financial commitments; and it may contain such observations, conclusions, and recommendations as the committee may wish to make to the Assembly.

The question was put on this motion; a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 121 in Appendix)

Yeas: 83 Nays: 0 Abstentions: 0

## **ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

## **Presenting Petitions**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 63 and 64, the abstracts of three petitions respecting the maintaining of the choice between full-time and half-time kindergarten were laid upon the Table:

 the first, the abstract of a petition signed by 3005 citizens from the riding of Deux-Montagnes, by Mrs. Robert (Deux-Montagnes);

(Sessional Paper No. 761-970410)

the second, the abstract of a petition signed by 1931 citizens from the riding of Saint-Jean, by Mr. Paquin (Saint-Jean);

(Sessional Paper No. 762-970410)

- the third, the abstract of a petition signed by 325 citizens from the riding of L=Assomption, by Mr. Saint-André (L'Assomption).

(Sessional Paper No. 763-970410)

#### **Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 59, Mr. Gautrin (Verdun) tabled the following:

An excerpt from an internal document of the Ministère de l=Éducation concerning the foreseen cutbacks for 1998-99.

(Sessional Paper No. 764-970410)

#### **Motions Without Notice**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 135, Mr. Bélanger, Government House Leader, moved:

In compliance with the modifications in the designation of certain committees:

THAT the Member for Arthabaska, Mr. Jacques Baril, current chairman of the Committee on the Budget and Administration, henceforth be chairman of the Committee on Public Finance;

THAT the Member for Mégantic-Compton, Mrs. Madeleine Bélanger, and the Member for Bourget, Mr. Camille Laurin, current chairman and vice-chairman of the Committee on Planning and Infrastructures, henceforth be chairman and vice-chairman of the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain.

By leave of the Assembly under Standing Order 84, the motion was carried.

\_\_\_\_\_

Following a motion to rescind the orders of referrals to committees whose designations have changed, Mr. Bélanger, Government House Leader, then moved:

THAT the following Bills be referred for clause-by-clause consideration to the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain:

- 63, An Act respecting semi-public companies in the municipal sector;

- 200, An Act to amend the charter of the city of Montréal;
- 206, An Act respecting Municipalité de Chertsey and Municipalité de Saint-Calixte;
- 236, An Act respecting Ville de Sorel;
  - 237, An Act respecting Ville de Charny;
- 239, An Act respecting Ville de Gatineau;

THAT the following Bills be referred for clause-by-clause consideration to the Committee on Transportation and the Environment;

- 55, An Act to amend the Act respecting the Ministère des Transports and the Highway Safety Code;
- 86, An Act respecting the SaguenayXSt. Lawrence Marine Park;

THAT Bill 81, An Act to amend the Taxation Act, the Act respecting the Québec sales tax and other legislative provisions, be referred to the Committee on Public Finance

Public Finance.		
The motion was carried.		

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 59, Mr. Jolivet, Chief Government Whip, tabled the following:

The list of members of the Standing Committees of the parliamentary group forming the Government.

(Sessional Paper No. 765-970410)

The list of temporary chairmen of the Standing Committees of the parliamentary group forming the Government.

(Sessional Paper No. 766-970410)

\_\_\_\_\_

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 59, Mr. Farrah, Chief Opposition Whip, tabled the following:

The list of members of the Standing Committees of the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition.

(Sessional Paper No. 767-970410)

The list of temporary chairmen of the Standing Committees of the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition.

(Sessional Paper No. 768-970410)

Mr. President tabled the following:

A letter, dated 9 April 1997, he had received from Mr. Jean Filion, the Member for Montmorency, indicating his wish to become a member of the Committee on Public Administration.

(Sessional Paper No. 769-970410)

A letter, dated 8 April 1997, he had received from Mr. Jacques Dubuc, political assistant to the Member for Iberville, indicating Mr. Richard Le Hir=s wish to continue to be a member of the Committee on Labour and the Economy.

(Sessional Paper No. 770-970410)

A letter, dated 8 April 1997, he had received from Mr. Mario Dumont, the Member for Rivière-du-Loup, indicating his intention to remain a member of the Committee on Institutions.

(Sessional Paper No. 771-970410)

\_\_\_\_\_

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 127, 139 and 188, Mr. Brouillet, Vice-President, then moved that these lists, as well as the choices expressed by the independent Members, be adopted.

This motion was carried.

## **Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 53, Mr. Bélanger, Government House Leader, convened the following Committee:

X the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, to continue its special consultations on the proposals for basic principles with respect to the management of odours, noise and dust in the agricultural sector.

Mr. President gave the following notices:

- X the Committee on Public Finance shall meet in order to elect its vice-chairman;
- X the following Committees shall meet in order to elect their chairman or vice-chairman: the Committee on Public Administration; the Committee on Transportation and the Environment; the Committee on Education; and the Committee on Institutions;
- X the Committee on Labour and the Economy shall hear the heads of Hydro-Québec within the framework of its order of surveillance of this agency.

#### **Motions Without Notice**

Mrs. Dionne-Marsolais, Minister for Industry and Trade, moved:

THAT the National Assembly mark Québec Retail Trade Week, which will be held from 13 to 19 April 1997 and, in so doing, recognize the economic contribution made by this branch of industry and by the people working in this sector and who contribute to the development of employment and to Québec=s prosperity.

By leave of the Assembly under Standing Order 84, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

## **Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

- Mr. Bélanger, Government House Leader, convened the following Committees:
- X the Committee on Public Finance, to continue the debate on the Budget Speech;
- X the Committee on Culture, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 40, An Act to amend the Charter of the French language;
- X the Committee on Institutions, to give clause-by-clause consideration to Bill 89, An Act respecting the implementation of the Act respecting administrative justice.

## Information on the Proceedings of the Assembly

Mr. Pinard, Vice-President, informed the Assembly that the interpellation scheduled for Friday, 11 April 1997, on "the state of the economy of Québec", during which Mrs. Gagnon-Tremblay (Saint-François) was to question Mr. Landry, Minister of Industry, Trade, Science

and Technology, will take place between Mr. Benoit (Orford) and Mr. Landry, Minister of Industry, Trade, Science and Technology.

# ORDERS OF THE DAY

Mr. Bélanger, Government House Leader, moved the adjournment of the Assembly until Tuesday, 15 April 1997, at 2.00 o=clock p.m.

The motion was carried.

Accordingly, at 3.27 o'clock p.m., the Assembly adjourned until Tuesday, 15 April 1997, at 2.00 o'clock p.m.

## JEAN-PIERRE CHARBONNEAU

President

# **APPENDIX**

## **Recorded Divisions**

On the motion by Mr. Brouillet, Vice-President, to adopt the amendments to the Standing Orders of the National Assembly:

(Division No. 121)

# **YEAS - 83**

Barbeau	Brien	Gautrin	Paquin
Baril	Brodeur	Harel	Paradis
(Arthabaska)	Brouillet	Houda-Pepin	Paré
Baril	Caron	Jolivet	Payne
(Berthier)	Carrier-Perreault	Julien	Perreault
Beaudet	Chagnon	Jutras	Pinard
Beaudoin	Cliche	Lachance	Poulin
Beaulne	Copeman	Landry	Rioux
Beaumier	Côté	(Verchères)	Rivard
Bégin	Cusano	Laprise	Robert
Bélanger	Delisle	Laurin	Saint-André
(Anjou)	Désilets	Leduc	Simard
Bélanger	Deslières	Léger	(La Prairie)
(Mégantic-Compton)	Dion	Létourneau	Sirros
Benoit	Dionne-Marsolais	Loiselle	Trudel
Bertrand	Doyer	Maciocia	Vaive
(Charlevoix)	Dumont	Marois	Vallières
Bertrand	Facal	Ménard	Vermette
(Portneuf)	Farrah	Middlemiss	
Blais	Filion	Morin	
Boisclair	Fournier	(Dubuc)	
Bordeleau	Frulla	Morin	
Boucher	Gagnon	(Nicolet-Yamaska)	
Bourbeau	Gagnon-Tremblay	Mulcair	
Brassard	Gaulin	Ouimet	

# NAYS - 0

# **ABSTENTIONS - 0**