



---

---

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

---

SECOND SESSION

THIRTY-NINTH LEGISLATURE

## **Votes and Proceedings**

**of the Assembly**

**Thursday, 31 March 2011 — No. 11**

**President of the National Assembly:  
Mr. Yvon Vallières**

---

**QUÉBEC**



The Assembly was called to order at 9.45 o'clock a.m.

---

## **ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

### **Statements by Members**

Mrs. Houda-Pepin (La Pinière) made a statement about an end to the massacre of the Libyan population by Gaddafi.

---

Mr. Turcotte (Saint-Jean) made a statement about Adult Learners Week.

---

Mrs. Richard (Marguerite-D'Youville) made a statement about the Syndicat de l'enseignement de Champlain.

---

Mr. Deltell (Chauveau) made a statement about Meals on Wheels.

---

**31 March 2011**

---

Mrs. Gaudreault (Hull) made a statement to underline Daffodil Days, for the Canadian Cancer Society.

---

Mr. Khadir (Mercier) made a statement about free quality university education.

---

Mr. Drolet (Jean-Lesage) made a statement about Le match bleu.

---

Mrs. Ménard (Laporte) made a statement to underline the 50<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Office du tourisme.

---

Mr. Villeneuve (Berthier) made a statement about health services in the Brandon sector of Lanaudière.

---

Mr. Bachand (Outremont) made a statement to underline the 50<sup>th</sup> anniversary of Revenu Québec and the creation of the Agence.

---

At 9.57 o'clock a.m., Mr. Chagnon, Second Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

---

**31 March 2011**

---

The proceedings resumed at 10.09 o'clock a.m.

\_\_\_\_\_

Moment of reflection

**Presenting Papers**

Mr. Arcand, Minister of Sustainable Development, Environment and Parks, tabled the following:

The annual report of the Kativik Environmental Advisory Committee, for the fiscal year ended 31 March 2010.

(Sessional Paper No. 103-20110331)

\_\_\_\_\_

Mrs. Ménard, Minister of Tourism, tabled the following:

The annual report of the Régie des installations olympiques, for the fiscal year ended 31 October 2010.

(Sessional Paper No. 104-20110331)

\_\_\_\_\_

Mr. President tabled the following:

The calendar for the consideration of the estimates of expenditure for 2011-2012.

(Sessional Paper No. 105-20110331)

### **Presenting Reports from Committees**

Mr. Marsan (Robert-Baldwin), committee chairman, tabled the following:

A report from the Committee on Culture and Education, which, on 18 January, on 8, 9, 10, 15 and 16 February, and on 23, 24, 29 and 30 March 2011, held public hearings within the framework of a general consultation on Bill 82, Cultural Heritage Act.

(Sessional Paper No. 106-20110331)

### **Presenting Petitions**

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mr. Villeneuve (Berthier) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition respecting health services in Brandon, and signed by 1000 citizens of the Lanaudière region.

(Sessional Paper No. 107-20110331)

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mr. Khadir (Mercier) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition respecting the construction of a major hydroelectric complex on the Romaine River, and signed by 84 North Shore Innu.

(Sessional Paper No. 108-20110331)

### **Complaints of Breach of Privilege or Contempt and Personal Explanations**

Mr. President rendered his decision regarding the point of privilege raised by the Official Opposition House Leader, on 29 March 2011, whereby he alleged that the Minister of Labour, during a speech in the Assembly, had been in contempt of Parliament by threatening Members sitting in opposition or by trying to influence them in the exercise of their duties.

**31 March 2011**

---

### **RULING FROM THE CHAIR**

During her address on the Budget Speech on 24 March 2011, the Minister of Labour made certain comments. After this address, still within the framework of the debate on the Budget Speech, the Member for Joliette rose and commented on the words used by the Minister. The latter then gave a brief explanation in pursuance of Standing Order 212 regarding the words she had used.

When the Chair interprets words used in the Assembly, it must take all facts into consideration.

Under the circumstances, the Minister invoked the provisions of Standing Order 212. This Standing Order is a procedural tool that allows a Member to explain the sense of the speech he has just given. In other words, this Standing Order allows a Member to set the facts straight in regard to some part of his speech that he deems may have been misquoted or misunderstood.

When a Member invokes Standing Order 212, his explanations cannot be called into question and must be considered as true. Furthermore, this falls within the reasoning behind the principle whereby no Member may refuse to take another Member at his word.

The Chair therefore cannot conclude that the comments made by the Minister of Labour within the framework of the debate on the Budget Speech constitute, at first glance, contempt of Parliament.

However, all speeches made in this Assembly are recorded in the *Journal des débats*. It is also important to recall the importance of the constitutional privilege of freedom of speech, in pursuance of which a Member may not be influenced, threatened or hindered in the exercise of his parliamentary duties.

At the request of Mr. President, Mr. Fournier, Government House Leader, withdrew certain words deemed unparliamentary.

### **Oral Questions and Answers**

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 53 and 59, Mr. Villeneuve (Berthier) tabled the following:

**31 March 2011**

---

Copy of a letter, dated 1 October 2010, he had received from Mr. Jean-François Foisy, President and Chief Executive Officer of the Centre de la santé et des services sociaux Lanaudière, concerning the ambulance service schedule of Saint-Gabriel.

(Sessional Paper No. 109-20110331)

### **Motions Without Notice**

Mr. Bergman (D'Arcy-McGee), together with Mr. Bonnardel (Shefford), Mr. Picard (Chutes-de-la-Chaudière) and Mr. Caire (La Peltrie), moved a motion concerning the Vigile.net site; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

---

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mrs. Marois, Leader of the Official Opposition, together with Mrs. Beauchamp, Minister of Education, Recreation and Sports, Mr. Bonnardel (Shefford), Mr. Picard (Chutes-de-la-Chaudière), Mr. Caire (La Peltrie) and Mr. Khadir (Mercier), moved:

THAT the National Assembly congratulate athlete Dominique Maltais, native of Petite-Rivière-Saint-François, who finished fourth in snowboard cross in Arosa, Switzerland, last 24 March, thus capturing the Crystal Globe in snowboard cross, which is given to the best athlete in the cumulative standing of the season.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

---

Mr. Bonnardel (Shefford), together with Mr. Bédard (Chicoutimi), Mr. Picard (Chutes-de-la-Chaudière), Mr. Caire (La Peltrie) and Mr. Khadir (Mercier), moved a motion concerning the Auditor General; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.



**31 March 2011**

---

Mr. Khadir (Mercier) moved a motion concerning Revenu Québec; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

—————

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 84.1 and 185, Mrs. St-Pierre, Minister of Culture, Communications and the Status of Women, together with Mr. Blanchet (Drummond), Mrs. Roy (Lotbinière), Mr. Picard (Chutes-de-la-Chaudière), Mr. Caire (La Peltre) and Mr. Khadir (Mercier), moved:

THAT the National Assembly mark the 50<sup>th</sup> anniversary  
of the creation of the Ministère des Affaires culturelles and of  
the Office québécois de la langue française.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate being concluded, the motion was carried.

—————

Mr. Bédard, Official Opposition House Leader, together with Mr. Khadir (Mercier), moved a motion concerning racist material on certain Web sites; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

### **Notices of Proceedings in Committees**

Mr. Gauthrin, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following Committees:

- the Committee on Institutions, to continue its clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 94, An Act to establish guidelines governing accommodation requests within the Administration and certain institutions;
- the Committee on Public Finance, to continue and conclude the debate on the Budget Speech.

**31 March 2011**

---

Mr. Chagnon, Second Vice-President, gave the following notices:

- the Committee on Public Administration shall hold a deliberative meeting to prepare the hearing concerning the administrative expenses of school boards; it shall then hold a public meeting to hear the Deputy Minister of Education, Recreation and Sports; and finally, it shall hold a deliberative meeting to determine the observations, conclusions and, if any, the recommendations following the hearing;
- the Committee on Institutions shall hold a deliberative meeting to organize its proceedings and to meet the Auditor General with regard to the documentation provided during the consideration of the estimates of expenditure.

#### **Information on the Proceedings of the Assembly**

Mr. Chagnon, Second Vice-President, informed the Assembly that on Friday, 8 April 2011, Mrs. Beaudoin (Rosemont) would question Mrs. Weil, Minister of Immigration and Cultural Communities, during an interpellation on "secularism and gender equality".

---

### **ORDERS OF THE DAY**

#### **Business Having Precedence**

##### *Debate on the Opening Speech*

The Assembly resumed the debate, which had been adjourned on 30 March 2011, on the Opening Speech of the Session, on the motion by Mr. Charest, Premier, as well as on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Marois, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Khadir (Mercier), Mr. Marceau (Rousseau), Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière), Mr. Blanchet (Drummond), Mrs. Lapointe (Crémazie), Mr. Aussant (Nicolet-Yamaska), Mr. Kotto (Bourget), Mrs. Richard (Marguerite-D'Youville) and Mrs. Maltais (Taschereau), subject to the receivability of these motions.

**31 March 2011**

---

At 1.00 o'clock p.m., Mr. Chagnon, Second Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 3.00 o'clock p.m.

---

The proceedings resumed at 3.03 o'clock p.m.

---

The Assembly continued the debate on the Opening Speech of the Session, on the motion by Mr. Charest, Premier, as well as on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Marois, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Khadir (Mercier), Mr. Marceau (Rousseau), Mr. Gaudreault (Jonquière), Mr. Blanchet (Drummond), Mrs. Lapointe (Crémazie), Mr. Aussant (Nicolet-Yamaska), Mr. Kotto (Bourget), Mrs. Richard (Marguerite-D'Youville) and Mrs. Maltais (Taschereau), subject to the receivability of these motions.

The debate was adjourned in the name of Mr. Leclair (Beauharnois).

---

At 6.00 o'clock p.m., Mrs. Houda-Pepin, First Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Tuesday, 5 April 2011, at 1.45 o'clock p.m.

**YVON VALLIÈRES**

*President*