



NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

SECOND SESSION

THIRTY-FIFTH LEGISLATURE

Votes and Proceedings

of the Assembly

Tuesday, 21 April 1998 — No. 168

**President of the National Assembly:
Mr. Jean-Pierre Charbonneau**

QUÉBEC

1935

The Assembly was called to order at 10.08 o'clock a.m.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Government Bills

Passage

Mr. Brassard, Minister of Transport, moved the passage of Bill 416, An Act to amend the Transport Act and the Act respecting transportation by taxi.

After debate thereon, the motion was carried and, accordingly, Bill 416 was passed.

Debates on Reports from Committees

The Assembly took into consideration the report from the Committee on Culture, which, on 4, 5, 6, 18, 19 and 20 March, 27 and 28 August and 4 September 1997, held a general consultation and public hearings within the framework of its order of initiative on identification cards and the protection of privacy. This report contains recommendations.

Before the debate began, Mr. Brouillet, Vice-President, announced the allocation of speaking

time for the proceedings with respect to this limited debate: five minutes shall be set aside for each of the independent Members; the two parliamentary groups shall share equally the rest of the period allotted for this debate; within this framework, any time not used by a parliamentary group or by the independent Members may be redistributed, and individual speeches will not otherwise be limited.

And debate arising;

The debate expired and, pursuant to Standing Order 95, no question was put.

At 11.40 o'clock a.m., by leave of the Assembly, Mr. Brouillet, Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 2.00 o'clock p.m.

The proceedings resumed at 2.03 o'clock p.m.

Moment of reflection

ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS

Presenting Papers

Mr. Bégin, Minister of the Environment and Wildlife, tabled the following:

The annual report of the James Bay Environmental Advisory Committee for the fiscal year ended 31 March 1997.

(Sessional Paper No. 1570-980421)

21 April 1998

Mr. President tabled the following, pursuant to Standing Order 97.1:

Copy of the notice of motion, by Mr. Gauthrin (Verdun), to be placed on the Order Paper and Notices of Wednesday, 22 April 1998, under Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition.

(Sessional Paper No. 1571-980421)

Presenting Reports from Committees

Mr. Baril (Arthabaska) tabled the following:

A report from the Committee on Public Finance, which, on 8 and 9 April 1998, continued the debate on the Budget Speech, pursuant to Standing Order 275.

(Sessional Paper No. 1572-980421)

Presenting Petitions

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mr. Paradis (Brome-Missisquoi) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition respecting the health services at the Centre hospitalier de l'Université de Montréal (CHUM) and signed by 7574 citizens from the Montréal region.

(Sessional Paper No. 1573-980421)

Oral Questions and Answers

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

Motions Without Notice

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 188, Mr. Jolivet, Government House

21 April 1998

Leader, moved:

THAT the Committee on Transportation and the Environment hold special consultations and public hearings on Bill 405, An Act to provide for the protection of groundwater, beginning on 12 May 1998, and, for this purpose, hear the following groups:

- Association des eaux souterraines du Québec;
- Association des embouteilleurs du Québec;
- Association des embouteilleurs de boissons gazeuses;
- Centre québécois du droit de l'environnement (CQDE);
- Coalition Eau-Secours;
- I.N.R.S. Eau;
- Association des géologues et des géophysiciens du Québec;
- Regroupement national des conseils régionaux en environnement;
- Regroupement québécois des groupes écologistes;
- Environment Network;
- Union des producteurs agricoles (UPA);
- Union des municipalités du Québec (UMQ);
- Union québécoise pour la conservation de la nature (UQCN);
- Union Saint-Laurent, Grands Lacs.

THAT a period of thirty minutes shall be allotted for the opening statements, which time shall be shared equally among the members of the parliamentary group forming the Government and the Members sitting in Opposition;

THAT a period of thirty minutes shall be allotted for the closing statements, which time shall be shared equally among the members of the parliamentary group forming the Government and the Members sitting in Opposition;

The presentation by each group shall not last more than fifteen minutes and the period set aside for questions between the members of the Committee and each grouping of interest groups shall not last more than thirty minutes, which time shall be shared equally between the two parliamentary groups;

THAT all briefs be submitted to the Secrétariat des commissions by 5 May 1998;

The Minister of the Environment and Wildlife shall be a member of the said

21 April 1998

Committee during its proceedings with respect to this order of reference.

By leave of the Assembly under Standing Order 84, the motion was carried.

Mr. Landry, Deputy Prime Minister, moved a motion concerning the elimination of the budget deficit; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

Mr. Bourbeau (Laporte) moved a motion concerning the fiscal balance objective; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

Mr. Landry, Minister of State for the Economy and Finance, moved a motion concerning the attainment of a fiscal balance in 1999-2000; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

Notices of Proceedings in Committees

Mr. Jolivet, Government House Leader, convened the following Committee:

- X the Committee on Public Finance, to give clause-by-clause consideration to Bill 415, An Act to establish a fund in respect of the ice storm of 5 to 9 January 1998.

Mr. President gave the following notices:

- X the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries and Food shall hold a deliberative meeting for the purpose of ruling on a request made by the Fédération des producteurs de porcs du Québec (Federation of Québec pork producers);

21 April 1998

- X the Committee on Public Administration shall hold a deliberative meeting for the purpose of determining its conclusions and recommendations after having heard deputy ministers and chief executive officers of public bodies, pursuant to the *Act respecting the accountability of deputy ministers and chief executive officers of public bodies*;
- X the Committee on Labour and the Economy shall hold a deliberative meeting for the purpose of hearing Dr. Pierre Couture in camera.

Information on the Proceedings of the Assembly

Mr. President informed the Assembly that on Wednesday, 22 April 1998, during Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition, a debate will be held on the motion by Mr. Gautrin (Verdun). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly denounce the Parti Québécois Government=s successive and indiscriminate cutbacks in our post-secondary institutions, which mortgage the collective future of Québec and stifle the vitality of these institutions.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Business Having Precedence

The Assembly resumed the debate, which had been suspended at the sitting of 8 April 1998, on the motion by Mr. Landry, Minister of Finance, —That the Assembly approves in general the budgetary policy of the Government, and on the want of confidence motions moved by Mr. Bourbeau (Laporte), Mr. Dumont (Rivière-du-Loup), Mr. Gautrin (Verdun), Mr. Béchar (Kamouraska-Témiscouata), Mr. Copeman (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce), Mr. Johnson, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Chagnon (Westmount—Saint-Louis) and Mr. Williams (Nelligan).

21 April 1998

The debate on the Budget Speech was concluded.

Recorded divisions were demanded on the want of confidence motions and on the motion by Mr. Landry, Minister of Finance.

The first motion to be put was that moved by Mr. Bourbeau (Laporte). This want of confidence motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Parti Québécois Government for its 1998-99 budget, which contains no measures to improve health and education services, which contains no real prospect for employment improvement, more specifically with regard to our youth, and which does not take on the impoverishment of Quebeckers.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. 200 in Appendix)

Yeas: **33** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

The next motion to be put was that moved by Mr. Dumont (Rivière-du-Loup). This want of confidence motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Parti Québécois Government for its interventionist economic orientation and its refusal to take on the main obstacle to economic growth brought on by Quebeckers= tax burden.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. 201 in Appendix)

Yeas: **33** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

The following motion to be put was that moved by Mr. Gautrin (Verdun). This want of

21 April 1998

confidence motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Parti Québécois Government for its lack of transparency with regard to the effect of the Government accounting reform modifications on the financial framework.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. 202 in Appendix)

Yeas: **33** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

The next motion to be put was that moved by Mr. Bécharde (Kamouraska-Témiscouata). This want of confidence motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Parti Québécois Government for its 1998-99 budget, which contains no realistic measures to counter the impoverishment of our regions, of the population and more specifically of our youth, and which offloads onto future generations an increase of more than 16 % in Québec's debt.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. 203 in Appendix)

Yeas: **33** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

The following motion to be put was that moved by Mr. Copeman (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce). This want of confidence motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Parti Québécois Government for the lack of measures, in its 1998-99 budget, which could improve the living conditions of the poorest members of our society.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

21 April 1998

(Division No. 204 in Appendix)

Yeas: **33** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

The next motion to be put was that moved by Mr. Johnson, Leader of the Official Opposition. This want of confidence motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Parti Québécois Government for its lack of vision and means as regards health, education, economy, employment and the future of our youth, which constitute the real priorities of Québec society.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. 205 in Appendix)

Yeas: **33** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

The following motion to be put was that moved by Mr. Chagnon (Westmount–Saint-Louis). This want of confidence motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Parti Québécois Government for having "omitted" to include in its 1998-99 budget specific measures to create employment in Québec which meet our youth=s real needs, while having reduced expenditures in education and vocational training.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. 206 in Appendix)

Yeas: **33** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

21 April 1998

The next motion to be put was that moved by Mr. Williams (Nelligan). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely blame the Parti Québécois Government, which continues to harass low-income taxpayers, particularly tip employees.

The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. 207 in Appendix)

Yeas: **33** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

The question was then put on the motion moved by Mr. Landry, Minister of Finance, XThat the Assembly approves in general the budgetary policy of the Government.

The motion was carried on the following vote:

(Division No. 208 in Appendix)

Yeas: **61** Nays: **33** Abstentions: **0**

At 5.04 o'clock p.m., on motion by Mr. Jolivet, Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned until Wednesday, 22 April 1998, at 10.00 o'clock a.m.

21 April 1998

ROYAL ASSENT

On Thursday, 16 April 1998, at 11.05 o'clock a.m., in the Office of the Lieutenant-Governor, in the presence of Mr. Côté (La Peltrie), the Delegate of the Prime Minister, and of Mr. Bédard, Director of the Secretariat of the Assembly, the Honourable Lise Thibault, Lieutenant-Governor of Québec, was pleased to assent to the following Bills:

181 An Act to amend the Civil Code and other legislative provisions as regards the publication of personal and movable real rights and the constitution of movable hypothecs without delivery;

401 An Act to amend the Consumer Protection Act with respect to itinerant merchants;

410 An Act to amend the Act respecting off-highway vehicles.

On Tuesday, 21 April 1998, at 4.05 o'clock p.m., in the Office of the Lieutenant-Governor, in the presence of Mr. Brouillet, Vice-President of the National Assembly, of Mrs. Barbeau (Vanier), the Delegate of the Prime Minister, of Mr. Middlemiss (Pontiac), the Delegate of the Leader of the Official Opposition, and of Mr. Bédard, Director of the Secretariat of the Assembly, the Honourable Lise Thibault, Lieutenant-Governor of Québec, was pleased to assent to the following Bill:

416 An Act to amend the Transport Act and the Act respecting transportation by taxi.

JEAN-PIERRE CHARBONNEAU

President

21 April 1998

APPENDIX

Recorded Divisions

On the want of confidence motion by Mr. Bourbeau (Laporte):

(Division No. 200)

YEAS - 33

| | | | |
|-----------|-----------------|----------------|-----------|
| Béchar | Chenail | Houda-Pepin | Mulcair |
| Benoit | Cusano | Johnson | Paradis |
| Bergman | Delisle | Lamquin-Éthier | Parent |
| Bissonnet | Dumont | Laporte | Poulin |
| Bordeleau | Farrah | Leblanc | Sirros |
| Bourbeau | Gagnon-Tremblay | Lefebvre | Vallières |
| Brodeur | Gautrin | Loiselle | |
| Chagnon | Gauvin | Marsan | |
| Chalifoux | Gobé | Middlemiss | |

NAYS - 61

| | | | |
|-----------------------|------------------|------------------------|----------------------------|
| Barbeau | Blackburn | Doyer | Leduc |
| Baril | Bouchard | Duguay | Léger |
| (<i>Arthabaska</i>) | Boucher | Gagnon | Lelièvre |
| Baril | Boulerice | Gaulin | Léonard |
| (<i>Berthier</i>) | Brassard | Jolivet | Létourneau |
| Beaudoin | Campeau | Julien | Malavoy |
| Beaulne | Caron | Jutras | Marois |
| Beaumier | Charest | Kieffer | Ménard |
| Bégin | Chevrette | Lachance | Morin |
| Bélanger | Cliche | Landry | (<i>Nicolet-Yamaska</i>) |
| (<i>Anjou</i>) | Côté | (<i>Bonaventure</i>) | Papineau |
| Bertrand | Désilets | Landry | Paquin |
| (<i>Charlevoix</i>) | Deslières | (<i>Verchères</i>) | Paré |
| Bertrand | Dion | Laprise | Payne |
| (<i>Portneuf</i>) | Dionne-Marsolais | Laurin | Pelletier |

21 April 1998

Perreault
Rivard
Robert

Rochon
Saint-André
Signori

Simard
(*Richelieu*)
Trudel

Vermette

ABSTENTIONS - 0

On the want of confidence motion by Mr. Dumont (Rivière-du-Loup):

(Division No. 201)

(Identical to Division No. 200)

On the want of confidence motion by Mr. Gauthier (Verdun):

(Division No. 202)

(Identical to Division No. 200)

On the want of confidence motion by Mr. Béchard (Kamouraska-Témiscouata):

(Division No. 203)

(Identical to Division No. 200)

On the want of confidence motion by Mr. Copeman (Notre-Dame-de-Grâce):

(Division No. 204)

(Identical to Division No. 200)

21 April 1998

On the want of confidence motion by Mr. Johnson, Leader of the Official Opposition:

(Division No. 205)

(Identical to Division No. 200)

On the want of confidence motion by Mr. Chagnon (Westmount–Saint-Louis):

(Division No. 206)

(Identical to Division No. 200)

On the want of confidence motion by Mr. Williams (Nelligan):

(Division No. 207)

(Identical to Division No. 200)

On the motion moved by Mr. Landry, Minister of Finance, XThat the Assembly approves in general the budgetary policy of the Government:

(Division No. 208)

YEAS - 61

| | | | |
|---------------------|---------------------|-----------|------------------|
| Barbeau | Bégin | Bouchard | Cliche |
| Baril | Bélanger | Boucher | Côté |
| <i>(Arthabaska)</i> | <i>(Anjou)</i> | Boulerice | Désilets |
| Baril | Bertrand | Brassard | Deslières |
| <i>(Berthier)</i> | <i>(Charlevoix)</i> | Campeau | Dion |
| Beaudoin | Bertrand | Caron | Dionne-Marsolais |
| Beaulne | <i>(Portneuf)</i> | Charest | Doyer |
| Beaumier | Blackburn | Chevrette | Duguay |

21 April 1998

| | | | |
|----------------------------------|----------------------------|-------------|----------------------|
| Gagnon | Gaulin | Jolivet | Julien |
| Jutras | Léger | Paquin | Simard |
| Kieffer | Lelièvre | Paré | (<i>Richelieu</i>) |
| Lachance | Léonard | Payne | Trudel |
| Landry (<i>Bonaventure</i>) | Létourneau | Pelletier | Vermette |
| Landry (<i>Verchères</i>) | Malavoy | Perreault | |
| Laprise | Marois | Rivard | |
| Laurin | Ménard | Robert | |
| Leduc | Morin | Rochon | |
| | (<i>Nicolet-Yamaska</i>) | Saint-André | |
| | Papineau | Signori | |

NAYS - 33

| | | | |
|-----------|-----------------|----------------|-----------|
| Bécharde | Chenail | Houda-Pepin | Mulcair |
| Benoit | Cusano | Johnson | Paradis |
| Bergman | Delisle | Lamquin-Éthier | Parent |
| Bissonnet | Dumont | Laporte | Poulin |
| Bordeleau | Farrah | Leblanc | Sirros |
| Bourbeau | Gagnon-Tremblay | Lefebvre | Vallières |
| Brodeur | Gautrin | Loiselle | |
| Chagnon | Gauvin | Marsan | |
| Chalifoux | Gobé | Middlemiss | |

ABSTENTIONS - 0