



---

---

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

---

---

SECOND SESSION

THIRTY-FIFTH LEGISLATURE

## **Votes and Proceedings**

**of the Assembly**

**Tuesday, 25 November 1997 — No. 137**

**President of the National Assembly:  
Mr. Jean-Pierre Charbonneau**

---

**QUÉBEC**



The Assembly was called to order at 10.04 o'clock a.m.

Moment of reflection

---

### **ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

#### **Presenting Reports from Committees**

Mr. Landry (Bonaventure) tabled the following:

A report from the Committee on Institutions, which met on 19 and 20 November 1997 for clause-by-clause consideration of the following Bill:

163 An Act to amend the Public Curator Act and other legislative provisions relating to property under the provisional administration of the Public Curator –  
Reported with certain amendments.

(Sessional Paper No. 1296-971125)

---

Mr. Chagnon (Westmount–Saint-Louis) tabled the following:

A report from the Committee on Public Administration, which, on 10 September 1997, heard

**25 November 1997**

---

the President of the Commission des services juridiques; on 30 September 1997, the President of the Régie des alcools, des courses et des jeux; on 1 October 1997, the Associate Secretary of the Services gouvernementaux and the Director General of the Services aériens et postaux; on 2 October 1997, the Deputy Minister of Public Security and the Deputy Minister of Justice; on 8 October 1997, the Deputy Minister of Industry, Trade, Science and Technology and the President of the Société de développement industriel; on 15 October 1997, the Deputy Minister of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food; and, on 12 and 19 November 1997, the Secretary of the Conseil du Trésor, pursuant to the *Act respecting the accountability of deputy ministers and chief executive officers of public bodies*. The Committee also held deliberative meetings on 3, 4, 10 and 30 September, on 1, 2, 8 and 29 October and on 11, 19 and 20 November 1997. The report contains recommendations.

(Sessional Paper No. 1297-971125)

### **Presenting Petitions**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mr. Dion (Saint-Hyacinthe) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition respecting the social welfare reform and signed by 2670 citizens from the riding of Saint-Hyacinthe.

(Sessional Paper No. 1298-971125)

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mrs. Doyer (Matapédia) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition respecting the traffic lights at the intersection of Chemin Perreault and Gaboury Boulevard in Mont-Joli and signed by 600 citizens from the riding of Matapédia.

(Sessional Paper No. 1299-971125)

### **Complaints of Breach of Privilege or Contempt and Personal Explanations**

Mr. President informed the Assembly that he had received from Mr. Paradis, Official Opposition House Leader, within the prescribed time, notices indicating his intention to rise on two points of privilege regarding the disclosure of personal information. The first matter involves the Minister of State for Natural Resources, who, on 20 November 1997, allegedly infringed upon the privileges of the House and of its Members by misleading the Assembly with regard to information on the dismissal of a Hydro-Québec public servant. The second matter involves the Prime Minister of Québec, who, on 20 November 1997, allegedly misled the Assembly when answering a question on the involvement of his office in the disclosure of confidential information.

Mr. President took the question of the receivability of these requests under advisement.

### **Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 53, Mr. Bouchard, Prime Minister, tabled the following:

Copy of a letter he had sent to Mr. Paul-André Comeau, chairman of the Commission d'accès à l'information, on 25 November 1997, regarding the holding of an inquiry on the allegations that personal and tax information had been disclosed to and by his Cabinet.

(Sessional Paper No. 1300-971125)

### **Deferred Divisions**

The Assembly took the division, which had been deferred during Business Having Precedence at the sitting of 20 November 1997, on the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Bourbeau (Laporte). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Parti Québécois Government, and more specifically its Minister of Finance, for:

25 November 1997

---

- the systematic recourse to parallel accounting;
- the establishment of a multitude of special funds;
- the transfer of part of its deficit, notably to cegeps, universities and hospitals;
- the utopianism of the zero deficit.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. 165 in Appendix)

Yeas: **42** Nays: **63** Abstentions: **0**

#### **Motions Without Notice**

Mrs. Leduc (Mille-Îles) moved a motion concerning the implementation of the *Pay Equity Act*; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

\_\_\_\_\_

Mr. Landry (Bonaventure) moved:

THAT the National Assembly today mark the one-hundredth anniversary of the Fondation des Chevaliers de Colomb (Knights of Columbus) in Québec and acknowledge the social involvement of the members of this movement.

By leave of the Assembly under Standing Order 84, the motion was carried.

\_\_\_\_\_

Mr. Jolivet, Government House Leader, moved:

**25 November 1997**

---

THAT the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain hold special consultations on Bill 160, An Act to amend the Act respecting safety in sports and other legislative provisions, on Tuesday, 25 November 1997, and, for this purpose, hear the following groups:

- from 8.00 o'clock p.m. to 8.15 o'clock p.m., opening statements by the members of the parliamentary group forming the Government;
- from 8.15 o'clock p.m. to 8.30 o'clock p.m., opening statements by the Members sitting in Opposition;
- from 8.30 o'clock p.m. to 9.15 o'clock p.m., the Régie des alcools, des courses et des jeux;
- from 9.15 o'clock p.m. to 10.00 o'clock p.m., the Régie de la sécurité dans les sports;
- from 10.00 o'clock p.m. to 10.45 o'clock p.m., the Fédération québécoise de hockey sur glace.

The presentation by each group shall not last more than fifteen minutes and its exchange with the members of the Committee shall not last more than thirty minutes, which time shall be shared equally among the members of the parliamentary group forming the Government and the Members sitting in Opposition;

The Minister of Municipal Affairs shall be a member of the said Committee during its proceedings with respect to this order of reference.

By leave of the Assembly under Standing Order 84, the motion was carried.

---

Mr. Jolivet, Government House Leader, moved:

THAT the Committee on Education hold special consultations on Bill 166, An Act to amend the General and Vocational Colleges Act and other legislative

**25 November 1997**

---

provisions, on Wednesday, 26 November 1997, and, for this purpose, hear the following groups:

- from 3.00 o'clock p.m. to 3.15 o'clock p.m., opening statements by the members of the parliamentary group forming the Government;
- from 3.15 o'clock p.m. to 3.30 o'clock p.m., opening statements by the Members sitting in Opposition;
  - from 3.30 o'clock p.m. to 4.15 o'clock p.m., the Fédération des cégeps;
- from 4.15 o'clock p.m. to 5.00 o'clock p.m., the Fédération des associations de parents des cégeps du Québec inc.;
- from 5.00 o'clock p.m. to 5.45 o'clock p.m., the Fédération nationale des enseignants du Québec;
- from 8.00 o'clock p.m. to 8.45 o'clock p.m., the Fédération des enseignants des collèges;
- from 8.45 o'clock p.m. to 9.30 o'clock p.m., the Fédération étudiante collégiale du Québec;
  - from 9.30 o'clock p.m. to 10.15 o'clock p.m., the Fédération autonome du collégial;
- from 10.15 o'clock p.m. to 11.00 o'clock p.m., the Conseil des collèges non subventionnés.

The presentation by each group shall not last more than fifteen minutes and its exchange with the members of the Committee shall not last more than thirty minutes, which time shall be shared equally among the members of the parliamentary group forming the Government and the Members sitting in Opposition;

The Minister of Education shall be a member of the said Committee during its proceedings with respect to this order of reference.

By leave of the Assembly under Standing Order 84, the motion was carried.

### **Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

Mr. Jolivet, Government House Leader, convened the following Committees:

- X the Committee on Labour and the Economy, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 149, An Act to reform the Québec Pension Plan and to amend various legislative provisions;
- X the Committee on Public Finance, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 165, An Act to amend the Taxation Act, the Act respecting the Ministère du Revenu, the Act to facilitate the payment of support and the Act respecting the Québec Pension Plan;
- X the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain, to hold special consultations on Bill 160, An Act to amend the Act respecting safety in sports and other legislative provisions, and to give clause-by-clause consideration to the said Bill.

---

Mr. President gave the following notice:

- X the Committee on Public Administration shall examine the financial commitments of the Ministère de l'Industrie, du Commerce, de la Science et de la Technologie contained in the lists for the months of March 1996 to March 1997.

---

### **ORDERS OF THE DAY**

#### **Urgent Debates**

Mr. President gave the following ruling with regard to a request made by Mr. Paradis, Official Opposition House Leader, for the holding of an urgent debate on the disclosure of personal information by the Ministère du Revenu.

25 November 1997

---

RULING FROM THE CHAIR

The request to hold an urgent debate is receivable since it meets the requirements of Standing Order 88; this is the only occasion on which the matter may be considered in debate.

Following a suspension of the sitting during which he met with the House leaders, Mr. President announced the allocation of speaking time for the proceedings with respect to this limited debate: five minutes shall be allotted for the independent Members; the two parliamentary groups shall share equally the rest of the time allotted for this debate, and individual addresses shall not be limited.

And debate arising;

At 1.00 o'clock p.m., the debate expired and, pursuant to Standing Order 92, no question was put.

---

At 1.00 o'clock p.m., Mr. Brouillet, Vice-President, having left the Chair, the proceedings were suspended until 3.00 o'clock p.m.

---

The proceedings resumed at 3.05 o'clock p.m.

**Government Bills**

*Passage in Principle*

Mrs. Marois, Minister of Education, moved, —That Bill 180, An Act to amend the Education

25 November 1997

---

Act and various legislative provisions, do now pass in principle.

And debate arising;

Mr. President rendered the following decision on a point of privilege raised by Mr. Paradis, Official Opposition House Leader, on whether the Minister of State for Natural Resources breached a privilege of Parliament by misleading the Assembly. According to the Official Opposition House Leader, the Minister allegedly made a statement outside of the Assembly which was contrary to a statement he made in the Assembly.

#### RULING FROM THE CHAIR

The facts adduced by the Official Opposition House Leader do not constitute, prima facie, a breach of privilege of the Assembly.

Under the Standing Orders of the National Assembly, there is a presumption to the effect that a Member must be taken at his word. This presumption may only be reversed if a Member, during a speech, misleads the Assembly and subsequently admits having deliberately done so, thus placing himself in contempt of Parliament.

In the case in point, the facts adduced by the Official Opposition House Leader may not be considered as being an unequivocal acknowledgement on the part of the Minister of State for Natural Resources of having deliberately misled the Assembly.

Mr. President then rendered the following decision on a second point of privilege raised by Mr. Paradis, Official Opposition House Leader, on whether the Prime Minister breached a privilege of Parliament by misleading the Assembly. According to the Official Opposition House Leader, an official statement issued by the office of the Prime Minister was allegedly contrary to a statement the latter made in the House.

#### RULING FROM THE CHAIR

The facts adduced by the Official Opposition House Leader do not constitute, prima facie, a breach of privilege of the Assembly.

25 November 1997

---

Under the Standing Orders of the National Assembly, there is a presumption to the effect that a Member must be taken at his word. This presumption may only be reversed if a Member, during a speech, misleads the Assembly and subsequently admits having deliberately done so, thus placing himself in contempt of Parliament.

In the case in point, the facts adduced by the Official Opposition House Leader may not be considered as an unequivocal acknowledgement that the Prime Minister deliberately misled the Assembly.

At 5.56 o'clock p.m., Mr. President having left the Chair, the proceedings were suspended until 8.00 o'clock p.m.

The proceedings resumed at 8.03 o'clock p.m.

*Passage in Principle*

And debate continuing on the motion by Mrs. Marois, Minister of Education, —That Bill 180, An Act to amend the Education Act and various legislative provisions, do now pass in principle;

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried on division and Bill 180 was accordingly passed in principle.

On motion by Mr. Jolivet, Government House Leader, Bill 180 was referred for clause-by-clause consideration to the Committee on Education.

**25 November 1997**

---

Mr. Rioux, Minister of Labour, moved, —That Bill 172, An Act to again amend the Act respecting labour standards, do now pass in principle.

After debate thereon, the motion was carried and Bill 172 was accordingly passed in principle.

On motion by Mr. Jolivet, Government House Leader, Bill 172 was referred for clause-by-clause consideration to the Committee on Labour and the Economy.

\_\_\_\_\_

Mr. Bélanger, Minister of Public Security, moved, —That Bill 174, An Act to amend the Act respecting explosives, do now pass in principle.

After debate thereon, the motion was carried and Bill 174 was accordingly passed in principle.

On motion by Mr. Jolivet, Government House Leader, Bill 174 was referred for clause-by-clause consideration to the Committee of the Whole.

\_\_\_\_\_

At 11.17 o'clock p.m., on the motion by Mr. Jolivet, Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned until Wednesday, 26 November 1997, at 10.00 o'clock a.m.

**JEAN-PIERRE CHARBONNEAU**

*President*

**1557**

25 November 1997

---

**APPENDIX**

**Recorded Divisions**

On the want of confidence motion moved by Mr. Bourbeau (Laporte) during Business Having Precedence at the sitting of 20 November 1997:

(Division No. 165)

**YEAS - 42**

Beaudet	Chenail	Houda-Pepin	MacMillan
Béchar	Cherry	Johnson	Marsan
Bélang	Copeman	Kelley	Middlemiss
<i>(Mégantic-Compton)</i>	Delisle	Lafrenière	Mulcair
Benoit	Dumont	Lamquin-Éthier	Paradis
Bergman	Farrah	Le Hir	Poulin
Bordeleau	Fournier	Leblanc	Sirros
Bourbeau	Frulla	Lefebvre	Vaive
Brodeur	Gautrin	LeSage	Vallières
Chagnon	Gauvin	Loiselle	Williams
Chalifoux	Gobé	Maciocia	

**NAYS - 63**

Barbeau	Bertrand	Désilets	Jutras
Baril	<i>(Portneuf)</i>	Deslières	Kieffer
<i>(Arthabaska)</i>	Blais	Dion	Lachance
Baril	Boisclair	Dionne-Marsolais	Landry
<i>(Berthier)</i>	Bouchard	Doyer	<i>(Bonaventure)</i>
Beaudoin	Boucher	Duguay	Landry
Beaulne	Brassard	Facal	<i>(Verchères)</i>
Beaumier	Campeau	Gagnon	Laprise
Bégin	Caron	Gaulin	Laurin
Bélang	Carrier-Perreault	Gendron	Leduc
<i>(Anjou)</i>	Charest	Harel	Léger
Bertrand	Cliche	Jolivet	Lelièvre
<i>(Charlevoix)</i>	Côté	Julien	Léonard

**25 November 1997**

---

Létourneau	Papineau	Rioux	Trudel
Malavoy	Paquin	Robert	Vermette
Marois	Paré	Rochon	
Ménard	Payne	Saint-André	
Morin	Pelletier	Simard	
<i>(Nicolet-Yamaska)</i>	Perreault	<i>(Richelieu)</i>	

**ABSTENTIONS - 0**

---